# Cold galaxies * 

Michael Rowan-Robinson ${ }^{1}$, David L. Clements ${ }^{1}$<br>$\dagger$, 1Astrophysics Group, Imperial College London, Blackett Laboratory, Prince Consort Road, London SW7 2AZ, UK


#### Abstract

We use $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ angular diameter estimates from Planck to test the idea that some galaxies contain exceptionally cold (10-13 K) dust, since colder dust implies a lower surface brightness radiation field illuminating the dust, and hence a greater physical extent for a given luminosity. The galaxies identified from their spectral energy distributions as containing cold dust do indeed show the expected larger $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ diameters. For a few cold dust galaxies where Herschel data are available we are able to use submillimetre maps or surface brightness profiles to locate the cold dust, which as expected generally lies outside the optical galaxy.


Key words: infrared: galaxies - galaxies: evolution - star:formation - galaxies: starburst - cosmology: observations

## 1 INTRODUCTION

One of the surprising results from submillimetre surveys with Herschel and Planck has been the discovery that some local ( $\mathrm{z}<0.1$ ) quiescent galaxies show spectral energy distributions (SEDs) characteristic of cold ( $\mathrm{T}=10-13 \mathrm{~K}$ ) dust (Rowan-Robinson et al 2011, 2014, Ade et al 2011, Wang and Rowan-Robinson 2014). Two examples are illustrated in Fig 1.

Cold dust in submillimetre galaxies has also been investigated by Galametz et al (2012), Smith et al (2012) and Symeonidis et al (2013) using SED fitting, by Bourne et al (2013) using CO and by Ibar et al (2013) using CII. Bendo et al (2014) have used surface brightness ratios at 250, 350 and $500 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ to explore the relative contribution of newly formed and old stars to dust heating.

To test the idea that exceptionally cold dust is present in some galaxies we compare Planck $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ diameters with diameters estimated from radiative transfer models for the far infrared and submillimetre emission. We also look at submillimetre maps for selected galaxies derived from Herschel data. Broadly speaking we expect to find that galaxies with colder dust will be more extended spatially at submillimetre wavelengths than normal galaxies of the same luminosity.

The structure of this paper is as follows: in section 2 we estimate the submillimetre diameters for galaxies with cool and cold dust and compare these with predictions for normal cirrus galaxies, in section 3 we compare these predictions

[^0]with the $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ diameters observed by Planck and in section 4 we discuss the few cases where we have Herschel maps for cold dust galaxies. Section 5 gives our discussion and conclusions.

## 2 PREDICTED SUBMILLIMETRE DIAMETERS

The temperature of optically thin interstellar dust ('cirrus') is determined by the intensity of the interstellar radiation field, which can be characterised by the ratio of the intensity of the radiation field to the local Solar Neighbourhood interstellar radiation field, $\psi$ (Rowan-Robinson et al 1992, hereafter RR92). The standard cirrus template of RowanRobinson et al $(2005,2008,2013)$ corresponds to $\psi=5$, and this is the value used by RR92 to fit the central regions of our Galaxy. $\psi=1$ corresponds to the interstellar radiation field in the vicinity of the Sun ('cool' dust). Rowan-Robinson et al $(2010,2014)$ found that some Herschel galaxies need a much lower intensity radiation field than this, with $\psi=$ 0.1 ('cold' dust). A similar result was found for some Planck galaxies by Ade et al (2011). The corresponding grain temperatures in the dust model of RR92 are given in Table 1 of Rowan-Robinson et al (2010). For the three values of $\psi$ $=5,1,0.1$, the ranges of dust grain temperatures for the different grain types are $20-24 \mathrm{~K}, 14.5-19.7 \mathrm{~K}$ and $9.8-13.4$ K respectively. Full details of the templates used are given via a readme page 1 .

One of the ways to test these ideas is to measure the submillimetre diameter. Since $\psi=1$ corresponds to the

[^1]

Figure 1. SEDs of NGC 3319 and NGC 3049, showing need for cold dust component (green).


Figure 2. Predicted submillimetre diameter versus redshift for cirrus ( $\psi=5$ ) galaxies (black), cool galaxies ( $\psi=1$, blue) and cold galaxies ( $\psi=0.1$, red) .
intensity in the solar neighbourhood, we can estimate the submillimetre diameter of galaxies by

$$
\theta \sim 2 R_{0} \psi^{-0.5}\left(z c \tau_{0}\right)^{-1}\left(L_{i r} / L_{M W}\right)^{-0.5}
$$

where $R_{0}=8.5 \mathrm{kpc}$, the distance of the Sun from the Galactic Centre, and $L_{M W}=2 \cdot 4 \cdot 10^{10} L_{\odot}$. The definition of $\psi$ in the Solar Neighbourhood is in terms of a mean surface brightness and so we can expect that $\theta$ defined by this equation is essentially a full-width to half-power when observing external galaxies.

Figure 2 shows a plot of the predicted angular size, $\theta$, versus redshift for galaxies in the RIFSCz IRAS galaxy redshift catalogue (Wang and Rowan-Robinson 2014) whose far infrared and submillimetre emission is best fitted by standard cirrus or cool cirrus, for the sample of Planck galaxies identified as requiring cold dust by Ade et al (2011), and for the RIFSCz galaxies identified as needing cold dust templates by Wang and Rowan-Robinson (2014). The prediction is that galaxies with significant cool or cold dust components should have larger submillimetre diameters than their normal cirrus counterparts. Table 1 summarises the properties of the cold dust galaxies from these latter two papers.

## 3 MEASURED PLANCK $350 \mu$ M DIAMETERS

We have focussed on those galaxies for which the predicted subillimetre diameter is greater than 3 arcmin and compared these with the PCCS submillimetre diameters (FWHM) observed by Planck at $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$. We use the Gaussian half-power width measured along the major axis. Table 2 summarises the properties of galaxies from the IRAS RIFSCz catalogue with predicted submillimetre diameter greater than 3 arcmin, spectroscopic redshifts, at least 8 optical photometric bands, $\chi^{2}$ for the infrared template fit $<5$, and SEDs dominated either by a cirrus or cool dust template. Figure 3L shows a comparison of the observed Planck diameters with the optical diameters, taken from the 3rd Reference Catalogue of Galaxies, for the galaxies of Tables 1 and 2. The quoted Planck beam at $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ is 4.3 arcmin (FWHM), so we deconvolve both the telescope beam and source profile can be approximated as Gaussians. Figure 3R shows a the observed diameters using $\theta_{\text {deconv }}=\left(\theta^{2}-4.3^{2}\right)^{-1 / 2}$, assuming that both the telescope beam and the source profile can be approximated as Gaussians (adaquate for our purposes). Values of $\theta_{\text {deconv }}<4 \mathrm{arcmin}$ will be subject to considerable uncertainty. Figure 3R shows a comparison of the deconvolved Planck diameters with the predicted values from eqn (1). All three types are consistent with a simple linear relation, apart from a cluster of galaxies with anomalously high Planck diameters, which we suggest are affected by Galactic cirrus (most have high cirrus flags in the Planck PCCS, eg NGC 1024, 3573, 4650, and IC 4831 and 5078). We have fitted straight lines through the origin to these three distributions and find slopes $1.38 \pm 0.13$ for 40 normal cirrus galaxies, $1.16 \pm 0.09$ for 64 cool galaxies (excluding 8 probable cirrus sources) and $1.32 \pm 0.21$ for 8 cold galaxies. Thus all three populations show statistically significant correlations between the observed and predicted diameters, the slopes are consistent with being the same in each case and are also not inconsistent with the true slope being unity.


Figure 5. SED of NGC 6744, outlier in Fig 3R.

There are also two outliers with rather large predicted diameters, NGC 6744 and M 104. Figures 4L and 5 show the SEDs for these two outliers. For NGC6744, once the IRAS fluxes from the IRAS Large Galaxy Catalog (Rice et al 1988) have been used, the SED is in fact dominated by a standard cirrus template, so it should move to the left in Fig 3R. For M104, Bendo et al (2006) have suggested that the AGN at the centre of the galaxy contributes to the submillimetre emission. Figure 4R shows Herschel $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ contours superposed on an i-band image for M104 ('The Sombrero'). The $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ emission arises from a ring of dust outside the main distribution of starlight. The predicted value of $\theta$ may also be an overestimate because in this edge-on system the starlight illuminating the dust ring has been significantly attenuated by dust in the disk of the galaxy, so again this object should move to the left in Fig 3R.

## 4 RESULTS FROM MAPS OF SELECTED SOURCES

Mapping data in the submillimetre from the SPIRE instrument (Griffin et al., 2010) on the Herschel Space Observatory (Pilbratt et al., 2010) is available for a few of the galaxies identified here as containing cold dust. This allows us to compare the location of the dust responsible for the submillimetre emission with the location of the starlight.

Two of the sources (NGC5701 and NGC5669) were observed as part of the Herschel Reference Survey (Boselli et al. 2010), and a third (NGC3049) was observed by the KINGFISH programme (Kennicutt et al. 2010). The SPIRE images were obtained from the Herschel or HerMES data archives.

For each of these objects we used an SDSS $i$ band optical image to trace the optical surface brightness profile from stellar emission after smoothing by a gaussian matched to the size of the $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ SPIRE beam, and then compared this to the $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ surface brightness profile resulting from dust emission. The surface brightness profiles for this calculation were produced using the the IRAF ellipse package and are


Figure 3. L: Observed Planck 857 GHz FWHM versus optical diameter (arcmins) for standard cirrus galaxies ( $\psi=5$, black), cool cirrus galaxies $(\psi=1$, cyan) and cold cirrus galaxies $(\psi=0.1$, red). The dotted line denotes the Planck 857 GHz beam (FWHM). R: Deconvolved Planck 857 GHz FWHM versus predicted submillimetre diameter (arcmins) for standard cirrus galaxies ( $\psi=5$, black), cool cirrus galaxies ( $\psi=1$, cyan) and cold cirrus galaxies $(\psi=0.1$, red).

Here the dotted line indicates the selection cutoff $\theta=3.0$.


Figure 4. L: SED of M104, an outlier in Fig 3R. R: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ contour map of M104 superposed on i-band image. Much of the $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ emission arises from a ring of dust outside the main optical image.
plotted in Figs 6L and 7. In all cases the optical and submm surface brightness profiles are clearly different.

This is most obvious in NGC5701, where there is a large ring of cold dust located outside most of the optical light distribution (see Fig. 6R). This ring makes a substantial contribution to the integrated submm emission, but the optical emission from starlight in this region is much less than in the more central regions of this object.

The dust emission in NGC5669 has a larger scale length than the optical emission, with the ratio of submm to optical surface brightness rising all the way to the edge of detectable emission in this object. Examination of the optical image suggests that this dust is associated with extended low surface brightness optical emission away from the galaxy's nucleus and bright spiral arms.

NGC3049 is an edge on spiral, which makes this analysis a little less clear, and we see only a slight hint of changes
to the optical to submm surface brightness ratio in the outer parts of this object, or possibly weak submm emission beyond the optically detected emission.

A further galaxy of interest, NGC1617, classified as cool in Table 2, was observed as part of the HerMES survey (Oliver et al., 2012) since it lies in the Akari Deep Field South (ADF-S, Matsuura et al 2011). Figure 9L shows 250 $\mu \mathrm{m}$ contours superposed on an r-band image (from Hameed and Devereux 1999), while Fig 9R shows $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ and rband intensity profiles. In this case a significant fraction of the submillimetre emission arises from two dust blobs that lie along the major axis to the north-west.

Table 1. Galaxies requiring cold dust components

| IRAS name <br> (a) Planck selected | z | $L_{o p t}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{\text {pred }}$ | $\theta_{\text {Planck }}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{o p t}$ | ncirr | name |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F10361+4155 | 0.002228 | 7.50 | 0.63 | 6.57 | 0.79 | 1 | NGC3319 |
| F14302+1006 | 0.00457 | 9.48 | 0.53 | 5.61 | 0.65 | 1 | NGC5669 |
| F09521+0930 | 0.00485 | 9.73 | 0.62 | 5.24 | 0.40 | 1 | NGC3049 |
| F10290+6517 | 0.00562 | 9.78 | 0.59 | 11.53 | 0.36 | 3 | NGC3259 |
| F14004+5603 | 0.00601 | 10.28 | 0.81 | 5.3 | 0.52 | 1 | NGC5443 |
| F15122+5841 | 0.00847 | 9.98 | 0.51 | 7.7 | -0.21 | 3 | MrK0847 |
| F15248+4044 | 0.00874 | 10.20 | 0.62 | 6.1 | 0.65 | 1 | UGC09858 |
| F14366+0534 | 0.00502 | 10.48 | 0.99 | 10.39 | 0.65 | 3 | NGC5701 |
| F13405+6101 | 0.00732 | 9.70 | 0.43 | 6.71 | 0.23 | 1 | UGC08684 |
| F08233+2303 | 0.01794 | 9.97 | -0.03 |  |  |  | KUG0823+230B |
| F15243+5237 | 0.01948 | 10.63 | 0.36 |  |  |  | UGC09853 |
| F15495+5545 | 0.03974 | 10.90 | -0.54 |  |  |  | SBS1549+557 |
| F04257-4913 | 0.05828 | 11.85 | -0.10 |  |  |  | ESO202-IG021 |
| (b) RIFSCz selected |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F12234+3348 | 0.001060 | 8.25 | 0.550 |  | 1.12 |  | NGC4395 |
| F23461+0353 | 0.009860 | 10.02 | 0.466 |  | 0.40 |  | NGC7757 |
| F11555+2809 | 0.011230 | 10.15 | 0.475 |  | 0.26 |  | NGC4004 |
| F02533+0029 | 0.013820 | 10.59 | 0.604 |  | 0.15 |  | UGC02403 |
| F12208+0744 | 0.014160 | 10.01 | 0.304 |  | 0.36 |  | NGC4334 |
| F15097+2129 | 0.015700 | 10.42 | 0.464 |  | 0.18 |  | UGC09763 |
| F00342+2342 | 0.016110 | 10.35 | 0.418 |  | 0.43 |  | NGC169 (Arp282) |
| F08070+3406 | 0.017520 | 10.92 | 0.666 |  | 0.35 |  | NGC2532 |
| F14280+2158 | 0.017750 | 10.24 | 0.321 |  | 0.19 |  | UGC09316 |
| F07581+3259 | 0.017910 | 10.38 | 0.387 |  | -0.24 |  | CGCG178-018 |
| F08277+2046 | 0.020050 | 10.04 | 0.168 |  | 0.05 |  | UGC04446 |
| F09388+1138 | 0.020810 | 10.35 | 0.307 |  | 0.36 |  | UGC05173 |
| F13090+4658 | 0.027370 | 10.49 | 0.258 |  | -0.23 |  | UGC08269 |
| F14236+0528 | 0.028400 | 10.38 | 0.187 |  | -0.41 |  | UGC09244 |
| F23254+0830 | 0.028920 | 10.96 | 0.469 |  | 0.06 |  | NGC7674 |
| F08199+0427 | 0.028930 | 10.93 | 0.454 |  | -0.31 |  | CGCG032-009 |
| F11078+0505 | 0.030230 | 10.69 | 0.315 |  | -0.24 |  | UGC06212 |
| F15426+4115 | 0.031750 | 10.54 | 0.218 |  | -0.05 |  | NGC5992 |
| F16269+4013 | 0.033570 | 10.30 | 0.074 |  | -0.38 |  | KUG1626+402 |
| F14547+2449 | 0.033670 | 10.62 | 0.233 |  | -0.18 |  | UGC09618 |




Figure 6. L: SED of NGC 5701. R: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ map of NGC5701. In this case the submillimetre emission arises from a ring of dust lying outside the main stellar distribution. The peak of emission to the SW of the nucleus is a chance superposition of a background $z=0.04$ galaxy.

Table 2. Comparison samples of large galaxies requiring cool dust or normal cirrus components

| IRAS name | z | $L_{\text {opt }}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{\text {pred }}$ | $\theta_{\text {Planck }}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{\text {opt }}$ | ncirr | name |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| cool dust galaxies |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F00380-1408 | 0.005460 | 11.17 | 0.798 | 7.30 | 0.70 | 1 | NGC0210 |
| F00446-2101 | 0.000520 | 9.29 | 0.879 | 13.11 | 1.34 | 2 | NGC0247 |
| F01191+0459 | 0.007580 | 11.24 | 0.690 | 6.43 | 0.73 | 1 | NGC0488 |
| F01443+3519 | 0.015590 | 11.46 | 0.487 | 13.7 | 0.51 | 4 | NGC0669 |
| F02364+1037 | 0.011780 | 11.27 | 0.514 | 18.46 | 0.62 | 7 | NGC1024 |
| F02403+3707 | 0.001730 | 9.60 | 0.512 | 6.85 | 0.51 | 1 | NGC1058 |
| F02415-2912 | 0.004840 | 10.69 | 0.610 | 7.81 | 0.53 | 1 | NGC1079 |
| F03116-0300 | 0.005710 | 10.85 | 0.618 | 8.44 | 0.73 | 1 | NGC1253 |
| F03151-3245 | 0.015140 | 11.44 | 0.490 | 4.90 | 0.36 | 1 | NGC1288 |
| F03174-1935 | 0.005260 | 11.07 | 0.764 | 6.77 | 0.80 | 1 | NGC1300 |
| F03222-2143 | 0.005310 | 10.91 | 0.680 | 5.56 | 0.68 | 2 | NGC1325 |
| F03291-3348 | 0.006350 | 11.39 | 0.842 | 5.80 | 0.72 | 1 | NGC1350 |
| F03309-1349 | 0.006660 | 11.02 | 0.637 | 11.27 | 0.45 | 2 | NGC1357 |
| F03367-2629 | 0.004660 | 11.42 | 0.992 | 6.82 | 0.85 | 1 | NGC1398 |
| F03401-3003 | 0.005040 | 11.11 | 0.803 | 7.87 | 0.76 | 1 | NGC1425 |
| F03417-3600 | 0.004630 | 10.46 | 0.514 | -9.99 | 0.47 | 5 | NGC1436 |
| F03451-3351 | 0.003600 | 10.37 | 0.579 | 6.00 | 0.39 | 2 | IC1993 |
| F04305-5442 | 0.003550 | 10.99 | 0.895 | -9.99 | 0.63 | 5 | NGC1617 |
| F05452-3415 | 0.003070 | 10.50 | 0.713 | 7.22 | 0.69 | 1 | NGC2090 |
| F06209-5942 | 0.007560 | 10.89 | 0.516 | 7.40 | 0.53 | 161 | ESO121-G026 |
| F07184+8016 | 0.007350 | 11.39 | 0.779 | 5.77 | 0.87 | 2 | NGC2336 |
| F07525+6028 | 0.004810 | 10.62 | 0.578 | 8.11 | 0.41 | 3 | NGC2460 |
| F08547+0306 | 0.013080 | 11.32 | 0.493 | 6.59 | 0.58 | 1 | NGC2713 |
| F09076+0714 | 0.004500 | 11.18 | 0.887 | 6.19 | 0.64 | 3 | NGC2775 |
| F09134+7358 | 0.007540 | 11.04 | 0.593 | 5.61 | 0.57 | 3 | IC0529 |
| F09186+5111 | 0.002130 | 10.41 | 0.827 | 6.95 | 0.91 | 1 | NGC2841 |
| F10068-2849 | 0.003680 | 10.50 | 0.634 | 6.17 | 0.82 | 29 | NGC3137 |
| F10312-2711 | 0.011270 | 11.31 | 0.553 | 6.25 | 0.43 | 163 | NGC3285 |
| F10346-2718 | 0.009630 | 11.24 | 0.586 | 8.46 | 0.45 | 223 | NGC3312 |
| F10456-2034 | 0.013430 | 11.47 | 0.557 | 6.08 | 0.42 | 34 | NGC3450 |
| F11089-3636 | 0.008310 | 10.93 | 0.495 | 22.25 | 0.57 | 13 | NGC3573 |
| F11163+1321 | 0.002690 | 10.63 | 0.835 | 7.05 | 0.99 | 4 | M065 |
| F11549+5339 | 0.003500 | 11.04 | 0.926 | 7.44 | 0.89 | 2 | M109 |
| F12015+3210 | 0.002530 | 10.00 | 0.547 | 6.75 | 0.61 | 1 | NGC4062 |
| F12133+1325 | 0.000440 | 8.61 | 0.612 | 7.29 | 0.91 | 223 | NGC4216 |
| F12149+3805A | 0.000810 | 9.05 | 0.567 | 10.44 | 1.22 | 1 | NGC4244 |
| F12194-3531 | 0.009790 | 11.12 | 0.519 | 6.99 | 0.51 | 6 | ESO380-G019 |
| F12234+1829 | 0.003070 | 10.04 | 0.483 | 5.41 | 0.57 | 11 | NGC4394 |
| F12257+2853 | 0.002210 | 9.87 | 0.541 | 6.30 | 0.60 | 1 | NGC4448 |
| F12259+1721 | 0.006520 | 11.06 | 0.666 | 7.10 | 0.72 | 3 | NGC4450 |
| F12329+1446 | 0.001620 | 10.30 | 0.890 | 11.02 | 0.74 | 2 | M091 |
| F12374-1120 | 0.003420 | 11.76 | 1.296 | 7.34 | 0.95 | 1 | M104 |
| F12407+0215 | 0.004450 | 10.69 | 0.647 | 7.47 | 0.49 | 2 | NGC4643 |
| F12415-4027 | 0.009850 | 11.19 | 0.552 | 14.12 | 0.56 | 5 | NGC4650 |
| F12474-1427 | 0.013060 | 11.41 | 0.539 | 6.31 | 0.36 | 5 | MCG-02-33-017 |
| F13191-3622 | 0.001560 | 10.39 | 0.952 | 8.74 | 0.90 | 2 | NGC5102 |
| F13331-3312 | 0.013990 | 11.37 | 0.489 | -9.99 | 0.38 | 3 | NGC5220 |
| F13447-3041 | 0.014900 | 11.55 | 0.552 | 5.71 | 0.27 | 5 | NGC5292 |
| F13550-2904 | 0.008920 | 11.32 | 0.660 | 6.56 | 0.80 | 2 | IC4351 |
| F14134+3627 | 0.009590 | 11.12 | 0.528 | 6.96 | 0.79 | 2 | NGC5529 |
| F14424+0209 | 0.005750 | 11.36 | 0.870 | 7.45 | 0.89 | 2 | NGC5746 |
| F15045+0144 | 0.008530 | 10.99 | 0.514 | 6.26 | 0.64 | 2 | NGC5850 |
| F15110-1405 | 0.006640 | 11.03 | 0.643 | 6.09 | 0.59 | 1 | NGC5878 |
| F17304+1626 | 0.010400 | 11.24 | 0.553 | 25.21 | 0.49 | 1 | NGC6389 |
| F17576-6625 | 0.014480 | 11.56 | 0.569 | -9.99 | 0.45 | 2 | NGC6389 |
| F18300-5832 | 0.007460 | 10.84 | 0.497 | 6.94 | 0.76 | 3 | IC4721 |
| F19049-6357 | 0.002800 | 11.25 | 1.128 | 9.88 | 1.31 | 2 | NGC6744 |
| F19101-6221 | 0.014490 | 11.50 | 0.539 | 14.27 | 0.55 | 3 | IC4831 |
| F19139-6035 | 0.012620 | 11.40 | 0.549 | 6.30 | 0.39 | 6 | NGC6769 |
| F19227-5503 | 0.010570 | 11.27 | 0.561 | 5.96 | 0.48 | 2 | NGC6788 |
| F19588-5613 | 0.014650 | 10.16 | 0.509 | 7.09 | 0.40 | 2 | NGC6848 |
| F20134-5257 | 0.009030 | 10.99 | 0.489 | 6.91 | 0.55 | 3 | NGC6887 |
| F20210-4348 | 0.009330 | 11.53 | 0.745 | 7.18 | 0.76 | 2 | NGC6902 |
| F20346-5217 | 0.015150 | 11.48 | 0.510 | 13.36 | 0.30 | 2 | NGC6935 |

Table 3. Comparison samples of large galaxies requiring cool dust or normal cirrus components (cont.)

| IRAS name | z | $L_{o p t}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{\text {pred }}$ | $\theta_{\text {Planck }}$ | $\log _{10} \theta_{o p t}$ | ncirr | name |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| cool dust galaxies (cont.) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F20597-1700 | 0.004920 | 10.57 | 0.543 | 17.33 | 0.63 | 1 | IC5078 |
| F21029-4822 | 0.017200 | 11.63 | 0.529 | 14.32 | 0.43 | 3 | ESO235-G057 |
| F21142-6358 | 0.010490 | 11.21 | 0.534 | 6.9 | 0.51 | 4 | IC5096 |
| F21596-1909 | 0.008790 | 11.14 | 0.576 | 8.17 | 0.51 | 4 | NGC7183 |
| F21598-2103 | 0.008740 | 11.42 | 0.718 | 6.92 | 0.78 | 1 | NGC7184 |
| F22061-4724 | 0.005840 | 11.39 | 0.879 | 7.18 | 0.49 | 2 | NGC7213 |
| F22369-6644 | 0.010850 | 11.19 | 0.510 | -9.99 | 0.59 | 1 | NGC7329 |
| F22450-2234 | 0.011140 | 11.56 | 0.683 | -9.99 | 0.46 | 1 | NGC7377 |
| F22521-3955 | 0.005840 | 11.31 | 0.839 | 7.94 | 0.72 | 1 | NGC7410 |
| F22543-4339 | 0.005710 | 11.29 | 0.838 | 7.50 | 0.70 | 1 | IC5267 |
| F22544-4120 | 0.003130 | 10.48 | 0.694 | 7.42 | 0.98 | 1 | NGC7424 |
| F23105-2837 | 0.005220 | 10.60 | 0.532 | 13.64 | 0.52 | 1 | NGC7513 |
| F23120-4352 | 0.005320 | 10.80 | 0.624 | -9.99 | 0.66 | 1 | NGC7531 |
| cirrus galaxies |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| F01319-2940 | 0.004940 | 11.27 | 0.541 | 6.33 | 0.74 | 1 | NGC0613 |
| F02207-2127 | 0.005030 | 11.23 | 0.513 | -9.99 | 0.78 | 1 | NGC0908 |
| F02441-3029 | 0.004240 | 11.41 | 0.678 | 6.32 | 0.98 | 4 | NGC1097 |
| F03075-2045 | 0.005350 | 11.44 | 0.592 | 5.92 | 0.87 | 1 | NGC1232 |
| F03207-3723 | 0.005870 | 12.01 | 0.836 | 11.92 | 1.05 | 4 | NGC1316 |
| F03316-3618 | 0.005460 | 11.57 | 0.648 | 7.37 | 1.05 | 2 | NGC1365 |
| F03404-4722 | 0.003590 | 11.03 | 0.560 | 6.9 | 0.81 | 2 | NGC1433 |
| F04022-4329 | 0.002990 | 10.87 | 0.559 | 6.8 | 0.95 | 1 | NGC1512 |
| F04101-3300 | 0.003470 | 11.04 | 0.580 | 9.2 | 1.10 | 1 | NGC1532 |
| F04188-5503 | 0.005020 | 11.34 | 0.569 | 5.58 | 0.92 | 8 | NGC1566 |
| F04449-5920 | 0.004440 | 11.18 | 0.543 | 6.88 | 0.92 | 117 | NGC1672 |
| F05035-3802 | 0.004040 | 11.13 | 0.559 | 5.51 | 0.72 | 2 | NGC1792 |
| F07365-6924 | 0.004890 | 11.27 | 0.546 | 5.3 | 0.81 | 7 | NGC2442 |
| F08491+7824 | 0.004670 | 11.22 | 0.541 | 7.71 | 0.69 | 4 | NGC2655 |
| F08495+3336 | 0.001370 | 10.36 | 0.643 | 6.87 | 0.98 | 1 | NGC2683 |
| F09293+2143 | 0.001830 | 10.77 | 0.723 | 7.78 | 1.10 | 4 | NGC2903 |
| F10126+7338 | 0.009350 | 11.86 | 0.559 | 5.24 | 0.59 | 1 | NGC3147 |
| F10407+2511 | 0.001930 | 10.55 | 0.589 | 6.95 | 0.85 | 1 | NGC3344 |
| F10413+1157 | 0.002590 | 10.88 | 0.627 | 7.41 | 0.88 | 3 | M095 |
| F10441+1205 | 0.002990 | 11.08 | 0.664 | 6.31 | 0.88 | 3 | M096 |
| F11032+0014 | 0.002670 | 11.20 | 0.773 | 5.9 | 1.04 | 7 | NGC3521 |
| F11176+1315 | 0.002430 | 11.06 | 0.744 | 6.64 | 0.97 | 2 | M066 |
| F11176+1351 | 0.002810 | 11.04 | 0.671 | 7.13 | 1.17 | 4 | NGC3628 |
| F12006+4448 | 0.002340 | 10.56 | 0.511 | 6.03 | 0.72 | 1 | NGC4051 Seyf1 |
| F12163+1441 | 0.008030 | 11.70 | 0.545 | 7.08 | 0.75 | 222 | M099 |
| F12193+0445 | 0.005220 | 11.43 | 0.597 | 5.25 | 0.81 | 7 | M061 |
| F12203+1605 | 0.005240 | 11.49 | 0.626 | 7.87 | 0.88 | 33 | M100 |
| F12239+3130 | 0.002390 | 10.63 | 0.537 | -9.99 | 0.56 | 2 | NGC4414 |
| F12294+1441 | 0.007610 | 11.91 | 0.674 | 5.63 | 0.85 | 4 | M088 |
| F12334+2814 | 0.002690 | 10.75 | 0.545 | 6.19 | 1.04 | 1 | NGC4559 |
| F12410+1151 | 0.004700 | 11.14 | 0.498 | 5.51 | 0.46 | 3 | NGC4647 (or 0.85 M60?) |
| F12464-0823 | 0.004650 | 11.41 | 0.638 | 6.17 | 0.59 | 3 | NGC4699 |
| F12498-0055 | 0.004130 | 11.20 | 0.584 | 6.87 | 0.77 | 1 | NGC4753 |
| F12542+2157 | 0.001360 | 10.80 | 0.866 | 6.7 | 1.02 | 3 | M064 |
| F13086+3719 | 0.003160 | 11.03 | 0.615 | 5.24 | 0.76 | 2 | NGC5005 |
| F13170-2708 | 0.007230 | 11.48 | 0.481 | 6.54 | 0.62 | 1 | NGC5078 |
| F13277+4727 | 0.001540 | 10.86 | 0.842 | 8.61 | 1.05 | 5 | M051a |
| F13350+0908 | 0.003840 | 10.93 | 0.481 | 6.43 | 0.79 | 1 | NGC5248 |
| F22347+3409 | 0.002720 | 11.07 | 0.700 | 6.97 | 1.06 | 53 | NGC7331 |
| F23552-3252 | 0.000770 | 9.83 | 0.629 | 6.85 | 0.98 | 1 | NGC7793 |

## 5 DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

The analysis of Planck $350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ data shows very clearly that the galaxies whose SEDs require a cold dust component are indeed larger than normal galaxies and by an amount consistent with the interpretation that the surface bright-
ness of the illuminating starlight is lower. The fact that this phenomenon of galaxies with cold dust did not show up in follow-up of IRAS galaxies refelects the fact that $60 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ selection biases samples towards galaxies with warmer dust. It needed the submillimetre sensitivity of Herschel and Planck to uncover this phenomenon.


Figure 7. $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ and optical intensity profiles of NGC5701. Diamonds indicate the $i$ band surface brightness derived from an SDSS image after it has been smoothed by a gaussian matching the SPIRE beam at $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$, triangles show the $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ surface brightness from SPIRE observations. The solid line indicates a gaussian model of the SPIRE $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ beam as given by the SPIRE Handbookhttp://herschel.esac.esa.int/Docs/SPIRE/spire_handbook.pdf. The true Herschel beam at $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ deviates somewhat from a pure Gaussian at radii beyond $\sim 20$ arcsecondsm at levels $<$ a few percent (Griffen et al. 2013). This is insignificant to the current analysis. The surface brightness scale is arbitrary with the two profiles scaled to the same value at a semi-major axis radius of 10 arcseconds In this case strong submillimetre emission arises in a ring of dust lying outside the main stellar distribution, which can be seen in Fig. 6R, leading to a region where the optical-to-submilimetre ratio is low.


Figure 8. L: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ and optical intensity profiles of NGC5669. Symbols and scalings as in Fig. 6R. R: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ and optical intensity profiles of NGC3049. Symbols and scalings as in Fig. 6R.

The limited submillimetre mapping data available for these cold dust galaxies shows that a variety of geometries may be involved. NGC5701 shows a large ring of cold dust located outside most of the optical light distribution but in NGC3049 the cold dust appears to be located closer to the centre of the galaxy.

It is unlucky that none of our cold dust galaxies is in the sample of nearby galaxies for which Bendo et al (2015) have studied the $160 / 250$ and $250 / 350 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ surface brightness profiles in detail. The next step will be to map some of these cold dust galaxies with ground-based submillimetre telescopes.

## 6 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Herschel is an ESA space observatory with science instru-
ments provided by European-led Principal Investigator consortia and with important participation from NASA. SPIRE has been developed by a consortium of institutes led by Cardiff University (UK) and including Univ. Lethbridge (Canada); NAOC (China); CEA, LAM (France); IFSI, Univ. Padua (Italy); IAC (Spain); Stockholm Observatory (Sweden); Imperial College London, RAL, UCL-MSSL, UKATC, Univ. Sussex (UK); and Caltech, JPL, NHSC, Univ. Colorado (USA). This development has been supported by national funding agencies: CSA (Canada); NAOC (China); CEA, CNES, CNRS (France); ASI (Italy); MCINN (Spain); SNSB (Sweden); STFC, UKSA (UK); and NASA (USA).

Based in part on observations obtained with Planck ([LINK http://www.esa.int/ Planck), an ESA science mission with instruments and contributions directly funded by ESA Member States, NASA, and Canada.


Figure 9. L: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ contours of NGC1617 superposed on r-band image. R: $250 \mu \mathrm{~m}$ and optical intensity profiles of NGC1617. Symbols and scalings as in Fig. 6R.

We thank George Bendo and an anonymous referee for helpful comments.

## REFERENCES

Ade P.A.R. et al, 2011, Planck early results XVI, AA 536, 16
Bendo G.J. et al, 2015, MNRAS 448, 135
Boselli A. et al, 2010, PASP 122, 261
Bourne N. et al, 2013, MNRAS 436, 479
Efstathiou A., Rowan-Robinson M., 2003, MNRAS 343, 322
Efstathiou A., Rowan-Robinson M., Siebenmorgen R., 2000, MNRAS 313, 734
Galametz M. et al, 2012, MNRAS 425, 763
Griffin M.J. et al, 2010, AA 518, L3
Griffin M.J. et al, 2013, MNRAS 434, 992
Hameed S., Devereux N., 1999, AJ 118, 730
Ibar E. et al, 2013, MNRAS 449, 2498
Kennicutt R.C. et al, 2010, PASP 123, 1347
Pilbratt G. et al, 2010, AA 518, L1
Rice W., Lonsdale C.J., Soifer B.T., Neugebauer G., Kopan E.L., Lloyd L.A., de Jong T., Habing H.J., 1988, ApJS 68, 91
Rowan-Robinson M., 1992, MNRAS 258, 787
Rowan-Robinson M. et al, 2005, AJ 129, 1183
Rowan-Robinson M. et al, 2008, MNRAS 386, 697
Rowan-Robinson M. et al, 2010, MNRAS 409, 2
Rowan-Robinson M. et al, 2013, MNRAS 428, 1958
Rowan-Robinson M. et al, 2014, MNRAS 445, 3848
Smith D.J.B. et al, 2012, MNRAS 427, 703
Symeonidis M. et al, 2013, MNRAS 431, 2317
Wang L., Rowan-Robinson M., 2009, MNRAS 398, 109
Wang L., Rowan-Robinson M., Norberg P., Heinis S., Han
J., 2014, MNRAS 442, 2739


[^0]:    * Herschel is an ESA space observatory with science instruments provided by European-led Principal Investigator consortia and with important participation from NASA.
    $\dagger$ E-mail: mrr@imperial.ac.uk

[^1]:    1 http://astro.ic.ac.uk/public/mrr/swirephotzcat/templates/readme

