Upper density of monochromatic infinite paths

Jan Corsten∗ Louis DeBiasio† Ander Lamaison‡
Richard Lang§

10th August 2018

We prove that in every 2-colouring of the edges of $K_N$ there exists a monochromatic (one-way infinite) path $P$ such that $V(P)$ has upper density at least $(12 + \sqrt{8})/17 \approx 0.87226$ and further show that this is best possible. This settles a problem of Erdős and Galvin.

1 Introduction

Given a complete graph $K_n$, whose edges are coloured in red and blue, what is the longest monochromatic path one can find? Gerencsér and Gyárfás [4] proved that there is always a red or blue path on $\lceil(2n + 1)/3\rceil$ vertices, which is best possible. It is natural to consider a density analogue of this result for 2-colourings of $K_N$. The upper density of a graph $G$ with $V(G) \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ is defined as

$$\overline{d}(G) = \limsup_{t \to \infty} \frac{|V(G) \cap \{1, 2, \ldots, t\}|}{t}.$$ 

The lower density is defined similarly in terms of the infimum and we speak of the density, whenever lower and upper density coincide.

Erdős and Galvin [3] described a 2-colouring of $K_N$ in which every monochromatic (one-way infinite) path has lower density 0 and thus we restrict our attention to upper densities. Rado [9] proved that every $r$-edge-coloured $K_N$ contains $r$ vertex-disjoint monochromatic paths which together cover all vertices. In particular, one of them must have upper density at least $1/r$. Erdős and Galvin [3] proved that in every 2-colouring of $K_N$ there is a monochromatic path $P$ with $\overline{d}(P) \geq 2/3$. Moreover, they constructed a 2-colouring of $K_N$ in which every monochromatic path $P$ has upper density at most $8/9$. DeBiasio and McKenney [2] recently improved the lower bound to $3/4$ and conjectured

∗Research supported by an LSE PhD scholarship.
†Research supported in part by Simons Foundation Collaboration Grant # 283194.
‡Research supported by a Berlin Mathematical School Phase II scholarship.
§Research supported by EPSRC, grant no. EP/P002420/1.
the correct value to be $8/9$. Progress towards this conjecture was made by Lo, Sanhueza-
Matamala and Wang [8], who raised the lower bound to $(9 + \sqrt{17})/16 \approx 0.82019$.

We prove that the correct value is in fact $(12 + \sqrt{8})/17 \approx 0.87226$.

**Theorem 1.1.** The edges of $K_N$ can be 2-coloured such that every monochromatic path
has upper density at most $(12 + \sqrt{8})/17$.

**Theorem 1.2.** In every 2-colouring of the edges of $K_N$, there is a monochromatic path
of upper density at least $(12 + \sqrt{8})/17$.

Now that we have solved the problem for two colors, it would be very interesting to
make any improvement on Rado’s lower bound of $1/r$ for $r \geq 3$ colors (see [2, Corollary
3.5] for the best known upper bound). In particular for three colors, the correct value is
between $1/3$ and $1/2$.

## 2 Notation

We write $\mathbb{N}$ to be the positive integers with the standard ordering. Throughout the paper
when referring to a finite graph on $n$ vertices, it is always assumed that the vertex set is
$[n] = \{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ and that it is ordered in the natural way. A (one-way) infinite path
$P$ is a graph with vertex set $V(P) = \{v_i : i \in \mathbb{N}\}$ and edge set $E(P) = \{v_i v_{i+1} : i \in \mathbb{N}\}$. For a graph $G$ with $V(G) \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ and $t \in \mathbb{N}$, we define

$$d(G, t) = \frac{|V(G) \cap [t]|}{t}.$$ 

Thus we can express the upper density of $G$ as $\overline{d}(G) = \limsup_{t \to \infty} d(G, t)$.

## 3 Upper bound

In this section, we will prove Theorem 1.1. Let $q > 1$ be a real number, whose exact
value will be chosen later on. We start by defining a colouring of the edges of the infinite
complete graph. Let $A_0, A_1, \ldots$ be a partition of $\mathbb{N}$, such that every element of $A_i$
precedes every element of $A_{i+1}$ and $|A_i| = \lfloor q^i \rfloor$. We colour the edges of $G = K_\mathbb{N}$ such
that every edge $uv$ with $u \in A_i$ and $v \in A_j$ is red if $\min\{i, j\}$ is odd, and blue if it is
even. A straightforward calculation shows that for $q = 2$, every monochromatic path
$P$ in $G$ satisfies $\overline{d}(P) \leq 8/9$ (see Theorem 1.5 in [3]). We will improve this bound by
reordering the vertices of $G$.

For convenience, we will say that the vertex $v \in A_i$ is red if $i$ is odd and blue if $i$ is
even. We also denote by $B$ the set of blue vertices and by $R$ be the set of red vertices.
We define a monochromatic red matching $M_r$ by forming a matching between $A_{2i-1}$ and
the first $|A_{2i-1}|$ vertices of $A_{2i}$ for each $i \geq 1$. Similarly, we define a monochromatic blue
matching $M_b$ by forming a matching between $A_{2i}$ and the first $|A_{2i}|$ vertices of $A_{2i+1}$ for
each $i \geq 0$. 
Figure 1: The colouring for \( q = 2 \).

Next, let us define a bijection \( f: \mathbb{N} \to V(G) \), which will serve as reordering of \( G \). Let \( r_i^* \) denote the \( t \)-th red vertex not in \( M_b \), and \( b_i^* \) denote the \( t \)-th blue vertex not in \( M_r \). The function \( f \) is defined as follows. We start enumerating blue vertices, in their order, until we reach \( b_1^* \). Then we enumerate red vertices, in their order, until we reach \( r_1^* \). Then we enumerate blue vertices again until we reach \( b_2^* \). We continue enumerating vertices in this way, changing colours whenever we find an \( r_i^* \) or a \( b_i^* \). (See also Figure 1.) Finally, for every \( H \subseteq G \), we define

\[
\bar{d}(H; f) = \limsup_{t \to \infty} \frac{|V(H) \cap f([t])|}{t}.
\]

Note that \( \bar{d}(H; f) \) is the upper density of \( H \) in the reordered graph \( f^{-1}(G) \).

**Claim 3.1.** Let \( P_r \) and \( P_b \) be infinite monochromatic red and blue paths in \( G \), respectively. Then \( \bar{d}(P_r; f) \leq \bar{d}(M_r; f) \) and \( \bar{d}(P_b; f) \leq \bar{d}(M_b; f) \).

**Claim 3.2.** We have

\[
\bar{d}(M_r; f), \bar{d}(M_b; f) \leq \frac{q^2 + 2q - 1}{q^2 + 3q - 2}.
\]

We can easily derive Theorem 1.1 from these two claims. Note that the rational function in Claim 3.2 evaluates to \( (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 \) at \( q := \sqrt{2} + 1 \). It then follows from Claim 3.1 and 3.2, that every monochromatic path \( P \) in \( G \) satisfies \( \bar{d}(P; f) \leq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 \). Thus we can define the desired colouring of \( K_N \), by colouring each edge \( ij \) with the colour of the edge \( f(i)f(j) \) in \( G \).

It remains to prove Claim 3.1 and 3.2.

**Proof of Claim 3.1.** By symmetry, it is enough to show \( \bar{d}(P_r; f) \leq \bar{d}(M_r; f) \). We prove that, for every positive integer \( k \), we have \( |V(P_r) \cap f([k])| \leq |V(M_r) \cap f([k])| \). Assume, for contradiction, that this is wrong and let \( k \) be the minimum positive integer for which the inequality does not hold. Every red vertex is saturated by \( M_r \), so \( |V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B| > |V(M_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B| \). By minimality of \( k \), \( f(k) \) must be in \( P_r \) but not in \( M_r \), and in particular it must be blue.
Let $f(k) \in A_{2i}$. Since $f(k) \not\in M_r$, we know that $f(k)$ is not among the first $|A_{2i-1}|$ vertices of $A_{2i}$. Therefore

$$|V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B| > |V(M_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B| = \sum_{j=1}^i |A_{2j-1}|. \quad (3.1)$$

On the other hand, every edge between two blue vertices is blue, so the successor of every blue vertex in $P_r$ is red, and in particular there is a red matching between $V(P_r) \cap B$ and $R$ saturating $V(P_r) \cap B$. So by (3.1), the number of red neighbours of $V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B$ is at least $|V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B| > \sum_{j=1}^i |A_{2j-1}|$. Observe that by definition of $f$, we have $V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B \subseteq \bigcup_{j=0}^i A_{2j}$. Hence the red neighbourhood of $V(P_r) \cap f([k]) \cap B$ is contained in $\bigcup_{j=1}^i A_{2j-1}$. A contradiction.

**Proof of Claim 3.2.** Let $\ell_r(t)$ and $\ell_b(t)$ denote the position of $r^*_t$ among the red vertices and of $b^*_t$ among the blue vertices, respectively. In other words, let $\ell_r(t) = i$ where $r^*_t = r_i$ and $\ell_b(t) = j$ where $b^*_t = b_j$ (so for example in Figure 1, $\ell_r(4) = 9$ and $\ell_b(4) = 14$). Note that $f^*(\ell_b(t) + \ell_r(t)) = r^*_t$, so for $k \geq \ell_b(t) + \ell_r(t) - 1$, $f^*([k])$ has at least $t - 1$ vertices outside of each of $M_r$ and $M_b$. As a consequence, we obtain

$$\bar{d}(M_r; f), \ \bar{d}(M_b; f) \leq \limsup_{t \to \infty} \left(1 - \frac{t - 1}{\ell_r(t) + \ell_b(t) - 1}\right). \quad (3.2)$$

It is easy to see that

$$\ell_r(t) = t + \sum_{j=0}^{i-1} |A_{2j+1}| \text{ for } \sum_{j=0}^{i-1}(|A_{2j+1}| - |A_{2j}|) < t \leq \sum_{j=0}^{i}(|A_{2j+1}| - |A_{2j}|), \text{ and}$$

$$\ell_b(t) = t + \sum_{j=1}^{i} |A_{2j-1}| \text{ for } \sum_{j=1}^{i-1}(|A_{2j}| - |A_{2j-1}|) < t - |A_0| \leq \sum_{j=1}^{i}(|A_{2j}| - |A_{2j-1}|).$$

Note that $\ell_r(t) - t$ and $\ell_b(t) - t$ are piecewise constant. Thus, in order to compute the right-hand side of (3.2), it suffices to consider values of $t$ for which $\ell_r(t) - t > \ell_r(t-1) - (t-1)$ or $\ell_b(t) - t > \ell_b(t-1) - (t-1)$. We will do the calculations for the former case (the latter case is similar), in which we have

$$t = 1 + \sum_{j=0}^{i-1}(|A_{2j+1}| - |A_{2j}|) = 1 + \sum_{j=0}^{i-1}(1 + o(1))q^{2j}(q - 1) = (1 + o(1))\frac{q^{2i}}{q + 1},$$

$$\ell_r(t) = t + \sum_{j=0}^{i} |A_{2j}| = (1 + o(1))\left(\frac{q^{2i}}{q + 1} + \sum_{j=0}^{i} q^{2j}\right) = (1 + o(1))(q^2 + q - 1)\frac{q^{2i}}{q^2 - 1}, \text{ and}$$

$$\ell_b(t) = t + \sum_{j=1}^{i} |A_{2j-1}| = (1 + o(1))\left(\frac{q^{2i}}{q + 1} + \sum_{j=0}^{i} q^{2j-1}\right) = (1 + o(1))\frac{(2q - 1)q^{2i}}{q^2 - 1}.$$ 

Plugging this into (3.2) gives the desired result. □
4 Lower bound

In this section we prove Theorem 1.2. A total colouring of graph $G$ is a colouring of $V(G) \cup E(G)$. Due to an argument of Erdős and Galvin, the problem of bounding the upper density of monochromatic paths in edge coloured graphs can be reduced to the problem of bounding the upper density of monochromatic path forests in totally coloured graphs.

**Definition 4.1** (Monochromatic path forest). Given a totally coloured graph $G$, a forest $F \subseteq G$ is said to be a monochromatic path forest if $\Delta(F) \leq 2$ and there is a colour $c$ such that all leaves, isolated vertices, and edges of $F$ receive colour $c$.

**Lemma 4.2.** For every $\gamma > 0$ and $k \in \mathbb{N}$, there is some $n_0 = n_0(k, \gamma)$ so that the following is true for every $n \geq n_0$. For every total 2-colouring of $K_n$, there is an integer $t \in [k, n]$ and a monochromatic path forest $F$ with $d(F, t) \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma$.

Some standard machinery related to Szemerédi’s regularity lemma, adapted to the ordered setting, will allow us to reduce the problem of bounding the upper density of monochromatic path forests to the problem of bounding the upper density of monochromatic simple forests.

**Definition 4.3** (Monochromatic simple forest). Given a totally coloured graph $G$, a forest $F \subseteq G$ is said to be a monochromatic simple forest if $\Delta(F) \leq 1$ and there is a colour $c$ such that all edges and isolated vertices of $F$ receive colour $c$ and at least one endpoint of each edge of $F$ receives colour $c$.

**Lemma 4.4.** For every $\gamma > 0$, there exists $N \in \mathbb{N}$ such that, for each $0 < \alpha \leq \gamma/(32N)$, the following holds. Let $k$ be a positive integer and $G$ be a totally 2-coloured graph on $kN$ vertices with minimum degree at least $(1 - \alpha)kN$. Then there exists an integer $t \in [k/8, kN]$ and a monochromatic simple forest $F$ such that $d(F, t) \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma$.

The real heart of the proof will be Lemma 4.4 which we prove in Section 4.3, but first, in the next two subsections we show how to deduce Theorem 1.2 from Lemmas 4.2 and 4.4.

4.1 From path forests to paths

In this section we use Lemma 4.2 to prove Theorem 1.2. Our exposition follows that of Theorem 1.6 in [2].

**Proof of Theorem 1.2.** Fix a 2-colouring of the edges of $K_N$ in red and blue. We define a 2-colouring of the vertices by colouring $n \in \mathbb{N}$ red if there are infinitely many $m \in \mathbb{N}$ such that the edge $nm$ is red and blue otherwise.

**Case 1.** Suppose there are vertices $x$ and $y$ of the same colour, say red, and a finite set $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ such that there is no red path disjoint from $S$ which connects $x$ to $y$.

We partition $\mathbb{N} \setminus S$ into sets $X, Y, Z$, where $x' \in X$ if and only if there is a red path, disjoint from $S$, which connects $x'$ to $x$ and $y' \in Y$ if and only if there is a red path
disjoint from $S$ which connects $y$ to $y'$. Note that every edge from $X \cup Y$ to $Z$ is blue. Since $x$ and $y$ are coloured red, both $X$ and $Y$ are infinite, and by choice of $x$ and $y$ all edges in the bipartite graph between $X$ and $Y \cup Z$ are blue. Hence there is a blue path with vertex set $X \cup Y \cup Z = \mathbb{N} \setminus S$.

**Case 2.** Suppose that for every pair of vertices $x$ and $y$ of the same colour $c$, and every finite set $S \subseteq \mathbb{N}$, there is a path from $x$ to $y$ of colour $c$ which is disjoint from $S$.

Let $\gamma_n$ be a sequence of positive reals tending to zero, and let $a_n$ and $k_n$ be increasing sequences of integers such that

$$a_n \geq n_0(k_n, \gamma_n) \text{ and } k_n/(a_1 + \cdots + a_{n-1} + k_n) \to 1,$$

where $n_0(k, \gamma)$ is as in Lemma 4.2. Let $\mathbb{N} = (A_i)$ be a partition of $\mathbb{N}$ into consecutive intervals with $|A_n| = a_n$. By Lemma 4.2 there are monochromatic path forests $F_n$ with $V(F_n) \subseteq A_n$ and initial segments $I_n \subseteq A_n$ of length at least $k_n$ such that

$$|V(F_n) \cap I_n| \geq \left( \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17} - \gamma_n \right) |I_n|.$$

It follows that for any $G \subseteq K_\mathbb{N}$ containing infinitely many $F_n$’s we have

$$\bar{d}(G) \geq \limsup_{n \to \infty} \frac{|V(F_n) \cap I_n|}{a_1 + \cdots + a_{n-1} + |I_n|} = \limsup_{n \to \infty} \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17} - \gamma_n = \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17}.$$

By the pigeonhole principle, there are infinitely many $F_n$’s of the same colour, say blue. We will recursively construct a blue path $P$ which contains infinitely many of these $F_n$’s. To see how this is done, suppose we have constructed a finite initial segment $p$ of $P$. We will assume as an inductive hypothesis that $P$ ends at a blue vertex $v$. Let $n$ be large enough that $\min(A_n)$ is greater than every vertex in $p$, and $F_n$ is blue. Let $F_n = \{P_1, \ldots, P_s\}$ for some $s \in \mathbb{N}$ and let $w_i, w'_i$ be the endpoints of the path $P_i$ (note that $w_i$ and $w'_i$ could be equal) for every $i \in [s]$. By the case assumption, there is a blue path $q_1$ connecting $v$ to $w_1$, such that $q_1$ is disjoint from $A_1 \cup \cdots \cup A_n$. Similarly, there is a blue path $q_2$ connecting $w'_1$ to $w_2$, such that $q_2$ is disjoint from $A_1 \cup \cdots \cup A_n \cup \{q_1\}$. Continuing in this fashion, we find disjoint blue paths $q_3, \ldots, q_s$ such that $q_i$ connects $w'_{i-1}$ to $w_i$. Hence, we can extend $p$ to a path $p'$ which contains all of the vertices of $F_n$ and ends at a blue vertex. \hfill \Box

### 4.2 From simple forests to path forests

In this section we use Lemma 4.4 to prove Lemma 4.2. The proof is based on Szemerédi’s Regularity Lemma, which we introduce below. The main difference to standard applications of the Regularity Lemma is, that we have to define an ordering of the reduced graph, which approximately preserves densities. This is done by choosing a suitable initial partition.

Let $G = (V, E)$ be a graph and $A$ and $B$ be disjoint subsets of $V$ of the same size. We write $e_G(A, B)$ for the number of edges in $G$ with one vertex in $A$ and one in $B$ and define the density of the pair $(A, B)$ to be $d_G(A, B) = e_G(A, B)/(|A||B|)$. The pair
$(A, B)$ is $\varepsilon$-regular (in $G$) if we have $|d_G(A', B') - d_G(A, B)| \leq \varepsilon$ for all $A' \subseteq A$ with $|A'| \geq \varepsilon |A|$ and $B' \subseteq B$ with $|B'| \geq \varepsilon |B|$. It is well-known (see for instance [5]) that dense regular pairs contain almost spanning paths. We include a proof of this fact for completeness.

**Lemma 4.5.** For $0 < \varepsilon < 1/4$ and $d \geq 2\sqrt{\varepsilon} + \varepsilon$, every $\varepsilon$-regular pair $(A, B)$ with density at least $d$ contains a path with both endpoints in $A$ and covering all but at most $2\sqrt{\varepsilon}|A|$ vertices of $A \cup B$.

**Proof.** We will construct a path $P_k = (a_1b_1 \ldots a_k)$ for every $k = 1, \ldots, \lceil (1 - \sqrt{\varepsilon})|A| \rceil$ such that $B_k := N(a_k) \setminus V(P_k)$ has size at least $\varepsilon|B|$. As $d \geq \varepsilon$, this is easy for $k = 1$. Assume now that we have constructed $P_k$ for some $1 \leq k < (1 - \sqrt{\varepsilon})|A|$. We will show how to extend $P_k$ to $P_{k+1}$. By $\varepsilon$-regularity of $(A, B)$, the set $\bigcup_{b \in B_k} N(b) \setminus V(P_k)$ has size at least $(1 - \varepsilon)|A|$. So $A' := \bigcup_{b \in B_k} N(b) \setminus V(P_k)$ has size at least $(\sqrt{\varepsilon} - \varepsilon)|A| \geq \varepsilon|A|$. Let $B' = B \setminus V(P_k)$ and note that $|B'| \geq \sqrt{\varepsilon}|B|$ as $k < (1 - \sqrt{\varepsilon})|A|$ and $|A| = |B|$. By $\varepsilon$-regularity of $(A, B)$, there exists $a_{k+1} \in A'$ with at least $(d - \varepsilon)|B'| \geq 2\varepsilon|B|$ neighbours in $B'$. Thus we can define $P_{k+1} = (a_1b_1 \ldots a_kb_{k+1}a_{k+1})$, where $b_{k+1} \in B_k \cap N(a_{k+1})$. \qed

A partition $\{V_i\}_{i \in [m]}$ of $V$ is said to refine another partition $\{W_j\}_{j \in [\ell]}$ of $V$ if, for all $i \in [m]$, there is some $j \in [\ell]$ with $V_i \subseteq W_j$.

**Lemma 4.6** (Regularity Lemma [6, 10]). For every $\varepsilon > 0$ and $m_0, \ell \geq 1$ there exists $M = M(\varepsilon, m_0, \ell)$ such that the following holds. Let $G$ be a graph on $n$ vertices whose edges are coloured in red and blue and let $d > 0$. Let $\{W_i\}_{i \in [\ell]}$ be a partition of $V(G)$. Then there exists a partition $\{V_0, \ldots, V_m\}$ of $V(G)$ and a subgraph $H$ of $G$ with vertex set $V(G) \setminus V_0$ such that the following holds:

(i) $m_0 \leq m \leq M$;

(ii) $\{V_i\}_{i \in [m]}$ refines $\{W_i\}_{i \in [\ell]}$;

(iii) $|V_0| \leq \varepsilon n$ and $|V_1| = \cdots = |V_m| \leq \lfloor \varepsilon n \rfloor$;

(iv) $\deg_H(v) \geq \deg_G(v) - (d + \varepsilon)n$ for each $v \in V(G) \setminus V_0$;

(v) $H[V_i]$ has no edges for $i \in [m]$;

(vi) all pairs $(V_i, V_j)$ are $\varepsilon$-regular and with density either $0$ or at least $d$ in each colour in $H$.

Let $G$ be a red and blue edge-coloured graph with a partition $V(G) = \{n\} = W_1 \cup \cdots \cup W_k$. Suppose that $V'(G) = \{n\} = V_0 \cup \cdots \cup V_m$ is obtained from Lemma 4.6 applied with parameters $\varepsilon$, $m_0$ and $d$. We define the $(\varepsilon, d)$-reduced graph $G'$ to be the graph with vertex-set $V(G') = \{m\}$ in which two vertices $i$ and $j$ are connected by a red (or blue) edge if $(V_i, V_j)$ is an $\varepsilon$-regular pair of density at least $d$ in $H$ in red (or blue, respectively). Note that it is thus possible that some $i$ and $j$ are connected by both a red and a blue edge. However, we will not make use of this fact. Finally, note that $G'$ inherits the minimum degree of $G$. More precisely, if $G$ has minimum degree $cn$, it
follows by a simple calculation (see [7, Proposition 42]) that $G'$ has minimum degree at least $(c - d - 2\varepsilon)m$.

**Proof of Lemma 4.2.** Suppose we are given $\gamma > 0$ and $k \in \mathbb{N}$ as input. Let $N \in \mathbb{N}$ be as in Lemma 4.4 with input $\gamma/4$. We choose constants $d, \varepsilon > 0$ and $\ell, m_0 \in \mathbb{N}$ satisfying

$$2\sqrt{\varepsilon} + \varepsilon \leq 1/\ell, d \leq \gamma/(256N)$$

and $m_0 \geq 4N/d$.

We obtain $M$ from Lemma 4.6 with input $\varepsilon, m_0$ and $2\ell$. Finally, set $n_0 = 16Nk$.

Now let $n \geq n_0$ and suppose that $K_n$ is an ordered complete graph on vertex set $[n]$ and with a total 2-colouring in red and blue. We have to show that there is an integer $t \in [k, n]$ and a monochromatic path forest $F$ such that $|V(F) \cap [t]| \geq ((12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma)t$.

Let $R$ be the set of red vertices and let $B$ be the set of blue vertices of $K_n$. Let $W = \{W_j\}_{j \in [\ell]}$ be a partition refining $\{R, B\}$ whose parts consist each of at most $[n/(\ell - 1)]$ subsequent elements of $R$ and $B$, respectively. Let $\{V_0, \ldots, V_m\}$ be a partition refining $W$ as detailed in Lemma 4.6 with $(\varepsilon, d)$-reduced graph $G$ of minimum degree $\delta(G) \geq (1 - 4d)m$. Set $k' = \lfloor m/N\rfloor > 0$ and observe that the subgraph $G'$ induced by $G$ in $[k'N]$ satisfies $\delta(G') \geq (1 - 8d)m$ as $m \geq 4N/d$. Define an ordering $\prec_G'$ on $V(G')$ by setting $V_i \prec_G' V_j$ if and only if $\max\{V_i\} < \max\{V_j\}$. Thus we can apply Lemma 4.4 with input $G', k', \gamma/4, \alpha = 8d \leq (\gamma/4)/(32N)$ to obtain an integer $t' \in [k'/8, k'N]$ and a, red say, simple forest $F' \subseteq G'$ such that $d_{G'}(F', t') \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma/4$.

Without loss of generality, let us assume that $V_{t'} \subseteq W_{j_R} \subseteq R$ for some $j_R \in [\ell]$ and let $t = \max\{W_{j_R}\}$. By definition of $\prec_G'$ and $W$ it follows that $V_i \subseteq [t]$ for all $i \leq t'$ and hence

$$t \geq t'|V_i| \geq \frac{k'}{8}|V_i| \geq \frac{m}{N} \left(1 - \varepsilon\right)^n \frac{n}{8m} \geq \frac{n}{16N}, \quad (4.1)$$

which implies, by choice of $n_0$, that $t \geq k$.

Let $t''$ be the largest index such that $t'' \leq t'$ and $V_{t''} \subseteq B$. If such a $t''$ exists, let $j_B \in [\ell]$ such that $V_{t''} \subseteq W_{j_B}$, otherwise set $j_B = j_R$. Hence $[t]$ is covered by $V_0 \cup W_{j_R} \cup W_{j_B} \cup \bigcup_{i \in [t']} V_i$. It follows that

$$t'|V_i| \geq t - |V_0| - |W_{j_R}| - |W_{j_B}|$$

$$\geq \left(1 - \varepsilon\right)\frac{n}{\ell} \frac{t}{t'} \quad (\text{by } (4.1))$$

$$\geq \left(1 - \frac{\gamma}{2}\right)t. \quad (4.2)$$

For every edge $ij \in E(F')$ with $V_i \subseteq R$, we apply Lemma 4.5 to choose a path $P_{ij}$ which starts and ends in $V_i$ and covers all but at most $2\sqrt{\varepsilon}|V_i|$ vertices of each $V_i$ and $V_j$. We denote the isolated vertices of $F'$ by $I'$. For each $i \in I'$ we have $V_i \subseteq R$. Hence the red path forest $F := \bigcup_{i \in I'} V_i \cup \bigcup_{ij \in E(F')} P_{ij} \subseteq K_n$ satisfies
\[ |V(F) \cap [t]| = \sum_{i \in I} |V_i \cap [t]| + \sum_{ij \in E(F')} (|V_i| - 2\sqrt{\varepsilon}|V_i|) \]
\[ \geq \sum_{i \in I \cap [t']} |V_i| + \sum_{ij \in (F' \setminus I) \cap [t']} (|V_i| - 2\sqrt{\varepsilon}|V_i|) \]
\[ \geq (1 - 2\sqrt{\varepsilon})|V_1||V(F') \cap [t']| \]
\[ \geq (1 - 2\sqrt{\varepsilon}) \left( \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17} - \frac{\gamma}{4} \right) t'|V_1| \]
\[ \geq \left( \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17} - \gamma \right) t \]  
(by (4.2)),

as desired. \qed

4.3 Upper density of simple forests

In this section we prove Lemma 4.4, which is based on the following definition and lemma.

**Definition 4.7** (Oscillation, \( \ell^+ (t), \ell^- (t) \)). Let \( a_1, \ldots, a_n \) be a non-decreasing sequence of real numbers. We define its oscillation as the maximum value \( T \) for which there exist indices \( i, j \in [n] \) with \( a_i - i \geq T \) and \( j - a_j \geq T \). If a sequence has oscillation \( T \), we define for all \( 0 < t \leq T \)

\[ \ell^+ (t) = \min \{ i \in [n] : a_i - i \geq t \}, \]
\[ \ell^- (t) = \min \{ j \in [n] : j - a_j \geq t \}. \]

**Lemma 4.8.** For all \( \gamma \in \mathbb{R}^+ \) there exists \( N \in \mathbb{N} \) such that for all \( k \in \mathbb{R}^+ \) and all sequences with oscillation at least \( kN \), there exists a real number \( t \in [k, kN] \) with

\[ \ell^+ (t) + \ell^- (t) \geq \left( 4 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma \right) t. \]

Before we give a proof of Lemma 4.8, let us show how this leads to the lower bound for the density of monochromatic simple forests.

**Proof of Lemma 4.4.** Suppose we are given \( \gamma' > 0 \). Let \( N \) be obtained from Lemma 4.8 with input \( \gamma = \gamma'/2 \) and suppose that \( 0 < \alpha \leq \gamma/16N \). Let \( k \) be a positive integer and consider a totally 2-coloured graph \( G' \) on \( n := kN \) vertices with minimum degree at least \((1 - \alpha)n\). Let \( R \) and \( B \) be the sets of red and blue vertices, respectively. Note that the edges of \( G' \) inside \( R \) and inside \( B \) are of no use in finding a dense monochromatic simple forest, so we let \( G \) be the bipartite graph obtained from \( G' \) by deleting all edges inside \( R \) and inside \( B \). We will show that there exists an integer \( L \in [k/8, n] \) and a monochromatic simple forest \( F \subseteq G \) such that \( d(F, L) \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - 2\gamma \).
For each red vertex $v$, let $d_b(v)$ be the number of blue edges incident to $v$. Let $a_1 \leq \cdots \leq a_{|R|}$ denote the degree sequence taken by $d_b(v)$. We claim that the sequence $a_1, \ldots, a_{|R|}$ has oscillation at least $kN/8$.

Let $X$ be a minimum vertex cover of the red edges. If $|X| \geq |B| - (1/8 + \alpha)n$, then König’s theorem implies that there is a red matching covering all but at most $(1/8 + \alpha)n$ blue vertices. Thus adding the red vertices we obtain a red simple forest $F$ with $d(F, kN) \geq 7/8 - \alpha \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma$. Therefore, we may assume $|X| < |B| - (1/8 + \alpha)n$. Every edge between $R \setminus (X \cap R)$ and $B \setminus (X \cap B)$ is blue. So there are at least $|R| - |X \cap R|$ red vertices $v$ with

$$d_b(v) \geq |B| - |X \cap B| - \alpha n = |X \cap R| + |B| - |X| - \alpha n > n/8 + |X \cap R|.$$ 

This implies that $a_{|X \cap R| + 1} \geq n/8 + |X \cap R| + 1$.

Let $Y$ be a minimum vertex cover of the blue edges. Using König’s theorem as above, we can assume that $|Y| \leq |R| - n/8$. Every edge between $R \setminus (Y \cap R)$ and $B \setminus (Y \cap B)$ is red, so there are at least $|R| - |Y \cap R|$ red vertices $v$ with

$$d_b(v) \leq |Y \cap R| = |Y| - |Y \cap R| \leq |R| - |Y \cap R| - \frac{n}{8}. $$

This implies that $a_{|R| - |Y \cap R|} \leq |R| - |Y \cap R| - n/8$.

It follows that the sequence $a_1, \ldots, a_{|R|}$ has oscillation at least $kN/8$. By Lemma 4.8, there is a real number $t' \in [k/8, kN/8]$ with

$$\ell^+(t') + \ell^-(t') \geq (4 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma)t'. $$

Let $t = \lceil t' \rceil$. Since the $a_i$ are all integers, $\ell^+(t) = \ell^+(t')$ and $\ell^-(t) = \ell^-(t')$. Let $L = \ell^+(t) + \ell^-(t) + t$. Our goal is now to find a monochromatic simple forest $F$ such that $d(F, L) \geq (12 + \sqrt{8})/17 - \gamma$. In fact, it is enough to show that there exists a
monochromatic simple forest $F$ that avoids at most $t + \alpha n$ vertices of $[L]$. Indeed, as $n = kN$, $t' \geq k/8$ and $\alpha \leq \gamma/(16N)$, we see that such a forest would satisfy

$$d(F, L) \geq \frac{L - t - \alpha n}{L} \geq \frac{(4 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma - 8\alpha N)t'}{(5 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma)t'} \geq \frac{(4 + \sqrt{8} - \frac{3}{2}\gamma)t'}{(5 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma)t'} \geq \frac{4 + \sqrt{8}}{5 + \sqrt{8}} - 2\gamma = \frac{12 + \sqrt{8}}{17} - 2\gamma$$

as desired.

It remains to show that there is a monochromatic simple forest that avoids at most $t + \alpha n$ vertices of $[L]$. Set $R' = R \cap [L]$ and $B' = B \cap [L]$.

Let $X'$ be a minimum vertex cover of the red edges in $[R, B']$. If $|X'| \geq |B'| - t - \alpha n$, then by König’s theorem there exists a red matching covering at least $|B'| - t - \alpha n$ vertices of $B'$. This together with the vertices in $R'$ gives a red simple forest covering all but at most $t + \alpha n$ vertices of $[L]$. So suppose $|X'| < |B'|- t - \alpha n$. Then every vertex $v$ in $R \setminus (X' \cap R)$ has

$$d_R(v) \geq |B'| - |X' \cap B'| - \alpha n = |X' \cap R| + |B'| - |X'| - \alpha n > |X' \cap R| + t.$$

So $a_{|X' \cap R| + 1} \geq |X' \cap R| + t + 1$, which implies $\ell^+(t) \leq |X' \cap R| \leq |X'| < |B'|- t - \alpha n$.

Consequently, we have $\ell^-(t) = L - t - \ell^+(t) > L - |B'| + \alpha n \geq |R'|$. Let $v_1, \ldots, v_{|R'|}$ be an ordering of the vertices of $R'$ such that $d_R(v_1) \leq \cdots \leq d_R(v_{|R'|})$. By the definition of $\ell^-(t)$, we have $d_R(v_i) \geq a_i \geq i - t$ for all $i \in [|R'|]$. Hence we can greedily find a blue matching saturating at least $|R'| - t$ vertices of $R'$ and thus together with $B'$, we have a blue simple forest covering all but at most $t$ vertices of $L$. \hfill \Box

The proof of Lemma 4.8 itself relies on the following definition and related lemma.

**Definition 4.9** ($k$-good, $u_0(k)$, $u_e(k)$). Let $a_1, \ldots, a_n$ be a sequence of non-negative real numbers and let $k$ be a positive real number. We say that the sequence is $k$-good if there exists an odd $i$ and an even $j$ such that $a_i \geq k$ and $a_j \geq k$. If the sequence is $k$-good, we define for all $0 < t \leq k$

$$u_0(t) = a_1 + \cdots + a_{i_0-1} \quad \text{where} \quad i_0 = \min\{i: a_i \geq t, i \text{ odd}\},$$

$$u_e(t) = a_1 + \cdots + a_{i_e-1} \quad \text{where} \quad i_e = \min\{i: a_i \geq t, i \text{ even}\}.$$ 

**Lemma 4.10.** For all $\gamma \in \mathbb{R}^+$ there exists $N \in \mathbb{N}$ such that for all $k \in \mathbb{R}^+$ and all $(kN)$-good sequences, there exists a real number $t \in [k, kN]$ with

$$u_0(t) + u_e(t) \geq \left(3 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma\right)t.$$

First we use Lemma 4.10 to prove Lemma 4.8.

**Proof of Lemma 4.8.** Given $\gamma > 0$, let $N$ be obtained from Lemma 4.10. Let $k \in \mathbb{R}^+$ and $a_1, \ldots, a_n$ be a sequence with oscillation at least $kN$. Suppose first that $a_1 \geq 1$. Partition $[n]$ into a family of non-empty intervals $I_1, \ldots, I_r$ with the following properties:

11
• For every odd $i$ and every $j \in I_i$, we have $a_j \geq j$.

• For every even $i$ and every $j \in I_i$, we have $a_j < j$.

Define $s_i = \max \{|a_j - j| : j \in I_i\}$. Intuitively, this is saying that the values in the even indexed intervals are “above the diagonal” and the values in the odd indexed intervals are “below the diagonal” and $s_i$ is the largest gap between sequence values and the “diagonal” in each interval.

Since $a_1, \ldots, a_n$ has oscillation at least $kN$, the sequence $s_1, \ldots, s_r$ is $(kN)$-good and thus by Lemma 4.10, there exists $t \in [k, kN]$ such that
\[
\ell^+(t) + \ell^-(t) \geq \left(3 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma\right)t.
\] (4.3)

Since the sequence $a_1, a_2, \ldots, a_n$ is non-decreasing, $a_j - j$ can decrease by at most one in each step and thus we have $|I_i| \geq s_i$. Moreover, we can find bounds on $\ell^+(t)$ and $\ell^-(t)$ in terms of the $s_i$:

• $\ell^+(t)$ must lie in the interval $I_i$ with the smallest odd index $i_o$ such that $s_{i_o} \geq t$, therefore $\ell^+(t) \geq s_1 + \cdots + s_{i_o - 1} = u_o(t)$.

• $\ell^-(t)$ must lie in the interval $I_j$ with the smallest even index $i_e$ such that $s_{i_e} \geq t$. Moreover, it must be at least the $t$-th element in this interval, therefore $\ell^-(t) \geq s_1 + \cdots + s_{i_e - 1} + t = u_e(t) + t$.

Combining the previous two observations with (4.3) gives
\[
\ell^+(t) + \ell^-(t) \geq u_o(t) + u_e(t) + t \geq \left(4 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma\right)t,
\]
as desired.

If $a_1 < 1$, we start by partitioning $[n]$ into a family of non-empty intervals $I_1, \ldots, I_r$ with the following properties:

• For every even $i$ and every $j \in I_i$, we have $a_j \geq j$.

• For every odd $i$ and every $j \in I_i$, we have $a_j < j$.

From this point, the proof is analogous.

Finally, it remains to prove Lemma 4.10.

Proof of Lemma 4.10. Let $\rho = 3 + \sqrt{8} - \gamma$ and let $m := m(\rho)$ be a positive integer which will be calculated later. Suppose that the statement of the lemma is false for $N = 6 \cdot 4^m$ and let $a_1, \ldots, a_n$ be an $(Nk)$-good sequence without $t$ as in the statement. We first show that $a_i$ has a long strictly increasing subsequence. Set
\[
I = \{i : a_i \geq k, a_i > a_j \text{ for all } j < i\},
\]
denote the elements of $I$ by $i_1 \leq i_2 \leq \cdots \leq i_r$ and let $a'_j = a_{i_j}$. Consider any $j \in [r - 1]$ and suppose that without loss of generality $i_{j+1}$ is odd. For $\delta$ small enough, this implies
In particular, this implies \( a'_{j+1} \leq (\rho - 2)a'_j - 2a'_{j-1} \). So we have
\[
6k \cdot 4^m = kN \leq a'_j < 4^r \cdot a'_1 \leq 4^r \max \{u_0(k), u_0(k)\} \leq 4^r (u_0(k) + u_0(k)) < 4^r \cdot \rho k < 6k \cdot 4^r
\]
and thus \( r \geq m \).

Finally, we show that any sequence of reals satisfying (4.4), will eventually become negative, but since \( a'_j \) is non-negative this will be a contradiction.

We start by defining the sequence \( b_1, b_2, \ldots \) recursively by \( b_1 = 1 \) and \( b_{i+1} = (\rho - 2)b_i - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{i-1}) \). Note that
\[
b_{i+1} = (\rho - 2)b_i - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{i-1}) \\
= (\rho - 1)b_i - b_i - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{i-1}) \\
= (\rho - 1)b_i - (\rho - 2)b_{i-1} - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{i-2}) - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{i-1}) \\
= (\rho - 1)b_i - \rho b_{i-1}
\]
So equivalently the sequence is defined by,
\[
b_1 = 1, \ b_2 = \rho - 2, \ \text{and} \ b_{i+1} = (\rho - 1)b_i - \rho b_{i-1} \ \text{for} \ i \geq 2.
\]
It is known that a second order linear recurrence relation whose characteristic polynomial has non-real roots will eventually become negative (see \([1]\)). Indeed, the characteristic polynomial \( x^2 - (\rho - 1)x + \rho \) has discriminant \( \rho^2 - 6\rho + 1 < 0 \) and so its roots \( \alpha, \bar{\alpha} \) are non-real. Hence the above recursively defined sequence has the closed form of \( b_i = z\alpha^i + \bar{z}\bar{\alpha}^i = 2\text{Re}(z\alpha^i) \) for some complex number \( z \). By expressing \( z\alpha^i \) in polar form we can see that \( b_m < 0 \) for some positive integer \( m \). Note that the calculation of \( m \) only depends on \( \rho \).

Now let \( a'_1, \ldots, a'_m \) be a sequence of non-negative reals satisfying (4.4). We will be done if we can show that \( a'_j < a'_ib_j \) for all \( 1 \leq j \leq m \); so suppose \( a'_j > a'_ib_j \) for some \( s \), and such that \( \{a'_j\}_{j=1}^{m} \) and \( \{a'_i b_j\}_{j=1}^{m} \) coincide on the longest initial subsequence. Let \( p \) be the minimum value such that \( a'_p \neq a'_ib_p \). Clearly \( p > 1 \). Applying (4.4) to \( j = p - 1 \) we see that
\[
a'_p \leq (\rho - 2)a'_{p-1} - 2(a'_1 + \cdots + a'_{p-2}) = (\rho - 2)a'_ib_{p-1} - 2(a'_1 b_1 + \cdots + a'_{p-2}) \\
= a'_1((\rho - 2)b_{p-1} - 2(b_1 + \cdots + b_{p-2})) = a'_1 b_p
\]
and thus \( a'_p < a'_ib_p \).

Let \( \beta = (a'_ib_p - a'_p)/a'_1 > 0 \). Now consider the sequence \( a''_j \) where \( a''_j = a'_j \) for \( j < p \) and \( a''_j = a'_j + \beta a'_{j-p+1} \) for \( j \geq p \). Then \( a''_p = a'_1 b_p = a''_1 b_p \). This new sequence satisfies
since
\[
a''_{p+j} = a'_{p+j} + \beta a'_{j+1} \\
\leq (\rho - 2)a'_{p+j-1} - 2 \left( a'_1 + \cdots + a'_{p+j-2} \right) + \beta(\rho - 2)a'_j - 2\beta \left( a'_1 + \cdots + a'_{j-1} \right) \\
= (\rho - 2)a''_{p+j-1} - 2 \left( a''_1 + \cdots + a''_{p+j-2} \right).
\]

We also have \(a''_s \geq a'_s > a'_1 b_s = a''_1 b_s\). This contradicts the fact that \(a'_j\) was such a sequence which coincided with \(a'_1 b_j\) on the longest initial subsequence.

\[\square\]

5 Acknowledgements

This project began as part of the problem session of the “Extremal Graph Theory and Ramsey Theory” focus week of the “Rio Workshop on Extremal and Structural Combinatorics” held at IMPA, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil in January 2018. We thank the organisers of the workshop and IMPA for the stimulating working environment.

References


Jan Corsten  
<j.corsten@lse.ac.uk>  
London School of Economics, Department of Mathematics, London WC2A 2AE.

Ander Lamaison  
<lamaison@zedat.fu-berlin.de>  
Institut für Mathematik, Freie Universität Berlin and Berlin Mathematical School, Berlin, Germany.

Louis DeBiasio  
<debiasld@miamioh.edu>  
Miami University, Department of Mathematics, Oxford, OH, 45056, United States.

Richard Lang  
<r.lang.1@bham.ac.uk>  
University of Birmingham, School of Mathematics, Birmingham B15 2TT, United Kingdom.