

Comment on Limitations on the superposition principle: superselection rules in non-relativistic quantum mechanics

Namit Anand¹

¹National Institute of Science Education and Research, Bhubaneswar, India

E-mail: namit.anand@niser.ac.in

Abstract. This is a comment to the paper, Limitations on the superposition principle: superselection rules in non-relativistic quantum mechanics by C Cisneros et al 1998 *Eur. J. Phys.* 19 237. doi:10.1088/0143-0807/19/3/005.

The proof that the authors construct for the limitation on the superposition of state vectors corresponding to different sectors of the Hilbert space, partitioned by a superoperator has a flaw as outlined below.

1. Introduction

In Ref. [1], section 2.4 (Impossibility of superposing states belonging to different coherent sectors), the authors construct a proof using a superoperator G that commutes with all observables of the system. The eigenstates of operator G are of the form $|g_m; \alpha_m\rangle$ where g_m and α_m are labels to distinguish different eigenvectors all of which are non-degenerate, i.e. $\langle g_m; \alpha_m | g_n; \alpha_n \rangle = 0$ if $m \neq n$.

In the next section (2.4), they construct a vector $|u\rangle = \sum_m u_m |g_m; \alpha_m\rangle$ superposing the eigenstates of G and claim that since G commutes with every other observable, $|u\rangle$ should be an eigenstate of every operator in a complete set of commuting observables of the system.

Now we know that if $G|a\rangle = a|a\rangle$ and $G|b\rangle = b|b\rangle$ are eigenvectors of an operator G , then $\lambda_1|a\rangle + \lambda_2|b\rangle$ is not an eigenvector unless they have the same eigenvalue since:

$$G(\lambda_1|a\rangle + \lambda_2|b\rangle) = a\lambda_1|a\rangle + b\lambda_2|b\rangle \neq \lambda(\lambda_1|a\rangle + \lambda_2|b\rangle) \quad (1)$$

(for some λ) unless $a = b$, which is not true in general and definitely not true for the hermitian operators with non-degenerate eigenvalues in the paper.

It is true that if G commutes with every other observable and has non-degenerate eigenvalues, then all such observables share the same eigenvectors. But $|u\rangle$ itself is not an eigenvector of G as proved above. And so $|u\rangle$ cannot be an eigenvector of other observables too. To summarize, the proof of superselection rules proposed is thus not valid for the case discussed by the authors. Whether a similar proof can be constructed is still open.

References

- [1] C Cisneros et al 1998 *Eur. J. Phys.* 19 237, doi:10.1088/0143-0807/19/3/005, Limitations on the superposition principle: superselection rules in non-relativistic quantum mechanics.