Non-thermal radiation of black holes off canonical typicality

Yu-Han Ma1,2, Qing-Yu Cai3, Hui Dong2, Chang-Pu Sun1,∗
1Beijing Computational Science Research Center, Beijing 100193, China
2Graduate School of Chinese Academy of Engineering Physics, Beijing 100084, China
3State Key Laboratory of Magnetic Resonances and Atomic and Molecular Physics, Wuhan Institute of Physics and Mathematics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Wuhan 430071, China

We study the Hawking radiation of black holes by considering the canonical typicality. For the universe consisting of black holes and their outer part, we directly obtain a non-thermal radiation spectrum of an arbitrary black hole from its entropy, which only depends on a few external qualities (known as hairs), such as mass, charge, and angular momentum. Our result shows that the spectrum of the non-thermal radiation is independent of the detailed quantum tunneling dynamics across the black hole horizon. We prove that the black hole information paradox is naturally resolved by taking account the correlation between the black hole and its radiation in our approach.

Introduction.-The study of black hole physics have elicited many important results, such as area law [11] and Hawking radiation [2, 3], which have tremendous impacts on many related researches in different areas of physics [14, 15]. One of them is the study of black hole information paradox. The thermal radiation of black hole directly leads to an information loss [3, 9], which contradicts with the properties of unitarity in quantum mechanics. In 2000, Parikh and Wilczek [10] considered the problem of black hole information loss from a consistent perspective of quantum tunneling, and a non-thermal radiation spectrum was discovered. Such spectrum allows the correlation between subsequently emitted particles. Zhang et al. [11] shows that by taking the correlation of black hole radiation into account, the black hole information is conserved. Thus they declared that the black hole information problem is explained.

Remarkably, all the radiation spectra studied case by case through quantum tunneling method [12] have a simple form and perfectly satisfy the requirement of information conservation. This observation hints an even deep origin of non-thermal nature of Hawking radiation without referring specially to the geometry of black hole’s horizon [13], as well as the exact quantum tunneling dynamics. To reveal such origin of non-thermal spectra, we need an even general derivation of radiation spectra.

In this letter, we prove that the non-thermal spectrum of Hawking radiation can be derived with the general principle of canonical typicality [14, 15] without referring to the dynamics of the particle tunneling. The radiation spectrum is directly obtained by making use of the black hole’s entropy and maintaining the non-canonical part, which matches exactly with the non-thermal feature of the radiation. Besides black hole, in some specific finite systems [14, 15], we also observed their non-canonical statistic behavior, that is, their distribution is not a perfect thermal equilibrium distribution. This implies that the non-thermal property of black hole radiation is the inevitable result of the finite system statistics that goes slightly off canonical typicality. With our general formalism, we derive the radiation spectra of several black holes, which are consistent well with the previous results achieved from the perspective of quantum tunneling [10, 19]. Further, the information carried by Hawking radiation is discussed in our framework, and then we clarify the so-called black hole information loss paradox is due to the ignorance of correlation between the black hole and its radiation. It is worth mentioning that by introdicing icezones [20, 22] to replace firewalls [23, 24], Stojkovic et al. have argued that once the correlation between the radiation fields is taken into consideration, the black hole information paradox will no longer exists. Such correlation, in our approach, is just the primary cause that result in the black hole radiation off thermal distribution.

Radiation spectrum off canonical typicality.-We first consider the universe U, which consists the system of interest B (e.g., black hole) and the environment O (see Fig. 1). The whole universe is assumed to be in an arbitrary pure universal state

\[ |\Psi\rangle = \sum_b \sum_o \frac{C(b,o)}{\sqrt{\Omega_U}} |b\rangle \otimes |o\rangle , \]

where \( \Omega_U = \Omega_U(E_U) \) is the total number of microstates for the universe with energy \( E_U \), and \( C(b,o) \) is the coefficient of state \( |b\rangle \otimes |o\rangle \). And \( |b\rangle \) and \( |o\rangle \) are the eigenstates of B and O, respectively. Without losing generality, we assume the orthogonal conditions \( \langle b_i|b_j \rangle = \delta_{ij} \), and \( \langle o_i|o_i \rangle = \delta_{ii} \). The normalization of state \( |\Psi\rangle \), \( \sum_b \sum_o |C(b,o)|^2 / \Omega_U = 1 \), directly implies the average value of \( |C(b,o)|^2 \), \( |C(b,o)|^2 = 1 \). Let \( \Psi_b = \sum_o C(b,o)|o\rangle \). Then the universe state becomes a maximum entanglement like state, i.e., \( |\Psi\rangle = \sum_b |b\rangle |\Psi_b\rangle / \sqrt{\Omega_U} \). As a result, ignoring the environment O, the reduced density matrix of B is obtained as

\[ \rho_B = \operatorname{Tr}_O (|\Psi\rangle \langle \Psi|) = \frac{1}{\Omega_U} \sum_{b_i, b_j} \langle \Psi_{b_i}|\Psi_{b_j}\rangle |b_i\rangle \langle b_j| , \]

where \( \operatorname{Tr}_O \) means tracing over the variables of O, and
When the total energy of system \( B \) is taken as a certain value, namely, \( E_0 = E \), the number of \( B \)'s micro-states, denoted as \( \Omega_B (E) = \frac{\Omega_U}{\Omega_O} (E_U - E) \), is fully contributed by the degrees of freedom that degenerated in the macro energy state of \( B \) with eigenenergy \( E \). When \( B \) is specific as a black hole, \( E \) corresponds to the total mass \( M \) of the black hole. The reduced density matrix of \( B \) is thus written as \( \rho_B = \sum_b \frac{\Omega_O (E_U - E_b)}{\Omega_U} |b\rangle \langle b| \). (4)

When the total energy of system \( B \) is taken as a certain value, namely, \( E_0 = E \), the number of \( B \)'s micro-states, denoted as \( \Omega_B (E) = \frac{\Omega_U}{\Omega_O} (E_U - E) \), is fully contributed by the degrees of freedom that degenerated in the macro energy state of \( B \) with eigenenergy \( E \). When \( B \) is specific as a black hole, \( E \) corresponds to the total mass \( M \) of the black hole. The reduced density matrix of \( B \) is thus written as \( \rho_B = \sum_b \frac{\Omega_O (E_U - E_b)}{\Omega_U} |b\rangle \langle b| \), which implies that \( B \) obeys the microcanonical distribution. In this case, the entropy of \( B \), \( S_B = -\ln \Omega_B (E) \), has been proved to be proportional to the area of \( B \)'s boundary in some specific model \([6,7]\). And this is the so-called entanglement entropy area theorem, which result in a possible explanation for the origin of the black hole's entropy.

Now we look at \( B \)'s subsystem \( R \), as shown in Fig. 1, the rest of \( B \) is denoted as \( B' = B - R \). The reduced density matrix of \( B \) can be rewritten as \( \sum_{r,r'} |r\rangle \langle r| / \Omega_B (E) \), where \( |r\rangle \) and \( |b\rangle \) are the eigenstates of \( R \) and \( B' \) with eigen-energies \( E_r \) and \( E_{r'} \), respectively. And \( E_r + E_{r'} = E \) is the constraint condition given by energy conservation. The reduced density matrix of \( R \)

\[
\rho_R = \text{Tr}_{B'} (\rho_B) = \sum_r \frac{\Omega_{B'} (E - E_r)}{\Omega_B (E)} |r\rangle \langle r| , \quad (5)
\]
is obtained by tracing over \( B' \). Here, \( \Omega_{B'} (E - E_r) \) is the number of micro-states of \( B' \) with energy \( E - E_r \), and it can be rewritten as \( \Omega_{B'} (E - E_r) = \exp [S_{B'} (E - E_r)] \), where \( S_{B'} (E - E_r) \) is the entropy of \( B' \). Therefore, we can further write Eq. (5) as

\[
\rho_R = \text{Tr}_{B'} (\rho_B) = \sum_r e^{-\Delta S_{BB'} (E_r, E)} |r\rangle \langle r| , \quad (6)
\]
where \( \Delta S_{BB'} (E_r, E) \equiv S_B (E) - S_{B'} (E - E_r) \) is the difference in entropy between \( B \) and \( B' \). We can clearly see from Eq. (6) that only when \( \Delta S_{BB'} \) depends on \( E_r \) linearly, the spectrum of \( R \) is perfectly thermal. What should be mentioned here is that we do not expand \( \Delta S_{BB'} \) only up to the first order of \( E_r \), as done in most studies in the thermodynamic limit. It will be shown later that the higher order of \( E_r \) or the non-canonical part of \( \rho_R \) just determines the non-thermal property of \( R \).

Until here, the discussion is a general one without any specification of black hole radiation. Now we will specify our system with \( B \) as black hole, \( R \) as Hawking radiation, and \( B' \), in this case, is considered as the remaining black hole. For the black hole \( B \) with three “hairs”, mass \( M \), charge \( Q \), and angular momentum \( J \), we let \( |\omega,q,j\rangle \) being the eigenstate of radiation \( R \) with energy \( \omega \), charge \( q \), and angular momentum \( j \). Then it follows from Eq. (6) and the conservation laws for charge and angular momentum that the radiation spectrum is obtained as

\[
\rho_R = \sum_{\omega,q,j} e^{-\Delta S_{BB'} (\omega,q,j,M,Q,J)} |\omega,q,j\rangle \langle \omega,q,j| . \quad (7)
\]

This is the main result of this letter. To get the explicit expression of \( \rho_R \), we then make use of the Bekenstein-Hawking entropy, which reads

\[
S_{BH} (M,Q,J) = \frac{A_H}{4} = \pi R_H^2 . \quad (8)
\]
where \( A_H = A_H (M,Q,J) \) and \( R_H = R_H (M,Q,J) \) are the “hairs”-determined area and radius of the black hole’s event horizon, respectively. It follows from Eqs. (7) and (8) that the radiation spectrum of the black hole \( B \) is
As the black hole evaporates, its mass decreases, and when $M$ becomes very small, the effect of quantum gravity gradually begins to appear. If the correction in the black hole entropy due to the quantum gravity is taken into account, the area entropy for the black hole is modified as

$$S_H = \frac{A_H}{4} + \alpha \ln \frac{A_H}{4} = \pi R_H^2 + \alpha \ln \left( \pi R_H^2 \right),$$

where $\alpha$ is a dimensionless parameter determined by the specific quantum gravity model. The effect of quantum gravity causes Eq. (9) to be rewritten as

$$\rho_R = \sum_{\omega,q,j} \exp \left[ \pi R_H^2 (M - \omega, Q - q, J - j) - \pi R_H^2 (M, Q, J) \right] |\omega, q, j \rangle \langle \omega, q, j| .$$

For a given black hole, one can first get the horizon radius as the function of its external qualities with the help of its metric. And then by making use of Eqs. (9) and (11), the radiation spectrum in the classical and quantum case are obtained, respectively.

**Schwarzschild black hole.** As the simplest black hole, there is only one hair for the Schwarzschild black hole, that is, the mass $M$. The radius of its event horizon is $R_H = 2M$, which together with Eq. (9) give the radiation spectrum of the Schwarzschild black hole as

$$\rho_R = \sum_{\omega,q,j} e^{-8\pi\omega(M-\omega/2)} |\omega \rangle \langle \omega| ,$$

where $|\omega \rangle$ is the eigenstate of the radiation. It is seen from Eq. (12) that the probability

$$p(\omega, M) = e^{-8\pi\omega(M-\omega/2)}$$

for the state $|\omega \rangle$ being in the distribution is the same as the tunneling probability $\Gamma(\omega, M) = \exp \left[ -8\pi\omega (M - \omega/2) \right]$, which is known as the Parikh-Wilczek spectrum [10], as the result of the WKB approximation through the perspective of quantum tunneling. Note that we did not use the tunneling dynamics of the radiation process at all, but we can obtain the non-thermal spectrum Eq. (12). Here, we only require the area entropy of black hole to be the function of energy. The simple derivation of radiation shows that the entropy of black hole is the key quantity to determine the radiation spectrum.

**Reissner-Nordström black hole.** For the Reissner-Nordström black hole with mass $M$ and charge $Q$, the radius of its outer event horizon obtained from the metrics reads $R_H = M + \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2}$. Substituting it into Eq. (6), we obtain the non-thermal spectrum of R-N black hole as

$$\rho_R = \sum_{\omega,q} \exp \left\{ \pi \left[ (M - \omega) + \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2} - Q \right]^2 + \pi \left[ (M + \sqrt{M^2 - Q^2})^2 - Q \right] \right\} |\omega, q \rangle \langle \omega, q| ,$$

where $|\omega, q \rangle$ is the eigenstate of the radiation. Equation (14) is exactly consistent with the radiation probability that obtained from the perspective of quantum tunneling in Ref [19]. Here, we show the density matrix for Schwarzschild and R-N black holes without referring the dynamics of the particle tunneling. Similar process for other black holes result in exact matching between our results and that obtained from dynamics analysis. This remind us that while considering the non-thermal effect of the black hole radiation spectrum, there is an even deeper intrinsic relationship between the quantum tunneling approach and our statistical method. For example, in previous work, by using the radiation spectrum, we successfully obtained the number of micro-states of the black holes [26].

**Information of black hole radiation.** Now we go back to Eq. (9) to discuss the information carried by Hawk-
Namely, \( S_R = S_B - \sum e^{-\Delta S_{BB'}}(E_r, E) S_{B'}(E - E_r) \). (15)

The corresponding Von-Neumann entropy \( S_R = S_B - S(B'|R) \), where \( S(B'|R) = \sum e^{-\Delta S_{BB'}(E_r, E)} S_{B'}(E - E_r) \) is the conditional entropy of \( B' \). This shows that there exists correlation between \( R \) and \( B' \), as a result of energy conservation. In the low energy limit, i.e., \( E_r \ll E \), the conditional entropy is approximated, by keeping the first order of \( E_r \), as

\[
S(R, B') = \text{Tr} \left( \rho_R \ln \rho_R \right) R
\]

where \( \rho_R \) is the density matrix of \( R \) and \( B' \), respectively. Moreover, it's easily checked that

\[
\sum_{p} p(j) j \ll 1
\]

The existence of correlation between sequences of emitted particles have been proved via mutual information [11, 27, 28]. Yet, the proofs are based on case with dark energy [Nucl. Phys. B, 931 (2018) 418]. The advantage of this approach is that there is no need to analyze the particle dynamics in the radiation process, but it only refers to the dependency of the entropy on the macro-quantized qualities of the whole system.

Acknowledgments.-Y. H. Ma thanks J. F. Chen and X. Wang for helpful discussions. We thank Prof. D. Stojkovic for his kind letter to let us know his works in black hole information paradox. This study is supported by the National Basic Research Program of China (Grants No. 2014CB921403 and No.2016YFA0301201), the NSFC (Grants No. 11421063 and No.11534002), and the NSAF (Grant No. U1530401).

Note added.- Recently, we applied the canonical typicality approach developed in this paper to obtain the radiation spectrum of Schwarzschild black hole in the case with dark energy [Nucl. Phys. B, 931 (2018) 418]. Some interesting results have been reported in this relevant work, showing the influences of dark energy on the non-thermal radiation of black holes

\[\text{cpsun@csrs.ac.cn}\]

(2000).


