Competition between horizontal and vertical polariton lasing in planar microcavities

O. Jamadi,1,2 F. Réveret,1 D. Solnyshkov,1 P. Disseix,1 J. Leymarie,1 L. Mallet-Dida,3 C. Brimont,3 T. Guillot,3 X. Lafosse,4 S. Bouchoule,4 F. Semon,5 M. Leroux,5 J. Zumiga-Perez,6 and G. Malpuech1

1 Université Clermont Auvergne, CNRS, SIGMA Clermont, Institut Pascal, F-63000 Clermont-Ferrand, France.
2 Univ. Lille, CNRS, UMR 8523 – PhLAM – Physique des Lasers Atomes et Molécules, F-59000 Lille, France
3 Laboratoire Charles Coulomb (L2C), Université de Montpellier, CNRS, Montpellier, France
4 Centre Nanosciences et Nanotechnologies (C2N), CNRS/UPSUD, Avenue de la Vauve, Palaiseau, France.
5 UCA, CRHEA-CNRS, Valbonne, France.

Planar microcavities filled with active materials containing excitonic resonances host radiative exciton-polariton (polariton) modes with in-plane wave vectors within the light cone and, at least, one non-radiative mode guided in the cavity plane by total internal reflection. We show that polariton lasing mediated by polariton stimulated scattering can occur concomitantly in both types of modes in a microcavity. By adjusting the detuning between the exciton and the radiative photon one can favor polariton lasing either in the radiative or in the guided modes. Our results suggest that the competition between these two types of polariton lasing modes may have played a role in many previous observations of polariton lasing and polariton Bose Einstein condensation.

PACS numbers:

Exciton-polaritons (polaritons) are quasi-particles resulting from the coupling between a light mode and an excitonic resonance. They have been theoretically introduced by Hopfield and Agranovich [1,2] at the end of the 50’s to describe light propagation in bulk semiconductors. In 1992, the achievement of strong light-matter coupling between the photonic radiative modes (within the light cone) of a planar microcavity and the excitonic resonances of embedded quantum wells [3] opened the era of 2-dimensional cavity polaritons, which since then have been very extensively studied both from a fundamental and from an applied point of view [4,5]. In a microcavity the radiative mode is not, however, the only photonic mode expected to cross the exciton energy. Indeed, at least one mode, fully guided in the plane of the cavity by total internal reflection, is expected to give rise to a guided polariton. The existence of these modes was perfectly understood in the 90’s, their presence being responsible for the relatively weak Purcell enhancement factors [6] of planar cavities. In the first attempts to reach the polariton lasing regime following Imamoglu and Ram proposal [7], they were correctly identified as "leaky modes".

The concept of polariton laser is an extension of the concept of exciton laser formulated in the 60s [5]. Exciton laser in a bulk semi-conductor is based on the scattering of an exciton-like polariton either on another exciton-like polariton or on a LO-phonon towards a polariton state with a lower energy and, thus, with a larger photonic fraction. If this relaxation process is more efficient than the reverse one, excitonic gain takes place. In bulk material, polariton states are stationary propagating non-radiative states, which can emit light only from the edge of the sample. The polariton laser proposal [7] added a vertical cavity on top of the exciton laser, where the modes to be amplified were the radiative vertical polariton modes of the cavity. Contrary to bulk polariton states, they are not propagating and possess a finite radiative lifetime. Polariton lasing requires both excitonic gain to be present and spontaneous scattering rate to be faster than the polariton decay, this last condition being absent from the simpler exciton laser picture. Polariton lasing and the related polariton Bose Einstein Condensation in planar cavities have then been reported in a large amount of cavity systems [9,19], becoming a very intense research topic. On the other hand, the possibility to get polariton lasing using non-radiative guided polariton modes [20–29] has been considered only recently [30], to our knowledge. In this last case, one needs to define certain system boundaries, which allow to introduce the notion of mean time spent by the polaritons in the gain region. The first observation of polariton lasing based on guided modes [29], performed in a monolithic ZnO-based waveguide, has shown pumping thresholds comparable to the ones obtained for vertical polariton lasing in state-of-the-art ZnO-based cavities. This similarity can be understood by simple estimates of the traveling time of guided polaritons under a typical pumping spot 10-20 µm wide, which is of the order of 1 ps. This is comparable with the polariton radiative lifetime in many types of vertical cavities where polariton lasing has been demonstrated. It suggests that polariton leakage into guided modes, and even horizontal polariton lasing, could be seriously competing with vertical polariton lasing in a large amount of experimental cases.

In this work, we study a ZnO-based microcavity showing a Q-factor of 2000 [31]. Under non-resonant optical pumping we are able to observe simultaneously polariton lasing under the pumping spot, associated to the vertical radiative modes, and also, at a different energy, polar-
ton lasing in the guided polariton modes, essentially extracted through the sample (mesa) edges. By changing either the pumping spot size or the detuning between the exciton and the radiative photon mode, we can tune the vertical cavity threshold and favor one type of polariton lasing with respect to the other.

The sample under study consists of a ZnO active layer embedded between a 30-pair AlN/AlGaN bottom distributed Bragg reflector (DBR) and an 11-pair SiO$_2$/HfO$_2$ top DBR. The cavity thickness is 290 nm ($2\lambda$) and the Rabi splitting 160 meV. The microcavity structures are grown on silicon mesas having lateral sizes of 100 $\mu$m, and whose lateral free surfaces are essential for the current observations (through which guided modes can be extracted). As studied in detail in [31], this thick cavity supports several radiative cavity modes relatively close in energy and also several fully guided modes which should strongly couple to excitons and that had not been considered previously. The sample is studied through micro-photoluminescence (PL) using the fourth harmonic (266 nm) of a Nd:YAG laser as the excitation source. The pulse duration is 400 ps and the repetition rate is 20 kHz. A UV microscope objective with 0.5 numerical aperture was used to obtain small excitation spots of different diameters. The emission of the sample was collected through the same objective and imaged onto the spectrometer slit by a spherical lens mounted on a motorized translation stage, which allows to collect emission from various areas of the sample. All the measurements are performed at 5 K.

Figure 1(a) shows a realistic sketch of the polariton dispersion computed using a model of three coupled oscillators (dotted lines) representing the exciton resonance, a cavity mode dispersion, and the fundamental guided TE mode of energy $E = \hbar c k n$, where $k$ is the in-plane wave vector, $c$ the speed of light, and $n$ the effective refractive index of the cavity material. For simplicity, we consider only one cavity mode and one guided mode. The solid black line shows the light cone where the radiative emission in vacuum is possible. The radiative and guided polariton modes are populated by the same relaxation processes represented by red arrows, which are assisted by exciton-phonon, exciton-exciton, and exciton-free carrier scattering [4]. Polariton can pass from the guided to the radiative polariton branch and vice versa by elastic scattering on static disorder, which typically shows fast sub-ps time scales.

As shown in many previous works [15 33 34], including one with experimental measurements performed on this specific sample [31], the polariton lasing threshold in the radiative modes of the cavity depends on temperature and on the exciton photon detuning at zero wave vector, defined as $\delta = E_\text{c} - E_\text{x}$. The black points in Fig. 1(b) are extracted from [31], and display the measured vertical polariton lasing threshold versus $\delta$ obtained with an optimum excitation spot of 150 $\mu$m$^2$ at the center of the patterned mesas (i.e. far from the mesa borders, contrary to the present study). For such diameter, we did not find any evidence of horizontal polariton lasing. The detuning dependence shows the usual U-shape, with a range of optimal detuning values minimizing the threshold.

The red points in Fig. 1(b) show the vertical lasing thresholds measured with a larger pumping spot of 650 $\mu$m$^2$. The measured thresholds are three to five times larger than for the smaller spot, due to the enhance leakage in guided modes and the competition with the onset of horizontal polariton lasing, as we show in details below. The three arrows in Fig. 1(b) show the detunings at which the measurements presented in the three next figures are performed. For the most negative detuning, polariton lasing in both horizontal and vertical modes is observed with similar thresholds. In the trade-off region, optimal detuning case, only vertical polariton lasing is observed, while at positive detuning, where the vertical lasing threshold is expected to strongly increase, only horizontal polariton lasing is achieved.

Figure 2 shows the real and reciprocal space PL of the
cavity for the most negative detuning $\delta = -96$ meV. Besides this negatively-detuned mode, a second polariton mode is visible at a very positive detuning, but it is not playing a crucial role. In this case, both vertical and horizontal polariton lasing take place at comparable lasing thresholds. At low pumping (Fig. 2(a)), only the radiative polariton modes are visible. At $35 \text{ W/cm}^2$ (Fig. 2(b)) a broad, non-dispersive line appears between both LPBs that we attribute to guided polaritons. At $39 \text{ W/cm}^2$ (Fig. 2(c)), multimode lasing takes place at the guided polariton modes. At $61 \text{ W/cm}^2$ (Fig. 2(d)), lasing takes place both in the guided modes and LPB1. Figure 2(e) shows the PL spectra as a function of pumping intensity. The inset presents the integrated emission intensity versus pumping for the two types of lasers, which clearly show a strong non linear threshold. A real space image of the emission is shown in Fig. 2(f). The pumping laser is near the mesa edge (white dotted line). The overall emission comes from two distinct areas. The emission below the pump spot maximum takes place at the radiative polariton energy (LPB1) and corresponds to the vertical polariton laser. The emission coming from the mesa edge is at the energy of the guided modes and corresponds to the horizontal polariton laser. In fact, horizontal polariton lasing certainly takes place everywhere, but the corresponding emission is extracted out of the sample only at the mesa edge or through structural defects (e.g. cracks).

One could argue that we cannot prove by this sole experiment that the guided modes are exciton-polariton modes and not just purely photonic states, given that we do not monitor their dispersion. First, one should take into account that we do resolve the dispersions of the vertical-cavity radiative polaritons (Fig. 2(a-d)), which remain almost unperturbed in the whole pumping power range we use and demonstrate that in this pumping range the strong coupling is maintained. Second, we recently demonstrated horizontal polariton lasing [29] in a ZnO-based waveguide sample where the dispersion was measured via a grating, and where the strong coupling was clearly maintained at least for pumping densities comparable with the one used in the present experiments. The goal of the present work is not to demonstrate horizontal polariton lasing (which we did previously), but to show that this phenomenon can take place also in planar cavities concomitantly with more standard vertical polariton lasing, with which it competes. The fact that guided modes are essentially invisible, except when large defects are present or in samples specially designed to extract such modes, makes this lasing mode difficult to be detected and probably explains why it was not reported before. At the detuning used in Fig. 2, the lasing thresholds of both types of lasers are quite similar. One can also note that in [29] we found a horizontal polariton lasing threshold at 5 K one order of magnitude smaller than in the present work. There are several reasons for this.

Figure 2: Measurements performed at 5 K and $\delta = -96$ meV (a-d): Angularly resolved emission spectrum of the microcavity measured at (a) 1.7 W/cm$^2$, (b) 35 W/cm$^2$, (c) 39 W/cm$^2$, (d) 61 W/cm$^2$. (e) Emission spectrum versus pumping power. Inset: Emission intensity versus pumping of the guided polariton laser (blue) and of the vertical polariton laser (black). (f) Real space emission taken at 39 W/cm$^2$. The dotted white line shows the position of the sample edge. The emission from the edge spectrally corresponds to the horizontal polariton laser energy (3312 meV), whereas the energy below the center of the spot corresponds to the one of the vertical polariton laser (3247 meV).

First, in [29] it was possible to optimize the spatial overlap between the pump and the horizontal cavities, which were defined by vertical cracks, which really allowed to lower the horizontal polariton lasing threshold. Second, the waveguide of [29] was monomode by design, contrary to the current situation, which reduces the mode competition that is necessarily present in our 2-λ microcavity. Finally, the structural quality of the monolithic active regions in [29] led to an excitonic nonradiative lifetime three to five times larger than on the current ZnO cavity, which is grown on a nitride DBR itself grown on top of a silicon substrate. In the following we will show that by changing $\delta$ it is possible to tune the vertical polariton lasing threshold and favor one or another type of lasing geometry.

Figure 3 shows PL emission taken at an exciton-photon detuning closer to the optimum for vertical polariton lasing. The threshold is at about 32 W/cm$^2$, which is indeed close to the threshold measured for the horizontal polariton laser in Fig. 2. The lasing peak emerges from the upper tail of the lower polariton mode. One should note that some amount of light is certainly scattered by imperfections from the LPB towards the guided modes, which are energetically resonant. It certainly explains
why above threshold (Fig. 3(d)), the image in Fourier space contains both the emission coming from the LPB and also dispersiveless features associated to the guided polariton modes.

Figure 4 is taken at a sufficiently positive detuning so that the vertical polariton laser is strongly unfavoured. The horizontal polariton lasing threshold is 18 W/cm² for this specific location on the sample. This low value is probably due to the weaker competition with the vertical laser. The non-dispersive modes emerge just below the LPB. Figure 4(c,d) shows the spatial and spectral distribution of the emission taken at threshold. The LPB emission takes place near \( X, Y = 0 \), below the pumping spot, and is centered at 3330 meV. Light is also emitted at the mesa edge (\( Y = 20 \) µm), at an energy of 3317 meV. These last features are spectrally very narrow, typical for lasing, and are weakly visible everywhere in the sample (Fig. 4(d)) due to the existence of scattering mechanisms (e.g. disorder scattering, as depicted in Fig. 1) that allow to partially extract the light from the guided modes into the radiative LPB modes.

It is interesting to note that this sample has been already thoroughly studied as a vertical polariton laser [31]. In that previous study we did not detect the occurrence of horizontal polariton lasing. This is really due to the fact that guided modes are truly weakly visible in this type of sample, unless one measures either close to a crack or to a mesa border. Furthermore, in the case of cracks the scattered light falls within the bandgap of the top Bragg mirror and, therefore, the light can only get out near the vertical direction in the radiative photonic modes, namely the LPBs. In fact, the horizontal lasing, which is very strongly present, is clearly visible only near the mesa edge, a region in which one is not typically trying to perform measurements because of the presence of defects and border effects modifying locally the designed microcavity structure (e.g. due to enhanced growth rates compared to the mesa centers). Moreover, it is in general hard to find something which is not expected.

Several consequences can be deduced from the current findings. First, one should note that theoretical calculations of polariton lasing threshold in vertical microcavities always neglected the possibility of lasing taking place in the guided modes. Our findings can really explain quantitative discrepancies between theory and experiment on the determination of these thresholds. The other consequence, which is much more crucial, is that guided modes, and even lasing in these modes, could have taken place without being noticed in a very large number of previous reports of vertical polariton lasing. It is in that sense that our present report is crucial. This is of course especially true in cavities showing moderate Q, probably below 10000, which is the case for the CdTe based cavities, where the first BEC effect was reported [9]. It is also the case for all structures where room temperature polariton lasing was observed, namely GaN, ZnO, organics, and perovskite-based cavities. Only the latest GaAs based structures with Q-factors of 100.000 or larger [18] seem to be relatively protected from competition with guided modes. However, even in this last case etched structures could show relatively well confined guided modes that could be living longer in the pump area that the radiative modes. One could also notice that the "polariton condensate instability" is often observed when large pumping spots are used [35], which is also the regime favorable for horizontal lasing, an aspect completely neglected by all models so far.

To conclude, we demonstrate that horizontal polariton...
lasing in guided modes and vertical polariton lasing in radiative modes can simultaneously take place in a planar microcavity. This is a crucial finding that could have affected for quite a long time many polariton lasing and polariton condensation reports. It might be impacting both polariton device operation and, from a more fundamental point of view, polariton condensate features.

We acknowledge the support of the ANR projects: "Plug and Bose" (ANR-16-CE24-0021), "Quantum Fluids of Light" (ANR-16-CE30-0021) and the "Investissement davenir" program GANEX (ANR-11-LABX-004), IMOBS3 (ANR-10-LABX-16-01), ISITE "Cap2025" (16-IDEX-0001). C2N is a member of RENATECH (CNRS), the national network of large micro-nanofabrication facilities. D.D.S. acknowledges the support of IUF (Institut Universitaire de France).