

A lower bound on the number of homotopy types of simplicial complexes on n vertices

Andrew Newman *

February 27, 2022

Abstract

For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, let $h(n)$ denote the number of simplicial complexes on n vertices up to homotopy equivalence. Here we prove that $h(n) \geq 2^{2^{0.02n}}$ when n is large enough. Together with the trivial upper bound of 2^{2^n} on the number of labeled simplicial complexes on n vertices this proves a conjecture of Kalai that $h(n)$ is doubly exponential in n .

1 Introduction

In [10], the present author defines $T_d(G)$ for $d \geq 2$ and G a finite abelian group to be the smallest integer n so that there exists a d -dimensional simplicial complex X on n vertices with the torsion part of $H_{d-1}(X)$ (denoted $H_{d-1}(X)_T$) isomorphic to G . The main result in [10] is the upper bound in the following theorem. The lower bound was previously known due to [5].

Theorem (Theorem 1.1 from [10]). *For every fixed $d \geq 2$, there exist constants c_d and C_d so that for any finite abelian group G ,*

$$c_d(\log |G|)^{1/d} \leq T_d(G) \leq C_d(\log |G|)^{1/d}.$$

While the research direction leading to this result was motivated by experiments conducted in [4] examining the torison burst in random complexes, the result also says something about the number of homotopy types of simplicial complexes on n vertices. Indeed, another formulation of this result is that for every $d \geq 2$, there exists a constant C_d so that for every n , *every* abelian group G of size at most $\exp(n^d/C_d^d)$ is realizable as the torsion subgroup of the $(d-1)$ st homology group for some simplicial complex on n vertices. If we let $h(n, d)$ for $n, d \in \mathbb{N}$ denote the number of d -dimensional simplicial complexes on n vertices up to homotopy type, the bound on $T_d(G)$ implies that $h(n, d) \geq \exp(n^d/C_d^d)$. Therefore if $h(n)$ denotes the number of homotopy types of simplicial complexes on n vertices without restriction on the dimension, then we have that $\log h(n)$ grows faster than any polynomial in n . Thus it becomes natural to ask how much faster.

Of course there is an obvious upper bound on $h(n)$. In particular, $h(n) \leq 2^{2^n}$ since this bounds the number of labeled simplicial complexes on n vertices. An improved upper bound

*Some of this work was conducted at Ohio State University and funded in part by the National Science Foundation grants NSF-DMS #1547357 and #60041693, and the rest was conducted at Technische Universität Berlin funded by Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation) Graduiertenkolleg “Facets of Complexity” (GRK 2434)

comes from the n th Dedekind number $M(n)$ which counts exactly the number of labeled simplicial complexes on n vertices and [7] shows that $\log M(n) \leq (1 + o(1))\binom{n}{\lfloor n/2 \rfloor}$.

The question of the number of homotopy types of simplicial complexes on n vertices appears on MathOverflow as a question of Vidit Nanda [8], where Gil Kalai conjectures [6] that the number of homotopy types of simplicial complexes on n vertices is doubly exponential in n . Here we modify the argument from [10] to give the following lower bound on $h(n)$ to show that this is the case.

Theorem 1. *For n large enough, $h(n) \geq 2^{2^{0.02n}}$.*

We point out that the approach of examining which torsion groups can appear in homology is better than the best lower bound one could hope for by counting, say the possible sequence of Betti numbers. Indeed if X is a simplicial complex on n vertices then for all $0 \leq i < n$,

$$\beta_i(X) \leq \binom{n}{i+1} \leq 2^n,$$

and $\beta_i = 0$ for $i \geq n$. Thus the number of possible sequences of Betti numbers for a simplicial complex on n vertices is upper bounded by 2^{n^2} .

Unfortunately, we cannot directly apply the main result of [10], as the upper bound constant C_d is too large, directly from the proof of the result itself, it is exponential in d . Indeed even going through the argument in [10] more carefully still gives a constant C_d that is $\Theta(d^7)$ and here we need a constant C_d which grows linearly in d . Such a bound can be obtained in general, however this requires going through the entire argument from [10] and improving the constants in several places in ways that are not particularly interesting in general. To more efficiently prove the main result here, we restrict to a special case. Namely, we consider abelian 2-groups rather than general finite abelian groups and prove the following.

Theorem 2. *For d large enough and G an abelian group of order 2^{2^d} there exists a simplicial complex X on $25d$ vertices of dimension d with $H_{d-1}(X)_T \cong G$.*

Proof of Theorem 1 from Theorem 2. It is well known that for $m \in \mathbb{N}$ the number of nonisomorphic abelian groups of order m is given by $\pi(e_1)\pi(e_2) \cdots \pi(e_k)$ where $m = p_1^{e_1} p_2^{e_2} \cdots p_k^{e_k}$ is the prime factorization of m and π is the partition counting function. Therefore, for any d , the number of abelian groups of order 2^{2^d} is given by $\pi(2^d)$. A result of Hardy and Ramanujan [3] gives the asymptotic rate of growth for $\pi(\cdot)$, and here gives that $\log_2(\pi(2^d))$ is asymptotic to $C2^{d/2}$ where $C > 1$ is an explicit constant. Therefore for d large enough there are at least $2^{2^{d/2}}$ abelian groups of order 2^{2^d} and each of them may appear as $H_{d-1}(X)_T$ for some simplicial complex X on $25d$ vertices. Thus for n large enough, there are at least $2^{2^{n/50}}$, $(n/25)$ -dimensional complexes on n vertices which each have a unique group of order $2^{2^{n/25}}$ as the torsion part of the codimension 1 homology group. \square

Note that in the proof above and elsewhere below we implicitly treat certain real numbers as integers; to simplify the notation we suppress floor and ceiling symbols.

2 Construction of simplicial complexes with prescribed torsion in homology

Here we briefly review the proof of the main result of [10]. We will modify certain parts of this proof in the proof of Theorem 2, but the idea is the same. There are two steps to the proof in [10], for fixed d the two steps are:

1. Show that for every $d \geq 2$ and every abelian group G there exists a d -dimensional simplicial complex $X = X(G)$ on $O_d(\log |G|)$ vertices whose 1-skeleton has maximum degree $O_d(1)$ and $H_{d-1}(X)_T \cong G$. This is accomplished via an explicit construction.
2. Given G build the initial construction X from Step 1. Using the probabilistic method, in particular the Lovász Local Lemma, find a proper coloring c of the vertices of X having at most $O_d(\sqrt[d]{|V(X)|})$ colors so that no two $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces of X receive the exact same set of colors on their vertices. The “final construction” denoted (X, c) is a quotient of X determined by the coloring c and proves the upper bound in the theorem.

The initial construction here will remain the same, though we restrict to the case of abelian 2-groups. In general the initial construction is called a sphere-and-telescope construction. After a simple reduction to the case of cyclic groups, one builds X so that $H_{d-1}(X)_T = \mathbb{Z}/m\mathbb{Z}$ via a repeated squares presentations. Suppose that $m = 2^{n_0} + \dots + 2^{n_k}$, then $\mathbb{Z}/m\mathbb{Z}$ is given by the abelian group presentation $\langle a_1, a_2, \dots, a_{n_k} \mid 2a_1 = a_2, 2a_2 = a_3, \dots, 2a_{n_k-1} = a_{n_k}, a_{n_0} + a_{n_1} + \dots + a_{n_k} = 0 \rangle$. The “telescope” portion of the construction gives the relators $2a_i = a_{i+1}$, with the “sphere” (or more precisely punctured sphere) portion of the construction giving the last relator. Thus for powers of 2, we only need the telescope portion making the initial construction easier to describe.

For the final construction (X, c) is given as a quotient of X by the following definition.

Definition 3 (Definition 2.2 from [10]). If X is a simplicial complex with a coloring c of $V(X)$ we define the *pattern* of a face to be the multiset of colors on its vertices. If c is a proper coloring, in the sense that no two vertices connected by an edge receive the same color, we define the *pattern complex* (X, c) to be the simplicial complex on the set of colors of c so that a subset S of the colors of c is a face of (X, c) if and only if there is a face of X with S as its pattern.

Now, if X is d -dimensional and c gives a unique pattern to every $(d-1)$ dimensional face of X , then the torsion part of $H_{d-1}(X)$ is the same as that of $H_{d-1}((X, c))$. This appears as Lemma 2.3 in [10]. This is why the second step, accomplished via the probabilistic method, is to prove that such a coloring exists.

3 Proof of Theorem 2

For [10], it sufficed to have constants in the statements and proofs that depended on d , without actually computing those constants. In the present situation, we need to understand how these constants depend on d . Since we have a different focus here we don’t worry about obtaining a constant C_d that is linear in d in general, rather opting for the special case of abelian 2-groups. Moreover for 2-groups the deterministic part of the construction is the same as in [10], the probabilistic coloring part still uses the Lovász Local Lemma but in a different way than in [10]. Thus we begin with the probabilistic step.

To state the coloring lemma we reintroduce some notation from [10]. If X is a simplicial complex, we denote by $\text{skel}_i(X)$ the set of i -dimensional faces of X and for nonnegative integers i and j , we denote by $\Delta_{i,j}(X)$ the maximum of degree of an i -dimensional face in j -dimensional faces. That is

$$\Delta_{i,j}(X) = \max_{\sigma \in \text{skel}_i(X)} |\{\tau \in \text{skel}_j(X) \mid \sigma \subseteq \tau\}|.$$

Lemma 4. *Let X be a d -dimensional simplicial complex, for $d \geq 2$, on n vertices with $\Delta_{0,d-1}(X) \leq L$ for some L . If there exists a proper coloring c of the vertices of X having at most K colors so that no pair of intersecting $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces receive the same pattern by c then there exists a second proper coloring c' of $V(X)$ having at most $K(3eL^2n)^{1/d}$ colors so that no pair of $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces of X receive the same pattern by c' .*

As in [10], we will make use of the Lovász Local Lemma which we state here as it appears in the symmetric case in [1]:

Lovász Local Lemma ([2]). *Let A_1, A_2, \dots, A_n be events in an arbitrary probability space. Suppose that each event A_i is mutually independent of all the other events A_j but at most t , and that $\Pr[A_i] \leq p$ for all $1 \leq i \leq n$. If $ep(t+1) \leq 1$ then $\Pr[\bigwedge_{i=1}^n \overline{A_i}] > 0$*

Proof of Lemma 4. Let X be a simplicial complex colored by c as described in the statement. For c' , which handles the disjoint $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces, we will take the product of c with a second coloring c_2 found using the Lovász Local Lemma by considering the random process of coloring every vertex independently from a set of $(3eL^2n)^{1/d}$ colors. Moreover, we will also use the fact that we have colored the vertices properly by c . For a vertex-disjoint pair of $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces (σ, τ) , let $A_{\sigma, \tau}$ be the event that σ and τ receive the same pattern by the coloring $c' = (c, c_2)$. If σ and τ receive different patterns by c , then c_2 is irrelevant to guaranteeing that they do not receive the same pattern by c' . Thus we only have to consider vertex-disjoint pairs (σ, τ) where σ and τ receive the same pattern by c . Since c is a proper coloring of $V(X^{(1)})$ we have that the identical colorings of σ and τ induce a bijection $\varphi : V(\sigma) \rightarrow V(\tau)$ by sending each vertex in σ to the unique vertex in τ that received the same coloring under c . Thus σ, τ receive the same pattern by c' if and only if for every $v \in \sigma$, $c_2(v) = c_2(\varphi(v))$. For each v , this occurs with probability $(3eL^2n)^{-1/d}$. Thus for every vertex-disjoint pair (σ, τ) we have

$$\Pr(A_{\sigma, \tau}) \leq \frac{1}{((3eL^2n)^{1/d})^d} = \frac{1}{3eL^2n}$$

Now, we need to bound the number of (σ', τ') which have $A_{\sigma, \tau}$ not independent from $A_{\sigma', \tau'}$. This is bounded above by $2dL(Ln/d) = 2L^2n$ (pick one of the at most dL faces σ' which share a vertex with σ , then pick any of the at-most Ln/d faces for τ and multiply by two since we may reverse the role of σ and τ). Now, we have

$$e \frac{1}{3eL^2n} (2L^2n + 1) \leq 1,$$

so the Lovász Local Lemma applies. Thus there is a coloring c_2 , so that the resulting product c' of c and c_2 has that no two $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces receive the same pattern. \square

Now we just need to find K , L , and n from a colored initial construction in order to apply Lemma 4 to prove Theorem 2. We will prove the following theorem regarding the initial construction restricting to the case of 2-groups.

Lemma 5. *Let $d \geq 2$ be an integer. Then for every abelian 2-group G there exists a d -dimensional simplicial complex $X = X(G)$ with $H_{d-1}(X)_T \cong G$ so that the following bounds hold:*

$$|V(X)| \leq 2(d+1) \log_2 |G|$$

and

$$\Delta_{0, (d-1)}(X) \leq 2((2 + o_d(1))^d d)$$

And moreover there exists a proper coloring of $V(X)$ using at most $3(d+1)$ colors so that no pair of intersecting $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces receive the same pattern.

Before we prove this we will use it to prove Theorem 2.

Proof of Theorem 2. Fix $d \geq 2$ and G an abelian 2-group. We apply Lemma 4 to the initial construction X for G given by Lemma 5 with $K = 3(d+1)$, $L = 2((2 + o_d(1))^d d)$, and $n \leq$

$2(d+1)\log_2 |G|$. Thus there exists a coloring of X satisfying the conclusion of Lemma 4 having at most

$$(3d+3)(3e(2(2+o_d(1))^d d^2)^{1/d}(\log_2 |G|)^{1/d}$$

colors. As d tends to infinity, this approaches $3d(4\log_2^{1/d} |G|) = 12d\log_2^{1/d} |G|$. Thus for d large enough, the final construction for any G with $|G| = 2^{2^d}$ will have at most $25d$ vertices. \square

The full proof of Lemma 5 is omitted here as the construction is identical to the construction for the case of abelian 2-groups in [10]. Instead we only describe the construction and its coloring. In doing so we prove every part of Lemma 5 except that the homology group is correct, but this should be believable from the description and the full details to verify the homology group are given in Section 3 of [10].

The first observation to prove Lemma 5 is that we may restrict to the case that G is cyclic. Indeed, suppose that $G = \mathbb{Z}/(2^{e_1})\mathbb{Z} \oplus \mathbb{Z}/(2^{e_2})\mathbb{Z} \oplus \cdots \oplus \mathbb{Z}/(2^{e_t})\mathbb{Z}$ and we have Lemma 5 for cyclic groups. Then for each e_i there exists X_i , d -dimensional colored by colors $\{1, \dots, 3(d+1)\}$ so that no intersecting pair of $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces receive the same pattern. And for each i , $H_{d-1}(X_i) = \mathbb{Z}/(2^{e_i})\mathbb{Z}$, $\Delta_{0,(d-1)}(X_i) \leq 2((2+o_d(1))^d d)$ and X_i has at most $2(d+1)e_i$ vertices. Now taking X to be the disjoint union of the X_i (with the vertex colorings remaining unchanged) gives us Lemma 5 for G .

The construction for cyclic 2-groups is now given by first defining a family of building blocks $P(d)$ for $d \geq 2$. Each $P(d)$ is a simplicial complex on $2(d+1)$ vertices with $H_{d-1}(P(d)) = \langle a, b \mid 2a = b \rangle$, with the homology class of a being represented by the boundary of a d -simplex and the homology class b being represented by the boundary of another d -simplex disjoint from the first. Note that the $2(d+1)$ vertices in these two simplex boundaries constitute all the vertices of $P(d)$. Now for given $d, t \in \mathbb{N}$ with $d \geq 2$, take t copies of $P(d)$, denoted P_1, \dots, P_t with $H_{d-1}(P_i) = \langle a_i, b_i \mid 2a_i = b_i \rangle$. Next for $i \leq t-1$, glue P_i to P_{i+1} by identifying the simplex boundary representing b_i to the simplex boundary representing a_{i+1} . Finally fill in the d -simplex boundary representing b_t with a d -simplex and we have a complex $X = X(d, t)$ with $H_{d-1}(X) = \langle a_1, \dots, a_t, b_t \mid 2a_1 = a_2, 2a_2 = a_3, \dots, 2a_{t-1} = a_t, 2a_t = b_t, b_t = 0 \rangle = \langle a_1 \mid 2^t a_1 = 0 \rangle \cong \mathbb{Z}/2^t \mathbb{Z}$.

Now clearly the number of vertices in $X(d, t)$ is $(d+1)(t+1) \leq (d+1)(\log_2 |\mathbb{Z}/2^t \mathbb{Z}| + 1) \leq 2(d+1)\log_2 |\mathbb{Z}/2^t \mathbb{Z}|$. Moreover as each vertex is contained in at most 2 copies of $P(d)$, we have that $\Delta_{0,d-1}(X(d, t))$ is at most twice the number of $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces of $P(d)$. We should therefore describe how $P(d)$ is constructed.

The complex $P(d)$ is constructed by induction on the dimension. For $P(2)$, we start with the triangulation of the real projective plane with 6 vertices, 15 edges, and 10 faces given by antipodal identification of the icosahedron, and then delete a single face. Explicitly, $P(2)$ can be described as the pure simplicial complex on vertex set $\{1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6\}$ with 2-dimensional faces

$$[1, 2, 6], [1, 3, 6], [2, 4, 6], [3, 5, 6], [2, 3, 4], [2, 3, 5], [1, 3, 4], [1, 4, 5], [1, 2, 5].$$

For the induction with $d \geq 3$ we observe that $P(d-1)$ has $2d$ vertices which define two disjoint $(d-1)$ -simplex boundaries each representing a homology class. Let v_1, \dots, v_d and u_1, \dots, u_d be the vertices defining these two simplex boundaries. Now construct $P(d)$ by taking the suspension of $P(d-1)$ with suspension points v' and u' , then add two new d -dimensional faces $[u', v_1, \dots, v_d]$ and $[v', u_1, \dots, u_d]$ (as well as the $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces $[v_1, \dots, v_d]$ and $[u_1, \dots, u_d]$). In $P(d)$ the two simplex boundaries representing the relevant homology class are the simplex boundary on v', v_1, v_2, \dots, v_d and the simplex boundary on u', u_1, u_2, \dots, u_d .¹

¹When formally defining $P(d)$ in [10], it is necessary to be careful with how the simplices are oriented so that things may be properly attached to give the right torsion group. If you want a cyclic group of order $2^0 + 2^3 + 2^6 = 73$, you don't want to attach something "backwards" and end up with $2^0 - 2^3 + 2^6 = 57$ instead, for instance. We exclude these details here.

It is clear that $P(d+1)$ will have $2d+2$ vertices and will have, if we let f_i denote the usual i th entry of the f -vector of a complex, $2(f_d(P(d))) + 2$ top-dimensional faces with $P(2)$ having 9 2-dimensional faces. Thus we obtain the claimed bound on the number of $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces.

The last piece to check is that we may color $X = X(d, t)$ with $3(d+1)$ colors so that no pair of intersecting $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces receives the same pattern. We have that X is given by t copies of P_i so its vertices come from $t+1$, d -simplex boundaries. Denote these simplex boundaries S_0, S_1, \dots, S_t and properly color the vertices of S_i arbitrarily with colors $\{1, \dots, d+1\}$ for $i \equiv 0 \pmod 3$, with colors $\{d+2, \dots, 2d+2\}$ for $i \equiv 1 \pmod 3$, and with colors $\{2d+3, \dots, 3d+3\}$ for $i \equiv 2 \pmod 3$. Now any pair of vertices at distance (in the 1-skeleton of X) at most 2 from one another receive different colors so there can be no intersecting $(d-1)$ -dimensional faces that receive the same pattern. This now completes the sketch of the argument for Lemma 5. With this we have completed the proof of Theorem 1.

4 Remarks

For the proof of the main result, we restricted to the case of constructing complexes with prescribed abelian 2-groups in homology. This was to make the argument simpler as it relates to the main focus here. It is possible to prove that for any $d \geq 2$ and any abelian group G , $T_d(G) \leq Cd \sqrt[d]{\log |G|}$ where C is an absolute constant. Chapter 4 of the author's Ph.D. thesis [9] gives such an argument with $C = 50$. However for $|G|$ not a power of 2 the deterministic construction is more complicated as is the first round coloring. Such an argument could be worth going through here if it could be pushed further to give that for any $\epsilon > 0$ and n large enough $\log_2 \log_2 h(n) \geq (1 - \epsilon)n$, but this does not seem to be the case.

In the other direction, the connection to enumerating homotopy types does give the following proposition:

Proposition 6. *Let $C < \frac{\log_2(e)}{e}$, then there exists d arbitrarily large and a finite abelian group G so that $T_d(G) > Cd \sqrt[d]{\log_2 |G|}$.*

Proof. Suppose that for every d large enough and every finite abelian group G that $T_d(G) \leq Cd \sqrt[d]{\log_2 |G|}$ with $C < \log_2(e)/e$. Then every cyclic group of order e^{e^d} is realizable as the torsion part of the $(d-1)$ st homology group for a simplicial complex on $Cde \sqrt[d]{\log_2(e)}$ vertices. For d large enough this is at most $C_1 de$ for some C_1 satisfying $C < C_1 < \frac{\log_2(e)}{e}$. Thus setting $n = C_1 de$ we have at least $e^{e^{n/(C_1 e)}}$ homotopy types for simplicial complexes on n vertices, but this exceeds the trivial upper bound of 2^{2^n} . \square

Based on this proposition, we end with the following conjecture which would imply that $\frac{\log_2 \log_2 h(n)}{n} \rightarrow 1$ as $n \rightarrow \infty$.

Conjecture. For $d \geq 2$ and G an arbitrary finite abelian group

$$T_d(G) \leq (1 + o_d(1)) \frac{d}{\log(2)e} \sqrt[d]{\log |G|}$$

References

- [1] N. Alon and J. H. Spencer, *The probabilistic method*, fourth ed., Wiley Series in Discrete Mathematics and Optimization, John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Hoboken, NJ, 2016. MR 3524748
- [2] P. Erdős and L. Lovász, *Problems and results on 3-chromatic hypergraphs and some related questions*, (1975), 609–627. Colloq. Math. Soc. János Bolyai, Vol. 10. MR 0382050

- [3] G. H. Hardy and S. Ramanujan, *Asymptotic Formulae in Combinatory Analysis*, Proc. London Math. Soc. (2) **17** (1918), 75–115. MR 1575586
- [4] M. Kahle, F. H. Lutz, A. Newman, and K. Parsons, *Cohen–Lenstra heuristics for torsion in homology of random complexes*, Experimental Mathematics **0** (2018), no. 0, 0–0, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10586458.2018.1473821>.
- [5] G. Kalai, *Enumeration of \mathbf{Q} -acyclic simplicial complexes*, Israel J. Math. **45** (1983), no. 4, 337–351. MR 720308
- [6] G. Kalai (https://mathoverflow.net/users/1532/gil_kalai), *How many simplicial complexes on n vertices up to homotopy equivalence?*, MathOverflow, URL:<https://mathoverflow.net/q/230095> (version: 2016-02-03).
- [7] D. Kleitman and G. Markowsky, *On Dedekind’s problem: the number of isotone Boolean functions. II*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **213** (1975), 373–390. MR 0382107
- [8] V. Nanda (https://mathoverflow.net/users/18263/vidit_nanda), *How many simplicial complexes on n vertices up to homotopy equivalence?*, MathOverflow, URL:<https://mathoverflow.net/q/102587> (version: 2012-07-18).
- [9] A. Newman, *Torsion in homology of random simplicial complexes*, 2018, Thesis (Ph.D.)–The Ohio State University.
- [10] ———, *Small Simplicial Complexes with Prescribed Torsion in Homology*, Discrete Comput. Geom. **62** (2019), no. 2, 433–460, <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00454-018-9987-y>. MR 3988121