Possible candidate of $0^+ s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ state

Bing An Li

University of Kentucky

Lexington, KY 40506, USA

February 25, 2022

Abstract

The possibility of the 0⁺ $\eta\eta$ resonance $f_0(2100)$ as a candidate of the $Q^2\bar{Q}^2$ state $C^{ss}(36)$ is explored. The $\eta\eta$ channel of $f_0(2100)$ is the dominant decay mode, $\eta\eta'$ channel has less decay rate, the decay rate of the $\eta'\eta'$ channel is very small. The $\pi\pi$, $K\bar{K}$, 4π modes are at next leading order in N_C expansion. Other possible decay modes are discussed.

Among many $I^G(J^{PC}) = 0^+(0^{++})$ resonances discovered [1] around 2 GeV there are $f_0(2100)$ and $f_0(2020)$ two scalar mesons [1]. The parameters of the $f_0(2100)$ are determined to be [1]

$$M = 2103 \pm 8 \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 209 \pm 19 \text{MeV}.$$

The $f_0(2020)$ is a broad scalar meson whose decay width is about 400 MeV and it has many decay modes: $\rho\pi\pi$, $\pi^0\pi^0$, $\rho\rho$, $\omega\omega$, $\eta\eta$, ... [1]. The $f_0(2100)$ is different from the $f_0(2020)$. In this paper the possible nature of the $f_0(2100)$ is investigated. In 1993 $\eta\eta$ resonances have been reported in following processes [2]

$$\bar{p} + p \to 3\pi^0, \ 2\pi^2, \ \pi^0 2\eta, \ 3\eta.$$

The $f_0(2100)$ is one of the three $\eta\eta$ resonances and its mass and decay width are determined to be

$$M = 2104 \pm 20 \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 203 \pm 10 \text{MeV}.$$

This state has not been identified definitely in the $\pi\pi$ channel and the quantum numbers are not determined in this study. In Ref. [3] the $f_0(2100)$ has been discovered in

$$\bar{p} + p \rightarrow \eta \eta, \ \eta \eta', \ \dots$$

The $f_0(2100)$ appears strongly in $\eta\eta$ channel and

$$M = 2105 \pm 10 \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 200 \pm 25 \text{MeV}.$$

The $f_0(2100)$ appears weakly in the $\pi^0 \pi^0$ data, contributing only $(4.6 \pm 1.5)\%$ of the cross section, comparing with $(38 \pm 5)\%$ in $\eta\eta$ channel. The cross section for $\eta\eta'$ contains a weak peak at about 2150 MeV.

Recently, the BES III Collaboration has reported the discovery of the $\eta\eta$ resonance $f_0(2100)$ in $J/\psi \to \gamma\eta\eta$ [4]. Its mass and decay width are determined to be

$$m = 2081 \pm 13$$
 MeV, $\Gamma = 273^{+27}_{-24}$ MeV

respectively, which are in agreement with the measurements [2,3]. The product branching ratio is measured to be

$$B(J/\psi \to \gamma f_0(2100) \to \gamma \eta \eta) = (1.13^{+0.09}_{-0.1}) \times 10^{-4}.$$

On the other hand, the discovery of $f_0(2100)$ has not been reported in $K\bar{K}$ channels of $J/\psi \to \gamma K\bar{K}$ [4] and $pp \to p_f(K\bar{K})p_s$ [5,6].

In Ref. [6] in $J/\psi \to \gamma \pi^+ \pi^-$ besides a 2⁺⁺ state $\theta(1700)$ a X(2100) is reported

$$M = 2027 \pm 12 \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 220 \pm 30 \text{MeV}$$

However, it is claimed that the angular distributions of X(2100) are similar to those of the $\theta(1700)$ which has been determined to be a 2⁺⁺ state. In Ref. [7] in the decay $J/\psi \to \gamma \pi \pi$ a wide resonance $f_0(2020)$ is seen, which is listed in Ref. [1]. It seems that the results from

these two experiments do not agree each other. On the other hand, in Ref. [1] the scalar resonance $f_0(2100)$ is not listed in the $\pi\pi$ channel in $J/\psi \to \gamma\pi\pi$.

The experimental study of the scalar resonance in the 4π channel lasts a pretty long time. Now it is needed to check whether the $f_0(2100)$ has 4π decay mode. $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma 4\pi$ and $pp \rightarrow p_f(4\pi)p_s$ are the two processes to search for $X \rightarrow 4\pi$.

- 1. MARK II has done a study of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma 4\pi$ [8] and it is found that the $\gamma \rho \rho$ are the components of these channels. It is no mentioned whether there is resonance of $\rho \rho$ around 2 GeV.
- 2. In Ref. [9] a 0⁻⁺ resonance $\eta(2100)$ which decays to both $\rho^+\rho^-$ and $\rho^0\rho^0$ has been observed by DM2 and $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \rho\rho$ has not been reported.
- 3. MARK III did a study on $J/\psi \to \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- \pi^+ \pi^-$ [10]. The $f_0(2104)$ has been reported in the 4π channel with $\Gamma = 203$ MeV and $\sigma\sigma$ is the dominant decay channel. Large branching ratios are reported

$$B(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2104))B(X(2104) \to 4\pi) = (3.0 \pm 0.8) \times 10^{-4},$$

$$B(J/\psi \to \gamma X(2104))B(X(2104) \to \rho\rho) = (6.8 \pm 1.8) \times 10^{-4}$$

4. BES has reported a partial wave analysis of $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma \pi^+ \pi^- \pi^+ \pi^-$ [11]. $f_0(2100)$ has

been found in the 4π channel with

$$M = 2090^{+30}_{-30} \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 330^{+100}_{-100} \text{MeV}$$

 $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \sigma \sigma$ decay is reported. From the values of the mass and width of f_0 is hard to say the resonance is $f_0(2100)$ or $f_0(2020)$.

From the current data it is difficult to draw a conclusion whether the $f_0(2100)$ has been found in the 4π channel produced in the J/ψ radiative decays.

The process $pp \rightarrow p_f(4\pi)p_s$ has been studied by WA102 [12] and broad scalar with

$$m = 2020 \pm 35 \text{MeV}, \ \Gamma = 410 \pm 50 \text{MeV}$$

has been found. The resonance decays to $\rho\pi\pi$ and $\rho\rho$. It is the $f_0(2020)$ resonance. In Ref. [13] a spin analysis of the 4π channels produced in central pp interactions has been done. It is mentioned that the $J^P = 0^+ \rho\rho$ distribution shows a peak at 1.45 MeV together with a broad enhancement around 2 GeV. These experiments show that the 0^+ resonance found in the 4π channel produced in pp collision is the broad $f_0(2020)$.

The experimental data mentioned above show that the scalar resonance $f_0(2100)$ discovered in $p\bar{p}$ annihilation and J/ψ radiative decay decays to $\eta\eta$ dominantly. It has weak coupling with $\pi\pi$ channel in $p\bar{p}$ annihilation and it is not found in $J/\psi \to \gamma\pi\pi$. The $f_0(2100)$ weakly decays to $\eta\eta'$. It is not discovered in the $K\bar{K}$ channels of J/ψ radiative decay and $p\bar{p}$ collision. The data of $p\bar{p} \to p_s(4\pi)p_f$ show that there is no sign of the $f_0(2100) \to 4\pi$. The authors of Ref. [3] claim that $f_0(2100)$ decays dominantly through a $s\bar{s}$ component and the strong production in $p\bar{p}$ strongly suggest exotic character. It is either a glueball or a hybrid and there maybe mixing with $q\bar{q}$ and $s\bar{s}$.

In this paper possible exotic character of the $f_0(2100)$ is investigated. We explore the possibility that the $f_0(2100)$ is a four quark state of $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ [14]. The possible direct decay channels of $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ are $\eta\eta$, $\eta\eta'$, $\eta'\eta'$, $\phi\phi$, etc.. The $\eta\eta$ mode has the largest phase space. Therefore, the $\eta\eta$ is the dominant decay mode of the $f_0(2100)$. The $\pi\pi$, $K\bar{K}$, 4π decays of the $f_0(2100)$ are via the meson loop diagrams, $\eta\eta \to \pi\pi$, $K\bar{K}$, 4π completed. In a meson theory [15] it shows that the tree diagrams of mesons are at the leading order in the N_C expansion and the meson loop diagrams are at next leading order. For example, in this meson theory [15] the amplitude of $\phi \to K\bar{K}$ is at $O(N_C)$. The decay $\phi \to \rho\pi$ is via one-loop meson diagrams completed. The amplitude of this decay is at O(1) in the N_C expansion. Comparing with $\phi \to K\bar{K}$, the decay $\phi \to \rho\pi$ is suppressed. For the decays of the $f_0(2100)$ the $f_0(2100) \to \eta\eta$ is resulted in tree diagram and the $\pi\pi$, $K\bar{K}$, 4π channels are resulted in loop diagrams of mesons, therefore, they are suppressed in the N_C expansion.

In Ref. [14] the spectrum and the properties of $Q^2 \bar{Q}^2$ states have been studied in the MIT bag model. The $Q^2 \bar{Q}^2$ states studied in Ref. [14] have been successfully applied to study the reactions $\gamma \gamma \to \rho^0 \rho^0$ and $\gamma \gamma \to \rho^+ \rho^-$ [16]. Recently, a 0⁺⁺ resonance, $f_0(1810)$, has been discovered in $J/\psi \to \gamma \omega \phi$ [17]. If this new resonance is just one of the ordinary

mesons the process $J/\psi \to \gamma f_0(1810), f_0(1810) \to \omega \phi$ would be doubled OZI suppressed. In Ref. [18] the new $\omega\phi$ resonance has been interpreted as the production of the $Q^2\bar{Q}^2$ state, $C^{s}(\underline{9})$ [14], in J/ψ radiative decay and the doubled OZI suppression is avoided.

Now we take the $0^{++} C^{ss}(36)$ state studied in Ref. [14] as the $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ state

$$C^{ss}(36) = \eta_s \eta_s, \ \eta_s = s\bar{s},\tag{1}$$

whose mass has been predicted to be

$$m = 1950 \text{MeV}.$$
 (2)

This value is very close to the mass of the $f_0(2100)$. The color wave function of $C^{ss}(36)$ state consists of color octet- color octet and color singlet-color singlet two parts [14]. The recoupling coefficients of this state are shown in Table I [14] (the color octet is indicated by underline).

 $\underline{P} \cdot \underline{P}$ PP VV $\underline{V} \cdot \underline{V}$ $C^{ss}(36)$ -0.6440.269-0.322-0.639

Table 1: Table I Recoupling Coefficients

In this study the $C^{ss}(36)$ with mass 2100 MeV is taken as the $f_0(2100)$ and the decays and productions of the $C^{ss}(36)$ state are investigated. We study the decays first, then the productions. Through a "fall apart" [14] mechanism the $C^{ss}(36)$ decays to $\eta\eta$, $\eta\eta'$, $\eta'\eta'$, $\phi\phi$, etc.. For the decay $s\bar{s}s\bar{s} \to PP$ the $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ is expressed as

$$s\bar{s} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}\eta' - \sqrt{\frac{2}{3}}\eta,$$

$$s\bar{s}s\bar{s} = \frac{2}{3}\eta\eta + \frac{1}{3}\eta'\eta' - \frac{2\sqrt{2}}{3}\eta\eta',$$
 (3)

where $\eta = \frac{1}{\sqrt{6}}(u\bar{u} + d\bar{d} - 2s\bar{s})$ and $\eta' = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}(u\bar{u} + d\bar{d} + s\bar{s})$ are taken. The three decay amplitudes are via the mechanism of "fall apart" obtained

$$<\eta\eta|T|f_0(2100)>= -0.644 \ a \ m \ \frac{4}{3},$$

 $<\eta\eta'|T|f_0(2100)>= 0.644 \ a \ m \ \frac{2\sqrt{2}}{3},$
 $<\eta'\eta'|T|f_0(2100)>= -0.644 \ a \ m \ \frac{2}{3}$ (4)

where a is a unknown constant from the mechanism of the fall apart, -0.644 is the recoupling coefficient from Tab. I, m = 2100 MeV. The decay widths are derived as

$$\Gamma(f_0 \to \eta \eta) = \frac{0.644^2}{18\pi} a^2 m (1 - \frac{4m_\eta^2}{m^2})^{\frac{1}{2}} = 1.34 \times 10^{-2} a^2 \text{GeV},$$

$$\Gamma(f_0 \to \eta \eta') = \frac{0.644^2}{9\pi} a^2 \{ \frac{1}{4m^2} (m^2 + m_\eta^2 - m_{\eta'}^2)^2 - m_\eta^2 \}^{\frac{1}{2}} = 1.05 \times 10^{-2} a^2 \text{GeV},$$

$$\Gamma(f_0 \to \eta' \eta') = \frac{0.644^2}{72\pi} a^2 m (1 - \frac{4m_{\eta'}^2}{m^2})^{\frac{1}{2}} = 1.58 \times 10^{-3} a^2 \text{GeV}.$$
(5)

The ratios of the three decay channels of the $f_0(2100)$ are

 $\Gamma(\eta\eta):\Gamma(\eta\eta'):\Gamma(\eta'\eta')\sim 1:0.78:0.12.$ (6)

This $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ scheme [14] predicts very small decay rate for the channel $\eta'\eta'$, which is caused by two factors: small phase space and small coefficient of the decomposition (3). This mechanism also predicts a smaller decay rate for the channel $\eta\eta'$. In Ref. [3] a weaker peak in the channel $\eta\eta'$ at 2150 MeV has been reported.

It is known that there is mixing between η , η' and the 0⁻⁺ glueball which is believed to be $\eta(1405)$ [19]. The mixing makes the 0⁻⁺ glueball $\eta(1405)$ have $s\bar{s}$ component [19]. Therefore, the decay $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \eta \eta(1405)$ exists and have a small decay rate. Using the results presented in the first paper of Ref. [19] it is estimated $\Gamma(f_0(2100) \rightarrow \eta \eta(1405)) \sim$ $0.09\Gamma(f_0(2100) \rightarrow \eta \eta)$. However, this decay channel will provide useful information for accurate determination of the $\eta - \eta' - \eta(1405)$ mixing. Because the coefficients of the mixing determined by different authors [19] are different the mixing effects on Eqs. (5,6) won't be studied in this paper.

In the same way the decay $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \phi \phi$ can be studied

$$<\phi_{\lambda_1}(k_1)\phi_{\lambda_2}(k_2)|T|f_0(2100)>=2\ b\ m\ 0.269\ \epsilon^{\lambda_1}(k_1)\cdot\epsilon^{\lambda_2}(k_2),$$

$$\Gamma(f_0\to\phi\phi)=\frac{1}{8\pi}(0.269)^2m(1-\frac{4m_{\phi}^2}{m^2})^{\frac{1}{2}}\{2+\frac{m^4}{4m_{\phi}^4}(1-\frac{2m_{\phi}^2}{m^2})\}b^2=0.633\times10^{-2}\ b^2\ \text{GeV} (7)$$

where b is a parameter and the relationship between a and b is unknown.

Because the parameter b is unknown and it is not able to do reliable prediction for the decay rate of the $\phi\phi$ channel. It is worth to search for the resonance $f_0(2100)$ in the $\phi\phi$ channel. Comparing with the $\eta\eta$ channel, the small phase space and the recoupling coefficient of the $\phi\phi$ channel make the decay rate of $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \phi\phi$ much small. However, there are other two factors which enhance the decay rate of $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \phi\phi$. The amplitude of this decay contains a factor $\epsilon^{\lambda_1}(k_1) \cdot \epsilon^{\lambda_2}(k_2)$, where $\lambda_i(i = 1, 2)$ and $k_i(i = 1, 2)$ are the polarization and momentum of the two ϕ mesons respectively. This polarization factor contributes a factor 4.38 to the decay rate. The second factor is that for the channel $\phi\phi$ the factor for the $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ component is one and for the $\eta\eta$ channel this factor is $\frac{4}{9}$ (3). All the factors together makes the decay rate of $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \phi\phi$ not too small. If $a \sim b$ is assumed we obtain

$$\Gamma(f_0(2100) \to \eta \eta) : \Gamma(f_0(2100) \to \phi \phi) \sim 1 : 0.47.$$

There are experimental study on $J/\psi \to \gamma \phi \phi$ [20], in which the 0⁺⁺ $\phi \phi$ at 2100MeV is not studied. It is worth to search for the $f_0(2100)$ in the $J/\psi \to \gamma \phi \phi$.

In the picture of four quark state the mechanism of the productions of the $\eta\eta$ resonance $f_0(2100)~(C^{ss}(36))$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions and J/ψ radiative decay can be understood qualitatively. A proton is made of uud quarks and the $f_0(2100)$ is a $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ state. How this $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$ state is produced in $p\bar{p}$ collision? It is known that half of the energy of a proton is carried by gluons. Therefore, $p\bar{p} \rightarrow gg + ..., gg \rightarrow f_0(2100)$ is the process for the production of the $f_0(2100)$ in $p\bar{p}$ collisions. In QCD the J/ψ radiative decay is described as $J/\psi \rightarrow \gamma gg$. Therefore, the same $gg \to f_0(2100) \to ...$ is responsible for the production of the $f_0(2100)$ in J/ψ radiative decay. In this study the $f_0(2100)$ is taken as the $C^{ss}(36)$ in which there is a component $-0.639 \ \underline{\phi} \cdot \underline{\phi}$ (Tab. I), where $\underline{\phi}$ is the color octet ϕ . The Vector Meson Dominance (VMD) works well in particle physics, in which photon is coupled to the vector mesons (ρ , ω , ϕ). A similar mechanism is proposed in Refs. [21,22], in which gluon is coupled to color octet vector, \underline{V}

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}g_s \ g_{\underline{\phi}} \ g^a \ \underline{\phi}^a,\tag{8}$$

where the a is the color index, g_s is the coupling constant of QCD, $g_{\underline{\phi}}^2 = \frac{2}{3}g^2$, g = 0.395 is determined in Ref. [15], g^a is the gluon field. The process $g + g \to \underline{\phi} \phi \to f_0(2100) \to \eta \eta$ is responsible for the productions of the $f_0(2100)$ in both $p\bar{p}$ annihilation and J/ψ radiative decay. Using this mechanism, the amplitude of the production of $f_0(2100)$ is at $O(g_s^2)$. Comparing with glueball production in J/ψ radiative decay, the amplitude of the production of the $f_0(2100)$ is suppressed by $O(\frac{1}{N_C})$ and is at the same order of magnitude of the production of the hadrons made of quarks. Roughly speaking, the production rate of glueball in J/ψ radiative decay is at about $O(10^{-3})$ and the $f_0(2100)$ is at $O(10^{-4})$. This is consistent with the analysis above. This mechanism has been applied to study $J/\psi \to \gamma X(1810), X(1810) \to \omega \phi$ [18]. Usually, the $J/\psi \to \gamma \omega \phi$ is a double OZI suppressed process. However, if X(1810) is a four quark state the double OZI suppression no longer exists. In summary, the study shows that all the decay properties of the $\eta\eta$ resonance $f_0(2100)$ can be understood by the four quark state $s\bar{s}s\bar{s}$, $C^{ss}(36)$. The $\eta\eta$ channel is the dominant decay mode. The study predicts that the $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \eta\eta'$ has less decay rate. The decay channels, $\pi\pi$, $K\bar{K}$, 4π , are at next leading order in N_C expansion and suppressed. The existence of the decay mode of $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \phi\phi$ is predicted and the measurement of this channel is significant for the $q^2\bar{q}^2$ scheme of the $f_0(2100)$. Because of $\eta - \eta' - \eta(1405)$ mixing the $\eta(1405)$ should have small $s\bar{s}$ component. Therefore, $f_0(2100) \rightarrow \eta\eta(1405)$ exists. The production of $f_0(2100)$ in J/ψ radiative decay and $p\bar{p}$ collisions are resulted in $gg \rightarrow f_0(2100)$.

References

- [1] J. Beringer et al., Particle Data Group, Phys. Rev. **D86**, 1 (2012).
- [2] T. A. Armstrong et al., Phys. Lett., **B** 307, 394 (1993).
- [3] A. V. Anisovich et. al., Phys. Lett., B 449, 145 (1999); A. V. Anisovich et. al., Nucl. Phys., A 662, 319 (2000); A. V. Anisovich et. al., Phys. Lett., B 491, 47 (2000).
- [4] M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. D 87, 092009 (2013).
- [5] R. M. Baltrusaitis et al., Phys Rev. D 35, 2077 (1987).

- [6] J. Z. Bai et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 27, 3959 (1996); Phys. Rev. D 68, 052003 (2003); D. Barberis, et al., Phys. Lett. B 453, 305 (1999).
- [7] J. Z. Bai et al., Phys. Lett. **B** 642, 441 (2006).
- [8] D. L. Burke et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 49, 632 (1982).
- [9] D. Bissello, et al., Phys Rev. **D39**, 701 (1989).
- [10] D. V. Bugg et al., Phys. Lett. **B353**, 378 (1995).
- [11] J. Z. Bai et al., Phys. Lett. B 472, 207 (2000).
- [12] D. Barberis et al., Phys. Lett. **413**,217 (1997).
- [13] D. Barberis et al., Phys. Lett. **B471**, 400 (2000).
- [14] R.L.Jaffe, Phys.Rev.**D15**,267(1977); 287(1977).
- [15] B. A. Li, Phys. Rev. D 52, 5165; D 52, 5184 (1995).
- [16] see recent review article by J.Rosner, Phys.Rev.D70,034028(2004); B.A.Li and K.F.Liu, Phys. Lett.B118,435(1982) and B124,550(E)(1983); Phys. Rev. Lett. 51,1510(1983); K.F.Liu and B.A.Li, Phys.Rev.Lett.58,2288(1987); N.N.Achesov et al., Phys.Lett.B108,134(1982);B108,435(E)(1982); Z.Phys.C16,55(1982); C27,99(1985); I.V.Anikin, B.Pire, O.V.Teryaev, Phys.Lett. B626,86(2005); hep-ph/0510286.

- [17] M. Ablikim et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 96, 162002 (2006); arXiv: 1211.5668.
- [18] B. A. Li, Phys. Rev. **D** 74, 054017 (2006).
- [19] B. A. Li, Phys. Rev. D 81, 114002 (2010); A. Masoni, C. Cicalo, and G. L. Usai, J. Phys. G: Part. Phys. 32 R293, (2006); C. Amsler and A. Masoni, Phys. Lett. B 667, 641 (2008); F. Ambrosino et al., KLOE Collaboration, Phys. Lett. B 648, 267 (2007); T. Feldmann, P. Kroll, and B. Stech, Phys. Rev. D 58, 114006 (1998); Phys. Lett. B 449, 339(1999); Hai-Yang Cheng, Hsiang-Nan Li, and Keh-Fei Liu, Phys. Rev. D 79 014024, (2009); T. Gutsche, V. E. Lyubovitskij and M. C. Tichy, Phys. Rev. D 80, 014014 (2009); F. Buisseret, V. Mathiau, C. Semay, Phys. Rev. D 80, 074021 (2009); V. Mathiau, V. Vento, Phys. Rev. D 81, 034004 (2010); S. He, M. Huang, Q. S. Yan, Phys. Rev. D 81, 014003 (2010).
- [20] D. Bisello, et al., DM2 Collaboration, Phys. Lett. B 179, 294 (1986); B 241, 617 (1990); Z. Bai et al., MARK III Collaboration, Phys. Rev. Lett. bf 65, 1309 (1990).
- [21] B. A. Li and K. F. Liu, Phys. Rev. D 40, 2856 (1989).
- [22] B. A. Li and K. F. Liu, Phys. Lett.B 134,128(1984); B. A. Li et al., Phys. Rev. D 32, 308 (1985); B. A. Li and K. F. Liu, Phys. Rev. D 28, 163 (1983); D 30, 613 (1984).