Ergoregion instabilities and vortex stability in dilute Bose–Einstein condensates

Luca Giacomelli* and Iacopo Carusotto†
INO-CNR BEC Center and Dipartimento di Fisica,
Università di Trento, I-38123 Povo, Italy 14, 38123 Povo (TN), Italy

We investigate the dynamical instability of multiply quantized vortices in spatially homogeneous atomic Bose–Einstein condensates. A careful analysis of the role of boundary conditions at large distance in the linearized Bogoliubov problem shows that this is a dispersive version of the ergoregion instability of rotating spacetimes with respect to scalar field perturbations. Different mechanisms that suppress the instability in specific regimes are identified, either via interference effects in finite-size condensates or because of the superluminal dispersion of Bogoliubov modes in high angular momentum channels.

Since the pioneering work by Penrose [1] it has been known that in the so-called ergoregion surrounding rotating black holes particles can have negative energies with respect to an asymptotic observer. As a consequence, (positive) energy can be extracted from a rotating black hole by accumulating negative energy there. Similarly, radiation incident on a rotating black hole can be amplified during reflection at the expense of a negative energy partner being transmitted into the ergoregion: this phenomenon is known as rotational superradiance [2].

This is an energetic instability of the rotating black hole that can become a dynamical one under suitable boundary conditions. Amplified superradiant scattering from a dynamically stable system is found if perturbations are free to propagate away both in the asymptotic outward direction and in the inward one across the horizon. On the other hand, superradiance can get self-stimulated in the presence of sizable reflections on either side, which gives rise to radiation modes with complex frequencies, corresponding to exponentially growing perturbations. If reflection occurs on the inside, e.g. in a rotating spacetime displaying an ergoregion but no horizon, this dynamical instability is called ergoregion instability [3, 4]. If instead reflection occurs in the external space away from the black hole, a black hole bomb is found, e.g. for rotating black holes in a AdS background [5, 6].

Since these phenomena only depend on the propagation of fields in a curved background, they directly transfer to condensed matter analog models of gravity, where collective excitations modes propagate on top of a moving medium according to the same equations as a massless scalar field on a curved spacetime [7]. Superradiant scattering has been widely studied in these systems [8–12] and has been recently observed using surface gravity waves on top of a water flow configuration displaying a draining vortex [13]. Also ergoregion instabilities were theoretically studied in purely rotating vortex configurations within the hydrodynamic approximation [14, 15].

Because of their exceptional control and flexibility, atomic Bose–Einstein condensates (BECs) [16] are among the most promising systems to realize analogue models of gravity: thanks to the ultracold temperature, quantum features are visible, allowing the investigation of very quantum aspects of the physics of fields in curved spacetimes. As a most celebrated example, pioneering results on the observation of analog Hawking radiation were recently reported [17]. Conversely, the gravitational analogy can also shed new light on the basic physics of condensates: schemes to exploit analog Hawking processes to entangle collective phonon modes were proposed in [18] and a one-dimensional superfluid flow instability was reinterpreted in [19] as a black hole lasing effect.

In this Letter we adopt this perspective to revisit the problem of the stability of vortices in BECs, much studied in trapped systems [20–27] and less understood in spatially homogeneous ones [27, 28], and link it to ergoregion instabilities. Vortices in BECs display an irrotational flow pattern with an azimuthal velocity \( v_\theta \propto 1/r \), which becomes supersonic in the vicinity of the vortex core. While this suggests the possibility of ergoregion instabilities, the sudden density drop in the vortex core and the superluminal dispersions of collective excitations hinder a straightforward use of the hydrodynamic approximation on which the gravitational analogy is based. Here we study the Bogoliubov spectrum of collective excitations around vortices of different charges in infinite and spatially homogeneous two-dimensional BECs: while singly quantized vortices are stable, doubly (and higher) quantized ones are dynamically unstable. This result settles the debate on the nature of the instability [23, 27, 28], showing that the instability of the vortex is of the ergoregion instability type and not of the black hole bomb one. We also highlight the role of the superluminal dispersion of excitations beyond hydrodynamics, which modifies the effect with respect to the gravitational analogy by introducing an upper bound on the azimuthal number of the unstable collective modes.

**Vortices and the linear problem** – Atomic BECs are well described at the mean field level by the Gross–Pitaevskii equation (GPE) for a scalar classical field describing the order parameter \( \Psi(r,t) \) [16],

\[
i\hbar \partial_t \Psi = \left[ -\frac{\hbar^2 \nabla^2}{2M} + g|\Psi|^2 + V_{\text{ext}} \right] \Psi,
\]

where \( g \) is the interparticle interaction constant and \( M \) is the atomic mass. We consider two spatial dimensions,
that is a good approximation for a pancake-shaped condensate tightly confined in the third direction. $V_{\text{ext}}(r)$ is a cylindrically-symmetric external trapping potential. We focus on vortices located at the center of the trap described by cylindrically-symmetric stationary solutions of (1) of the form $\Psi(r, t) = f(r) \exp(i\vartheta) \exp(-i\mu t/\hbar)$ with an amplitude $f(r) \to f_\infty$ at large distances and the chemical potential $\mu = gn_\infty = gf_\infty^2$. In order for the order parameter to be single valued, the vortex circulation must be quantized to integer values $\ell$. The current of a vortex of charge $\ell$ becomes supersonic at a radius $r_E \sim \xi_\ell$, with $\xi = \hbar/(mgf_\infty)^{1/2}$ being the so-called healing length.

To study the stability of these solutions one can adopt the Bogoliubov approach and linearize the GPE around the stationary state $\Psi_{\ell}$ [29]. To this purpose, we consider the (small) perturbation $\delta \Psi(r, t)$ and its complex conjugate $\delta \Psi^*$ as independent variables and group them into the spinor $(\delta \Psi, \delta \Psi^*)^T$. Given the cylindrical symmetry of the problem, we decompose the perturbation in its angular momentum $m$ components,

$$
\left( \begin{array}{c} \delta \Psi \\ \delta \Psi^* \end{array} \right)(r, \vartheta, t) = e^{im\vartheta} \left( e^{i\mu t/\hbar}u_\varphi(r, t) e^{-i\mu t/\hbar}v_\varphi(r, t) \right).
$$

The time evolution for the spinor $|\phi\rangle := (u_\varphi, v_\varphi)^T$ is given by the Bogoliubov–de Gennes (BdG) equation

$$
i\hbar \partial_t |\phi\rangle = \mathcal{L}_{\ell,m} |\phi\rangle
$$

with

$$
\mathcal{L}_{\ell,m} = \begin{bmatrix} D_+ + V_{\text{ext}} & 2gf^2 - \mu \\ -gf^2 & -(D_- + V_{\text{ext}} + 2gf^2 - \mu) \end{bmatrix}
$$

$$
D_{\pm} = \frac{\hbar^2}{2M} \left( -\partial_r^2 - \frac{\ell^2}{r^2} \right).
$$

The evolution (3) is pseudo-unitary, so that the conserved inner product and norm

$$
\langle \psi | \sigma_3 | \psi \rangle = \int dr \left[ u_\varphi^*(r)u_\varphi(r) - v_\varphi^*(r)v_\varphi(r) \right]
$$

are non-positive definite. The energy of an eigenmode $|\psi_i\rangle$ of the BdG matrix (3b) with frequency $\omega_i$ is given by $E_i = \langle \psi_i | \sigma_3 | \psi_i \rangle \hbar \omega_i$, so that, for example, negative-norm modes with a positive frequency have negative energy. In this way, even if the BdG equation does not have an associated positive definite norm it well conserves energy. While BdG equations share many properties of the Klein-Gordon equation for scalar fields on curved space-times, in particular for what concerns the particle-hole symmetry, they differ from relativistic equations in the crucial fact that the dispersion has a superluminal behaviour and eventually turns quadratic at high momenta.

Besides pairs of particle-hole symmetric pairs of positive and negative norm modes also zero-norm modes may exist. The symmetries of the BdG matrix impose that $(\omega_i - \omega_j^*) \langle \psi_j | \sigma_3 | \psi_i \rangle = 0$ holds for eigenmodes, which implies that unstable complex frequency modes have zero norm: in physical terms, the exponential growth of unstable modes corresponds to the simultaneous creation of particles and antiparticles with opposite energy, thus leaving the energy unchanged.

**Vortices in trapped BECs** ~ In an infinite condensate, a charge $\ell$ vortex has a greater energy than an array of $\ell$ singly charged vortices [30]: this means that multiply quantized vortices are energetically unstable.

Extensive studies with the Bogoliubov approach [20, 21] have shown that vortices in harmonically trapped condensates ~ even singly quantized ones ~ are always energetically unstable since they possess a negative energy $m = 1$ mode localized around the vortex core, corresponding to precession around the trap center, that tends to make the vortex spiral out of the condensate. Actual occurrence of this process however requires some energy dissipation mechanism, for example via interaction with thermal atoms [31]. Singly quantized vortices in harmonically trapped condensates are instead dynamically stable under the purely conservative dynamics (3), while multiply quantized ones display alternate intervals of dynamical instability and stability as the nonlinear interparticle interaction is varied with respect to the trap frequency [22].

Even though the literature agrees on the occurrence of this instability and experimental evidence is available [25], the situation is much less clear for what concerns its physical origin. Several authors [28, 32] have ascribed it to the trapping potential, making it similar to a black hole bomb instability, in the sense that the energetic instability of the core is turned to a dynamical one by the reflecting boundary condition at the outer edge of the trapped BEC. In contrast to this statement, we are now going to show that a multiply charged vortex is inherently unstable but a subtle destructive interference effect can quench the instability in suitably small BECs.

**A charge 2 vortex in an infinite BEC** ~ As a first step, we follow the path of [27] and investigate the stability of a doubly quantized vortex in an infinite BEC by looking how the spectrum of a finite system of size $R$ evolves in the infinite size limit $R \to \infty$. To this purpose, we numerically find the radial profile $f(r)$ of the GPE ground state $\Psi_{\ell}$ with a given circulation $\ell$ on an interval $[0, R]$. In order to mimic a spatially homogeneous BEC, Neumann boundary conditions $\partial_r f |_{r=R} = 0$ are imposed. The BdG spectrum is then obtained imposing Dirichlet boundary conditions at $r = R$ onto the perturbation, $u_\varphi(r = R) = v_\varphi(r = R) = 0$. The calculation is repeated for growing values of the size $R$.

The resulting discrete spectra of modes are shown in the upper panels of Fig.1 as a function of $R$ for an $m = 2$ perturbation on a charge $\ell = 2$ vortex. An energeti-
of the core mode.

structively (constructively) interferes with the oscillation phase of the reflected waves at the

emitters placed in a cavity, the stability islands (insta-

tantly) are well separated and occur whenever the

moderate case, the positive-norm collective modes of the con-

vortex in a BEC of size $R$. Black, red, green lines correspond to positive-, negative-, and zero-norm modes. A wider view of the imaginary part is given in panel (d). Here, the $1/\sqrt{R}$ dashed line envelopes the instability maxima up to moderate $R$. The horizontal line indicates the instability rate extracted from the time-dependent simulation with absorbing boundary conditions shown in Fig.2. Panel (c): spatial shape of the core mode for $R = 50\xi$. The green and red lines respectively show the $u_\phi$ and $v_\phi$ components of the Bogoliubov spinor. The dashed line shows the (rescaled) density profile of the vortex.

cally unstable mode (with negative norm and positive frequency) is clearly visible in the top panel at an (almost) $R$-independent frequency around $0.44 \mu/\hbar$. This $R$-independence is a strong indication that the mode is localized in the core region, which is further verified in the exponential decay of the envelope of $u_\phi$ and $v_\phi$ (panel (c)). The oscillations are due to the interference of outgoing waves with their reflection at $r = R$. Given the symplectic [33] nature of the Bogoliubov problem, the crossing of the negative norm core mode with one of the positive norm collective modes of the condensate gives rise to dynamically unstable zero-norm modes [26] with the characteristic instability bubble visible in Fig.1(b).

An important distinction must however be made between the moderate-$R$ and large-$R$ regimes. In the former case, the positive-norm collective modes of the condensate are well distinct in energy and, analogously to emitters placed in a cavity, the stability islands (instability peaks) are well separated and occur whenever the phase of the reflected waves at the $r = R$ boundary destructively (constructively) interferes with the oscillation of the core mode.

For large $R$ instead the energy spacing between collective modes (at a given energy) decreases as $1/R$, faster than the $1/\sqrt{R}$ one of the instability rate maxima for moderate-$R$ (dashed line in Fig.1(d)), so that neighboring instability bubbles end up merging with each other and the system becomes generically unstable with an instability rate that tends to a $R$-independent value. Since the energy spacing corresponds to the inverse round-trip time from the core to the $r = R$ boundary and back, this means that the instability develops so quickly that it does not have the time to feel the presence of the boundary.

While this reasoning is intuitively sound, a recent work [34] for a related Klein-Gordon problem has pointed out that the spectrum of a closed system in the infinitesize limit can be quantitatively different from the one with asymptotic outgoing boundary conditions. It is thus important to corroborate our conclusions with a numerical study of the time-evolution of the BdG equations (3) that directly implements outgoing boundary conditions so to remove all reflected waves.

In Fig.2 snapshots of the evolution of a $m = 2$ Gaussian perturbation (upper-left panel) incident on a $\ell = 2$ vortex core vortex are shown. After a transient in which the perturbation wavepacket is reflected by the vortex core and then propagates away from it (upper-right panel), the dynamics is characterized by the unstable core mode being amplified while maintaining a constant shape (bottom panels). Compared to Fig.1(c), the outgoing boundary conditions remove the interference-induced oscillations in the core mode wavefunction, leaving only the exponential decay. The temporal growth of the core mode can be precisely fitted with an exponential (not shown), from which we extract the value for the instability rate $\Im(\omega) \simeq 0.00242 \mu/\hbar$. This instability rate is indicated by the horizontal line in Fig.1(d) and is in perfect agree-

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{Fig1}
\caption{Real (a) and imaginary (b) parts of the Bogoliubov eigenfrequencies for modes of azimuthal number $m = 2$ on a charge $\ell = 2$ vortex in a BEC of size $R$. Black, red, green lines correspond to positive-, negative-, and zero-norm modes. A wider view of the imaginary part is given in panel (d). Here, the $1/\sqrt{R}$ dashed line envelopes the instability maxima up to moderate $R$. The horizontal line indicates the instability rate extracted from the time-dependent simulation with absorbing boundary conditions shown in Fig.2. Panel (c): spatial shape of the core mode for $R = 50\xi$. The green and red lines respectively show the $u_\phi$ and $v_\phi$ components of the Bogoliubov spinor. The dashed line shows the (rescaled) density profile of the vortex.}
\end{figure}

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{Fig2}
\caption{Snapshots of the time evolution of a $m = 2$ perturbation scattering on a $\ell = 2$ vortex. Green and red lines respectively show the $u_\phi$ and $v_\phi$ components of the Bogoliubov spinor. Outgoing boundary conditions are imposed by including a wide and smooth imaginary potential of Gaussian spatial shape centered at the edge of the integration box $r = 700\xi$, of variance of $120\xi$ and amplitude $0.15\mu$, so to effectively absorb the perturbation spinor $|\phi\rangle$ and in this way suppress the reflected waves.}
\end{figure}
ment with the one found for the closed system in the $R \to \infty$ limit. This corroborates the conclusions of [27] and provides a deeper physical understanding of their infinite-size limit procedure.

Higher charge vortices – Based on this important result, we can now move to the case of $\ell > 2$ charge vortices. As an example, we display in Fig.3 the $R$-dependence of the different-$m$ spectra for a given charge $\ell = 4$. Independently from $\ell$, the $m = 1$ spectrum always shows a negative-norm mode approaching zero frequency as $R \to \infty$. This core mode corresponds to the zero energy mode found in [35] and associated to the translation of the vortex core [36].

While the $m = 1$ mode is the only core mode for $\ell = 1$ vortices, for larger $\ell$ other negative norm core modes appear for increasing $m$ at both negative and positive BdG frequencies (corresponding thus to positive and negative energies): dynamical instabilities appear whenever these two modes cross positive norm modes. Interestingly, the energy of the (lowest energy) core mode decreases until $m = \ell$ and then starts increasing again until it becomes positive and dynamical stability is recovered. In general, we find that dynamical instabilities are present for $2 \leq m \leq 2\ell - 2$ (and not only for $m \leq \ell$ as claimed in [22] of for all $m$ as claimed in [26]), but their rate is strongest for $m = 2$ and then decreases with $m$. Since the instability of multiply charged vortices is associated to their splitting into an assembly of $\ell$ singly charged vortices, one may have expected the most unstable mode to be at $m = \ell$. Actually, it turns out that the vortex decay begins with lower-$m$ deformations of the core and the splitting in $\ell$ parts may start dominating only during the nonlinear stages of the later dynamics.

Finally, it is interesting to compare our results to the recent work [14] carried out for an hydrodynamic system for which the gravitational analogy holds exactly. By imposing a reflecting boundary condition at a finite radius, it was found that for a given size of the ergoregion all the high-enough $m$ modes show instability, but this latter is typically stronger for the lower $m$ unstable modes. Similarly, our calculations show that the lower $m$ modes are the most unstable, however we also find an upper bound on $m$, above which no instability occurs any longer. This important difference can be ascribed to the density profile of the vortex core, but more importantly to the superluminal dispersion of the Bogoliubov modes that suppresses the instability at large (angular) momenta. Further evidence in support of this statement is provided by calculations for a dispersive version of the Schiff–Snyder–Weinberg effect [37], where a similar instability is also found [38] with no density variations.

Conclusions. – In this Letter we have provided evidence that multiply ($\ell \geq 2$) charged vortices in spatially infinite atomic BECs are intrinsically unstable. Similarly to rotating spacetimes displaying an ergoregion but no horizon, the instability is due to the presence of negative energy modes localized in the vortex core and resonantly coupled to outward propagating collective modes of positive energy. Differently from the black hole bomb effect, the only role of the trap is to modulate the instability rate and possibly prevent it via a destructive interference mechanism in trapped BECs of suitable size.

From the analogue gravity point of view, our results show that concepts valid in the hydrodynamic approximation underlying the gravitational analogy remain qualitatively correct with minor quantitative changes even in regimes where quantum pressure and the superluminal shape of the Bogoliubov dispersion play a principal role. Well beyond atomic BECs, our results are directly applicable to generic quantum fluids showing vortex excitations, in particular quantum fluids of light [39].

In addition to on-going work on the dispersive Schiff–Snyder–Weinberg effect that allows for additional insight on ergoregion instabilities in simple geometries [37], future studies will address ergoregion instabilities in two-component condensates [40] and the consequences of a radial flow, which may quench the instability by dragging the localized core mode away in the inward direc-
tion. Going beyond mean-field, one can anticipate that the superradiant scattering of quantum fluctuations off the ergoregion will result in a spontaneous pair production [41] similar to the Hawking effect process and in peculiar geometric signatures on the correlation function of density fluctuations [17, 42].

We acknowledge financial support from the European Union FET-Open grant “MIR-BOSE” (n. 737017), from the H2020-FETFLAG-2018-2020 project ”PhoQuS” (n.820392), and from the Provincia Autonoma di Trento. Useful discussions with L. P. Pitaevskii and S. G. Butera are warmly acknowledged.

* luca.giacomelli-1@unitn.it
† iacopo.carusotto@unitn.it

[36] Note that in the considered geometry the core mode has a positive energy so the BEC is energetically stable. This is to be contrasted with the energetic instability of harmonically trapped BEC [20]. The difference is due to flat density profile of our BEC, to be contrasted with the inverted parabola shape of harmonically trapped ones, for which the energetically unstable mode is always below the lowest positive-norm collective mode, so that the instability never becomes dynamical. If instead a vortex is placed at the top of a density bump surrounded by a wide region of constant and lower density, this energetic ordering of the modes is no longer guaranteed and also a singly charged vortex may become dynamically unstable.