The hybrid-order topology of weak topological insulators

Sander H. Kooi,1 Guido van Miert,1 and Carmine Ortix1,2

1 Institute for Theoretical Physics, Center for Extreme Matter and Emergent Phenomena, Utrecht University, Princetonplein 5, 3584 CC Utrecht, the Netherlands
2 Dipartimento di Fisica “E. R. Caianiello”, Università di Salerno I-84084 Fisciano (Salerno), Italy

(Dated: August 5, 2019)

We consider weak topological insulators with a twofold rotation symmetry around the dark direction, and show that these systems can be endowed with the topological crystalline structure of a higher-order topological insulator protected by rotation symmetry. These hybrid-order weak topological insulators display surface Dirac cones on all surfaces. Translational symmetry breaking perturbations gap the Dirac cones on the side surfaces leaving anomalous helical hinge modes behind. We also prove that the existence of this topological phase comes about due to a hidden crystalline topological invariant of quantum spin-Hall insulators that can neither be revealed by symmetry indicators nor using Wilson loop invariants. Considering the minimal symmetry requirements, we anticipate that our findings could apply to a large number of weak topological insulators.

Introduction – The essence of a free-fermion topological insulating phase is that it cannot be adiabatically connected to a trivial atomic insulator, whose nature can be understood considering electrons as localized point particles. Topological insulators therefore do not admit a representation in terms of exponentially localized Wannier functions (WFs). This obstruction to a Wannier representability is, in turn, reflected in the presence of anomalous gapless boundary modes. Examples include the chiral (helical) edge modes in quantum (spin) Hall insulators [1–3], as well as the surface Dirac cones of three-dimensional topological insulators (TI) [7].

In crystalline systems with an additional set of spatial symmetries, additional topological phases can arise [5]. These topological crystalline insulators (TCI) cannot be represented in terms of WFs respecting the set of spatial symmetries of the system, and feature, by bulk-boundary correspondence, anomalous surface states violating a stronger version of the fermion doubling theorem [4] on surfaces that are left invariant under the protecting symmetry. Mirror Chern insulators [10, 11], for instance, are characterized by the presence of gapless surface Dirac cones pinned to mirror planes. Similarly, the so-called higher-order topological insulators [12, 13] feature anomalous gapless one-dimensional modes at the hinges connecting two surfaces related by the protecting crystalline symmetry [16].

The topologies related to the internal and spatial symmetries do not necessarily exclude each other and can even coexist. This occurs, for instance in different “dual” topological materials [17–20], which have the topological structure of both a weak TI and a mirror Chern insulator. Likewise, it has been recently proposed that certain topological superconductors can concomitantly feature both Majorana surface cones and Majorana hinge modes [21]. In all these systems, the topological crystalline structure can be diagnosed using the spatial symmetry content of the electronic bands [22–26] while the topology due to the internal symmetry is uniquely determined by the “tenfold-way” invariants [27, 28]. There exist, however, certain topological phases that are neither characterizable by symmetry indicators, nor by the tenfold way. In two-dimensional systems these phases have been recently started to be classified [29].

The question that immediately arises is whether crystalline topologies without symmetry indicators can be embedded in a topological non-trivial insulating phase protected by an internal symmetry. In this work, we show that this is the case and that weak topological insulators in crystals possessing a twofold rotation symmetry around the “dark” direction can be in a non-trivial topological crystalline phase, leading to the presence of anomalous surface Dirac cones on the dark surface. Such a phase corresponds to a form of hybrid-order topology since the system can be switched to a higher-order topological insulating phase with helical hinge modes using translational symmetry breaking perturbations. In this higher-order form, the non-trivial crystalline topology can be detected using a topological invariant defined in terms of a nested quantized partial polarization.

Crystalline topological invariants in quantum spin-Hall insulators – We start out by considering two-dimensional (2D) crystals possessing at least a twofold rotation symmetry $C_2$. All atomic, topologically trivial, insulating states in such a crystal can be represented using exponentially localized $C_2$-symmetric WFs. The Wannier charge center of a single symmetric WF will be then necessarily pinned at one of the four $C_2$-symmetric Wyckoff positions in the unit cell. Since pairs of $C_2$-related WFs may be arbitrarily moved throughout the unit cell, we find that the the parity of the number of symmetric WFs at a $C_2$-symmetric Wyckoff position corresponds to a $\mathbb{Z}_2$-invariant. However, in systems equipped with time-reversal symmetry $\Theta$, Kramers’ theorem guarantees that $C_2$-symmetric WFs will always come in time-reversal pairs [20]. Thus, naively one might consider all $C_2$-symmetric systems topologically equivalent as the number of WFs at each Wyckoff position will be

\[ \sum_{\text{Wyckoff}} \text{WFs} = 0 \]\n
where $\text{WFs}$ represent the number of WFs at each Wyckoff position, and $\text{Wyckoff}$ is the notation for a Wyckoff position in a crystallographic unit cell.
exp indicates a path-ordered exponential and as shown in Fig. 1(b). Let us now imagine to consider the partial polarization Kramers pair of bands. Without loss of generality, we will consider the simple case of a QSHI with only one occupied crystalline topology that cannot be read off from the rotation symmetric crystal carries an additional “hidden” properties of its Wilson loop spectrum. Let us first consider that for any atomic insulating state, the spectrum generated by the eigenphases of the Wilson loop operator
\[ W_{(k_1, 2\pi)\sim (k_1, 0)} = \exp \left[ \frac{2\pi i}{\nu} \int_{0}^{2\pi} dk' A_{k_1}(k') \right], \]
where \( \exp \) indicates a path-ordered exponential and \( A_{k_1}(k) = \langle u^\dagger(k_1, k_2) i\delta_{k_2} u(k_1, k_2) \rangle \) is the non-Abelian Berry connection, has to possess a finite Wannier gap. This gap separates two sectors centered around 0 and 1/2, respectively, each of which carries topological information. Contrary to this nested quantized partial Berry phase, the partial polarizations \( \gamma'_{1,2} \) can be defined even in the absence of a Wannier gap. They can be expressed in terms of the centers of charge of one-dimensional hybrid Wannier functions, which can be safely defined even in topologically non-trivial (crystalline) phases. As a result, one would conclude that, contrary to the topologically trivial atomic insulating phases, a time-reversal invariant topological insulator can be endowed with only two \( \mathbb{Z}_2 \) topological crystalline insulating phases: it is either a topological crystalline insulator of the fragile type \([29]\) or a trivial atomic insulator with Wannier charge centers at \( C_2 \) related Wyckoff positions in the unit cell.

We will now negate this assertion by showing that a quantum spin Hall insulating (QSHI) phase in a twofold rotation symmetric crystal carries an additional “hidden” crystalline topology that cannot be read off from the properties of its Wilson loop spectrum. Let us first consider the simple case of a QSHI with only one occupied Kramers pair of bands. Without loss of generality, we will consider the partial polarization \( \gamma'_{1,2} \equiv 0 \). The non-trivial value of the “strong” \( \mathbb{Z}_2 \) topological invariant introduced by Fu, Kane and Mele \([4, 5]\) necessarily implies that the partial polarizations on the time-reversal and twofold rotation symmetric lines \( k_{1,2} = G_{1,2}/2, G_{1,2} \) being the reciprocal lattice vectors, are quantized to \( \gamma'_{k_{1,2}} = G_{1,2}/2 = \pi \). This mandates a Wilson loop spectrum along the \( k_1 \) direction as shown in Fig. 1(b). Let us now imagine to let such QSHI interact with a different QSHI but with identical partial polarizations. Clearly, the \( \mathbb{Z}_2 \) topological indices corresponding to the partial polarizations of the combined system, as well as the total Fu-Kane-Mele invariant, are identically zero. However, the resulting \( N_F = 4 \) insulating phase can still belong to two distinct insulating phases: it is either a topological crystalline insulator of the fragile type \([29]\) or a trivial atomic insulator where the two Wannier Kramers’ pairs are centered at generic Wyckoff positions. The corresponding possible Wilson loops are shown in Fig. 2(c),(d) [see Supplemental Material for a concrete example]. Note that the transition between the two Wilson loops is necessarily accompanied by a closing and reopening of the band gap. Namely, the local annihilation of two degeneracies at \( \nu = 0 \) (\( \nu = 1/2 \)) would entail a jump in the partial Berry phase that necessarily requires a bulk bandgap closing. Furthermore, the existence of two distinct insulating phases in QSHI “bilayers” is valid for a generic number of occupied pairs of bands with the following caveat: when more than one pair of bands is occupied in each QSHI, the fragile topological phase is trivialized into an atomic insulating phase where all the four \( C_2 \)-
symmetric Wyckoff positions are populated by an odd number of Wannier Kramers’ pairs. We can thus conclude that the “hidden” crystalline topology of a QSHI is a form of relative topology and can only be revealed when comparing systems characterized by different topological indices.

**Hybrid-order weak TIs** — Next, we exploit the existence of this additional crystalline topology in three-dimensional bulk crystals with a $C_{2z}$ rotational symmetry. To do so, let us consider the three-dimensional Brillouin zone of our time-reversal invariant system as a collection of two-dimensional momentum cuts parameterized by the momentum $k_z$ parallel to the twofold rotation axis. At the time-reversal invariant two-dimensional planes $k_z = 0, \pi$ we consider the system to be a topological non-trivial QSHI. As a result, the bulk three-dimensional crystal will be a three-dimensional topological insulator of the weak class. In principle, we could choose the two $\mathbb{Z}_2$ topological crystalline indices corresponding to the quantized partial polarization of the $k_z = 0, \pi$ QSHI to be different. This, however, would imply that in the triad of “weak” topological invariants $[\nu_1, \nu_2, \nu_3]$, $\nu_1$ and/or $\nu_2$ are different from zero. Hence, the three-dimensional system would feature an even number of surface Dirac cones protected by time-reversal at the (001) and (001) surfaces that are left invariant under the $C_{2z}$ rotation symmetry. As a result, any physical consequence of the crystalline topology cannot manifest itself; it would be completely obscured by the internal, time-reversal, symmetry topology.

However, we can choose the two $\mathbb{Z}_2$ topological crystalline invariants at the time-reversal invariant planes to be equal, thus constraining the weak invariants to be $(0, 0, 1)$. The time-reversal symmetric topology now guarantees the existence of an even number of massless Dirac cones appearing at time-reversal invariant (100) and (010) surface momenta [c.f. Fig. 2], while it leaves the $C_{2z}$ invariant (001) surfaces completely dark. A non-trivial crystalline topology, which can thus only arise from the “hidden” topology discussed above, will then be in full force and lead to the appearance of a single pair of surface Dirac cones [c.f. Fig. 2] at unpinned surface momenta related by the twofold rotation symmetry. This pair of surface Dirac cones realizes a rotational anomaly violating the fermion multiplication theorem of Ref. [9] and can be only removed by breaking the protecting $C_{2z}$ and/or $\Theta$ symmetry [c.f. Fig. 2]. We will dub this three-dimensional insulating phase an hybrid-order weak topological insulator: it is by itself a first-order topological insulator in $d = 3$ dimensions with $d - 1$ gapless boundary modes, but it can be switched using unit cell doublings in the $\hat{z}$-direction, and thus without breaking any protecting symmetry, to a second-order topological insulator with anomalous gapless hinge modes [c.f. Fig. 2]. Note that in its first-order pristine form, this insulating state represents a first-of-its-kind example of a topological phase that can neither be diagnosed using symmetry indicators [29, 30, 35] nor using Wilson loop invariants [12, 29]. When suitable translational symmetry breaking perturbations yield a doubling of the unit cell in the $z$ direction, instead, the higher-order topological nature of the insulating phase can be inferred by computing a single $\mathbb{Z}_2$ topological invariant corresponding to the difference of the nested quantized partial Berry phases [29] evaluated on the time-reversal invariant planes $k_z = 0, \pi/2$ of the folded Brillouin zone.

**Stacked Kane-Mele model** — Having established the existence of the hybrid-order weak topological insulator, we next apply this notion explicitly to stacked Kane-Mele systems. We thus consider a tight-binding model for spin-1/2 electrons on AA stacked honeycomb lattices. In momentum space the Bloch Hamiltonian can be written as:

$$H(k) = d_1(k)\tau_z \otimes s_0 + d_2(k)\tau_y \otimes s_0 + d_5(k)\tau_z \otimes s_x + d_4(k)\tau_z \otimes s_y,$$

(1)

where the $\tau_i$’s and $s_i$’s are the Pauli matrices acting in sublattice and spin space respectively. The first two terms in the Hamiltonian above correspond to intralayer spin-independent nearest-neighbor hopping processes, and the corresponding coefficients are $d_1(k) = -t[1 + \cos x_1 + \cos x_2]$ and $d_2(k) = -t[\sin x_1 + \sin x_2]$. Here we have introduced the hopping amplitude $t$ while $x_{1,2} = k \cdot a_{1,2}$, $a_{1,2}$ being the Bravais lattice vectors. The third term in the Hamiltonian Eq. [1] corresponds to spin-orbit interaction which involves intralayer spin-dependent second-neighbor hopping. We take the corresponding coefficient $d_5(k) = 2t_2 \sin (x_1)$, with $t_2$ the
Figure 3. (color online) (a) Bulk bandstructure of the stacked Kane-Mele model Eq. 1 by further accounting for a Rashba spin-orbit coupling term of strength $\lambda/t = 0.1$. The strength of the modified intralayer spin-orbit coupling term has been fixed to $t_2/t = 0.7$, whereas the interlayer spin-orbit coupling strength has been fixed to $t_3/t = 0.4$. (b) Energy spectrum in a slab geometry with open boundary conditions along the $\hat{y}$ direction. The (010) and (010) surface exhibit an even number of Dirac cones pinned at time-reversal invariant surface momenta as required by the weak topological invariants. (c) Surface energy spectrum along the stacking $\hat{z}$ direction. The are two pairs of surface Dirac cones localized at the (001) and the (001) surface. The Dirac points are found at unpinned surface momenta related by the $C_2$ symmetry. The zoom-in (d) shows that the Dirac cones at opposite surface are located at different momenta due to the lack of inversion symmetry. All energies have been measured in unit of the hopping strength $t$.

hopping strength, thus explicitly breaking the threefold rotation symmetry. Finally the last term in the Hamiltonian involves interlayer spin-dependent hopping amplitudes and the corresponding coefficient reads $d_4(k) = -2t_3 \sin(k_z)$. We introduce this term to explicitly break the effective “in-plane” time-reversal symmetry to allow for the possibility of a change of (crystalline) topology in the two time-reversal symmetric planes $k_z = 0, \pi$. Since the Hamiltonian Eq. 1 preserves bulk inversion symmetry, we can immediately obtain the strong and weak topological indices and thus obtain $(\nu_0; \nu_1, \nu_2, \nu_3) = (0; 0, 0, 1)$. In this form, however, Eq. 1 does not model a hybrid-order weak topological insulator: it can be adiabatically connected to a stack of uncoupled QSHI and consequently its (001) surface has to be dark. To endow the system with a non-trivial crystalline topology we instead modify the intralayer spin-orbit coupling as $d_5(k) \to \cos(k_z)d_5(k)$. This modification keeps the strong and weak topological indices intact but changes the crystalline topology of the system.

To show this, we have computed the bulk bandstructure [see Fig. 3(a)] and the surface energy spectra [see Fig. 3(b), (c), (d)] of this modified model by further accounting for an intralayer Rashba spin-orbit coupling term of strength $\lambda$ that explicitly breaks inversion symmetry. At the side surfaces we observe the conventional surface Dirac cones of a weak topological insulators [c.f. Fig. 3(b)]. More importantly, diagonalization of the Hamiltonian with open boundary conditions along the stacking direction [c.f. Fig. 3(c)] reveals the presence of two $C_2$ symmetry protected surface Dirac cones thus verifying that our model realizes an hybrid-order weak topological insulator. Note that the pairs of Dirac cones at the (001) and (001) surface are found at different surface momenta in agreement with the lack of inversion symmetry.

We have also verified that our model can be switched to an higher-order topological insulator by suitable translational symmetry breaking perturbations. Specifically we have introduced an interlayer staggered chemical potential of strength $\epsilon$ that provides the required doubling of the unit cell and further introduced an interlayer coupling in the enlarged unit cell of the form $-\delta \tau_z s_x$. Fig. 4(a) shows the corresponding bulk bandstructure that is still

Figure 4. (color online) (a) Bulk band structure of the stacked Kane-Mele model with a translational breaking perturbation. The parameter set is the same as in Fig. 3. Moreover the translational symmetry breaking parameters have been fixed to $\epsilon/t = 0.1$ and $\delta/t = 0.2$. (b) Surface energy spectrum showing the gapping of the time-reversal symmetry protected Dirac cones. (c) Surface energy spectrum along the stacking direction that still feature the $C_2$-protected Dirac cones at unpinned surface momenta. (d) Energy spectrum in a ribbon geometry with periodic boundary conditions only along the stacking direction. Within the surface energy gap we find gapless anomalous helical hinge modes, colored in red.
characterized by a substantial gap. At the (010) [(010)] surface the time-reversal symmetry protected Dirac cones are gapped out [see Fig. [4b]] while the twofold rotation symmetry-protected Dirac cones at the (001) [(001)] surface are preserved [see Fig. [4c]]. Notice that Dirac cone pairs localized at opposite surface are connected by helical hinge states [see Fig. [4d]] as expected for a helical higher-order topological insulator protected by a twofold rotation symmetry.

**Conclusions** – To sum up, we have shown that weak topological insulators with an additional twofold rotation symmetry around the dark direction can appear at unpinned points in the surface Brillouin zone, we anticipate that our findings could apply to a large number of weak topological insulators.

C.O. acknowledges support from a VIDI grant (Project 680-47-543) financed by the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO). This work is part of the research programme of the Foundation for Fundamental Research on Matter (FOM), which is part of the Netherlands Organization for Scientific Research (NWO). S.K. acknowledges support from a NWO-Graduate Program grant.

---

[37] The term is $-1/2 + \cos(k_2) - \cos(k_1)]\tau_y \otimes s_x + \sin(k_2) - \sin(k_1)/2]\tau_y \otimes s_x + [\sqrt{3}/2(\cos(k_1) - 1)]\tau_y \otimes \sigma_y + \sin(k_1)\sqrt{3}/2]\tau_y \otimes s_y$. 

---

**References**

SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL

Sums of quantum spin Hall insulators

In this supplemental material we explicitly show how adding together and coupling two QSHI can result in either a fragile topological phase or a trivial phase. To this end we consider a Kane-Mele model,

\[ H_{KM}(t, t_2) = -t \left[1 + \cos(k_1) + \cos(k_2)\right] \tau_x \otimes s_0 - t \left[\sin(k_1) + \sin(k_2)\right] \tau_y \otimes s_0 + 2t_2 \sin(k_1) \tau_z \otimes s_z, \]

where \( t \) and \( t_2 \) are the nearest-neighbor and intrinsic spin-orbit coupling amplitudes, and \( \tau_i \) and \( s_i \) are Pauli matrices acting in sub-lattice and spin-space. We also add a Rashba coupling

\[ H_R = \lambda \left\{ \left[-1/2 + \cos(k_2) - \cos(k_1)\right] \tau_y \otimes s_x + \left[\sin(k_2) - \sin(k_1)/2\right] \tau_x \otimes s_x + \left[\sqrt{3}/2(\cos(k_1) - 1)\right] \tau_y \otimes \sigma_y + \left[\sin(k_1)\sqrt{3}/2\right] \tau_x \otimes s_y \right\}, \]

where \( \lambda \) is the Rashba amplitude. Note that the intrinsic spin-orbit coupling term only acts along \( k_1 \) such that threefold rotation symmetry is broken.

We now take two copies of this model, and couple them by adding a term \(-\delta \sigma_x \otimes \tau_x \otimes s_y\), where \( \delta \) is the amplitude of the coupling and \( \sigma_x \) is a Pauli matrix acting in "copy" space. Let us denote the parameters of the two copies by \( t^i \) and \( t_2^i \), where \( i = 1, 2 \) denotes the copy. To examine the phase that results from coupling the two QSHI, we consider its Wilson loop spectrum along \( k_1 \) (see main text). Let us first consider the parameters of the two Kane-Mele models to be equal and such that the system is insulating. This leads to a Wilson loop spectrum as in Fig. 5(a), showing this is an atomic insulator with two Kramers pairs at unpinned points in the BZ. Changing the sign of \( t_2 \) between the copies, such that \( t_2^1 = -t_2^2 \) and keeping the sign of \( t \) the same, results in a fragile topological phase [see Fig. 5(b)]. To obtain this phase, we can also instead change the sign of \( t \) between the copies such that \( t^1 = -t^2 \), while keeping the sign of the other parameters equal. Changing both the sign of \( t \) and \( t_2 \) between the two copies again results in the trivial phase.

Figure 5. (color online) (a) Wilson loop spectrum of two coupled Kane-Mele models for \( t_2^2/t_1^1 = t_2^1/t_1^1 = 0.7, \lambda/t_1^1 = 0.2 \) and \( \delta/t_1^1 = 0.4 \). (b) Wilson loop spectrum for the same model as in a), changing only \( t_2^1/t_1^1 = -t_2^2/t_1^1 = 0.7 \).