# ON LOEWNER'S CHARACTERIZATION OF POLYNOMIALS 

J. M. ALMIRA


#### Abstract

We give a new demonstration of Loewner's characterization of polynomials, solving in the positive a conjecture proposed by Laird and McCann in 1984.


## 1. Introduction

We give a new proof of the following result:
Theorem 1.1 (Loewner, 1959). Assume that $d>1$ is a natural number. Let $f \in C\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ and let $R_{f}=\operatorname{span}\left\{f(L x): L\right.$ is an isometry of $\left.\mathbb{R}^{d}\right\}$. Then $f$ is an ordinary polynomial if and only if $\operatorname{dim} R_{f}<\infty$.

This theorem was demonstrated by Loewner using Anselone-Koreevar's theorem [5], which claims that exponential polynomials can be characterized as elements of finite dimensional translation invariant subspaces of $C\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$. Later on, in 1984, Laird and McCann [8] gave a characterization of polynomials as the elements of finite dimensional subspaces of $C\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ which are simultaneously translation and dilation invariant (their result allows $d=1$ ). Their proof used Fréchet's characterization of polynomials, instead of Anselone-Koreevar's theorem. Then they conjectured that a similar proof for Loewner's theorem should exist. The main goal of this short note is to solve their conjecture in the positive.

## 2. Main Result

Note that, if $\operatorname{dim} R_{f}<\infty$ then for all $y \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$ and all $P \in \mathbf{O}(d):=\left\{A \in \mathbf{G} \mathbf{L}_{d}(\mathbb{R}): A^{t}=A^{-1}\right\}$ the maps $\tau_{y}(g)(x)=g(x+y)$ and $O_{P}(g)(x)=g(P x)$ are well defined as operators from $R_{f}$ into $R_{f}$. In fact, they are automorphisms of this space, since they are injective and $\operatorname{dim} R_{f}<\infty$. Indeed, $\left(\tau_{y}\right)^{-1}=\tau_{-y}$ and $\left(O_{P}\right)^{-1}=O_{P^{-1}}=O_{P^{t}}$.

Let $X_{d}$ denote indistinctly either the space $\mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)^{\prime}$ of Schwartz complex valued distributions defined on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ or the space $C\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ of continuous complex valued functions defined on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$. For $f \in \mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)^{\prime}$ we can introduce the translation operator $\tau_{h}(f)\{\phi\}=f\left\{\tau_{-h}(\phi)\right\}$, where $h \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$ and $\phi \in \mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ is any test function,
and the operator

$$
O_{P}(f)\{\phi\}=\frac{1}{|\operatorname{det}(P)|} f\left\{O_{P^{-1}}(\phi)\right\}
$$

where $P \in \mathbf{G L}_{d}(\mathbb{E})$ is any invertible matrix, $\phi \in \mathcal{D}\left(\mathbb{R}^{d}\right)$ is any test function, and $O_{P^{-1}}(\phi)(x)=$ $\phi\left(P^{-1} x\right)$ for all $x \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$.

We demonstrate the following result, which is stronger than Loewner's theorem, since it works for distributions.

[^0]Theorem 2.1. Let $d \geq 2$ be a natural number, let $f \in X_{d}$ and assume that, for a certain finite dimensional space $V \subseteq X_{d}$ we have that:

- $f \in V$
- $V$ is translation invariant (i.e., $\tau_{h}(V) \subseteq V$ for all $h \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$ ).
- $V$ is invariant by orthogonal transformations of $\mathbb{R}^{d}$ (i.e., $O_{P}(V) \subseteq V$, for all $P \in \mathbf{O}(d)$ ). Then $f$ is, in distributional sense, an ordinary polynomial on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$. In particular, $f$ is equal almost everywhere to an ordinary polynomial and, if $f$ is a continuous ordinary function, then it is an ordinary polynomial.

Our proof is based on the following theorem
Theorem 2.2. Let $f$ be a complex valued distribution defined on $\mathbb{R}^{d}$. Assume that $q\left(\tau_{y}\right) f=0$ for all $y$ with $\|y\| \leq \delta$, for a certain polynomial $q(z)=a_{0}+a_{1} z+\cdots a_{n} z^{n}$ such that $a_{0} \neq 0$. Then $f$ is, in distributional sense, an ordinary polynomial.

Proof. By assumption, $q\left(\tau_{y}\right) f=0$ for all $y$ with $\|y\| \leq \delta$, which means that

$$
\begin{equation*}
0=\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k} \tau_{k y} f(x) \text { for all } y \in B_{d}(\delta):=\left\{h \in \mathbb{R}^{d}:\|h\|<\delta\right\} \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Assume that $y, h_{1} \in B_{d}(\delta / 2)$ (so that $\left.y^{*}=y-h_{1} \in B_{d}(\delta)\right)$ and use (1) with $y^{*}$ to conclude that:

$$
\begin{equation*}
0=\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k} \tau_{k y^{*}} f(x)=\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k} \tau_{k y-k h_{1}} f(x) \text { for all } y, h_{1} \in B_{d}(\delta / 2) \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Apply $\tau_{n h_{1}}$ to both sides of the equation. Then

$$
\begin{equation*}
0=\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k} \tau_{n h_{1}} \tau_{k y-k h_{1}} f(x)=\sum_{k=0}^{n} a_{k} \tau_{(n-k) h_{1}}\left(\tau_{k y} f\right)(x) \text { for all } y, h_{1} \in B_{d}(\delta / 2) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Taking differences between (3) and (1), we conclude that

$$
\begin{equation*}
0=\sum_{k=0}^{n-1} a_{k} \Delta_{(n-k) h_{1}}\left(\tau_{k y} f\right)(x) \text { for all } y, h_{1} \in B_{d}(\delta / 2) \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

We can repeat the argument, reducing the norm of $y, h_{1}$ to $\delta / 4, \delta / 8$, etc., which leads to the equation

$$
a_{0} \Delta_{h_{n}} \Delta_{2 h_{n-1}} \cdots \Delta_{(n-1) h_{2}} \Delta_{n h_{1}}(f)(x)=0 \text { for all } h_{1}, \cdots, h_{n} \in B_{d}\left(\delta / 2^{n}\right)
$$

The result follows from Montel's type version of Fréchet's theorem for distributions, since $a_{0} \neq 0$ by hyphotesis (see, e.g., [1, 2, 3, 4]).

We also use the following technical result, which is well known (see, for example, [7, 11, 12] and [6], for the original exposition of this result):

Lemma 2.3 (Frobenius, 1896). Let $V$ be a finite dimensional complex vector space. Assume that $T, S: V \rightarrow V$ are commuting linear operators (i.e., $T S=S T$ ). Then they are simultaneously triangularizable. In particular, the eigenvalues $\lambda_{i}(T), \lambda_{i}(S)$ and $\lambda_{i}(T S)$ of $T, S$ and $T S$, respectively, can be arranged, counting multiplicities, in such a way that $\lambda_{i}(T S)=\lambda_{i}(T) \lambda_{i}(S)$ for $i=1, \cdots, \operatorname{dim} V$.

Proof of Theorem 2.1. Obviously

$$
\tau_{y+z}=\tau_{y} \tau_{z}=\tau_{z} \tau_{y} \text { for all } y, z \in \mathbb{R}^{d}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\tau_{P y}=\left(O_{P}\right)^{-1} \tau_{y} O_{P}=O_{P^{t}} \tau_{y} O_{P} \text { for all } y \in \mathbb{R}^{d} \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

To demonstrate (5) we consider first the case of ordinary functions. In that setting it is clear that $\left(O_{P}\right)^{-1}=O_{(P)^{-1}}=O_{P^{t}}$ and

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left(O_{P^{-1} \tau_{y}} O_{P} g\right)(x) & =\left(O_{P^{-1} \tau_{y}(g(P x))=O_{P^{-1}}(g(P(x+y)))}\right. \\
& =O_{P^{-1}(g(P x+P y))=g\left(P^{-1} P x+P y\right)} \\
& =g(x+P y)=\tau_{P y}(g)(x),
\end{aligned}
$$

for every function $g$. Assume now that $V$ is a space of distributions and $g \in V$. Then, for every test function $\phi$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left(O_{P^{-1}} \tau_{y} O_{P}\right)(g)\{\phi\} & =O_{P^{-1}}\left(\tau_{y} O_{P}(g)\right)\{\phi\}=\frac{1}{\left|\operatorname{det}\left(P^{-1}\right)\right|}\left(\tau_{y} O_{P}(g)\right)\left\{O_{P}(\phi)\right\} \\
& =\frac{1}{\left|\operatorname{det}\left(P^{-1}\right)\right|} \tau_{y}\left(O_{P}(g)\right)\left\{O_{P}(\phi)\right\}=\frac{1}{\left|\operatorname{det}\left(P^{-1}\right)\right|}\left(O_{P}(g)\right)\left\{\tau_{-y} O_{P}(\phi)\right\} \\
& =\frac{1}{\left|\operatorname{det}\left(P^{-1}\right)\right|} \frac{1}{|\operatorname{det}(P)|} g\left\{O_{P^{-1}} \tau_{-y} O_{P}(\phi)\right\}=g\left\{O_{P^{-1}} \tau_{-y} O_{P}(\phi)\right\} \\
& =g\left\{\tau_{-P y}(\phi)\right\}=\tau_{P y}(g)\{\phi\},
\end{aligned}
$$

which is what we wanted to prove. It follows that
(a) For any $y \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$, the operators $\tau_{y}: V \rightarrow V$ and $\tau_{P y}: V \rightarrow V$ have the very same eigenvalues and characteristic polynomial.
(b) For any $y, z \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$, the operators $\tau_{y}: V \rightarrow V$ and $\tau_{z}: V \rightarrow V$ are simultaneously triangularizable, since they are commuting operators (i.e., $\tau_{y} \tau_{z}=\tau_{z} \tau_{y}$ ). In particular, it is possible to arrange the eigenvalues $\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y}\right), \lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{z}\right)$ and $\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y+z}\right)$ of $\tau_{y}, \tau_{z}$ and $\tau_{y+z}$, respectively, in such a way that

$$
\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y+z}\right)=\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y}\right) \lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{z}\right), \quad i=1, \cdots, N:=\operatorname{dim} V
$$

Let $y \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$. From $(a)$ we have that, for a certain permutation $\sigma$ of $\{1, \cdots, N\}$ (which depends on $P$ ),

$$
\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{P y}\right)=\lambda_{\sigma(i)}\left(\tau_{y}\right), i=1, \cdots, N
$$

Moreover, if we set $z=(P-I) y$, then $P y=y+(P-I) y)$ and (b) implies that:

$$
\lambda_{\sigma(i)}\left(\tau_{y}\right)=\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{P y}\right)=\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y}\right) \lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{(P-I) y}\right), i=1, \cdots, N .
$$

Hence

$$
\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{(P-I) y}\right)=\frac{\lambda_{\sigma(i)}\left(\tau_{y}\right)}{\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y}\right)}, i=1, \cdots, N
$$

since $\tau_{y}$ is an automorphism, which implies that $\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{y}\right) \neq 0$ for all $i$.
Take $y=e_{1}=(1,0, \cdots, 0) \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$. Let us consider the polynomial

$$
q(z)=\prod_{\sigma \in S_{N}} \prod_{i=1}^{N}\left(z-\frac{\lambda_{\sigma(i)}\left(\tau_{e_{1}}\right)}{\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{e_{1}}\right)}\right)
$$

where $S_{N}$ denotes the set of permutations of $\{1, \cdots, N\}$. Then $q(z)=a_{0}+a_{1} z+\cdots a_{m} z^{m}$ for certain coefficients $a_{k}$, with $m=N \cdot N!$, and $a_{0} \neq 0$ because all eigenvalues $\lambda_{i}\left(\tau_{e_{1}}\right)$ are different from 0 (since $\tau_{e_{1}}$ is injective). Moreover, $q(z)$ is a multiple of the characteristic polynomial of the operator $\tau_{(P-I) e_{1}}$, for every $P \in \mathbf{O}(d)$. It follows that $q(z)$ is a multiple of the characteristic
polynomial of $\tau_{z}$ for every $z \in \mathbb{R}^{d}$ whose norm is equal to the norm of $(P-I) e_{1}$ for some $P \in \mathbf{O}(d)$, since $\left\|z_{1}\right\|=\left\|z_{2}\right\|$ implies that there exist $P \in \mathbf{O}(d)$ such that $P z_{1}=z_{2}$, and $\tau_{z_{1}}, \tau_{P z_{1}}$ have the very same characteristic polynomial. Obviously, $\left\{\left\|(P-I) e_{1}\right\|: P \in \mathbf{O}(d)\right\}=[0,2]$, since $d>1$. Henceforth, Hamilton's theorem implies that $q\left(\tau_{z}\right)=0$ for all $\|z\| \leq 2$. Now we can apply Theorem 2.2 to conclude that $f$ is, in distributional sense, an ordinary polynomial.
Remark 2.4. For $d=1$ the result is false, since $V=\boldsymbol{\operatorname { s p a n }}\left\{2^{x}, 2^{-x}\right\}$ is invariant by isometries of $\mathbb{R}$.

## References

1. A. Aksoy, J. M. Almira, On Montel and Montel-Popoviciu Theorems in several variables, Aequationes Mathematicae, 89 (2015) 1335-1357.
2. J. M. Almira, Montel's theorem and subspaces of distributions which are $\Delta^{m}$-invariant, Numer. Functional Anal. Optimiz. 35 (4) (2014) 389-403.
3. J. M. Almira, K. F. Abu-Helaiel, On Montel's theorem in several variables, Carpathian Journal of Mathematics, 31 (2015), 1-10.
4. J. M. Almira, L. Székelyhidi, Montel-type theorems for exponential polynomials, Dem. Math. 49 (2) (2016) 197-212.
5. P. M. Anselone, J. Korevaar, Translation invariant subspaces of finite dimension, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. 15 (1964), 747-752.
6. G. Frobenius, Uber vertauschbare Matrizen, Sitzungsber. Akad. Wiss. Berlin 26 (1896) 601-614.
7. T. J. Lalfey, Simultaneous reduction of sets of matrices under similarity, Linear Algebra Appl. 84 (1986) 123-138.
8. P.G. Laird, R. McCAnn, On some characterizations of polynomials, Amer. Math. Monthly 91 (2) (1984) 114-116.
9. P.G. Laird, On characterizations of exponential polynomials, Pacific J. Math. 80 (1979) 503-507.
10. C. Loewner, On some transformation semigroups invariant under Euclidean and non-Euclidean isometries, J. Math. Mech. 8 (1959) 393-409.
11. N. H. McCoy, On the characteristic roots of matrix polynomials, Bull. Amer. Math. Sot. 42 (1936) 592-600.
12. H. Radjavi, P. Rosenthal, Simultaneous Triangularization, Springer-Verlag New York, Inc., 2000.

Departamento de Matemáticas, Universidad de Jaén, E.P.S. Linares, Campus Científico Tecnológico de Linares, Cinturón Sur s/n, 23700 Linares, Spain

E-mail address: jmalmira@ujaen.es


[^0]:    2010 Mathematics Subject Classification. 39B22, 39A70, 39B52.
    Key words and phrases. Functional equations, Schwartz distributions, Polynomials, Exponential polynomials, Montel type theorem.

