Mechanical and Optical Properties of Amorphous Oxide Thin Films: Experimental Correlation Between Internal Friction and Urbach Energy

Alex Amato,* 2Silvana Terreni, 1Massimo Granata, 1Christophe Michel, 1Benoit Sassolas, 1Laurent Pinard, 2Maurizio Caneva, and 4Gianpier Cagnoli

1Laboratoire des Matériaux Avancés, CNRS/IN2P3, F-69622 Villeurbanne (FR).
2OPTMATLAB, Dipartimento di Fisica, Università di Genova, Via Dodecaneso 33, 16146 Genova (IT).
3INFN, Sezione di Genova, Via Dodecaneso 33, 16146 Genova, Italy. and
4Institut Lumière et Matière, CNRS, Université de Lyon, F-69622 Villeurbanne (FR).

(Dated: June 25, 2019)

Optical interference amorphous coatings find scientific and technological applications in many fields. In such system, the study of optical and mechanical properties are of fundamental importance in order to develop low noise devices. In this work the optical properties, related to the electronic density of states, and mechanical properties, regarding the internal friction, are compared by their relationship with the topological defects of structure in a short to medium range order. In particular, by studying the optical and mechanical properties of oxides suitable for gravitational-wave detectors, a correlation between the Urbach energy, related to the exponential behaviour of the absorption edge, and the internal friction, related to the energy dissipation in a two level system model, has been found.

I. INTRODUCTION

High quality optical interference coatings (OIC) formed by alternate low- and high-index layers find scientific and technological applications in many fields of optics where the transmission or reflection of light needs to be perfectly defined as a function of wavelength. In particular in this work we are dealing with OIC that are used in low noise devices such as laser frequency stabilization cavities[1], opto-mechanical resonators[2], atomic clocks[3] and Gravitational Wave detectors to name a few. Amorphous oxide (AO) multilayers deposited by ion beam sputtering (IBS) are appealing for NIR interference as they are highly isotropic, homogeneous and endowed with extremely low optical absorption, which is a factor of obvious success for the best functionality of mirrors. Notably, in gravitational-wave astronomy, AO multilayers represent the key elements of high performance Bragg reflectors which are exploited in the Fabry-Perot cavities of wide-area, giant interferometer detectors (GWD)[4–6]. Indeed, multilayers made of Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ (the high index material) and silica (SiO$_2$, the low index material) deposited on massive, large-area fused silica substrates have been adopted by Advanced LIGO (aLIGO) and Advanced Virgo (AdV) detectors[7], contributing to the recent, first observations of gravitational waves[8]. For these GWD applications, in addition to the highest optical quality, very low internal friction is the necessary requirement to have low thermal noise [9]. In these devices noise comes from thermally activated relaxations inside the amorphous materials forming the OIC. In this respect, high-index materials (AO of transition metals like Ti and Ta) were early recognized as the dominant source of thermal noise in GWD[10], which limits the performance in the most sensitive region of the detection band (30 Hz to 300 Hz) where GWs from the coalescing binaries have the strongest amplitude. Fostering higher sensitivity in the next generation of GWD detectors, necessary to investigate deeper portions of the universe, calls for a lowering of coating thermal noise and a better knowledge of the structure of AO coatings at the molecular level[11]. In particular, thermal noise is associated with thermally activated transitions between equilibrium configurations of structure. There is interest to find which static properties of the amorphous structure are able to affect either the rate or the total number of such transitions. In the context of optical measurements, so called Urbach tails[12] routinely observed by optical absorption measurements in crystalline and amorphous semiconductors[13], describe a sub-gap exponential broadening of the absorption edge that is related to structural and thermal disorder. The concept of band-tails states finds interesting application in the study of amorphous solids [14, 15] where the structural disorder is dominant with respect to thermal one. In this view, the structural origin of the exponential tails[16] can give precious insight in atomic organization of the system involving several tens of atoms. In this paper we present the first experimental evidence of a correlation between the amount of mechanical losses in AO wide band-gap semiconductors and the energy extension of Urbach tails. In order to show this correlation we have combined mechanical and spectroscopic ellipsometry (SE) measurements on the same kind of samples. We have considered films grown using the same procedures adopted to produce the Bragg reflectors used in aLIGO and AdV interferometers. Tantalum (Ta$_2$O$_5$), “titania-doped” tantala (Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$), niobia (Nb$_2$O$_5$) and “niobia-doped” titania (Nb:TiO$_2$) amorphous thin films have been tested in their mechanical and optical response and the effect of standard annealing procedures and mixing on the optical and mechanical properties investigated. A possible explana-

* a.amato@lma.in2p3.fr
tion of the correlation between mechanical and optical properties may come from the spatial extension probed by the Urbach’s tails measurements that is typical of the structures that causes internal friction and noise in amorphous Ta$_2$O$_5$[17]. The correlation is observed analysing different oxide coating materials, suggesting a general rather than specific validity of such properties.

II. EXPERIMENTAL

A. Materials

Samples are IBS AO mono-layers deposited at LMA. In particular, Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ have been deposited using a custom made coater machine developed to deposit the mirrors for GWD, the so-called Grand Coater (GC)[18]. The Ti-doping concentration has been optimized in order to minimize the mechanical loss[19, 20]. The atomic ratio of Ti to Ta is equal to 0.27 as measured through Rutherford backscattering spectrometry (RBS). More information about these coatings can be found elsewhere[21].

Nb$_2$O$_5$ and Nb:TiO$_2$ with atomic ratio of Nb to Ti equal to 0.37, as measured through energy-dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDX), have been deposited by a smaller custom-designed IBS machine. Niobia based materials have been investigated as candidate to replace the high-index material in GWD coatings.

Mechanical investigation requires substrates having lower internal friction than coating materials. On the other hand, optical analysis requires substrates suitable for reflection measurement. Thus, silica disk-shaped resonators (2" or 3" of diameter and 1 mm thick) have been adopted because of their low loss angle at room temperature for mechanical investigation. One-side polished silicon wafers (2" of diameter and 1 mm thick) have been used for optical investigation. Using the CG it was possible to deposit the same coating on the different substrates, for optical and mechanical characterization, at the same time. Using the smaller IBS machine particular attention has been dedicated to deposit coating materials in the strictly same conditions.

Coatings for GWD undergo a post-deposition heating treatment in order to reduce the optical absorption at 1064 nm and the mechanical loss. For this reason, all the samples have been analysed before and after the annealing. In particular, Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ have been annealed at 500°C for 10, following the same procedure for GWD mirrors. TiO$_2$ coating instead has a crystallization temperature below 500°C and can not be used in GWD mirrors. Under this respect, the Nb doping allows to increase the crystallization temperature of TiO$_2$ without significantly reducing the refractive index, reaching 400°C.

B. Mechanical Characterization

The mechanical dissipation of amorphous coatings, related to the relaxation process, has been measured by the resonance method[22] using the Gentle Nodal Suspension[21, 23–25]. In particular, the ringdown time $\tau_k$ of several vibrational modes $k$ with frequency $\nu_k$, before and after the coating deposition has been measured in order to obtain the loss angle $\phi_k = (\pi \nu_k \tau_k)^{-1}$ that quantifies the internal friction of the sample. Considering a harmonic excitation of the system, at each cycle the dissipated energy reads

$$E_{diss} = 2\pi \phi E_{st},$$

where $E_{st}$ is the stored energy in the system. In this sense, equation 1 makes explicit the relation between the loss angle and mechanical dissipation of the system. The coating loss angle is worked out through the subtraction of the measurements of the bare substrate from that of the coated sample as detailed in ref.[21, 26].

C. Optical Characterization

In the purpose of finding a possible link of structural features to mechanical properties, an accurate investigation of the optical absorption edge in the near UV region seems promising, since it is primarily determined by the electronic joint density of states (JDOS) in turn directly depending on structural and morphological properties. We have exploited broad-band spectroscopic ellipsometry (SE) to obtain information on the absorption edge of AO coatings. A rotating analyzer ellipsometer (JA Woollam VASE) allowed measurements at 910 different wavelengths in the 1.1 – 6.5 eV (190 – 1100 nm) energy range. The ($\Psi$, $\Delta$) measurements have been acquired at different angles 55°, 60°, 65°, close to the Brewster angle $\theta_B$ (for example, $\theta_B \sim 63.7$ for Ta$_2$O$_5$). In AO, the absorption coefficient describing the optical transitions between an initial localized state in the valence band tail and an extended state in the conduction band reads

$$\alpha(E) \propto e^{(E-E_0)/E_U},$$

where $E_0$ is the energy limit of the extended band-like states and the Urbach energy $E_U$ characterizes the energy spread of the tail decay into the gap due to lattice disorder.

III. RESULTS

A. Mechanical Response

Figure 1 shows the coating loss angle of the analysed materials, for several resonant modes in the $10^3 – 10^4$ Hz band. In particular, in panel a), data taken on Ta$_2$O$_5$.
and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ samples show that both the annealing and the so-called “doping” treatment contribute to reduce the coating loss angle. This behaviour is in agreement with previous studies on Ti doping of annealed Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$/SiO$_2$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coatings[19–21]. In panel b), measurements on Nb$_2$O$_5$ and Nb:TiO$_2$ are shown. The data confirm a loss angle lowering by annealing and doping.

The origin of loss can be ascribed to the peculiar structure of AO, that presents an enormous number of equilibrium configurations. The study of these equilibrium configurations is based on a pure theoretical representation known as two-level system (TLS), where two equilibrium states are described by an asymmetric double-well potential (ADWP)[27]. In order to represent the complexity of the material, different TLS having a distribution of the ADWP potential $V$ and asymmetry $\Delta$ are considered[27]. It is possible to show that the internal friction in a material is proportional to the density of TLS that have a barrier height of about 0.5 eV[28]. In fact, following the Arrhenius law, the TLS with lower barrier height are too fast with respect to the period of the external excitation and in this way their contribution to the energy dissipation is negligible. The same happens for the TLS that have a higher barrier height for which the relaxation is much longer than the excitation period[27].

### B. Optical Measurements

Considering Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating as a representative sample, figures 2.a and 2.b) show a comparison between $(\Psi, \Delta)$ data before and after the heating treatment. As shown in the figure, it is clear that SE measurements before and after the annealing present evident differences in the energy region from 3.5 eV to 4.5 eV, where the optical absorption threshold is located. In particular, after the annealing there are oscillations that are more evident near the absorption edge. This is related to the reduction of optical transitions involving energy states in the energy gap with the annealing. We note that the same considerations can be done by comparing Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coatings, taking into account that the energy gap of the two materials is different.

Following previous works[29] SE data were analysed through a three-layer system (ambient/coating/substrate). After having determined the optical properties of the substrate by dedicated measurements on bare samples, the complex dielectric function $\varepsilon$ of the coating was modelled by a convenient parametric model, including Urbach absorption tails. The optical parameters and the thickness of the coating were then determined by fitting the $(\Psi, \Delta)$ data[30].

Previous work on transition metal amorphous oxides (29) and references therein), showed that the KK-consistent Cody-Lorentz (CL) formula[31] for the dielectric function $\varepsilon$ provides an adequate interpretation of optical properties in a wide energy region across the absorption edge. The CL model accounts for the Urbach tail and includes $E_U$ as a relevant parameter to be exploited in the fitting procedure. As example, in figures 2.c) and 2.d) the CL model simulation is compared to the $(\Psi, \Delta)$ experimental data for Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ before the heating treatment.

The best fit determination of the complex dielectric function allows to calculate the absorption coefficient through the well-known relation $\alpha(E) = (\varepsilon_2E)/(\hbar c n)$, where $\varepsilon_2$ is the imaginary part of $\varepsilon$, $n$ is the refractive index, $c$ the speed of light in [cm/s] and $\hbar$ the reduced Planck constant.

Figure 3 shows the absorption coefficient as the function of the photon energy for the same materials analysed in previous section. In the logarithmic scale representation chosen for $\alpha$, Urbach tails have a linear appearance and the inverse of the slope is proportional to $E_U$.
FIG. 2. SE data for Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating. Comparison of $\Psi$ (a) and $\Delta$ (b) for measurements acquired with an angle of incident of 60°, before (blue) and after (green) the annealing. $\Psi$ (c) and $\Delta$ (d) data acquired at different angles before the annealing compared to the CL model simulation (red).

(equation 2). Panels a), b), c) and d) show the effect of the annealing on Ta$_2$O$_5$, Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$, Nb$_2$O$_5$ and Nb:TiO$_2$ coatings, respectively.

In the figure, it is possible to appreciate the reduction of the extension of the Urbach tails. The reduction of the optical gap induced by doping (see Table I) is also evident. The values confirm the homogeneity of the coatings since, especially for Ta$_2$O$_5$ the shift of the energy gap due to the Ti-doping, where the TiO$_2$ has been found to have an energy gap about 3.3–3.5 eV [32, 33], is in agreement with the atomic ratio concentration. The shift of the energy gap is less evident for Nb:TiO$_2$ as the two oxides have similar energy gap. For a more quantitative comparison, the values of the Urbach energy obtained by the fit using the CL model are reported in table I. From the table it can be observed that, as already noticed, also Ti/Ta mixing induces a reduction of $E_U$ but to an extent which is smaller than the annealing-induced variation. Anyway, the greatest reduction can be obtained by suitably combining annealing and doping.

C. Correlation between mechanical loss and Urbach energy

The results about the coating loss angle and the optical absorption coefficient reported in figure 1 and 3 respectively, exhibit a similar trend regarding the annealing and the mixing. In this respect, it is interesting to look at figure 4 where the coating loss angle is reported as function of the Urbach energy $E_U$, for both tantala and niobia coating under different conditions. The values used in figure 4 are summarised in table I. The linear behaviour suggests the existence of a correlation between these two quantities.

To our knowledge, this is the first time that such correlation is reported.

IV. DISCUSSION

The observed correlation between coating loss angle and Urbach energy calls for a common physical background, to be most naturally searched in the structural ground.

In this respect interesting results were recently obtained on tantala and Ti-doped tantala coatings, i.e. the
The values of the data are listed in Table I.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Coating</th>
<th>Thickness (nm)</th>
<th>$\phi_c$ (meV)</th>
<th>$E_U$ (eV)</th>
<th>$E_g$ (eV)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ta$_2$O$_5$</td>
<td>579 ± 2</td>
<td>6.4 ± 0.2</td>
<td>164 ± 8</td>
<td>4.1 ± 0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$</td>
<td>500 ± 2</td>
<td>6.1 ± 0.2</td>
<td>152 ± 5</td>
<td>3.6 ± 0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ta$_2$O$_5$ ann.</td>
<td>592 ± 2</td>
<td>4.6 ± 0.5</td>
<td>130 ± 10</td>
<td>4.0 ± 0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ ann.</td>
<td>509 ± 2</td>
<td>3.7 ± 0.7</td>
<td>108 ± 5</td>
<td>3.6 ± 0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb$_2$O$_5$</td>
<td>8.3 ± 0.4</td>
<td>110 ± 10</td>
<td>3.4 ± 0.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb:TiO$_2$</td>
<td>7.4 ± 0.8</td>
<td>108 ± 5</td>
<td>3.3 ± 0.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb$_2$O$_5$ ann.</td>
<td>4.8 ± 0.7</td>
<td>80 ± 10</td>
<td>3.4 ± 0.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nb:TiO$_2$ ann.</td>
<td>4.7 ± 0.9</td>
<td>80 ± 5</td>
<td>3.3 ± 0.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The absorption coefficient of Ta$_2$O$_5$ (top) and Nb$_2$O$_5$ (bottom) before and after the annealing for undoped (left) and doped (right) material, obtained by CL model. The logarithmic scale allows to distinguish better the different slopes in the region where the absorption decays exponentially with the energy $E_U$. The solid lines represent the absorption appreciated by SE analysis. The dashed lines represent an extension of the CL model to better distinguish the different slopes.

The circles refer to as deposited samples whereas the squares to the samples after the heating treatment. Two different coatings are considered, the Ta$_2$O$_5$ (blue) and the Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ (green). The values of the data are listed in Table 1.
decrease of the measured loss angle is accompanied by a reduction of the width of the main peak, related to metal-oxygen distances. More recent studies [35] highlighted that the amorphous material is made by Primary Structural Units (PSU) very similar to that of the crystalline version of the same material. The authors claimed that annealing favours the organization of PSUs in short 1D-chains or 2D ribbons. Instead doping with Zr works in the opposite way. Further they suggest that the emergence or suppression of medium range 2D order may have important influence on properties of Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating.

In another recent work, Raman spectroscopy measurements on SiO$_2$ coating showed that extended structures such as rings made of three tetrahedrons of SiO$_2$ (the PSU of SiO$_2$) are correlated to the coating loss angle[36] and have an activation energy of about 0.43 eV[37]. Furthermore, molecular dynamics of AO such as SiO$_2$ showed that TLS with a barrier of 0.5 eV primarily involves quasi-1D chain of Si-O-Si and rings of Si-O-Si bonds[38]. The ensemble of measurements suggests that at room temperature the main contribution to the loss angle is to be ascribed not only to short-range order but also to non-local structural organization.

The evidence for a relation between Urbach tails and structure is dating back to early works on the subject: Cody et al.[13], recognized that the width of the exponential tail is controlled by the amount of structural and thermal disorder in the network. More recent works[16, 39] have pointed out a relation between the presence of structural, not crystalline atomic organization on a medium range scale and the extension of Urbach tails. Interesting results have been obtained by atomistic modelling of amorphous silicon[16]: molecular dynamics calculations show that after the relaxation of the structure an exponential valence tail appears in the electronic DOS. An inverse participation ratio (IPR) analysis shows that the extreme tail eigenstates on amorphous semiconductors are primary localized on so-called topological filaments (TF). In fact, while well localized defects induce mid-gap states, more complex and organized structures induces Urbach states near the valence or conduction band edge. In a-Si such structures are connected sub-network of short bonds or long bonds [15]. Interesting, if the defects correlation is artificially destroyed the Urbach tail is severely affected. Structural relaxation favours defects correlation and reduces the Urbach energy[16].

In this view, Urbach tails can be viewed as a simple, meaningful way to visualize the impact of structural organization in the amorphous structure, in a multi-range perspective. In this respect, the correlation between the Urbach tail extension and the mechanical losses could be explained through the range of characterization of defect offered by the Urbach tails analysis, which includes the same scale of the typical structures that are responsible of the dissipation of mechanical energy as measured at 300 K in the acoustic band.

Post-deposition annealing generally modifies the Urbach tails. For example, Xue et al.[40] recorded the decreasing of Urbach energy in ZnO thin film with increasing annealing temperature from 600°C to 750°, whereas an inverse trend is observed exceeding 750°. This observation can help to understand Urbach tailing mechanisms, where the annealing may be used to allow a structural self-organization with a consequent lattice strain relaxation[41].

In some simple models the structural disorder of AO, where atom positions are disposed in a continuous random network (CNR), is described in terms of Gaussian distributions of bond lengths and angles[42, 43]. The heating treatment could conceivably lead to an effective relaxation of local strains, to a narrowing of the above-mentioned Gaussian distributions, and eventually to an improvement of defects correlation with reduction of the tails in the electronic states probed in optical measurements. Hence, the annealing progressively reduces the strain and consequently the Urbach energy is reduced too. How this fact may explain a reduction of losses remains partially unclear. However on the side of the loss measurements, the annealing is known to reduce the density of TLS having a barrier height of 0.5 eV. As mentioned in section III.A these particular TLS are the main source of internal friction at room temperature.

The effect of Ti/Ta mixing on the reduction of the Urbach energy is less intuitive and to some extent even counter-intuitive. The investigation done in [34] points out that Ti-doping changes the Ta$_2$O$_5$ structure, leading to an increase of short-range homogeneity. It is shown that this is related to a low coating loss angle. In [34] reverse Monte Carlo (RMC) simulation has been used to match the observed RDF and a significant fraction of TaTiO$_2$ ring fragments is formed in the doped coating. This changes the structure by modifying the angles between oxygen-metal-oxygen and metal-oxygen-metal as consequence. Under this respect, it is reasonable to assume that the Urbach tails are reduced by the increase of the structure homogeneity induced by the Ti-doping.

The considerations made above explain the reduction of the Urbach tails with the reduction of structural inhomogeneity of the material as a consequence of both annealing and mixing. The same effect of structural inhomogeneity has been already highlighted on internal friction. Another mechanism could justify the modification of Urbach energy after mixing, based on the consideration that Urbach energy depends not only on static structural disorder but also on a temperature term[13, 44] that is related to the interaction of electronic states with the phonon spectrum. In some cases the second term is not negligible as for example happens in the case of silica[45].

Although the measurements are done at the same room temperature mixing changes the phonon spectrum and likely the Debye temperature of the original materials. In [34] it has been suggested that mixing is able to change the connection between PSU i.e. they are connected through corner, edge and side sharing. A changing in PSU connection is able to change the Debye temperature.
Regarding internal friction, as pointed out by [34], the change in the distribution of sharing element is able to alter the barrier height of TLS. In any case, since the Urbach tails of doped oxide are less extended than the undoped one, we can infer that the local and non local structure of the doped material is more homogeneous, with a resulting lower loss angle.

V. CONCLUSION

The search of the structural origin of the mechanical dissipation behaviour in amorphous materials has produced several sound results in recent years.

In recent work [34] a correlation between the mechanical coating loss angle and the short-range structural organization has been claimed. However, recent studies [17, 38] showed that the TLS giving rise to the dissipation mechanism at room temperature must involve more complex structures, regarding a medium- and even long-range structural organization.

The Urbach energy is a parameter which quantifies the homogeneity of the structure by optical absorption investigation, probing a multi-range structural organization. In this work, both internal friction and Urbach energy have been studied for Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Nb$_2$O$_5$ coating materials, under different condition regarding the mixing with TiO$_2$ and a post-deposition heating treatment at 500°C for 10 hours.

The annealing relaxes the structure of coating materials, leading to a more organized structure, maintaining the amorphous state. In the same way, a certain amount of doping either modifies the structure forcing the system in a more homogeneous atomic disposition or it changes the phonon spectrum reducing effectively the impact of temperature on the Urbach energy. The annealing and the doping eventually reduce the mechanical loss angle and the Urbach energy, leading to a correlation between these quantities. The observed correlation between the energy extension of Urbach tails and the level of mechanical losses opens new perspectives. First, optical characterization of the fundamental absorption edge emerges as a tool for rapid pre-diagnostics of coating mechanical quality. At the same time the characterization of Urbach tails complements the analysis of the structure in a different spatial range. Being the Urbach energy a single value parameter hardly it can describe the complexity of the amorphous material, whereas it is correlated to the structural homogeneity of the material at the right range for the energy loss mechanisms. Finally, since the correlation has been proved with three different oxides (Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Nb$_2$O$_5$ mixed with TiO$_2$), further investigation will be important to extend the validity of the correlation for other oxide systems.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors wish to acknowledge G. Gemme of Università degli studi di Genova for his support to this activity.

of the Fifth International Symposium on Sputtering and Plasma Processes.

35. B. Shyam et al., Scientific Reports 6, 32170 (2016), article.