NORMAL SUBGROUPS OF POWERFUL \( p \)-GROUPS

JAMES WILLIAMS

Abstract. In this note we show that if \( p \) is an odd prime and \( G \) is a powerful \( p \)-group with \( N \leq G^p \) and \( N \) normal in \( G \), then \( N \) is powerfully nilpotent. An analogous result is proved for \( p = 2 \) when \( N \leq G^4 \).

1. Introduction

Powerfully nilpotent groups, introduced in [8], are a type of powerful \( p \)-group, possessing a central series of a special kind. This family of groups have a rich and beautiful structure theory. For example to each powerfully nilpotent group we can associate a quantity known as the powerful coclass, and it turns out that the rank and exponent of a powerfully nilpotent group can be bounded in terms of their powerful coclass. Many characteristic subgroups of powerful \( p \)-groups are in fact powerfully nilpotent. In [8] it is shown that if \( G \) is powerful then the proper terms of the derived and lower central series of \( G \) are powerfully nilpotent, as well as \( G^{p^i} \) for \( i \geq 1 \). In [9] the Omega subgroups of \( G^{p^i} \) are shown to be powerfully nilpotent. In this note we prove the following for odd primes \( p \):

Theorem. For an odd prime \( p \), if \( G \) is a powerful \( p \)-group and \( N \leq G^p \) with \( N \) normal in \( G \), then \( N \) is powerfully nilpotent.

For \( p = 2 \) we prove:

Theorem. If \( G \) is a powerful 2-group and \( N \leq G^4 \) with \( N \) normal in \( G \), then \( N \) is powerfully nilpotent.

This builds on the results in [8], which show that such a group \( N \) must be powerful and moreover provides an alternative proof for this fact. We also note that in [6], Mann poses the question: “Which \( p \)-groups are subgroups of powerful \( p \)-groups?” and our result provides a partial answer in this direction.

2. Preliminaries

In what follows all groups considered will be finite \( p \)-groups. First we shall recall some definitions and properties which will be used in the main part of this paper, with the aim of making this paper as self contained as possible. Recall that \( H^n = \langle x^n | x \in H \rangle \) is the subgroup generated by \( n \)th powers of elements of \( H \).

Definition. A subgroup \( N \) of a finite \( p \)-group \( G \) is powerfully embedded in \( G \) if \([N, G] \leq N^p \) for \( p \) an odd prime, or \([N, G] \leq N^4 \) if \( p = 2 \).

Definition. A finite \( p \)-group \( G \) is powerful if \([G, G] \leq G^p \) for \( p \) an odd prime, or \([G, G] \leq G^4 \) if \( p = 2 \).

Powerful \( p \)-groups were introduced in [5]. We will often make use of the following well known properties of powerful \( p \)-groups without explicit mention.
Lemma 2. [7, Lemma 3.1] If it has a powerfully central ascending chain of subgroups of powerfully nilpotent is powerfully central.

Theorem 1. Let $G$ be a powerful $p$-group, then

1. [5] Proposition 1.7] for every $k \in \mathbb{N}$ the subgroup $G^{p^k}$ coincides with the set \{ $x^{p^k} | x \in G$ \} of $p^k$th powers of elements of $G$.
2. [5] Corollary 1.2] $G^{p^k}$ is powerfully embedded in $G$ for all $k \in \mathbb{N}$.
3. [5] Corollary 1.9] Suppose that $G = \langle a_1, \ldots, a_r \rangle$ is generated by elements $a_1, \ldots, a_r$. Then $G^p = \langle a_1^p, \ldots, a_r^p \rangle$.

We also make use of the following result

Lemma 2. [7] Lemma 3.1] If $M$ and $N$ are powerfully embedded subgroups in a finite $p$-group $G$, then $[M^{p^i}, N^{p^j}] = [M, N]^{p^{i+j}}$ for all $i, j \in \mathbb{N}$.

We keep with the convention of [2] that if $G$ is a $p$-group, and $x \in G$, we define the meaning of the inequality $o(x) \leq p^i$ with $i < 0$ to be that $x = 1$. In [2], the following result is proved. This result forms an essential part of our argument, and holds for all primes $p$.

Theorem 3 (Fernández-Alcober). Let $G$ be a powerful $p$-group. Then, for every $i \geq 0$ if $x, y \in G$ are such that $o(x) \leq p^{i+1}$ and $o(y) \leq p^i$, then $o([x^{p^i}, y^{p^j}]) \leq p^{i-j-k}$ for all $j, k \geq 0$.

The following result is proved in [3].

Theorem 4. Let $G$ be a powerful $p$-group.

1. Let $p$ be an odd prime. If $N \triangleleft G$ and $N \leq G^p$ then $N$ is powerful.
2. Let $p = 2$. If $N \triangleleft G$ and $N \leq G^4$ then $N$ is powerful.

For further details on powerful $p$-groups, see [4] [5].

In [5] the notion of a powerfully nilpotent group was introduced.

Definition 5. Let $H \leq K \leq G$. An ascending chain of subgroups

$$H = H_0 \leq H_1 \leq \cdots \leq H_n = K$$

is powerfully central if $[H_i, G] \leq H_{i-1}^{p^i}$ for $i = 1, \ldots, n$. A powerful $p$-group $G$ is powerfully nilpotent if it has a powerfully central ascending chain of subgroups of the form

$$\{1\} = H_0 \leq H_1 \leq \cdots \leq H_n = G.$$

A fastest ascending powerfully central series, named the upper powerfully central series is defined recursively as follows: $\hat{Z}_0(G) = \{1\}$ and for $n \geq 1$ \[
\hat{Z}_n(G) = \{a \in G : [a, x] \in \hat{Z}_{n-1}(G)^p \text{ for all } x \in G\}.
\]

Notice in particular that $\hat{Z}_1(G) = Z(G)$.

The following result, proved in [8] Section 1, Proposition 1.1], allows us to reduce the problem of whether or not a group is powerfully nilpotent to looking at a group of exponent $p^2$.

Proposition 6. Let $G$ be any finite $p$-group, then $G$ is powerfully nilpotent if and only if $G/{G^{p^2}}$ is powerfully nilpotent.

The following reduction is also needed.

Proposition 7. $G$ is powerfully nilpotent if and only if $G/Z(G)^p$ is powerfully nilpotent.

Proof. This follows immediately from the definition of the upper powerfully central series. $\square$
3. Main Result

We begin this section with a remark on the prime \( p = 2 \). It was shown in [5], that any powerful 2-group is powerfully nilpotent. By Theorem 4, any normal subgroup of \( G \) contained within \( G^4 \) is powerful and thus will be powerfully nilpotent. However we give an alternate proof of the fact that this group is powerful, for \( p = 2 \) below, using ideas in line with the rest of this paper.

**Theorem 8.** Let \( G \) be a powerful 2-group and \( N \leq G^4 \) with \( N \) normal in \( G \). Then \( N \) is powerfully nilpotent.

**Proof.** It suffices to show that \( \frac{N}{N^2} \) is abelian. Let \( \bar{N} = \frac{N}{N^2} \) and \( \bar{G} = \frac{G}{N^2} \). Notice that \( \bar{G} \) is powerful. Consider two elements \( a, b \in \bar{N} \) and observe that the order of both elements is at most 4. Notice also that \( \bar{N} \leq \bar{G}^4 \), so we may assume \( a = g^{2^x} \) and \( b = h^{2^y} \) for some \( g, h \in \bar{G} \) as the group \( \bar{G} \) is powerful. Thus we must have \( o(g) \leq 2^4 \) and \( o(h) \leq 2^4 \). Then \([a, b] = [g^{2^x}, h^{2^y}] = 1\) by Theorem 3, setting \( x = g \), \( y = h \) and \( i = 4 \). It follows that \( \bar{N} \) is abelian and so \( N \) is a powerful 2-group. Then by the remark in [5, page 81], we know that powerful 2-groups are powerfully nilpotent and thus we have that \( N \) is powerfully nilpotent. \( \square \)

In what follows let \( p \) be an odd prime.

**Lemma 9.** If \( G \) is powerful, \( N \leq G^p \) and \( N \) has exponent at most \( p^2 \) then elements of order \( p \) in \( N \) are central in \( N \).

An equivalent result was proved in [9], but the short proof is included here for completeness.

**Proof.** This follows from Theorem 3 above. Indeed if \( g^p, h^p \in N \) and \( o(g) \leq p^2 \) and \( o(h) \leq p^3 \) then in Theorem 3 take \( i = 2 \), \( x = h \) and \( y = g \). \( \square \)

**Lemma 10.** Let \( G \) be a powerful \( p \)-group and \( N \leq G^p \) and suppose \( N \) has exponent \( p^2 \). Then any element in \( G^{p^2} \cap N \) is central in \( N \).

**Proof.** By Lemma 9 above, we know we only need to consider commutators between elements of order \( p^2 \). Suppose \( n_1 \in N \cap G^{p^2} \) and \( n_2 \in N \leq G^p \) are both of order \( p^2 \). Then we may write \( n_1 = g^{p^x} \) and \( n_2 = h^{p^y} \) for some \( g, h \in G \), where \( o(g) = p^4 \) and \( o(h) = p^3 \). Then by Theorem 3 above, we can set \( x = g \), \( y = h \) and \( i = 3 \) and we see that \([x^{p^x}, y^{p^y}] = 1\). \( \square \)

We now prove the following crucial lemma.

**Lemma 11.** Let \( G \) be a powerful \( p \)-group and let \( N \leq G^p \) where \( N \) is normal in \( G \) and the exponent of \( N \) is \( p^2 \). Then \( N \) contains an element of order \( p^2 \) which is central in \( N \).

**Proof.** First observe that by Lemma 9, we can assume that \( N \) contains at least two elements of order \( p^2 \) which do not commute with each other, or else \( N \) would be abelian and the result is trivial. Suppose these elements are \( n_1 \) and \( n_2 \). By Lemma 10 we can assume that these are in \( G^p \setminus G^{p^2} \). They are \( p \)th powers, since \( G \) is powerful, so we may write \( n_1 = a^{p^x} \) and \( n_2 = b^{p^y} \) for some \( a, b \in G \) where \( o(a) = p^3 = o(b) \). Now notice that \([b, a^{p^x}] \in N \) since \( N \) is normal in \( G \) and also observe that since \( G \) is powerful, we have that \([b, a^{p^x}] \in [G, G^p] \leq G^{p^2} \). Hence \([b, a^{p^x}] \in N \cap G^{p^2} \). We seek to show that this element has order \( p^2 \). Then the result
will follow by Lemma 11. Thus we argue by contradiction supposing that \([b,a^p]\) is of order \(p\).

We will now show that \([b,a^p]^p = [b^p,a^p]\). We first show that the subgroup 
\(M = \langle b, [b,a^p] \rangle\) is of class at most 2. Notice that \([b,a^p] \in G^{p^2}\) and so let 
\([b,a^p] = g^{p^2}\). Furthermore, since \(a^p \in N\) and \(N\) is normal in \(G\) we have that 
\([b,a^p] \in N\) and since the exponent of \(N\) is \(p^2\) we can conclude that the order of 
g is at most \(p^4\). Using Theorem 3 we see that \(o([g^{p^2},b]) \leq p^{3-2} = p\). Thus since 
\([g^{p^2},b] \in G^{p^4}\) we can let \([g^{p^2},b] = b^{p^3}\) where \(o(h) \leq p^4\).

Next notice that \([b, a^p] \in N\) and \(h^{p^3} = [[b, a^p], b] \in N\) are both of order at most \(p\), then by Lemma 9 they commute with each other. Finally we consider 
\([h^{p^3}, b] = [[[b, a^p], b], b]\). As \(o(h) \leq p^4\) and \(o(b) \leq p^2\), again appealing to Theorem 3 we see that this commutator is trivial. Hence we have that 
\([[b, a^p], b], [b, a^p]]\) and 
\([[b, a^p], b], b]\) are both trivial. We can then conclude that \(M\) has class at most 2 and 
\(M' = ([[b, a^p], b])\) is cyclic of order at most \(p\).

Since \(M\) has class 2 then \([b^p, a^p] = [b, a^p]^p \cdot [b, a^p, b]^{(2)}\) and as \(p\) is odd we have 
\(p \mid \binom{p}{2}\) and thus it follows that \([b, a^p]^p = [b^p, a^p]\). Now as we assumed that \(a^p\) and 
\(b^p\) did not commute, this means that \(o([b^p, a^p]) \geq p\). Hence we see that we must have 
\(o([b, a^p]) = p^2\), but then \([b, a^p] = g^{p^2}\) is an element of order \(p^2\) in \(N \cap G^{p^2}\) and 
so must be central in \(N\) by Lemma 10.

We can now prove the main result.

**Theorem 12.** Let \(G\) be a powerful \(p\)-group with \(p\) an odd prime. Let \(N \leq G^p\) and 
\(N \lhd G\). Then \(N\) is powerfully nilpotent.

**Proof.** The proof is by induction on the order of \(G\). The result is clearly true for 
\(|G| \leq p^2\). Suppose now that \(|G| = p^k\) with \(k > 2\) and that the claim holds for 
all smaller orders. Consider a normal subgroup \(N\) in \(G\) such that \(N \leq G^p\). We will 
show that \(N\) is powerfully nilpotent. Notice that \(N^{p^2}\) is characteristic in \(N\) and 
so is normal in \(G\). Therefore \(\frac{N}{N^{p^2}} \leq \left(\frac{G}{N^{p^2}}\right)^p\) and \(\frac{N}{N^{p^2}}\) is normal in \(G^p\). If 
\(|N^{p^2}| > 1\) then by the inductive hypothesis and Proposition 3 it would follow that 
\(N\) is powerfully nilpotent. Thus we may assume that \(|N^{p^2}| = 1\). We remark also 
that we may assume the exponent of \(N\) is precisely \(p^2\), for otherwise \(N\) would be 
abelian by Lemma 9.

Next notice that \(Z(N)^p\) is characteristic in \(N\) and so is normal in \(G\) and is contained in \(G^p\). By Lemma 11 we know that \(|Z(N)^p| \geq p\). Then observe that 
\(\frac{N}{Z(N)^{p^2}} \leq \left(\frac{G}{Z(N)^{p^2}}\right)^p\) and \(\frac{N}{Z(N)^{p^2}} \lhd \frac{G}{Z(N)^{p^2}}\) and as \(\frac{G}{Z(N)^{p^2}}\) is a group of strictly smaller order, it follows by the induction hypothesis that 
\(\frac{N}{Z(N)^{p^2}}\) is powerfully nilpotent. Then by Proposition 7 it follows that \(N\) is powerfully nilpotent.

The next corollary is immediate and shows that powerfully nilpotent groups are 
abundant within powerful \(p\)-groups.

**Corollary 13.** Let \(G\) be a powerful \(p\)-group and \(i \in \mathbb{N}\). If \(N\) is normal in \(G^{p^i}\) and 
contained within \(G^{p^{i+1}}\), then \(N\) is powerfully nilpotent.

This corollary holds for \(p = 2\) if \(G^{p^{i+1}}\) is replaced with \(G^{p^{i+2}}\).
4. Acknowledgements

The author is very grateful to Gustavo Fernández-Alcober for conjecturing the result proved in this paper and for his comments on this manuscript. The author would like to thank Gunnar Traustason for his consistently excellent supervision throughout his PhD and for noting an error in a preliminary draft of this manuscript. The author also wishes to thank Gareth Tracey for his feedback and critical reading of this paper.

References