Generation of off-critical zeros for hypercubic Epstein zeta-functions

Igor Travênc1 and Ladislav Šamaj1

1Institute of Physics, Slovak Academy of Sciences, Dúbravská cesta 9, 84511 Bratislava, Slovakia

We study the Epstein zeta-function formulated on the $d$-dimensional hypercubic lattice,

$$
\zeta(d)(s) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n_1, \ldots, n_d} (n_1^2 + \cdots + n_d^2)^{-s/2} \quad \text{where} \quad \Re(s) > d \quad \text{and the summation runs over all integers excluding the origin.}
$$

An analytical continuation of the Epstein function to the whole complex $s$-plane is constructed for spatial dimension $d$ being a continuous variable ranging from 0 to $\infty$. We are interested in zeros $\rho = \rho_x + i\rho_y$ defined by $\zeta(d)(\rho) = 0$. Besides the trivial zeros, there exist “critical” zeros (on the critical line) with $\rho_x = \frac{d^2}{2}$ and “off-critical” zeros (off the critical line) with $\rho_x \neq \frac{d^2}{2}$. Our numerical results reveal that critical zeros form closed or semi-open curves $\rho_y(d)$ which enclose disjunctive regions of the complex plane ($\rho_x = \frac{d^2}{2}, \rho_y$). Each curve involves a number of left/right edge points $\rho^*$, defined by an infinite tangent $d\rho_y/d\rho_x|_{\rho^*}$, which give rise to two conjugate tails of off-critical zeros with continuously varying dimension $d$. The curves of critical and off-critical zeros exhibit a singular expansion around edge points whose derivation resembles to the one around a critical point of mean-field type (with exponent $\frac{1}{2}$ for the order parameter) in many-body statistical models. Further it turns out that for each $d > 9.24555\ldots$ there exists a conjugate pair of real off-critical zeros which tend to the boundaries 0 and $d$ of the critical strip in the limit $d \to \infty$. As a by-product of the formalism, we derive an exact result for $\lim_{d \to 0} \zeta(d)(s)/d$ and an equidistant distribution of critical zeros along the imaginary axis in the limit $d \to \infty$.

1. Introduction

Let two particles at distance $r$ interact via the Riesz potential $V_s(r) = 1/r^s$ with real $s$ [1]. In an infinite $d$-dimensional space, the case $s = d − 2$ corresponds to the Coulomb potential. If the particles are placed...
equidistantly (with unit lattice spacing) on an infinite line and interact pairwisely by the Riesz potential, the energy per particle is given by the Riemann zeta-function

\[
\zeta(s) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{1}{|n|^s} = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^s}, \quad s > 1.
\]

(1.1)

where the prefactor \(1/2\) comes from the fact that each pair energy is shared by two particles and the prime in the first sum means omission of the self-energy \(n=0\) term from the set of integer \(n\). This function can be analytically continued to the whole complex \(s\)-plane. The Riemann zeta-function plays a fundamental role in algebraic number theory. The Riemann hypothesis about the location of its nontrivial zeros exclusively on the critical line \(\Re(s) = \frac{1}{2}\) is one of the Hilbert and Clay Millennium Prize problems. ZetaZeros are tabulated in the symbolic language Mathematica. The zeta-function and its various generalisations have numerous applications in mathematics (prime numbers, applied statistics) and physics (dynamical systems, regularization in QFT, Casimir effect).

If the particles sit on the vertices of the \(d\)-dimensional hypercubic lattice with unit spacing, the energy per particle is given by the hypercubic Epstein zeta-function

\[
\zeta^{(d)}(s) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n_1,n_2,\ldots,n_d} \frac{1}{(n_1^2 + n_2^2 + \ldots + n_d^2)^{s/2}}, \quad \Re(s) > d,
\]

(1.2)

where the self-energy term \((0,\ldots,0)\) is excluded from the summation and spatial dimension \(d\) is a positive integer. This function can be analytically continued (regularized) to the critical strip \(0 < \Re(s) < d\) by various methods. One of the methods is based on the fact that if the particles charges change signs periodically so that the system is electrically neutral, the appropriate lattice sums converge for all \(\Re(s) > 0\) except for \(s=d\) [5]. Since the hypercubic lattice is self-dual, one can use a functional relation that connects the lattice sums for \(s\to d-s\) and thus get an analytic continuation from \(\Re(s) > d\) to \(\Re(s) < 0\) [5], although the region \(\Re(s) < 0\) is problematic from the point of view of physical applications.

The critical line is defined by \(\Re(s) = \frac{d}{2}\). We are interested in zeros \(\rho = \rho_x + i\rho_y\) defined by \(\zeta^{(d)}(\rho) = 0\). Besides the trivial zeros at \(\rho = -2, -4, \ldots\), there exist “critical” zeros (on the critical line) with \(\rho_x = \frac{d}{2}\) and “off-critical” zeros (off the critical line) with \(\rho_x \neq \frac{d}{2}\). We label the nontrivial zeros as the critical and off-critical ones to simplify the notation.

For dimensions \(d = 2, 4, 6\) and 8, the Epstein zeta-functions can be expressed in terms of one-dimensional sums [6].

For \(d = 2\), it holds that

\[
\zeta^{(2)}(s) = 2 \zeta\left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \beta\left(\frac{s}{2}\right),
\]

\[
\beta(x) = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{(-1)^k}{(2k+1)^x} = \frac{1}{2\pi^x} \left[ \zeta\left(x, \frac{1}{4}\right) - \zeta\left(x, \frac{3}{4}\right) \right],
\]

(1.3)

where \(\zeta(x,a) = \sum_{n=0}^{\infty} (n + a)^{-x}\) is the Hurwitz zeta-function and \(\beta(x)\) is the Dirichlet beta-function which is a special case of Dirichlet \(L\)-series [5]. Zeros of this function are localized on the critical line \(\Re(x) = \frac{1}{2}\) [7], so that the nontrivial zeros of \(\zeta^{(2)}(s)\) are constrained to the critical line \(\Re(s) = 1\).

For \(d = 4\), the Epstein zeta-function is expressible as

\[
\zeta^{(4)}(s) = 4 \left(1 - 2^{-2s}\right) \zeta\left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \zeta\left(\frac{s}{2} - 1\right).
\]

(1.4)

The critical zeros are given by \(2^{\rho-\rho} = 1\), i.e. \(\rho = 2 + 2\pi ik/\ln 2\ (k = 0, \pm 1, \pm 2, \ldots\). There are also off-critical zeros lying on the lines \(\rho_x = 1\) and \(\rho_x = 3\).
For $d = 6$, it holds that
\[
\zeta^{(6)}(s) = 8 \beta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 2\right) - 2 \beta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 2\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right). \tag{1.5}
\]

Besides the critical zeros on the axis $\Re(s) = 3$, there exist off-critical zeros accumulated in specific regions of the complex plane.

For $d = 8$,
\[
\zeta^{(8)}(s) = \left(1 - 2^{1-s/2} + 4^{2-s/2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 3\right). \tag{1.6}
\]

Critical zeros are given by $2^{1-\rho/2} - 4^{2-\rho/2} = 1$, the off-critical ones are localized on the axes $\rho_x = 1$ and $\rho_x = 7$.

Many works are devoted to the study of the distribution of critical zeros for general two-dimensional periodic structures, see e.g. references [8,9].

For small odd dimensions only approximate formulas with controlled remainders were found [10]. General results about the zero-distribution of the Epstein function were derived in [11,12]. At integer dimensions $d$, a fast numerical algorithm for the evaluation of the Epstein zeta-function in the entire $s$-plane was developed in [13].

Critical zeros of the Epstein zeta-function are confined to the critical line $\Re(s) = \frac{d}{2}$ and therefore it is relatively simple to find numerically their imaginary positions. On the other hand, to find blindly the positions of all off-critical zeros is a hopeless task. The aim of this paper is to establish a generation mechanism of off-critical zeros from the critical ones with a specific topology. Our numerical results reveal that critical zeros form closed or semi-open curves which enclose disjunctive regions of the complex space ($\rho_x = \frac{4}{d}, \rho_y$). Each curve involves a finite number of special left/right “edge” points which give rise to two tails of off-critical zeros, conjugate by a symmetry, with continuously varying dimension $d$. The curves of critical and off-critical zeros exhibit a singular expansion around the critical edge points whose derivation resembles to the one around a critical point in many-body statistical models. Various versions of the generation mechanism are discussed. It turns out that for each $d > 9.24555 \ldots$ there exists a conjugate pair of real off-critical zeros which tend to 0 and $d$ in the limit $d \to \infty$. As a by-product of the formalism, we derive an exact result for $\lim_{d \to 0} \zeta^{(d)}(s)/d$ and an equidistant distribution of critical zeros along the imaginary axis in the limit $d \to \infty$.

The paper is organized as follows. An analytical continuation of the Epstein function to the whole complex $s$-plane is constructed in §2 for spatial dimension $d$ being a continuous variable ranging from 0 to $\infty$. Basic formulas for zeros of the Epstein function, together with specific sum rules, are given in §3. The exact solution of the limit $d \to 0$ and the distribution of critical zeros for $d \to \infty$ are studied in §4. §5 deals with numerical evaluation of the curves of critical zeros and a singular expansion of these curves around edge points. §6 describes the generation mechanism of off-critical zeros from any critical edge point. Analytical formulas derived close to the edge points are tested numerically. The concluding §7 brings a short recapitulation and open questions.

2. Regularization in $d$ dimensions

(a) $\Re(s) > d$

The lattice-sum representation (1.2) of $\zeta^{(d)}(s)$ is defined for $\Re(s) > d$. Using the standard $\Gamma$-identity
\[
\frac{1}{\Gamma^s} = \frac{1}{(\Gamma^s)^{s/2}} = \frac{1}{\Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt \, t^{s-1} e^{-t^2}, \tag{2.1}
\]

For $d = 6$, it holds that
\[
\zeta^{(6)}(s) = 8 \beta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 2\right) - 2 \beta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 2\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right). \tag{1.5}
\]

Besides the critical zeros on the axis $\Re(s) = 3$, there exist off-critical zeros accumulated in specific regions of the complex plane.

For $d = 8$,
\[
\zeta^{(8)}(s) = \left(1 - 2^{1-s/2} + 4^{2-s/2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2}\right) \zeta \left(\frac{s}{2} - 3\right). \tag{1.6}
\]

Critical zeros are given by $2^{1-\rho/2} - 4^{2-\rho/2} = 1$, the off-critical ones are localized on the axes $\rho_x = 1$ and $\rho_x = 7$.

Many works are devoted to the study of the distribution of critical zeros for general two-dimensional periodic structures, see e.g. references [8,9].

For small odd dimensions only approximate formulas with controlled remainders were found [10]. General results about the zero-distribution of the Epstein function were derived in [11,12]. At integer dimensions $d$, a fast numerical algorithm for the evaluation of the Epstein zeta-function in the entire $s$-plane was developed in [13].

Critical zeros of the Epstein zeta-function are confined to the critical line $\Re(s) = \frac{d}{2}$ and therefore it is relatively simple to find numerically their imaginary positions. On the other hand, to find blindly the positions of all off-critical zeros is a hopeless task. The aim of this paper is to establish a generation mechanism of off-critical zeros from the critical ones with a specific topology. Our numerical results reveal that critical zeros form closed or semi-open curves which enclose disjunctive regions of the complex space ($\rho_x = \frac{4}{d}, \rho_y$). Each curve involves a finite number of special left/right “edge” points which give rise to two tails of off-critical zeros, conjugate by a symmetry, with continuously varying dimension $d$. The curves of critical and off-critical zeros exhibit a singular expansion around the critical edge points whose derivation resembles to the one around a critical point in many-body statistical models. Various versions of the generation mechanism are discussed. It turns out that for each $d > 9.24555 \ldots$ there exists a conjugate pair of real off-critical zeros which tend to 0 and $d$ in the limit $d \to \infty$. As a by-product of the formalism, we derive an exact result for $\lim_{d \to 0} \zeta^{(d)}(s)/d$ and an equidistant distribution of critical zeros along the imaginary axis in the limit $d \to \infty$.

The paper is organized as follows. An analytical continuation of the Epstein function to the whole complex $s$-plane is constructed in §2 for spatial dimension $d$ being a continuous variable ranging from 0 to $\infty$. Basic formulas for zeros of the Epstein function, together with specific sum rules, are given in §3. The exact solution of the limit $d \to 0$ and the distribution of critical zeros for $d \to \infty$ are studied in §4. §5 deals with numerical evaluation of the curves of critical zeros and a singular expansion of these curves around edge points. §6 describes the generation mechanism of off-critical zeros from any critical edge point. Analytical formulas derived close to the edge points are tested numerically. The concluding §7 brings a short recapitulation and open questions.

2. Regularization in $d$ dimensions

(a) $\Re(s) > d$

The lattice-sum representation (1.2) of $\zeta^{(d)}(s)$ is defined for $\Re(s) > d$. Using the standard $\Gamma$-identity
\[
\frac{1}{\Gamma^s} = \frac{1}{(\Gamma^s)^{s/2}} = \frac{1}{\Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt \, t^{s-1} e^{-t^2}, \tag{2.1}
\]
the Epstein function can be reexpressed as

\[
\zeta^{(d)}(s) = \frac{1}{2 \Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt \, t^{s/2-1} \exp \left( \sum_{n_1, n_2, \ldots, n_d = -\infty}^{\infty} e^{-(n_1^2 + n_2^2 + \ldots + n_d^2) t} - 1 \right)
\]

(2.2)

where the Jacobi elliptic function with zero argument \( \theta_3(0, q) \equiv \theta_3(q) = \sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} q^{n^2} \) was introduced [14] and \(-1\) subtracts the summand with \( n_1 = n_2 = \ldots = n_d = 0 \). The last integral in (2.2) is known as the Mellin transform of the function in the square bracket.

The elliptic theta function \( \theta_3(e^{-t}) \) exhibits the following small-\( t \) and large-\( t \) expansions:

\[
\theta_3(e^{-t}) \sim \frac{\pi}{t} \left( 1 + 2e^{-\pi^2/t} + \cdots \right), \quad \theta_3(e^{-t}) \sim 1 + 2e^{-\pi^2} + \cdots \quad (2.3)
\]

The function under integration in (2.2) is integrable at large \( t \) and behaves like \( t^{s/2-1} e^{-t-d/2} \) for \( t \to 0 \), so the real part of the power must be greater than \(-1\) which yields the original restriction \( \Re(s) > d \).

To derive another representation of (2.2), we first substitute \( t = \pi t' \) and then split the integration interval into \( 0 < t' < 1 \) and \( 1 < t' < \infty \), to obtain

\[
\frac{2 \Gamma(s/2)}{\pi^{s/2}} \zeta^{(d)}(s) = \int_0^1 dt \, t^{s/2-1} \left[ \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - 1 \right] + \int_1^\infty dt \, t^{s/2-1} \left[ \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - 1 \right].
\]

(2.4)

The Poisson summation formula

\[
\sum_n e^{-(n+\phi)^2 t} = \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{t}} \sum_n e^{2\pi in \phi} e^{-(\pi n)^2/t}
\]

(2.5)

yields the following relation for the Jacobi theta function

\[
\theta_3(e^{-\pi t}) \equiv \sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} e^{-n^2 \pi t} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{t}} \sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} e^{-n^2 \pi/t} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{\pi t}} \theta_3(e^{-\pi/t}).
\]

(2.6)

Applying this equality in the last integral of equation (2.4) and afterwards using the substitution \( t = 1/t' \), one finds that

\[
\int_0^1 \frac{dt}{t} \, t^{s/2} \left[ \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - 1 \right] = \int_0^1 \frac{dt}{t} \, (t^{d-s}/2) \left[ \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - t^{-d/2} \right].
\]

(2.7)

As the next step, one adds \(-t^{-d/2} + t^{-d/2}\) in the square bracket of the first integral on the rhs of (2.4) and integrates explicitly the remaining term \(-1 + t^{-d/2}\), which can be done for \( \Re(s) > d \).

The final formula reads as

\[
\pi^{-s/2} \Gamma \left( \frac{s}{2} \right) \zeta^{(d)}(s) = -\frac{1}{s} - \frac{1}{d-s} + \frac{1}{2} \int_0^1 \frac{dt}{t} \, (t^{s/2} + t^{(d-s)/2}) \left[ \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - t^{-d/2} \right].
\]

(2.8)

By using the first relation in (2.3), the difference \( \theta_3^2(e^{-\pi t}) - t^{-d/2} \) is a constant for \( t \to 0 \) and the integral on the rhs converges for any complex \( s \). The representation (2.8) is therefore an analytic continuation of (2.2) to the whole complex plane, except for the singular \( s = d \) point. The limit \( s \to 0 \) does not represent any problem as the singularity \(-1/s\) on the rhs has a counterpart \( \Gamma(s/2) \sim 2/\pi s \) on the lhs, so that \( \zeta^{(d)}(0) = -1/2 \) for any \( d \).

Although the representation (2.8) can be used for any complex \( s \), in what follows we shall propose other analytic continuations of the basic formula (2.2) to the region \( \Re(s) < d \) which all lead to the same representation (2.8).
(b) $0 < \Re(s) < d$

To ensure the convergence of $\zeta(d)(s)$ for $0 < \Re(s) < d$, it is useful to “neutralize” particle systems in the way it is often made in Coulomb systems [15].

One possibility is to introduce the opposite charges on one half of the sites by inserting the factor $(-1)^{n_1}$ or $(-1)^{n_1+n_2}$, etc. into the sum (1.2) and then express $\zeta(d)(s)$ by using these finite expressions [5]. To get such expressions in a compact form, let us introduce another Jacobi theta function $\theta_4(q) = \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} (-1)^n q^n$.The function $\theta_4(e^{-t})$ exhibits the following small-$t$ and large-$t$ expansions:

$$
\theta_4(e^{-t}) \sim \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{t}} e^{-\pi^2/(4t)} + \cdots, \quad \theta_4(e^{-t}) \sim 1 - 2e^{-t} + \cdots. \tag{2.9}
$$

One of the equalities fulfilled by Jacobi theta functions reads as [5,16]

$$
\theta_3(q) = \frac{1}{2} \left[ \theta_3 \left( q^{1/4} \right) + \theta_4 \left( q^{1/4} \right) \right]. \tag{2.10}
$$

Replacing $\theta_4^d(e^{-t})$ in (2.2) by using this formula, substituting $t' = t/4$, using the binomial expansion formula and finally putting $\left( \frac{d}{2} \right) \theta_4^d(e^{-t}) - 1$ on lhs, one arrives at

$$
\zeta(d)(s) = \frac{1}{2^d \Gamma(s/2)(2d-s-1)} \int_0^\infty dt t^{s/2-1} \left[ \sum_{n=1}^{d} \frac{d}{n} \theta_3^{-n} (e^{-t}) \theta_4^{d-n}(e^{-t}) - n^d + 1 \right]. \tag{2.11}
$$

For large $t$, the expression in the square bracket $\simeq -2d e^{-t}$ which, when multiplied by $t^{s/2-1}$, is an integrable function. The small-$t$ asymptotic formula (2.9) for $\theta_4(e^{-t})$ ensures that the integral on the rhs converges for $\Re(s) > 0$. This approach was formulated for $d = 3$ in [5].

Another more direct way to regularize the Epstein zeta-function is the introduction of a homogeneous neutralizing background which cancels an infinite constant (divergence) from the summation. This procedure was explained in detail for the three-dimensional Coulomb potential ($s = 1$) at $d = 2$ in reference [15]. The generalisation of the derivation to any $d$ and $s$ leads to the addition of a background term $-(\pi/t)^{d/2}$ in the square bracket of the integrated function in (2.2),

$$
\zeta(d)(s) = \frac{1}{2^d \Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt t^{s/2-1} \left[ \theta_3^d \left( e^{-t} \right) - 1 - \left( \frac{\pi}{t} \right)^{d/2} \right], \quad 0 < \Re(s) < d. \tag{2.12}
$$

The addition of the background term exactly cancels the leading term of the expansion of $\theta_3^d(e^{-t})$ at small $t$, see the first relation in (2.3), removing in this way the divergence of the integral. The term $-t^{s/2-1}$ is integrable at small-$t$ for $\Re(s) > 0$ which corresponds to the lower bound in (2.12). The term dominant at large $t$ is proportional to $t^{-1+(s-d)/2}$ and it is integrable for $\Re(s) < d$ which corresponds to the upper bound in (2.12).

To confirm the consistency of the formalism, one can repeat the derivation of (2.11) starting from (2.12), now putting the combination $\theta_3^d(e^{-t}) - 1 - (\pi/t)^{d/2}$ on lhs.

Starting from (2.12), one can also apply the procedure analogous to that between equations (2.4) and (2.7). Integrating explicitly the $-1$ terms in the last step, we arrive at the same formula (2.8) as before, confirming its validity also for $0 < \Re(s) < d$.

(c) $\Re(s) \leq 0$

We keep the term $n_1 = n_2 = \ldots = n_d = 0$ in the sum in (1.2) for $\Re(s) < 0$, as the summand $r^{-s}$ vanishes automatically for $r = 0$. On the other hand, the neutralising background term must be present to ensure the convergence of the lattice sum, so that

$$
\zeta(d)(s) = \frac{1}{2^d \Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt t^{s/2-1} \left[ \theta_3^d \left( e^{-t} \right) - \left( \frac{\pi}{t} \right)^{d/2} \right], \quad \Re(s) < 0. \tag{2.13}
$$

While the function under integration is always integrable in the region of small-$t$, its large-$t$ limit $t^{s/2-1}$ is integrable for $\Re(s) < 0$ which corresponds to the upper bound in (2.13). Starting from the
representation (2.13) and repeating the steps presented in §2(a), we recover the universal relation (2.8) valid in the whole complex s-plane.

(d) Functional relation and non-integer values of d

Another property of the crucial relation (2.8) is that its rhs is invariant under the transformation $s \rightarrow \text{d} - s$. This symmetry implies the well-known functional relation for the self-dual hypercubic lattices [4]

$$
\pi^{-s/2} \Gamma\left(\frac{d}{2}\right) \zeta^{(d)}(s) = \pi^{-(d-s)/2} \Gamma\left(\frac{d-s}{2}\right) \zeta^{(d-s)}(d-s).
$$

(2.14)

This relation provides an analytical continuation of the lattice sum (1.2) from the region $\Re(s) > \text{d}$ to $\Re(s) < 0$ and it can serve as another check of validity of the representation (2.13).

While the original lattice-sum representation of the Epstein function (1.2) as well as the representation (2.11) are defined only for positive integer values of dimension $d$, $d$ can change continuously from 0 to $\infty$ in (2.8). The possibility to treat non-integer values of $d$, including the limit $d \rightarrow 0$, is of fundamental importance in this work.

3. Definition of zeros, sum rules

The “trivial” zeros are related to the divergence of the Gamma functions $\Gamma(s/2)$ at $s = -2n$ ($n = 1, 2, \ldots$). The rhs of equation (2.8) does not exhibit any zeros at these trivial points.

The “critical” zeros (on the critical line) have $\rho_x = \frac{d}{2}$. Inserting $\rho = \frac{d}{2} + i\rho_y$ into the rhs of (2.8), the expression becomes real and its nullity determines the imaginary component $\rho_y$ as follows

$$
-\frac{d}{(d/2)^2 + \rho_y^2} + \int_{0}^{\infty} dt t^{d/4-1} \cos\left(\frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2}\right) \left[ \theta_3^d\left(\text{e}^{-\pi t}\right) - t^{-d/2}\right] = 0.
$$

(3.1)

This equation is symmetric with respect to the complex conjugation $\rho_y \rightarrow -\rho_y$. In $d = 1$, the critical zeros with $\rho_x = \frac{1}{2}$ are those suggested by Riemann to be the only ones in the complex plane.

The “off-critical” zeros (off the critical line) are those with $\rho_x \neq \frac{d}{2}$. Let us denote the deviation of $\rho_x$ from its critical value $\frac{d}{2}$ as

$$
\Delta\rho_x(d) = \rho_x(d) - \frac{d}{2}.
$$

(3.2)

In this case, the rhs of (2.8) becomes complex and the off-critical zeros are given by the pair of coupled equations

$$
-\left[ \frac{d}{2} + \Delta\rho_x \right] \left[ \frac{d}{2} + \Delta\rho_x \right] + \left[ \frac{d}{2} - \Delta\rho_x \right] \left[ \frac{d}{2} - \Delta\rho_x \right] + \int_{0}^{\infty} dt t^{d/4-1} \cos\left(\frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2}\right) \cosh\left(\frac{\Delta\rho_x \ln t}{2}\right) \left[ \theta_3^d\left(\text{e}^{-\pi t}\right) - t^{-d/2}\right] = 0,
$$

(3.3)

$$
\rho_y \left[ \frac{1}{\left(\frac{d}{2} + \Delta\rho_x \right)^2 + \rho_y^2} - \frac{1}{\left(\frac{d}{2} - \Delta\rho_x \right)^2 + \rho_y^2} \right] + \int_{0}^{\infty} dt t^{d/4-1} \sin\left(\frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2}\right) \sinh\left(\frac{\Delta\rho_x \ln t}{2}\right) \left[ \theta_3^d\left(\text{e}^{-\pi t}\right) - t^{-d/2}\right] = 0.
$$

(3.4)

These equations are symmetric with respect to the sign reversals $\Delta\rho_x \rightarrow -\Delta\rho_x$ and $\rho_y \rightarrow -\rho_y$. This means that when $(\Delta\rho_x, \rho_y)$ with $\Delta\rho_x \neq 0$ is the zero solution of equations (3.3) and (3.4), also $(\Delta\rho_x, -\rho_y), (-\Delta\rho_x, \rho_y)$ and $(-\Delta\rho_x, -\rho_y)$ belong to the zero points.
The known product representation of the Jacobi theta function 

\[ \theta_3(q) = \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 - q^{2j})(1 + q^{2j-1})^2 \]

is not sufficient for our purposes and must be symmetrized. Let us consider the function

\[ g(q) = \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 + q^j)(1 - q^{2j-1}) = 1 + a_1 q + a_2 q^2 + \cdots \]

4. Special limits of dimension \( d \)

(a) \( d \to 0 \)

To study the small-\( d \) limit within the representation (2.2) valid for \( \Re(s) > d \), we set \( \theta_3^d(e^{-1}) - 1 \approx d \ln \theta_3(e^{-1}) \) and get

\[ f(s) = \lim_{d \to 0} \frac{\zeta(d)(s)}{d} = \frac{1}{2d \Gamma(s/2)} \int_0^\infty dt t^{s/2-1} \ln \left[ \theta_3^d(e^{-t}) \right]. \]
which is evidently analytic in $q$ around $q = 0$. Since it holds
\[
g(q^2) = \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 + q^{2j})(1 - q^{2j-1})(1 + q^{2j-1}) = \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} (1 + q^j)(1 - q^{2j-1}) = g(q),
\]
we have $g(q) = g(q^2) = g(q^3) = \ldots = 1$. The division of the representation (4.2) of $\theta_3(q)$ by $g(q^2)$ results in
\[
\theta_3(q) = \prod_{j=1}^{\infty} \frac{(1 - q^{2j})(1 + q^{2j-1})}{(1 + q^{2j})(1 - q^{2j-1})}
\
Consequently,
\[
\ln \theta_3(q) = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (-1)^j \ln \left(1 - q^{2j}\right) = -2 \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (-1)^j \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{2k+1} q^{j(2k+1)}.
\]
Inserting this expansion into (4.1) yields
\[
f(s) = \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (-1)^{j+1} \frac{1}{j^{s/2}} \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k+1)^{s/2+1}}.
\]
It is easy to derive the following relations
\[
\sum_{j=1}^{\infty} (-1)^{j+1} \frac{1}{j^{s}} = (1 - 2^{1-s})\zeta(s), \quad \sum_{k=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{(2k+1)^{s}} = (1 - 2^{-s})\zeta(s).
\]
Thus,
\[
\lim_{d \to 0} \frac{\zeta(d)(s)}{d} = (1 - 2^{-s/2+1})(1 - 2^{-s/2-1})\zeta(s/2)\zeta(s/2 + 1).
\]
This exact result complements the known formulas (1.3)-(1.6).

The zeros of the $d \to 0$ Epstein zeta-function are of two kinds. One of the first two brackets on the rhs of (4.9) vanishes for
\[
s_k^{\pm} = 2 \left( \pm 1 + \frac{2\pi i}{\ln 2} k \right), \quad k = \pm 1, \pm 2, \ldots.
\]
Note that $s_k^- = -2$ with $k = 0$ is trivial zero and $s_k^+ = 2$ with $k = 0$ is not zero because the limit $\lim_{s \to 2} (1 - 2^{-s/2+1})\zeta(s/2) = \ln 2$ is finite. The second set of zeros has the origin in the product of the Riemann zeta-functions $\zeta(s/2)\zeta(s/2 + 1)$. Let us denote by $\zeta_n = \frac{1}{2} + ip_n (n = 1, 2, \ldots)$ the successive series of (critical) zeros of $\zeta(s)$ in the upper half-plane with $\Re p_n > 0$ and by $\zeta_n = \frac{1}{2} + ip_n (n = 1, -2, \ldots)$ the complex conjugate ones in the lower half-plane with $\Re p_n = -\Re p_n < 0$. The zeros of the product $\zeta(s/2)\zeta(s/2 + 1)$ read as
\[
s_n^{(1)} = 2\zeta_n, \quad s_n^{(2)} = 2(\zeta_n - 1).
\]
According to the Riemann hypothesis, they are constrained to the axes $\Re(s) = \pm 1$.

The function $\zeta(d)(s)$ in (4.9) is proportional to $d$ and as the limit $d \to 0$ is taken, it is necessary to check whether the above zeros fulfill the sum rules (3.9)-(3.11). Taking the $d \to 0$ limit of the sum rule (3.9) yields $\sum_\rho 1/\rho = 0$. This result is confirmed by the explicit calculation
\[
\sum_{\rho} \frac{1}{\rho} = \frac{1}{2} \sum_{n} \left( \frac{1}{\zeta_n} + \frac{1}{\zeta_n - 1} \right) + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k \neq 0} \left( \frac{1}{d \pi i k} - \frac{1}{1 + \frac{2\pi i}{\ln 2} k} \right) = 0,
\]
where we have used that $1 - \zeta_n = \zeta_{-n}$. The second sum rule (3.10) implies
\[
\sum_{\rho} \frac{1}{\rho^2} = -\frac{1}{2} \left[ \int_{0}^{\infty} \frac{dt}{t} \ln \left[ \beta \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) \sqrt{t} \right] \right] = -2 \lim_{s \to 0} \left[ \pi^{-s/2} \Gamma \left( \frac{s}{2} \right) f(s) - \frac{1}{s^2} \right]
\]
\[
= \frac{\gamma^2}{2} - \frac{\pi^2}{16} + (\ln 2)^2 + \gamma_1.
\]
\[ \frac{1}{d} \sum_n \left( \frac{1}{\zeta_n} + \frac{1}{(\zeta_n - 1)^2} \right) = \frac{1}{2} \sum_n \frac{1}{\zeta_n} = \frac{\gamma_0^2}{2} + \frac{1}{2} - \frac{\pi^2}{16} + \gamma_1, \]  

(4.14)

see [18], and

\[ \frac{1}{d} \sum_{k \neq 0} \left[ \frac{1}{\left(1 - \frac{2\pi i}{\ln 2} \right)^2} + \frac{1}{\left(1 + \frac{2\pi i}{\ln 2} \right)^2} \right] = -\frac{1}{2} + (\ln 2)^2, \]  

(4.15)

the same result holds by substituting directly the spectrum of zeros. Finally, from (3.11) one gets that \( \sum_n 1/\rho^3 = 0 \) which is trivially reproduced by identified zeros.

The critical zeros, which must have \( \rho_x = 0 \), are absent at zero dimensionality. In other words, all identified zeros are off-critical at \( d \to 0 \) and they are lying on the axes \( \Re(s) = \pm 1, \pm 2 \).

(b) \( d \to \infty \)

By using the relation (2.6), the difference \( \theta^d_2 \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) - t^{-d/2} \) can be expanded as

\[ \theta^d_2 \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) - t^{-d/2} = \frac{2d}{d/2} \left[ e^{-\pi t} + (d - 1)e^{-2\pi t} + \frac{2}{3}(d - 1)(d - 2)e^{-3\pi t} + \cdots \right]. \]  

(4.16)

Let us look for the critical zeros in the limit \( d \to \infty \). Inserting this expansion into (3.1) and taking the limit \( d \to \infty \), one gets the condition

\[ \int_0^1 \frac{dt}{t} t^{-d/4} \cos \left( \rho_y \ln t \frac{\pi}{2} \right) \left[ e^{-\pi t} + (d - 1)e^{-2\pi t} + \frac{2}{3}(d - 1)(d - 2)e^{-3\pi t} + \cdots \right] = 0. \]  

(4.17)

The leading term (in the limit \( d \to \infty \)) inside the square bracket is the first one with \( e^{-\pi t} \). Like for instance, the second term with \( e^{-2\pi t} \) gives, after the substitution \( t = 2t' \), a vanishing contribution of order \( 2^{-d/4}d \) in comparison with the first one. The consequent equation

\[ \int_0^1 dt e^{S(t)} \cos \left( \rho_y \ln t \frac{\pi}{2} \right) = 0, \quad S(t) = \left( -1 - \frac{d}{4} \right) \ln t - \frac{\pi}{t} \]  

(4.18)

can be treated within the saddle-point method. The maximum point of the action \( S(t) \), given by the condition \( \partial S(t)/\partial t = 0 \), is \( t \sim 4\pi/d \) in the limit \( d \to \infty \). This point lies in the interval \([0, 1]\) as it should be and it determines the possible values of \( \rho_y \) via

\[ \cos \left( \frac{\rho_y}{2} \ln \left( \frac{4\pi}{d} \right) \right) = 0, \quad \rho_y = \frac{(2n + 1)\pi}{\ln[d/(4\pi)]} \quad (n = 0, \pm 1, \ldots). \]  

(4.19)

The critical zeros are therefore distributed equidistantly along the imaginary axis in the limit \( d \to \infty \).

5. Singular expansion around critical edge zeros

In figures 1 and 2, we present by open symbols interconnected via solid lines the numerical results for critical zeros of the Epstein zeta-function \( \zeta^{(d)}(s) \), with the imaginary component \( \rho_y \) smaller than 45 to keep high numerical accuracy (6-25 decimal digits). The numerical evaluation of one zero using Mathematica takes approximately 5 seconds of CPU time on standard PC.

Figure 1 concerns small values of dimension \( d \leq 4 \). It is seen that the solid lines form closed or semi-open curves which enclose disjunctive regions of the complex plane. There are no critical zeros as \( \rho_x = \frac{4}{d} \to 0 \), in agreement with the analysis of the previous section. In the studied interval of \( \rho_y \)-values, there is a gap between the axis \( \rho_x = 0 \) and the smallest \( \rho_x \)-component of the critical zeros; an open question remains whether the nonzero dimensional gap is present for all critical zeros (with larger values of \( \rho_y \)).
Figure 2 concerns large values of $d$. The solid curve connecting the first zeros ends up at $d = 9.2455524667456$, but the curve continues symmetrically in the lower quadrant. The solid lines of the second and third zeros (as they appear in the region of small $d$) go up to an infinite dimension. In the limit $d \to \infty$ (actually $d \approx 50$), the critical zeros are distributed equidistantly along the imaginary axis, as is predicted by the asymptotic relation (4.19) (dashed lines).

From all critical zeros lying on a given curve, the “edge” points, denoted as $\rho^* = (d^*/2, \rho_y(d^*))$, are the most relevant. They are defined by the tangent $d\rho_y/d\rho^* = \infty$ or, equivalently, $dd/d\rho_y|_{\rho^*} = 0$. They satisfy equation (3.1) for critical zeros,

$$- \frac{d^*}{\left(\frac{d^*}{2}\right)^2 + \rho_y^2} + \int_0^1 dt \frac{t^*/4-1}{2} \cos \left(\frac{\rho_y^* \ln t}{2}\right) \left[\frac{1}{3} \left( e^{-\pi t} - t^{-d^*/2} \right) \right] = 0, \quad (5.1)$$

and simultaneously the derivative of equation (3.1) with respect to $\rho_y$, taken with $dd/d\rho_y|_{\rho^*} = 0$,

$$\frac{2d^*\rho_y^*}{\left(\frac{d^*}{2}\right)^2 + \rho_y^2} - \frac{1}{2} \int_0^1 dt \frac{t^*/4-1}{2} \sin \left(\frac{\rho_y^* \ln t}{2}\right) \ln t \left[\frac{1}{3} \left( e^{-\pi t} - t^{-d^*/2} \right) \right] = 0. \quad (5.2)$$

The set of equations (5.1) and (5.2) has an infinite number of solutions for $\rho^*$ with dimension $d^*$ being in general non-integer. We have to distinguish between the “left” edge points, for which $d^2/d\rho_y^2|_{\rho^*} > 0$, and the “right” edge points, for which $d^2/d\rho_y^2|_{\rho^*} < 0$. The coordinates and left/right orientation of edge points in figures 1 and 2 are summarized in table 1.

$\rho_y$ as the function of $d$ is singular (non-analytic) at the edge points. To show that, let us consider say a left edge point with coordinates $(d^*/2, \rho_y(d^*))$ and study an infinitesimal deviation from it along the curve of critical zeros $\rho_y(d)$. Setting

$$d = d^* + \Delta d \quad (\Delta d > 0, \Delta d \ll 1), \quad \rho_y(d) = \rho_y(d^*) + \Delta \rho_y \quad (\Delta \rho_y \ll 1) \quad (5.3)$$
in (3.1) and expanding systematically in powers of small deviations $\Delta d$ and $\Delta \rho_y$, one gets

$$
\alpha \Delta d + \gamma (\Delta \rho_y)^2 - \beta \Delta d \Delta \rho_y - \delta (\Delta \rho_y)^3 + O \left( (\Delta d)^2 \right) + O \left[ \Delta d (\Delta \rho_y)^2 \right] = 0,
$$

(5.4)
where the expansion coefficients are given by

$$
\alpha = \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} - \rho_y(d^*) \right] \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} + \rho_y(d^*) \right] + \int_0^1 dt t^{d^* - 1} \cos \left( \frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2} \right) \\
\times \left\{ \ln t \frac{\ln \left( \left( \frac{d^*}{d*} \right)^2 + \theta^* \right)}{4} \left( e^{-\pi t} t^{-d*/2} \right) + \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) \ln \left[ \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) \right] \right\},
$$

(5.5)

$$
\beta = 2\rho_y(d^*) \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} - \rho_y(d^*) \right] \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} + \rho_y(d^*) \right] + \int_0^1 dt t^{d^* - 1} \sin \left( \frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2} \right) \ln t \\
\times \left\{ \ln t \frac{\ln \left( \left( \frac{d^*}{d*} \right)^2 + \theta^* \right)}{4} \left( e^{-\pi t} t^{-d*/2} \right) + \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) \ln \left[ \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) \right] \right\},
$$

(5.6)

$$
\gamma = d^* \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} - \rho_y(d^*) \right] \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} + \rho_y(d^*) \right] - \frac{1}{8} \int_0^1 dt t^{d^* - 1} \cos \left( \frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2} \right) \left( \ln t \right)^2 \\
\times \left[ \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) - t^{-d*/2} \right],
$$

(5.7)

$$
\delta = 4d^* \rho_y(d^*) \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} - \rho_y(d^*) \right] \left[ \frac{d^*}{d*} + \rho_y(d^*) \right] - \frac{1}{48} \int_0^1 dt t^{d^* - 1} \sin \left( \frac{\rho_y \ln t}{2} \right) \left( \ln t \right)^3 \\
\times \left[ \theta^* \left( e^{-\pi t} \right) - t^{-d*/2} \right].
$$

(5.8)

Note that the linear term of order $\Delta \rho_y$ is missing in (5.4) due to the validity of equation (5.2) for critical edge zeros.

Equation (5.4) tells us that $\Delta \rho_y$ is the following singular function for $d > d^*$:

$$
\rho_y(d) = \rho_y(d^*) \pm \sqrt{-\frac{a}{\gamma}} \sqrt{d - d^*} + \frac{1}{2\gamma} \left( \beta - \frac{a\omega}{\gamma} \right) \left( d - d^* \right) + O \left( (d - d^*)^{3/2} \right),
$$

(5.9)

where the prefactor sign $\pm$ specifies the up and down branches of the plot $\rho_y(d)$. The leading (singular) term is given by the first two terms on the rhs of (5.4), $\alpha \Delta d + \gamma (\Delta \rho_y)^2 = 0$. Notice that $-\alpha/\gamma$ must be a positive number to get a real solution for $\rho_y(d)$, and for the studied left edge points it really is so. A similar singularity with exponent $\frac{1}{2}$ occurs for the order parameter in critical phenomena of statistical systems at the second-order phase transition within the so-called mean-field approach [19,20].

A similar analysis can be made for right edge zeros, to keep the parameter $\Delta d$ positive (negative) from the side of critical (off-critical) zeros it must be defined as $\Delta d = d^* - d$.

6. Generation of off-critical zeros from critical edge zeros

This section is about a continuous generation of off-critical zeros from critical edge zeros.

In the case of left edge zero, equation (5.4) with $-\alpha/\gamma > 0$ has no real solution for $\Delta \rho_y$ if $\Delta d = d - d^* < 0$. Let us assume that for $\Delta d < 0$ there is also a continuous deviation of the $\rho_x$-component from its critical value $\frac{1}{2}$, see equation (3.2). Considering then the relations (5.3) in equations (3.3) and (3.4) and expanding in powers of small variables $\Delta d$, $\Delta \rho_x$ and $\Delta \rho_y$, one obtains

$$
\alpha \Delta d - \gamma (\Delta \rho_x)^2 + \beta (\Delta \rho_y)^2 + 3\delta (\Delta \rho_x)^2 \Delta \rho_y - \delta (\Delta \rho_y)^3 + \cdots = 0,
$$

(6.1)

$$
\Delta \rho_x \left[ \beta \Delta d - 2\gamma \Delta \rho_y - \delta (\Delta \rho_x)^2 + 3\delta (\Delta \rho_y)^2 + \cdots \right] = 0.
$$

(6.2)
As is evident from the first relation (6.1), setting $\Delta \rho_x = 0$, $\Delta \rho_y$, which is real for $\Delta d > 0$, becomes pure imaginary for $\Delta d < 0$. However, the term $\gamma(\Delta \rho_y)^2$ containing the variable $\Delta \rho_y$ has a counterpart with an opposite sign $-\gamma(\Delta \rho_x)^2$ containing the variable $\Delta \rho_x$ which, when combined with $\alpha \Delta d$, provides in the leading order the real solution for $\Delta d < 0$:

$$\Delta \rho_x = \pm \sqrt{-\frac{\alpha}{\gamma} d^* - d} + O \left[ (d^* - d)^{3/2} \right], \quad d < d^*. \quad (6.3)$$

The second relation (6.2) implies that

$$\Delta \rho_y = -\frac{1}{2\gamma} \left( \beta - \frac{\alpha \delta}{\gamma} \right) (d^* - d) + O \left[ (d^* - d)^{3/2} \right], \quad d < d^*. \quad (6.4)$$

We conclude that the expansion of up and down branches of $\rho_y(d)$ (5.9), valid for $d > d^*$, splits into two expansions of left and right branches (tails) of $\rho_x(d)$ (6.3) and $\rho_y(d)$ (6.4) for $d < d^*$, with similar expansion coefficients. While the previous two up and down branches of $\rho_y(d)$ for $d > d^*$ were not bound by a symmetry, the positive and negative branches of off-critical zeros $[\rho_x(d), \rho_y(d)]$ for $d < d^*$ are bound by the symmetry $[\rho_x(d), \rho_y(d)] \rightarrow [d - \rho_x(d), \rho_y(d)]$ which takes place for every deviation from the edge point.

In what follows, various scenarios are presented how two conjugate tails of off-critical zeros originate in edge points. The numerical evaluation of one off-critical zero using *Mathematica* is simplified by the continuity of tails as $d$ varies and takes approximately 60 seconds of CPU time on standard PC.

![Figure 3](image-url)

**Figure 3.** The left and right tails of off-critical zeros (full circles) starting from the critical edge point 1a ($d^* \simeq 0.217$). The dimension of off-critical zeros is indicated at few points. The tails go down to $d = 0$ at points $(-2, 4\pi/\ln 2)$, respectively. The latter points coincide with the $k = 1$ zeros (4.10) found in $d = 0$. As is seen in the figure, the end-point of the right tail $(2, 4\pi/\ln 2)$ coincides with a critical zero at $d = 4$. The most simple scenario is connected with the left edge point 1a in figure 3. The critical zeros are represented by open circles, the left and right tails of off-critical zeros by full circles. The dimension of off-critical zeros is indicated at few points. The left and right tails of off-critical zeros start from $d^* \simeq 0.217$ at the edge point 1a and go down monotonously to $d = 0$ at points $(-2, 4\pi/\ln 2)$ and $(2, 4\pi/\ln 2)$, respectively. The latter points coincide with the $k = 1$ zeros (4.10) found in $d = 0$. As is seen in the figure, the end-point of the right tail $(2, 4\pi/\ln 2)$ coincides with a critical zero at $d = 4$. 
Figure 4. The log-log plot of numerical data for the dependence of $\Delta \rho_x$ (full circles) and $\Delta \rho_y$ (full squares) on the small dimension deviation $d^* - d$ for the right tail going from the left edge point 1a. Data fit perfectly with the analytic predictions \((6.5)\) represented in logarithmic scale by dashed straight lines.

The test of the analytic expansion formulas \((6.3)\) and \((6.4)\) for the right tail generated from the left edge point 1a is presented in figure 4. Our numerical data for the dependence of $\Delta \rho_x$ and $\Delta \rho_y$ on $d^* - d$ are represented in logarithmic scale by full circles and squares, respectively. For small deviations from the edge point $d^* - d \to 0^+$, the expansion formulas imply that

$$\Delta \rho_x \simeq \pm 4.24563\sqrt{d^* - d}, \quad \Delta \rho_y \simeq 0.344516(d^* - d). \tag{6.5}$$

The log-log plots of these analytic predictions, represented in figure 4 by dashed straight lines, fit perfectly the corresponding numerical data for deviation $d^* - d$ ranging from $10^{-9}$ to $10^{-2}$.

The form of the tails of off-critical zeros is more complicated in the case of the right edge point 2b in figure 5. Because of the right orientation of this edge point, dimension $d$ increases along the left (full circles) and right (full squares) tails from $d^* \simeq 2.272$ to $\infty$. As check points, for the left tail we recover the equivalent off-critical zeros at $d = 4$ (1.4) and $d = 8$ (1.6), which coincide with the fourth critical zero of the $d = 2$ (1.3) Epstein zeta-function. For dimension of special interest $d = 3$, the left tail contains the off-critical zero $\rho = 0.111189793551259 + 27.02788114125727548i$. It is interesting that the left tail covers also a tiny interval of negative values of $\rho_x$ for dimensions from the interval $[4.965, 5.775]$. This means that for integer dimension $d = 5$ there exists a pair of conjugate off-critical zeros with the same imaginary component, namely $\rho_y \simeq 28.5599914110240345$, and the real components $\rho_x \simeq -0.00717997528701, 5.00717997528701$ which lie outside the critical strip $[0, 5]$.

Another scenario is presented in figure 6 where the two tails of off-critical zeros (full triangles) interpolate between the right edge point 3b ($d^* \simeq 0.352$) and the left edge point 3e ($d^* \simeq 0.566$), both points lying on the same curve of critical zeros (open triangles). Although the interval of dimensions is relatively narrow, the interval of $\rho_x$-values of off-critical zeros is relatively large and involves also negative values.
Figure 5. The left (full circles) and right (full squares) tails of off-critical zeros starting from the critical edge point 2b ($d^* \approx 2.272$). Dimension $d$ increases along the tails up to $\infty$, only fragments of the tails are shown in the figure.

Figure 6. Interpolation of off-critical zeros (full triangles) between the right edge point 3b ($d^* \approx 0.352$) and the left edge point 3e ($d^* \approx 0.566$), both edge points lying on the same curve of critical zeros (open triangles).

In figure 7, the two tails of off-critical zeros (full squares) interpolate between the right edge point 3d ($d^* \approx 1.399$) and the left edge point 4a ($d^* \approx 1.890$) which lie on different curves of critical zeros (open triangles and diamonds).
Figure 7. Interpolation of off-critical zeros (full squares) between the right edge point 3d \( (d^* \approx 1.399) \) and the left edge point 4a \( (d^* \approx 1.890) \), the edge points lying on distinct curves of critical zeros (open triangles and diamonds).

Figure 8. Real off-critical zeros (full circles) coming from the right edge point 1b, localized at the intersection of the curve of critical zeros (open circles) and the real axis. The inset contains the numerical verification (full circles) of the asymptotic relation (6.9) (dashed line).

The critical point 1b in figure 2 is the right edge one because the curve continues symmetrically along the \( \rho_x \)-axis into the lower quadrant. The position of this point \( (\rho_c^*)_x = d_c^*/2 \) can be found
by setting $\rho_y = 0$ in (3.1),
\[ -\frac{4}{d} \frac{d}{d_x} + \left[ \int_0^1 dt \frac{t^{d_c/4-1}}{t} \left[ \theta_{3}^{d_c/2} (e^{-\pi t}) - t^{-d_c/2} \right] \right] = 0. \tag{6.6} \]

The numerical solution of this equation is $d_c^* = 9.24555 \ldots$ For every $d > d_c^*$, there exists a pair of off-critical zeros on the real axis [note that equation (3.4) holds automatically for $\rho_y = 0$] whose conjugate components $\rho_x$ and $d - \rho_x$ satisfy the equation
\[ -\frac{1}{\rho_x} - \frac{1}{d - \rho_x} + \left[ \int_0^1 dt \frac{t^{\rho_x/2}}{t} + \frac{t^{(d-\rho_x)/2}}{2} \left[ \theta_{3}^{d/2} (e^{-\pi t}) - t^{-d/2} \right] \right] = 0. \tag{6.7} \]

The two solutions of this equation are always lying in the critical strip $0 < \rho_x < d$, see figure 8, as for real $\rho > d$ the Epstein zeta-function is the sum of positive numbers and therefore cannot vanish. To be more particular, for $d = 10$ one has $\rho = 2.17985543417; 7.82014456853$, for $d = 12$ one has $\rho = 0.7951625733; 11.2048342671$, for $d = 20$ one has $\rho = 0.0127182144; 19.9872817856$, etc. In the limit $d \to \infty$, the two solutions tend to the boundaries $0$ and $d$ of the critical strip. To derive the corresponding asymptotic behaviour, the difference in the square bracket of (6.7) is substituted by the leading term of the expansion (4.16). Let us restrict ourselves to zeros with $\rho_x \to 0$ when $d \to \infty$:
\[ -\frac{1}{\rho_x} + d \int_0^1 \int_{-d/2}^{1-\pi/t} e^{-\pi y} = -\frac{1}{\rho_x} + d \int_1^\infty dy y^{d/2-1} e^{-\pi y} = 0. \tag{6.8} \]

Since $\int_0^1 dy y^{d/2-1} e^{-\pi y}$ goes to 0 in the limit $d \to \infty$, we can enlarge the integration interval over $y$ from $[1, \infty]$ to $[0, \infty]$. Consequently,
\[ \rho_x \sim d \sim \frac{\pi^{d/2}}{d} \left( \frac{\pi}{d} \right)^{d/2} \sim \frac{1}{2} \frac{1}{\sqrt{\pi d}} \left( \frac{2\pi}{d} \right)^{d/2}, \tag{6.9} \]

where we have used the Stirling formula. This asymptotic relation is exact up to the constant term. The quick approach of $\rho_x$ to 0 is confirmed numerically (full circles) in the inset of figure 8 by comparing with the asymptotic relation (6.9) (dashed line).

7. Conclusion

The basic definition of the hypercubic Epstein zeta-function (1.2) requires an integer value of the spatial dimensionality $d$. The analytic continuation of the lattice sum to the whole complex s-plane (2.8) is well defined also for non-integer values of $d$. This extension was used to obtain numerically the closed or semi-open curves $\rho_y(d)$ of critical zeros (on the critical line), see figures 1 and 2. Each curve involves a finite number of left/right critical edge points $\rho_0 = (d^*/2, \rho_0(d^*))$, defined by an infinite tangent $d \phi_y/dd_0$. Coordinate data in table 1 indicate that the dimension of edge critical points is in general non-integer. As was shown in §5, the function $\rho_y(d)$ is a singular function of the dimension deviation $d - d^* > 0$ ($d^* - d > 0$) for the left (right) edge points. Changing the sign of the dimension deviation to $d - d^* < 0$ ($d^* - d < 0$) for the left (right) edge points, these edge points give rise to two conjugate tails of off-critical zeros (off the critical line) with continuously varying dimension $d$, in formal analogy with critical phenomena for many-body statistical systems (§6). Various versions of the generation mechanism are presented. Figure 3 documents the generation of left and right tails of off-critical zeros from the left edge point 1a ($d^* \simeq 0.217$), the dimension along the tails goes down to 0 at the $d \to 0$ off-critical zeros ($\pm 2, 4\pi i/ln 2$). The corresponding log-log plots of numerical data for $\Delta \rho_x = \rho_x(t) - \rho_x(d^*)$ and $\Delta \rho_y = \rho_y(t) - \rho_y(d^*)$ in the case of the right tail, presented in figure 4, are in perfect agreement with the analytic prediction (6.5) valid for small dimension deviations $d^* - d$. The generation of the off-critical tails from the right edge point 2b, with dimension along tails going up to infinity, is pictured in figure 5. The interpolation of off-critical zeros between the right edge point 3b and the left edge point 3e, both edge points lying on the same curve, is presented in figure 6. Figure
concerns an interpolation of off-critical zeros between the right edge point 3d and the left edge point 4a, the edge points lying on different curves of critical zeros. For every $d > d^*_c \simeq 9.246$, there exists a pair of conjugate off-critical zeros on the real axis, having their origin in the right edge point 1b, see figure 8. As $d \to \infty$, the two zeros tend very quickly to the boundaries 0 and $d$ of the critical strip; the asymptotic behaviour of $\rho_x \to 0$ is given in equation (6.9), for its numerical verification see the inset of figure 8.

As a by-product of the formalism, we have derived the exact formula (4.9) for $\lim_{d \to 0} \zeta^{(d)}(s)/d$. This formula tells us that there are no critical zeros in the limit $d \to 0$. An open question is whether there is a gap between the critical zero with the lowest dimension $d$ or not. The spectrum of off-critical zeros in the limit $d \to 0$ was checked to fulfill the obligatory sum rules. Another check of the spectrum is that off-critical tails generated from left edge points end correctly at the $d \to 0$ off-critical zeros. The exact treatment of the limit $d \to \infty$ in §5(b) predicts an equidistant distribution of critical zeros along the imaginary axis (4.19). This result is confirmed numerically in figure 2 where the critical zeros (open circles and triangles) approach to the equidistant distribution (4.19) represented by dashed lines.

Another open question is whether the presented mechanism of generation of tails of off-critical zeros from the critical edge points is the only one. We anticipate that it is so.

Ethics. All ethics standards were regarded.

Data Accessibility. This article has no additional data.

Authors’ Contributions. Both authors contributed equally.

Competing Interests. There are no competing interests.

Funding. VEGA Grant No. 2/0003/18, Project EXSES APVV-16-0186.

Acknowledgements. The support received from VEGA Grant No. 2/0003/18 and Project EXSES APVV-16-0186 is acknowledged.

References