The understanding of how the structure rules the several properties that distinguish amorphous solids from crystals is important for a technological progress, regarding several applications. The random network structure that characterises amorphous solids and causes the loose of a long-range order forces the research to a continuous efforts in order to explain all the properties that differ from crystals, through the creation of models without using the Bloch theorem, which is based on the periodicity of the lattice. This aspect of amorphous structure is responsible of interesting feature. In this work the optical properties, related to the electronic density of states, and mechanical properties, regarding the internal friction, are compared by their relationship with the topological defects of structure in a short-medium range-order. In particular, by studying the optical and mechanical properties of oxides suitable for gravitational-wave detectors, a correlation between the Urbach energy, related to the exponential behaviour of the absorption edge caused by the transition from localized to extended states in the electronic density of states, and the internal friction, related to the energy dissipation in a two level system model, has been found.

I. INTRODUCTION

High quality Optical Interference Coatings formed by alternate low- and high-index layers find scientific and technology applications in many fields of optics where the transmission or reflection of light needs to be perfectly defined as a function of wavelength. In particular in this work we are dealing with OIC that are used in low noise devices such as laser frequency stabilization cavities[1], opto-mechanical resonators[2], atomic clocks[3] and Gravitational Wave detectors to name a few. In these devices noise comes from thermally activated relaxations inside the amorphous materials forming the OIC. Amorphous oxide (AO) multilayers deposited by ion beam sputtering (IBS) are appealing for IR interferometry as they are highly isotropic, homogeneous and endowed with extremely low optical absorption, which is a factor of obvious success for the best functionality of mirrors. Notably, in gravitational-wave astronomy, AO multilayers represent the key elements of high performance Bragg reflectors which are exploited in the Fabry-Perot cavities of wide-area, giant interferometer detectors (GWD)[4-6]. For these GWD applications, in addition to the highest optical quality, very low internal friction is the necessary requirements to have low thermal noise [7]. In this respect, high-index materials (AO of transition metals like Ti and Ta) were early recognized as the dominant source of thermal noise in GWD[8], which limits the performance in the most sensitive region of the detection band (30 Hz to 300 Hz) where GWs from the coalescing binaries have the strongest amplitude. Fostering further sensitivity increase in the next generation of GWD detectors, necessary to investigate deeper portions of the universe, calls for a lowering of coating thermal noise and a better knowledge of the influence of the structure at the molecular level of AO coatings[9] on the mechanical properties. In particular, thermal noise is associated with thermally activated transitions between equilibrium configurations of structure. Scientists are searching which static properties of the amorphous structure are able to affect either the rate or the total number of such transitions.

In this paper we present the first experimental evidence of a correlation between the energy extension of Urbach tails, which add precious elements of information in the medium-long range order (to be precise around and beyond 10 Å) and the amount of mechanical losses in AO wide band-gap semiconductors. In order to show this correlation we have combined optical and mechanical measurements on the same samples. We have considered IBS films grown at LMA, Lyon, using the same procedures adopted to produce the Bragg reflectors used in aLIGO and Adv interferometers. Tantalum (Ta2O5), “titania-doped” tantalum (Ti:Ta2O5), niobia (Nb2O5) and “niobia-doped” titania (Nb:TiO2) amorphous thin films have been tested in their mechanical and optical response and the effect of standard annealing procedures and mixing on the optical and mechanical properties investigated. A possible explanation of the correlation between mechanical and optical properties may come from the range probed by the Urbach’s tails measurements that is typical of the structures that causes internal friction and noise in amorphous Ta2O5[10]. The results of this work have been assumed to be valid for the other investigated materials.
II. RESULTS

A. The Mechanical Response

The mechanical dissipation of amorphous coatings, related to the relaxation process, has been measured by the resonance method[11] using the Gentle Nodal Suspension, described in details elsewhere[12–14]. In particular, the ringdown time $\tau_k$ of several vibrational modes $k$ with frequency $\nu_k$, before and after the coating deposition has been measured in order to obtain the loss angle $\phi_k = (\pi \nu_k \tau_k)^{-1}$ that quantifies the internal friction of the sample. Considering a harmonic excitation of the system, at each cycle the dissipated energy reads

$$E_{\text{diss}} = 2\pi \phi E_{\text{st}},$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

where $E_{\text{st}}$ is the stored energy in the system. In this sense, equation 1 makes explicit the relation between the loss angle and mechanical dissipation of the system. The coating loss angle is worked out through the comparison between the measurements of the coated and bare substrate, details are found in[15, 16]. Figure 1 shows the coating loss angle of the analysed materials, for several resonant modes in the $10^3 - 10^4$ Hz band. In particular, in panel a), data taken on Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ samples show that the so-called “doping” treatment and in particular the annealing both act in the same direction, reducing the coating loss angle. This behaviour is in agreement with previous studies where effective reduction of losses has been obtained by tuning post deposition annealing, selecting suitable temperature and duration and by exploiting convenient oxide mixtures, with doping[17]. Indeed, multilayers made of Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ (the high index material) and silica (SiO$_2$, the low index material) deposited on massive, large-area fused silica substrates have been adopted by Advanced LIGO (aLIGO) and Advanced Virgo (AdV) detectors[18], contributing to the recent, first observations of gravitational waves[19]. In panel b), measurements on Nb$_2$O$_5$ and Nb:TiO$_2$ are shown. The latter has been tested as possible candidate for further upgrade of GWD. The data confirm a loss angle lowering by annealing and doping. We note that Nb:TiO$_2$ loss angle is higher than Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$.

The origin of loss can be ascribed to the peculiar structure of AO, that presents an enormous number of equilibrium configurations. The study of these equilibrium configurations is based on a pure theoretical representation known as two-level system (TLS), where two equilibrium states are described by an asymmetric double-well potential (ADWP)[20]. In order to represent the complexity of the material, different TLS having a distribution of the ADWP potential $V$ and asymmetry $\Delta$ are considered[20]. It is possible to show that the internal friction in a material is proportional to the density of TLS that have a barrier height of about 0.5 eV. In fact, following the Arrhenius law, the TLS with lower barrier height are too fast with respect to the period of the external excitation and in this way their contribution to the energy dissipation is negligible. The same happens for the TLS that have a higher barrier height for which the relaxation is much longer than the excitation period[20].

B. The Optical Response

Optical measurements are routinely performed to characterize the refractive index or the extremely low extinction coefficient of coatings at the operational laser wavelength of interest for GWD (1064 nm for aLIGO and AdV). Despite this kind of information is definitely essential to design and check the optical properties of coatings and mirrors, no direct link can be easily established to the coating’s atomic structure. In this direction and also in the purpose of finding a possible relation with mechanical properties, an accurate investigation of the fundamental optical absorption edge in the near UV region[21, 22] seems much more promising, since it is primarily determined by the electronic joint density of states (JDOS), in turn directly depending on structural and morphological properties.

In this context, so called Urbach tails[23], routinely observed by optical absorption measurements in crystalline and amorphous semiconductors[24], describe a sub-gap broadening of the absorption edge that is related to structural and thermal disorder. The concept of band-tails states finds interesting application in the study of amorphous solids [25, 26] where the structural disorder, is dominant with respect to thermal one. The absorption coefficient describing the optical transitions between an initial localized state in the valence band tail and an extended state in the conduction band reads

$$\alpha(E) \propto e^{(E-E_0)/E_U},$$  \hspace{1cm} (2)

where $E_0$ is the energy limit of the extended band-like states and the Urbach energy $E_U$ characterizes the energy spread of the tail decay into the gap due to lattice disorder.

We have exploited broad-band spectroscopic ellipsometry (SE) to obtain information on the absorption edge of AO coatings. Thus, following previous works[27] SE data were analysed through a three-layer system (ambient/coating/substrate). After having determined the optical properties of the substrate by dedicated measurements on bare samples, the complex dielectric function $\varepsilon$ of the coating was modelled by a convenient parametric model, including Urbach absorption tails. The optical parameters and the thickness of the coating were then determined by fitting the $(\Psi, \Delta)$ data[28]. Figures 2,a) and 2,b) show a comparison between $(\Psi, \Delta)$ data for Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating before and after the heating treatment.

As shown in the figure, it is clear that SE measurements before and after the annealing differ mainly in the energy region from 3.5 eV to 4.5 eV, where the energy gap occurs. In particular, after the annealing there are oscillations that are more evident near the absorption
edge. This is related to the reduction of optical transitions involving energy states in the energy gap with the annealing. We note that the same considerations can be done by comparing Ta$_2$O$_5$ and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coatings but since the energy gap is different, a direct comparison is not clear as in figure 2.

Previous work on transition metal amorphous oxides (27] and references therein), showed that the KK-consistent Cody-Lorentz (CL) formula[29] for the dielectric function $\varepsilon$ provides an adequate interpretation of opti-

FIG. 1. Coating loss angle as function of frequency for Ta$_2$O$_5$ (blue) and Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ (green) coating before and after the annealing on the left, for Nb$_2$O$_5$ (orange) and Nb:TiO$_2$ (violet) on the right.

FIG. 2. SE data for Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating. Comparison of $\Psi$ (a) and $\Delta$ (b) for measurements acquired with an angle of incident of 60°, before (blue) and after (green) the annealing. $\Psi$ (c) and $\Delta$ (d) data acquired at different angles before the annealing compared to the CL model simulation (red).
tional properties in a wide energy region across the absorption edge. The CL model accounts for the Urbach tail and includes $E_U$ as a relevant parameter to be exploited in the fitting procedure. As example, in figures 2,c) and 2,d) the CL model simulation is compared to the $(\Psi,\Delta)$ experimental data for Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ before the heating treatment.

The best fit determination of the complex dielectric function allows to calculate the absorption coefficient through the well-known relation $\alpha(E) = (\varepsilon_2 E)/\hbar c n$, where $\varepsilon_2$ is the imaginary part of $\varepsilon$, $n$ is the refractive index, $c$ the speed of light in [cm/s] and $\hbar$ the reduced Plank constant.

Figure 3 shows the absorption coefficient as the function of the photon energy for the same materials analysed in previous section. In the logarithmic scale representation chosen for alpha, Urbach tails have a linear appearance and the inverse of the slope is proportional to $E_U$ (equation 2). Panels a), b), c) and d) show the effect of the annealing on Ta$_2$O$_5$, Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$, Nb$_2$O$_5$ and Nb:TiO$_2$ coatings, respectively.

In the figure, it is possible to appreciate the reduction of the Urbach tails. It is also evident the increase of the optical gap induced by doping. For a more quantitative comparison, the values of the Urbach energy obtained by the fit using the CL model are reported in table I. From the table it can be observed that also Ti/Ta mixing induces a reduction of $E_U$ to an extent which is smaller than the annealing-induced variation. Thus, the greatest reduction can be obtained by suitably combining annealing and doping.

C. Correlation between mechanical loss and Urbach energy

The results about the coating loss angle and the optical absorption coefficient reported in figure 1 and 3 respectively, exhibit a similar trend regarding the annealing and the mixing. In this respect, it is interesting to look at figure 4 where the coating loss angle is reported as function of the Urbach energy $E_U$, for both tantala and niobia coating under different conditions. The values used in figure 4 are summarised in table I. The nicely linear behaviour suggests the existence of a correlation between these two quantities.

To our knowledge, this is the first time that such correlation is reported.

III. DISCUSSION

The correlated coating loss angle and Urbach energy must share a common physical background, to be most naturally searched in the structural ground.

Particularly interesting results were obtained in recent research which combined loss angle and Transmission Electron Microscope (TEM) measurements, corroborated by molecular dynamics simulations[30], on tantala and titania-doped tantala coatings, i.e. the same systems investigated here. Evidence was presented about a correlation between the coating loss angle and so-called reduced density functions, computed by the Fourier transform of the averaged reduced scattering intensity[30]. Radial density function (RDF) determinations on Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating have shown that a decrease of the measured loss angle is accompanied by a reduction of the width of the main peak, related to metal-oxygen distances. More recent studies from the same group[31] highlighted that the amorphous material is made by Primary Structural Units (PSU) (polygons in general – in silica these are tetrahedrons) very similar to that of the crystalline version of the same material. The authors claimed that annealing/mixing procedures favour the emergence of organized structures such as short 1D-chains or 2D ribbons, consisting of Ta-O-Ta PSU, which could put in correlation the short to medium range atomic organization to the mechanical properties of Ta$_2$O$_5$ coating.

In another recent work, Raman spectroscopy measurements on SiO$_2$ coating showed that extended structures such as rings made of 3 tetrahedrons of SiO$_2$ (the PSU of SiO$_2$) are correlated to the coating loss angle[32] and have an activation energy of about 0.43 eV[33]. Furthermore, molecular dynamics of AO such as SiO$_2$ showed that TLS with a barrier of 0.5 eV primarily involves quasi-1D chain of Si-O-Si and rings of Si-O-Si bonds[34]. The ensemble of measurements suggests that at room temperature the main contribute to the loss angle is to be ascribed not only to a short-range order but also to a non-local structural organization.

The relation between Urbach tails and structure is instead dating back to early works on the subject[24], recent works have pointed out precise relationships between Urbach broadening and the emerging of structural, not crystalline organization[35–37]. Furthermore, interesting results have been obtained by atomistic modelling of
amorphous silicon \cite{35}: molecular dynamics calculations show that after the relaxation of the simulated structure an exponential valence tail appears in the electronic DOS. An inverse participation ratio (IPR) analysis of amorphous semiconductors shows that the extreme tail eigenstates on amorphous semiconductors are primary localized on so-called topological filaments (TF). In fact, while localized defects induce energetic levels deep in the gap region approaching the Fermi level, more complex and extended organized structures induce many, dense levels near the valence and conduction band edge \cite{26}.

In this view, Urbach tails represent a simple, meaningful way to visualize the impact of structural organization in the amorphous structure, in a multi-range perspective not limited to short-range or medium-range. In this respect, the correlation between the Urbach tail extension and the mechanical losses could be explained through the range of characterization of defect offered by the Urbach tails analysis, which contain the same scale of the typical structures that are responsible of the dissipation of mechanical energy as measured at 300 K in the acoustic band.

Post-deposition annealing generally modifies the Urbach tails. For example, Xue et al. \cite{38} recorded the decreasing of Urbach energy in ZnO thin film with increasing annealing temperature from 600°C to 750°C.

FIG. 3. Absorption coefficient of Ta$_2$O$_5$ (top) and Nb$_2$O$_5$ (bottom) before and after the annealing for undoped (left) and doped (right) material, obtained by CL model. The logarithmic scale allows to distinguish better the different slopes in the region where the absorption decays exponentially with the energy $E_U$.

FIG. 4. Coating loss angle as function of Urbach energy. The circles refer to as deposited samples whereas the squares to the samples after the heating treatment. Two different coatings are considered, the Ta$_2$O$_5$ (blue) and the Ti:Ta$_2$O$_5$ (green). The values of the data are listed in table 1.
whereas an inverse trend is observed exceeding 750 °C. This observation can help to understand Urbach tailing mechanisms, where the annealing may be used to allow a structural self-organization with a consequent lattice strain relaxation[39]. In some simple models the structural disorder of AO, where atom positions are disposed in a continuous random network (CNR), is described in terms of Gaussian distributions of bond lengths and angles[40, 41]. In this view, the heating treatment could conceivably lead to an effective relaxation of local strains, to a narrowing of the above-mentioned Gaussians distributions, and eventually to the reduction of the tails in the electronic DOS felt by light in the optical measurements. Hence, the annealing progressively reduces the width of the strain distribution function and consequently the Urbach energy is reduced too. The narrowing of the strain distribution makes the structure more homogeneous, in other words less chaotic. How this feat explains a reduction of losses remain unknown. However on the side of the loss measurements, the annealing is known to reduce the density of TLS having a barrier height of 0.5 eV. As mentioned in section II.A these particular TLS are the main source of internal friction at room temperature. The effect of Ti/Ta mixing on the reduction of the Urbach energy is less intuitive and to some extent even counter-intuitive. The investigation done in [30] points out that Ti-doping changes the Ta2O5 structure, leading to a high degree of structural homogeneity at the nearest-neighbour. It is shown that this is related to a low coating loss angle. They used reverse Monte Carlo (RMC) simulation to match the observed RDF and a significant fraction of TaTiO2 ring fragments is formed in the doped coating. This changes the structure by modifying the angles between oxygen-metal-oxygen and metal-oxygen-metal as consequence. Under this respect, it is reasonable to assume that the Urbach tails are reduced by the increase of the structure homogeneity induced by the Ti-doping. The above considerations have justified the reduction of the Urbach tails after the heating treatment and the doping with the reduction of structural disorder of the material. The same effect of structural disorder has been already highlighted on internal friction. On the other hand we said before that this explanation is counter-intuitive, especially considering the mixing which almost by definition is expected to increase the structural disorder. In this respect another mechanism that justifies the modification of Urbach energy comes considering that the mixed material is fundamentally different from any of the two components. Urbach energy depends not only on static structural disorder but also on a temperature term[37] that is related to the interaction of electronic states with the phonon spectrum. In some cases the second term is not negligible as for example happens in the case of silica[42]. Although the measurements are done at the same room temperature mixing could change the phonon spectrum of the original materials. [x,y,z] have already suggested that mixing is able to changes the connection between PSU i.e. they are connected through corner, edge and side sharing. A changing in PSU connection is able to changes the fundamental frequency of the phonon spectrum, hence even if the measurements are done at the same temperature the disorder induced by thermal vibration and so the Urbach tails could be reasonably different between pure and mixed material. Regarding internal friction, as pointed out by [x,y,z], the change in the distribution of sharing element is able to alter the barrier height of TLS. Under this assumption, since the Urbach tails of doped oxide are less extended than the undoped one, the structure of the doped material presents more topological defects locally constricted than the undoped one, with a resulting more homogeneous structure and hence a lower coating loss angle.

IV. CONCLUSION

The search of the structural origin of the mechanical dissipation behaviour in amorphous materials has produced several sound results in recent years. In recent work[30] a correlation between the mechanical coating loss angle and the short-range structural organization has been claimed. However, recent studies [10, 34] showed that the TLS giving rise to the dissipation mechanism at room temperature must involve more complex structures, regarding a medium- and long-range structural organization. The Urbach energy is a parameter which quantifies the homogeneity of the structure by absorption investigation, probing a multi-range structural organization. In this work, both internal friction and Urbach energy have been studied for Ta2O5 and Nb2O5 coating materials, under different condition regarding the mixing with TiO2 and a post-deposition heating treatment at 500°C for 10 hours. The annealing relaxes the structure of coating materials, leading to a reorganization of the atomic positions leading to a more organized structure, maintaining the amorphous status. In the same way, a certain amount of doping modify the structure forcing the system in a more homogeneous atomic dispositions. The annealing and the doping eventually act in the same way, reducing the mechanical loss angle and the Urbach energy, hence leading to a correlation between these quantities. The observed correlation between the energy extension of Urbach tails and the level of mechanical losses opens new perspectives. First, optical characterization of the fundamental absorption edge emerges as a tool for rapid pre-diagnostics of coating mechanical quality. At the same time the characterization of Urbach tails complements the analysis of the structure in a different spatial range. Furthermore, the statement of the correlation is still valid analysing two different oxide coating materials, suggesting a general rather than specific validity of such properties.