A Multiferroic Molecular Magnetic Qubit

Alexander I. Johnson, Flokrul Islam, Carlo M. Canali and Mark R. Pederson

Department of Physics, Central Michigan University, Mt. Pleasant, MI 48859

Department of Physics and Electrical Engineering, Linnaeus University, Kalmar, Sweden

Department of Physics, University of Texas El Paso, El Paso, TX 79968

(Dated: September 20, 2019)

The chiral Fe₆O₉(NC₅H₅)₃(O₂CC₆H₅)₆ molecular cation, with C₃ symmetry, is composed of three six-fold coordinated spin-carrying Fe³⁺⁺ cations that form a perfect equilateral triangle. Experimental reports demonstrating the spin-electric effect in this system also identify the presence of a magnetic uni-axis and suggest that this molecule may be a good candidate for an externally controllable molecular qubit. Here we demonstrate, using standard density-functional methods, that the spin-electric behavior of this molecule could be even more interesting as there are energetically competitive reference states associated with both high and low local spins (S=5/2 vs. S=1/2) on the Fe³⁺⁺ ions. Each of these structures allow for spin-electric ground states. We find that qualitative differences in the broadening of the Fe(2s) and O(1s) core levels and the single-spin anisotropy Hamiltonian may be used to confirm whether the high-spin manifold is lower in energy than the low-spin manifold.

PACS numbers: 31.15.Ar, 31.70.Hq, 34.70.+e, 84.60.Jt, 87.15.Mi
Keywords: Molecular Magnets, Density-Functional Methods

I. INTRODUCTION AND MOTIVATION

Molecules composed of spin carrying metal centers are ubiquitous in nature and play important roles in inorganic chemistry and biophysics. Such systems are used to transport oxygen, convert water into oxygen and hydrogen [1–4], and convert nitrogen to ammonia. The spin-spin and spin-orbit interactions associated with the heavier transition metal ions can provide non-destructive spectroscopic probes for understanding such chemical rearrangements [5]. Further, the magnetic and spin-electric behaviors of these molecules suggest they are interesting candidates from the standpoint of quantum sensing, development of classical information storage systems, and also as possible qubits for quantum information applications [6–9]. While either integer or half-integer systems could be relevant to classical information storage systems, an analysis based upon a single-J Heisenberg Hamiltonian identifies transition-metal complexes composed of half-integer spins as the system that is most likely to lead to the straightforward construction of a qubit [8] and ligand-stabilized experimental manifestations of such qubits have been reported recently [9].

Two primary types of collective behaviors present themselves in molecules when inversion symmetry is absent. For molecules that contain metal ions with large moments (more than two unpaired electrons per site) and relatively strong exchange-coupling, the entire molecule behaves as a single spin at temperatures that are small compared to inter-exchange coupling. If such molecules have uniaxial symmetries, spin-orbit coupling determines the magnitude and sign of D in the single-spin Hamiltonian (H_A = DS^2). [10–17] If D is negative, the system exhibits easy axis, e.g. quasiclassical, magnetic behavior. If D is positive, the system exhibits easy-plane magnetic behavior. If easy-axis magnetic behavior is observed in these systems, the molecule is often referred to as a Type-1 molecular magnet or as an anisotropic molecular magnet. The quantum states of such molecules can be switched through the application of magnetic fields that are integer multiples of the anisotropy parameter (D). [12, 13] While the single macrospin character associated with Type-1 molecular magnets is expected if the spin-ordering energetics are very large, there is indeed an extremely large active space of nearly degenerate spin configurations which invites the conclusion that multi-reference effects are also important. However, by virtue of the large moments on each metal center, the multitude of nearly degenerate states exhibiting different spin orderings are not coupled by the spin-orbit operator since the spin-orbit operator is at most a two-electron operator. This aspect is important from the standpoint of ensuring that multi-configurational effects do not significantly alter the single-spin characteristics. Such behavior is often observed in molecules containing an even number of metal ions, but there is no fundamental reason that this must be the case. Until recently, and in contrast to Type-1 molecular magnets, Type-2 molecular magnets or spin systems have been primarily found in complexes containing an odd number of metal ions that have small moments (one unpaired electron per site) [18–25]. Also, relative to their Type-1 siblings, states with different spin orderings can indeed be coupled by the spin-orbit interaction. Furthermore, higher-energy charge-transfer states between pairs of metal centers, otherwise known as the upper Hubbard band, are also coupled to the ground state by the spin-orbit interaction. This type of spin-orbit effect is generally referred to as the Dzyaloshinskii-Moriya (DM) interaction [26, 27] or antisymmetric exchange interaction. The occurrence of a lack of inversion symmetry, and frustrated spin ordering provides a very different type of emergent behavior than what is observed in Type-1 molecular magnets. Moreover, because there
are multiple low-energy degenerate spin-ordered configurations, each of which lead to a net dipole moment, these systems exhibit the spin-electric effect which allows one to manipulate the quantum states with an applied electric field. The spin-electric effect, introduced in Refs. [6] [20] arises when the spin-ordering in an equilateral triangle changes from having three ferromagnetically ordered spins to one of the frustrated configurations with two parallel and one anti-parallel spin on their respective ions. For the remainder of this paper we refer to the non-ferromagnetically ordered configurations as either anti-ferromagnetic (AF) or frustrated. Shortly after the paper by Triff et al. [20], Islam et al. quantified the behavior of these systems using the NRLMOL suite of codes and calculated the DM interaction using density-functional theory. [21] [22] This interaction is eventually reduced to

\[ H_{DM} = \Delta_{Spin-Orbit} C_2 S_z \]

where \( C_2 \) is the chirality operator and \( \Delta_{Spin-Orbit} \) is a constant that depends on the spin-orbit interaction between the upper and lower Hubbard bands in the half-filled three-site \( C_3 \) system. The result is that the chiral and antichiral states with the same \( M_s \) are split by \( 2\Delta_{Spin-Orbit} \). For a sufficiently large spin-orbit interaction this leads to a ground-state doublet composed of a chiral \( M_s = \frac{1}{2} \) and anti-chiral \( M_s = \frac{-1}{2} \) that can behave as a qubit.

The spin re-ordering causes a symmetry change which allows for an in-plane dipole moment. As a result the system’s coupling to an applied electric field transitions from quadratic to linear. The formation of the resulting dipole moment is a simple manifestation of the Pauli principle and the emergence of such a dipole moment does not depend on the number of unpaired electrons on each site. The physical explanation is that the kinetic energy of the electrons on the site that is antiparallel to the two other sites decreases because orthogonality of the spatial part of the wavefunction to those on the other two sites is not required. As a result, the relative localization of the anti-parallel and parallel frontier orbitals changes which leads to the emergence of a dipole moment at zero field.

The experimental demonstration of the spin-electric effect has occurred only recently. For example, Plass et al. [9] and Boudalis et al. [23] have experimentally identified Cu-based and Fe-based molecular spin qubits in which the transition metal ions are found on a triangular lattice in molecules with perfect \( C_3 \) symmetry. These papers reiterate the need to construct such a qubit from metal ions that contain half-integer electron spin (\( S_{loc} = \frac{2K+1}{2} \)) since, as also outlined below, such systems lead to a ground state with a total spin of \( S_{tot} = \frac{1}{2} \).

To date, most Type-2 molecular magnets, such as the one recently identified by Plass et al. [9], have been composed of metal ions that tend to carry small moments (e.g. Cu and V). However, the Fe-based system [23], introduced by Boudalis et al., is interesting due to the observations of the magneto-electric coupling in a qubit composed of high-spin (\( S_{loc} = \frac{5}{2} \)) metal centers. By subjecting the molecule to an electric field that is parallel to the plane of the three iron atoms, they have demonstrated that the ground state couples to the externally applied electric field and comment that their work is the first experimental confirmation of the spin-electric effect. Boudalis et al. point out that there have not been previous theoretical attempts at describing the spin-electric effect in systems such as \( Fe^{3+} \) triangular systems.

In this paper we perform calculations on two energetically competitive spin manifolds of the molecule introduced by Boudalis et al. In contrast to other molecular magnets that have exhibited either Type-1 or Type-2 behavior but not both, our calculated results suggest that this molecule can exhibit both Type-1 and Type-2 behavior. In addition, the occurrence of two different spin manifolds, composed of high and low half-integer triangular spins, yields two different states that both exhibit spin-electric coupling. This behavior is due to nearly degenerate qualitatively different electronic configurations on the \( Fe^{3+} \) ions. To further quantify this result, we perform calculations to determine the splitting between the two sets of Kramer doublets. Based on the calculations presented here, we suggest that environmental effects such as isotropic pressure or secondary electric fields that perturb cation/anion separations may allow external switching between different manifolds of this multi-ferroic molecular qubit.

One of the ways that high-spin and low-spin spin-electric systems differ is that when spin-orbit is turned on, there is indeed a difference between a low-moment \( C_3 \) system with one unpaired electron on each site and a high-moment \( C_3 \) system with five unpaired electrons on each site. The former problem maps onto a standard three-site one-band Heisenberg Hamiltonian and there is only one electron that can hop from one site to the

![Image](image-url)
TABLE I: Atomic positions, local charges and local moments for the inequivalent atoms for the low-moment and high-moment configurations of the molecule. The number of decimal places included in the table is technically necessary, with respect to round-off error, if one wishes to use all 12 symmetry operations that this molecule has. The local charges for the first nearest-neighbor oxygens, the nitrogens and the iron atom are very sensitive to the total spin as is the local charge on the Fe iron.

next. However, for a high-moment system, there are sev- eral electrons on each site that can hop to other sites. In both high-moment and low-moment cases, these are high-energy charge transfer excitations. Further, for the high-spin case, it is possible, if not likely, that the energy of a single electron on a high-moment site is the lowest electronic excitation in the problem. This is in contrast to the low-moment system where such a flip simply gives a different degenerate configuration. Alternatively, in the limit of a single exchange-coupling parameter and no spin-orbit interaction it can be shown analytically that the lowest energy structure has a spin of $\frac{1}{2}$.

II. GEOMETRY AND SYMMETRY CONSIDERATIONS

The geometry of (Fe$^{3+}$)$_3$O$^{-2}$($NC_5H_5$)$_3$(O$_2$CC$_6$H$_5^{-1}$)$_6$ cationic complex is shown in Fig. [4]. The point group
symmetry of this molecule has twelve symmetry operations. When oriented so that the < 111 > axis is along the cylindrical axis, the group may be generated from cyclic permutations, \((x, y, z) \rightarrow (z, x, y)\), an inverted non-cyclic permutation \((x, y, z) \rightarrow (-y, -x, -z)\) and the special rotation matrix, \(R_Q\) below:

\[
R_Q = \begin{pmatrix}
\frac{1}{3} & -\frac{2}{3} & -\frac{2}{3} \\
-\frac{2}{3} & \frac{1}{3} & -\frac{2}{3} \\
\frac{2}{3} & -\frac{2}{3} & \frac{1}{3}
\end{pmatrix}
\]

The resulting group of order 12 leads to a total of six representations with degeneracies of (1,1,2,2,1,1). None of these representations are either even or odd under inversion. For an isolated \(Fe^{+3}\) atom, the ground state of the system has an outer valence configuration of \(3d^{10}\uparrow\uparrow\uparrow\) leading to a high net spin of \(S = 5/2\). However, a higher energy configuration of \(3d^{10}3d\uparrow\downarrow\) with a low net spin of \(S = 1/2\) is also electronically and magnetically stable but approximately 2-3 eV higher in energy than the high-spin \(Fe^{+3}\) cation. Our results indicate that when ligated according to the figure, the relative stability of the high- and low-spin is changed significantly. In Table I we present the local charges and moments for each of the inequivalent atoms that we have found in calculations for the high- and low-moment manifolds. We also compare the five Fe-O and Fe-N nearest-neighbor distances for the two structures.

III. THEORY AND METHODOLOGY

The calculations presented here use approximations to density-functional theory (DFT) \([28, 30]\), at the generalized-gradient level, to describe the electronic and magnetic structure of the molecular cation. The NRLMOL computational code employs Gaussian orbitals to represent the Kohn-Sham orbitals. \([31, 33]\) The basis sets that are used in NRLMOL are roughly triple to quadruple zeta quality \([33]\). The PBE-GGA density functional approximation is used for the exchange correlation functional in these self-consistent-field (SCF) calculations. For the iron atom, we have used 20 bare Gaussians with exponents varying from 0.12050 to 0.38667 \times 10^7 to construct a contracted basis set composed of 7 s-type, 5 p-type, and 4 d-type contracted orbitals. For simplicity in describing the basis sets on other atoms we refer to this as \([Fe(20): 0.12050 - 0.38667 \times 10^7, 7s5p4d]\). With this notation the oxygen, nitrogen, carbon, and hydrogen basis sets are designated as: \([O(13): 0.10492 - 0.61210 \times 10^5, 5s4p3d], [N(13): 0.09411 - 0.51751 \times 10^5, 5s4p3d], [C(12): 0.07721 - 0.22213 \times 10^5, 5s4p3d] and [H(6): 0.22838 - 0.77840 \times 10^2, 4s3p1d]\) respectively. The Limited-Memory Broyden-Fletcher-Goldfarb-Shanno (LBFGS) scheme programmed by Liu and Nocedal \([34]\) has been used for the optimization of structure with energy and force convergence criteria of 0.10000 \times 10^{-5} Hartree and .003 Hartree/Bohr for consistency.

Spin polarized calculations have been performed with the inclusion of spin-orbit coupling for the evaluation of magnetic properties \([11]\). Generally speaking, to determine the relevant parameters for the spin Hamiltonians for a triangular lattice of identical spins \((S_{loc}=1/2\) or \(5/2\) here), one calculates the energy of the ferromagnetically ordered state \(E_{FM}\) and the anti-ferromagnetically ordered state \(E_{AF}\). Then based on the assumption of a Heisenberg Hamiltonian of the form \(H = E_o + J[S_1 \cdot S_2 + S_2 \cdot S_3 + S_3 \cdot S_1]\), one can determine that \(E_o = (E_{FM} + 3E_{AF})/4\) and \(J = (E_{FM} - E_{AF})/(4S_{loc}^2)\). For our calculations, we find energies of \(E_{FM}(S_{loc} = 1/2) = -7129.713243\) and \(E_{AF}(S_{loc} = 5/2) = -7129.697517\) Hartree. For each of these cases we then calculate the antiferromagnetically ordered structures finding energies of \(E_{AF}(S_{loc} = 1/2) = -7129.714280\) and \(E_{AF}(S_{loc} = 5/2) = -7129.714586\) Hartree. After extracting \(E_o\) and \(J\) for both the high-spin and low-spin configurations we can arbitrarily shift both spin Hamiltonians by a constant so that \(E_o(S_{loc} = 1/2) \equiv 0\). The resulting values of \(J\) and \(E_o\) are given in Table \([11]\). This Heisenberg Hamiltonian may be more simply represented according to:

\[
H = E_o(S_{loc}) + \frac{J}{2} \{[\Sigma_i S_i]^2 - \Sigma_i S_i^2 \}. \quad (1)
\]

The resulting eigenstates of the above Hamiltonian, arising from a specific \(S_{loc}\), are also eigenstates of \(S_{tot}^2, S_{tot}^z\). In the absence of anisotropy, the energies are given by

\[
E = E_o(S_{loc}) + \frac{J}{2} [S_{tot}(S_{tot} + 1) - 3S_{loc}(S_{loc} + 1)] \quad (2)
\]

This affirms that regardless of \(S_{loc}\) the ground-state energy corresponds to \(S_{tot} = 1/2\). This equation allows us to determine the relative energies of the two sets of Kramer doublets that are associated with the two different spin manifolds. These are presented in the last column of Table \([11]\).

IV. RESULTS

From Table \([11]\) we observe that a spin moment appears on the central atoms for the high-spin case but not for the low-spin case. This moment has the same sign as the moment on the Fe ions which could simply mean that some of the valence charge on the Fe ions is leaking onto the central oxygen. If this is the case, it could mean that there is a greater degree of Fe 4s-3d hybridization for the case of the high-spin manifold. To make links with future experiments, we provide predictions of the relative
TABLE II: Magnetic and spin-electric properties for two nearly degenerate spin manifolds of the cation. The first manifold has a local spin and valence of \( \frac{1}{2} \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{2} \) on each Fe ion. The second manifold has a local valence of \( \frac{3}{2} \frac{5}{2} \) on each Fe ion. The spontaneous dipole moments acquired by the antiferromagnetically ordered structures are qualitatively different in magnitude. The calculated local moments (within a sphere of radius 2.19 Bohr) are consistent with the local valences. In both cases, the dipole moments result from movement of electrons from the two ions with paired spins to the ion with an unpaired spin as in the case of Ref. [21]. For calculations of \( J \), we use the convention that the Heisenberg Hamiltonian is given by \( H = E_o + J(S_1 \cdot S_2 + S_2 \cdot S_3 + S_3 \cdot S_4) \). In other words both manifolds prefer antiferromagnetic ordering.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>( S_{loc} )</th>
<th>( E_o (eV) )</th>
<th>( J(eV) )</th>
<th>MAE (K)</th>
<th>Gap(eV)</th>
<th>AF Dipole (au)</th>
<th>( \mu^F )</th>
<th>( \mu_1^{AF} )</th>
<th>( \mu_2^{AF} )</th>
<th>( \mu_3^{AF} )</th>
<th>( E_o + J \frac{1}{2} - 3S_{loc}(S_{loc} + 1) )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1/2</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.053</td>
<td>3.8 (EA)</td>
<td>-0.053</td>
<td>0.091</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td>-0.93</td>
<td>-0.93</td>
<td>-0.08 (eV)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5/2</td>
<td>0.095</td>
<td>0.019</td>
<td>-8.5 (EP)</td>
<td>-0.424</td>
<td>0.139</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>3.94</td>
<td>-3.84</td>
<td>-3.84</td>
<td>-0.39 (eV)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE III: Energy (eV) of ferromagnetically ordered molecule as a function of \( M_S \) and the geometry. This molecule shows spin crossover behavior as a function of the geometry which suggests that the ground magnetic state will change when pressure is applied and that it could be sensitive to size of the charge-compensating counter anion in the unit cell.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>( M_S )</th>
<th>( \Delta E^{5/2} )</th>
<th>( \mu^{5/2} )</th>
<th>( \Delta E^{15/2} )</th>
<th>( \mu^{15/2} )</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3/2</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td>1.602</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6/2</td>
<td>0.891</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td>1.792</td>
<td>1.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9/2</td>
<td>1.277</td>
<td>2.73</td>
<td>1.226</td>
<td>2.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/2</td>
<td>1.865</td>
<td>3.45</td>
<td>0.924</td>
<td>3.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15/2</td>
<td>1.930</td>
<td>4.05</td>
<td>0.404</td>
<td>4.05</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To summarize, the \( Fe^{III} \) ions, arranged at the vertices of an equilateral triangle, in the cationic molecule studied here can exist with valences of \( 3d^{5} \) or \( 3d^{7} \). Our geometries, optimized for each spin configuration, find that the lowest energy Kramer doublet states for each system are close in energy but with the high-moment case slightly lower in energy (0.3 eV). Both of these degenerate Kramer doublet states can be manipulated with an electric field. It is generally expected that density-functional methods, without corrections for the onsite Coulomb repulsion, will overestimate exchange-coupling parameters by a factor of 2-3 which would then adjust the energy splitting to a number that is close to room temperature. There are other factors that usually do not enter in to determining the optimal ground-state reference energy that could then play a role in fully determining the splitting between the two sets of Kramer doublets that arise from the two different reference states. Other factors that should be considered include zero-point vibrational energies and average spin-orbit energies. The expectation is that vibrational effects would slightly stabilize the low-spin manifold and that inclusion of the total spin-orbit energy would slightly favor the high-spin manifold. Work on quantifying this result is in progress.

Regardless of which reference state is lower in energy, the presence of nearly degenerate reference states, composed of high-spin and low-spin centers, is of potential interest for quantum sensing applications. The low-spin case offers the possibility of a molecular magnet that has weak easy-axis anisotropy and that would therefore be switchable through the applications of magnetic fields as well as electric fields. The low-spin and high-spin case offers the possibility of two different spin-electric signatures. Prospects for practically switching between these two states appear to be good. The overall size of the molecular cation depends on the moments which means that the Madelung stabilization of the low-spin molecule, in a crystal, could be greater if counter anions of differing size can be used. In addition...
to more experiments on this interesting molecular magnetic qubit, it will be important to consider the use of higher-level quantum chemistry methods, and improved density-functional based methods, such as those obtained from the Fermi-Löwdin-Orbital-Self-Interaction-Corrected (FLOSIC) \[35][42]. Finally the inclusion of non-collinear mean-field methods, with comparison to multi-configurational methods, will help to realize quantitative computational understanding of this qubit. Due to the importance of rigorously understanding decohering mechanisms in these systems, inclusion of group-theoretical symmetrization methods have been used here. Fully incorporating such techniques into non-collinear and multi-configurational approaches should enhance the effectiveness for applications to quantum sensors and qubits.

VI. ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A.I. Johnson thanks the Michigan-State Computer Center for computer time used on this project. M.R.P. was supported from startup funds provided by the University of Texas-El Paso and the Texas Science and Technology Aquisition and Retention (STARS) Program. CMC and FI are supported by the Faculty of Technology at Linnaeus University, the Swedish Research Council (VR) through Grant No. 621-2014-4785, and by the Carl Tryggers Stiftelse through Grant No. CTS 14:178. Computational resources for preliminary calculations have been provided by the Lunarc Center for Scientific and Technical Computing at Lund University.


