Recurrence relations for four-electron integrals over Gaussian basis functions

Giuseppe M. J. Barca and Pierre-François Loos

1) Research School of Chemistry, Australian National University, ACT 2601, Australia
2) Laboratoire de Chimie et Physique Quantiques, Université de Toulouse, CNRS, UPS, France

In the spirit of the Head-Gordon-Pople algorithm, we report vertical, transfer and horizontal recurrence relations for the efficient and accurate computation of four-electron integrals over Gaussian basis functions. Our recursive approach is a generalization of our algorithm for three-electron integrals [J. Chem. Theory Comput. 12, 1735 (2016)]. The RRs derived in the present study can be applied to a general class of multiplicative four-electron operators. In particular, we consider various types of four-electron integrals that may arise in explicitly-correlated F12 methods.

Keywords: three-electron integral, four-electron integral, many-electron integral, Gaussian basis function, explicitly-correlated method, F12 method, recurrence relation

I. INTRODUCTION

In 1985, starting from the Hylleraas functional \[^1,2\] and using the interelectronic distance \( r_{12} = |r_1 - r_2| \) as a correlation factor, Kutzelnigg derived the seminal form of the MP2-R12 equations.\[^3\] This explicitly-correlated method (more formally stated together with Klopper in 1987 \[^5\]) was later extended to higher level of theory and more accurate correlation factors \( f_{12} = f(r_{12}) \) \[^6-15\] such as Gaussian geminals

\[
f_{12} = \exp(-\lambda r_{12}^2),
\]

or Slater geminals

\[
f_{12} = \exp(-\lambda r_{12}).
\]

The resulting “F12 methods” achieve chemical accuracy for small organic molecules with relatively small Gaussian basis set \[^19,20\] and are quickly becoming the first-choice method for high accuracy.\[^19,20\]

However, the inclusion of the correlation factor \( f_{12} \) dredged up an old problem: in addition to two-electron integrals (traditional ones and new ones), three-electron integrals over \( f_{13}f_{23}, r_{12}^{-1}f_{13}, r_{12}^{-1}f_{13}f_{23} \) and as well as four-electron integrals over \( r_{12}^{-1}f_{14}f_{23}, r_{12}^{-1}f_{13}f_{34} \) and \( r_{12}^{-1}f_{13}f_{14} \) arise. Except when one uses Gaussian geminals \[^22,23\] these integrals are not known analytically and, at that time, the only way to evaluate them would have been via expensive Gauss-Legendre quadratures.\[^24,25\] Additionally, citing Kutzelnigg and Klopper, \[^26\] “even if fast procedures for the evaluation of these integrals were available, one would have to face the problem of the large number of these integrals; while that of two-electron integrals is \( \sim N^4 \), there are \( \sim N^6 \) three-electron and \( \sim N^8 \) four-electron integrals. The storing and manipulating of these integrals could be handled only for extremely small basis sets.”

Undoubtedly, in the late 80’s, the two-electron integrals technology was still in development.\[^27-34\] Nowadays, though still challenging, these integrals could be computed much more effectively via judicious recursive schemes, designing the quadrature only to the fundamental integrals.\[^35\] Another important remark is that the actual number of significant (i.e. greater than a given threshold) three- and four-electron integrals in a large system, is, at worst, \( O(N^3) \) or \( O(N^4) \). These kinds of scaling are achievable, for example, by exploiting robust density fitting \[^36\] or upper bound-based screening methods.\[^37\]

Nevertheless, the success of the R12 method was due to the decision of avoiding three- and four-electron integrals entirely through the insertion of the resolution of the identity (RI) \[^17,26,38\]

\[
\hat{I} \approx \sum_{\mu}^{N_{RI}} |\chi_\mu\rangle \langle \chi_\mu|.
\]

In this way, three- and four-electron integrals are approximated as linear combinations of products of more conventional two-electron integrals. Of course, the accuracy of the RI approximation \[^3\] relies entirely on the assumption that the

\[^a\) Corresponding author; Electronic mail: loos@irsamc.ups-tlse.fr\]
A contracted Gaussian-type function (CGF) is defined as a normalized sum of PGFs with \( A \)-type Gaussians.

The integral (i.e. the integral in which all eight basis functions are indicated) is a complete class of integrals from a shell-octet.

For example,  
\[
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4 \rangle \equiv \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | f_{1234} | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4 \rangle
\]

A contracted Gaussian-type function (CGF) is defined as a normalized sum of PGFs

\[
\psi^A_a(r) = \sum_{k=1}^{K_A} D_{ak} (x - A_x)^{a_x} (y - A_y)^{a_y} (z - A_z)^{a_z} e^{-\alpha_k |r - A|^2},
\]

where \( K_A \) is the degree of contraction and the \( D_{ak} \) are contraction coefficients. Throughout this paper, we use physicists' notations, and we write the integral over a four-electron operator as

\[
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4 | f_{1234} | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4 \rangle
\]

Additionally, square-bracketed integrals denote integrals over PGFs:

\[
[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4] \equiv [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | f_{1234} | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4]
\]

The fundamental integral (i.e. the integral in which all basis functions are \( s \)-type PGFs) is defined as \([0] \equiv [0000|0000] \) with \( 0 = (0, 0, 0) \). The Gaussian product rule reduces it from eight to four centers:

\[
[0] = S_1 S_2 S_3 S_4 \int \int \int \int \phi^A_a(r_1) \phi^A_a(r_2) \phi^A_a(r_3) \phi^A_a(r_4) f_{1234} \phi^A_b(r_1) \phi^A_b(r_2) \phi^A_b(r_3) \phi^A_b(r_4) dr_1 dr_2 dr_3 dr_4,
\]

where

\[
\zeta_i = \alpha_i + \beta_i, \quad \mathbf{z}_i = \alpha_i \mathbf{a}_i + \beta_i \mathbf{b}_i, \quad S_i = \exp \left( -\frac{\alpha_i \beta_i}{\zeta_i} \mathbf{a}_i \cdot \mathbf{b}_i \right),
\]

with \( \mathbf{a}_i, \mathbf{b}_i = \mathbf{a}_i - \mathbf{b}_i \). For conciseness, we will adopt a notation in which missing indices represent \( s \)-type Gaussians. For example, \([a_2 a_3] \) is a shorthand for \([0 a_2 a_3 | 0000] \). We will also use unbold indices, e.g. \([a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 b_2 b_3 b_4] \) to indicate a complete class of integrals from a shell-octet.
A. Four-electron operators

In the present study, we are particularly interested in the four-electron operators $g_{13}h_{23}i_{34}$ (trident) and $f_{12}h_{23}i_{34}$ (four-electron chain or 4-chain) because they can be required in explicitly-correlated methods such as F12 methods.\textsuperscript{17–20} Explicitly-correlated calculations may also require three-electron integrals over the (3-chain) $f_{12}h_{23}$ and (cyclic) $f_{12}g_{13}h_{23}$ operators, as well as two-electron integrals over $f_{12}$. However, we will eschew the study of the two-electron integrals here as they have been extensively studied in the past 25 years.\textsuperscript{11,13,15,26,40–49} Note that the nuclear attraction integrals can be easily obtained by taking the large-exponent limit of a $s$-type shell-pair. We refer the interested reader to Refs.\textsuperscript{34} and \textsuperscript{50} for more details about the computation of nuclear attraction integrals.

The structure of these operators is illustrated in Fig. 1 where we have adopted a diagrammatic representation. Starting with the “pacman” operator $f_{12}g_{13}h_{23}i_{34}$, we are going to show that one can easily derive all the RRs required to compute two-, three- and four-electron integrals following simple rules. Therefore, in the following, we will focus our analysis on this master “pacman” operator.

III. FUNDAMENTAL INTEGRALS

The first step required to compute integrals of arbitrary angular momentum is the computation of the (momentumless) fundamental integrals $|0\rangle$. These are derived starting from Eq. (8) using the Gaussian integral representation of each
TABLE I. Kernels $F(t)$ of the Gaussian integral representation for various $f_{12}$ operators. $δ(x)$ and $θ(x)$ are respectively the Dirac delta and Heaviside step functions, and $\text{erf}(x)$ and $\text{erfc}(x)$ are the error function and its complement version, respectively:$^{[23]}$

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$f_{12}$</th>
<th>$F(t)$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$1$</td>
<td>$δ(t)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r_{12}^{-1}$</td>
<td>$2/\sqrt{π}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r_{12}^{-2}$</td>
<td>$2t$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$(r_{12}^2 + λ^2)^{-1/2}$</td>
<td>$(2/\sqrt{π}) \exp(-λ^2t^2)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\exp(-λ r_{12})$</td>
<td>$(λ t^2/2π) \exp(-λ^2 t^{-2}/2)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r_{12}^{-1} \exp(-λ r_{12})$</td>
<td>$(2/\sqrt{π}) \exp(-λ^2 t^{-2}/2)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$\exp(-λ^2 r_{12}^2)$</td>
<td>$δ(t - λ)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r_{12}^{-1} \exp(λ r_{12})$</td>
<td>$(2/\sqrt{π}) θ(t - λ)$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$r_{12}^{-1} \text{erfc}(λ r_{12})$</td>
<td>$(2/\sqrt{π}) [1 - θ(t - λ)]$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

two-electron operator. For instance, we have

$$f_{12} = \int_0^∞ F(t_{12}) \exp(-t_{12}^2 r_{12}^2) dt_{12},$$  \hspace{1cm} (10)$$

where $F(t_{12})$ is a Gaussian kernel. Table I contains kernels $F(t)$ for a variety of important two-electron operators $f_{12}$. From the formulas in Table I one can also easily deduce the kernels for related functions, such as $f_{12}^2$, $f_{12}/r_{12}$, and $∇^2 f_{12}$, which are of interest in explicitly-correlated methods. More general kernels can be found in Ref. $^{[35]}$.

Next, the integration over $r_1, r_2, r_3$ and $r_4$ can be carried out, yielding

$$[0] = S_1 S_2 S_3 S_4 \iiint F(t_{12}) G(t_{13}) H(t_{23}) I(t_{34}) w_0(t) dt,$$  \hspace{1cm} (11)$$

where $t = (t_{12}, t_{13}, t_{23}, t_{34})$ and

$$w_0(t) = \left( \frac{π^4}{D(t)} \right)^{3/2} \exp\left[ -\frac{N(t)}{D(t)} \right].$$  \hspace{1cm} (12)$$

Defining the following polynomials

$$s_1 = t_{12}^2, \quad s_2 = t_{13}^2, \quad s_3 = t_{23}^2,$$  \hspace{1cm} (13a)$$

$$s_4 = t_{34}^2, \quad s_5 = t_{12}^2 t_{13} + t_{12}^2 t_{23} + t_{13}^2 t_{23}, \quad s_6 = t_{12}^2 t_{34},$$  \hspace{1cm} (13b)$$

$$s_7 = t_{13}^2 t_{34}, \quad s_8 = t_{23}^2 t_{34}, \quad s_9 = t_{12}^2 t_{13}^2 t_{34} + t_{12}^2 t_{23}^2 t_{34} + t_{13}^2 t_{23}^2 t_{34}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (13c)$$

we have

$$D(t) = ζ_1 ζ_2 ζ_3 ζ_4 + (ζ_1 + ζ_2) ζ_3 ζ_4 s_1 + ζ_2 ζ_4 (ζ_1 + ζ_3) s_2 + ζ_1 ζ_4 (ζ_2 + ζ_3) s_3 + ζ_1 ζ_2 (ζ_3 + ζ_4) s_4 + ζ_2 (ζ_1 + ζ_2 + ζ_3) s_5 + (ζ_1 + ζ_2) (ζ_3 + ζ_4) s_6 + ζ_2 (ζ_1 + ζ_3 + ζ_4) s_7 + ζ_1 (ζ_2 + ζ_3 + ζ_4) s_8 + (ζ_1 + ζ_2 + ζ_3 + ζ_4) s_9,$$  \hspace{1cm} (14a)$$

$$N(t) = ζ_3 ζ_4 κ_{12} s_1 + ζ_2 ζ_4 κ_{13} s_2 + ζ_1 ζ_4 κ_{23} s_3 + ζ_1 ζ_2 κ_{34} s_4 + ζ_4 (κ_{12} + κ_{13} + κ_{23}) s_5 + [(ζ_3 + ζ_4) κ_{12} + (ζ_1 + ζ_2) κ_{34}] s_6 + ζ_2 (κ_{13} + κ_{14} + κ_{34}) s_7 + ζ_1 (κ_{23} + κ_{24} + κ_{34}) s_8 + (κ_{12} + κ_{13} + κ_{14} + κ_{23} + κ_{24} + κ_{34}) s_9,$$  \hspace{1cm} (14b)$$

where $κ_{ij} = ζ_ιζ_j |Z_i - Z_j|^2$.

Following Obara and Saita,$^{[23]2}$ vertical RRs (VRRs) are obtained by differentiation of Eq. (11) with respect to the center coordinates. Therefore, one can show that (11) has to be generalized to the following form:

$$[0]^m = S_1 S_2 S_3 S_4 \iiint F(t_{12}) G(t_{13}) H(t_{23}) I(t_{34}) w_m(t) dt,$$  \hspace{1cm} (15)$$
where \( m = (m_1, m_2, m_3, m_4, m_5, m_6, m_7, m_8, m_9) \) is, for the pacman operator, a nine-dimensional auxiliary index, and

\[
w_m(t) = w_0(t) \prod_{k=1}^{\dim m} \left[ \frac{s_k}{D(t)} \right]^{m_k}.
\]  

(16)

As reported in Fig. 1 while the fundamental integrals of the pacman operator contains 9 auxiliary indices (i.e. \( \dim m = 9 \)), the two interesting four-electron operators (trident and chain) contains 7. The cyclic and chain three-electron operators have only four and three, respectively, while the two-electron chain operator has a single \( m \) component (i.e. \( \dim m = 1 \)). These numbers are drastically reduced if one uses Gaussian geminals due to their factorization properties.\(^{33}\)

IV. RECURRENCE RELATIONS

In this Section, we report vertical, transfer and horizontal RRs for the computation of four-electron integrals of arbitrary angular momentum. In particular, we refer the interested readers to the appendix of Ref. \(^{35}\) for more details about how to derive these VRRs à la Ahlrichs.\(^{53}\)

A. Vertical recurrence relations

To build angular momentum over center \( A_1 \), we have derived the following 24-term VRR:

\[
[a^+_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^m = Z_1 A_1 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^m - \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{12} [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(1)} - \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{13} [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(2)} \\
- \zeta_1 (\zeta_2 Z_{12} + \zeta_3 Z_{13}) [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(5)} - \zeta_2 (\zeta_1 + \zeta_4) Z_{12} [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(6)} \\
- \zeta_2 (\zeta_3 Z_{13} + \zeta_4 Z_{14}) [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(7)} - (\zeta_2 Z_{12} + \zeta_3 Z_{13} + \zeta_4 Z_{14}) [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \\
+ \frac{a_1}{2 c_1} \left\{ [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^m - \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{12} [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(1)} - \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{13} [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(2)} \\
- \zeta_4 (\zeta_2 + \zeta_3) [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(5)} - \zeta_2 \zeta_3 + \zeta_4) [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(6)} \\
- \zeta_2 (\zeta_3 + \zeta_4) [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(7)} - (\zeta_2 + \zeta_3 + \zeta_4) [a^-_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \right\} \\
+ \frac{a_2}{2} \left\{ \zeta_3 \zeta_4 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(1)} + \zeta_2 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(5)} + (\zeta_3 + \zeta_4) [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(6)} + [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \right\} \\
+ \frac{a_3}{2} \left\{ \zeta_2 \zeta_4 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(2)} + \zeta_2 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(5)} + \zeta_2 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(7)} + [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \right\} \\
+ \frac{a_4}{2} \left\{ \zeta_2 a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4^{(7)} + [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \right\},
\]  

(17)

where the superscript + or − denotes an increment or decrement of one unit of Cartesian angular momentum. (Thus, \( a^\pm \) is analogous to \( a \pm 1 \) in the notation of Obara and Saika.) The value in the curly superscript indicates which component of the auxiliary index vector \( m \) is incremented.

Because Eq. (17) builds angular momentum over \( A_1 \) and all four bra centers have non-zero angular momentum, we will call this expression VRR\(_A^A_1\). The VRRs used to obtain \( [a^+_1 a_2 a_3]^m, [a^+_1 a_2]^m \) and \( [a^+_1]^m \) can be easily derived from Eq. (17) by setting successively \( a_4 = 0, a_3 = 0 \) and \( a_2 = 0 \). These are respectively named VRR\(_A^A_1, VRR_{A_2}^{A_1}, VRR_{A_3}^{A_1}\).

One can easily derive VRRs for the trident and 4-chain operators following the simple rules given in Fig. 1. We obtain the VRRs for the trident operator by removing the terms \{1\} and \{6\}. Similarly, 4-chain VRRs are obtained by removing the terms \{2\} and \{7\}. This yields a 18- and 17-term VRR\(_A^A_1\) for the trident and 4-chain operators, respectively.

VRR\(_A^A_2, VRR_{A_3}^{A_1}\) and VRR\(_A^A_4\) are used to build angular momentum over \( A_2, A_3 \) and \( A_4 \), respectively. Their
expressions are

\[
[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^m = Z_2 A_2[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^m + \zeta_1 \zeta_2 \zeta_3 Z_{12}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(11)} - \zeta_1 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{23}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(13)} \\
+ \zeta_1 \zeta_3 Z_{23} - \zeta_4 Z_{12}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4] \left[ a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 \right]^{(5)} + \zeta_1 (\zeta_3 + \zeta_4) Z_{12}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(6)} \\
\]

Again, the corresponding expressions for VRR are

\[
\frac{\partial}{\partial \epsilon} \left[ a_1 a_2 \zeta_2 a_3 a_4 \right]^m = \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(4)} + \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(5)} - \zeta_4 (\zeta_1 + \zeta_2) Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(6)} \\
+ \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(7)} + \zeta_1 \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(8)} \\
+ \zeta_2 \zeta_3 \zeta_4 Z_{34}[a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4]^{(9)} \\
\]

Again, the number of terms for each of these VRRs is reported in Fig. 2 for the 3-chain f_{12}h_{23} (top left), cyclic f_{12}g_{13}h_{23} (top right), 4-chain f_{12}h_{23}t_{34} (bottom left) and trident g_{13}h_{23}t_{34} (bottom right) operators.
FIG. 2. Graph representation of the VRRs for the 3-chain \( f_{12} h_{23} \) (top left), cyclic \( f_{12} g_{13} h_{23} \) (top right), 4-chain \( f_{12} h_{23} i_{34} \) (bottom left) and trident \( g_{13} h_{23} i_{34} \) (bottom right) operators. The edge label gives the number of terms in the corresponding VRR. The red path corresponds to the algorithm generating the smallest number of intermediates.
B. Transfer recurrence relations

TRRs redistribute angular momentum between centers hosting to different electrons. Using translational invariance, one can derive

\[
\begin{align*}
[a_1^+ a_2 a_3 a_4] = & \frac{a_1}{2\xi_1} [a_1^+ a_2 a_3 a_4] + \frac{a_2}{2\xi_1} [a_1 a_2^+ a_3 a_4] + \frac{a_3}{2\xi_1} [a_1 a_2 a_3^+ a_4] + \frac{a_4}{2\xi_1} [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4^+] \\
& - \frac{\xi_2}{\xi_1} [a_1^+ a_2 a_3 a_4] - \frac{\xi_3}{\xi_1} [a_1 a_2^+ a_3 a_4] - \frac{\xi_4}{\xi_1} [a_1 a_2 a_3^+ a_4] \\
& - \frac{\beta_1}{\xi_1} A_1 B_1 + \frac{\beta_2}{\xi_1} A_2 B_2 + \frac{\beta_3}{\xi_1} A_3 B_3 + \frac{\beta_4}{\xi_1} A_4 B_4 [a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4].
\end{align*}
\]

C. Horizontal recurrence relations

The so-called HRRs enable to shift momentum between centers over the same electronic coordinate:

\[
\begin{align*}
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1^+ \rangle = & \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 \rangle + A_1 B_4 \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_1 \rangle, \quad (22a) \\
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2^+ b_3 \rangle = & \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3 \rangle + A_2 B_3 \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3 \rangle, \quad (22b) \\
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2^+ b_3^+ \rangle = & \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3^+ \rangle + A_2 B_2 \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3^+ \rangle, \quad (22c) \\
\langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2^+ b_3 b_4 \rangle = & \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3 b_4 \rangle + A_2 B_1 \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | b_2 b_3 b_4 \rangle. \quad (22d)
\end{align*}
\]

Note that HRRs can be applied to contracted integrals because they are independent of the contraction coefficients and exponents.
V. ALGORITHM

In this Section, we describe a recursive scheme for the computation of three- and four-electron integrals based on a late contraction scheme à la Head-Gordon-Pople (HGP). The general skeleton of the algorithm is shown in Fig. 3 for two representative examples: the 3-chain operator \( f_{12g} \) (left) and the 4-chain operator \( f_{12h} \) (right). Let us focus on the 3-chain operator.

To compute a class of three-electron integrals \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 | b_1 b_2 b_3 \rangle \), starting from the fundamental integrals \( \langle 000 \rangle \), we first build up angular momentum over center \( A_3 \) with the 6-term VRR1 to obtain \( \langle 00a_3 \rangle \). Then, we use the 10-term VRR2 over \( A_2 \) to obtain \( \langle 0a_2 a_3 \rangle \). Finally, we build up momentum over the last bra center \( A_1 \) using the 9-term VRR3 to get \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 \rangle \).

Note that, in our previous paper, we claimed that it would be computationally cheaper to use the 6-term TRR instead of VRR3 because the number of terms in the TRR is much smaller than in VRR3. However, we have found that the number of intermediates (i.e., the number of pre-computed classes needed to calculate a given class) required by the paths involving the TRR is much larger (see Table I). This can be easily understood noticing that, to increase the momentum by one unit on the last center, one must increase the momentum by the same amount on all the other centers (as evidenced by the second term in the right-hand side of Eq. (21)). Hence, the TRR is computationally expensive for three- and four-electron integrals due to the large number of centers.

As illustrated in the top left graph of Fig. 2, other paths, corresponding to different VRRs, are possible. However, we have found that they do generate a larger number of intermediates, as reported in Table II.

Similarly to the 3-chain operator, for the 4-chain operator, we get \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 \rangle \) by successively building up momentum over \( A_4, A_3, A_2, \) and \( A_1 \). The number of intermediates required by the other paths are gathered in Table II. Again, the paths involving the 8-term TRR (reported in Eq. (21)) are much more expensive.

The last two steps of the algorithm are common to the three- and four-electron integral schemes. Following the HGP algorithm, we contract the integrals: \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | 000 \rangle \) to form \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 a_4 | 0000 \rangle \) in the four-electron case, or \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 | 000 \rangle \) to form \( \langle a_1 a_2 a_3 | 0000 \rangle \) in the three-electron case. More details about the contraction step can be found in Ref. 34.

VI. CONCLUDING REMARKS

In this study, we have reported recurrence relations (RRs) for the efficient and accurate computation of four-electron integrals over Gaussian basis functions and a general class of multiplicative four-electron operators of the form \( f_{12g13} \). Starting from this master operator, one can easily derive the RRs for various operators arising in explicitly-correlated methods following simple diagrammatic rules (see Fig. 1).

Here, we have derived three types of RRs: i) starting from the fundamental integrals, vertical RRs (VRRs) allow to increase the angular momentum over the bra centers; ii) the transfer RR (TRR) redistributes angular momentum between centers hosting different electrons, and can be used instead of the VRR on the last bra center; iii) the horizontal RRs (HRRs) enable to shift momentum from the bra to the ket centers corresponding to the same electronic coordinate. Importantly, HRRs can be applied to contracted integrals.

Finally, after carefully studying the different paths one can follow to build up angular momentum (see Fig. 2), we have proposed a late-contraction recursive scheme which minimizes the number of intermediates to be computed (see Fig. 3). We believe our approach represents a major step towards a fast and accurate computational scheme for three- and four-electron integrals within explicitly-correlated methods. It also paves the way to contraction-effective methods for these types of integrals. In particular, an early contraction scheme would have significant computational benefits.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

P.F.L. thanks the NCI National Facility for generous grants of supercomputer time, and the Australian Research Council for a Discovery Project grant (DP140104071).

1 E. A. Hylleraas, Z. Phys. 48, 469 (1928).
The path generating the minimum number of intermediates is highlighted in bold. The number of terms in the RRs and the associated incremental center are also reported.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Integral</th>
<th>type</th>
<th>operator</th>
<th>path</th>
<th>number of terms</th>
<th>centers</th>
<th>integral class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>two-electron</td>
<td>$f_{12}$</td>
<td>VV</td>
<td>(4,6)</td>
<td>(A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VT</td>
<td>(4,4)</td>
<td>(A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>three-electron chain</td>
<td>$f_{12}h_{23}$</td>
<td>VVV</td>
<td>(6,7,12)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₁,A₂)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVV</td>
<td>(6,10,9)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVV</td>
<td>(8,9,9)</td>
<td>(A₂₃,A₁)</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVT</td>
<td>(6,7,6)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₁,A₂)</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>246</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVT</td>
<td>(6,10,6)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>314</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVT</td>
<td>(8,8,6)</td>
<td>(A₂₃,A₁)</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>cyclic</td>
<td>$f_{1293}h_{23}$</td>
<td>VVV</td>
<td>(8,10,12)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>469</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVT</td>
<td>(8,10,6)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>four-electron chain</td>
<td>$f_{12}h_{23}i_{34}$</td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(10,11,20,24)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₁,A₃,A₂)</td>
<td>465</td>
<td>13,781</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(10,18,20,17)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₂,A₃,A₁)</td>
<td>436</td>
<td>12,535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(14,14,20,17)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₃,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>433</td>
<td>12,704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(14,18,16,17)</td>
<td>(A₂₃,A₄,A₁)</td>
<td>435</td>
<td>12,863</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(10,11,20,8)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₁,A₃,A₂)</td>
<td>532</td>
<td>16,295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(10,18,20,8)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₄,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>560</td>
<td>17,029</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(14,14,20,8)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₄,A₁)</td>
<td>559</td>
<td>17,487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(14,18,16,8)</td>
<td>(A₂₃,A₄,A₁)</td>
<td>543</td>
<td>16,612</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>trident</td>
<td>$g_{13}h_{23}i_{34}$</td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(10,12,14,28)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₂,A₁,A₃)</td>
<td>445</td>
<td>13,139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(10,12,24,18)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₂,A₃,A₁)</td>
<td>447</td>
<td>13,381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(10,20,16,18)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₄,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>418</td>
<td>12,447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVV</td>
<td>(16,14,16,18)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₄,A₁)</td>
<td>418</td>
<td>12,054</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(10,12,14,8)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₂,A₁,A₃)</td>
<td>470</td>
<td>13,306</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(10,12,24,8)</td>
<td>(A₄,A₂,A₃,A₁)</td>
<td>546</td>
<td>16,917</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(10,20,16,8)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₄,A₂,A₁)</td>
<td>521</td>
<td>15,515</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>VVVT</td>
<td>(16,14,16,8)</td>
<td>(A₃,A₂,A₄,A₁)</td>
<td>499</td>
<td>13,969</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---