A CURIOUS CONVERGENT SERIES

MELVYN B. NATHANSON

ABSTRACT. By a classical theorem of Kempner, the sum of the reciprocals of integers with missing digits converges. This result is extended to a much larger family of “missing digits” sets of positive integers with convergent harmonic series. Related sets with divergent harmonic series are also constructed.

If $A$ is the set of all positive integers or if $A$ is the set of prime numbers, then the series $\sum_{a \in A} 1/a$ diverges. If $A$ is the set of squares or cubes or twin primes, then the series $\sum_{a \in A} 1/a$ converges. Mathematicians have long been interested in the convergence or divergence of “harmonic” series of the form $\sum_{a \in A} 1/a$.

Let $c \in \{1, 2, \ldots, 9\}$, and let $A_{10}(c)$ be the set of positive integers in which the digit $c$ does not occur in the usual decimal representation. Kempner [10] proved in 1914 that $\sum_{a \in A_{10}(c)} 1/a$ converges. He called this “a curious convergent series.” Kempner’s theorem has been studied by Baillie [1], Farhi [6], Gordon [7], Irwin [9], Lubeck-Ponomarenko [12], and Schmelzer and Baillie [15].

More generally, for every integer $g \geq 2$, every positive integer $n$ has a unique $g$-adic representation of the form $n = \sum_{i=0}^{k} c_i g^i$, with digits $c_i \in \{0, 1, 2, \ldots, g-1\}$ for $i = 0, 1, \ldots, k$ and $c_k \neq 0$. If $A_g(c)$ is the set of integers whose $g$-adic representation contains no digit $c$, then the infinite series $\sum_{a \in A_g(c)} 1/a$ converges (Hardy and Wright [8, Theorem 144]).

The $g$-adic representation is a special case of a more general method to represent the positive integers. Let $G = (g_i)_{i=0}^{\infty}$ be a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that $g_0 = 1$ and $g_i$ divides $g_{i+1}$ for all $i \geq 0$. The integer $d_i = \frac{g_{i+1}}{g_i}$ satisfies $d_i \geq 2$ and

$$g_{k+1} = g_k d_k = d_0 d_1 d_2 \cdots d_k$$

for all $k \geq 0$. Every nonnegative integer $n$ has a unique representation in the form

$$n = \sum_{i=0}^{\infty} c_i g_i$$

where $c_i \in \{0, 1, \ldots, d_i - 1\}$ for all $i \geq 0$, and $g_i = 0$ for all sufficiently large $i$. Moreover, $g_k \leq n < g_{k+1}$ if and only if $c_k \geq 1$ and $c_i = 0$ for all $i \geq k + 1$. We call $G$-adic representation of $n$. This is equivalent to deBruijn’s additive system (Nathanson [11]). In Theorem 1 we construct sets of integers with missing $G$-adic digits whose harmonic series converge. In Theorem 2 we construct sets of integers with missing $G$-adic digits whose harmonic series diverge.


2010 Mathematics Subject Classification. 11A63, 11B05, 11B75, 11K16.

Key words and phrases. Integers with missing digits, harmonic series.
Lemma 1. Let \( G = (g_i)_{i=0}^\infty \) be a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that \( g_0 = 1 \) and \( g_i \) divides \( g_{i+1} \) for all \( i \geq 0 \). Let \( d_i = g_{i+1}/g_i \). Let \( I \) be a set of nonnegative integers, and, for all \( i \in I \), let \( U_i \) be a nonempty proper subset of \([0, d_i - 1]\). For all \( k \geq 0 \), let \( A_k \) be the set of integers \( n \in [g_k, g_{k+1} - 1] \) whose \( G \)-adic representation \( n = \sum_{i=0}^{k} c_i g_i \) satisfies the following missing digits condition:

\[
\text{If } k \in I \text{ and } U_k = [1, d_k - 1], \text{ then } A_k = \emptyset. 
\]

If \( k \notin I \) or if \( k \in I \) and \( U_k \neq [1, d_k - 1] \), then \( A_k \neq \emptyset \) and

\[
|A_k| \leq \left( \prod_{i=0}^{k-1} (d_i - |U_i|) \right) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i.
\]

Proof. If \( n = \sum_{i=0}^{k} c_i g_i \in [g_k, g_{k+1} - 1] \), then \( c_k \neq 0 \), and so \( c_k \in [1, d_k - 1] \). It follows that if \( k \in I \) and \( U_k = [1, d_k - 1] \), then \( A_k = \emptyset \).

Let \( A_k \neq \emptyset \) and \( n \in A_k \). There are three cases.

(i) If \( k \in I \) and \( 0 \in U_k \), then

\[
|A_k| = \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i.
\]

(ii) If \( k \in I \) and \( 0 \notin U_k \), then \( U_k \neq [1, d_k - 1] \) and \( |U_k| \leq d_k - 2 \) and

\[
d_k - |U_k| \leq 2(d_k - |U_k| - 1).
\]

We have

\[
|A_k| = (d_k - |U_k| - 1) \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i < \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i \leq 2(d_k - |U_k| - 1) \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i = 2|A_k|.
\]

(iii) Note that \( d_k \geq 2 \) implies \( d_k \leq 2(d_k - 1) \). If \( k \notin I \), then

\[
|A_k| = (d_k - 1) \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i < \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i
\]

and

\[
2|A_k| = 2(d_k - 1) \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i \geq \prod_{i \in I} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \notin I} d_i.
\]

This completes the proof. \( \square \)
Let $A$ be a subset of the set $\mathbb{N}_0$ of nonnegative integers, and let $A(x)$ be the number of elements $a \in A$ with $a \leq x$. The set $A$ has density zero if $\lim_{x \to \infty} A(x)/x = 0$.

**Theorem 1.** Let $G = (g_i)_{i=0}^\infty$ be a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that $g_0 = 1$ and $g_i$ divides $g_{i+1}$ for all $i \geq 0$. Let $d_i = g_{i+1}/g_i$. Let $I$ be a set of nonnegative integers, and, for all $i \in I$, let $U_i$ be a nonempty proper subset of $[0, d_i - 1]$. Let $A$ be the set of positive integers whose $G$-adic representations satisfy the following missing digits condition: If $n = \sum_{i=0}^k c_i g_i$, then $c_i \in [0, d_i - 1] \setminus U_i$ for all $i \in I$. If

$$\limsup_{i \to \infty} d_i < \infty$$

and if

$$I(x) \geq ax^\theta$$

for some $\alpha > 0$, $\theta > 0$, and all $x \geq x_0$, then the set $A$ has density zero, and the harmonic series $\sum_{a \in A} 1/a$ converges.

Kempner’s theorem is the special case $g_i = 10^i$, $d_i = 10$, and $U_i = \{c\}$ for all $i \in I = \mathbb{N}_0$.

**Proof.** For all $i \in I$, we have

$$1 \leq |U_i| \leq d_i - 1$$

and

$$\frac{1}{d^\ell} \leq \frac{1}{d_i} \leq \frac{d_i - |U_i|}{d_i} = 1 - \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} \leq 1 - \frac{1}{d^\ell} < 1.$$

For all $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$, the sets $A_k = A \cap [g_k, g_k + 1]$ are pairwise disjoint, and $A = \bigcup_{k=0}^\infty A_k$. Choose $\ell_0$ such that $g_{\ell_0} \geq x_0$. If $x \geq g_{\ell_0}$, then

$$g_{\ell} \leq x \leq g_{\ell+1} - 1$$

for some $\ell \geq \ell_0$. By Lemma [1]

$$A(x) \leq A(g_{\ell+1} - 1) = \sum_{k=0}^\ell |A_k| \leq \sum_{k=0}^\ell \prod_{i=0}^k (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i=0}^k d_i$$

$$\leq (\ell + 1) \prod_{i=0}^\ell (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i=0}^\ell d_i.$$

Because $\limsup_{i \to \infty} d_i < \infty$, there exists $d^* \ast$ such that $d_i \leq d^* \ast$ for all $i \geq 0$. From [1] and [4] we have

$$\frac{A(x)}{x} \leq \frac{A(g_{\ell+1} - 1)}{g_\ell} \leq \frac{d_\ell (\ell + 1)}{\prod_{i=0}^\ell d_i} \prod_{i=0}^\ell (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i=0}^\ell d_i$$

$$\leq d^* (\ell + 1) \prod_{i=0}^\ell \left( 1 - \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} \right) \leq d^* (\ell + 1) \prod_{i=0}^\ell \left( 1 - \frac{1}{d^*} \right)$$

$$\leq d^* (\ell + 1) \left( 1 - \frac{1}{d^*} \right)^{\theta^\alpha}.$$
and so
\[
0 \leq \lim_{x \to \infty} \frac{A(x)}{x} \leq \limsup_{\ell \to \infty} \frac{A(g_{\ell+1} - 1)}{g_\ell} \leq \lim_{\ell \to \infty} d^*(\ell + 1) \left( 1 - \frac{1}{d^*} \right)^{\alpha \theta} = 0.
\]

Thus, the set \( A \) has density zero.

If \( a \in A_k \), then \( a \geq g_k \) and so
\[
\sum_{a \in A} \frac{1}{a} = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \sum_{a \in A_k} \frac{1}{a} \leq \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{|A_k|}{g_k}
\]
\[
\leq \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{d_k}{\prod_{i=0}^{k} d_i} \prod_{i=0}^{k} (d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i=0}^{k} d_i
\]
\[
\leq d^* \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\prod_{i=0}^{k} d_i} \prod_{i=0}^{k} d_i
\]
\[
\leq d^* \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{d^*} \right)^{\alpha \theta} < \infty.
\]

Thus, the harmonic series converges. This completes the proof. \( \square \)

Harmonic series constructed from sequences of integers with missing \( G \)-adic digits do not always converge. Theorem 1 implies that if \( |I| = N_0 \) and \( A \) is a sequence with missing \( G \)-adic digits whose harmonic series diverges, then \( \limsup_{\ell \to \infty} d_\ell = \infty \). The following Theorem shows that the “missing digits” set constructed from \( G = (g_i)_{i=0}^{\infty} \) with \( g_i = 2^{(i+1)/2} \) and \( d_i = 2^i \) and with \( I = N_0 \) and \( U_i = \{0\} \) for all \( i \in I \) has a divergent harmonic series.

**Theorem 2.** Let \( G = (g_i)_{i=0}^{\infty} \) be a strictly increasing sequence of positive integers such that \( g_0 = 1 \) and \( g_i \) divides \( g_{i+1} \) for all \( i \geq 0 \). Let \( d_i = g_{i+1}/g_i \). Let \( I \) be a set of nonnegative integers, and, for all \( i \in I \), let \( U_i \) be a proper subset of \([0, d_i - 1]\). Let \( A \) be the set of positive integers whose \( G \)-adic representations satisfy the missing digits condition \( \Theta \). Let \( A_k = A \cap [g_k, g_{k+1} - 1] \). If \( A_k \neq \emptyset \) for only finitely many \( k \), then the set \( A \) is finite and its harmonic series converges. If \( A_k \neq \emptyset \) for infinitely many \( k \), and if

\[
\sum_{i \in I} \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} < \infty
\]

then the harmonic series \( \sum_{a \in A} 1/a \) diverges.

**Proof.** The convergence of the series \( \Theta \) implies the convergence of the product
\[
\prod_{i \in I} \left( 1 - \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} \right)
\]
and so there exists \( \delta > 0 \) such that
\[
\prod_{i=0}^{k} \left( 1 - \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} \right) > \delta
\]
for all $k \in \mathbb{N}_0$. Using the notation of Theorem 1, we have

$$\sum_{a \in A} \frac{1}{a} = \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \sum_{a \in A_k} \frac{1}{a} \geq \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{|A_k|}{g_k + 1}$$

$$\geq \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{\prod_{i=0}^{k-1} d_i \prod_{i \in I}(d_i - |U_i|) \prod_{i \not\in I} d_i}$$

$$= \frac{1}{2} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \prod_{i=0}^{k-1} \left( 1 - \frac{|U_i|}{d_i} \right).$$

If $A_k \neq \emptyset$ for infinitely many $k$, then the harmonic series diverges. This completes the proof. □

There is a large literature on integers with missing digits (for example, Bourgain [2, 3], Erdős, Mauduit, and Sárközy [4, 5], Konyagin [11], Maynard [13], Swaenepoel [16], and Walker and Walker [17]). These papers consider only representations of integers to base $g$ for $g \geq 2$. It would be of interest to extend this work to sets of positive integers with missing digits in $G$-adic representations.

References
