Mie Scattering of Phonons by Point Defects in IV-VI Semiconductors
PbTe and GeTe

Ruiqiang Guo\textsuperscript{1} and Sangyeop Lee\textsuperscript{1,2,*}

\textsuperscript{1}\textit{Department of Mechanical Engineering and Materials Science, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15261, USA}

\textsuperscript{2}\textit{Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15261, USA}

* sylee@pitt.edu
Abstract

The scattering of thermal acoustic phonons by point defects in solids has been widely assumed the Rayleigh scattering type. In contrast to this conventional perception, using an ab initio Green’s function approach, we show that the scattering by point defects in PbTe and GeTe exhibits Mie scattering characterized by a weaker frequency dependence of the scattering rates and highly asymmetric scattering phase functions. These unusual behaviors occur because the strain field induced by a point defect can extend for a long distance up to 10 Å. Because of the asymmetric scattering phase functions, the widely used relaxation time approximation fails with an error of ~20% at 300K in predicting lattice thermal conductivity when the vacancy fraction is 1%. Our results show that the phonon scattering by point defects in IV-VI semiconductors cannot be described by the simple kinetic theory combined with Rayleigh scattering.
Scattering of waves by the inhomogeneity of the medium is a fundamental process underpinning diverse applications including electromagnetics, optics, and acoustics [1-4]. This is of equal importance for thermal phonons [5-7]. Randomly distributed particles can result in phonon localization through multiple scattering and interference of phonon waves [8,9]. Periodic inclusions in phononic crystals give rise to new vibrational band structures due to Bragg and Mie scatterings [10,11]. The wave-defect interaction is usually assumed elastic and its characteristics dramatically depend on the size of the scattering centers. The elastic scattering of phonons, analogous to that of electromagnetic waves, falls into three regimes: (i) Rayleigh scattering for the scattering centers much smaller than the phonon wavelength \( d < 1/10\lambda \) where \( d \) and \( \lambda \) are the diameter of the scattering center and the wavelength, respectively), (ii) Mie scattering for those with comparable size to the wavelength \( 1/10\lambda < d < \lambda \), and (iii) Geometric scattering for those larger than the wavelength \( d > \lambda \) [12,13].

A point defect at a single lattice site possesses the minimum size of a scattering center in solids. Since the wavelengths of thermal phonons are usually many times of the lattice spacing, the scattering of thermal phonons by a point defect is often considered as Rayleigh scattering and exhibits very weak scattering strength for low frequency phonons. The Rayleigh scattering is well captured by models suggested by Klemens [14] and Tamura [15], which assume that the change in mass and interatomic force constants (IFCs) by a point defect is limited to a single lattice site. The recently developed \textit{ab initio} Green’s function approach [16,17] also shows the Rayleigh scattering behavior for strongly bonded materials, such as diamond and BAs [18-24].

In this report, we show that the point defects in IV-VI semiconductors (PbTe and GeTe), unlike the previously studied strongly bonded materials, cause Mie scattering of thermal phonons. The IV-VI semiconductors are widely used for the applications of thermoelectrics and phase change materials where the thermal conductivity is a key parameter for the device figure-of-merit. Particularly, large amounts of vacancies (1~3\%) have been observed in these materials [25-28], which can largely impact thermal transport. Also, it is common that thermoelectric materials contain large concentrations of
substitutional defects (1 to 2\%) to achieve an optimal doping level for enhanced thermoelectric power factor [29-31].

We use an \textit{ab initio} Green’s function approach to calculate the scattering matrix of phonons by point defects in PbTe and GeTe. For comparison, we also present results for Si. The scattering rates were calculated using three different approaches: (i) exact Green’s function calculation based on T-matrix formalism, (ii) Green’s function calculation to the first order (Born approximation), and (iii) Klemens’ model with the effective mass variance \((\Delta M / M)^2 = 9\) for single vacancy case [32] combined with Tamura’s formula to consider full phonon dispersion [15]. We call the last approach Klemens’ model in this paper. The T-matrix method and the Born approximation consider mass variance and finite size effects of scattering center by including the changes of IFCs in all nearby atoms, while Klemens’ model assumes an infinitesimally small point defect and only mass variance. Both the Born approximation and Klemens’ model are based on the lowest-order perturbations while the T-matrix method includes all high-order terms. Recent \textit{ab initio} Green’s function calculations show the failure of the lowest-order perturbative approaches for many strongly bonded materials [18-24]. Details of the approaches, including the density functional theory calculations for IFCs, can be found in the Supplementary Information.

The calculated phonon-vacancy scattering rates for PbTe, GeTe, and Si are shown in Fig. 1. For frequencies below 2 THz, the scattering rates for Si from all three methods follow \(\omega^4\) dependence where \(\omega\) is a phonon frequency, typical of Rayleigh scattering behavior. However, for PbTe and GeTe, the scattering rates from the T-matrix and Born approximation show substantially weaker frequency dependence \((\omega^{2.5} \text{ and } \omega^3\), respectively\) below 1 THz. It is also noted that the Born approximation gives similar results to the T-matrix for PbTe and GeTe, while it severely underestimates the scattering rate for Si. This is due to the weaker bonding in PbTe and GeTe. Illustrating this, the self-interaction IFCs for PbTe (3.76 eV/Å\(^2\)) and GeTe (5.96 eV/Å\(^2\)) are much smaller than that for Si (22.23 eV/Å\(^2\)).
FIG. 1. Phonon-vacancy scattering rates normalized by the atomic fraction of vacancy for PbTe (Pb vacancy), GeTe (Ge vacancy) and Si using three different approaches: T-matrix, Born approximation, and Klemens’ model.

The weaker frequency-dependence of the phonon-vacancy scattering rates indicates Mie scattering at a frequency as low as 0.1 THz in PbTe and GeTe. We therefore evaluate how far the strain field induced by a single vacancy can persist in these materials. We calculated the Frobenius norm of changes in the self-interaction IFCs for each atom \( i \), $\| \mathbf{V}_i \|$ where \( \mathbf{V}_i \) is the change of the self-interaction IFC tensor, which reflects the overall change of the IFCs related to atom \( i \) [22]. Figure 2(a) shows the $\| \mathbf{V}_i \|$ normalized by $\| \mathbf{V}_0 \|$ (where 0 denotes the vacancy site) with respect to the distance between the atom \( i \) and the vacancy site. It shows that $\| \mathbf{V}_i \|$ decreases rapidly for the first two nearest neighbors for all three materials, while PbTe and GeTe exhibit a significantly large $\| \mathbf{V}_i \|$ at even farther neighbors as marked by red circles. The long-ranged strain field induced by a single vacancy is consistent with the long-ranged interatomic interaction observed in perfect crystalline PbTe and GeTe [33], as shown in Fig. 2(b). Particularly, the change of IFCs at around 10 Å from the vacancy site is significant, resulting in the strain field with a diameter of ~20 Å. Thus, for phonons with frequency larger than 0.1 THz, corresponding to the wavelength less than 200 Å, the phonon-vacancy scattering can behave like Mie scattering. This can explain the weaker frequency dependence of phonon-vacancy scattering for those materials shown in Figs. 1(a) and 1(b). In contrast, the $\| \mathbf{V}_i \|$ in Si is short-ranged, resulting in the $\omega^4$ dependence of the Rayleigh scattering in Fig. 1(c).
Another characteristic of Mie scattering that further distinguishes it from Rayleigh scattering can be found in the scattering phase function, which describes the angular probability distribution of scattered phonons. Mie scattering usually exhibits a highly asymmetric phase function with forward scattering being more significant than backward scattering, while the phase function of Rayleigh scattering is symmetric [2]. Figure 3 shows the calculated scattering phase functions where the incident phonon is from the low-lying transverse acoustic (TA1) branch with a wavelength of ~40 Å and scattered phonons remain in the TA1 branch. Indeed, the scattering phase functions for PbTe and GeTe are highly asymmetric, while it is almost symmetric for Si. Similar phenomena occur for other acoustic phonons in a wide spectrum, as shown in Fig. S1 in the Supplementary Information. These observations indicate that the long-ranged strain field rather than a local empty lattice site scatters phonons like Mie scattering where a finite size particle scatters electromagnetic waves or phonons [2,34-37].
FIG. 3. Scattering phase functions by a vacancy in PbTe, GeTe, and Si, where both incident and scattered phonons are from the low-lying transverse acoustic branch. The incident phonon has a wavelength of \(~40\ \angstrom\) and an incident angle of 0 degree.

The asymmetric scattering phase function shows that phonon transport cannot be described with the simple kinetic theory of phonon gas that assumes each scattering process attempts to relax the phonon distribution into the symmetric equilibrium distribution as in the commonly used relaxation time approximation (RTA). The RTA is exact when the scattering phase function is symmetric as shown in the Supplementary Information; all off-diagonal elements of a scattering matrix are cancelled out and thus the relaxation of phonons at a certain mode can be described independently from other modes. However, when the scattering phase function is asymmetric, the off-diagonal elements of a scattering matrix become important and thus the relaxation of phonons at a certain mode is coupled to other modes. A similar behavior has been shown in the high thermal conductivity materials where normal phonon-phonon scattering is much stronger than umklapp phonon-phonon scattering [5]; the strong normal scattering results in the asymmetric scattering phase function due to the phonon momentum conservation. In Fig. 4, we calculate the lattice thermal conductivity \(\kappa_L\) of PbTe, GeTe, and Si with vacancy using either RTA or full scattering matrix. We choose a specific vacancy fraction that reduces \(\kappa_L\) by \(~50\%\) at 300 K such that the phonon-vacancy scattering is comparable to the phonon-phonon scattering in terms of the strength for each material. Figure 4 shows that the RTA for the phonon-vacancy scattering substantially underestimates \(\kappa_L\) of PbTe and GeTe but
produces almost identical results as the full scattering matrix for Si. At 300 K, \( \kappa_L \) is underestimated by 15 to 20% for PbTe and GeTe when the vacancy fraction is 1%. Recent studies show that the phonon renormalization and four-phonon scattering are important for predicting thermal properties of weakly bonded materials such as PbTe, particularly at high temperatures [38-42]. As our study focuses on the Mie scattering of phonons by defects, we use a quasi-harmonic phonon approach with three-phonon scattering for the sake of simplicity.

![Temperature dependent lattice thermal conductivity of PbTe, GeTe (trigonal direction), and Si](image)

**FIG. 4.** Temperature dependent lattice thermal conductivity of PbTe, GeTe (trigonal direction), and Si. The \( f \) is atomic vacancy fraction. For the RTA case, only diagonal terms of phonon-vacancy scattering matrix are included while the full matrix case includes all elements of the scattering matrix. The phonon-phonon scattering for both cases is included with a full matrix. The thermal conductivity of GeTe along the binary direction, similar to the trigonal direction case, is shown in Fig. S2 in the Supplementary Information.

The Mie scattering behavior is not limited to phonon-vacancy scattering, but can also be observed in phonon-dopant scattering. In Fig. 5, we present the scattering rates of phonons by two widely used dopants for PbTe, Na and Bi substituting Pb [30,43,44]. The atomic fraction of dopants is usually high ranging from 1 to 2% in samples with high thermoelectric figure-of-merits [30,43,44] and therefore its impact on the phonon scattering and lattice thermal conductivity can be significant. We consider both mass and IFC perturbations in the calculation using the T-matrix approach though the phonon scattering due to mass differences is negligible. Figure 5 shows that the scattering rate has much weaker dependence than \( \omega^4 \), indicating Mie scattering for Na and Bi dopants as well as Pb vacancy. Also, highly asymmetric phase functions are observed for both dopants, as
shown in Fig. S3 in the Supplementary Information, confirming the simple kinetic theory does not fully describe the phonon transport in the materials with dopants.

![Graph showing phonon scattering rates]

**FIG. 5.** Comparison of phonon scattering rates by Pb vacancy (vPb), Na and Bi substitution for Pb in PbTe from the T-matrix approach. The scattering rates are normalized by the atomic fraction of point defects.

In summary, we have applied an *ab initio* Green’s function approach to investigate the scattering of phonons by point defects in PbTe, GeTe, compared to Si. In contrast to the often assumed Rayleigh scattering, the scattering of most acoustic phonons in PbTe and GeTe exhibit Mie scattering behaviors due to the long-ranged strain field induced by point defects. Specifically, the frequency dependence of scattering rates is weaker than the $\omega^4$ of Rayleigh scattering and the scattering phase function is highly asymmetric. The latter results in the failure of the relaxation time approximation, with an error of ~20% in predicting the lattice thermal conductivity at 300 K when the vacancy fraction is 1%. Our results highlight the importance of the long-ranged strain field induced by point defects for thermal transport. Similar behavior is expected in other materials with high electronic polarizability which can lead to the long-ranged strain field by a point defect. The significant Mie scattering behavior shows the complexity of phonon scattering by point defects in IV-VI semiconductors, which cannot be described by the simple kinetic theory combined with the conventional Rayleigh scattering.
Acknowledgement

We thank Nebil A. Katcho and Lucas Lindsay for helpful discussions. We acknowledge support from National Science Foundation (Award No. 1705756 and 1709307). This work used the Extreme Science and Engineering Discovery Environment (XSEDE) Linux cluster at the Pittsburgh Supercomputing Center through Allocation No. TG-CTS180043 and the Linux cluster of the Center for Research Computing at the University of Pittsburgh.
References


Supplementary Material for

Mie Scattering of Phonons by Point Defects in IV-VI Semiconductors
PbTe and GeTe

Ruiqiang Guo¹ and Sangyeop Lee¹,²,*

¹Department of Mechanical Engineering and Materials Science, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15261, USA

²Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15261, USA
I. Computational Details

1. Phonon-vacancy scattering rates

1.1 Green’s function approach

When a phonon mode $q_s$ (which represent the wavevector and polarization, respectively) is scattered into another phonon mode $q_{s'}$ elastically by a point defect, the transition rate $q_s \rightarrow q_{s'}$ can be calculated using the Green’s function approach [1-9]

$$\Gamma_{q,q'} = \frac{\pi \Omega}{qV_d} \left( \left| T^+ \left( \omega \right) \right| \left| q_s \right| \right)^2 \delta \left( \omega_{q_s}^2 - \omega_{q_{s'}}^2 \right), \quad (1)$$

where $\omega$ is the angular frequency of phonons, $\Omega$ is the volume into which the phonon eigenstate $|q_s\rangle$ is normalized and $V_d$ is the defect volume. The $T^+$ is the $T$ matrix defined by

$$T^+ = (I - VG)^+ V, \quad (2)$$

where $I$ is the identity matrix, $V$ is the perturbation matrix representing the differences induced by the point defect. $G^+_0$ is the retarded Green’s function of the unperturbed crystal, which is calculated numerically using the tetrahedron approach of Lambin and Vigneron [10]. In the general case, the perturbation matrix $V$ can be decomposed into $V^M$ and $V^K$, which represent the changes of atomic mass and interatomic force constants (IFCs), respectively. The $V^M$ is expressed as

$$V^M = -\frac{M_i' - M_i}{M_i} \omega^2, \quad (3)$$

where $M_i$ and $M_i'$ are the atomic masses at the lattice site $i$ in the perfect and defected crystals, respectively. The $V^K$ is constructed based on the IFCs of the perfect ($K$) and defected ($K'$) structures, with each matrix element calculated by

$$V^K_{\alpha,\beta} = \frac{K'_{\alpha,\beta} - K_{\alpha,\beta}}{(M_i M_j)^{1/2}}, \quad (4)$$

where $\alpha$ and $\beta$ are Cartesian axes, $i$ and $j$ represent lattice sites.

Assuming the scattering of phonons by a point defect is independent of other point defects, the phonon-defect scattering rate is
\[ \frac{1}{\tau_{qs}} = f \sum_{q_{s}'} \Gamma_{qs,q_{s}'}^{d}, \]  

where \( f \) is the volumetric fraction of point defects.

### 1.2 Born approximation and Klemens’ model using real phonon dispersion

For weak perturbations, the above calculation can be simplified using the Born approximation, i.e., substituting the \( T \) matrix in Eq. (1) with the perturbation matrix \( V \), which is the first-order approximation of the Born series

\[ T^{+} = V + V G_{0}^{*} V + V G_{0}^{*} V G_{0}^{*} V + ... \approx V. \]  

Klemens suggested a simple model of phonon-vacancy scattering rate based on the Debye phonon dispersion and an effective mass variance \( (\Delta M / M)^{2} = 9 \) [11]. In order to employ the realistic phonon dispersion from \textit{ab initio} calculation, we combine the Klemens’ effective mass variance with the Tamura’s model for phonon-isotope scattering:

\[ \frac{1}{\tau_{qs}^{iso}} = \frac{\pi \omega_{qs}^{2}}{2} \sum_{i} g(i) \left| \mathbf{e}_{qs}^{\ast}(i) \cdot \mathbf{e}_{qs}(i) \right|^{2} \delta(\omega_{qs} - \omega_{qs}''), \]  

with mass variance \( g(i) = \sum_{b} f_{b}(i) [1 - M_{b}(i) / \bar{M}(i)]^{2} \), \( f_{b}(i) \) and \( M_{b}(i) \) the fraction and mass of the \( b \)th isotope of atom \( i \) and \( \bar{M}(i) \) the average mass of the \( i \)th atom in the unit cell. We call this Klemens’ model and applied it to the vacancy case in this work.

### 2. Density functional theory (DFT) calculation

We determined the harmonic and anharmonic IFCs from DFT calculations using the projector augmented wave method [12], as implemented in the Vienna \textit{ab initio} simulation package (VASP) [13]. The Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof (PBE) generalized gradient approximation was used for the exchange-correlation functional for all materials [14]. In Table S1, we list the cutoff energy and \( \mathbf{k} \)-point sampling grid for electronic states used in the relaxation of the primitive cell. Also, the spin-orbit interaction was included for the heavy elements Pb and Te.

To calculate the harmonic and anharmonic IFCs, we used a supercell of \( 4 \times 4 \times 4 \) for Si and a relatively larger one \( 5 \times 5 \times 5 \) for PbTe and GeTe in which long-range interatomic interactions are significant. The self-consistent calculation was performed with the force convergence criteria of \( 10^{-6} \) eV/Å.
3. Lattice thermal conductivity

In Fig. 4, we calculated the lattice thermal conductivity using two different methods: Full Matrix and RTA. For the Full Matrix case, we obtain the total scattering matrix by adding phonon-phonon, phonon-isotope, and phonon-vacancy scattering matrices. For the RTA case, only diagonal terms from the phonon-vacancy scattering matrix are included while full matrices of phonon-phonon and phonon-isotope scattering are used. Then, the linearized Peierls-Boltzmann transport equation was solved with an iterative manner as implemented in ShengBTE [15]. More technical details can be found in previous publications [15-19]. The $q$-point sampling grids for phonon states are listed in Table S1. The isotopes of each element are assumed naturally occurring case.
## II. Supplementary Table

Table S1. Parameters for the calculations: i) cutoff energy of plane wave basis and the sampling of electronic states (k-mesh) in the first Brillouin zone for the DFT calculation; ii) the sampling of phonon states in the first Brillouin zone (q-mesh) for thermal conductivity calculation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cutoff energy (eV)</th>
<th>k-mesh</th>
<th>q-mesh</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PbTe</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>15×15×15</td>
<td>16×16×16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GeTe</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>15×15×15</td>
<td>16×16×16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Si</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>15×15×15</td>
<td>24×24×24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III. Supplementary Figures

FIG. S1. Scattering phase functions by single vacancy for incident phonons with various wavelengths in PbTe, GeTe and Si. Both incident and scattered phonons are from the low-lying transverse acoustic (TA1) branch. The incident phonon propagates with an angle of 0 degree.
FIG. S2. Temperature dependent lattice thermal conductivity of perfect crystalline GeTe and GeTe with vacancy (the atomic fraction \( f \) is 1\%) along the binary direction. For the RTA case, only diagonal terms of phonon-vacancy scattering matrix are included while the full matrix case includes all elements of the scattering matrix. The phonon-phonon scattering for both cases is included with a full matrix.
FIG. S3. Scattering phase functions by Na and Bi substitution for incident phonons with various wavelengths in PbTe. Both incident and scattered phonons are from the low-lying transverse acoustic (TA1) branch. The incident phonon propagates with an angle of 0 degree.
IV. Supplementary Derivations

We show that the relaxation time approximation is exact when the scattering phase function is symmetric. Starting with the Peierls-Boltzmann transport equation for an infinitely large sample with a spatially homogenous temperature gradient along $x$-direction:

$$-v_s(q_s) \frac{\partial f_0(q_s)}{\partial T} \frac{dT}{dx} = \sum_{q'q} [f(q's')S(q's',q_s) - f(q_s)S(q_s,q's')] , \quad (8)$$

where $S(q_s,q's')$ is the transition rate from a phonon mode $q_s$ to another phonon mode $q's'$. The phonon distribution function $f$ can be decomposed into the equilibrium part $f_0$ and an asymmetric part $f_A$ displaced by the temperature gradient,$$

f(q_s) = f_0(q_s) + f_A(q_s) . \quad (9)$$

With the detailed balance, the scattering term in Eq. (8) can be written as

$$\sum_{q'q} [f_A(q's')S(q's',q_s) - f_A(q_s)S(q_s,q's')] \quad (10)$$

Considering the relation $f_A(-q_s) = -f_A(q_s)$, Eq. (10) becomes

$$-f_A(q_s)\sum_{q'q} S(q_s,q's') + \sum_{q'q} f_A(q's')[S(q's',q_s) - S(-q's',q_s)] \quad (11)$$

If the scattering phase function is symmetric, i.e., $S(q's',q_s) = S(-q's',q_s)$, the scattering integral can be reduced to a simple scattering term with a relaxation time:

$$\sum_{q'q} [f(q's')S(q's',q_s) - f(q_s)S(q_s,q's')] = -\frac{f_A(q_s)}{\tau} , \quad (12)$$

where $\tau^{-1} = \sum_{q'q} S(q_s,q's')$. 


