Three level Lambda system, relativistic invariance and renormalization in QED

Navin Khaneja *†

June 14, 2018

Abstract

In this paper, we develop an analogy between the three level atomic system so called Lambda system and scattering processes in quantum electrodynamics (QED). In a Lambda system we have two ground state levels $|1\rangle$ and $|3\rangle$ at energy $E_1$ and excited level $|2\rangle$ at energy $E_2$. The transition from $|1\rangle$ to $|2\rangle$ has strength $\Omega_1$ and transition from $|2\rangle$ to $|3\rangle$ has strength $\Omega_2$. In the interaction frame of natural Hamiltonian of the system, we get a second order term connecting level $|1\rangle$ to $|3\rangle$ with strength $\frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}$. This term creates an effective coupling between ground state levels and drives transition from $|1\rangle$ to $|3\rangle$. Scattering processes in QED can be modelled like this. Feynman amplitudes are calculation of second order term $M = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}$. In the rest frame $O'$(CM frame) where sum of momentum of incoming particles is 0, if the Feynman amplitude is $M'$, then in a frame $O$ in which $O'$ moves with velocity $v$, the time gets dilated to $t = \frac{\epsilon}{\sqrt{1 - \frac{v^2}{c^2}}}$ and hence it must be true that $M = M' \sqrt{1 - \frac{v^2}{c^2}}$. We show that to make this relativistic invariance of $M$ to work, we have to modify the QED interaction Hamiltonian. Using this modification, we calculate the scattering amplitude for QED processes, Compton scattering and Møller Scattering. This gives an additional factor of $\frac{P}{P_0}$ in Feynman amplitude, where $P$ is sum of four momentum of incoming particles (or outgoing) and $P = \sqrt{P^2}$. In this paper taking vacuum polarization as a example, we show that we can avoid divergences in QED if we correctly work with this factor $\eta = \frac{P}{P_0}$.

*To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email:navinkhaneja@gmail.com
†Indian Institute of Technology Bombay, Powai - 400076, India.
1 Introduction

We first develop an analogy between the three level atomic system so called Lambda (Λ) system and scattering processes in quantum electrodynamics (QED) [1, 2, 3, 4]. In a Lambda system as shown in Fig. 1 we have two ground state levels \(|1⟩\) and \(|3⟩\) at energy \(E_1\) and excited level \(|2⟩\) at energy \(E_2\). The transition from \(|1⟩\) to \(|2⟩\) has strength \(\Omega_1\) and transition from \(|2⟩\) to \(|3⟩\) has strength \(\Omega_2\). In the interaction frame of natural Hamiltonian of the system, we get a second order term connecting level \(|1⟩\) to \(|3⟩\) with strength \(\frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)}\). This term creates an effective coupling between ground state levels and drives transition from \(|1⟩\) to \(|3⟩\). Scattering processes in QED can be modelled like this. Feynman amplitudes are calculation of second order term \(\mathcal{M} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)}\).

![Figure 1: Above Fig. shows a three level Lambda system with two ground state levels \(|1⟩\) and \(|3⟩\) and an excited level \(|2⟩\).](image)

The state of the three level system evolves according to the Schröedinger equation

\[
\dot{\psi} = -i \frac{\hbar}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & \Omega_1^* & 0 \\ \Omega_1 & E_2 & \Omega_2^* \\ 0 & 0 & E_1 \end{bmatrix} \psi. \tag{1}
\]

We proceed into the interaction frame of the natural Hamiltonian (system energies) by transformation

\[
\phi = \exp \left( i \frac{\hbar}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & E_2 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & E_1 \end{bmatrix} \right) \psi. \tag{2}
\]

This gives for \(\Delta E = E_2 - E_1\),
\[ \dot{\phi} = \frac{-i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \exp(-\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t)\Omega_1^* & 0 \\ \exp(\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t)\Omega_1 & 0 & \exp(-\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t)\Omega_2^* \\ 0 & \exp(\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t)\Omega_2 & 0 \end{bmatrix} H(t) \phi. \]  

(3)

\( H(t) \) is periodic with period \( \Delta t = \frac{2\pi}{\Delta E} \). After \( \Delta t \), the system evolution is

\[ \phi(\Delta t) = (I + \int_0^{\Delta t} H(\sigma)d\sigma + \int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} H(\sigma_1)H(\sigma_2)d\sigma_2d\sigma_1 + \ldots)\phi(0). \]  

(4)

The first integral averages to zero, while the second integral

\[ \int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} H(\sigma_1)H(\sigma_2)d\sigma_2d\sigma_1 = \frac{1}{2} \int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} [H(\sigma_1),H(\sigma_2)]d\sigma_2d\sigma_1. \]  

(5)

Evaluating it explicitly, we get for our system that second order integral is

\[ \frac{-i\Delta t}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \Omega_1\Omega_2 \frac{\Omega_1\Omega_2}{E_1-E_2} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \frac{\Omega_1\Omega_2}{E_1-E_2} & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}. \]  

(6)

Thus we have created an effective Hamiltonian

\[ \begin{bmatrix} 0 & \frac{\Omega_1\Omega_2}{E_1-E_2} \\ 0 & 0 & 0 \\ \frac{\Omega_1\Omega_2}{E_1-E_2} & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}. \]  

(7)

which couples level \(|1\rangle\) and \(|3\rangle\) and drives transition between them at rate \( \mathcal{M} = \frac{\Omega_1\Omega_2}{(E_1-E_2)} \).

2 Modelling QED as three level Lambda system

QED processes can be modelled as three level Lambda system as shown in Fig. In a QED scattering process, level 1 represents all the incoming particles with total energy \( E_1 \) and four momentum \( P \). Level 3 all the outgoing particles with energy \( E_3 \) and level 2 represent all the intermediate particles including a off shell virtual particle with four momentum \( q \) and energy \( E_q \) (virtual particle is only present in level 2). Let \( E_2 \) denote total energy of all particles in level 2. Then using notation \( P = \sqrt{P^2} = \sqrt{P_\mu P^\mu} \), we can define \( \eta = \frac{P}{E_0} \).
\[ \Omega_1 = (\varepsilon c \hbar \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}}) \bar{u}_b \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu u_a, \quad (8) \]

\[ \Omega_2 = (\varepsilon c \hbar \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}}) \bar{u}_d \gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu u_c, \quad (9) \]

\[ \mathcal{M} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)}, \quad (10) \]

where \( u_a, u_b, u_c, u_d \) are spinors we can associate with the QED process through \( \mathcal{H}_{ep} \), the electron-photon interaction Hamiltonian \[H\],

\[ \mathcal{H}_{ep} = \int d^3x \, e A_\mu \bar{\psi} \gamma_\mu \psi, \quad (11) \]

where vector potential \( A \) in terms of photon annihilation and creation operators \( a \) and \( a^\dagger \) is

\[ A = c \sqrt{\frac{\hbar}{V \epsilon_0}} \sum_k \sum_{\alpha=1,2} \epsilon_\alpha(k) \left[ \frac{a_{\alpha k}}{\sqrt{\omega_k}} \exp i k \cdot r + \frac{a^\dagger_{\alpha k}}{\sqrt{\omega_k}} \exp -i k \cdot r \right], \quad (12) \]

where \( \epsilon \) is a four vector and \( \alpha \) indices polarization and \( k \) wave-vector. \( V \) is mode volume and \( \epsilon_0 \) permittivity. The electron field

\[ \psi = \frac{1}{\sqrt{V}} \sum_p \sum_{s=1,2} u_s(p) b_{sp} \exp \frac{i}{\hbar} p \cdot r + u_s(-p) d_{sp}^\dagger \exp -\frac{i}{\hbar} p \cdot r, \quad (13) \]

where \( u_s(p) \) are the positive eigenvectors of the Dirac equation and \( s \) indices helicity and \( p \) momentum. \( b_{sp} \) and \( d_{sp}^\dagger \) are annihilation and creation operators for electron and positron.

Important is to note that in \( \Omega_1, \Omega_2 \), the coefficients as determined by \( \mathcal{H}_{ep} \) have been modified to one shown in (8 and 9). This ensures that we get the right relativistic dependence of the Feynman amplitude. In some sense we have re-defined the QED coupling Hamiltonian to get in tune with relativity.

To get a sense for how amplitude has right relativistic dependence, we find when we sum over two processes that define a Feynman diagram (also see section \[H\]) we get

\[ \mathcal{M} = \sum \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{2} \left( \frac{1}{q_0 - E_q} - \frac{1}{q_0 + E_q} \right) = \Omega_1 \Omega_2 E_q \left( \frac{1}{q_0^2 - E_q^2} \right) = \Omega_1 \Omega_2 E_q \left( \frac{1}{q^2 - m^2} \right), \quad (14) \]

where, \( m = 0 \), when virtual particle is a photon. The term in bracket above is called propagator. Then
where spinor terms are relativistically invariant (spinor for off-shell virtual particle has its mass as off-shell mass). Now imagine we are in center of mass frame (CM frame), and we make a change of frame, then $P_0 \rightarrow \frac{P_0}{\sqrt{1 - \frac{v^2}{c^2}}}$ and $V \rightarrow \sqrt{1 - \frac{v^2}{c^2}} V$. Rest everything is relativistically invariant and hence we get the right relativistic dependence of amplitude.

Furthermore observe, in the center of mass frame we have $P_0 = \mathbf{P}$ and hence

$$\mathcal{M}_{c.m.} \propto \frac{1}{q^2 - m^2} \bar{u}_b \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu \epsilon_a \bar{u}_d \gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu \bar{u}_c, \quad (16)$$

which is what we know from Feynman calculus.

We now take few examples that illustrate the above methodology. We consider first Compton scattering and then Møller scattering and calculate their scattering amplitudes.

### 3 Compton Scattering

Compton scattering is the inelastic scattering of a photon with an electrically charged particle, first discovered in 1923 by Arthur Compton [5]. This scattering process is of particular historical importance as classical electromagnetism is insufficient to describe the process; a successful description requires us to take into account the particle-like properties of light. Furthermore, the Compton scattering of an electron and a photon is a process that can be described to a high level of precision by QED.

In Compton scattering an electron and photon with momentum $p$ and $k$ respectively scatter into momentum $p'$ and $k'$ respectively. We want to calculate the amplitude for this scattering.

There are two Feynman diagrams that show mechanism of Compton scattering. They are shown in Fig. 2. We can associate each of these with two three level diagrams as shown in Fig. 3.

Consider Feynman diagram A in Fig. 2 where a electron of momentum $p$ and photon of momentum $k$ are annihilated to give an electron of momentum $q = p + k$ which is then annihilated to create electron and photon with momentum $p'$ and $k'$. This correspond to three level system Fig. 3 A. The scattering amplitude for this system is as follows

$$\Omega_1 = (\epsilon c \hbar \sqrt{\frac{1}{V c_0 E_q}}) \bar{u}_s(p + k) \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u(p), \quad (17)$$
Figure 2: Fig. A shows Fig. B show the two mechanisms for Compton scattering.

\[ \Omega_2 = \left( e c \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}} \right) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') u_s(p + k), \]  
(18)

\[ E_1 - E_2 = q_0 - E_q = E_p + E_k - E_{p+k}, \]  
(19)

\[ M_{1a}^* = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}. \]  
(20)

where \( E_p = \sqrt{(|p|c)^2 + m^2} \) and \( E_k = |k|c \). Summing over electron polarization we get

\[ M_{1a} = \left( \frac{\hbar^2 \epsilon c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0} \right) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') \sum_s u_s(p + k) \bar{u}_s(p + k) \frac{E_q(q_0 - E_q)}{E_q(q_0 - E_q)} \gamma^\nu \epsilon^*_\nu(k) u(p). \]  
(21)

There is an associated three level diagram with this as shown in B, where we first create
Figure 3: Fig. shows three level systems that go with Feynman diagrams in Fig. (2).

electron and photon with momentum $p'$ and $k'$ respectively alongside a positron with momentum $q = -(p' + k') = -(p + k)$ and then annihilate electron and photon with momentum $p$ and $k$ alongside a positron with momentum $-(p + k)$.

The scattering amplitude for this system is as follows

$$\Omega_1 = (e\hbar n) \sqrt{\frac{1}{V\epsilon_0 E_q}} \bar{u}(p')\gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k')u_s(p + k),$$

$$\Omega_2 = (e\hbar n) \sqrt{\frac{1}{V\epsilon_0 E_q}} \bar{u}_s(p + k)\gamma^\nu \epsilon^*_\nu(k)u(p),$$

$$E_1 - E_2 = -(q_0 + E_q) = -E_{p+k} - (E_p + E_k),$$
\[ M_{1b} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}. \] (25)

Summing over electron polarization we get

\[ M_{1b} = -\left( \frac{\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0} \right) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') \sum_s u_s(p + k) \bar{u}_s(p + k) \frac{E_{q_0} + E_q}{q_0 + E_q} \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u(p). \] (26)

Adding the two amplitudes \( M_1 = M_{1a} + M_{1b} \), we get

\[
M_1 = \left( \frac{2\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0} \right) \frac{\bar{u}(p') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') \sum_s u_s(p + k) \bar{u}_s(p + k) \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u(p)}{q^2 - m^2},
\]

\[
= \left( \frac{\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{E_q V \epsilon_0} \right) \frac{\bar{u}(p') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k')(q + m) \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u(p)}{q^2 - m^2}. \] (27)

We made use of identity \( \sum_s u_s(q) \bar{u}_s(q) = \frac{q + m}{2E_q} \), where \( q = q_j \gamma^j \) and \( m \) is off-shell mass (\( c \) is implicit).

Now consider Feynman diagram B in Fig. 2, where an electron of momentum \( p \) is annihilated and photon of momentum \( k' \) is created to give an electron of momentum \( q = p - k' \) which is then annihilated along-with the photon of momentum \( k \) to create electron with momentum \( p' \). This correspond to three level system Fig. 3 C. The scattering amplitude for this system is as follows

\[
\Omega_1 = (e c \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}}) \bar{u}_s(p - k') \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') u(p), \] (28)

\[
\Omega_2 = (e c \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}}) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u_s(p - k'), \] (29)

\[ E_1 - E_2 = q_0 - E_q = E_p - E_{p-k} - E_{k'}, \] (30)

\[
M_{2a} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}. \] (31)

Summing over electron polarization we get

\[
M_{2a} = \left( \frac{\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0 E_q} \right) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) \frac{\sum_s u_s(p - k') \bar{u}_s(p - k')}{q_0 - E_q} \gamma^\mu \epsilon^*_\mu(k') u(p). \] (32)

There is an associated three level diagram with this as shown in 3 D, where we first create electron and annihilate photon with momentum \( p' \) and \( k \) respectively alongside creating a
positron with momentum $-(p - k') = -(p' - k)$ and then annihilate electron and create photon with momentum $p$ and $k'$ alongside annihilate positron with momentum $-(p - k')$.

The scattering amplitude for this system is as follows

\[
\Omega_1 = (\text{e} \hbar \eta) \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}} \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u_s(p - k'),
\]

\[
\Omega_2 = (\text{e} \hbar \eta) \sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0 E_q}} \bar{u}_s(p - k') \gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu^*(k') u(p),
\]

\[
E_1 - E_2 = -(q_0 + E_q) = -E_{p-k'} - E_p + E_{k'},
\]

\[
\mathcal{M}^2_{2b} = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2}.
\]

Summing over electron polarization we get

\[
\mathcal{M}^2_{2b} = -(\frac{\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0}) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) \sum_s u_s(p - k') \bar{u}_s(p - k') \frac{q_0 + E_q}{q^2 - m^2} \gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu^*(k') u(p).
\]

Adding the two amplitudes $\mathcal{M}_2 = \mathcal{M}_{2a} + \mathcal{M}_{2b}$, we get

\[
\mathcal{M}_2 = (\frac{2\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{V \epsilon_0}) \bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) \sum_s u_s(p - k') \bar{u}_s(p - k') \frac{q_0 + E_q}{q^2 - m^2} \gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu^*(k') u(p),
\]

\[
= (\frac{\hbar^2 e^2 c^2 \eta^2}{E_q V \epsilon_0}) \frac{\bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) (\gamma^\mu \epsilon_\mu^*(k') u(p))}{q^2 - m^2}.
\]

We can compare the expression for $\mathcal{M}_1$ and $\mathcal{M}_2$ in Eq. (27) and (38) with the one in textbooks [2, 3], derived using a Feynman propagator and we find that the textbook expressions are

\[
\tilde{\mathcal{M}}_1 \propto \frac{\bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu^*(k') (p + k + m) \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) u(p)}{((p + k)^2 - m^2)},
\]

\[
\tilde{\mathcal{M}}_2 \propto \frac{\bar{u}(p') \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k) (p' - k^2 + m) \gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu^*(k') u(p)}{((p - k')^2 - m^2)}.
\]

Our expression matches it when we are in CM frame, else we have an additional factor of $\frac{P}{P_0}$, which makes amplitude relativistically correct and is 1 in CM frame.

We now look at a different QED process, Möller scattering.
4 Coulomb Potential and Møller Scattering

In Møller scattering, electrons with momentum $p_1$ and $q_1$ exchange photon with momentum $k$ and scatter to new momentum states $p_2$ and $q_2$. Observe the virtual particle four momentum is $k$. The Feynman diagram for the process is in Fig. There are two three level systems associated with this process. Let $P = p_1 + q_1$.

\[ \Omega_1 = \left( \frac{\epsilon e h \sqrt{1}}{V \epsilon_0 E_k} \right) \bar{u}(p_2) \gamma^\nu \epsilon^\nu \epsilon^{*}(k) u(p_1), \]  

(41)

Figure 4: Fig. shows the Feynman diagram for the Møller scattering and its corresponding three level system. The electron with momentum $p_1$ emits (absorbs) a photon and scatters to momentum $p_2$, the photon is absorbed (emitted) by electron with momentum $q_1$ which scatters to momentum $q_2$.

In figure A, we have the first three level system where the electron with momentum $p_1$ is annihilated, a electron of momentum $p_2$ is created and a photon of momentum $k = p_1 - p_2$ is created. Subsequently, the electron with momentum $q_1$ is annihilated, a electron of momentum $q_2$ is created and photon of momentum $k$ is annihilated. The amplitude for this process is
\[ \Omega_2 = (\text{e} \chi \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V_{c_0} E_k}}) u'(q_2) \gamma_{\nu} \epsilon_\nu(k) u(q_1), \]  
\[ E_1 - E_2 = k_0 - E_k = E_p_1 - E_p_2 - E_k, \]  
\[ \mathcal{M}_1^\epsilon = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)}. \]  

We can now sum over photon polarization \( \epsilon \).

Similarly we have another three level system, fig 4B in which \( q_1 \) emits photon with momentum \(-k\) and \( p_1 \) absorbs it. This gives

\[ \Omega_1 = (\text{e} \chi \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V_{c_0} E_q}}) u'(q_2) \gamma_{\nu} \epsilon^\nu(-k) u(q_1), \]  
\[ \Omega_2 = (\text{e} \chi \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V_{c_0} E_q}}) u'(p_2) \gamma_{\nu} \epsilon_\nu(-k) u(p_1), \]  
\[ E_1 - E_2 = -(k_0 + E_k) = E_{q_1} - E_{q_2} - E_k, \]  
\[ \mathcal{M}_2^\epsilon = \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(E_1 - E_2)}. \]  

We can now sum over photon polarization \( \epsilon \).

Using conservation of energy \( E_{p_2} - E_{p_1} = E_{q_1} - E_{q_2} \), we get that when we add the two amplitudes, we get the total amplitude as

\[ \frac{E_k \Omega_1 \Omega_2}{(k_0)^2 - E_k^2} \propto \eta^2 \frac{1}{(p_1 - p_2)^2}. \]

In case of Møller scattering, we get the same amplitude as obtained using Feynman propagator except an additional factor of \( \frac{P}{P_0} \). In CM frame this is 1.

We now look at QED processes that are modelled as a two level system and then show how they can be used to calculate vacuum polarization in QED.

## 5 Modeling vacuum polarization as two level system

Consider the Feynman diagram in Fig. 5A, a photon with momentum \( k \) spontaneously creates an electron-positron pair with momentum \( p + k \) and \(-p\) respectively, which recombine to give \( k \) again. Creating a \(-p\) positron is same as annihilate a negative energy electron with momentum \( p \). We represent this as a two level system shown in Fig. 5B, with lower level 1 comprising of incoming momentum \( p, k \) and higher level 2, the outgoing electron with momentum \( p + k \). The transition rate \( \Omega \) from 1 to 2 is given by
\[ \Omega = (\text{\textit{e}}\hbar \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V\epsilon_0(E_{p+k} + E_p)}}) \bar{u}(p + k)\gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k)u(p), \]

where \( P = p + k \), and

\[ \eta_1 = \frac{P}{P_0} = \frac{m}{\sqrt{|p + k|^2 + m^2}}, \]

the relativistic factor for the outgoing electron. There is an associated two level system with this where we first create an electron, positron and photon with momentum \( p, -(p + k), k \) respectively. This is shown in Fig. 5C, where again creating a \(-(p + k)\) positron is same as annihilate a negative energy electron with momentum \( p + k \). The transition rate \( \Omega \) from 1 to 2 is

\[ \Omega = (\text{\textit{e}}\hbar \eta \sqrt{\frac{1}{V\epsilon_0(E_{p+k} + E_p)}}) \bar{u}(p)\gamma^\nu \epsilon^{*\nu}(k)u(p + k), \]

The dynamics of this two level system is

\[ \dot{\psi} = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & \Omega^* \\ \Omega & E_2 \end{bmatrix} \psi. \]
We proceed into the interaction frame of the natural Hamiltonian (system energies) by transformation
\[
\phi(t) = \exp\left(\frac{i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & 0 \\ 0 & E_2 \end{bmatrix} t\right) \psi(t).
\] (52)

This gives for \(\Delta E = E_2 - E_1\)
\[
\dot{\phi} = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \left[ \frac{0}{\exp\left(\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t\right)\Omega} \begin{bmatrix} \exp(-\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t)\Omega^* \\ 0 \end{bmatrix} \right] \phi.
\] (53)

\(H(t)\) is periodic with period \(\Delta t = \frac{2\pi}{\Delta E}\). After \(\Delta t\), the system evolution is
\[
\phi(\Delta t) = (I + \int_0^{\Delta t} H(\sigma)d\sigma + \int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} H(\sigma_1)H(\sigma_2)d\sigma_2 d\sigma_1 + \ldots)\phi(0).
\] (54)

The first integral averages to zero, while the second integral
\[
\int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} H(\sigma_1)H(\sigma_2)d\sigma_2 d\sigma_1 = \frac{1}{2} \int_0^{\Delta t} \int_0^{\sigma_1} [H(\sigma_1), H(\sigma_2)]d\sigma_2 d\sigma_1.
\] (55)

Evaluating it explicitly, we get for our system that second order integral is
\[
-\frac{i\Delta t}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} \frac{\Omega^*}{E_1 - E_2} & 0 \\ 0 & \frac{-\Omega^*}{E_1 - E_2} \end{bmatrix}.
\] (56)

Thus we have created an shift of energy level 1 from \(E_1 \to E_1 + \frac{\Omega^*}{(E_1 - E_2)}\).

Now lets return to Møller scattering where electrons with momentum \(p_1, q_1\) exchange a virtual photon with momentum \(k\) and scatter to momenta \(p_2, q_2\). In previous section we modelled this as a three level atomic system, where level 2 contains the virtual particle. Now consider the situation as in Fig. (6), where the virtual photon creates electron-positron pairs along the way. This is modelled in Fig. (7), where level 2 containing virtual photon is coupled to additional levels representing electron-positron pairs. This was already modelled as a two level system in the beginning of this section. Now we can eliminate the additional levels. To fix ideas just imagine we have one additional level we call 4. Then the three level dynamics with additional level is
\[
\dot{\psi} = -\frac{i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & 0 & \Omega_1^* \\ 0 & E_3 & \Omega_2 \\ \Omega_1 & \Omega_2^* & E_2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} \Omega^* \\ 0 \\ \Omega \end{bmatrix} \psi.
\] (57)
Figure 6: Fig. shows Feynman diagram for vacuum polarization.

Figure 7: Fig. shows how vacuum polarization is represented as additional levels when Möller scattering is represented as a three level system.

We transform,

$$
\phi(t) = \exp\left(\frac{i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix}
E_1 & 0 & \Omega_1^* & 0 \\
0 & E_3 & \Omega_2 & 0 \\
\Omega_1 & \Omega_2^* & E_2 & 0 \\
0 & 0 & 0 & E_4
\end{bmatrix} t\right) \psi(t).
$$

(58)

This gives for $\Delta E = E_2 - E_4$
\[ \dot{\phi} = \frac{-i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \exp(\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t) \Omega^* & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \exp(\frac{i}{\hbar} \Delta E t) \Omega & 0 \end{bmatrix} \phi. \quad (59) \]

\[ H(t) \] is periodic with period \( \Delta t = \frac{2\pi}{\Delta E} \). After \( \Delta t \), the system evolution is

\[ \phi(\Delta t) = \exp\left(\frac{-i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & E_2' & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & E_4' \end{bmatrix} \right) \Delta t \phi(0), \quad (60) \]

with \( E_2', E_4' \) as calculated in description of energy shifts. Then

\[ \psi(\Delta t) \approx \exp\left(\frac{-i}{\hbar} \begin{bmatrix} E_1 & 0 & \Omega_1^* & 0 \\ 0 & E_3 & \Omega_2 & 0 \\ \Omega_1 & \Omega_2^* & E_2 + E_2' & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 0 & E_4 + E_4' \end{bmatrix} \right) \Delta t \psi(0) \]

Thus we have removed coupling \( \Omega \) and introduced energy shifts in \( E_2 \) and \( E_4 \). We can now eliminate level 2 and calculate transition amplitude between 1 and 3 and as before the transition amplitude is

\[ M \propto \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2 E_1}{E_1 - E_2 - E_2'}, \quad (61) \]

We can estimate how big \( E_2' \) is. We know

\[ E_2' \propto \frac{\Omega \Omega^*}{E_2 - E_4}. \quad (62) \]

Using \( \Omega \) from Eq. (49) and Eq. (50), we find,

\[ E_2'(p) \propto \eta_i^2 \frac{1}{(E_{p+k} + E_p)} \left( \frac{1}{E_k - E_p - E_{p+k}} - \frac{1}{E_p + E_k + E_{p+k}} \right) = -\eta_i^2 \frac{1}{(E_p + E_{p+k})^2 - E_k^2}. \quad (63) \]
We now have to sum over all momentum $p$. Observe for large $|p|$, we have

$$\eta_1 \sim \frac{1}{|p|}, \quad \frac{1}{(E_p + E_{p+k})^2 - E_k^2} \sim \frac{1}{|p|^2}. \quad (64)$$

If we look at the spinor terms $\bar{u}(p+k)\gamma^\nu \epsilon_\nu(k)u(p)$, then for large $|p|$, we have $u(p+k) - u(p) \sim \frac{1}{|p|}$ and $\bar{u}(p)\gamma_0 u(p) \sim 1$, then for large $p$, we have

$$E'(p) \propto \frac{1}{|p|^2} \frac{1}{|p|^2}. \quad (65)$$

When we integrate over $p$ by moving to polar coordinates we cancel the first factor of $\frac{1}{|p|^2}$ with $|p|^2 dp$ leaving us with the integral $\int \frac{1}{|p|^2} d|p|$ which is finite.

Now returning back to Eq. (61), we can rewrite

$$\mathcal{M} \propto \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2}{E_1 - E_2} (1 + \frac{E'_2}{E_1 - E_2}), \quad (66)$$

Thus we get a correction to $\mathcal{M}$ as

$$\mathcal{M}_1 \propto \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2 E'_2}{(E_1 - E_2)^2}, \quad (67)$$

Now referring back to Fig. 4 there are two Feynman diagrams one with $E_1 - E_2 = E_{p_1} - E_{p_2} - E_k$ and $E_1 - E_2 = E_{q_1} - E_{q_2} - E_k$, which explain Möller scattering. Then using $E_{p_1} - E_{p_2} = E_{q_2} - E_{q_1}$ the above formula reduces to

$$\mathcal{M}_1 \propto \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2 E'_2}{(E_1 - E_2)^2} \frac{1}{(E_{p_1} - E_{p_2} - E_k)^2} + \frac{1}{(E_{p_1} - E_{p_2} + E_k)^2}, \quad (68)$$

$$\propto \frac{\Omega_1 \Omega_2 E'_2}{(E_{p_1} - E_{p_2})^2 + E_k^2} \frac{1}{((E_{p_1} - E_{p_2})^2 - E_k^2)}, \quad (69)$$

$$\propto \mathcal{M} \frac{E'_2}{E_k} \frac{(E_{p_1} - E_{p_2})^2 + E_k^2}{p} \frac{1}{(E_{p_1} - E_{p_2})^2 - E_k^2} \quad (70)$$

We have shown $\mathcal{M}$ is relativistically invariant. To make sure that the next correction $\mathcal{M}_1$ is also invariant, we define $\mathcal{P}_0$ as $\mathcal{P}$ calculated in the CM frame. Let us modify $\Omega$ in fig. 4 and Eq. (49) (similarly in Eq. (50)) as

$$\sqrt{\frac{1}{V \epsilon_0} \frac{1}{(E_p + E_{p+k})}} \rightarrow \sqrt{\frac{\mathcal{P}_0}{\mathcal{P} V \epsilon_0 (E_p + E_{p+k})}}, \quad (71)$$

Then both $\mathcal{M}$ and its first order correction are relativistically invariant. The above procedure may be continued to all orders of correction.
6 Conclusion

In this paper we made an analogy between scattering processes in QED and three level atomic system called Λ system. We showed how Feynman propagator and amplitudes can be read from the three level system. We introduced a method to make Feynman amplitudes relativistically invariant by introducing a scale factor $\eta = \frac{P}{P_0}$. Taking vacuum polarization as an example, we showed that we can avoid divergences in QED if we correctly work with this factor.

References


