Topological superconductivity in a designer
ferromagnet-superconductor van der Waals heterostructure

Shawulium Kezilebieke,1 Md Nurul Huda,1 Viliam Vaño,1 Markus
Aapro,1 Somesh C. Ganguli,1 Orlando J. Silveira,1 Szczepan Głowzik,2
Adam S. Foster,1,3 Teemu Ojanen,4,5 and Peter Liljeroth1,6

1 Department of Applied Physics, Aalto University School of Science,
PO Box 15100, 00076 Aalto, Finland

2 Institute of Physics, M. Curie-Skłodowska University, 20-031 Lublin, Poland

3 WPI Nano Life Science Institute (WPI-NanoLSI),
Kanazawa University, Kakuma-machi, Kanazawa 920-1192, Japan

4 Computational Physics Laboratory, Physics Unit,
Faculty of Engineering and Natural Sciences,
Tampere University, PO Box 692, FI-33014 Tampere, Finland

5 Helsinki Institute of Physics PO Box 64, FI-00014, Finland

(Dated: February 11, 2020)
Abstract

The designer approach has become a new paradigm in accessing novel quantum phases of matter. Moreover, the realization of exotic states such as topological insulators, superconductors and quantum spin liquids often poses challenging or even contradictory demands for any single material. For example, it is presently unclear if topological superconductivity, which has been suggested as a key ingredient for topological quantum computing, exists at all in any naturally occurring material. This problem can be circumvented by using designer heterostructures combining different materials, where the desired physics emerges from the engineered interactions between the different components. Here, we employ the designer approach to demonstrate two major breakthroughs – the fabrication of van der Waals (vdW) heterostructures combining 2D ferromagnetism with superconductivity and the observation of 2D topological superconductivity. We use molecular-beam epitaxy (MBE) to grow two-dimensional islands of ferromagnetic chromium tribromide (CrBr$_3$) on superconducting niobium diselenide (NbSe$_2$) and demonstrate the existence of the one-dimensional Majorana edge modes using low-temperature scanning tunneling microscopy (STM) and spectroscopy (STS). The fabricated two-dimensional vdW heterostructure provides a high-quality controllable platform for electronic devices harnessing topological superconductivity.
There has been a surge of interest in designer materials that would realize electronic responses not found in naturally occurring materials. Topological superconductors are one of the main targets of these efforts and they are currently attracting intense attention due to their potential as building blocks for Majorana-based qubits for topological quantum computation. Majorana zero-energy modes (MZM) have been reported in several different experimental platforms, with the most prominent examples being semiconductor nanowires with strong spin-orbit coupling and ferromagnetic atomic chains proximitized with an s-wave superconductor. It is also possible to realize MZMs in vortex cores on a proximitized topological insulator surface or on FeTe$_{0.55}$Se$_{0.45}$ superconductor surface. In these cases the MZM were spectroscopically identified as zero energy conductance signals that are localized at the ends of the one dimensional (1D) chain or in the vortex core. In two-dimensional systems, 1D dispersive chiral Majorana fermions are expected to localize near the edge of the system (Fig. 1A). For example, it was proposed that the dispersing Majorana states can be created at the edges of an island of magnetic adatoms on the surface of an s-wave superconductor. Experimentally, promising signatures of such 1D chiral Majorana modes have recently been reported around nanoscale magnetic islands either buried below a single atomic layer of Pt, or adsorbed on a Re substrate, and in domain walls in FeTe$_{0.55}$Se$_{0.45}$. However, these types of systems can be sensitive to disorder and may require interface engineering through, e.g., the use of an atomically thin separation layer. In addition, it is difficult to incorporate these materials into device structures. These problems can be circumvented in van der Waals (vdW) heterostructures, where the different layers interact only through vdW forces. VdW heterostructures naturally allow for very high quality interfaces and a multitude of practical devices have been demonstrated. While vdW materials with a wide range of properties have been discovered, ferromagnetism has been notably absent until recent discoveries of atomically thin Cr$_2$Ge$_2$Te$_6$, CrI$_3$, and CrBr$_3$. The first reports relied on mechanical exfoliation for the sample preparation, but CrBr$_3$ and Fe$_3$GeTe$_2$ have also been grown using molecular-beam epitaxy (MBE) in ultra-high vacuum (UHV). This is essential for realizing clean edges and interfaces.

Among the various known vdW materials, the recently discovered monolayer ferromagnet transition metal trihalides combined with transition metal dichalcogenide (TMD) superconductors form an ideal platform for realizing 2D topological superconductivity (Fig. 1A). Here, we use MBE to grow high-quality monolayer ferromagnet CrBr$_3$ on a NbSe$_2$ super-
FIG. 1. **Realization of topological superconductivity in CrBr$_3$-NbSe$_2$ heterostructures**. 

(A) Schematic of the experimental setup. (B,C) Schematic of the bandstructure engineering to realize topological superconductivity. Effect of adding spin-orbit interactions and weaker and stronger Zeeman-type magnetization on the low-energy band structure in the normal (B) and superconducting states (C). (D) STM image of a monolayer thick CrBr$_3$ island grown on NbSe$_2$ using MBE (STM feedback parameters: $V_{\text{bias}} = +1$ V, $I = 10$ pA, scale bar: 10 nm). (E) Atomically resolved image on the CrBr$_3$ layer (STM feedback parameters: $V_{\text{bias}} = +1.7$ V, $I = 0.5$ nA, image size: $19 \times 19$ nm$^2$). (F) Calculated structure and the induced spin-polarization from density-functional theory calculations. (G) Experimental d$I$/d$V$ spectroscopy on the NbSe$_2$ substrate (blue), the middle of the CrBr$_3$ island (red) and at the edge of the CrBr$_3$ island (green) measured at $T = 350$ mK.
conducting substrate. The mirror symmetry is broken at the interface between the different materials and this lifts the spin degeneracy due to the Rashba effect. Therefore, we have all the necessary ingredients — magnetism, superconductivity and Rashba spin-orbit coupling — required to realize a designer topological superconductor\cite{32,33}. We demonstrate the existence of the one-dimensional Majorana edge modes using low-temperature scanning tunneling microscopy (STM) and spectroscopy (STS). Realizing topological superconductivity in a van der Waals heterostructure has significant advantages compared to the other possible platforms: vdW heterostructures can potentially be manufactured by simple mechanical exfoliation, the interfaces are naturally very uniform and of high quality, and the structures can be straightforwardly integrated in device structures. Finally, layered heterostructures can be readily accessed by a large variety of external stimuli making external control of 2D topological superconductivity potentially possible by electrical\cite{34}, mechanical\cite{35}, chemical\cite{36}, and optical approaches\cite{37}.

Pioneering theoretical works\cite{32,33} demonstrated that topological superconductivity may arise from a combination of out-of-plane ferromagnetism, superconductivity and Rashba-type spin-orbit coupling, as illustrated in Fig. 1B,C. In this scheme, the Rashba coupling lifts the spin-degeneracy of the conduction band while Zeeman splitting due to proximity magnetization lifts the remaining Kramers degeneracy. Adding superconductivity creates a particle-hole symmetric band structure and the superconducting pairing opens gaps at the Fermi energy. In our theoretical model for magnetically covered NbSe\(_2\), a similar picture arises for the real band structure around any of the high symmetry points of the hexagonal Brillouin zone (\(\Gamma\), K, or M) where Rashba coupling vanishes. Depending on the magnitude of the magnetization induced gap \(M\) and the position of the Fermi energy \(\mu\), the system enters a topological phase when \(|\epsilon(k_0) - \mu| \leq M\), where \(\epsilon(k_0)\) is the energy of the band crossing at the high symmetry point in the absence of magnetization. This is due to the created effective \(p\)-wave pairing symmetry. The power of the designer approach with vdW heterostructures comes from the fact that the different components retain their intrinsic properties allowing for rational design of emergent quantum phases of matter and realizing schemes such as shown in Fig. 1B,C.

In Fig. 1D, we show a constant-current STM image of the CrBr\(_3\) island grown on a freshly cleaved bulk NbSe\(_2\) substrate by MBE (details of sample growth and STM experiments are given in the Supplementary Material (SM)). The CrBr\(_3\) islands show a well-ordered moiré
superstructure with 6.3 nm periodicity arising from the lattice mismatch between the CrBr$_3$ and the NbSe$_2$ layers. Fig. 1E shows an atomically resolved STM image of the CrBr$_3$ monolayer, revealing periodically spaced triangular protrusions. These features are formed by the three neighboring Br atoms as highlighted in the Fig. 1F (red triangle) showing the fully relaxed geometry of CrBr$_3$/NbSe$_2$ heterostructure obtained through density functional theory (DFT) calculations (see SM for details). The measured in-plane lattice constant is 6.5 Å, consistent with the recent experimental value (6.3 Å) of monolayer CrBr$_3$ grown on graphite and our DFT calculations. As expected for a weakly-interacting vdW heterostructure, DFT calculations further confirm that the CrBr$_3$ monolayer retains its ferromagnetic ordering with a magnetocrystalline anisotropy favouring an out-of-plane spin orientation as shown in Fig. 1F. The magnetization density (Fig. 1F) shows that the magnetism arises from the partially filled $d$ orbitals of the Cr$^{3+}$ ion. While the largest magnetization density is found close to the Cr atoms, as expected, there is also significant proximity induced magnetization on the Nb atoms in the underlying NbSe$_2$ layer.

This establishes that our system has the required key ingredients for topological superconductivity and now we probe the resulting emergent quantum matter with STS measurements at a temperature of $T = 350$ mK. Fig. 1G shows experimental $dI/dV$ spectra (raw data) taken at different locations indicated in Fig. 1D (marked by filled circles). The $dI/dV$ spectrum of bare NbSe$_2$ has a hard gap with an extended region of zero differential conductance around zero bias, which can be fitted by a double gap s-wave BCS-type spectrum (see SM for details). In contrast, the spectra taken in the middle of the CrBr$_3$ island have small but distinctly non-zero differential conductance inside the gap of the NbSe$_2$ substrate. Moreover, we observe pairs of conductance onsets at $\pm 0.3$ mV around zero bias (red arrows). The magnetization causes the formation of energy bands (dubbed Shiba bands) that exist inside the superconducting gap of the substrate. By introducing spin-orbit interactions (as discussed above), the system can be driven into a topological phase with associated closing and reopening of the gap between the Shiba bands.

We observe edge modes consistent with the expected Majorana modes along the edge of the magnetic island that are the hallmark of 2D topological superconductivity. Moreover, the spectroscopic feature of the Majorana edge mode appears inside the gap defined by the Shiba bands (the topological gap) and is centred around the Fermi level ($E_F$). A typical spectrum taken at the edge of the CrBr$_3$ island is shown in Fig. 1G, where a peak
FIG. 2. Electronic structure of CrBr$_3$-NbSe$_2$ heterostructures. (A) The band structure of the spin-split Nb $d$-band used in the effective model for topological superconductivity with magnetization $M = 100$ meV. The inset shows the 1$^{st}$ Brillouin zone, where the six M-points and the Rashba texture around them has been highlighted. (B) Calculated phase diagram of the magnetized NbSe$_2$ based on the effective low-energy model. The color scale indicates the energy gap $E_{\text{gap}}$ (in the units of $\Delta$). (C) The calculated topological gap $\Delta_t$ as a function of the Rashba and magnetization energies (in units of the superconducting gap $\Delta$). (D) Calculated band structure of the topological phase based on a phenomenological tight-binding model (see SM for details).

localized at $E_F$ is clearly seen. Furthermore, there are two side peaks located at $\pm 0.41$ mV (see SM for a more detailed analysis) that are very close in energy to the Shiba bands on the CrBr$_3$ layer.

To account for the experimental observations and to corroborate the topological nature of the edge modes, we model the system through DFT calculations and develop an effective low-energy model for the system (see SM for details). The band structure of the Nb $d$-states derived band used in the effective model is shown in Fig. 2A (direct comparison with DFT is shown in the SM). Topological superconductivity can be generated when magnetization is sufficiently strong to push one of the spin-degenerate bands at a high-symmetry point above...
the Fermi energy. We identify the observed topological phase as a state arising from the gap-closing transition at M point with a Chern number $C = 3$. The calculated topological phase diagram in Fig. 2B indicates that for a reasonable magnetization of $M \lesssim 100$ meV, the $C = 3$ state lies approximately 100-200 meV below the Fermi energy of pristine NbSe$_2$. Thus, a small renormalization of the chemical potential resulting from the contact with the magnetic material will drive the system to the topological phase. The two other nontrivial phases that originate from gap closings at the $\Gamma$ point and $K$ points give rise to topological phases with $C = -1$ and $C = -2$. Realization of either of these phases would require notably larger shifts in chemical potential ($\sim 0.6$ eV), making them improbable for the experimental observations. The absolute values of the nontrivial Chern numbers can be understood by a three-fold rotational symmetry (see SM).

The key quantity characterizing robustness of the nontrivial phase is the topological energy gap $\Delta_t$. This scale should be much larger than temperature for the state to be observable in experiment. In the simple parabolic band model this quantity can be estimated by $\Delta_t = \alpha k_F / [(\alpha k_F)^2 + M^2]^{1/2}$, where $\alpha$ is the Rashba coupling and $k_F$ the Fermi wavelength\cite{37}. The calculated gap based on our more realistic tight-binding (TB) model is shown in Fig. 2C. Based on the experimental results shown in Fig. 1G, the topological gap is $\Delta_t \approx 0.3\Delta$. The calculated band structure in a strip geometry corresponding to the experimental gap is shown in Fig. 2D, where we see the Majorana edge modes crossing the topological gap. The edge modes are seen to coexist with the bulk states in a finite subgap energy window in agreement with experimental observations.

To further elucidate the properties of the Majorana edge modes, we have carried out spatially resolved $dI/dV$ spectroscopy over the edge of the CrBr$_3$ island (Fig. 3A). It can be seen that the edge mode is more localized at the edge at zero bias (deeper within the topological gap), but becomes more delocalized at energies closer to the topological gap edge. Moreover, the energy dependence of the main feature of the edge mode LDOS is such that it splits off from the top edge of the topological gap inside the CrBr$_3$ island, smoothly crosses the topological gap and merges with its lower edge outside the CrBr$_3$ island. In order to visualize the evolution of the spatial extension of the Majorana edge modes, we have recorded grid $dI/dV$ spectroscopy maps (Fig. 3B-G). At $E_F$, the Majorana edge modes are confined within $\sim 2.4$ nm of the edge of the island (see SM). In addition to the edge mode signature close to the Fermi level, there is also enhanced LDOS at the energies similar to size of the
FIG. 3. **Spatially resolved spectroscopy of the Majorana zero modes.** (A) $dI/dV$ spectroscopy over the edge of the CrBr$_3$ island (STM topography shown on the top). (B-G) STM topography and spatially resolved LDOS maps extracted from grid spectroscopy experiments. STM feedback parameters: (A) $V_{bias} = +1$ V, $I = 10$ pA; (B) $V_{bias} = +0.8$ V, $I = 10$ pA. Scale bars: (A) 4 nm; (B) 12 nm. (H-N) Corresponding calculated linespectra (H) and LDOS maps (J-N) with the island shape shown in (I) (see SM for details).

topological gap (Fig. 3E,F) where we also see significant excitations inside the magnetic island. The theoretically computed LDOS (Fig. 3H-N, see SM for details) reproduces the essential features of the experimental results and shows exponential localization of Majorana edge modes at the edge of the island at subgap energies. In particular, we confirm the
experimental finding that the distribution of the spectral weight of the edge mode along the edge (excluding the regular moiré pattern) should be non-uniform. This stems from the geometric irregularities of the island boundary with characteristic length scale that is comparable to the edge mode penetration depth. However, this does not imply the edge modes are discontinuous along the edge. It simply means that the interference effects near edge irregularities suppress the visibility of the edge mode due to finite experimental resolution. The simulations also reproduce the slightly dispersing peaked LDOS across the island edge, and the enhanced LDOS at the islands edges at and above the topological gap edge.

It is conceivable that the experimentally observed edge modes could possess a topologically trivial origin, unrelated to the existence of a topological superconducting state. However, in addition to the near quantitative match with the theoretical results incorporating the main ingredients of the experimental system, the edge mode signature is experimentally very robust. We consistently observe it in our hybrid vdW heterostructures on all CrBr$_3$ islands, irrespective of their specific size and shape (see SM for more examples). To prove the observed edge modes of the hybrid heterostructures are strongly linked to the superconductivity of the NbSe$_2$ substrate, we have carried out experiments in magnetic fields up to 4 T, suppressing superconductivity in the NbSe$_2$ substrate. All features associated with the gap at the center of the island and the edge modes disappear in the absence of superconductivity in NbSe$_2$ (see SM for details). This rules out trivial edge modes as the cause of the observed results. Another non-topological reason for resonances close to the Fermi energy, the Kondo effect, should also be present in the normal state and can hence be ruled out as well.

In conclusion, our work constitutes two breakthroughs in designer quantum materials. By fabricating vdW heterostructures with 2D ferromagnet epitaxially coupled to superconducting NbSe$_2$, we obtained a near ideal designer structure exhibiting two competing electronic orders. The induced magnetization and spin-orbit coupling renders the superconductor topologically nontrivial, supporting Majorana edge channels which we characterized by STM and STS measurements. The demonstrated heterostructure provides a high-quality platform for electrical devices employing topological superconductivity. This is an essential step towards practical devices employing topological superconductivity and the demonstrated system would in principle allow electrical control of the topological phase through
electrostatic tuning of the chemical potential.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This research made use of the Aalto Nanomicroscopy Center (Aalto NMC) facilities and was supported by the European Research Council (ERC-2017-AdG no. 788185 “Artificial Designer Materials”), Academy of Finland (Academy professor funding no. 318995 and 320555, and Academy postdoctoral researcher no. 309975), and the Aalto University Centre for Quantum Engineering (Aalto CQE). SG acknowledges the support of National Science Centre (NCN, Poland) under grant 2017/27/N/ST3/01762. Computing resources from the Aalto Science-IT project and CSC, Helsinki are gratefully acknowledged. ASF has been supported by the World Premier International Research Center Initiative (WPI), MEXT, Japan.

*Email: kezilebieke.shawulienu@aalto.fi, teemu.ojanen@tuni.fi, peter.liljeroth@aalto.fi


