Tuning the distance to a possible ferromagnetic quantum critical point in $A_2Cr_3As_3$

J. Luo, 1,2 J. Yang, 1 R. Zhou, 1 Q. G. Mu, 1,2 T. Liu, 1,2 Zhi-an Ren, 1 C. J. Yi, 1,2 Y. G. Shi, 1 and Guo-qing Zheng 1,3

1Institute of Physics, Chinese Academy of Sciences, 
2School of Physical Sciences, University of Chinese Academy of Sciences, Beijing 100190, China 
3Department of Physics, Okayama University, Okayama 700-8530, Japan 
(Dated: July 26, 2019)

Although superconductivity in the vicinity of antiferromagnetic (AFM) instability has been extensively explored in the last three decades or so, superconductivity in compounds with a background of ferromagnetic (FM) spin fluctuations is still rare. We report $^{3}$He as nuclear quadrupole resonance measurements on the $A_2Cr_3As_3$ family, which is the first group of Cr-based superconductors at ambient pressure, with A being alkali elements. From the temperature dependence of the spin-lattice relaxation rate ($1/T_1$), we find that by changing A in the order of $A=$Na, Ni$_{0.75}$K$_{0.25}$, K, and Rb, the system is tuned to approach a possible FM quantum critical point (QCP). This may be ascribed to the Cr$_2$-As$_2$-Cr$_2$ bond angle that decreases towards $90^{\circ}$, which enhances the FM interaction via the Cr$_2$-As$_2$-Cr$_2$ path. Upon moving away from the QCP, the superconducting transition temperature $T_{sc}$ increases progressively up to 8.0 K in Na$_2$Cr$_3As_3$, which is in sharp contrast to the AFM case where $T_{sc}$ usually shows a maximum around a QCP. The $1/T_1$ decreases rapidly below $T_{sc}$ with no Hebel-Slichter peak, and ubiquitously follows a $T^3$ variation below a characteristic temperature $T^* \approx 0.6$ $T_{sc}$, which indicates the existence of point nodes in the superconducting gap function commonly in the family. These results suggest that the $A_2Cr_3As_3$ family is a possible solid-state analog of superfluid $^3$He.

PACS numbers: 74.70.Xa, 74.25.nj, 74.25.-q, 75.25.Dk

The interplay between magnetism and superconductivity is a key topic in condensed matter physics. In the past thirty years or so, a large amount of superconductors in proximity to an antiferromagnetic (AFM) ordered phase have been found in heavy fermions $^{[1,2]}$, cuprates $^{[3]}$, and iron pnicotides $^{[4]}$. Superconductivity appears on the verge of antiferromagnetic instability, and the critical temperature $T_{sc}$ usually takes a maximum at the AFM quantum critical point (QCP). However, superconductivity in the vicinity of a ferromagnetic ordered phase is still rare. UGe$_2$ is a ferromagnet, but becomes superconducting under high pressure when the Curie temperature $T_C$ is reduced inside the ferromagnetic phase $^{[5]}$. However, superconductivity has not been found when the ferromagnetic order is completely destroyed.

Ferromagnetic interactions can also promote quantum states other than superconductivity. For example, superfluidity in $^3$He emerges in the background of ferromagnetic spin fluctuations. There are two phases, namely A phase and B phase, in $^3$He $^{[6,7]}$. The A phase is a $p$-wave ABM (Anderson-Brinkman-Morel) state with equal spin pairing (↑↑ and ↓↓) $^{[7,8]}$. The B phase is a $p$-wave BW (Balian-Werthamer) state with an additional component $1/\sqrt{2}(↑+↓)$ $^{[9]}$. There are point nodes in the gap function in ABM state but the gap is isotropic in BW state $^{[10]}$. It has been pointed out that the spin triplet pairing in $^3$He is induced by FM spin fluctuations $^{[8]}$. Notably, $^3$He phases are topologically non-trivial, which has received new and intensive interests in the past few years $^{[11]}$. The B phase of $^3$He belongs to the so-called DIII topological class $^{[12]}$, and the A phase bares similarities to topological Weyl semi-metals. Therefore, searching for a solid state analog of $^3$He serves to bridge three large research areas: strong correlations, unconventional superconductivity, and topological quantum phenomena.

Recently, a 3$d$-electron system, chromium-based superconductors $A_2Cr_3As_3$ ($A =$ Na, K, Rb, Cs), has been discovered $^{[13-16]}$. In this family, superconductivity emerges from a paramagnetic state, K$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ and Rb$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ have $T_{sc}=$6.1 and 4.8 K $^{[13,14]}$, respectively, and Na$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ has the highest $T_{sc} = 8.0$ K. Resistivity measurement suggests that Cs$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ superconducts below $T = 2.2$ K $^{[15]}$. Although anomaly at $T = 2.2$ K was not found by nuclear quadrupole resonance (NQR) $^{[17,18]}$, magnetic susceptibility measurement does confirm bulk superconductivity below $T = 1.2$ K $^{[19]}$. Density function theory (DFT) calculations show that there are three bands across the Fermi level, namely, two quasi-one-dimensional (1D) band $\alpha$ and $\beta$, and one three-dimensional (3D) band $\gamma$ $^{[20,21]}$. The $\gamma$ band makes the main contribution to the density of states (DOS).

NQR, penetration depth, muon spin rotation ($\mu$SR), upper critical field $H_C$ and specific heat measurements show signatures of unconventional superconductivity $^{[22-24]}$. Theoretically, spin-triplet superconducting state has been proposed $^{[30-32]}$. In the normal state, ferromagnetic spin fluctuations have been found from the Knight shift and spin-lattice relaxation rate ($1/T_1$) measurements in Rb$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ $^{[23]}$. Neutron scattering measurements also suggest short-range magnetic order in K$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ $^{[33]}$. However, how the spin fluctuations evolve with changing A is unknown. In addition, the gap symmetry is still controversial. For example, $1/T_1 \propto T^4$ was reported in K$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ $^{[22]}$, but $1/T_1 \propto T^3$ was found in Rb$_2$Cr$_3As_3$ $^{[23]}$. The latter result suggests point nodes in the gap function $^{[23]}$. On the other hand, line nodes were claimed by penetration depth and specific heat measurements $^{[24,27]}$. In this work, we systematically study the normal and superconducting states of the family $A_2Cr_3As_3$ by NQR. We find that $1/T_1T$ in the normal state for all compounds can be fit-
ted by Moriya’s theory for 3D FM spin fluctuations \cite{34}. Our results show that on going from A = Na to Na_{0.75}K_{0.25}, K, Rb, the system progressively approaches a possible FM QCP, which may be ascribed to the Cr2-As2-Cr2 bond angle that decreases toward 90° in the same order and enhances the FM interaction. In the superconducting state, 1/T1 for all compounds show no Hebel-Slichter peak, and follows a T^3 variation below a characteristic temperature T^* ≈ 0.6T_sc, indicating a common formation of point nodes in the gap function. Our results indicate that A_{2}Cr_{1}As_{3} shows some properties similar to superfluid 3He.

Polycrystal sample of Na_{2}Cr_{3}As_{3} was prepared by a low temperature ion-exchange method \cite{16}, and the others were prepared by solid state reaction method \cite{13}. We crush the samples into powders or cut them into pieces to avoid skin depth problem in the NQR measurements. To protect the samples against air and water vapor, we seal the samples into an epoxy (stycast 1266) tube in an Ar-filled glove box. To protect the samples against air and water vapor, we seal the samples into an epoxy (stycast 1266) tube in an Ar-filled glove box. The T1 was measured by using the saturation-recovery method, and obtained by a good fitting \cite{23} of the nuclear magnetization to 1 − M(t)/M0 = exp(−3t/T1), where M(t) is the nuclear magnetization at time t after the single saturation pulse and M0 is the nuclear magnetization at thermal equilibrium.

![FIG. 1: (Color online) (a) The structure of [Cr3As3]∞ tube, the Cr2-As2-Cr2 bond angle (α) and Cr1-As1-Cr1 bond angle (β). (b) 75As NQR spectra of A_{2}Cr_{1}As_{3}(A = Na, Na_{0.75}K_{0.25}, K, Rb) measured at T = 150 K. Solid lines are fitting results by two Lorentzian functions. The dashed curve represents data of \cite{22}.](image)

As can be seen in Fig. 2, 1/T1T is a constant above T ≈ 150 K and increases with decreasing temperature down to T_sc for all samples. For a conventional non-interacting metal, 1/T1T is a constant. Therefore, the results indicate electron correlations. Previous Knight shift measurements in Rb_{2}Cr_{3}As_{3} found that spin susceptibility increases with decreasing temperature, which indicates that the electron correlation is ferromagnetic in character. DFT calculations also show that the interaction within each Cr sublattice is ferromagnetic \cite{20, 21, 30}. Below we apply the 3D ferromagnetic spin fluctuations theory of Moriya to characterize the spin fluctuations \cite{34}. The 1/T1T can be expressed as 1/T1T = (1/T1T)_{SF} + (1/T1T)_{AF}. The first part originates from spin fluctuations of 3d electrons, and the second part is due to non-interacting electrons. For 3D ferromagnetic spin fluctuations \cite{34}, (1/T1T)_{SF} follows a relation of C/(T + θ), with the parameter θ describing a distance to FM QCP. The obtained θ decreases in the order of A=Na, Na_{0.75}K_{0.25}, K, and Rb. The parameter θ=4±1.5 K for Rb_{2}Cr_{3}As_{3} and θ= 57±7 K for Na_{2}Cr_{3}As_{3}.

Figure 3 shows the phase diagram of the family, where θ and T_sc are plotted as a function of the ionic radius of alkali element A. As the ionic radius increases, the parameter θ decreases, indicating that the system is tuned closer to a possible FM QCP. Concomitantly, T_sc decreases. Below we show that the transverse axis of Fig. 3 correlates with ferromagnetic interaction strength. The larger the ionic radius is, the stronger the ferromagnetic interaction is.

As shown in Fig. 4 analysis of the available data shows that the Cr2-As2-Cr2 bond angle α has a linear relationship with the ionic radius, while the Cr1-As1-Cr1 angle β is almost a constant. Notably, as the ionic radius increases, α decreases towards 90°. It was pointed out that the Cr-Cr coupling would be antiferromagnetic according to Goodenough-Kanamori-Anderson rule \cite{30}. However, since Cr is in an av-

![FIG. 2: (Color online) 75As nuclear spin-lattice relaxation rate 1/T1 divided by temperature. Data for Rb_{2}Cr_{3}As_{3} are from Ref. \cite{23}. The dashed curves on the normal state data are fittings to 1/T1T = a + b/(T + θ).](image)
eraged valence of 2.3, double exchange interaction through Cr-As-Cr path is possible \[30\], which is ferromagnetic. At \(\alpha = 90^\circ\), the As-4p\(_x\) and As-4p\(_y\) orbitals become degenerated with respect to Cr-3d orbitals, which will maximize the double exchange interaction between the two Cr2 along the c-axis via the As-4p\(_x\) and As-4p\(_y\) orbitals. Therefore, on going from \(A = \text{Na}\) to \(\text{Na}_{0.75}\text{K}_{0.25}\), K, and Rb, an increase in the ferromagnetic interaction can be expected, which drives the system towards a FM QCP. In order to directly access such QCP, we propose to replace \(A\) with Ca, Sr or Ba, thereby a long-range ordered phase can hopefully be obtained.

In Fig. 3 one sees that \(T_{sc}\) decreases upon approaching the FM QCP. This is in sharp contrast to the AFM case where \(T_{sc}\) forms a peak around a QCP. Superconductivity near a FM QCP in paramagnetic side was discussed by Fay and Appel in their seminal work \[37\], but to our knowledge, had not been confirmed thus far. In the AFM case, the pairing interaction is enhanced due to increased quantum fluctuations \[38\]. In the FM case, when it is approached from the paramagnetic side, increased quantum fluctuations also enhances pairing strength \[37\] \[38\]. However, Fay and Appel found, based on a random phase approximation, that mass enhancement due to FM spin fluctuations will kill a spin-triplet superconducting state so that \(T_{sc}\) is zero right at ferromagnetic QCP \[37\]. Later on, Monthoux and Lonzarich \[38\] and Wang et al \[39\] calculated \(T_{sc}\) in the strong-coupling limit. They pointed out that mass enhancement and a finite quasiparticle lifetime act as pair breaking, but found a non-zero \(T_{sc}\) at ferromagnetic QCP. In UGe\(_2\), however, no \(T_{sc}\) was found in the paramagnetic side. In a related compound UCoGe \[41\], although superconductivity survives after ferromagnetic order is suppressed, the ferromagnetic-paramagnetic transition is a first-order phase transition \[42\] and thus cannot be directly compared to theories. Our results experimentally demonstrate \[50\], for the first time, the evolution of \(T_{sc}\) in paramagnetic side predicted by theories \[37\] \[38\]. Looking forward, it would be interesting to experimentally probe the evolution of effective electron mass by London penetration depth at the zerotemperature limit \[43\], for example.

Next, we discuss the properties of superconducting state. In Fig. 5(a) are shown the \(1/T_1\) data for the four compounds. There is no coherence peak for all cases. In contrast to the previous report for a \(K_2Cr_3As_3\) sample with a lower \(T_{sc}=5.7\) K than our case \((6.1\) K \[22\] \[36\]), our data show that \(K_2Cr_3As_3\) exhibits a temperature variation very similar to \(Rb_2Cr_3As_3\). In Fig. 5(b), we show the data with reduced scales for the axes. As can be seen there, \(1/T_1\) commonly shows a \(T^5\) behavior below a characteristic \(T^*/T_{sc} \approx 0.6\). This suggests that the gap symmetry is the same for all members of this family.

The \(1/T_1\) in superconducting state can be expressed as

\[
\frac{(T_1)_r}{T_1} = \frac{2}{k_B T} \int N(E) \left( 1 + \frac{\Delta^2}{E^2} \right) f(E) (1 - f(E)) dE,
\]

where \(N(E)\) is the DOS below \(T_{sc}\), \(f(E)\) is Fermi distribution function, \(\Delta\) is the gap function. When there exist point nodes in the gap function, such as in the ABM model \[7\] \[8\] with \(\Delta = \Delta_0 \sinh^\theta\phi\), \(N(E) \propto E^2\). This results in \(1/T_1 \propto T^5\) at low temperatures. Previously, Katayama et al found such a \(T^5\) variation in filled skutterudite superconductor \(PrOs_3Sb_{12}\) un-
The arrows indicate its value at $T_c$ based superconductors \[46\]. Another possibility is multiplet superconductivity, as seen in iron-based superconductors \[46\]. Another possibility is multiple phases arising from internal freedoms associated with spin-triplet pairing as seen in UPt$_3$ \[47\]. Clearly, more work is needed in this regard.

In summary, we have performed $^{75}$As-NQR measurements on the A$_2$Cr$_3$As$_3$ family. We find that by changing A in the order of A=Na, Na$_{0.75}$K$_{0.25}$, K, and Rb, the system is tuned to approach a possible ferromagnetic QCP. We propose that the Cr$_2$As$_2$-Cr$_2$ bond angle ($\alpha$) that decreases towards 90 degree is responsible for the increase of ferromagnetic interaction. Upon approaching the QCP, the superconducting critical temperature $T_{sc}$ decreases, which is in sharp contrast to the AFM case where $T_{sc}$ usually forms a broad peak around a QCP. In the superconducting state, $1/T_1$ decreases with no Hebel-Slichter peak just below $T_{sc}$, and ubiquitously follows a $T^5$ variation at low temperatures, which indicates the existence of point nodes in the gap function commonly in the whole family. Our results indicate that the A$_2$Cr$_3$As$_3$ family is a possible solid-state analog of superfluid $^3$He. Therefore, further investigations on this family promise to enrich the physics across multiple research areas of electron correlations, unconventional superconductivity and topological quantum phenomena.

We thank G.H. Cao, Y. Haga, J.P. Hu, H. Kontani, K. Miyake, A. Sumiyama, Z.Q. Wang, H.M. Weng, G.M. Zhang and Y. Zhou for helpful discussions, and C.G. Wang for technical assistance. This work was partially supported by NSFC grants (Nos. 11674377, 11634015 and 11774399), MOST grants (Nos. 2016YFA0300502, 2017YFA0302901 and 2017YFA0302904), as well as JSPS/MEXT Grants (No. JP15H05852 and JP19H00657). J. Y. also acknowledges support by the Youth Innovation Promotion Association of CAS.

---

**gqzheng123@gmail.com**


[18] We have also performed NQR measurements on Cs$_2$Cr$_3$As$_3$ down to $T = 1.4$ K and obtained similar results with Ref. [17]. Namely, different from other compounds described in this paper, $1/T_1T$ for Cs$_2$Cr$_3$As$_3$ shows a pseudogap-like behavior below $T \sim 75$ K, whose origin is unknown.


[36] For phase diagram compared to theories, lattice constants and others, see Supplemental Materials.


