Skepxels: Spatio-temporal Image Representation of Human Skeleton Joints for Action Recognition

Jian Liu, Naveed Akhtar, Ajmal Mian

School of Computer Science and Software Engineering
The University of Western Australia

Abstract. Human skeleton joints are popular for action analysis since they can be easily extracted from videos to discard background noises. However, current skeleton representations do not fully benefit from machine learning with CNNs. We propose “Skepxels” a spatio-temporal representation for skeleton sequences to fully exploit the correlations between joints using the kernels of CNN. We transform skeleton videos into images of flexible dimensions using Skepxels and develop a CNN-based framework for effective human action recognition using the resulting images. Skepxels encode rich spatio-temporal information about the skeleton joints in the frames by maximizing a unique distance metric, defined collaboratively over the distinct joint arrangements used in the skeletal images. Moreover, they are flexible in encoding compound semantic notions such as location and speed of the joints. The proposed action recognition exploits the representation in a hierarchical manner by first capturing the micro-temporal relations between the skeleton joints with the Skepxels and then exploiting their macro-temporal relations by computing the Fourier Temporal Pyramids over the CNN features of the skeletal images. We extend the Inception-ResNet CNN architecture with the proposed method and improve the state-of-the-art accuracy by 4.4% on the large scale NTU human activity dataset. On the medium-sized NUCLA and UTH-MHAD datasets, our method outperforms the existing results by 5.7% and 9.3% respectively.

Keywords: Skeleton, CNN, Spatio-temporal, Action Recognition.

1 Introduction

Extracting human skeleton joints from videos to perform action recognition is a popular technique as it is robust to the variations in clothing, illumination condition and background. Moreover, recent methods can extract skeleton data in real-time from single view RGB videos. Convolutional Neural Networks (CNNs) are popular for processing raw images because they effectively exploit the correlation between the local pixels in the images, which is the key to accurate image classification. We envisage that higher human action recognition accuracy can be achieved analogously by capitalizing on the correlations between the skeleton joints. This is possible by arranging the skeleton joints in images and allowing CNNs to be directly trained on such images. However,
the low number of joints and the inherent dissimilarity between the skeletons and images restrict the utility of CNNs for processing the skeleton data.

Previous attempts [16,17] of using CNNs for human skeleton data generally use the skeleton joints of a video frame to form an image column. This severely limits the number of joints per frame in the receptive field of the 2D kernels of the CNNs, restricting the kernel’s capacity to exploit the correlations between multiple skeleton joints. These methods also find it inevitable to up-sample the skeleton data to construct appropriate size images for using pre-trained networks. On one hand, up-sampled images suffer from ill-defined semantics; on the other, the image generation process adds noise to the data. Finally, existing methods do not take into account the different ways in which skeleton joints can be arranged to form an image.

We propose an atomic visual unit Skepxel - skeleton picture element or skeleton pixel, to construct skeletal images of flexible dimensions that can be directly processed by modern CNN architectures without any re-sampling. Skepxels are constructed by organizing a set of distinct skeleton joint arrangements from multiple frames into a single tensor. The set is chosen under a unique distance metric that is collectively defined over the joint arrangements for each frame. Unlike previous works where skeleton joints of a frame were arranged in a column, we arrange them in a 2D grid to take full advantage of the 2D kernels in CNNs. The temporal evolution of the joints is captured by employing Skepxels from multiple frames into one image. Thus, the resulting image is a compact representation of rich spatio-temporal information about the action. Owing to the systematic construction of the skeletal images, it is also possible to encode multiple semantic notions about the joints in a single image - shown by encoding “location” and “velocity” of the joints.

We also contribute a framework that uses the proposed Skepxels representation for human action recognition. To that end, we hierarchically capture the micro-temporal relations between the joints in the frames using Skepxels and exploit the macro-temporal relations between the frames by computing the Fourier Temporal Pyramids [18] of the CNN features of the skeletal images. We demonstrate the use of skeletal images of different sizes with the Inception-ResNet [19]. Moreover, we also enhance the network architecture for the proposed framework. The proposed technique is thoroughly evaluated using the NTU Human Activity Dataset [20], Northwestern-UCLA Multiview Dataset [21] and UTD Multimodal Human Action Dataset [22]. Our approach improves the state-of-the-art performance on the large scale dataset [20] by 4.4%, whereas the gain on the remaining two datasets is 5.7% and 9.3%.

2 Related Work

With the easy availability of reliable human skeleton data from RGB-D sensors, the use of skeleton information in human action recognition is becoming very popular. Skeleton based action analysis is becoming even more promising because of the possibility of extracting skeleton data in real time using a single RGB
camera [5]. Zanfir et al [23] proposed a moving pose descriptor which considers both pose information and the differential quantities of the skeleton joints for human action recognition. Du et al [17] transformed the skeleton sequences into images by concatenating the joint coordinates as vectors and arranged these vectors in a chronological order as columns of an image. The generated images are resized and passed through a series of adaptive filter banks. Although effective, their approach fails to exploit the local correlation of joints in skeletons.

Veeriah et al [24] proposed to use a differential Recurrent Neural Network (dRNN) to learn the salient spatio-temporal structure in a skeleton action. They used the notion of “Derivative of States” to quantify the information gain caused by the salient motions between the successive frames, which guides the dRNN to gate the information that is memorized through time. Their method relies on concatenating 5 types of hand-crafted skeleton features to train the proposed network. Similarly, Du et al [5] applied a hierarchical RNN to model skeleton actions. They divided the human skeleton into five parts according to human physical structure. Each part is fed into a bi-directional RNN and the outputs are hierarchically fused for the higher layers.

Shahroudy et al [25] also used the division of body parts and proposed a multimodal-multipart learning method to represent the dynamics and appearance of body. They selected the discriminative body parts by integrating a part selection process into their learning framework. Their method is based on depth and skeleton data and uses the LOP (local occupancy patterns) and the HON4D (histogram of oriented 4D normals) as features. Vemulapalli and Chellappa [6] used rolling maps to represent skeletons as points in the Lie group, and modeled human actions as curves in the Lie group. By combing the logarithm map with the rolling maps, they managed to unwrap the action curves and performed classification in the non-Euclidean space.

Huang et al [26] incorporated the Lie group structure into deep learning, to transform the high-dimensional Lie group trajectory into temporally aligned Lie group features for skeleton-based action recognition. Their learning structure generalizes the traditional neural network model to non-Euclidean Lie groups. Kerola et al [27] used spatio-temporal key points and skeletons to represent an action as a temporal sequence of graphs, and then applied the spectral graph wavelet transform to create the action descriptors. Ke et al [16] transformed a skeleton sequence into three clips of gray-scale images. Each clip consists of four images, which encode the spatial relationship between the joints by inserting reference joints into the arranged joint chains. They employed the pre-trained VGG19 model to extract image features and applied the temporal mean pooling to represent an action. A Multi-Task Learning was proposed for classification.

Wang [7] proposed a two-stream RNN architecture to simultaneously exploit the spatial relationship of joints and temporal dynamics of the skeleton sequences. In the spatial RNN stream, they used a chain-like sequence and a traversal sequence to model the spatial dependency, which restricts modeling all possibilities of the joint movements. Kim and Reiter [28] proposed a Res-TCN architecture to learn spatial-temporal representation for skeleton actions. They
constructed per-frame inputs to the Res-TCN by flating 3D coordinates of the joints and concatenating values for all the joints in a skeleton. This method imports interpretability for skeleton action data, however, it does not effectively leverage the rich spatio-temporal relationships between different body joints.

To better represent the structure of skeleton data, Liu et al. [29] proposed a tree traversal algorithm to take the adjacency graph of the body joints into account. They processed the joints in top-down and bottom-up directions to keep the contextual information from both the descendants and the ancestors of the joints. Although this traversal algorithm discovers spatial dependency patterns, it has the limitation that the dependency of joints from different tree branches can not be easily modeled.

3 Proposed Approach

Restricted by the small number of joints in a human skeleton, existing approaches for converting the skeleton data into images generally result in smaller size images than what is required for the mainstream CNN architectures e.g. VGG [30], Inception [31], ResNet [32]. Consequently, the images are up-sampled to fit the desired network architectures which imports unnecessary noise in the data. This also compromises the effectiveness of the network kernels that are unable to operate on physically meaningful discrete joints. One potential solution is to design new CNN architectures that are better suited to the smaller images. However, small input image size restricts the receptive fields of the convolution kernels as well as the network depth. As a result, the network may not be able to appropriately model the skeleton data.

In this paper, we address this problem by mapping the skeleton data from a fixed length sequence to an image with the help of a basic building block (similar to pixel). The resulting image is rich in both spatial and temporal information of the skeleton sequences, and can be constructed to match arbitrary input dimensions of the existing network architectures. The approach is explained below.

3.1 Skeleton Picture Elements (Skepxels)

We propose to map a skeleton sequence to an image $I \in \mathbb{R}^{H \times W \times 3}$ with the help of Skepxels. A Skepxel is a tensor $\psi \in \mathbb{R}^{h \times w \times 3}$ obtained by arranging the indices of the skeleton joints in a 2D-grid and encoding their coordinate values along the third dimension. We treat the skeleton in a video as a set $S \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{3}$ such that its $j^{th}$ element, i.e. $s_j \in \mathbb{R}^{3}$ represents the Cartesian coordinates of the $j^{th}$ skeleton joint. Thus, the cardinality of $S$, i.e. $|S| \in \mathbb{R}$ denotes the total number of joints in the skeleton. For $\psi$, it entails $h \times w = |S|$. This formulation allows us to represent a Skepxel as a three-channel image patch, as illustrated in Fig. 1. We eventually construct the image $I$ by concatenating multiple Skepxels for a skeleton sequence.

Owing to the square shaped kernels of CNN architectures, the skeletal information in images is likely to be processed more effectively for square/near square
shaped building blocks of the images. Therefore, our representation constrains the height and the width of the Skepxels to be as similar as possible.

### 3.2 Compact spatial coding with Skepxels

A Skepxel constructed for a given skeleton frame encodes the spatial locations of the skeleton joints. Considering the convolution operations involved in CNN learning, it is apparent that different arrangements of the joints in a Skepxel can result in a different behavior of the models. This is fortuitous, as we can encode more information in the image $I$ for the CNNs by constructing it with multiple Skepxels that employ different joint arrangements. However, the image must use only a few (but highly relevant) Skepxels for keeping the representation of the skeleton sequence compact.

Let $A \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{h \times w}$ be a set of 2D-arrays, with its $i^{th}$ element $A_i \in \mathbb{R}^{h \times w}$ representing the $i^{th}$ possible arrangement of the skeleton joints for a Skepxel. The cardinality of this set can be given as $|A| = (h \times w)!$. Even for a video containing only a 25-joint skeleton, the total number of possible arrangements of the joints for a Skepxel is $\sim 1.55 \times 10^{25}$. Assume that we wish to use only $m$ Skepxels in $I$ for the sake of compactness, we must then select the joint arrangements for those Skepxels from a possible $|A|C_m$ combinations, which becomes a prohibitively large number for the practical cases (e.g. $(4 \times 4)!C_{16} > 10^{199}$). Therefore, a principled approach is required to choose the suitable arrangements of the joints to form the desired Skepxels.

To select the $m$ arrangements for the same number of Skepxels, we define a metric $\Delta(A^m) \rightarrow \gamma$ over an arbitrary subset $A^m$ of $A$, where $|A^m| = m$, such that

$$\Delta(A^m) = \sum_{j=1}^{|A^m|} \sum_{i=1}^{|S|} \delta(\alpha_i, A^m_j).$$

(1)

In Eq. (1), $A^m_j$ denotes the $j^{th}$ element of $A^m$ and $\alpha_i$ is the $i^{th}$ element of the set $\{1, 2, ..., |S|\}$. The function $\delta(\cdot, \cdot)$ computes the cumulative radial distance.

**Fig. 1** Illustration of a Skepxel rendered as an RGB image patch. The numbers on skeleton and color image share the joint description. e.g. 3-neck, 18-right knee, 21-spine, etc.

**Fig. 2** Illustration of the employed definition of the radial distance on $5 \times 5$ grids. If the joint $\alpha_i$ is located at [1,1] position in $A^m_j$, the left $5 \times 5$ grid is used. For the joint location [4,2], the right grid is used. There are 25 such grids in total to measure the distance of skeleton joints among $m$ arrangements.
between the location of the joint $α_i$ in $A^m_j$ and its locations in the remaining elements of $A^m$. As per the definition of $Δ(\cdot)$, $γ$ is a distance metric defined over a set of $m$ possible arrangements of the skeleton joints such that a higher value of $γ$ implies a better scattering of the joints in the considered $m$ arrangements. The notion of the radial distance used in Eq. (1) is illustrated in Fig. 2. Noticing the image patterns in the figure, we can see the relevance of this metric for the CNNs that employ square shaped kernels, as compared to the other metrics, e.g. Manhattan distance.

Due to better scattering, the skeleton joint arrangements with the larger $γ$ values are generally preferred by the CNN architectures to achieve higher accuracy. Moreover, different sets of arrangements with similar $γ$ values were found to achieve similar accuracies. Interestingly, this implies that for the CNNs the relative positions of the joints in the Skepxels become more important as compared to their absolute positions. This observation preempts us to construct Skepxels with the skeleton joint arrangements based on the semantics of the joints. On the other hand, selection of the best set of arrangements from the $\mid A\mid C_m$ possibilities is an NP-hard problem for all practical cases.

We devise a pragmatic strategy to find a suitable set of the skeleton joint arrangements for the desired $m$ Skepxels. That is, we empirically choose a threshold $γ_t$ for the Skepxels and generate $m$ matrices in $\mathbb{R}^{h \times w}$ such that the coefficients of the matrices are sampled uniformly at random in the range $[1, h \times w]$, without replacement. We consider these matrices as the elements of $A^m$ if their $γ$ value is larger than $γ_t$. We use the resulting $A^m$ to construct the $m$ Skepxels. The Skepxels thus created encode a largely varied skeleton joint arrangements in a compact manner. Fig. 3 illustrates three Skepxels created by the proposed scheme for a single skeleton frame containing 25 joints. The Skepxels are shown as RGB image patches. In our approach, we let $m = H/h$ and construct a tensor $Ψ \in \mathbb{R}^{H \times W \times 3}$ by the row-concatenation of the Skepxels $ψ_{i \in \{1,2,\ldots,m\}}$. The constructed tensor $Ψ$ is rich in the spatial information of the joints in a single frame of the video.

![Fig. 3](image1.png) A group of Skepxels generated for a single skeleton frame. The same color corresponds to the same joint. Only joint number 20 is marked for better visibility.

![Fig. 4](image2.png) Illustration of Skepxels for a sequence of frames. The same location corresponds to the same joint. Only three Skepxels for three frames are shown.
3.3 Compact temporal coding with Skepxels

To account for the temporal dimension in a sequence of the skeleton frames, we compute the tensor $\Psi_i$ for the $i^{th}$ frame in the $n$-frame sequence and concatenate those tensors in a column-wise manner to construct the desired image $I$. As illustrated in Fig. 4 for a sequence of frames the appearance of a Skepxel changes specifically at the locations of the active joints for the action - indicating effective encoding of the action dynamics by Skepxels. The concatenation of $\Psi_i \in \{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ ensures that the dynamics are recorded in $I$ under $m$ suitable Skepxels, making the representation spatially and temporally rich. The formation of the final image by concatenating $\Psi_i, \forall i$ is illustrated in Fig. 5.

Different action videos may contain various number of skeletal frames. For the videos that comprise the skeleton sequences with more than $n$ frames, we create multiple images from the same video and label them according to the action label. For the videos with fewer than $n$ frames, we found that the simple strategy of interpolating between the frames works well to construct the image of the desired size. Note that, the images resulting from the proposed method capture the temporal dynamics in the raw skeleton data. By fixing the length of the temporal window to $n$, the images are able to encode the micro-temporal movements that are expected to model the fine motion patterns contributing to the classification of the entire action video. In Section 3.7, we also discuss the exploitation of the macro-temporal relationships with the proposed representation.

3.4 Modeling joint speed with Skepxels

The modular approach to construct images with the Skepxels not only allows us to easily match the input dimensions of an existing CNN architecture, it also provides the flexibility to encode a notion that is semantically different than the “locations” of the skeleton joints. We exploit this fact to extend our representation to the skeleton joint “speeds” in the frame sequences. To that end, we construct the Skepxels similar to the procedure described above, however instead
of using the Cartesian coordinate values for the joints we use the differences of these values for the same joints in the consecutive frames. A Skepoxel thus creates encodes the speeds of the joint movements, where the time unit is governed by the video frame-rate. We refer to the final tensors constructed with the joint coordinates as the location images, and the tensors constructed using the joint speeds as the velocity images.

For many actions, the speed variations among different skeleton joints is an important cue for distinguishing between them (e.g. walking and running), and it is almost always supplementary to the information encoded in the absolute locations of the joints. Therefore, in our representation, we augment the final image by appending the three speed channels \( dx, dy, dz \) to the three location channels \( x, y, z \). This augmentation is illustrated in Fig. 6. We note that unless allowed by the CNN architecture under consideration, the augmentation with the speed channels is not mandatory in our representation. Nevertheless, it is desirable for better action recognition accuracy, which will become evident from our experiments in Section 5.

3.5 Normalization and data augmentation

Before converting the skeleton data into images using the proposed method, we perform the normalization of the raw skeleton data. To do so, we anchor the hip joint in a skeleton to the origin of the used Cartesian coordinates, and align the virtual vector between the left-shoulder and the right-shoulder of the skeleton to the x-axis of the coordinate system. This normalization strategy also results in mitigating the translation and viewpoint variation effects in the skeleton data by filtering out the motion-irrelevant noises. A further normalization is performed over the channels of the resulting images to restrict the values of the pixels in the range \([0, 255]\). Both types of normalizations are carried out on the training as well as the testing data.

In order to augment the data, we make use of the additive Gaussian noise. We draw samples from the zero Mean Gaussian distribution with 0.02 Standard Deviation and add those samples to the skeleton joints in the frame sequences to double the training data size. This augmentation strategy is based on the observation that slight variations in the joint locations/speeds generally do not vary the skeletal information significantly enough to change the label of the associated action. For our experiments, doubling the training data size already resulted in a significant performance gain over the existing approaches. Therefore, no further data augmentation was deemed necessary for the experiments.

3.6 Processing skeletal images with CNNs

Due to its flexibility, the proposed mapping of the skeletal information to the image-like tensors allows us to exploit a wide variety of existing (and potentially future) CNN architectures to effectively process the information in the skeleton frame sequences. To demonstrate this, we employ the Inception-ResNet [19] as the test bed for our representation. This recent CNN architecture has been
Fig. 7 Modified architecture of the Inception-ResNet [19]: The “STEM” part of the network is extended to fit the augmented 6-channel input images. The input and output sizes are described as $\text{rows} \times \text{columns} \times \text{channels}$. The kernel is specified as $\text{rows} \times \text{columns} \times \text{filters}, \text{stride}$.

successful in the general image classification task [33], as well as the specific tasks such as face recognition [34]. More importantly, the architecture allows for a variable input image size both in terms of the spatial dimensions and the number of color channels of the image.

First, we trained the Inception-ResNet from scratch by constructing the skeletal images of different dimensions (without the speed channel augmentation). This training resulted in a competitive performance of the network for a variety of image sizes - details provided in Section 5. We strictly followed the original work [19] for the training methodology, which demonstrates the compatibility of the proposed representation with the existing frameworks. In our experiments, training the network from scratch was consistently found to be more effective than fine tuning the existing models. We conjecture that the visible difference of the patterns in the skeleton images and the images of the natural scenes is the main reason for this phenomenon. Hence, it is recommended to train the network from scratch for the full exploitation of the proposed representation.

To demonstrate the additional benefits of augmenting the skeletal image with the speeds of the skeleton joints, we also trained the Inception-ResNet for the augmented images. Recall, in that case the resulting image has six channels - three channels each for the joint locations and the joint speeds. To account for the additional information, we modified the Inception-ResNet by extending the “STEM” part of the network [19]. The modified architecture is summarized in Figure. 7. To train the modified network, Center loss [35] is added to the cross entropy to form the final loss function. We optimized the network with the RMSProp optimizer, and selected the initial learning rate as 0.1. The results of our experiments (reported in Section 5) demonstrate a consistent gain in the performance of the network by using the augmented images.

3.7 Macro-temporal encoding and classification

Once it is possible to process the skeleton data with the desired CNN, it also becomes practicable to exploit the CNN features to further process the skeletal
information. For instance, as noted in Section 3.3, a single skeleton image used in
this work represents the temporal information for only $n$ skeletal frames, which
encodes the micro-temporal patterns in an action. To explore the long term
temporal relationship of the skeleton joints, we can further perform a macro-
temporal encoding over the CNN features. We perform this encoding as follows.

Given a skeleton action video, we first construct the ‘$Q$’ possible skeleton im-
ages for the video. These images are forward passed through the network and the
features $\xi_i \in \{1, 2, ..., Q\} \in \mathbb{R}^{1792}$ from the prelogit layer of the Inception-Resnet
are extracted. We compute the Short Fourier Transform \[36\] over $\xi_i$, $\forall i$ and re-
tain ‘$z$’ low frequency components of the computed transform. Next, the column
vectors $\xi_i$ are divided into two equal segments along their row-dimension, and
the Fourier Transform is again applied to retain another set of ‘$z$’ low frequency
components for each segment. The procedure is repeated ‘$\ell$’ times and all the
$2^{\ell-1} \times z$ resulting components are concatenated to represent the video. These
features are used for training an SVM classifier. We used $\ell = 3$ in our exper-
iments in Section 5. The features computed with the above method take into
account the whole skeletal sequence in the videos, thereby accounting for the
macro-temporal relations between the skeleton joints.

It is noteworthy that whereas we present the macro-temporal encoding in our
approach by employing subsequent processing of the CNN features, the Skepxels-
based construction also allows for the direct encoding of the skeletal information
over large time intervals using the larger images. Nevertheless, in this work, the
main objective of the underlying approach is to demonstrate the effectiveness
of the Skepxels-based representation for the common practices of exploiting the
CNNs for the skeleton data. Hence, we intentionally include the explicit pro-
cessing of the CNN features and show that the state-of-the-art performance is
achievable with the compact representations.

4 Dataset

We perform experiments with three standard benchmark datasets for human
action recognition, namely the NTU RGB+D Human Activity Dataset \[20\], the
Northwestern-UCLA Multiview Dataset \[21\] and the UTD Multimodal Human
Action Dataset \[22\]. The details of these datasets and the followed experimental
protocols are given below.

4.1 NTU RGB+D Human Activity Dataset

The NTU RGB+D Human Activity Dataset \[20\] is a large-scale RGB+D dataset
for human activity analysis. This dataset has been collected with the Kinect v2
sensor and it includes 56,880 action samples each for RGB, depth, skeleton and
infra-red videos. Since we are concerned with the skeleton sequences only, we use
the skeleton part of the dataset to evaluate our method. In the dataset, there
are 40 human subjects performing 60 types of actions including 50 single person
actions and 10 two-person interactions. Three sensors were used to capture the
data simultaneously from three horizontal angles: $-45^\circ$, $0^\circ$, $45^\circ$, and every action
Fig. 8 Skeleton and RGB sample frames from the NTU RGB+D Human Activity Dataset [20]. Three sensors C-1, C-2 and C-3 are used for recording. The left image group shows the actions recorded with the performer facing C-3. The right group is recorded when the action performer faces C-2. Moreover, the height of the sensors and their distances to the action performer have been adjusted in the dataset to get further viewpoint variations. The NTU RGB+D dataset is one of the largest and the most complex cross-view action dataset of its kind to date. Fig. 8 shows representative samples from this dataset.

We followed the standard evaluation protocol proposed in [20], which includes cross-subject and cross-view evaluations. For the cross-subject case, 40 subjects are equally split into training and testing groups. For the cross-view protocol, the videos captured by the sensor C-2 and C-3 are used as the training samples, whereas the videos captured by the sensor C-1 are used for testing.

4.2 Northwestern-UCLA Multiview Dataset

This dataset [21] contains RGB, Depth and skeleton videos captured simultaneously from three different viewpoints with the Kinect v1 sensor, while we only use skeleton data in our experiments. Fig. 9 shows the representative sample frames from this dataset for the three viewpoints. The dataset contains videos of 10 subjects performing 10 actions: (1) pick up with one hand, (2) pick up with two hands, (3) drop trash, (4) walk around, (5) sit down, (6) stand up, (7) donning, (8) doffing, (9) throw, and (10) carry. The three viewpoints are: (a) left, (b) front, and (c) right. This dataset is challenging because some videos share the same “walking” pattern before and after the actual action is performed. Moreover, some actions such as “pick up with one hand” and “pick up with two hands” are hard to distinguish from different viewpoints.

We use skeleton videos captured from two views for training and the third view for testing, which produces three possible cross-view combinations.

4.3 UTD Multimodal Human Action Dataset

The UTD-MHAD dataset [22] consists of 27 different actions performed by 8 subjects. Each subject repeated the action for 4 times, resulting in 861 action
sequences in total. The RGB, depth, skeleton and the inertial sensor signals were recorded. We only use skeleton videos in our experiments. Fig. 10 shows the sample frames from this dataset. We follow \[22\] to evaluation UTH-MHAD dataset with cross-subject protocol, which means the data from subject 1, 3, 5, 7 is used for training, and the data form subject 2, 4, 6, 8 is used for testing.

5 Experiments

5.1 Skeleton Image Dimension

We first analyze the performance of the models trained with different sizes of the skeleton images to choose a suitable image size for our experiments. We used the NTU RGB+D Human Activity Dataset \[20\] for this purpose. According to the evaluation protocol of \[20\], we split the training samples into training and validation subset. Only the location images were evaluated. After the best image size was chosen, we applied it to both location and velocity images, and conducted the comprehensive experiments. During our evaluation for the image size selection, we increased the image size from $120 \times 120$ to $300 \times 300$, with a step of 20 pixels. Fig. 11 shows the recognition accuracy for each setting. We eventually selected $180 \times 180$ as the image dimensions based on these results. These skeletal image dimensions were kept the same in our experiments with the other data sets as well.
Table 1  Action recognition accuracy (%) on the NTU RGB+D Dataset.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Cross Subject</th>
<th>Cross View</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td></td>
<td>50.1</td>
<td>52.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lie Group [4]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>56.3</td>
<td>64.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deep RNN [20]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>59.1</td>
<td>64.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HBRNN-L [5]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>60.2</td>
<td>65.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dynamic Skeleton [37]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>60.7</td>
<td>67.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deep LSTM [20]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>61.4</td>
<td>67.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LieNet [26]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>62.9</td>
<td>70.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P-LSTM [20]</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>66.2</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LTMD [38]</td>
<td></td>
<td>69.2</td>
<td>77.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST-LSTM [29]</td>
<td></td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSSCA-SSLM [39]</td>
<td>RGB-D</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>83.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interaction Learning [40]</td>
<td>Joints-D</td>
<td>79.6</td>
<td>84.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clips+CNN+MTLN [16]</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>81.3</td>
<td>89.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.2 Evaluation on NTU RGB+D Dataset

We trained our CNN model from scratch for the NTU RGB+D dataset. The model was trained twice for cross-subject and cross-view evaluations respectively. We first evaluated the proposed method with the location images only, where the input tensor to the network was in $\mathbb{R}^{H \times W \times 3}$. We call this evaluation as Skepxel$_{loc}$ mode. Then, we evaluated our method in Skepxel$_{loc+vel}$ mode, where we combined the location and velocity images to train the network with the input tensors in $\mathbb{R}^{H \times W \times 6}$. We used the network defined in Figure 7 for our evaluation in the Skepxel$_{loc+vel}$ mode. Table 1 compares the performance of our approach with the existing techniques on the NTU dataset. Our method is able to improve the accuracy by 4.4% in the Skepxel$_{loc+vel}$ mode over the nearest competitor.

5.3 Evaluation on the NUCLA Dataset

We took the CNN model trained for the NTU cross-view evaluation as a baseline. Firstly, we directly applied this model on the NUCLA dataset to evaluate the generalization of our model on the unseen skeleton data. Secondly, we fine-tuned the model with the NUCLA dataset and conducted the evaluation again.

Table 1 summarizes our results on the NUCLA dataset. The proposed method for the skeleton images alone achieves 83.0% average accuracy without fine-tuning on the target dataset, which demonstrates the generalization of our technique. After fine-tuning, the average accuracy increases by 2.2%. The best performance is achieved when we combined the skeleton and the velocity images, improving the accuracy over the nearest competitor by 5.7%.
Table 2 Action recognition accuracy (%) on the NUCLA dataset. $V_{1,2}^3$ means that view 1 and 2 were used for training and view 3 was used for testing. Skepxel$^\ast_{loc}$ used the NTU cross-view model without fine-tuning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>$V_{1,2}^3$</th>
<th>$V_{1,3}^2$</th>
<th>$V_{2,3}^1$</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hankelets</td>
<td>RGB</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>45.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOULE</td>
<td>RGB/D</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>44.7</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>49.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DVV</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>55.2</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>51.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CVP</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>60.6</td>
<td>55.8</td>
<td>39.5</td>
<td>52.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AOG</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>73.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>nCTE</td>
<td>RGB</td>
<td>68.6</td>
<td>68.3</td>
<td>52.1</td>
<td>63.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NKTM</td>
<td>RGB</td>
<td>75.8</td>
<td>73.3</td>
<td>59.1</td>
<td>69.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R-NKTM</td>
<td>RGB</td>
<td>78.1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPM+TM</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>91.9</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>71.9</td>
<td>79.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$^\ast_{loc}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>89.9</td>
<td>83.9</td>
<td>75.2</td>
<td>83.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$_{loc}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>88.8</td>
<td>85.3</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>85.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$_{loc+vel}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>91.5</td>
<td>85.5</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>85.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 Action recognition accuracy (%) on UTH-MHAD dataset. Skepxel$^\ast_{loc}$ used the NTU cross-view model without fine-tuning.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELC-KSVD</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>76.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>kinect-Inertia</td>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>79.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cov3DJ</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>85.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOS</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>87.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JTM</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>87.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$^\ast_{loc}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>94.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$_{loc}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel$_{loc+vel}$</td>
<td>Joints</td>
<td>97.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5.4 Evaluation on the UTD-MHAD Dataset

For the UTH-MHAD dataset, we evaluated the performance of our technique using the models pre-trained with the NTU dataset. The performance of our technique for the different models is summarized in Table 2. The proposed approach achieves a significant accuracy gain of 9.3% on this dataset.

We note that our Skepxels representation can be used with multiple existing CNN architectures, which provides the opportunity to extract varied network features. Exploiting ensembles/concatenation of such features, it is possible to achieve further performance gain using our method. We provide discussion on this aspect of our approach in the supplementary material of the paper.

6 Conclusion

A novel method is proposed to map skeletal data to images that are effectively processed by CNN architectures. The method exploits a basic building block, termed Skepxel - skeleton picture element, to construct the skeletal images of arbitrary dimensions. The resulting images encode fine spatio-temporal information about the human skeleton under multiple informative joint arrangements in different frames of the skeleton videos. This representation is further extended to incorporate the joint speed information in the videos. Moreover, it is also shown that the proposed compact representation can be easily used to successfully capture the macro-temporal details in the videos. When used with the Inception-ResNet architecture, the proposed skeletal image representation result in the state-of-the-art skeleton action recognition performance on the standard large scale action recognition datasets.
7 Acknowledgement

This research was supported by ARC grant DP160101458. The Titan Xp used for this research was donated by NVIDIA Corporation.
Appendix: Supplementary Material

Appendix A  Testing Different CNN Architectures
Skepxel is an effective representation for human skeletons as it allows CNNs to exploit both spatial-only and spatio-temporal convolutions. It is also flexible in generating images of arbitrary dimensions to suit different CNN architectures. We tested Skepxel with two additional CNN models, GoogLeNet \cite{10} and ResNet \cite{11} to demonstrate that its representation power generalizes well over different architectures. We used the NTU RGB+D Dataset \cite{20} to train GoogLeNet and ResNet from scratch. The same normalization and data augmentation as described in Section 3.5 was applied in our experiments. The trained models were then tested on the NUCLA Dataset \cite{21} and UTH-MHAD Dataset \cite{22} as described in Section 3.7 of the paper. For both networks, we extracted features from the layers prior to the softmax layer resulting in $\xi_{i \in \{1, 2, \ldots, Q\}} \in \mathbb{R}^{1024}$ and $\xi_{i \in \{1, 2, \ldots, Q\}} \in \mathbb{R}^{2048}$ features for GoogLeNet and ResNet respectively. Results are reported in Table 1 and 2 below.

Appendix B  Using an Ensemble of CNN Models
The possibility of using Skepxels with multiple CNN architectures allows us to exploit ensemble of features extracted from different models that can potentially improve the recognition performance. Therefore, we also experimented by concatenating the features of multiple CNN models for action recognition. We evaluated the performance using the ensemble technique for NUCLA and UTH-MHAD Datasets. These results are also summarize in Tables 1 and 2 below.

Appendix C  Analysis of Results
From the results in Table 1 and 2 we can conclude that (1) the proposed Skepxel representation generalizes well over CNN architectures (2) the accuracy of our proposed representation improves with better networks, (3) an ensemble of CNNs improves the accuracy further, nevertheless the performance also remains comparable when applied to individual networks which shows that the representation is sufficient for extracting features using a single CNN model which is important as it save computation time and memory requirements.
Table 1  Action recognition accuracy (%) on the NUCLA dataset. $V_{1,2}^3$ means that view 1 and 2 were used for training and view 3 was used for testing. Skepxel_{loc+vel} means CNN model trained with both location and velocity images. Skepxel_{loc} only uses location images.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>CNN</th>
<th>$V_{1,2}^3$</th>
<th>$V_{1,3}^2$</th>
<th>$V_{2,3}^1$</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Network</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet</td>
<td>88.8</td>
<td>85.3</td>
<td>81.6</td>
<td>85.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet</td>
<td>91.5</td>
<td>85.5</td>
<td>79.2</td>
<td>85.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>GoogLeNet</td>
<td>89.9</td>
<td>82.5</td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>82.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>GoogLeNet</td>
<td>91.0</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>84.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>ResNet</td>
<td>88.4</td>
<td>83.7</td>
<td>78.6</td>
<td>83.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>ResNet</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>85.7</td>
<td>80.8</td>
<td>86.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Ensemble</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+GoogLeNet</td>
<td>92.1</td>
<td>86.1</td>
<td>82.6</td>
<td>86.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+GoogLeNet</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>86.7</td>
<td>83.0</td>
<td>87.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+ResNet</td>
<td>91.9</td>
<td>86.9</td>
<td>80.2</td>
<td>86.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+ResNet</td>
<td>93.9</td>
<td>87.3</td>
<td>83.8</td>
<td>88.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2  Action recognition accuracy (%) on the UTH dataset.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>CNN</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Single Network</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet</td>
<td>97.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>GoogLeNet</td>
<td>88.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>GoogLeNet</td>
<td>94.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>ResNet</td>
<td>88.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>ResNet</td>
<td>92.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Network Ensemble</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+GoogLeNet</td>
<td>96.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+GoogLeNet</td>
<td>98.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+ResNet</td>
<td>94.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skepxel_{loc+vel}</td>
<td>Inception-ResNet+ResNet</td>
<td>97.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References