The Grover search as a naturally occurring phenomenon

Stéphane Guillet,1 Mathieu Roget,1 Pablo Arrighi,2 and Giuseppe Di Molfetta1

1Aix-Marseille Univ, Université de Toulon, CNRS, LIS, Marseille, France
2Aix-Marseille Univ, Université de Toulon, CNRS, LIS, Marseille, France and IXXI, Lyon, France

(Dated: 17 septembre 2019)

We provide first evidence that under certain conditions, electrons may naturally behave like a Grover search, looking for defects in a material. The theoretical framework is that of discrete-time quantum walks (QW), i.e. local unitary matrices that drive the evolution of a single particle on the lattice. Some of these are well-known to recover the $(2+1)$-dimensional Dirac equation in continuum limit, i.e. the free propagation of the electron.

We study two such Dirac QW, one on the square grid and the other on a triangular grid reminiscent of graphene-like materials. The numerical simulations show that the walker localises around a defect in $O(\sqrt{N})$ steps with probability $O(1/\log N)$. This in line with previous QW formulations of the Grover search on the 2D grid. But these Dirac QW are ‘naturally occurring’. More crucially even, they require no specific oracle step, than just a hole defect in a material : this practical way of performing the oracle step could carry through to experimental implementations of QW on various substrates.

Quantum Computing has three main fields of applications for quantum computing : quantum cryptography ; quantum simulation ; and quantum algorithms (e.g. Grover, Shor...). Whilst the first two are considered short and mid term applications respectively, the last one, perhaps the most fascinating, is generally considered to be a long term application. This is because of the common understanding that we will need to build scalable implementations of universal quantum gate sets with fidelity $10^{-5}$ first, and implement quantum error corrections then, in order to finally be able to run our preferred quantum algorithm on the thereby obtained universal quantum computer. This seems feasible, yet long way to go.

In this letter we argue that this may be a pessimistic view. Scientists may get luckier than this and find out that nature actually implements some of these quantum algorithms ‘spontaneously’. Indeed, the hereby presented research suggests that the Grover search may in fact be a naturally occurring phenomenon, e.g. when fermions propagate in crystalline materials under certain conditions.

Amongst all quantum algorithms, the reasons to focus on the Grover search are many. First of all because of its remarkable generality, as it speeds up any brute force $O(N)$ problem into a $O(\sqrt{N})$ problem. Having just this quantum algorithm would already be extremely useful. Second of all, because of its remarkable robustness : the algorithm comes in many variants and has been rephrased in many ways, including in terms of resonance effects [23] and quantum walks [13].

Remember that a quantum walks (QW) are essentially local unitary gates that drive the evolution of a particle on a lattice. They have been used as a mathematical framework for different quantum algorithms [31] but also for quantum simulations e.g. [5, 14, 16]. This is where things get interesting. Indeed, it has been shown that many of these QW admit, as their continuum limit, some well-known PDE of physics, such as the Dirac equation [10, 12]. Recall that the Dirac equation governs the free propagation of the electron. Thus, these Dirac QW provided ‘quantum numerical schemes’, for the future quantum computers, to simulate the electron. For instance [21] shows that it is possible to describe the dynamics of fermions in graphene using QW. This is great, but now let us turn things the other way round : this also means that fermions provide a natural implementation of these Dirac QW. Could these be useful algorithmically?

Here we provide evidence that these Dirac QW work fine to implement the diffusion step of the Grover search. Thus, free electrons (or free fermions, or any propagating free particle—as we do not make use of canonical anticommutation relations) may provide a natural implementation of this step. Similar conclusions were reached over the square grid [26], which we extend to a triangular grid reminiscent of the naturally occurring, graphene-like materials. However, recall that the Grover search is the alternation of a diffusion step, with an oracle step. The later puts on a minus one phase whenever the walker hits the solution of the problem. Could the oracle step be naturally implemented in terms of electrons, as well?

Here we provide evidence that the mere presence of hole defect suffices to implement an effective oracle step. This second point is, on the practical side, probably more important than the previous one. Indeed, whilst there are several experimental realizations of QW, including 2D QW, often using cold atoms or photons [17, 30], these have not been considered as scalable substrates for implementing the Grover search so far—probably due to the lack of an easy way of implementing the oracle step.

This paper focusses on Dirac QW in $(2+1)$-dimensions, on both the square grid and the triangular grid. The triangular grid is of particular interest for instance because of its resemblance to several naturally occurring crystal-like materials. Moreover, it features topological phase effects which, by creating edge states around the hole defect, may help improve localization. Notice the non-Dirac Grover search has already been described on triangular grids in [2, 12] and more generally on a variety of graphs before. These spatial search yield $O(\sqrt{N \log(N)})$ time complexity algorithms [1, 26, 31]. The sole aim of this contribution is to show that simple variations of these are in fact naturally occurring phenomena—with the
we denote by \(\psi(x)\) representing the amplitude of the walker being there, which lies in the composite Hilbert space \(\mathcal{H}_2 \otimes \mathcal{H}_2\). Of course wherever two facets are glued, so are their \(Z\) positions in \(\mathbb{Z}^2\). For the square grid we can label these points by their \((x, y)\) lattice. More precisely we consider periodic tilings of the plane, where the tiles are either squares or equilateral triangles, of \(\mathbb{Z}^2\). To any such point \(x\) we assign a complex number representing the amplitude of the walker being there, which we denote by \(\psi^+(x)\) (resp. \(\psi^-(x)\)) if the tile is white (resp. grey). Of course wherever two facets are glued, so are their middle points, and so the two complex numbers form a spinor \(\psi(x) = (\psi^+(x), \psi^-(x))^T\) in \(\mathcal{H}_2\). This degree of freedom at a single point is referred to as the walker’s ‘coin’ or ‘spin’.

For the full square grid, the overall state of the walker therefore lies in the composite Hilbert space \(\mathcal{H}_2 \otimes \mathcal{H}_2\), and can be written \(|\psi\rangle = \sum_x \psi^-(x) |v_--\rangle \otimes |x\rangle + \psi^+(x) |v_+\rangle \otimes |x\rangle\). For the full triangular grid the amplitude of one in every two position needs be zero. For a grid with a missing white (resp. grey) tile the corresponding \(\psi^+(x)\) (resp. \(\psi^-(x)\)) for \(x\) on a side of the tile, need be zero.

The class of evolution operators that we consider in this paper are QW of the form:

\[
|\psi(t + \epsilon/l)\rangle = WR|\psi(t)\rangle
\]

with \(l = 2\) for the square grid and \(l = 3\) for the triangular grid. Here, \(R\) stands for the synchronous anti-clockwise rotation of all tiles. Notice that, wherever there is no missing tile, the simultaneous rotations of the two tiles glued at \(x\) precisely implement a partial shift \(T_{k,\epsilon}\) along a direction \(u_k\):

\[
T_{k,\epsilon} \left( \begin{array}{c} \psi^+(x) \\ \psi^-(x) \end{array} \right) = \left( \begin{array}{c} \psi^+(x + u_k \epsilon) \\ \psi^-(x - u_k \epsilon) \end{array} \right)
\]

Moreover, \(W\) stands for the synchronous application of a \(2 \times 2\) unitary \(W(x)\) on the spins \(\psi(x)\). This unitary depends on \(x\) only in a very simple way which we now clarify. First of all, if it so happens that a tile is missing at \(x\), then the spinor \(\psi(x)\) is incomplete, and so \(W(x) = 1\). Second of all, if there is no missing tile, then \(W(x) = W_k\), where the \(k\) is that corresponding to the partial translation direction \(u_k\) occurring at \(x\).

It follows that, in the case of a full grid, any given walker will undergo \(T_{k,\epsilon}\) and then \(W_k\) for \(k = 1 \ldots l\) successively, amounting to

\[
|\psi(t + \epsilon)\rangle = \Pi_k W_k T_{k,\epsilon} |\psi(t)\rangle.
\]

The way we choose these \(W_k\) is so that QW is Dirac QW, meaning that

\[
\Pi_k W_k T_{k,\epsilon} \approx \exp(i\epsilon H_D)
\]

as we neglect the second order terms in \(\epsilon\), with \(H_D\) the Dirac Hamiltonian in natural \(h = c = 1\) units, i.e.

\[
H_D = p_x \sigma_x + p_y \sigma_y + m \sigma_z.
\]

Therefore, on the full grid, these QW simulate the Dirac Eq., thereby mimicking the free propagation of the electron more and more closely as \(\epsilon\) goes to zero.

**Square grid.** Let us consider the unit vectors along the \(x\)-axis and \(y\)-axis, namely \(\{u_0, u_1, u_2\}\) and use them to specify the directions of the translations \(T_{x,\epsilon}\) and \(T_{y,\epsilon}\). Eq. (1) then reads:

\[
U = W_x T_{y,\epsilon} W_y T_{x,\epsilon}
\]

where \(W_k = \exp(i\sigma_k \theta_k)\) with \(\theta_k = \pm(k\pi \pm \epsilon m)\) and \(m\) is real constant, namely the mass. In the formal limit for \(\epsilon \to 0\), the Eq. recovers the Dirac Hamiltonian in \((2 + 1)\)-spacetime. Iterates of the walk observationally converge towards solutions of the Dirac Eq., as was proven in full rigour in [7].

**Triangular lattice.** For the triangular lattice let us consider the unit vectors \(\{u_0, u_1, u_2\}\), as in Fig. 1 and defined by

\[
u_k = \cos \left( \frac{2k\pi}{3} \right) u_x + \sin \left( \frac{2k\pi}{3} \right) u_y \text{ for } k = 0, 1, 2.
\]

and use them to specify the directions of the translations \(T_{k,\epsilon}\). Eq. (1) then reads:

\[
e^{-i\epsilon H_D} = WT_{2x} W T_{1x} W T_{0x}
\]

with \(W = e^{i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_y} e^{-i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_x} e^{-i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_y} e^{-i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_x} e^{i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_y} e^{i\frac{\epsilon}{2} \sigma_x}\), the coin operator, which turns out not to depend on the direction \(u_k\). In [6] it has been proved in detail by some of the authors how this particular choice also leads, in the continuum limit, to the Dirac Hamiltonian in \((2 + 1)\)-spacetime.

**Defects.** A sector of a crystallographic lattice may be inaccessible, e.g. due to surface defects such as the vacancy of an atom (e.g. Schottky point defect) and others. These affect the physical and chemical properties of the material, including electrical resistivity or conductivity. In fact all real solids are impure with about one impurity per \(10^6\) atoms [20].
Here we model these defects in the simplest possible way: locally, a small number of squares or triangles are missing—thereby breaking the translation invariance of the lattice. In other words, the walker is forbidden access to a ball \( B \) of unit radius, as in Fig. 2. This is done by reflecting those signals that reach the boundary \( \partial B \) of the ball, simply by letting \( W = I \) on the facets around \( \partial B \).

**Edge states.** Wherever we replace the coin \( W \) by identity, both Dirac walks reduce to just anti-clockwise rotation \( R \) as in Eq. , see Fig. 1. Still, the operators and may have different topological properties around \( \partial B \). For instance, the square grid QW has vanishing Chern number and trivial topological properties [22] for vanishing \( m \), which can still become non-trivial from \( m > 0 \) [9]. The triangular walk on the other hand is always topologically non-trivial and has Chern number equal to one [23]. In the triangular case the positive and negative component decouple respectively in the grey and the white triangles, and may be thought of as inducing polarized local topological currents of spin, called edge states [32]. According to [32], this phenomenon will be observed whenever initial states have an overlap with \( \partial B \), elsewhere the walker does not localize and explores the lattice with ballistic speed. Thus, we expect these topological effects to play a role in the triangular case only.

Our conjecture is that, starting from a uniformly superposed wavefunction, the walker will, in finite time, localize around the hole defect in \( O(\sqrt{N}) \) steps, with probability in \( O(1/\log(N)) \), with \( N \) the total number of squares/triangles. In the following we discuss the numerical evidence we have for such a conjecture.

**GROVER SEARCH**

Our numerical simulations over the square and triangular grids are exactly in line with a series of results [1, 13, 13, 31] showing that 2D spatial search can be performed in \( O(\sqrt{N}) \) steps with a probability of success in \( O(1/\log(N)) \). With \( O(\log(N)) \) repetitions of the experiment one makes the success probability an \( O(1) \), yielding an overall complexity of \( O(\sqrt{N} \log N) \). Making use of quantum amplitude amplification [11], however, one just needs \( O(\sqrt{\log N}) \) repetitions of the experiment in order to make the probability an \( O(1) \), yielding an overall complexity of \( O(\sqrt{N \log N}) \). This bound is unlikely to be improved, given the strong arguments given by [24]. In particular [25, 29] explain why the extra \( \sqrt{\log N} \), with respect to Grover’s original algorithm, is unlikely to be removed.

These works were not using Dirac QW, nor defects. Our aim here is demonstrate that QW which recover the Dirac equation, also perform a Grover search, as they propagate over the discrete surface and localize around its defects. More concretely we proceed as follows: (i) Prepare, as the initial state the wavefunction which is uniformly superposed over every square or triangle, and whose coin degree of freedom is also the uniformly superposed \((|v^+\rangle + |v^-\rangle)/\sqrt{2}\). Notice that amplitude inside the hole defect is zero; (ii) Let the walker evolve with time; (iii) Quantify the number of steps \( t \) before the walker reaches its peak probability \( p \) of being localized in a ball of radius 2 around the center of the hole defect, and estimate this probability; (iv) Characterize \( t(N) \) and \( p(N) \), i.e. the way the peak recurrence time and the peak probability depend upon the total number of squares/triangles \( N \).

We indeed observe that the probability of being found around the hole defect has a periodic behavior, see in Fig. 3: for instance over a square lattice of \( N = 2500 \) sites, for \( m = 0 \), the peak recurrence time is at \( t \sim 25 \), with maximum probability is \( p \sim 10^{-1} \). The dependencies in \( N \) were interpolated from the data set shown Fig. 4. We observe that \( t(N) = \sqrt{N} \) and \( p(N) \approx 1/\log N \) asymptotically, with a prefactor depending upon \( m \). In this massless case the interpolation \( p(N) \approx 1/\log N \) works right-away. As the mass gets larger, the curve remains longer along \( p(N) \approx 1/N \), before it enters its asymptotic \( p(N) \approx 1/\log N \) regime.
FIGURE 4: Square grid scalings. Peak probability of being localized around the hole defect, versus the number of squares in the grid. The inset shows the peak recurrence time.

FIGURE 5: Triangular grid scalings. Recurring peak probability of being localized around the hole defect, versus the number of triangles in the grid. The inset shows the peak recurrence time.

FIGURE 6: Triangular grid edge states appearance. First peak probability of being localized around the hole defect, versus the number of triangles in the grid. The inset shows the occurring time of this first peak.

Clearly, repeating the experiment an $O(\log N)$ number of times will make the probability of finding the hole defect as close to 1 as desired, leading to an overall time complexity in $O(\sqrt{N \log N})$. Again we could, instead, propose to use quantum amplitude amplification [11] in order to bring the needed number of repetitions down an $O(\sqrt{\log N})$, leading to an overall time complexity in $O(\sqrt{N \log N})$. But it seems that this would defeat the purpose of this paper to some extent: since our aim is to show that there is a ‘natural implementation’ of the Grover search, we must not rely on higher-level routines such as quantum amplitude amplification.

Over the triangular grid the situation is slightly more intricate, as two phenomena seem to coexist. On the one hand, the Grover search is again at play. Indeed the data set of Fig. 5 confirms the results obtained over the square grid: the peak recurrence time is again $t(N) \simeq O(\sqrt{N})$, and its corresponding peak probability is again $p(N) \simeq O(1/\log N)$ for large $N$, although this time with a prefactor that depends upon the mass. Again this leads to an overall complexity of $O(\sqrt{N \log N})$, or $O(\sqrt{N \log N})$ using amplitude amplification.

On the other hand, a topological effect is at play. Indeed, an edge state rapidly appears, on the boundary $\partial B$ of the hole defect. This first peak’s probability also seems to scale as $p'(N) \simeq O(1/\log N)$, but with an occurrence time $t'_m$ which is constant in $N$ whenever $m > 0$. At first this seems extremely promising, suggesting that the hole defect may be found in $O(\log N)$, breaking Grover’s optimality bound. On second thoughts one realizes that this is overoptimistic, and that this scaling cannot hold for large $N$. Indeed, if the first peak’s occurrence time $t'_m$ is constant, then its amplitude can only ever be drawn from the $\pi t'_m^{-2}$ adjacent sites, each of which started with probability $1/N$. Summing them all yields $\pi t'_m^{-2}/N$. Thus $p'(N)$ is, in the long run an $O(1/N)$: the first peak brings no complexity advantage. By augmenting the mass as a function of $N$, one can augment $t'_m(N)$ and escape this upper bound, but then $t'_m(N)$ needs again be an $O(\sqrt{N})$. Still, at the technical level it may be advantageous, for instance, to tune the mass so that $t'_m(N)$ equals $t(N)$ and have both the Grover search effect and the topological effect interfere constructively.
CONCLUSION

It is now common knowledge that Quantum Walks (QW) implement the Grover search, and that some QW mimic the propagation of the free electron, as well as other fermions [8] [16] and ballistically propagating quantum particles in general [4] [10], since multi particle statistics do not matter to the one-particle sector. Yet, could this mean that these particles naturally implement the Grover search? Answering this question positively may be the path to a serious technological leap, whereby experimentalist would bypass the need for a full-fledged scalable and error-correcting Quantum Computer, and take the shortcut of looking for ‘natural occurrences' of the Grover search instead. So far, however, this idea has remained unexplored. The QW used to implement the Grover diffusion step were unrelated to the Dirac QW used to simulate the electron, with the noticeable exception of [26]. More crucially, the Grover oracle step seemed like a rather artificial, involved controlled-phase, far from something that could occur in nature. This contribution begins to remedy both these objections.

Indeed, we used Dirac QW over both the triangular and the square grid as the Grover diffusion step. Instead of alternating this with an extrinsic oracle step, we coded for the solution directly inside the grid, by introducing a hole defect. We obtained strong numerical evidence showing that the Dirac QW localize around the hole defect in $O(\sqrt{N})$ steps with probability $O(1/\log N)$, just like previous QW implementations of the Grover search would. We observed how sometimes topological effects come into play that may be of technical help.

Our next step is to use QW to locate not just a hole defect, but a particular QR code-like defect, amongst many possible others that could be present on the lattice. This would bring us one step closer to a natural implementation of an unstructured database Grover search. Indeed, replacing the Grover oracle step by surface defects seems way more practical in terms of experimental realizations, whatever the substrate, possibly even in a biological setting [27].

Acknowledgements

The authors acknowledge inspiring conversations with Fabrice Debbasch, that sparked the idea of Grover searching for surface defects; enlightening discussions on topological effects with Alberto Verga; and useful remarks on how to better present this work by Janos Asboth, Tapabrata Ghosh, Apoorva Patel. This work has been funded by the Pépinière d’Excellence 2018, AMIDEX fondation, project DiTiQuS.

References

[20] Harald Ibach and Hans Lüth. Solid-State Physics : An Introduc-


