Topological Dirac semimetal and superconductivity in two-dimensional transition-metal MOH (M= Zr, Hf)

Ali Ebrahimian,1, * Mehrdad Dadsetani,1 and Reza Asgari2,3

1 Department of Physics, Lorestan University, Khoramabad, Iran
2 School of Nano Science, Institute for Research in Fundamental Sciences (IPM), Tehran 19395-5531, Iran
3 School of Physics, Institute for Research in Fundamental Sciences (IPM), Tehran 19395-5531, Iran

(Dated: July 10, 2019)

Discovering new two-dimensional (2D) Dirac semimetals incorporating both superconductivity and the topological band structure provides a novel platform for realizing the intriguing applications of massless Dirac fermions and Majorana quasiparticles, ranging from high-speed quantum devices at the nanoscale to topological quantum computations. In this work, utilizing first-principles calculations and symmetry analysis, we introduce MOH (M= Zr, Hf) as a new topological Dirac superconductor with Dirac points close to a Fermi level which are connected with nearly flat edge states as a striking feature of topological semimetals. Our calculations show that ZrOH as a 2D Dirac semimetal can exhibit superconductivity and is a novel platform for studying the interplay between superconductivity and Dirac states in low-dimensional materials.

*Present address: Department of Physics, Lorestan University, Khoramabad, Iran
**Corresponding author: ebrahimian.ali@lu.ac.ir

Nowadays, the boundary between different branches of science is fading and novel idea developed by researchers in one area have broad applications in others. Condensed matter science and other subjects have been a source of many discoveries, some examples would be 3He-B and 3He-A phases as topological superfluid, graphene, Weyl semimetal and topological order. After introducing the Dirac (Weyl) superconductor (SC) [1], searching for topological superconducting materials has become one of the main topics in modern physics. So far two kinds of topological SC including topological insulator/SC heterostructure [2–4] and doped topological insulator [5, 6] have been reported. However, the experimental observation of superconductivity in these materials is very challenging [7, 8]. Recent theoretical studies show that the unique orbital texture of Dirac points in doped Dirac semimetals allows odd-parity Cooper pairing between electrons with different quantum numbers [9, 10]. In Dirac semimetals, the energy bands are doubly degenerate with the conduction bands intersecting with the valence bands at Dirac points, such that the band-crossing points are four-fold degenerate and their low-energy excitations are linearly dispersing Dirac fermions [11]. This degeneracy in general is not topologically protected [12] and requires the protection of the special space group symmetries in which case the band-crossing remain intact as symmetry-protected degeneracies [13].

Two-dimensional (2D) materials with tunable topological and electronic properties via surface termination, are a paradigm for designing materials that incorporate both superconductivity and the topological band structure [14–16]. More speculative effects arise in such a system providing a platform to learn novel effect in spintronics and topological qubit. Here, we report an investigation of the influence of surface termination in transition metal halide MX (M=Zr, Hf; X=Cl, Br) monolayers on their topological nature and propose a method for creating new topological Dirac SC from these monolayers, based on the quantitative first-principles calculations and symmetry analysis. Layered compounds ZrCl and ZrBr, consisting of tightly bound double hexagonal Zr atomic layers sandwiched between two halogen atomic layers, have been synthesized in experiment [17–19]. More excitingly, L. Zhou et al. have predicted that MX monolayers constitute a novel family of robust Quantum spin Hall (QSH) insulator [20]. In this work, we predict that by replacing Halogene atoms of these monolayers with Hyroxyl (OH) groups, the conduction (valence) bands shift down (up) and the band inversion happens at the Γ point leading to appearance of Dirac cone and high density of states (DOS) at the Fermi energy. Moreover, during this change of surface termination, the Zr-Zr (Hf-Hf) distance decreases and the highly disperse and flat bands appear in the vicinity of the Fermi level providing the necessary condition for high superconducting transition temperature (Tc) [21–23]. In other words, our calculations show that ZrOH (HfOH) is a topological SC with a superconducting Tc of greater than 20 K in addition to Dirac cone at 0.05 eV above the Fermi level which make it an ideal platform to study Dirac (Weyl) physics and Majorana fermion quasiparticle.

Our calculations are based on density functional theory [24–33]. The calculations of electron-phonon coupling (EPC) and superconductivity are based on the density functional perturbation theory (DFPT) [34, 35]. The Tc can be estimated by Allan-Dynes modified McMillan formula [36, 37]:

\[
T_c = \frac{f_1 f_2 \omega_n}{1.2} \exp\left[-\frac{1.04(1 + \lambda)}{\lambda - \mu^*(1 + 0.62\lambda)}\right],
\]

where \(\mu^*\) is the Morel-Anderson Pseudopotential [35]. The parameters \(f_1\) and \(f_2\) are strong-coupling and shape correction respectively. \(\lambda\) is the EPC strength (see Appendix A) and \(\omega_n\) is given by

\[
\omega_n = \int d\omega \frac{\ln \omega}{\omega} \alpha^2 F(\omega)
\]
Before, tic constants (C in 2D framework [38, 39]. The calculated 2D linear elastic interactions with the periodic copies and correctly account within DFPT to eliminate the spurious long-range dispersions are calculated by using the 2D Coulomb cut.

The stability of the ZrOH monolayer. Note that the phonon (Fig. 2) show no imaginary mode, implying the structural are given in Appendix E. The calculated phonon spectra we focus on the ZrOH monolayer. The results for HfOH to similarities of electronic structures of ZrOH and HfOH, and lattice constants as the ground state structure. Due to the MX sheets, the MOH layers prefer smaller bond lengths sequence of H-O-M-M-O-H (Fig. 1). Compared to the double hexagonal M atomic layers sandwiched between two MX monolayers [20] which is composed of tightly bound atoms with OH groups, the lattice constant of Cl atoms with OH groups, the lattice constant is reduced to a well-known Allan-Dysnes MacMillan formula which works in a case that \( \lambda \) is smaller than unity. In our studied systems, the \( \lambda \) is less than unity and therefore, \( T_c \) is the same obtained within those formulas.

MOH (M= Zr, Hf) monolayer has a similar structure to MX monolayers [20] which is composed of tightly bound double hexagonal M atomic layers sandwiched between two hexagonal Hydroxyl group (OH) layers in layering sequence of H-O-M-M-O-H (Fig. 1). Compared to the MX sheets, the MOH layers prefer smaller bond lengths and lattice constants as the ground state structure. Due to similarities of electronic structures of ZrOH and HIOH, we focus on the ZrOH monolayer. The results for HfOH are given in Appendix E. The calculated phonon spectra (Fig. 2) show no imaginary mode, implying the structural stability of the ZrOH monolayer. Note that the phonon dispersions are calculated by using the 2D Coulomb cut off within DFPT to eliminate the spurious long-range interactions with the periodic copies and correctly account for the long wavelength of polar-optical phonons in 2D framework [38, 39]. The calculated 2D linear elastic constants (\( C_{11} = 149.23, C_{12} = -26.7, C_{13} = 41.22, C_{33} = 34.43 \) and \( C_{55} = 37.88 \text{ Nm}^{-1} \)) satisfy the Born stability criteria [40] of hexagonal sheet, indicating robust mechanical stabilities for ZrOH. Moreover, the formation energy of ZrOH (which is defined as \( E_\text{f}=E_\text{tot}(\text{ZrOH})-E_\text{tot}(\text{Zr})-E_\text{tot}(\text{OH}) \) where \( E_\text{tot}(\text{ZrOH}) \) and \( E_\text{tot}(\text{Zr}) \) stand for the total energies of ZrOH and Zr monolayer, respectively, and \( E_\text{tot}(\text{OH}) \) is the total energy of O\( _2+\text{H}_2 \) is computed to consider its thermodynamic stability (Appendix B). The calculated formation energy of ZrOH is negative, implying exothermic functionalization of OH on the pristine Zr monolayer. Since the formation energy of ZrOH is larger than those of ZrX, probably its experimental production may be more feasible.

As shown in Fig. 1, the valence and conduction bands cross each other along the \( \Gamma-K \) making a Dirac point band degeneracy at 0.05 eV above Fermi level. The three-dimensional (3D) plot for a Dirac cone (Fig. 1 (c)) presents a notably anisotropic character around the Dirac point which can be used for manipulating the propagation of carriers [41]. When taking to account the spin-orbit coupling (SOC) effects, the Dirac band structure is well retained except for a negligible band gap at the Dirac point (Fig. 1 (a)). In other words, in the presence of the SOC the main feature of the band structure is unchanged. The huge DOS at the Fermi level drives us to check the correlation effect in d electrons of transition-metal Zr.

Our calculations stemming from GGA+U method show that albeit DOS is huge at \( E_F \), the system does not go to a strongly correlated regime and the ground-state of the ZrOH is always nonmagnetic (Appendix C).

Just as transition metal halide ZrX, Zr-d orbitals dominate the band near Fermi level (Fig. 1). In comparison to ZrX, OH termination pushes downward the conduction band beneath the Fermi level result in band crossing. Due to the \( D_{3d} \) symmetry of the structure, the point group of the wave vector at the high-symmetry point \( \Gamma, K \) and \( M \) is \( D_{3d}, D_3 \), and \( C_2 \), respectively. The \( D_{3d} \) point group at the \( \Gamma \) point splits the Zr-d orbitals into three groups (\( d_{xy}, d_{xz}, d_{yz} \)) and \( d_{z^2} \). The point group along the high symmetry line \( \Gamma-K \) (\( \Gamma-M \)) is \( C_{2v} \left( C_{\gamma} \right) \) which has two irreducible representations. The calculated irreducible representations of the point group of the crossing bands show that these bands have different representations A and B along the \( \Gamma-K \). So they cannot interact and mix with each other making a Dirac point near the Fermi level. Furthermore, since off-symmetry point has \( C_1 \) point group, the band crossing is avoided for every general nonsymmetric point. Therefore, the dispersion relation is linear at the vicinity of the Dirac point forming a Dirac cone around the Dirac point (Fig. 1 (c)). To investigate the reason of the band crossing, we change the lattice constant \( a \) while analyzing the band order associated with atomic orbitals. Furthermore, considering the effects of substitution of Cl with OH group, we calculate the band structures of ZrCl and ZrCl\(_{0.5}\)OH\(_{0.5}\) monolayers. As shown in Fig. 8 by replacing 50 percent of Cl atoms with OH groups, the lattice constant...
becomes smaller lowering the energy of the conduction bands above the \( \Gamma \) point. When the Cl atoms are replaced completely by OH groups (ZrOH), the lattice constant \( a \) reduces to 3.30 Å, causing the conduction and valence band inversion at the \( \Gamma \) point. In ZrOH, by increasing the lattice constant \( a \), the distance between Zr atoms increases so the interactions between Zr atoms and hybridization between Zr-\( d_{xy} \) and \( d_{x^2-y^2} \) (Zr-\( d_{z^2} \)) diminishes (enhances) which lowers (raises) the energy of the bands composed from Zr-\( d_{xy} \) (Zr-\( d_{z^2} \)) orbitals resembling the band structure of ZrCl monolayer.

Because of separation of the conduction and valence bands, the Fu-Kane formula of topological invariants can be applied to ZrOH and the \( Z_2 \) invariant is determined by examining the parity eigenvalues of the valence band at time reversal invariant momenta (TRIM) points [42]. The parity products for occupied states at two TRIM of \( \Gamma, M \) are calculated to be “+” and “−” respectively which give \( Z_2=1 \), indicating the nontrivial topological phase. The calculated momentum-resolved surface density of states along the high symmetry line of \( \bar{K}-\Gamma-K \) in the \( \{1,0\} \) edge BZ (Fig. 2 (b)) shows the presence of nearly flat edge modes (red line) connecting two projected Dirac points. The calculated Fermi surface in Fig. 2 (a) shows that there are six equivalent Dirac points in Brillouin zone (BZ) which is consistent with \( C_3 \) rotation and time-reversal symmetry of the structure. At the \( \{1,0\} \) edge, because four bulk Dirac nodes project onto two points in the edge Brillouin zone, there are four Dirac nodes in this edge (Fig. 2 (d)).

Searching for appropriate substrate is crucial for the deposition of the ZrOH monolayer in experiments. As a 2D insulator with large band gap of 3.57 eV [43], ZnO monolayer can match well with the ZrOH monolayer with a very small lattice mismatch (~0.9%). Fig. 3 shows that electronic states near the Fermi level are still dominated by the ZrOH films and the Dirac cone remains in the presence of the substrate. Due to substrate effects, a small gap is opened at the Dirac point and the inversion symmetry is broken. Therefore, the Weyl points are separated in energy. The calculated momentum-resolved surface density of states in \( \{1,0,0\} \) shows that these Weyl points are connected by edge states, confirming that the topological phase of ZrOH monolayer is not affected (Fig. 3).

Fig. 2 shows that ZrOH monolayer hosts Fermi surfaces surrounding Dirac points. Theoretically, such a Dirac semimetal is expected to display Cooper pairing between different orbitals at the Fermi surfaces enclosing Dirac points [9, 10]. Moreover, around the Dirac point (along the \( \Gamma-K \)), the two inverted bands have opposite parity and then inversion operator can be choose
TABLE I. The calculated $T_c$, $\lambda$ and carrier concentration ($n_s$) at $E_F$ for the Fermi level shift ($\Delta E_F$) referring to the Dirac point (see Fig. 4)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>$\Delta E_F$ ($K$)</th>
<th>$n_s$ (cm$^{-2}$)</th>
<th>$\lambda$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-0.05</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>5.3$\times$10$^{11}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>19.02</td>
<td>6.0$\times$10$^{13}$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.05</td>
<td>27.9</td>
<td>1.20$\times$10$^{14}$</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

as $\hat{p} = \sigma_z$. Therefore, the orbital-mixed Cooper pairs in ZrOH monolayer should have odd parity. As Fig. 1 shows, the conduction band touches the Fermi level at the $\Gamma$ point and under small lattice compressive strain, this band crosses the Fermi energy (Fig 8). Since the Fermi surface in ZrOH encloses an odd number of TRIM in the Brillouin zone, any time-reversal-invariant odd-parity superconductivity realized on this Fermi surface is topological [44]. As a result, ZrOH is an odd-parity topological SC with a gapless Majorana edge mode on the boundary.

As is evident from Fig. 4, the vibrational modes are divided into three parts, with low frequencies dominated by Zr/O atoms, intermediate and high frequencies related mainly to H atoms. Comparing the $\alpha^2 F(\omega)$ with partial phonon density of states (PHDOS), it is clear that the most substantial contribution to the EPC comes from H and O modes at intermediate frequencies (Fig. 4). In our calculations we find the total EPC $\lambda$ to be 0.52 with major contribution from optical phonon mode around 10 THz. The superconducting $T_c$ is estimated to be 24.7 K at the Fermi level which is located below the Dirac point. The Fermi level is 0.05 eV below the Dirac point which corresponds to hole concentration $n_s = 5.3\times10^{11}$ cm$^{-2}$ [45, 46] (see Appendix D). To consider the superconductivity around the Dirac point, we raise the Fermi energy and placing it at the Dirac point and above it (see Fig. 4). By setting the Fermi energy at the Dirac point, the electron concentration becomes $n_s = 6\times10^{13}$ cm$^{-2}$ which is driven by parabolic band. If we locate the Fermi energy at 0.05 eV above the Dirac point, both Dirac point and parabolic band take part in generating $n_s = 1.20\times10^{14}$ cm$^{-2}$ for the electron concentration at the Fermi level. The calculated results (Table I) show that the EPC $\lambda$ is increased to 0.7 by raising the Fermi energy while $T_c$ is decreased by 23% at the Dirac point and then increased by 30% above band crossing. The calculated $T_c$ for several values of the Coulomb pseudopotential $\mu^*$ (Fig. 4), shows the strong impact of the electron-electron interaction on $T_c$. The high EPC and superconductivity in ZrOH can be attributed to a Van Hove singularity of density of state at the Fermi level resulting from Zr-Zr distance reduction. These results are in good agreement with a previous report which shows that the change in Zr-Zr distance is the most important factor in the appearance of superconductivity in ZrNCl [23].

In summary, we have investigated the electronic structure and the EPC of ZrOH (HIOH). The calculated electronic and phonon properties of ZrOH show the coexistence of nontrivial band topology and superconductivity in this monolayer. In fact, the superconducting $T_c$ is estimated to be 24.7 K. Our work demonstrates that 2D ZrOH can exhibit superconductivity and is a novel platform for realizing Majorana fermions.
APPENDIX A: CALCULATIONS METHOD

The electronic structure simulations are based on density functional theory which is implemented in WIEN2k code [24] as well as the FHI-aims code package [25] to meet high accuracy requirements. To avoid the possible underestimation of the band gap within generalized gradient approximation (GGA), in addition to PBE-type [26] of generalized gradient approximation functional, the hybrid density functional (HSE06) [27, 28] and the mBJ potential [29] are used in the calculations. A 20×20×1 MonkhorstPack k-point mesh was used in the computations. The spin-orbit coupling (SOC) is included consistently within the second variational method. A 21Å thick vacuum layer is used to avoid interactions between nearest layers. The WannierTools code [30] was used to investigate the topological properties based on maximal localized functions tight-binding model [31] that was constructed by using the Wannier90 package [32] with Zr (Hf) d orbitals as projectors. The surface state spectra are calculated using the iterative Greens function method [30, 33].

The calculations of electron-phonon coupling and superconductivity are based on the density functional perturbation theory (DFPT) [34]. Quantum Espresso [35] packages are employed with Ultrasoft Pseudopotentials in the phonon calculations. The energy cutoff is 50 Ry (500 Ry) for wave function (charge densities) calculations. 48×48×1 k grid and 6×6×1 q grid are used in DFPT calculations. The electron-phonon coupling strength is given by

\[ \lambda_{q\nu} = \frac{1}{\pi N_F} \frac{\pi''_{q\nu}}{\omega_{q\nu}^2} \]  (4)

where \( N_F \) is the density of states at the Fermi level and \( \omega_{q\nu} \) is a phonon frequency of mode \( \nu \) at wave vector \( q \). The electron-phonon quasiparticle line width \( \pi''_{q\nu} \) can be written as

\[ \pi''_{q\nu} = \pi \omega_{q\nu} \sum_{mn,n} | g_{mn}^{\nu}(k,q) |^2 \delta(\epsilon_n) \delta(\epsilon_{m+n+q}) \]  (5)

where \( \epsilon_n \) is the energy of the KS orbital and the dynamical matrix \( g_{mn}^{\nu}(k,q) \) reads

\[ g_{mn}^{\nu}(k,q) = \left( \frac{\hbar}{2M \omega_{q\nu}} \right)^{1/2} \langle \Psi_{kn} | \frac{dV_{\text{ext}}}{du_{q\nu}} | \Psi_{k+n,qm} \rangle \]  (6)

where \( M \) and \( \epsilon_{q\nu} \) represent the mass of the atom and the unit vector along \( u_{q\nu} \) respectively and \( \frac{dV_{\text{ext}}}{du_{q\nu}} \) denote the deformation potential at the small atomic displacement \( du_{q\nu} \) of the given phonon mode. The transition temperature \( T_c \) can be estimated by Allan-Dynes modified McMillan formula [36, 37]:

\[ T_c = \frac{f_1 f_2 \omega_{ln}}{1.2} \exp\left[-\frac{1.04(1+\lambda)}{\lambda - \mu^* (1+0.62\lambda)}\right] \]  (7)

where \( \mu^* \) is the Morel-Anderson Pseudopotential [37] and is usually set between 0.1 and 0.2. The parameters \( f_1 \) and \( f_2 \) are strong-coupling and shape correction respectively. \( \lambda \) and \( \omega_{ln} \) is given by

\[ \lambda = \sum_{q\nu} \lambda_{q\nu} \]  (8)

\[ \omega_{ln} = \int d\omega \ln \omega \alpha^2 F(\omega) \]  (9)

\[ \alpha^2 F(\omega) = \frac{1}{2} \int_{BZ} d\omega \lambda_{q\nu} \omega_{q\nu} \delta(\omega - \omega_{q\nu}) \]  (10)

It is worth mentioning that by setting \( f_1 = f_2 = 1 \), Eq. 7 is reduced to a well-known Allan-Dynes MacMillan formula which works in a case that \( \lambda \) is smaller than unity. In our case, as we will discuss in the Numerical results, the \( \lambda \) is less than unity and therefore, \( T_c \) is the same obtained within those formulas.

APPENDIX B: FORMATION ENERGY

The formation energies of surface groups for single-layer ZrX (X= OH, Cl, Br, F) are shown in Figure 5, which are defined as

\[ E_f = E_{\text{tot}}(ZrX) - E_{\text{tot}}(Zr) - E_{\text{tot}}(X) \]  (11)

where \( E_{\text{tot}}(ZrX) \) and \( E_{\text{tot}}(Zr) \) stand for the total energies of ZrX and Zr monolayer, respectively, and \( E_{\text{tot}}(X) \) is the total energy of \( O_2+H_2, Cl_2, Br_2 \) and \( F_2 \). Since the formation energy (-14.24) of ZrOH is larger than those of ZrX, probably its experimental production may be more feasible.

APPENDIX C: GGA+U CALCULATIONS

To check the correlation effect in d electrons of transition-metal Zr, using the linear response approach, we calculate the interaction parameter entering GGA+U method where U is the on-site Coulomb interaction [47]. In this approach, the response function \( \chi = \frac{2n}{\pi} \) is calculated by using a matrix of response functions. Here \( n \) is the site occupation and is given by the ration of potential shifts to the projector on the localized d electron of the selected atom. Then the value of U is obtained by

\[ U = \chi_0^{-1} - \chi_f^{-1} \]  (12)
FIG. 5. (Color online) The formation energies of surface groups for single-layer ZrX (X = OH, Cl, Br, F).

FIG. 6. (Color online) Left panel: Band structure of bulk of ZrOH obtained within the GGA+U approach. Right panel: occupations as a function of the potential $\alpha$ where $\chi_0$ and $\chi_f$ are the bare and self-consistent response function (Fig. 6). The obtained result for U is 1.05 eV which is too small to change low-energy bands around the Fermi energy (Fig. 6). Our calculations based on GGA+U show that the correlation effect is negligible and the ground-state of the ZrOH is always nonmagnetic.

APPENDIX D: CARRIER CONCENTRATION

The carrier (hole) concentration, $n_s$, at the Fermi level is related to the Dirac cone (Fig. 4) with negligible part from a parabolic band around the zone center. Therefore, $n_s$ is given by [48, 49]

$$\Delta E_F = h |v_F| \sqrt{\pi n_s}$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)

where $\Delta E_F$ is the Fermi level shift referring to the Dirac point and $v_F = 0.5 \times 10^8$ cm/s is the Fermi velocity. The Fermi level is 0.05 eV below the Dirac point which corresponds to hole concentration $n_s = 5.3 \times 10^{11}$ cm$^{-2}$. To consider the carrier (hole) concentration around the Dirac point, we expand (see Fig. 4) the electron dispersion, E(k), around the zone center to second order, $E = a k^2 + b k$, which provides a very good fit to the results of ab-initio calculation with $a = 2.645$ and $b = 0.011$.

FIG. 7. (Color online) Left panel: The bulk band structure for optimized HfOH using HSE06 and PBE. Right panel: The phonon dispersions for optimized HfOH nanosheets. LA and TA correspond, respectively, to the longitudinal and transverse waves with in-plane atomic displacements. ZA represents the transverse waves with out-of-plane atomic displacements. We calculate the slopes of in-plane acoustic branches in the vicinity of the $\Gamma$ point. The sound velocities in the $\Gamma$-K direction are obtained as 1.41 and 0.89 km/s for longitudinal and transverse atomic motions for HfOH, respectively.

APPENDIX E:

The bulk band structure and phonon dispersions for optimized HfOH nanosheets are depicted in Fig 7. To investigate the reason of the band crossing, the evolution of closest bands to the Fermi level under lattice strain for ZrOH is shown in Fig 8. As shown in Fig 8, by replacing the Cl atoms with OH groups, the lattice constant $a$ becomes smaller lowering the energy of the conduction bands above the $\Gamma$ point.


* ebrahimian.AI@fs.lu.ac.ir
FIG. 8. (Color online) Upper panel: The band structures of ZrCl (a), ZrCl$_{0.5}$(OH)$_{0.5}$ (b). (c) The evolution of closest bands to the Fermi level under lattice strain for ZrOH. Lower panel: The calculated bulk band structure of ZrOH under the in-plane strain-off (solid line) and in-plane strain-on (dashed line) (left). The Fermi surface of ZrOH under -3% in-plane strain (right).