Coherent nonlinear oscillations in magnetohydrodynamic plasma at Alfvén resonance

Rupak Mukherjee, Rajaraman Ganesh and Abhijit Sen
Institute for Plasma Research, HBNI, Bhat, Gandhinagar - 382428, India

Single fluid magnetohydrodynamic (MHD) equations have been studied through direct numerical simulation using pseudo-spectral method in two as well as three spatial dimensions at Alfvén resonance and exchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables have been observed. For a wide range of initial flow speeds or Alfvén Mach number it is shown that the coherent nonlinear oscillation persist. As the Alfvén Mach number is increased further, a tendency to mean field dynamo is seen. The dependency of the frequency of energy exchange decreases as the Alfvén Mach number increased leading to dynamo like phenomena and increases as the initial wave number excited in the fluid flow in increased. A finite mode representation of the single fluid MHD equations has been carried out in two spatial dimensions and similar behavior is found to hold.

I. INTRODUCTION

Understanding kinetic energy cascade for different initial spectrum has been a longstanding challenge in the field of fluid dynamics. Of late several direct numerical simulation (DNS) techniques have helped to analyse the kinetic energy spectra with the time evolution of any fluid governed by Navier-Stokes equation. The fluid equations represented as an infinite dimensional system is hard to solve analytically. The complexity increases manifold when the fluid is charged and hence becomes susceptible to magnetic field. The self generated magnetic field dynamically affects the fluid flows through the Lorentz force term in the momentum equation. Thus the energy accumulated in any mode may be expected to find new route via nonlinear cascade to other modes through transformation of kinetic to magnetic energy and vice versa. In the presence of weak resistivity, the MHD model is known to predict irreversible conversion of magnetic energy into fluid kinetic energy (i.e. reconnection) as well as conversion of kinetic energy into mean large scale magnetic field (i.e. dynamo). Therefore it is interesting to ask oneself, for a given fluid type and magnetic field strength, are there fluid flow profiles which do not - that is, neither does the flow generate mean magnetic field nor the magnetic field energy is converted to flow energy; instead there are nearly "reversible" coherent nonlinear oscillations. For a wide range of initial flow speeds or Alfvén Mach number it is shown that the coherent nonlinear oscillation persist. As the Alfvén Mach number is increased further, a tendency to mean field dynamo is seen.

In this paper, we report numerical observation of interplay of kinetic and magnetic energy in two as well as three dimensional single fluid magnetohydrodynamic simulation for different set of initial flow profiles both chaotic and non-chaotic. A finite mode representation of the field variables resulting in a set of nonlinear coupled ordinary differential equations has been presented in support of the pseudo-spectral DNS results. Our numerical as well as analytical observations indicate that nonlinear reciprocity of kinetic and magnetic energy can take place within the frame-work of single fluid magnetohydrodynamic representation of plasma and strongly depending on the $M_A$.

We start with a set of well known velocity flows as initial conditions and numerically time evolve the fluid as well as the magnetic variables self-consistently. The magnetic field we choose is uniform in space to start with. We look into the regime where the Alfvén speed is equal to the sound speed of the system. This choice facilitates most efficient coupling between magnetic and kinetic variables through the Lorentz force term. We find a continuous nonlinear exchange of energy between fluid and magnetic variables. The key results that we obtain from our DNS study backed with the results from an analytical galerkin representation are:

- For decaying two dimensional Orszag-Tang (OT) flow and Cat’s Eye flow at Alfvén resonance ($M_A = 1$), an initial uniform magnetic field profile leads to nonlinear coherent oscillation between kinetic and magnetic modes.
- For decaying three dimensional Roberts flow, Cat’s Eye flow and Arnold-Beltrami-Childress (ABC) flow at Alfvén resonance ($M_A = 1$), an initial uniform magnetic field profile leads to nonlinear coherent oscillation between kinetic and magnetic modes.
- The parameter dependency (Alfvén Mach number) of this oscillation for three dimensional ABC flow is studied indicating boundary between two nonlinear events - coherent oscillation and dynamo effect.
- For externally forced OT and ABC flows, the nearly ideal magnetohydrodynamic plasma acts as a forced-relaxed system.

The paper is arranged as follows. Section II summarizes the equations that are time evolved in the code.
MHD3D described in section III. In section IV, we provide all the parameters in which the code is run and section V provides all the direct numerical simulation (DNS) results we have obtained in two and three dimensions. Section VI describes an analytical two dimensional finite mode representation of the DNS results and section VII summarises all the results and analysis done in this paper.

II. GOVERNING EQUATIONS

The basic equations governing the dynamics of the magnetohydrodynamic fluid are as follows:

\[
\begin{align*}
\frac{\partial \rho}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\rho \vec{u}) &= 0 \\
\frac{\partial (\rho \vec{u})}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot \left[ \rho \vec{u} \otimes \vec{u} + \left( P + \frac{B^2}{2} \right) \mathbf{I} - \vec{B} \otimes \vec{B} \right] &= \mu \nabla^2 \vec{u} + \rho \vec{f} \\
\frac{\partial \vec{B}}{\partial t} + \nabla \cdot (\vec{u} \otimes \vec{B} - \vec{B} \otimes \vec{u}) &= \eta \nabla^2 \vec{B} \\
P &= C_s^2 \rho
\end{align*}
\]

In this system of equations, \( \rho, \vec{u}, P \) and \( \vec{B} \) are the density, velocity, kinetic pressure and magnetic field of a fluid element respectively. \( \mu \) and \( \eta \) denote the coefficient of kinematic viscosity and magnetic resistivity. We assume \( \mu \) and \( \eta \) are constants over space and time. The symbol \( \otimes \) represents the dyadic between two vector quantities.

The kinetic Reynolds number \( (Re) \) and magnetic Reynolds number \( (Rm) \) are defined as \( Re = \frac{U_0 L}{\mu} \) and \( Rm = \frac{U_0 L}{\eta} \) where \( U_0 \) is the maximum velocity of the fluid system to start with and \( L \) is the system length.

We also define the sound speed of the fluid as \( C_s = \frac{U_0}{M_s} \), where, \( M_s \) is the sonic Mach number of the fluid. The Alfvén speed is determined from \( V_A = \frac{U_0}{M_A} \) where \( M_A \) is the Alfvén Mach number of the plasma. The initial magnetic field present in the plasma is determined from the relation \( B_0 = V_A \sqrt{\rho_0} \), where, \( \rho_0 \) is the initial density profile of the fluid.

III. DETAILS OF MHD3D CODE

In order to simulate the plasma dynamics governed through the above-mentioned MHD equations, a DNS code, MHD3D, has been developed in-house at Institute for Plasma Research. MHD3D is an OpenMP parallel three dimensional weakly compressible, viscous, resistive magnetohydrodynamic code using pseudo-spectral technique to simulate a general scenario of three dimensional magnetohydrodynamic turbulence problem. The pseudo-spectral technique, one of the most accurate CFD techniques available till today, uses the FFTW libraries which is one of the fastest Fourier Transform libraries developed recently. This technique is applied to calculate the spatial derivatives and to evaluate the non-linear terms involved in the basic underlying equations with a standard de-aliasing by 2/3 truncation rule. The time derivative is solved using multiple time solvers viz. Adams-Bashforth, Runge-Kutta 4 and Predictor-Correcter algorithms and all the solvers have been checked to provide identical results.

For two-dimensional hydro-dynamic case, we reproduced the results obtained earlier by Drazin and Keppens et al for a Kelvin-Helmholtz like scenario in both incompressible and compressible limits. The compressible magnetohydrodynamic solver in two dimensions is benchmarked with Keppens et al and Orszag et al. The three dimensional weakly compressible neutral fluid solver is benchmarked with the result of Samtaney et al for the root mean square of velocity divergence and the skewness of velocity field for a decaying turbulence case. The three dimensional kinetic dynamo effect is matched with Galloway et al in the case of ABC flow for a grid resolution of 64. More benchmarking details and specifications about the code are given in previous literature.

IV. PARAMETER DETAILS

We choose \( L = 2\pi \) periodic box as our simulation domain and fix \( \rho_0 = 1 \) and keep these parameters identical throughout our simulation. The initial magnitude of density \( (\rho_0) \) is known to affect the dynamics and growth rate of an instability in a compressible neutral fluid. However, in this report we keep the initial density fixed \( (\rho_0 = 1) \) for all the runs unless stated otherwise.

For two dimensional runs we choose a grid resolution of \( N_x = N_y = 128 \) and a time stepping interval \( \delta t = 10^{-5} \). The kinetic and magnetic Reynolds numbers are chosen as \( Re = Rm = 10^{-4} \). We run our code for the incompressible limit \( (M_s = 0.01) \).

For three dimensional runs we choose a grid resolution of \( N_x = N_y = N_z = 64 \) and a time stepping interval \( \delta t = 10^{-4} \). The kinetic and magnetic Reynolds numbers are chosen as \( Re = Rm = 450 \). For all cases we run our code for the incompressible limit \( (M_s = 0.1) \).

For both two and three dimensional runs we check our code with higher grid resolution \( (N) \) and smaller time stepping \( (\delta t) \) and found no significant variation in the results of our test runs.

The velocity profiles we choose are equilibrium stable solutions of Navier-Stokes equation and hence if there were no Lorentz force term present in the momentum equation, the flows would not have been disturbed even after a long time evolution. But back coupling of the magnetic variables through Lorentz force term affects the flow profile thereby giving rise to completely new dynamics in the system.
FIG. 1. Time evolution of shifted kinetic $[u^2(t) - u^2(0)]$, magnetic $[B^2(t) - B^2(0)]$ and total $[u^2(t) - u^2(0) + B^2(t) - B^2(0)]$ energy per grid for two dimensional Orszag-Tang flow with $N = 128^2$, $U_0 = 1$, $k_0 = 1$, $M_s = 0.01$, $M_A = 1$ and $Re = Rm = 10^{-4}$ in the absence of external forcing. The energy keeps on switching between kinetic and magnetic modes keeping the total energy conserved. It is found that the time period of oscillation is $T = 2.971$.

We choose $M_A = 1$ i.e. the mean velocity ($U_0$) is equal to the Alfvén speed of the system ($V_A$) (i.e. Alfvén resonance) for both the two as well as the three dimensional runs.

For two dimensional flows the initial magnetic field profile is chosen as $B_x = B_y = B_0$ and that for three dimensional flows as $B_x = B_y = B_z = B_0$.

V. SIMULATION RESULTS

A. Results for Decaying 2D Orszag-Tang Flow

For two dimensional Orszag-Tang flow the velocity profile is chosen as

$$u_x = -A \sin(k_0 y)$$
$$u_y = +A \sin(k_0 x)$$

with $A = 1$ and $k_0 = 1$. The interchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables is plotted in Fig. 1. The x-axis represents the time evolution and the y-axis represents the shifted kinetic and magnetic energy where the shift indicates that the initial values of the corresponding variables are subtracted from the time evolution data. A long time evolution of the system with several cycles of oscillations with $N = 256^2$, $\delta t = 10^{-6}$, $U_0 = 1$, $k_0 = 1$, $M_s = 0.01$, $M_A = 1$ and $Re = Rm = 10^{-5}$ found to show numerical convergence. From figure in it evident that the time period of oscillation is $T = 2.971$.

B. Results for Decaying 2D Cat’s Eye Flow

For two dimensional Cat’s Eye flow the velocity profile is chosen as

$$u_x = + \sin(k_0 x) \cos(k_0 y) - A \cos(k_0 x) \sin(k_0 y)$$
$$u_y = - \cos(k_0 x) \sin(k_0 y) + A \sin(k_0 x) \cos(k_0 y)$$

with $A = 0.5$, $k_0 = 1$. The interchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables is plotted in Fig. 2. It is found that the time period of oscillation is $T = 1.659$.

C. Results for Forced 2D Orszag-Tang Flow

$$\vec{f} = \alpha \left[ -A \sin(k_f y) + A \sin(k_f x) \right]$$

We choose, $\alpha = 0.1$, $A = 1$ and $k_f = 1$. The kinetic and magnetic energy continue to oscillate but the magnitudes of the peaks varies with time. The total (kinetic + magnetic) energy for the decaying cases were constant and the tiny decay was solely due to viscous and resistive effects. But for the forced case though the forcing acts for all the time over the whole system, the total energy oscillates with half the frequency of oscillation of the kinetic and magnetic energy [Fig. 3].
FIG. 3. Time evolution of shifted kinetic, magnetic and total energy per grid for two dimensional Orszag-Tang flow with $N = 128^2$, $U_0 = 1$, $k_0 = 1$, $M_4 = 0.01$, $M_A = 1$ and $Re = Rm = 10^{-4}$ in the presence of external forcing. The energy keeps on switching between kinetic and magnetic modes. The total energy also oscillates around the same frequency and the whole system acts as a forced-relaxed system. The shift denotes the initial values of the kinetic and magnetic energies (at time $t = 0$) are subtracted from the time evolution data of the corresponding variables.

D. Results for Decaying 3D Roberts Flow

For three dimensional Roberts flow the velocity profile is chosen as

$$u_x = U_0[A \sin(k_0 z)]$$
$$u_y = U_0[B \sin(k_0 x)]$$
$$u_z = U_0[C \sin(k_0 y)]$$

(8)

with $A = B = C = 1$, $k_0 = 1$. The interchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables is plotted in Fig. 4. It is found that the time period of oscillation is $T = 30.680$.

E. Results for Decaying 3D Cat’s Eye Flow

For three dimensional 3D Cat’s Eye flow the velocity profile is chosen as

$$u_x = U_0[B \sin(k_0 y)]$$
$$u_y = U_0[A \sin(k_0 x)]$$
$$u_z = U_0[A \cos(k_0 x) - B \cos(k_0 y)]$$

(9)

with $A = \sqrt{\frac{3}{5}}$, $B = 2A$. The interchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables is plotted in Fig. 5. It is found that the time period of oscillation is $T = 30.510$.

F. Results for Decaying 3D ABC Flow

For three dimensional Arnold-Beltrami-Childress flow we choose the velocity profile as

$$u_x = U_0[A \sin(k_0 z) + C \cos(k_0 y)]$$
$$u_y = U_0[B \sin(k_0 x) + A \cos(k_0 x)]$$
$$u_z = U_0[C \sin(k_0 y) + B \cos(k_0 x)]$$

(10)

with $A = B = C = 1$. The interchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic variables is plotted in Fig. 6. It is found that the time period of oscillation is $T = 30.171$.

G. Analysis of Decaying 3D ABC Flow

1. Effect of Initial Wave-number

We choose $k_0 = 1, 2, 4, 8, 16$ keeping $M_A = 1$. The frequency of oscillation increases with the increase of $k_0$ value. However the viscous ($\mu \nabla^2 \vec{u}$) as well as the resistive terms ($\eta \nabla^2 \vec{B}$) in Equation (12) and (3) affect the dynamics heavily when a higher wavenumber is excited. It is because the second derivative in the viscous and the resistive terms becomes more prominent when the velocity and magnetic field variables contain a higher magnitude of $k_0$ [Table 1, Fig. 9].
We primarily believe these oscillations are due to excitation of Alfven waves. We know the time period of oscillation of Alfven wave ($T_{Alfven}$) varies linearly with $B_0$ which is directly proportional to $V_A = \frac{U_0}{M_A}$. Thus if $M_A$ is increased, $T_{Alfven}$ decreases linearly Fig. [10, 11]. We analyse the frequency of oscillation for a series of $M_A$ values and find good agreement with this linearity prediction [Table II, Fig. 12].

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$M_A$</th>
<th>Time Period of Oscillation (T)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>3.150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>6.268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>9.364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>12.428</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>15.461</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>30.171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>43.238</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE II. Time period of oscillation ($T$) of kinetic and magnetic energy with $M_A$.

2. Effect of Alfven Speed

We study the effect of Alfven speed ($V_A$) on the energy exchange process by changing the Alfven Mach number $M_A$ for $k_f = 1$. Fig. [10] represents the oscillation of kinetic energy for $M_A = 0.1, 0.2, 0.3, 0.4, 0.5$ and Fig. [11] represents the oscillation of kinetic energy for $M_A = 0.5, 1.0, 1.5$. From both the figures it is evident that the frequency of oscillation decreases linearly with the increase of $M_A$. However if we further increase $M_A$ to 10, 100 and 1000 the oscillation vanishes and saturation of magnetic energy is observed after a linear growth of magnetic energy at the cost of kinetic energy indicating a dynamo effect taking place [Fig. 13].

Now we turn on the forcing on the velocity field. The forcing term we apply for all the time in the system is as follows:

$$f = \alpha \begin{bmatrix} A \sin(k_f z) + C \cos(k_f y) \\ B \sin(k_f x) + A \cos(k_f y) \\ C \sin(k_f y) + B \cos(k_f x) \end{bmatrix}$$  \hspace{1cm} (11)

We choose, $\alpha = 0.1$, $A = B = C = 1$ and $k_f = 1$.

Similar to the externally forced two dimensional system [Fig. 8], the total energy oscillates with time Fig. [14]. Initially [Fig. 15] the frequency of oscillation...
VI. GALERKIN REPRESENTATION IN TWO DIMENSIONS

In order to gain further understanding of the process, we resort to the finite mode representation for the field variables. The analytical theory is constructed for two dimensional decaying cases and is believed to hold for three dimensional decaying phenomena also. In two dimensions, we construct stream function ($\psi$) defined as $\vec{u} = \hat{z} \times \nabla \psi$ and magnetic vector potential ($\vec{A}$), defined as, $\vec{B} = \nabla \times \vec{A}$. In two dimensions the normalised incompressible MHD equations turn out as

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \nabla^2 \psi + (\hat{z} \times \nabla \psi \cdot \nabla) \nabla^2 \psi = -\nabla \times ((\nabla \times \vec{B}) \times \vec{B})$$

(12)

$$\frac{\partial \vec{A}}{\partial t} + (\hat{z} \times \nabla \psi \cdot \nabla) \vec{A} = 0$$

(13)

We represent the finite mode expansion as,

$$\psi(x, y) = \psi_0 \sin kx + e^{iky}(\psi_1 + \psi_3 \cos kx) + e^{-iky}(\psi_1^* + \psi_3^* \cos kx)$$

(14)

$$A(x, y) = A_0 \sin kx + e^{iky}(A_1 + A_3 \cos kx) + e^{-iky}(A_1^* + A_3^* \cos kx)$$

(15)
where \( k \) is the wave vector corresponding to the largest scale length of the system. Substituting Equation (14) and (15) into Equation (12) and (13) we obtain the time evolution of the galarkin truncated modes. The evolution of various modes of stream function and magnetic vector potential can thus be written as,

\[
\frac{d\psi_0}{dt} = ik^2(\psi_0^*\psi_1 - \psi_3\psi_1^*) \tag{16}
\]

\[
\frac{d\psi_1}{dt} = \frac{i}{2} k^2(\psi_0\psi_3 + A_0A_3) \tag{17}
\]

\[
\frac{d\psi_3}{dt} = 0 \tag{18}
\]

\[
\frac{dA_0}{dt} = ik^2(A_3\psi_1^* - A_3^*\psi_1 + A_1\psi_3^* - A_1^*\psi_3) \tag{19}
\]

\[
\frac{dA_1}{dt} = \frac{i}{2} k^2(A_0\psi_3 - A_3\psi_0) \tag{20}
\]

\[
\frac{dA_3}{dt} = ik^2(A_0\psi_1^* - A_1\psi_0) \tag{21}
\]

We start with a case similar to that of our initial condition used for the DNS code (\( \psi_0 = 1, \psi_1 = 0 = \psi_3, A_0 = A_1 = A_3 = 1 \) and \( k = 1 \)) and time evolve the above set of ordinary differential equations using RK4 method. In Fig. 19 we show the time evolution of real part of \( \psi_1 \)
FIG. 14. Time evolution of shifted kinetic, magnetic and total energy per grid for three dimensional Arnold-Beltrami-Childress flow with $N = 64^3$, $U_0 = 0.1$, $A = B = C = 1$, $k_0 = 1$, $M_s = 0.1$, $M_A = 1$ and $Re = Rm = 450$ in the presence of external forcing. The energy keeps on switching between kinetic and magnetic modes. The total energy also oscillates around the same frequency and the whole system acts as a forced-relaxed system. The shift denotes the initial values of the kinetic and magnetic energies (at time $t = 0$) are subtracted from the time evolution data of the corresponding variables.

FIG. 15. Initial time evolution obtained from Fig. 14. The variables ($\psi_1$ and $A_1$) are found to keep exchanging their values as the time evolves.

We also find the increment of frequency with the increase of $k_0$ in two dimensional system similar to that in three dimensional system [Fig 20, 21].

We further explore the parameter space by choosing lower values of $A$ indicating the higher $M_A$ cases where the “dynamo effect” happened in the 3D DNS runs. No saturation of magnetic energy is observed in the low degree of freedom model, indicating that the dynamo effect requires more number of modes to occur which is beyond the scope of the present analytical model.

FIG. 16. Intermediate time evolution obtained from Fig. 14. The variables ($\psi_1$ and $A_1$) are found to keep exchanging their values as the time evolves.

FIG. 17. Late time evolution obtained from Fig. 14. The variables ($\psi_1$ and $A_1$) are found to keep exchanging their values as the time evolves.

FIG. 18. Time evolution of kinetic and magnetic energy per grid for three dimensional Arnold-Beltrami-Childress flow with $N = 64^3$, $U_0 = 0.1$, $A = B = C = 1$, $k_0 = 1$, $M_s = 0.1$, $M_A = 0.1$ and $Re = Rm = 450$ in the presence of external forcing. The shift denotes the initial values of the kinetic and magnetic energies (at time $t = 0$) are subtracted from the time evolution data of the corresponding variables.
FIG. 19. Galerkin truncated two dimensional MHD equations representing similar nonlinear coherent oscillations observed in DNS results with $k = 1$.

FIG. 20. Galerkin truncated two dimensional MHD equations representing similar nonlinear coherent oscillations observed in DNS results with $k = 2$.

FIG. 21. Galerkin truncated two dimensional MHD equations representing similar nonlinear coherent oscillations observed in DNS results with $k = 4$.

VII. SUMMARY AND FUTURE WORK

In this paper we show the single fluid magnetohydrodynamic equations supports energy exchange between kinetic and magnetic variables over a long enough period in both two and three dimensions. Thus it is shown that the energy exchange phenomena takes place for both non-chaotic as well as chaotic fields. The time period of oscillation of the energy exchange is found to vary linearly with Alfven Mach number ($M_A$). Also frequency is seen to increase with the initial wave-number ($k$) excited within the flow. In presence of an external forcing identical to the initial velocity field, the system is found to act as a forced-relaxed system showing the periodic variation of the total energy of the system as well as exchange of energy between kinetic and magnetic modes.

The three dimensional calculations are performed over $64^3$ grid resolution. A better spatial resolution is expected to be capable of simulating higher fluid and magnetic Reynold’s number runs. Thus the periodicity of energy exchange in three dimensional flows could be observed for larger number of cycles for high resolution runs.

VIII. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The development as well as benchmarking of MHD2D and MHD3D have been done at Udbhav and Uday clusters at IPR.