

# Zero-one law of orbital limit points for weighted shifts

Antonio Bonilla and Karl-G. Grosse-Erdmann\*

## Abstract

Chan and Seceleanu have shown that if a weighted shift on  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$  admits an orbit with a non-zero limit point then it is hypercyclic. We present a new proof of this result that allows to extend it to very general sequence spaces. Under a stronger assumption on the orbit we also obtain that the weighted shift is chaotic.

## 1 Introduction

Linear dynamics has seen some very striking results. For example, Bourdon and Feldman [6] have shown that if an orbit of an operator is somewhere dense then it is already dense, which implies that the operator is hypercyclic. Clearly, if the orbit is only supposed to have a non-zero limit point one can no longer deduce that it is dense. It therefore came as quite a surprise when Chan and Seceleanu [14], [8] showed the following: If a weighted shift on  $\ell^p$ ,  $1 \leq p < \infty$ , admits an orbit that has a non-zero limit point then the weighted shift is hypercyclic. They call such a result a *zero-one law of orbital limit points*. The zero-one law applies both to unilateral and bilateral weighted shifts, the proof in the latter case being considerably more difficult.

Now, Chan and Seceleanu do not discuss whether this behaviour extends to weighted shifts on other sequence spaces. We have a number of results in linear dynamics where weighted shifts on  $c_0$  behave differently from those on  $\ell^p$ ; see [2] for just one example. Nonetheless, He, Huang and Yin [13, Lemma 5] have recently obtained a result that implies, for unilateral weighted shifts, the zero-one law of orbital limit points on all reasonable Fréchet sequence spaces.

It is the main aim of this short note to obtain the zero-one law of orbital limit points also for bilateral weighted shifts on very general Fréchet sequence spaces. Our proof uses ideas that are very different from those of Chan and Seceleanu for  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$ , leading us to a shorter argument.

Recall that a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{N}_0$  is a Fréchet space that is a subspace of the space  $\mathbb{K}^{\mathbb{N}_0}$  of all (real or complex) sequences and such that each coordinate functional  $x = (x_n)_{n \geq 0} \rightarrow x_k$ ,  $k \geq 0$ , is continuous. The unit sequences are denoted by  $e_n = (\delta_{n,k})_{k \geq 0}$ . A weight sequence is a sequence  $w = (w_n)_{n \geq 1}$  of non-zero scalars. The unilateral weighted (backward) shift  $B_w$  is then defined by  $B_w(x_n)_{n \geq 0} = (w_{n+1}x_{n+1})_{n \geq 0}$ . Fréchet sequence spaces over  $\mathbb{Z}$  and bilateral weighted (backward) shifts are defined analogously.

As already done by He et al. [13], we will consider the main question in the larger context of  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclicity. Here,  $\mathcal{F}$  is a Furstenberg family, that is, a non-empty family of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}_0$  with the property that if  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  and  $B \supset A$  then  $B \in \mathcal{F}$ ; we will also

---

\*The work was partially supported by MICINN and FEDER, projects MTM2016-75963-P and PID2019-105011GB-I00; the second author was also supported by FNRS Grant PDR T.0164.16

assume that  $\mathcal{F}$  does not contain the empty set. A Furstenberg family is called left-invariant if  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  and  $n \geq 0$  implies that  $A - n := \{k - n : k \in A, k \geq n\} \in \mathcal{F}$ ; and partition regular if, whenever  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  is decomposed as  $A = A_1 \cup A_2$ , then  $A_1$  or  $A_2$  is in  $\mathcal{F}$ .

A (continuous, linear) operator  $T$  on a Fréchet space  $X$  is called  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclic if it admits a vector  $x \in X$ , also called  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclic, such that, for any non-empty open set  $U$  in  $X$ ,

$$\{n \geq 0 : T^n x \in U\} \in \mathcal{F}.$$

This notion has been studied in detail in [3] and [4]. Classical hypercyclicity is  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclicity for the Furstenberg family of infinite sets; in other words, a vector is hypercyclic if its orbit is dense. Frequent hypercyclicity is  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclicity for the Furstenberg family of sets of positive lower density. Finally, an operator is chaotic if it is hypercyclic and has a dense set of periodic points. For more on linear dynamics we refer to [1] and [12].

The present investigation was motivated by our work with co-authors on frequently recurrent operators, which will appear elsewhere, see [5].

## 2 Orbital limit points for unilateral weighted shifts

For unilateral weighted shifts, the Chan-Secoleanu zero-one law has recently been generalized by He et al. [13, Lemma 5]. For the sake of completeness we present here the argument.

**Theorem 2.1** (He, Huang, Yin). *Let  $X$  be a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{N}_0$  in which  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis. Suppose that the weighted shift  $B_w$  is an operator on  $X$ . Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a Furstenberg family. If there is some  $x \in X$  and a non-zero vector  $y \in X$  such that, for any neighbourhood  $V$  of  $y$ ,*

$$\{n \geq 0 : B_w^n x \in V\} \in \mathcal{F},$$

*then there is a set  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  such that*

$$\sum_{n \in A} \frac{1}{\prod_{\nu=1}^n w_\nu} e_n \quad \text{converges in } X.$$

*Proof.* By a standard conjugacy argument, see [12, p. 96], it suffices to consider the unweighted shift  $B$ . Let  $x \in X$  and  $y \neq 0$  be given by the hypothesis. Let  $p \geq 0$  be such that  $y_p \neq 0$ . We may assume that  $y_p = 2$ . Let  $V$  be a neighbourhood of  $y$  such that  $z \in V$  implies that  $|z_p| \geq 1$ . Then there is a set  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  such that, for all  $n \in A$ ,  $B^n x \in V$  and hence that  $|x_{n+p}| \geq 1$ . Since  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis in  $X$  and  $x \in X$ , we deduce that

$$\sum_{n \in A} e_{n+p} \quad \text{converges in } X.$$

A  $p$ -fold application of  $B$  implies the claim. □

The following is implicit in [13].

**Corollary 2.2** (Zero-one law of orbital limit points for unilateral weighted shifts). *Let  $X$  be a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{N}_0$  in which  $(e_n)_n$  is a basis. Suppose that the weighted shift  $B_w$  is an operator on  $X$ . If there exists an orbit with a non-zero limit point, then  $B_w$  is hypercyclic.*

*Proof.* Apply Theorem 2.1 to the Furstenberg family of infinite sets to deduce that there is a subsequence  $(n_k)_k$  such that  $(\prod_{\nu=1}^{n_k} w_\nu)^{-1} e_{n_k} \rightarrow 0$  in  $X$ , which implies that  $B_w$  is hypercyclic, see [12, Theorem 4.8]. Note that for this Furstenberg family the unconditionality of the basis is not needed in the proof of Theorem 2.1.  $\square$

Let us note that, for  $X = \ell^p$ , Chan and Seceleanu [8, Theorem 1.1] have obtained even weaker conditions than in Corollary 2.2 that imply hypercyclicity. Moreover, in [9], the same authors have found sufficient conditions under which the vector whose orbit has a non-zero limit point is itself cyclic.

We do not know whether, or for which Furstenberg families  $\mathcal{F}$ , the hypothesis in Theorem 2.1 implies that  $B_w$  is  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclic. The conclusion in the theorem is only a minor part of the characterization of  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclic unilateral weighted shifts, see [4, Theorem 6.2].

**Remark 2.3.** He et al. [13, Corollary 4.2] have applied Theorem 2.1 to the Furstenberg family of syndetic sets, that is, sets with bounded gaps. In that case it follows immediately that  $B_w$  is chaotic, and hence frequently hypercyclic, see [12, Theorem 4.8, Corollary 9.14].

### 3 Orbital limit points for bilateral weighted shifts

The main purpose of this note is to extend the Chan-Seceleanu zero-one law for bilateral weighted shifts on  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$  to more general spaces and Furstenberg families. As one can see in [8], the bilateral case is much more demanding than the unilateral one. In fact, Chan and Seceleanu deduce the hypercyclicity of the shift from an explicit construction of a hypercyclic vector. We will give here an alternative, more abstract, and it seems shorter argument in the general situation.

**Theorem 3.1.** *Let  $X$  be a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{Z}$  in which  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis. Suppose that the weighted shift  $B_w$  is an operator on  $X$ . Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a left-invariant and partition regular Furstenberg family. If there is some  $x \in X$  and a non-zero vector  $y \in X$  such that, for any neighbourhood  $V$  of  $y$ ,*

$$\{n \geq 0 : B_w^n x \in V\} \in \mathcal{F},$$

*then, for any  $p \geq 0$  and any 0-neighbourhood  $W$  in  $X$ , there is a set  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  such that*

$$\sum_{n \in A} \frac{1}{\prod_{\nu=1}^{p+n} w_\nu} e_{p+n} \quad \text{converges in } X, \text{ and}$$

$$\left( \prod_{\nu=p-n+1}^0 w_\nu \right) e_{p-n} \in W \quad \text{for all } n \in A, n \geq p.$$

*Proof.* First, by the usual conjugacy argument, see [12, pp. 100–101], we may assume that the shift  $B_w = B$  is unweighted. Let  $x \in X$  and  $y \neq 0$  be as in the hypothesis. Then there is some  $q \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $y_q \neq 0$ . We may suppose that  $y_q = 2$ .

Since  $\mathcal{F}$  is left-invariant and does not contain the empty set, each of its sets is infinite. It follows that  $x_n \neq 0$  for infinitely many  $n \geq 0$ . Replacing  $x$  by  $Bx$ , if necessary, we may assume that there are infinitely many  $r \geq 0$  such that  $x_{2r-q} \neq 0$ ; note that  $Bx$  also satisfies the hypothesis by left-invariance of  $\mathcal{F}$ .

Now fix  $p \geq 0$ . There is then some  $r \geq \max(p, q)$  such that  $x_{2r-q} \neq 0$ ; let  $\delta = |x_{2r-q}| > 0$ . Fix also a 0-neighbourhood  $W$  of  $X$ . By unconditionality of the basis the operators  $z \rightarrow z_j e_j$ ,  $j \in \mathbb{Z}$ , are uniformly continuous on  $X$ . Thus there is a 0-neighbourhood  $W_0$  in  $X$  such that, if  $z \in W_0$  and  $j \in \mathbb{Z}$ , then

$$|z_j| \geq \delta/2 \implies e_j \in B^{-(r-p)}(W). \quad (1)$$

By making  $W_0$  smaller, if necessary, we can also assume that  $|z_q| \geq 1$  whenever  $z \in y + W_0$ .

By hypothesis, there is then a set  $A \in \mathcal{F}$  such that  $B^n x \in y + W_0$  and hence  $|x_{q+n}| \geq 1$  whenever  $n \in A$ . Setting

$$D := A - (r - q) = \{n - (r - q) : n \in A, n \geq r - q\}$$

we have by left-invariance that  $D \in \mathcal{F}$ . And we have for any  $m \in D$  that  $x_{r+m} = x_{q+n}$  for some  $n \in A$  and hence  $|x_{r+m}| \geq 1$ . Since  $x \in X$ , unconditionality of the basis  $(e_n)_n$  implies that

$$\sum_{m \in D} e_{r+m} \in X.$$

Since  $B$  is continuous and  $p \leq r$  we also have that

$$\sum_{m \in D} e_{p+m} \in X. \quad (2)$$

Next, let us consider the two subsets

$$D_1 = \{m \in D : |y_{r-m}| \geq \delta/2\}$$

and

$$D_2 = \{m \in D : |y_{r-m}| < \delta/2\}$$

of  $D$ . Since  $D \in \mathcal{F}$ , partition regularity implies that one of the two sets must belong to  $\mathcal{F}$ .

First, if  $D_1 \in \mathcal{F}$  then since  $y \in X$ , unconditionality of the basis implies that  $\sum_{m \in D_1} e_{r-m} \in X$ . Thus there is some  $N \geq p$  such that, for any  $m \in D_1 \cap [N, \infty)$ ,

$$e_{r-m} \in B^{-(r-p)}(W)$$

and hence

$$e_{p-m} \in W. \quad (3)$$

Now, since  $\mathcal{F}$  is partition regular and contains no finite sets, we have that  $D_1 \cap [N, \infty) \in \mathcal{F}$ ; thus (2) and (3) imply the claim after another application of unconditionality.

Finally, suppose that  $D_2 \in \mathcal{F}$ . We recall that  $B^n x - y \in W_0$  for all  $n \in A$ , and hence  $B^{m+r-q} x - y \in W_0$  for all  $m \in D$ . The coordinate at index  $r - m$  of  $B^{m+r-q} x - y$  is

$$x_{2r-q} - y_{r-m}.$$

Since  $|x_{r-2q}| = \delta$ , we then have by the definition of  $D_2$  that

$$|x_{2r-q} - y_{r-m}| > \delta/2, \quad m \in D_2.$$

Since  $B^{m+r-q} x - y \in W_0$ , (1) implies that

$$e_{r-m} \in B^{-(r-p)}(W),$$

and hence again (3) for all  $m \in D_2$ . Together with (2) the claim follows also in this case.  $\square$

As a consequence we can extend the Chan-Seceleanu bilateral zero-one law to all reasonable Fréchet sequence spaces.

**Corollary 3.2** (Zero-one law of orbital limit points for bilateral weighted shifts). *Let  $X$  be a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{Z}$  in which  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis. Suppose that the weighted shift  $B_w$  is an operator on  $X$ . If there exists an orbit with a non-zero limit point, then  $B_w$  is hypercyclic.*

*Proof.* We apply Theorem 3.1 to the Furstenberg family of infinite subsets of  $\mathbb{N}_0$ . It is again no restriction of the generality to consider the unweighted shift.

The theorem then tells us that, for any  $p \geq 0$  and any 0-neighbourhood  $W$  in  $X$ , there is some  $n \geq p$  such that

$$e_{p+n} \in W \quad \text{and} \quad e_{p-n} \in W.$$

Choosing  $W$  even smaller, if necessary, and applying  $B^k$ ,  $k = 0, \dots, 2p$ , we obtain by the continuity of  $B$  that, for any  $p \geq 0$  and any 0-neighbourhood  $W$  in  $X$ , there is some  $n \geq p$  such that, for any  $j = -p, \dots, p$ ,

$$e_{j+n} \in W \quad \text{and} \quad e_{j-n} \in W.$$

But this is precisely the characterization of hypercyclicity for  $B$ , see [12, Theorem 4.12] and its proof.  $\square$

We note that for the corollary to hold we do not need that  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis; for the Furstenberg family of infinite sets, the proof of Theorem 3.1 also works under the weaker assumption that  $(e_n)_n$  is a basis for which the operators  $x \rightarrow x_n e_n$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ , are uniformly continuous on  $X$ .

Once more, Chan and Seceleanu [8, Theorem 2.1] have obtained an even weaker condition that implies hypercyclicity for bilateral weighted shifts on  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$ .

We do not know whether, in general, the conclusion in Theorem 3.1 implies that  $B_w$  is  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclic. The conclusion falls well short of the known characterization of  $\mathcal{F}$ -hypercyclicity, see [11, Theorem 15].

Let us look at the special case when  $\mathcal{F}$  is the family of syndetic sets. Unlike for unilateral weighted shifts, see Remark 2.3, it is then not obvious whether the conclusion in Theorem 3.1 yields that  $B_w$  is chaotic. But we can obtain chaos by a direct argument that is specific to syndetic sets.

**Theorem 3.3.** *Let  $X$  be a Fréchet sequence space over  $\mathbb{Z}$  in which  $(e_n)_n$  is an unconditional basis. Suppose that the weighted shift  $B_w$  is an operator on  $X$ . If there is some  $x \in X$  and a non-zero vector  $y \in X$  such that, for any neighbourhood  $V$  of  $y$ ,*

$$\{n \geq 0 : B_w^n x \in V\}$$

*is syndetic, then  $B_w$  is chaotic and therefore frequently hypercyclic.*

*Proof.* By conjugacy it suffices once more to consider the unweighted shift  $B$ . Let  $x, y \in X$  with  $y \neq 0$  be as in the hypothesis. Then there is some  $q \in \mathbb{Z}$  so that  $y_q$  is non-zero, and we may assume that  $y_q = 2$ . Let  $V$  be a neighbourhood of  $y$  so that  $z \in V$  implies that  $|z_q| \geq 1$ . Then, by hypothesis, there is a syndetic set  $A \subset \mathbb{N}_0$  such that, for all  $k \in A$ ,  $B^k x \in V$  and hence  $|x_{k+q}| \geq 1$ . Since  $x \in X$ , unconditionality of the basis implies that

$$\sum_{n \in A+q} e_n \in X,$$

where  $A + q = \{k + q : k \in A, k + q \geq 0\} \subset \mathbb{N}_0$  is a syndetic set.

Let  $N$  be the size of the maximum gap in  $A$ , and let  $I$  be an integer interval in  $] -\infty, -1]$  of length  $N$ . We choose a 0-neighbourhood  $W$  in  $X$  so that, for any  $z \in W$  and any  $n \in I$ ,  $|z_n| \leq \frac{1}{2}$ . By hypothesis, there is an infinite (even syndetic) set  $D \subset \mathbb{N}_0$  such that  $B^m x \in y + W$  for all  $m \in D$ . Note that for any  $m \in D$  large enough, the set  $I + m - q$  intersects  $A$ , so that there are  $n \in I$ ,  $m \in D$  and  $k \in A$  with

$$n + m - q = k.$$

Now,  $B^m x - y \in W$  implies that  $\frac{1}{2} \geq |[B^m x]_n - y_n| = |x_{n+m} - y_n| = |x_{k+q} - y_n|$  and hence  $|y_n| \geq \frac{1}{2}$ ; note that  $|x_{k+q}| \geq 1$ . Since  $I \subset ] -\infty, -1]$  was an arbitrary interval of length  $N$  we see that there is an infinite set  $A' \subset ] -\infty, -1]$  with bounded gaps such that, for any  $n \in A'$ ,  $|y_n| \geq \frac{1}{2}$ . The fact that  $y \in X$ , together with unconditionality of the basis, gives us that

$$\sum_{n \in A'} e_n \in X.$$

Altogether we have that

$$z := \sum_{n \in (A+q) \cup A'} e_n$$

belongs to  $X$ . Since  $(A+q) \cup A' \subset \mathbb{Z}$  has bounded gaps and is unbounded above and below there is some  $M \geq 0$  such that all entries of the sequence

$$\sum_{j=0}^M B^j z \in X$$

are at least 1. Thus, with a final application of unconditionality, we obtain that  $\sum_{n=-\infty}^{\infty} e_n$  belongs to  $X$ . This shows that  $B$  is chaotic, see [12, Theorem 4.12].

For the additional statement, note that any chaotic weighted shift is frequently hypercyclic (see [12, Corollary 9.14, Exercise 9.2.3]).  $\square$

If the underlying space is an  $\ell^p$ -space, then a considerable improvement is available. The following uses an argument of Bès et al. [3]. We remark that the result does not hold on  $c_0(\mathbb{N}_0)$ , see [2, Theorem 5].

**Theorem 3.4.** *Let  $B_w$  be a weighted shift on  $\ell^p(\mathbb{N}_0)$  or  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$ ,  $1 \leq p < \infty$ . If there is some  $x \in X$  and a non-zero vector  $y \in X$  such that, for any neighbourhood  $V$  of  $y$ ,*

$$\{n \geq 0 : B_w^n x \in V\}$$

*has positive upper Banach density, then  $B_w$  is chaotic and therefore frequently hypercyclic.*

*Proof.* We only consider the bilateral case. Thus, let  $x$  and  $y \neq 0$  be as in the hypothesis. Then there is some  $q \in \mathbb{Z}$  such that  $y_q \neq 0$ , and we may assume that  $y_q = 1$ . Now, the unweighted shift  $B$  is an isomorphism on  $\ell^p(\mathbb{Z})$ . Moreover, there is a bounded weight sequence  $v$  such that

$$B_v B^q = B^q B_w;$$

in fact,  $v = B^q w$  (as taken in  $\ell^\infty(\mathbb{Z})$ ). It follows that  $B_w$  is chaotic if and only if  $B_v$  is. Also, for any neighbourhood  $V$  of  $B^q y$ , the set  $\{n \geq 0 : B_v^n(B^q x) \in V\}$  has positive upper Banach density.

This argument implies that we can assume that  $q = 0$ , that is  $y_0 = 1$ . Now, the set

$$A = \{n \geq 0 : \|B_w^n x - y\| \leq \frac{1}{2}\}$$

has positive upper Banach density. We then have for any  $n \in A$  that  $|w_1 \cdots w_n x_n - 1| \leq \frac{1}{2}$ , and also

$$(\|y\| + \frac{1}{2})^p \geq \|B_w^n x\|^p \geq \sum_{m < n} |w_{m-n+1} \cdots w_0 w_1 \cdots w_m x_m|^p + \sum_{m > n} |w_{m-n+1} \cdots w_m x_m|^p.$$

Continuing now word by word as in the proof of [3, Theorem 12] we deduce that

$$\sum_{n \geq 1} \frac{1}{|w_0 w_1 \cdots w_n|^p} < \infty \quad \text{and} \quad \sum_{n < 0} |w_n w_{n+1} \cdots w_0|^p < \infty,$$

which implies that  $B_w$  is chaotic, see [12, Example 4.15], and hence frequently hypercyclic.  $\square$

To end this note we point out that Chan and Seceleanu [7] have obtained their zero-one law of orbital limit points also for the adjoints of multiplication operators with non-constant multiplier on Bergman spaces  $A^2(\Omega)$  on arbitrary regions  $\Omega$  in  $\mathbb{C}$ . They mention that their argument breaks down when the underlying space is the Hardy space  $H^2(\mathbb{D})$ . On the other hand, for a very general class of spaces, including  $A^2(\mathbb{D})$  and  $H^2(\mathbb{D})$ , Costakis and Parissis [10, Proposition 6.1] have shown that, for adjoints of multiplication operators with non-constant multipliers, recurrence implies hypercyclicity. This would suggest that the answer to the following question is positive.

**Question 3.5.** Is the adjoint of a multiplication operator with non-constant multiplier on  $H^2(\mathbb{D})$  hypercyclic as soon as it admits an orbit with a non-zero limit point?

There is a close link between adjoint multiplication operators on  $H^2(\mathbb{D})$  and functions of the (unweighted) shift  $B$  on  $\ell^2$ , see [12, Proposition 4.41]. Thus we may also be interested in the following.

**Question 3.6.** Let  $\varphi$  be a non-constant holomorphic function on a neighbourhood of  $\overline{\mathbb{D}}$ . Let  $B$  be the shift on a complex sequence space  $\ell^p$ ,  $1 \leq p < \infty$ , or  $c_0$ . Is then  $\varphi(B)$  hypercyclic as soon as it admits an orbit with a non-zero limit point?

We note that a characterization of the hypercyclicity of  $\varphi(B)$  seems to be known only for  $\ell^2$ , see [12, Theorem 4.42].

## References

- [1] F. Bayart and É. Matheron, *Dynamics of linear operators*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 2009.
- [2] F. Bayart and I. Z. Ruzsa, Difference sets and frequently hypercyclic weighted shifts, *Ergodic Theory Dynam. Systems* 35 (2015), 691–709.
- [3] J. Bès, Q. Menet, A. Peris, and Y. Puig, Recurrence properties of hypercyclic operators, *Math. Ann.* 366 (2016), 545–572.
- [4] A. Bonilla and K.-G. Grosse-Erdmann, Upper frequent hypercyclicity and related notions, *Rev. Mat. Complut.* 31 (2018), 673–711.

- [5] A. Bonilla, K.-G. Grosse-Erdmann, Antoni López-Martínez, and Alfred Peris, Frequently recurrent operators, arXiv:2006.11428.
- [6] P. S. Bourdon and N. S. Feldman, Somewhere dense orbits are everywhere dense, *Indiana Univ. Math. J.* 52 (2003), 811–819.
- [7] K. C. Chan and I. Seceleanu, Orbital limit points and hypercyclicity of operators on analytic function spaces, *Math. Proc. R. Ir. Acad.* 110A (2010), 99–109.
- [8] K. Chan and I. Seceleanu, Hypercyclicity of shifts as a zero-one law of orbital limit points, *J. Operator Theory* 67 (2012), 257–277.
- [9] K. Chan and I. Seceleanu, Cyclicity of vectors with orbital limit points for backward shifts, *Integral Equations Operator Theory* 78 (2014), 225–232.
- [10] G. Costakis and I. Parissis, Szemerédi’s theorem, frequent hypercyclicity and multiple recurrence, *Math. Scand.* 110 (2012), 251–272.
- [11] K.-G. Grosse-Erdmann, Frequently hypercyclic bilateral shifts, *Glasg. Math. J.* 61 (2019), 271–286.
- [12] K.-G. Grosse-Erdmann and A. Peris Manguillot, *Linear chaos*, Springer, London 2011.
- [13] S. He, Y. Huang, and Z. Yin,  $J^{\mathcal{F}}$ -class weighted backward shifts, *Internat. J. Bifur. Chaos Appl. Sci. Engrg.* 28 (2018), 1850076, 11 pp.
- [14] I. Seceleanu, *Hypercyclic operators and their orbital limit points*, PhD-thesis, Bowling Green State University, 2010.

Antonio Bonilla  
 Departamento de Análisis Matemático  
 Universidad de La Laguna  
 C/Astrofísico Francisco Sánchez, s/n  
 38721 La Laguna, Tenerife, Spain  
 E-mail: a.bonilla@ull.es

Karl-G. Grosse-Erdmann  
 Département de Mathématique  
 Université de Mons  
 20 Place du Parc  
 7000 Mons, Belgium  
 E-mail: kg.grosse-erdmann@umons.ac.be