Measuring the atomic composition of planetary building blocks.

M. K. McClure1,2, C. Dominik1, M. Kama3,4

1 Anton Pannekoek Institute for Astronomy, Universiteit van Amsterdam, Science Park 904, 1098 XH Amsterdam, Netherlands
2 Leiden Observatory, Leiden University, PO Box 9513, 2300 RA Leiden, The Netherlands
3 Department of Physics and Astronomy, University College London, Gower Street, London, WC1E 6BT, UK
4 Tartu Observatory, University of Tartu, Observatooriumi 1, Tõravere, 61602, Estonia

e-mail: mcclure@strw.leidenuniv.nl

Received -; accepted -

Astronomy & Astrophysics manuscript no. twhya_letter1_v2

October 22, 2021
©ESO 2021

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Abstract

Context. Volatile molecules are critical to terrestrial planetary habitability, yet difficult to observe directly where planets form at the midplanes of protoplanetary disks. It is unclear whether the inner ∼1 AU of disks are volatile-poor or if this region is resupplied with ice-rich dust from colder disk regions. Dust traps at radial pressure maxima bounding disk gaps can cut off the inner disk from such volatile reservoirs. However, the trap retention efficiency and atomic composition of trapped dust have not been measured.

Aims. We present a new technique to measure the absolute atomic abundances in gas accreting onto T Tauri stars and infer the bulk atomic composition and distribution of midplane solids that have been retained in the disk around the young star TW Hya.

Methods. We identify near-infrared atomic line emission from gas-phase material inside the dust sublimation rim of TW Hya. Gaussian decomposition of the strongest H Paschen lines isolates the inner disk hydrogen emission. We measure several key elemental abundances, relative to hydrogen, using a chemical photoionization model and infer dust retention in the disk. With a 1D transport model, we determine approximate radial locations and retention efficiencies of dust traps for different elements.

Results. Volatile and refractory elements are depleted from TW Hya’s hot gas by factors of ∼108 and up to 1010, respectively. The abundances of the trapped solids are consistent with a combination of primitive Solar system bodies. Dust traps beyond the CO and N2 snowline cumulatively sequester 96% of the total dust flux, while the trap at 2 AU, near the H2O snowline, retains 3%. The high depletions of Si, Mg, and Ca are explained by a third trap at 0.3 AU with >95% dust retention.

Conclusions. TW Hya sports a significant volatile reservoir rich in C- and N-ices in its outer sub-mm ring structure. However, unless the inner disk was enhanced in C by earlier radial transport, typical C destruction mechanisms and lack of C resupply should leave the terrestrial planet-forming region of TW Hya ‘dry’ and carbon-poor. Any planets that form within the silicate dust trap at 0.3 AU could resemble Earth in terms of the degree of their volatile depletion.

Key words. protoplanetary disks – stars: variables: T Tauri – line: formation – techniques: spectroscopic solid state: volatile – astrochemistry

1. Introduction

Relative abundances of common elements, e.g. C, O, and Si, are used to characterize both planetary atmospheric compositions (Madhusudhan 2012) and those of solar system solid bodies (Bergin et al. 2015). Despite their high solar abundances and enhancement in gas giant atmospheres, C, O, and N are depleted relative to Si on Earth and all classes of meteorites (Bergin et al. 2015; Lodders 2010). The fraction of each element in rocks (‘refractories’) versus ices (‘volatiles’) may influence these trends. Ice sublimation depletes solids, and additional mechanisms may exist to destroy C-rich rocky grains in the inner regions of protoplanetary disks (PPDs) while retaining those rich in Si (Anderson et al. 2017). Radial transport of fresh solids from the cold outer disk could renew the C in the terrestrial planet forming region of PPDs, and it may be that the low C abundances in solar system bodies are a consequence of Jupiter segregating the inner solar PPD, rather than of destruction by a universal mechanism (Klarmann et al. 2018). However, the midplane distribution of volatile-rich solids in protoplanetary disks is not yet observationally well-determined, due to high optical depths. Moreover, it is unclear where or when these solids start being retained in the disk, or ‘locked’ out of the gas accreting onto the central star, a key step in the formation of planets (Drake et al. 2005).

The presence of midplane ice reservoirs in the nearby disk TW Hya has been inferred from cold gas depletions of CO and water by factors of ∼100 and ∼800, respectively, relative to the values typically measured for the interstellar medium (ISM) (Schwarz et al. 2016; Hogerheijde et al. 2011), depending on the disk chemistry (Kamp et al. 2013). These missing gas species are thought to be located beyond ‘snowlines’, the locations in PPDs where the midplane temperature is low enough for gas of a given species to freeze out onto dust grains, e.g. 4 AU for water and 20 AU for CO in TW Hya (Zhang et al. 2013, 2017). If icy grains grow to at least millimeter sizes, then they no longer vertically circulate into the region where the ice could be photodesorbed by stellar radiation. Dust evolution models predict that these large icy grains will drift radially towards the star faster than the PPD gas, enhancing the gaseous carbon and oxygen abundances inside the CO and water snowlines (Du et al. 2015; Krijt et al. 2018), as seen for HD 163296 (Zhang et al. 2020). In contrast, TW Hya does not show a strong gaseous volatile molecule enhancement inside its CO snowline at 20 AU (Zhang et al. 2017). Either CO ice is chemically processed into a more rocky carbon carrier or the radial drift of solids is inefficient due to grains col-
lecting in traps (Bosman & Banzatti 2019), which may be the first step to forming planets, or planetesimals themselves.

Measurements of the bulk gas elemental abundances interior to the dust sublimation rim can probe whether the icy C and O have returned to the gas phase or are still missing. The former would imply chemical processing of the ice into other ice species with higher sublimation temperatures, while the latter would suggest that the C and O have been locked into midplane ice reservoirs. For stars >1.4 M$_\odot$, the inner disk elemental abundances can be inferred from the stellar photospheric abundances, due to the formation of a radiative outer envelope that isolates recently accreted material at the stellar surface (Kama et al. 2015; Jermyn & Kama 2018). However, this technique does not work with PPDs around lower mass T Tauri stars, which are the precursors of solar type stars, as their outer layers are convective. Interior circulation thus mixes away the compositional signatures of the accreted gas. Recently, we directly measured the inner PPD gas around a set of these lower mass stars through the use of near-infrared atomic C emission lines (McClure 2019). That work inferred carbon locking in these PPDs but did not observationally measure abundances of hydrogen or other critical elements, e.g. O or Si, which could identify whether these elements were locked in rocky versus icy materials.

In this Letter, we model the hydrogen density and atomic abundances for the inner disk of TW Hya from near-infrared atomic emission lines. We then use these abundances to identify the locations where rock- and ice-forming elements are being locked into midplane dust grain reservoirs in this system.

### 2. Data analysis and physical scenario

To measure the disk abundances inside the dust sublimation radius, we analyze spectra of TW Hya spanning 0.8 - 2.5 $\mu$m taken in three epochs: 2010a and 2010b (VLT X-shooter), and 2013 (Magellan FIRE). The observations and data reduction details are given in Appendix A briefly, the reduced spectra were corrected for telluric absorption, heliocentric velocities, and convolved down to a uniform spectral resolution, R $\sim$6000. All three epochs show H$^0$, He$^0$, Ca$^{+}$, and O$^0$ emission lines (Figs. A.1 and A.2). In the 2013 spectrum, these lines were brighter and showed additional emission from C$^{+}$ and S$^0$ lines at 1.07 and 1.045 $\mu$m, respectively, as shown in Figures A.1 and A.2. We subtract the continuum under the lines of interest in each spectrum using the automated continuum fitter from McClure et al. (2013a). For the detected Ca$^{+}$, O$^0$, C$^{+}$, and S$^0$ lines, we integrated the lines and list the fluxes in Table A.1. For the non-detected strong lines, we use the continuum rms value to obtain 3$\sigma$ upper limits.

The strengthening of all emission lines in 2013 suggests an increase in the density of the accreting, inner disk material for this epoch. We use the H recombination line profiles to confirm this scenario. As shown in Fig. 2 the continuum-subtracted Paschen $\gamma$ lines from 2010b and 2013 are both centrally peaked at the stellar rest velocity, with inverse P-Cygni profiles in the wings. However, the maxima and minima of the 2013 profile are stronger. By subtracting the 2010 line profiles from the 2013 spectrum, we remove the contributions of the star and bulk disk to the emission lines. We model the residual profile with a four-component Gaussian decomposition. A centrally peaked component is found, within the observed velocity resolution uncertainty. Since any stellar chromospheric contribution was removed during the subtraction of the weaker accretion epoch, our fitting results suggests the centrally peaked component could only come from the inner accretion disk, for which the Keplerian motion is in the plane of the sky. In contrast, there is additional inverse P-Cygni emission peaking at -152 km/s and absorbing at +114 km/s. Since TW Hya is face-on (Andrews et al. 2016), we interpret the blue-shifted emission component as the contribution from magnetospheric accretion columns launching out of the disk plane and the red-shifted absorption component to the post-accretion shock braking region at the stellar surface. A fourth Gaussian component absorbs at +389 km/s, close to the predicted free-fall velocity at the accretion shock interface and ~4 times the post-shock velocity, as expected theoretically (Hartmann et al. 2016). Therefore the shape of the H line profiles support our hypothesis of an increase in the density of the inner disk gas. We model the physical conditions and elemental abundances in this gas in the section below.

### 3. Modeling

The gaussian decomposition fit to the H line profiles kinematically isolates the 2013 inner disk hydrogen emission. Using an existing 1D model of the inner disks of T Tauri stars (McClure 2019) driven by the photoionization and chemistry code Cloudy (Ferland et al. 2017), we compare the observed flux ratio between the H Pas and Pay emission lines to measure observationally the H number density, n$_H$, in the inner disk. Then we model the observed flux ratios between these elemental lines and Pay, together with the derived n$_H$, to measure total elemental abundances relative to the total amount of H for the inner disk gas.

Our 1D model assumes the inner disk extends from the co-rotational radius at 0.015 AU out to 0.024 AU. This width was determined from the radial distance travelled on a viscous timescale of ~2.5 years, the difference between epochs 2013 and 2010b, assuming a ‘typical’ $\alpha$=0.01. We took a radially dependent power-law hydrogen density of power -2. We created a composite radiation field to represent the joint contributions from the star and accretion shock. For the star we used ATLAS9 stellar models with solar metallicity (Castelli & Kurucz 2003) at the stellar effective temperature and luminosity, $T_{\text{eff}}$ = 3850 K with $L_{\odot}$ = 0.3 $L_{\odot}$. We treated the accretion shock as a combination of UV and x-ray emission. The UV emission is approximated by a stellar emission spectrum with a temperature and luminosity, $T_{\text{eff}}$ = 8000 K with $L_{\text{shock}}$ = 0.01 $L_{\odot}$. We include a hard X-ray component, assuming a 10 MK bremsstrahlung emission spectrum, with a luminosity of $L_X=10^{30}$ erg/s between 0.3 keV and 10 keV (Rab et al. 2018). Accretion heating was enabled using the Hextra keyword, as described in Section 11.9.4 of the Cloudy user manual, assuming $\alpha$=0.01, the stellar mass, M$_* = 0.6$ M$_\odot$ (Sokal et al. 2018), and the radius set to 0.024 AU.

Cloudy includes a chemical network with atomic and molecular opacities appropriate to the hot, dense, dust-free region interior to the inner dust rim, which enables radiative transfer calculation in the absence of dust opacity. It is important to note that due to the high densities at this location, the chemistry does not behave as in a typical PDR, i.e. ionization of H is provided by charge exchange collisions, rather than photo- or collisional-ionization. Therefore C$^+$ and H$^0$ coexist and are the main C and H carriers despite the exposure to UV and x-rays or expected self-shielding by H$_2$. The inner disk chemistry is discussed extensively in the text of Section 3 and Figures 3 and 4 of McClure (2019), but we also summarize briefly the salient mechanisms, sources of systematic uncertainty in the final abundances, and a complete list of the model parameters in Appendix B.

A value of log(n$_H$) = 14.40 cm$^{-3}$ at the inner edge of the disk model is required to fit the observed Pas/Pay = 2.3 flux ratio in the inner disk kinematic component from 2010b-2010a. By 2013, the inner disk gas density increased to log (n$_H$) = 14.74
Fig. 1. Schematic of emitting regions for previous TW Hya observations, compared with the region probed in this work. For comparison, observed disk structures in millimeter grains (ALMA, Andrews et al. 2016; VLTI, Menu et al. 2014), micron-sized grains (SPHERE, van Boekel et al. 2017), and CO gas (Banzatti & Pontoppidan 2015; Huang et al. 2018) are shown. The vertical scale is not meaningful. References: (a) Dupree et al. (2012), (b) Brickhouse et al. (2010), (c) Herczeg et al. (2002), (d) France et al. (2012), (e) Bergin et al. (2013), (f) Zhang et al. (2013), Bosman & Banzatti (2019), (g) Banzatti & Pontoppidan (2015), Bosman & Banzatti (2019), (h) Zhang et al. (2017). The "zone" labels correspond to the regions described in the analytic calculation of §4.1.

Fig. 2. Isolation of the hydrogen contribution from the inner disk edge. A. Comparison of the Paγ line emission for the 2010b epoch (gray) and 2013 epoch (black) after continuum subtraction. Dashed vertical line indicates the local stellar velocity, to which the spectra have been corrected. B. Gaussian decomposition fit (gray) of the residual spectrum (black) obtained by subtracting the 2010b epoch spectrum from that of 2013. Contributions are indicated with colored fill and include blue-shifted emission (blue: -152 km/s, FWHM ∼ 172 km/s), a centrally peaked emission (green: 7 km/s, FWHM ∼ 126 km/s), and two redshifted absorption components (dark red: 114 km/s, FWHM ∼ 137 km/s; bright red: 389 km/s, FWHM ∼ 124 km/s). C. Cartoon of the physical scenario revealed by the variability and gaussian fitting.
This is consistent with the physical scenario derived from the hydrogen line profiles. We then fixed $\log(n_H)$ to the 2013 value of 14.74 cm$^{-3}$ and varied the atomic abundances of C, O, S, and Ca. Plots of the model fluxes with elemental abundance for each element are shown in Fig. A.3. After confirming that the Paβ/Py ratio was still valid, we determined 3σ upper limits to the abundances of N, K, Na, Mg, Fe, Al, and Si, which have not been detected to this region. The resulting abundances are given in Table A.1.

## 4. Results and discussion

The results of this comprehensive elemental abundance measurement for the inner disk of a T Tauri star contradict the predictions of dust evolution models. All measured elements are depleted with respect to the sun, with volatiles depleted by up to two orders of magnitude and refractories by up to five orders of magnitude. We note that our C/H and O/H values of 3.39×10$^{-6}$ and 1.60×10$^{-5}$, respectively, are consistent within our systematic uncertainties with the C/H and O/H values for TW Hya recently found by Bosman & Banzatti (2019). Likewise, our N/H upper limit of <1.6×10$^{-5}$ is depleted by a factor of 4. This value encompasses the depleted N/H of ~3×10$^{-6}$ inferred for TW Hya by van ’t Hoff et al. (2017) from ALMA observations of NO H+. It is also consistent with a fainter finding of N depletion on the stellar surface of TW Hya, ranging between factors of 1.5 and 5 (Brickhouse et al. 2010).

As shown in Fig. 3 the accretion of primary atmospheres in this gas would not explain the enhanced giant planet atmospheric volatile abundances seen in our solar system. However, the abundance pattern seen between the elements in TW Hya’s gas is a close inverse of the CI chondrite abundance pattern, suggesting that the depletion could be caused by the retention of chondrite-like solids in the disk.

### 4.1. Outer disk dust traps for C, N, and S

Bosman & Banzatti (2019) suggest that the C depletion in TW Hya’s inner disk could result from either a dust trap at the CO snowline (~20 AU) or a CO$_2$ trap close to the H$_2$O snowline (4 AU). Due to the fact that our C/H measurement is entirely within the dust sublimation rim, we can use previous measurements of CO and a simple analytic treatment (Appendix C) to estimate the location where C is locked out.

First, we divide the disk into three zones (see Fig. 1), one exterior to the CO snowline (Zone 1), a second between the CO snowline and dust inner rim (Zone 2), and a third interior to the dust inner rim (Zone 3). This division closely matches the dust traps found by Bosman & Banzatti (2019), with the dust traps at the end of Zone 1 and in the middle of Zone 2. For each zone we take a representative value of C/H. In Zone 3, a C/H depletion factor of 79 is taken from the present work. For Zones 1 and 2, we calculate a C/H ratio from the CI$^{15}$O measurements of Zhang et al. (2019). That works finds a minimum depletion factor for CO/H$_2$ of ~78 outside of the CO snowline, while the average depletion factor within the CO snowline is ~20, taken relative to the interstellar medium CO/H$_2$ value of 10$^{-4}$. These values convert into C/H values of 6.4×10$^{-7}$ and 2.5×10$^{-6}$, making the gross approximation that all gas phase C is in CO.

We then consider that an infinitely thin parcel of gas and dust is transported from the outer edge of Zone 1 through each zone sequentially. The dust is composed of a CO ice component and a “higher temperature” component with carbon carriers that sublime at a higher temperatures than CO, e.g. CO$_2$, organic residues, or graphite. The dust is either locked into the disk in a given zone or allowed to pass through into the next zone, where a portion of it sublimes. We assume a higher temperature component fraction of 0.83, which is the refractory C fraction observed in comet 67P (Rubin et al. 2019), and use Eqs. C.5 and C.10 to calculate the fraction of the initially available carbon dust that is locked into the disk the parcel moves through each zone. We find that 95.9% of the initial carbon dust mass is locked into the disk exterior to the CO snowline (Zone 1). Therefore the combined efficiency of any dust traps exterior to that point is also ~96%. Only 4.1% of the initial dust is transported into Zone 2, with 0.7% of that dust in volatiles that sublimate. Between the CO snowline and the inner dust sublimation rim (Zone 2), an additional 3.06% of the initial dust mass is locked. Only 0.34% of the initial dust crosses the inner dust rim into Zone 3, where it sublimes. In total, only 1.04% of the initial Zone 1 carbon dust mass is returned to the gas phase and accreted onto the central star. The agreement between our C/H abundance in Zone 3 and that of Bosman & Banzatti (2019), which is representative of the gap at 1 AU in Zone 2, between the H$_2$O and CO$_2$ ice snowlines and the silicate dust trap, suggests that the 3% of initial dust locked in Zone 2 is located beyond the 1 AU gap. The efficiency of locking in traps between 1.5 and 20 AU is then 90%.

The most of the uncertainty in the above estimate depends on the higher temperature carbon fraction. Reasonable values range from 0.5, which would lock 99% of the initial carbon mass within Zone 1, at the expense of Zone 2. Decreasing the CO/H$_2$ depletion factor from 20 to 15, the value observed by Zhang et al. (2019) at 4 AU, would reduce the locked dust mass beyond the CO snowline to 94% of the initial dust mass, suggesting that even if CO is converted into CO$_2$ ice, most of that material is already trapped efficiently in the outer disk rings. Locking of solids chemically isolates the inner disk, preventing replenishment of higher temperature C and potentially leading to Earth-like C abundances (Klarmann et al. 2018, Anderson et al. 2017) for terrestrial planets.

A quantitative analysis of the N depletion validates our C transport model and choice of $f_r$. The N/H found by van ’t Hoff et al. (2017) is only ~4% of the solar abundance, i.e. the same fraction of N is missing as we find for C beyond the CO snowline in our model using $f_r$=0.83. Since N$_2$ is likely the dominant solid N-carrier in the outer disk, and its midplane snowline at ~18 K (Pino et al. 2016) should be just outside of the CO snowline, then the N$_2$ must also be trapped in the three submillimeter rings beyond 30 AU.

In contrast with TW Hya, several other disks show no evidence for C or N gas depletion. HD 163296 has enhanced C/H gas interior to the CO snowline (Zhang et al. 2020) due to radial drift, while IM Lup shows depletions of almost 4% (Cleeves et al. 2018). For IM Lup, the gas temperature structure puts the N$_2$ snowline at >250 AU (Cleeves et al. 2016, Fig. 9), which is well outside of the outermost dust ring in IM Lup at 134 AU (Huang et al. 2018). Therefore little N$_2$ ice is trapped in this disk, and gaseous N is not as depleted. A similar lack of dust traps beyond the N$_2$ snowline could account for the ISM N abundance found by Anderson et al. (2019) for a set of ~5-11 Myr disks in upper Sco; however these disks lack the same high spatial resolution continuum observations that enabled the ring detections in IM Lup and TW Hya. For HD 163296, a ring with a deep gap does sit at 100 AU, just outside the CO snowline at 70 AU, that apparently does not trap dust efficiently (Isella et al. 2018). However, while TW Hya’s outer disk gaps are less deep than in HD 163296, it does have three, which may explain their large cumulative trapping efficiency. Alternatively, if the dust in...
the rings of TW Hya has grown larger than in HD 163296, it may be filtered out more efficiently (Rice et al. 2006), or planetesimals have formed, then they would no longer drift efficiently regardless of trapping.

As a further check of the locking location, in the bottom panel of Fig. 3 we compare the bulk atomic composition of the solids left behind in TW Hya’s disk with the abundances of some primitive solar system bodies originating in each of the three zones, e.g. CI chondrites (Lodders 2010 Zone 3), comet 67P (Bardyn et al. 2017) and ultra-carbonaceous Antarctic micro-meteorites (Dartois et al. 2017 Mathurin et al. 2019 UCAMMs, Zone 1). The TW Hya solids are all nearly solar, and within the uncertainties, chondritic abundances are generally a good match to the refractory and semi-volatile elements, as well as S. However, chondrites underproduce TW Hya’s C, N, and O abundances, by an order of magnitude in the case of the former two. Comet 67P and the UCAMMs are more abundant in all three of these elements, but with opposite abundance patterns, i.e. low N/O in comets and high N/O in UCAMMs. A crude check fitting a blend of abundances from CI chondrites and either Comet 67P or UCAMMs, or both combined, to TW Hya’s solid abundances confirms that neither 67P nor UCAMMs on their own provide a good fit to C, N, and O. The former overproduces O and underproduces N, while the latter underproduces N and O, and both fits are poor overall ($\chi^2 \sim 5000-8000$). Interestingly, a combination of all three bodies succeeds in fitting C and O, with $\chi^2 \sim 3$, but not N.

There are several potential explanations of the apparent ‘excess’ nitrogen in TW Hya’s solids. The UCAMMs are thought to originate from differentiated parent bodies beyond the N$_2$ snowline, in which N$_2$ was converted to higher temperature residues (Dartois et al. 2017), but they are ultimately recovered in Antarctica. These residues are more stable against sublimation than the original N$_2$ ice, but is is possible that they encountered some loss on atmospheric entry, artificially lowering the observed abundances. Alternatively, there may be differences between the dust trapping patterns in the solar system and TW Hya that produce different types of primitive bodies; i.e. CI chondrites, comet 67P, and UCAMMs may not be an appropriate basis set for TW Hya’s solids. This is generally true to some extent, particularly as we have only used one comet, 67P, to represent the entire cometary class, due to a lack of comprehensive elemental abundances for additional comets. Finally, the primitive bodies represent the cumulative elements locked into solids at a particular disk radius over the lifetime of the solar nebula, while TW Hya’s solid abundances represent a snapshot of the material that has been locked out of a moving parcel of gas over multiple radii and a later range of times, from $\sim$2-8 Myr based on viscous accretion timescales. If the N-rich dust trap formed later in TW Hya’s lifetime than it did in the solar nebula, then the net effect on the cumulative N abundances in the primitive bodies would be diluted.

Unlike N, S can be found in both volatile molecules, e.g. H$_2$S, or minerals that contain more refractory elements, i.e. FeS. Analysis of the atmospheres of accreting Herbig AeBe stars with disks suggests that of the total S content, <1% is in gaseous form, with 89±8% of S is in refractory minerals (Kama et al. 2019) and the remainder in ices. The depletion of S here is consistent with an 89% refractory fraction; if the trap at 2 AU lets through 0.3% of the total initial dust mass, as for the C transport model, then sublimation of volatile ice with an initial fraction of 11% in that dust can account for all of the gas phase S that we see in the inner disk. The mineral sulphides pass through the 1 AU gap into the inner, refractory disk, which is discussed below.

4.2. Inner disk refractory dust trap

One of the refractory elements, Ca, was firmly detected in the gas phase with a depletion of nearly five orders of magnitude, relative to the solar value. While more depletion of refractories than volatiles is to be expected, due to rocky cores in all icy dust grains, at first glance five orders of magnitude seems extreme. However, two of the upper limits to the abundances of the other refractory elements, Mg and Si, are depleted by approximately $10^{-4}$, roughly supporting such low values. The latter is qualitatively consistent with previous findings of weaker Si relative to C or N in TW Hya’s accretion streams (Ardila et al. 2013). Our extreme depletions suggest that there is an additional dust trap interior to the sublimation point of most species considered for our higher temperature carbon component, where the bare silicate grains are prevented from sublimating.

An obvious choice for this trap is the dust ring interior to 0.5 AU, detected with ALMA (Andrews et al. 2016). Inner disk temperature and density structures calculated self-consistently in hydrostatic equilibrium normally reach the silicate sublimation temperature of 1400 K at $\sim$0.1 AU, in M0 T Tauri stars with mass accretion rates $>10^{-9}$ M$_{\odot}$yr$^{-1}$ (e.g. GO Tau in McClure et al. 2013b Fig. 10). However, using near- and mid-IR interferometry (Menu et al. 2014) find the inner rim for TW Hya at 0.3 AU instead, suggesting that the inner edge is associated with a pressure maximum rather than the silicate sublimation front. Blocking accretion or drift of large silicate grains at 0.3 AU would retain the elements Mg, Si, and Ca in the disk. The cumulative amount of the initial dust mass passing through the three submillimeter rings outside of the CO and N$_2$ snowlines is $\sim$4%, and the trap near the water snowline only allows 10% of that first 4% of the dust to continue through. To reproduce the fraction of initial Si, Mg, and Ca returned to the inner disk gas of $10^{-4}$-2$\times10^{-5}$, only 4.6-0.6% of the dust in the inner 0.3-0.5 AU can pass through the 0.3 AU dust trap and sublimate. This suggests that the trapping efficiency is inversely proportion to the disk radius, with 96% trapping efficiency cumulatively over the outer three submillimeter rings, 90% at the 2 AU ring, and $\sim$95-99% at the 0.3 AU ring.

If the refractory C within the 0.3-0.5 AU ring is efficiently removed by photolysis or oxidation, as suggested by Anderson et al. 2017, then the high trapping efficiency of the 2 AU and outer submillimeter dust traps cuts off C replenishment by drifting solids, as proposed by Klarmann et al. 2018. Should the innermost, refractory trap of TW Hya eventually form terrestrial planets, they would form from very dry and poor in C and N dust, possibly resulting in Earth-like depletions of these elements.

5. Conclusions

To summarize, we piloted a novel method to determine the bulk atomic composition of unseen solids locked at the midplanes of protoplanetary disks, using the TW Hya disk. The volatile elements in this system are depleted by a factor of $\sim$100 with respect to the solar value, while the refractories are depleted by up to five orders of magnitude. The high degree of depletion and difference between the depletion factors of the volatile and refractory elements can be explained if the submillimeter rings all host dust traps, including the truncated ring from 0.3-0.5 AU.

A simple model for the efficiency of dust retention in these traps finds that the inner two dust traps at 0.3 and 2 AU have a high efficiency ($\geq90\%$ each), while the three submillimeter rings beyond the midplane CO and N$_2$ snowlines are collectively $\sim$96%, less individually. Such a high retention efficiency, relative
Fig. 3. Top Comparison of bulk elemental gas abundances inside TW Hya’s dust sublimation rim (black stars, gray stars with arrows for upper limits), with atmospheric abundances of Jupiter (red circles), Saturn (orange circles), Uranus (light blue circle), and Neptune (purple circle), and CI chondrite solids (Lodders 2010, salmon triangles). All data are plotted with error bars. Abundances are with respect to hydrogen and are normalized to the solar abundances (Asplund et al. 2009), with the solar value indicated by the dotted horizontal line. Bottom Comparison of bulk elemental abundances of solids for: TW Hya (black stars), CI chondrites (Lodders 2010, salmon triangles), comet 67P (bulk, dust/ice 1, teal triangles) (Bardyn et al. 2017), and UCAMMs (violet triangles) (Dartois et al. 2017; Mathurin et al. 2019), with the solar value indicated by the dotted horizontal line.

References

Lodders, K. 2010, Astrophysics and Space Science Proceedings, 16, 379
Fig. A.1. Top: Comparison of the three observed epochs of TW Hya: 2010a (cyan, thin line), 2010b (gray, medium line), and 2013 (black, thick line). The oxygen line (left) is a triple line blend, and the calcium line (right) is blended with an $\text{H}^0$ Paschen series line and an absorption artifact from the telluric correction of that line, which we fit out before determining the integrated flux. Bottom: Residual spectra after subtraction of epoch 2 from epoch 3.

**Appendix A: Observation and data reduction details**

One spectrum of TW Hya was obtained with the FIRE spectrograph (Simcoe et al. 2013) at Las Campanas (R ∼ 6000, 0.8 < λ < 2.5 μm) on January 2nd, 2013 (PI McClure). Two 6.0 second exposures in the Fowler 1 read mode were obtained with the 0.6” slit under 0.45” seeing at airmass 1.009 in excellent conditions. We obtained the usual suite of arc lamp and flat-field calibrations and extracted the FIRE spectrum using the standard FIREhose pipeline, with MCN 7202 as the telluric calibrator star. The other two spectra were obtained with VLT X-shooter (Vernet et al. 2011) (visible: 0.8 - 1 μm, R ∼ 18,000; near-IR arm: 1 - 2.5 μm, R ∼ 11,000) on April 7th and May 3rd, 2010. We corrected ESO’s Phase 3 reduced data for telluric absorption using the MolecFit software package. Spectra from all three epochs were corrected for their heliocentric velocities, and the X-Shooter spectra were convolved down to the resolution of the FIRE spectrum. The processed spectra, before and after local continuum subtraction (as described in §2), are shown below. A comparable spectrum of hydrogen is shown in the main text (Fig. 2). The integrated line fluxes are given in Table A.1.

**Appendix B: Inner disk chemical model mechanisms and uncertainties**

Our 1D inner disk model uses version 17.02 of Cloudy (Ferland et al. 2017). As discussed in Section 3.3 of McClure (2019), the high midplane gas densities at 0.024 AU ($n_\text{H} \sim 10^{15}$ [cm$^{-3}$], $N_\text{H} \sim 10^{26}$ [cm$^{-2}$]) lead to a chain of reactions that ultimately produce a mostly neutral gas population, but with a large fraction of free electrons donated mainly by hydrogen itself.

Since the physics and chemistry of molecular hydrogen is critical to understand the atomic H emission, we enabled the larger $\text{H}_2$ molecule module in Cloudy (Shaw et al. 2005). Collisional dissociation of $\text{H}_2$ is efficient at these high densities; however, formation of $\text{H}_2^+$ is hampered, due to the absence of dust inside the silicate sublimation rim (at 0.3 AU). Therefore a large population of $\text{H}^0$ exists. In turn, at these densities $\text{H}^+$ is efficiently created through charge exchange reactions, particularly with sulphur as the collision partner. The fraction of hydrogen in $\text{H}^+$ is $\sim 10^{-3.5}$, and therefore H is the major contributor to the electron density, unlike a PDR where $\text{C}^+$ dominates. Recombination to $\text{H}^0$ produces Lyman photons. However, at these large column densities the gas is...
Carbon

Sulphur

Fig. A.2. The same as for Fig. [A.1] but for S (left) and C (right). The integrated flux of the S line is includes the three-line blend, while the C flux includes only the first three lines. Line styles are the same as in Fig. [A.1].

Table A.1. Observed line fluxes and modeled abundances

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Atomic species</th>
<th>Line [\mu m]</th>
<th>F_{int} [erg/s/cm^2]</th>
<th>S/N</th>
<th>F_X/F_Pa\gamma</th>
<th>X/H ([X/H]_\odot)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H0 (Pa \gamma)</td>
<td>1.09381</td>
<td>7.0\times10^{-9}</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1.26\pm0.54 \times10^{-2}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H0 (Pa \beta)</td>
<td>1.28181</td>
<td>2.0\times10^{-8}</td>
<td>1090.5</td>
<td>2.857\pm0.016</td>
<td>\log (n_H) = 14.74\pm0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C0</td>
<td>1.06831</td>
<td>3.8\times10^{-10}</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>0.0543\pm0.0030</td>
<td>&lt; 2.35\times10^{-1}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N0 (blend)</td>
<td>1.04072</td>
<td>&lt;2.5\times10^{-10}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0073</td>
<td>&lt; 2.67\times10^{-3}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O0 (blend)</td>
<td>0.84464</td>
<td>1.7\times10^{-9}</td>
<td>58.7</td>
<td>0.2429\pm0.0043</td>
<td>3.27\pm2.09 \times10^{-2}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Na0</td>
<td>1.70311</td>
<td>&lt;4.7\times10^{-11}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0067</td>
<td>&lt; 1.12\times10^{-4}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mg0</td>
<td>1.71087</td>
<td>&lt;4.7\times10^{-11}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0067</td>
<td>&lt; 1.68\times10^{-1}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al0</td>
<td>1.67189</td>
<td>&lt;1.1\times10^{-10}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0157</td>
<td>&lt; 1.83\times10^{-4}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Si0</td>
<td>1.58884</td>
<td>&lt;9.8\times10^{-11}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0140</td>
<td>&lt; 2.72\times10^{-2}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S0 (blend)</td>
<td>1.04568</td>
<td>5.6\times10^{-10}</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>0.0800\pm0.0021</td>
<td>8.70\pm4.06 \times10^{-3}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K0</td>
<td>1.51631</td>
<td>&lt;4.7\times10^{-11}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0067</td>
<td>&lt; 6.33\times10^{-3}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ca^{+1}</td>
<td>0.86621</td>
<td>8.7\times10^{-10}</td>
<td>93.1</td>
<td>0.1240\pm0.0015</td>
<td>1.39\pm1.15 \times10^{-5}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fe^{+1}</td>
<td>1.64355</td>
<td>&lt;4.0\times10^{-11}</td>
<td>&lt; 3</td>
<td>&lt;0.0057</td>
<td>&lt; 2.72\times10^{-2}</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: The uncertainties on the modeled abundances are dominated by a systematic 20% uncertainty on the synthetic line fluxes, which results from factor of ~2-4 uncertainty on the charge exchange rate coefficients, as discussed in Section 3.3.4 of Hazy, the Cloudy users’ manual. Abundances are with respect to the Asplund et al. (2009) solar values.
optically thick to UV radiation, so the Lyman photons are absorbed locally by the remaining population of $\text{H}_2$, causing it to enter an excited electronic state. Collisional de-excitation of the $\text{H}_2$ then heats the surrounding gas to $\sim$6000 K. The net result is that at this location in the disk midplane there is no dust, little molecular emission, and mostly neutral atomic gas for which emission line ratios directly probe the bulk elemental abundances. We visually summarize this series of processes in Fig. B.1.

The main source of uncertainty in these calculations comes from the charge exchange rate coefficients, which are accurate to within a factor of 2-4 (Kingdon & Ferland 1996, 1999). The coefficients determine the amount of $\text{H}^{+}$, and therefore the electron density of the gas. In turn, the electron density impacts the level populations in the upper state of the transitions giving rise to the observed emission lines. The uncertainty in the rate coefficients leads to a systematic uncertainty of typically 20% on the synthetic line fluxes, as discussed in Section 3.3.4 of Hazy, the Cloudy users’ manual. We have included that uncertainty in the abundances listed in Table A.1. A secondary source of uncertainty in these calculations is the geometry of the emitting region. However, because we are fitting line ratios, we are not overly sensitive to the geometry of the emitting area, assuming that all of the lines originate in the same region.

An additional complication in the N abundance determination in less dense regions would normally be self-shielding of $\text{N}_2$ against photodissociation, which is known to limit conversion of $\text{N}_2$ into atomic N or other N-bearing molecules more efficiently than for CO. However, as the excitation temperature increases, the efficiency of self-shielding relative to other modes of shielding (e.g. by H, H$_2$, or CO) becomes much less (Heays et al. 2014), and a larger column of $\text{N}_2$ would be required in order to self-shield. At the high temperatures and densities in our model ($T_e \sim$6500 K, log ($n_H$)$\sim$14.75 cm$^{-3}$), Cloudy indeed predicts that atomic N represents at least 99.8% of the total N budget. Critically, even if shielding were efficient at these temperatures, the fact that the UV field is generated locally by H recombination would effectively prevent the formation of a sufficiently large column to shield, as the H$^+$ and $\text{N}_2$ are intimately mixed. There is observational evidence, in any event, for $\text{N}_2$ photodissociation already occurring further out in the disk. [Hily-Blant et al. 2019] detect selective $\text{N}_2$ photodissociation indirectly where the $\text{N}_2$ snowline starts in the disk upper layers around 40 AU, through variation in the $^{15}\text{N}/^{14}\text{N}$ ratio in ALMA observations of HCN isotopologs. And in our own data, we see the 1.04μm [N I] quadruplet at all three epochs; however, it subtracts out of the epoch differenced spectrum, suggesting that it originates further out in the disk rather than in the ring of denser material that we model moving towards the star in 2013.

As an independent check on the resulting hydrogen density, we ran CHIANTI models of line ratios taken between the C$^0$ lines, as in McClure (2019), with additional line ratios between the S$^0$ triplet. The range of electron densities and electron temperatures produced by these abundance- and geometry-independent measures for both C and S, combined, are log ($n_e$) $\sim$ 10.3-12.0 cm$^{-3}$ at $T_e \sim$ 7500-5500 K. The best-fitting Cloudy model has a value of log ($n_e$) $\sim$ 11 cm$^{-3}$ at $T_e \sim$ 6500 K, which is consistent with CHIANTI’s predicted range.

Appendix C: Carbon locking fractions

As an independent check on the location where carbon is locked out of the accreting gas, we formulate a toy model, pictured in Figure 1 of the main text. First, we divide the disk into three zones: Zone 1 (between the outer disk edge and the CO snowline), Zone 2 (between the CO snowline and dust inner rim), and Zone 3 (interior to the dust inner rim). Then we define the model as a parcel of constant density gas and dust that initially sits in the outer disk but is radially transported via accretion processes through the disk to the launching region for the stellar magnetospheric accretion columns. The parcel starts as carbon gas, $M_{g,0}$, with overall solar carbon abundances $X_{C,0} = (C/H)_0 = 2.69 \times 10^{-4}$ (Asplund et al. 2009), from which in Zone 1 solid carbon condenses out with mass:

$$M_{d,1} = M_{g,0} - M_{g,1},$$

leaving a depleted carbon gas mass of $M_{g,1}$ and corresponding abundance $X_{C,1}$ with respect to hydrogen. In the main text, we assume $X_{C,1} = 6.4 \times 10^{-7}$ (Zhang et al. 2019).

The solid carbon component can be split into volatile ice, as CO, and dust that sublimates at higher temperatures than CO, with fraction $f_s$. The higher temperature carbon could be in any of the following materials: CO$_2$ or other C-rich ices, organic residues, amorphous carbon, or graphite. The grains are assumed to move radially along with the gas, unless they become decoupled from the accretion stream and locked in place in one of the zones. This locking could be caused either by the dust decoupling from the gas and entrainment of larger, millimeter-sized dust grains at pressure maxima or by the formation of bodies that are large enough to neither accrete with the gas nor radially drift. The model is agnostic to the exact locking mechanism. We do not consider complications from decoupling of the gas and non-locked dust due to radial drift; we assume that this dust moves with the gas.

We define a fraction, $f_{L,1}$, of the initial dust, $M_{d,1}$, that is locked in some manner in Zone 1, outside of the CO snowline, while the remaining dust exists in small, coupled grains that accrete with the gas across the CO snowline. The successfully transported dust is defined as:

$$M_{d,1} = (1 - f_{L,1})M_{d,1}.$$

At the CO snowline, the volatile dust sublimates, releasing carbon back into the gas phase. Therefore the new carbon gas mass is:

$$M_{g,2} = M_{g,1} + (1 - f_s)M_{d,1},$$

which can be rewritten as:

$$M_{g,2} = M_{g,1} + (1 - f_s)(1 - f_{L,1})(M_{g,0} - M_{g,1}).$$

Article number, page 9 of 12
and corresponds to a carbon abundance of $X_{g,2}$ with respect to hydrogen. In the main text, we assume $X_{g,2} = 2.5 \times 10^{-6}$ (Zhang et al. 2019). Solving Eq. C.4 for the fraction of dust locked in Zone 1, $f_{L,1}$, and rewriting the gas masses of each zone in terms of their observed C/H abundances, $X_{g,1}$ and $X_{g,2}$, yields:

$$f_{L,1} = 1 - \frac{1}{1 - f_r} \frac{X_{g,2} - X_{g,1}}{X_{g,0} - X_{g,1}}$$

(C.5)

assuming that no appreciable hydrogen mass is locked into the grains. The dust mass interior to the CO snowline is then the fraction of the transported solids with a higher sublimation temperature than CO:

$$M_{d,2} = f_r M_{d,d,1}.$$  

(C.6)

A fraction of the dust mass in Zone 2, $f_{L,2}$, is also locked eventually, either through growth to large grains or to planetesimal sizes. Therefore, the mass of dust that is transported in the parcel across the inner dust rim is the dust mass in Zone 2 less the fraction of dust mass $M_{d,2}$ locked in Zone 2:

$$M_{d,d,2} = (1 - f_{L,2}) M_{d,2}.$$  

(C.7)

The mass of gas phase carbon interior to the innermost dust rim is then the carbon gas mass of Zone 2, plus the additional mass of higher temperature transported dust, all of which now sublimes:

$$M_{g,3} = M_{g,2} + M_{d,d,2}.$$  

(C.8)

The latter can be rewritten as:

$$M_{g,3} = M_{g,2} + (1 - f_{L,2}) f_r (1 - f_{L,1}) (M_{g,0} - M_{g,1}).$$  

(C.9)

The Zone 3 corresponds to the carbon abundance found in this work, $X_{g,3} = 3.4 \times 10^{-6}$. Solving Eq. C.9 for the fraction of dust mass $M_{d,2}$ locked into Zone 2, $f_{L,2}$, yields:

$$f_{L,2} = 1 - \frac{1}{(1 - f_{L,1}) f_r} \frac{X_{g,3} - X_{g,2}}{X_{g,0} - X_{g,1}}$$

(C.10)

This locked fraction, which is in terms of the Zone 2 dust mass, can be converted via the definition of $M_{d,2}$ into a locking fraction in terms of the initial dust mass, $M_{d,1}$. We cannot simultaneously constrain both the locking fraction and the higher temperature carbon fraction, but if we assume that the latter is equivalent to the refractory carbon fraction, then reasonable value range from $f_r = 0.5$ in the ISM to $f_r = 0.83$ in comet 67P, as discussed in the main text. Using this range of values and the three observed carbon abundances discussed above produces locking fractions exterior (Zone 1) and interior (Zone 2) to the CO snowline ranging from 90-99%. 

Article number, page 10 of 12
Fig. A.3. Upper left corner: Model flux ratios between Pa $\beta$ and Pa $\gamma$ (y-axis), versus $n_{H_{\text{tot}}}$ (x-axis), compared with the observed flux ratio and error bars (horizontal lines). All other panels: Model flux ratios of studied atomic lines relative to Pa $\gamma$ (y-axis) versus elemental abundance relative to H in solar units (x-axis) for all elements in this study. The diagonal dashed lines indicate the systematic error in the models due to the charge exchange rate coefficients, as discussed in Appendix B. Observational flux ratios are indicated (horizontal lines), with error bars for the four elements with $>3\sigma$ detections (C, O, S, and Ca), while $3\sigma$ upper limits are indicated for the other elements.
Fig. B.1. **Flowchart of the inner disk physical processes** leading to the high temperatures and domination of H over H$_2$ and C over CO at the disk midplane, in contrast to the typical photon-dominated region physics seen in molecular clouds and the outer disk upper layers.