

A Subspace of Maximal Dimension with Bounded Schmidt Rank

Priyabrata Bag & Santanu Dey

Abstract

We study Schmidt rank for a vector (i.e., a pure state) and Schmidt number for a mixed state which are entanglement measures. We show that if a subspace of a certain bipartite system contains no vector of Schmidt rank $\leq k$, then any state supported on that space has Schmidt number at least $k + 1$. A construction of subspace of $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ of maximal dimension, which does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank less than 3, is given here.

Keywords: Schmidt number; Schmidt rank.

Mathematics Subject Classification: 81P68; 81P40; 15A03.

1 Introduction

A *state* (also known as the density matrices) is a positive matrix whose trace is equal to 1. A pure state $|v\rangle \in \mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ (or $|v\rangle\langle v|$) is said to be a *product state* if it can be written as $|v\rangle = |v_1\rangle \otimes |v_2\rangle = |v_1\rangle\langle v_2|$ for some $|v_1\rangle \in \mathbb{C}^m$ and $|v_2\rangle \in \mathbb{C}^n$; otherwise it is called *entangled*. The states, which are not pure, are also referred to as *mixed states*. If $\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle\}$ is the standard basis of $\mathbb{C}^2$, then the states

$$\frac{|e_0\rangle|e_0\rangle \pm |e_1\rangle|e_1\rangle}{\sqrt{2}} \text{ and } \frac{|e_0\rangle|e_1\rangle \pm |e_1\rangle|e_0\rangle}{\sqrt{2}}$$

are famous entangled states (cf. Sections 1.3.7 and 2.3 of [5]), which are known as *Bell states* or *EPR pairs*.

A mixed state $\rho \in M_m \otimes M_n$ is called *separable* if it is convex combination of pure product states; otherwise it is called *entangled*. Entanglement is the key property of quantum systems which is responsible for the higher efficiency of quantum computation and tasks like teleportation, super-dense coding, etc (cf. [4]). The Schmidt rank of vectors and Schmidt number of states in a bipartite finite dimensional Hilbert space are measures of entanglement. In Section 2, we establish a sufficient condition for states on a bipartite finite dimensional Hilbert space to be of Schmidt number bounded below by some positive integer. A construction of subspace of $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ of maximal dimension, which does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank less than 3, is given in Section 3.

In [2], it was proved using algebraic geometric techniques that for a bipartite system $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$, the dimension of any subspace of Schmidt rank greater than or equal to k is bounded above by $(m-k+1)(n-k+1)$. In [2, Proposition 10] it was also shown that this bound is attained. In this article, motivated by the analysis done in [1], we present an alternate approach to prove that this bound is attained for $k = 3$. We construct a subspace of $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ of Schmidt rank greater than or equal to 3 and, unlike [2], we also have a basis of this subspace consisting of elements of Schmidt rank 3. For the case when a subspace of $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ is of Schmidt rank greater than or equal to 2 (i.e., the subspace does not contain any product vector), the maximum dimension of that subspace is $(m-1)(n-1)$, and this was first proved in [6] and [8] (cf. [1]).

2 Schmidt Rank and Schmidt Number

Let $\mathcal{H}$ denote the bipartite Hilbert space $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$. By Schmidt decomposition theorem (cf. [5, Section 2.5]), any pure state $|\psi\rangle \in \mathcal{H}$ can be written as

$$|\psi\rangle = \sum_{j=1}^k \alpha_j |u_j\rangle \otimes |v_j\rangle \quad (2.1)$$

for some $k \leq \min\{m, n\}$, where $\{|u_j\rangle : 1 \leq j \leq k\}$ and $\{|v_j\rangle : 1 \leq j \leq k\}$ are orthonormal sets in $\mathbb{C}^m$ and $\mathbb{C}^n$ respectively, and α_j 's are nonnegative real numbers satisfying $\sum_j \alpha_j^2 = 1$.

Definition 2.1. *In the Schmidt decomposition (2.1) of a pure bipartite state $|\psi\rangle$ the minimum number of terms required in the summation is known as the Schmidt rank of $|\psi\rangle$, and it is denoted by $SR(|\psi\rangle)$.*

In the bipartite Hilbert space $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$, for any $1 \leq r \leq \min\{m, n\}$, there is at least some state $|\psi\rangle$ with $SR(|\psi\rangle) = r$. Any state ρ on a finite dimensional Hilbert space $\mathcal{H}$ can be written as

$$\rho = \sum_j p_j |\psi_j\rangle \langle \psi_j|, \quad (2.2)$$

where $|\psi_j\rangle$'s are pure states in $\mathcal{H}$ and $\{p_j\}$ forms a probability distribution. The following notion was introduced in [7]:

Definition 2.2. *The Schmidt number of a state ρ on a bipartite finite dimensional Hilbert space $\mathcal{H}$ is defined to be the least natural number k such that ρ has a decomposition of the form given in (2.2) with $SR(|\psi_j\rangle) \leq k$ for all j . The Schmidt number of ρ is denoted by $SN(\rho)$.*

The next theorem gives a sufficient condition for a state to have Schmidt number greater than k .

Theorem 2.1. *Let $\mathcal{S}$ be a subspace of $\mathcal{H} = \mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ which does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank lesser or equal to k . Then any state ρ supported on $\mathcal{S}$ has Schmidt number at least $k + 1$.*

Proof. Let ρ be a state with Schmidt number, $SN(\rho) = r \leq k$. So, ρ can be written as

$$\rho = \sum_j p_j |v_j\rangle \langle v_j|,$$

where $SR(|v_j\rangle) \leq k$ for all j and $\{p_j\}$ forms a probability distribution. First we show that each of $|v_j\rangle$ is in the range of ρ . With out loss of generality, we show this for $j = 1$. Write

$$\rho = p_1 |v_1\rangle \langle v_1| + T, \quad (2.3)$$

where $p_1 > 0$ and T is a nonnegative operator.

Let $|\psi\rangle \neq 0$ in $\mathcal{H}$ be such that $T|\psi\rangle = 0$ and $\langle v_1|\psi\rangle \neq 0$. Clearly, $\rho|\psi\rangle$ is a nonzero multiple of $|v_1\rangle$ and hence $|v_1\rangle$ belongs to the range of ρ . Now suppose the null space of T is contained in $\{|v_1\rangle\}^\perp$. Then $|v_1\rangle$ is in the range of T . So, there exists $|\psi\rangle \neq 0$ such that $T|\psi\rangle = |v_1\rangle$. Thus, (2.3) yields

$$\rho|\psi\rangle = (p_1 \langle v_1|\psi\rangle + 1)|v_1\rangle.$$

If $\rho|\psi\rangle = 0$, then by the positivity of ρ , $p_1 |v_1\rangle \langle v_1|$ and T , and (2.3), we obtain $\langle T\psi|\psi\rangle = 0$, and hence $T|\psi\rangle = 0$. This is a contradiction. Thus, we deduce that $\rho|\psi\rangle \neq 0$. Therefore, it follows that $|v_1\rangle$ is in the range of ρ .

If such a ρ is supported on $\mathcal{S}$, then the above statement gives a contradiction to the fact that $\mathcal{S}$ does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank lesser or equal to k . This completes the proof. $\square$

3 A Subspace of Maximal Dimension of Schmidt Rank ≥ 3

Let $\mathcal{H} = \mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ as before. Let us fix an infinite dimensional Hilbert space $\mathcal{K}$ with orthonormal basis $\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots\}$, and identify $\mathbb{C}^m$ and $\mathbb{C}^n$ with $\text{span}\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots, |e_{m-1}\rangle\}$ and $\text{span}\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots, |e_{n-1}\rangle\}$, respectively. Define $N = n + m - 2$, and for $2 \leq d \leq N - 2$ define

$$\mathcal{S}^{(d)} = \text{span}\{|e_{i-1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j+1}\rangle - 2|e_i\rangle \otimes |e_j\rangle + |e_{i+1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j-1}\rangle : 1 \leq i \leq m-2, 1 \leq j \leq n-2, i+j=d\}, \quad (3.1)$$

$$\mathcal{S}^{(0)} = \mathcal{S}^{(1)} = \mathcal{S}^{(N-1)} = \mathcal{S}^{(N)} = \{0\}, \text{ and } \mathcal{S} := \bigoplus_{d=0}^N \mathcal{S}^{(d)}. \quad (3.2)$$

We claim that $\mathcal{S}$ does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank less than 3.

Lemma 3.1. *The columns of the $(t+2) \times t$ matrix*

$$A_t = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ -2 & 1 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & -2 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & & \vdots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & -2 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 & -2 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

are linearly independent such that any linear combination of these columns has at least 3 nonzero entries.

Proof. At first, we show that all the order- t minors of A_t are nonzero. We would prove this statement by induction. The statement clearly holds for $l = 1$, i.e., for the matrix $A_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$.

Assume that the statement holds for $l = t - 1$. We would show that the statement is true for $l = t$ by observing the following cases:

1. If the two rows deleted from A_t to obtain the order- t minor does not include the first row, then let us denote the $t \times t$ matrix by F whose determinant gives this order- t minor. By two elementary row operations (involving the first row) on F which does not change the determinant, we can obtain $(1, 0, 0, \dots, 0)^T$ as the first column of F , where superscript T denotes the transpose. The order- $(t-1)$ minor obtained by deleting the first row and the first column of F is nonzero by induction hypothesis because it is a order- $(t-1)$ minor of A_{t-1} . It follows that the $\det F$ is nonzero.
2. If the two rows deleted from A_t to obtain the order- t minor does not include the last row, then let us denote the $t \times t$ matrix by L whose determinant gives this order- t minor. By two elementary row operations (involving the last row) on L which does not change the determinant, we can obtain $(0, \dots, 0, 0, 1)^T$ as the last column of L . The order- $(t-1)$ minor obtained by deleting the last row and the last column of F is nonzero by induction hypothesis because it is a order- $(t-1)$ minor of A_{t-1} . It follows that the $\det L$ is nonzero.

3. If the first and the last row is deleted from A_t to obtain the order- t minor, then we need to show that the determinant of

$$C_s = \begin{bmatrix} -2 & 1 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ 1 & -2 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & \dots & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & & \vdots & \vdots \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & -2 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & \dots & 1 & -2 \end{bmatrix}$$

is nonzero. We claim that $\det C_s = (-1)^s(s+1)$. Once again induct on s . Verifying for $s = 2, 3$ directly. Assume that the formula holds for all $k < s$ and $s > 3$. Then expand along the first row to see that

$$\begin{aligned} \det C_s &= -2(\det C_{s-1}) - \det C_{s-2} \\ &= -2(-1)^{s-1}s - (-1)^{s-2}(s-1) \\ &= (-1)^s(s+1). \end{aligned}$$

Thus, all the order- t minors of A_t are nonzero. Let us assume that a linear combination of columns of A_t has less than 3 non zero entries, i.e., a linear combination of columns of A_t has t or more zero entries. Let I be the set of indices of any t of those zero entries. So, the $t \times t$ submatrix formed from the rows of A_t which are indexed by I , is such that the columns of this submatrix is linearly dependent. We deduce that the corresponding order- t minor is zero and this is a contradiction. This proves that any linear combination of the columns of A_t has at least 3 nonzero entries. It also follows that the columns of the matrix A_t are linearly independent. $\square$

Theorem 3.2. *Let m and n be natural numbers such that $3 \leq \min\{m, n\}$. The space $\mathcal{S}$ defined by equations (3.1) and (3.2) does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank ≤ 2 and $\dim \mathcal{S} = (m-2)(n-2)$.*

Proof. Let us fix an infinite dimensional Hilbert space $\mathcal{K}$ with orthonormal basis $\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots\}$, and identify $\mathbb{C}^m$ and $\mathbb{C}^n$ with $\text{span}\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots, |e_{m-1}\rangle\}$ and $\text{span}\{|e_0\rangle, |e_1\rangle, \dots, |e_{n-1}\rangle\}$, respectively, as done before. If for any element $|v\rangle \in \mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$, we have $|v\rangle = \sum_{ij} c_{ij} |e_i\rangle \otimes |e_j\rangle$, then we identify the bipartite system $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ with the space $M_{m \times n}$ of $m \times n$ matrices by the isometric isomorphism $\phi : \mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n \rightarrow M_{m \times n}$ defined by $\phi(|v\rangle) = [c_{ij}]_{m \times n}$. It follows from the standard proof of Schmidt decomposition based on the singular value decomposition that, an element of $\mathbb{C}^m \otimes \mathbb{C}^n$ has Schmidt rank at least r , if and only if the corresponding $m \times n$ matrix is of rank at least r . Also, it is known that a matrix has rank at least r if and only if it has a nonzero minor of order r (cf. [3, page 18]). Thus, it is enough to construct a set of $(m-2)(n-2)$ linearly independent matrices, which are image under ϕ of a basis of $\mathcal{S}$, such that any linear combination of these matrices has a nonzero minor of order 3.

Label the anti-diagonals of any $m \times n$ matrix by non-negative integers k , such that the first anti-diagonal from upper left (of length one) is labelled $k = 0$ and value of k increases from upper left to lower right. Let the length of the k^{th} anti-diagonal be denoted by $|k|$. If we assume, without loss of generality, that $m \leq n$, then the formula for $|k|$ is

$$|k| = \begin{cases} k+1 & \text{for } 0 \leq k \leq m-1 \\ m & \text{for } m-1 \leq k \leq n-1 \\ m+n-(k+1) & \text{for } n-1 \leq k \leq N. \end{cases}$$

Recall that for $2 \leq k \leq N-2$, $\mathcal{S}^{(k)}$ is generated by the set

$$B_k = \{|e_{i-1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j+1}\rangle - 2|e_i\rangle \otimes |e_j\rangle + |e_{i+1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j-1}\rangle : 1 \leq i \leq m-2, \\ 1 \leq j \leq n-2, i+j=k\}.$$

For $2 \leq k \leq N-2$, let $\tilde{B}_k$ denote the image of B_k under the map ϕ . Note that any element of $\tilde{B}_k$ is the matrix obtained from the $m \times n$ zero matrix by replacing the k^{th} anti-diagonal by $(0, \dots, 0, 1, -2, 1, 0, \dots, 0)$. For $2 \leq k \leq N-2$ and $t = |k| - 2$, from Lemma 3.1, $\tilde{B}_k$ is a set of t linearly independent matrices. Also, by Lemma 3.1 it follows that if M is a matrix obtained by taking any linear combination of matrices from $\tilde{B}_k$, then M has at least 3 nonzero entries in the k^{th} anti-diagonal and the entries of M , other than those on k^{th} anti-diagonal, are zeros. Since the determinant of the 3×3 submatrix with these 3 nonzero elements in its principal anti-diagonal is clearly nonzero, any linear combination of the matrices in $\tilde{B}_k$ has at least one nonzero order-3 minor, thus has rank at least 3.

Let $\tilde{B} = \bigcup_{k=2}^{N-2} \tilde{B}_k$. Since elements from different $\tilde{B}_k$ have different nonzero anti-diagonal,

$\tilde{B}$ is linearly independent. Thus $B = \bigcup_{k=2}^{N-2} B_k$ is a basis for $\mathcal{S}$. Let C be a matrix obtained

by an arbitrary linear combination from the elements of $\tilde{B}$. Let κ be the largest k for which the linear combination involves an element from $\tilde{B}_k$. The κ^{th} anti-diagonal of C has at least 3 nonzero elements. Because κ labels the bottom-rightmost anti-diagonal of C that contains nonzero elements, the 3×3 submatrix of C , with these 3 nonzero elements in the principal anti-diagonal, has only zero entries in all its anti-diagonals which are below the principal anti-diagonal. Hence the 3×3 submatrix has nonzero determinant. Thus, the rank of C is at least 3. We conclude that $\mathcal{S}$ does not contain any vector of Schmidt rank ≤ 2 .

The dimension of $\mathcal{S}$ is equal to the cardinality of B . Without loss of generality, assume $m \leq n$. Then, the cardinality of B is given by

$$\begin{aligned} |B| &= \sum_{k=2}^{N-2} |B_k| = \sum_{k=2}^{N-2} (|k| - 2) \\ &= \sum_{k=2}^{m-2} (k-1) + \sum_{k=m-1}^{n-1} (m-2) + \sum_{k=n}^{m+n-4} (m+n-2-(k+1)) \\ &= (n-m+1)(m-2) + 2 \sum_{k=2}^{m-2} (k-1) \\ &= (m-2)(n-2). \end{aligned}$$

□

From the above theorem it follows that the basis

$$B = \bigcup_{k=2}^{N-2} \{|e_{i-1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j+1}\rangle - 2|e_i\rangle \otimes |e_j\rangle + |e_{i+1}\rangle \otimes |e_{j-1}\rangle : 1 \leq i \leq m-2, \\ 1 \leq j \leq n-2, i+j=k\},$$

of $\mathcal{S}$ is of Schmidt rank 3 (i.e., all the elements have Schmidt rank 3).

References

- [1] B. V. Rajarama Bhat. A completely entangled subspace of maximal dimension. *Int. J. Quantum Inform.*, 04(02):325–330, 2006.
- [2] T. Cubitt, A. Montanaro, and A. Winter. On the dimension of subspaces with bounded Schmidt rank. *Journal of Mathematical Physics*, 49(2):022107, 2008.
- [3] R. A. Horn and C. R. Johnson. *Matrix Analysis*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 1985.
- [4] R. Horodecki, P. Horodecki, M. Horodecki, and K. Horodecki. Quantum entanglement. *Rev. Mod. Phys.*, 81:865–942, 2009.
- [5] M. A. Nielsen and I. L. Chuang. *Quantum Computation and Quantum Information*. Cambridge University Press, New Delhi, India, 10th anniversary edition, 2013.
- [6] K. R. Parthasarathy. On the maximal dimension of a completely entangled subspace for finite level quantum systems. *Proceedings Mathematical Sciences*, 114(4):365–374, 2004.
- [7] B. M. Terhal and P. Horodecki. Schmidt number for density matrices. *Phys. Rev. A*, 61:040301, 2000.
- [8] N. R. Wallach. An unentangled Gleason’s theorem. In *Contemp. Math.*, volume 305, pages 291–298, 2002.

Priyabrata Bag
Department of Mathematics
Indian Institute of Technology Bombay
Mumbai, Maharashtra 400076, India
E-mail: priyabrata@iitb.ac.in

Santanu Dey
Department of Mathematics
Indian Institute of Technology Bombay
Mumbai, Maharashtra 400076, India
E-mail: santanudey@iitb.ac.in