

Black-hole evaporation, cosmic censorship, and a quantum lower bound on the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature

Shahar Hod

The Ruppin Academic Center, Emeq Hefer 40250, Israel

and

The Hadassah Institute, Jerusalem 91010, Israel

(Dated: October 10, 2021)

Abstract

The semi-classical Hawking evaporation process of Reissner-Nordström black holes is analyzed. It is shown that this quantum mechanism may turn a near-extremal black-hole spacetime with $T_{\text{BH}} \lesssim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$ into an horizonless naked singularity, thus violating the Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture. It is therefore conjectured that, within the framework of a self-consistent quantum theory of gravity, the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature should be bounded from below by the simple relation $T_{\text{BH}} \gtrsim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$.

I. INTRODUCTION

Following Bekenstein's proposal that black holes have a well defined entropy [1], Hawking, using a semi-classical analysis [2], has revealed the intriguing fact that these fundamental objects of general relativity are characterized by thermally distributed (filtered black-body) radiation spectra. In particular, the emission spectra of the canonical family of charged and rotating Kerr-Newman black holes are characterized by the well defined Bekenstein-Hawking temperature [3]

$$T_{\text{BH}} = \frac{\hbar(r_+ - r_-)}{4\pi G(r_+^2 + a^2)} . \quad (1)$$

Here

$$r_{\pm} = GM \pm (G^2 M^2 - GQ^2 - a^2)^{1/2} \quad (2)$$

are the (inner and outer) horizon radii which characterize the black-hole spacetime, where $\{M, Q, a\}$ are respectively the asymptotically measured black-hole mass, electric charge, and angular momentum per unit mass.

Inspection of the functional expression (1) for $T_{\text{BH}} = T_{\text{BH}}(M, Q, a)$ immediately reveals the intriguing fact that the semi-classical Bekenstein-Hawking temperature approaches zero in the $M^2 - Q^2 - a^2 \rightarrow 0$ limit of near-extremal black holes.

In the present paper we shall address the following physically interesting question: Can the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of a given mass black hole be made arbitrarily small? According to Page [4, 5], the answer to this question is 'yes'. Page has based his argument for the non-existence of a lower bound on the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature on the fact that, for near-extremal Reissner-Nordström ($a = 0$) black holes in the large-mass regime [4, 6]

$$M \gg \frac{e\hbar}{\pi m_e^2} , \quad (3)$$

the emission of charged massive fields is exponentially suppressed as compared to the emission of neutral massless (electromagnetic and gravitational) fields [4, 5]. It was therefore argued by Page [4, 5] that, by emitting neutral fields which reduce the black-hole mass (without reducing its electric charge), a charged Reissner-Nordström black hole can approach arbitrarily close to the zero-temperature (extremal) limit $T_{\text{BH}} \rightarrow 0$ [7–9].

The main goal of the present compact paper is to reveal the fact that near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes in the regime $T_{\text{BH}} \lesssim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$, if they exist, may violate,

through the Hawking emission process, the black-hole condition $Q \leq M$ which is imposed by the Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture [10, 11]. This fact, to be proved below, suggests that, in order to guarantee the validity of the fundamental Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture, the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of a given mass black hole should be bounded from below by the simple relation $T_{\text{BH}} \gtrsim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$.

II. THE SEMI-CLASSICAL HAWKING EVAPORATION PROCESS OF NEAR-EXTREMAL REISSNER-NORDSTRÖM BLACK HOLES

In the present section we shall analyze the physical and mathematical properties which characterize the Hawking radiation spectra of near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes in the regime [12]

$$0 \leq \Delta \equiv M - Q \ll M . \quad (4)$$

Here Δ is the excess energy of the charged Reissner-Nordström spacetime above the minimal mass (extremal) black-hole configuration with $M = M_{\text{min}}(Q) = Q$. As explicitly shown in [4], the semi-classical decay of near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes in the large-mass regime (3) is dominated by the emission of massless neutral photons with unit angular momentum [13].

The black-hole radiation power for one bosonic degree of freedom is given by the semi-classical Hawking integral relation [14]

$$P = \frac{\hbar G}{2\pi} \sum_{l,m} \int_0^\infty \frac{\Gamma \omega}{e^{\hbar\omega/T_{\text{BH}}} - 1} d\omega , \quad (5)$$

where $\{l, m\}$ are the angular (spheroidal and axial) harmonic indices which characterize the emitted field mode, and the frequency-dependent dimensionless parameters $\Gamma = \Gamma_{lm}(\omega)$ are the greybody factors which characterize the linearized interaction (scattering) of the field mode with the curved black-hole spacetime [14].

It is interesting to point out that the characteristic thermal factor $\omega/(e^{\hbar\omega/T_{\text{BH}}} - 1)$ that appears in the semi-classical expression (5) for the Hawking radiation power implies that the black-hole-field emission spectra peak at the characteristic dimensionless frequency

$$\frac{\hbar\omega^{\text{peak}}}{T_{\text{BH}}} = O(1) . \quad (6)$$

Since the semi-classical Bekenstein-Hawking temperature (1) of a near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black hole in the regime (4) is characterized by the strong dimensionless inequality [15]

$$\frac{GMT_{\text{BH}}}{\hbar} \ll 1, \quad (7)$$

one deduces from (6) that, for near-extremal black holes in the regime (7), the characteristic field frequencies which constitute the Hawking black-hole emission spectra are characterized by the strong dimensionless inequality

$$M\omega^{\text{peak}} \ll 1. \quad (8)$$

Interestingly, and most importantly for our analysis, it has been demonstrated in [4] that, in the low-frequency regime (8) which dominates the emission spectra of the near-extremal black holes, the dimensionless greybody factors $\Gamma_{lm}(\omega)$ that appear in the integral relation (5) can be expressed in a closed analytic form. In particular, one finds the simple expression [4]

$$\Gamma_{1m} = \frac{1}{9}\epsilon^8\nu^4(1+\nu^2)(1+4\nu^2) \cdot [1 + O(M\omega)] \quad (9)$$

for the characteristic greybody factor of unit ($l = 1$) angular momentum photons [16], where here we have used the dimensionless physical quantities

$$\epsilon \equiv \frac{r_+ - r_-}{r_+} \quad \text{and} \quad \nu \equiv \frac{\hbar\omega}{4\pi GT_{\text{BH}}}. \quad (10)$$

Substituting Eq. (9) into Eq. (5), and using the relations [see Eqs. (1), (4), and (10)]

$$\epsilon = \sqrt{\frac{8\Delta}{M}} \cdot [1 + O(\epsilon)] \quad \text{and} \quad \omega = \nu \sqrt{\frac{8\Delta}{M^3}} \cdot [1 + O(\epsilon)], \quad (11)$$

one obtains the simple expression [4]

$$P = \frac{\hbar\epsilon^{10}}{3\pi GM^2} \int_0^\infty \mathcal{F}(\nu) d\nu \quad \text{with} \quad \mathcal{F}(\nu) \equiv \frac{4\nu^9 + 5\nu^7 + \nu^5}{e^{4\pi\nu} - 1} \quad (12)$$

for the semi-classical Hawking radiation power of the near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes.

From Eq. (12) one finds that the function $\mathcal{F}(\nu)$, which determines the energy distribution of the radiated field modes, has a maximum at

$$\nu = \nu_{\text{peak}} \simeq 0.511, \quad (13)$$

implying that the characteristic photons in the emission spectra of the near-extremal black holes have an energy which is of the order of [see Eqs. (11) and (13)]

$$E = \hbar\omega = \hbar G^{-1} \nu_{\text{peak}} \sqrt{\frac{8\Delta}{M^3}} . \quad (14)$$

The Hawking emission of these neutral field modes would reduce the black-hole mass (without reducing its charge) by $\Delta M = -E$. Thus, the mass of the resulting black-hole configuration (after the emission of a characteristic Hawking photon) is given by [see Eqs. (4) and (14)]

$$M_{\text{new}} = M - E = Q + \Delta - E . \quad (15)$$

Taking cognizance of the Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture [10, 11], one immediately realizes that, in order for the Hawking evaporation process to respect the black-hole condition (4), the characteristic energy of the emitted photons must be bounded from above. In particular, using the constraint

$$Q \leq M_{\text{new}} \quad (16)$$

on the physical parameters which characterize the black-hole configuration after the emission of a characteristic Hawking photon, one finds the lower bound [see Eqs. (14), (15), and (16)]

$$\Delta \geq \frac{8(\hbar\nu_{\text{peak}}/G)^2}{M^3} \quad (17)$$

on the excess energy of a given mass Reissner-Nordström black hole.

Interestingly, using the relation [see Eqs. (1), (10), and (11)]

$$T_{\text{BH}} = \hbar G^{-1} \sqrt{\frac{\Delta}{2\pi^2 M^3}} \cdot [1 + O(\epsilon)] , \quad (18)$$

one finds from (17) the lower bound

$$T_{\text{BH}} \geq \frac{2\nu_{\text{peak}}\hbar^2}{\pi G^2 M^3} \quad (19)$$

on the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of the near-extremal black holes. Thus, as opposed to the claim made in [4, 5], a near-extremal black hole cannot radiate its excess energy all the way down to $T_{\text{BH}} \rightarrow 0$. In particular, our analysis has revealed the intriguing fact that Reissner-Nordström black holes that violate the relation (19) would also violate, through the Hawking evaporation process, the fundamental Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture [10, 11].

III. SUMMARY AND DISCUSSION

In the present compact paper we have raised the following physically interesting question: Can the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of a given mass black hole be made arbitrarily small? In order to address this question, we have analyzed the physical and mathematical properties of the semi-classical Hawking radiation spectra which characterize near-extremal [see (4)] Reissner-Nordström black holes in the large-mass regime (3).

It has been shown that the black-hole evaporation process may turn a near-extremal black hole with $\Delta < 8(\hbar\nu_{\text{peak}}/G)^2/M^3$ [or equivalently, with a Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of $T_{\text{BH}} < 2\nu_{\text{peak}}\hbar^2/\pi G^2 M^3$] into an horizonless naked singularity with $Q > M$, thus violating the cosmic censorship conjecture [10, 11].

Our analysis therefore suggests that one of the following physical scenarios should be valid in a self-consistent quantum theory of gravity:

(1) The Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture can be violated within the framework of a quantum theory of gravity.

(2) The Hawking semi-classical treatment of the black-hole evaporation process breaks down in the regime $T_{\text{BH}} \lesssim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$ of near-extremal black holes in such a way that the emission of charged massive fields (which reduce the black-hole charge and thus increase the black-hole temperature) dominates over the emission of neutral massless fields.

(3) Near-extremal black holes with $\Delta \lesssim \hbar^2/G^2 M^3$ do not exist within the framework of a self-consistent quantum theory of gravity. If true, this last scenario implies that the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of quantized black holes is bounded from below by the simple relation [17, 18]

$$T_{\text{BH}} \gtrsim \frac{\hbar^2}{G^2 M^3} . \quad (20)$$

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research is supported by the Carmel Science Foundation. I thank Don Page for interesting correspondence. I would also like to thank Yael Oren, Arbel M. Ongo, Ayelet B. Lata, and Alona B. Tea for stimulating discussions.

[1] J. D. Bekenstein, Phys. Rev. D **7**, 2333 (1973).

- [2] S. W. Hawking, Commun. Math. Phys. **43**, 199 (1975).
- [3] We shall use natural units in which $c = k_B = 1$.
- [4] D. Page, arXiv:hep-th/0012020 .
- [5] D. Page, private communication (2018).
- [6] Here e and m_e are respectively the electric charge and proper mass of the positron.
- [7] It is worth noting that it has been claimed in the physics literature that extremal black holes possess some peculiar physical properties. For instance, it was argued that, despite having non-zero surface areas, the entropy of extremal black holes is zero [8] (see also [9] and references therein).
- [8] S. W. Hawking, G. T. Horowitz, S. F. Ross, Phys. Rev. D **51**, 4302 (1995).
- [9] S. Hod, Phys. Rev. D **61**, 084018 (2000) [arXiv:gr-qc/0004003].
- [10] S. W. Hawking and R. Penrose, Proc. R. Soc. Lond. **A314**, 529 (1970).
- [11] R. Penrose, Riv. Nuovo Cimento I **1**, 252 (1969); R. Penrose in *General Relativity, an Einstein Centenary Survey*, eds. S.W. Hawking and W. Israel (Cambridge University Press, 1979).
- [12] The requirement $\Delta \geq 0$ ($M \geq Q$) follows from the Penrose cosmic censorship conjecture [10, 11] as applied to charged Reissner-Nordström black-hole configurations.
- [13] In particular, it has been shown in [4, 5] that, in the large-mass regime (3), the black-hole emission of charged massive fields is exponentially suppressed as compared to the Hawking emission of neutral massless fields. In addition, for the near-extremal black holes (4), the emission of electromagnetic and gravitational field quanta with larger values of the angular momentum parameter ($l > 1$) is suppressed, as compared to the emission of photons with unit angular momentum ($l = 1$), by several factors of the large dimensionless ratio M/Δ [4, 5].
- [14] D. N. Page, Phys. Rev. D **13**, 198 (1976); W. H. Zurek, Phys. Rev. Lett. **49**, 1683 (1982); D. Page, Phys. Rev. Lett. **50**, 1013 (1983); J. D. Bekenstein, Phys. Rev. Lett. **70**, 3680 (1993).
- [15] Note that near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes are characterized by the strong inequality $(r_+ - r_-)/r_+ \ll 1$. This inequality implies the dimensionless relation $GMT_{\text{BH}}/\hbar \ll 1$ [see Eq. (1)] for the near-extremal black holes.
- [16] It is worth emphasizing again that, as explicitly shown in [4], these unit angular momentum photons dominate the Hawking radiation spectra of the near-extremal Reissner-Nordström black holes in the large-mass regime (3).
- [17] Note that the dimensionless factor $2\nu_{\text{peak}}/\pi$ in Eq. (19) is of order unity.

- [18] See S. Hod, Phys. Lett. B **759**, 541 (2016) [arXiv:1701.00492] for an independent physical argument for the existence of a quantum lower bound on the Bekenstein-Hawking temperature of black holes.