

Lower bounds on the maximum dimension of a simple module in characteristic p

Geoffrey R. Robinson

March 17, 2024

Abstract

We obtain lower bounds for the maximum dimension of a simple FG -module, where G is a finite group, p is a prime, and F is an algebraically closed field of characteristic p . These bounds are described in terms of properties of p -subgroups of G . It turns out that it suffices to treat the case that $O_p(G) = \Phi(G) = 1$. In that case, our main result asserts that if p is an odd prime which is not Mersenne, then there is a simple FG module S of dimension at least $\frac{|G|_p}{|\text{Out}_G(X)|_p}$,

where $X = O^{p'}(E(G))$ and $\text{Out}_G(X) = G/XC_G(X)$ is (isomorphic to) the group of outer automorphisms of X induced by the conjugation action of G . Note, in particular, that this quotient is $|G|_p$ when $X = 1$, that is to say, when no component of G has order divisible by p (and, more generally, the quotient is $|G|_p$ when $\text{Out}_G(X)$ is a p' -group).

We also use simplicial complex methods to obtain a weaker general bound which still applies when $p = 2$ or when p is a Mersenne prime.

1 Introduction and Statement of Theorem 1

In this note, we are interested in exhibiting simple FG -module S whose dimension is large relative to the size of p -subgroups of G , where F is an algebraically closed field of characteristic p . We will prove:

Theorem 1: *Let G be a finite group, p be a prime, and F be an algebraically closed field of characteristic p . Suppose further that $O_p(G) = \Phi(G) = 1$. Set $X = O^{p'}(E(G))$ and $\text{Out}_G(X) = G/XC_G(X)$. Then:*

- i) *If p is an odd prime which is not Mersenne, then there is a simple FG module S of dimension at least $\frac{|G|_p}{|\text{Out}_G(X)|_p}$.*
- ii) *If $p = 2$, or if p is a Mersenne prime, then there is a simple FG -module of dimension at least $|A|$, where A is a maximal Abelian p -subgroup of $XC_G(X)$ which contains an Abelian p -subgroup of maximal order of $C_G(X)$.*

Remark: Note, in particular, that the quotient given in part i) of Theorem 1 is $|G|_p$ when $X = 1$, that is to say, when no component of G has order divisible by p .

2 On the maximal dimension of a simple module

Let G be a finite group, p be a prime, and F be an algebraically closed field of characteristic p . Let P be a Sylow p -subgroup of G . We define the invariant $m_s(G) = m_s(G, p)$ to be the maximal dimension of a simple FG -module, and we are concerned in this note with obtaining lower bounds for $m_s(G)$ in terms of properties of P and its subgroups. Clearly, we have $m_s(G) = m_s(G/O_p(G))$, so it suffices to deal with the case that $O_p(G) = 1$. Note that we clearly have $m_s(G) = m_s(X)m_s(Y)$ when $G = X \times Y$ is a direct product of subgroups X and Y .

There are many examples of finite groups G with $O_p(G) = 1$ and $m_s(G) = |P|$. For example, when $p = 2$ and $G = \text{SL}(2, 2^n)$, then we have $m_s(G) = 2^n$, the degrees of the simple FG -modules being $1, 2, 2^2, \dots, 2^n$ (with $\binom{n}{j}$ occurrences of simple modules of dimension 2^j), so we can't expect to obtain a general bound stronger than $m_s(G) \geq |P|$. It is known that finite simple groups of Lie type have a p -blocks of defect zero for every prime p by theorems of Michler [5] and Willems [9], so we do have $m_s(G) \geq |P|$ for such groups G (whatever the defining characteristic of G is). For most primes p (other than the defining characteristic and prime divisors of the order of the Weyl group), such groups G have Abelian Sylow p -subgroups.

It is clear that $m_s(G) \geq m_s(H)$ for each section H of G . For if $N \triangleleft G$, we certainly have $m_s(G/N) \leq m_s(G)$, while if K is a subgroup of G , and S is a simple FK -module of maximal dimension, then $\text{Ind}_K^G(S)$ has a composition factor T such that S is a composition factor of $\text{Res}_K^G(T)$, so that $\dim_F(T) \geq \dim_F(S)$.

Slightly less obvious than the reduction to $O_p(G) = 1$ is that it suffices to deal with the case $\Phi(G) = 1$ when $O_p(G) = 1$. For if $O_p(G) = 1$, then $\Phi(G)$ is a nilpotent p' -group. We reproduce the well-known proof that $O_p(G/\Phi(G)) = 1$. For suppose otherwise, and let $N \triangleleft G$ denote the full pre-image in G of $O_p(G/\Phi(G))$. Let Q be a Sylow p -subgroup of N . Then $G = NN_G(Q)$ by the Frattini argument, and $N = \Phi(G)Q$, so that $G = \Phi(G)N_G(Q)$. Hence $G = N_G(Q)$, contrary to $O_p(G) = 1$.

Note that when $\Phi(G) = 1$, we have $\Phi(M) = 1$ whenever $M \triangleleft \triangleleft G$. In particular, each component of G (if any exist) is a non-Abelian simple group. Also, $F(G)$ is a direct product of minimal normal subgroups of G , each of which is complemented in G . In particular, $F(G)$ is a direct product of elementary Abelian groups (for various primes). Hence $F^*(G) = \text{soc}(G)$ is the direct product of the minimal normal subgroups of G .

In determining a lower bound for $m_s(G)$ in terms of properties of p -subgroups of G when $O_p(G) = \Phi(G) = 1$, it suffices to treat the case that $G = PF^*(G)$. For $O_p(PF^*(G))$ centralizes $F^*(G)$ in that case, and $Z(F(G))$ is a p' -group. Hence we assume from now on that $O_p(G) = \Phi(G) = 1$, and that $G = PF^*(G)$, with $F^*(G)$ being a direct product of (possibly Abelian) simple groups.

3 When $G \neq O^p(G)$

In the previous section, we reduced to a configuration where $G = PF^*(G)$. Note that $G \neq O^p(G)$ if $G \neq F^*(G)$. It may be worthwhile to digress to make some general remarks about the relationship between $m_s(G)$ and $m_s(H)$ when $H = O^p(G)$. In one sense, the Clifford theory between simple FH -modules and simple FG -modules is transparent, yet the relationship between $m_s(G)$ and $m_s(H)$ is less clear in general.

Given a simple FH -module S , with inertial subgroup $I_G(S) = K$, say, then S has a unique extension \tilde{S} to a simple FK -module, and then $\text{Ind}_K^G(\tilde{S})$ is the unique simple FG -module covering S . Hence the number of simple FG -modules is the number of orbits of G on isomorphism types of simple FH -modules, and a simple FH -module S in a given G -orbit gives rise to a simple FG -module of dimension $[G : I_G(S)]\dim_F(S)$.

Hence we obtain $m_s(H) \leq m_s(G) \leq [G : H]m_s(H)$ but it is usually difficult to ascertain without further knowledge which simple FH -module gives rise in this fashion to a simple FG -module of maximal dimension.

A case we will return to later is when $G = F^*(G)P$, and G has no component of order divisible by p . Even in the case that $F^*(G) = N$ is Abelian, there are examples where $m_s(G) = |A|$, the maximal order of an Abelian p -subgroup of G .

When $G = NP$, with N an Abelian normal p -complement acted on faithfully by the finite p -group P , the discussion at the beginning of this section shows that each simple FG -module has dimension a power of p dividing $|P|$. Also, each projective indecomposable FG -module has dimension $|P|$. In general, there need not be a projective simple FG -module (indeed, by dimension considerations, there certainly can be no such simple module if $|P| > |N|$, a situation which can occur).

Examples of the last phenomenon occur as familiar types of counterexamples to “Burnside’s other $p^a q^b$ -theorem”, or to various types of regular orbit theorems. One standard type is when p is a Mersenne prime, $P \cong C_p \wr C_p$, and N is an elementary Abelian group of order $(p+1)^p$. In this case, we do have $|P| > |N|$, so that $m_s(G) < |P|$, and we find that $m_s(G) = \frac{|P|}{p}$, which is the maximal order of an Abelian subgroup of P .

Another standard type of counterexample is when $p = 2$ and N is an elementary Abelian q -group of order q^2 , where $q > 3$ is a Fermat prime. Then the

2-group $P = C_{q-1} \wr C_2$ acts faithfully on N , and we have $|P| > |N|$, the semidirect product $G = NP$ has $m_s(G) < |P|$, and we again find that $m_s(G) = \frac{|P|}{p}$, which is the maximum order of an Abelian subgroup of P . Even in the case $p = 2, q = 3$, we find that $m_s(G) = 4$, the maximum order of an Abelian 2-subgroup of $G = NP$, although we do have $|P| = 8 < 9 = |N|$ in this case.

When $p = 2$ or p is a Mersenne prime, we may use direct products of some of the groups above to construct arbitrarily large examples of solvable p -nilpotent groups G with $O_p(G) = 1$ such that $m_s(G)$ is the maximum order of an Abelian p -subgroup A of P , yet G has a non-Abelian Sylow p -subgroup P . In fact, it is clear that $[P : A]$ may be made as large as desired.

In the next section, we use p -subgroup complexes to obtain a weaker general bound which suffices to cover these exceptional cases, but which will be significantly improved in the last section for odd primes p which are not Mersenne.

4 Using p -subgroup complexes

When G is a finite group, we let \mathcal{P} denote the simplicial complex associated to the poset of non-trivial p -subgroups of G . This was introduced by D. Quillen in [7], and has been extensively studied by K.S. Brown, S. Bouc, P.J. Webb, and J. Thévenaz, among others. We let σ denote a strictly increasing chain of non-trivial p -subgroups of G . We let $|\sigma|$ denote the number of inclusions in the chain. The group G acts by conjugation on chains, and the reduced Euler characteristic of this complex is (up to a sign depending on conventions chosen) $\sum_{\sigma \in \mathcal{P}/G} (-1)^{|\sigma|} [G : G_\sigma]$, where we include the empty chain, and consider it to have length 0.

In the Green Ring for FG , there is defined what P.J. Webb described as the Steinberg (virtual) module for \mathcal{P} , which is

$$\sum_{\sigma \in \mathcal{P}/G} (-1)^{|\sigma|} \text{Ind}_{G_\sigma}^G(F),$$

and which we denote by $St_p(G)$. This was proved in (Webb,[8]), to be a virtual projective module, that is to say, a difference of projective modules (allowing the possibility of the zero module).

The virtual module $St_p(G)$ may instead be calculated with respect to other G -homotopy equivalent complexes (with the same result). One of these, favoured by Quillen, is the complex \mathcal{E} associated to the poset of elementary Abelian p -subgroups of G . Another, favoured by S. Bouc, is the complex \mathcal{U} associated to the poset of non-trivial p -subgroups U of G which satisfy $U = O_p(N_G(U))$.

Since $St_p(G)$ is a virtual projective module, it is a difference of projective FG -modules, each of which is liftable to characteristic zero. Hence $St_p(G)$ yields

a well-defined complex virtual character. Furthermore, $\text{St}_p(G)$ is uniquely determined (as a linear combination of indecomposable projectives) by this virtual character, using the non-singularity of the Cartan matrix.

If $O_p(G) \neq 1$, it is well-known (see, eg, Quillen [7]), that $\text{St}_p(G) = 0$. We know of no example of a finite group with $O_p(G) = 1$ and $\text{St}_p(G) = 0$, but it seems to be an open question at present whether $O_p(G) = 1$ implies $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$.

The virtual character afforded by (the lift to characteristic zero) of $\text{St}_p(G)$ is the alternating sum of characters afforded by homology modules associated to the complex \mathcal{P} . In particular, if $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$, then the homology of the complex \mathcal{P} is non-zero, and the complex \mathcal{P} is not contractible.

In cases where we are able to establish that $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$, we obtain a lower bound for $m_s(G)$:

Lemma 1: *Let G be a finite group such that $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$. Then there is simple FG -module S and a chain σ of non-trivial p -subgroups of G , such that $\text{Res}_{G_\sigma}^G(S)$ contains the projective cover of the trivial module as a summand. In particular, $\dim_F(S) \geq |Q|$, where $Q \in \text{Syl}_p(G_\sigma)$. The chain σ may be chosen to consist of elementary Abelian p -subgroups of G , in which case we have $|Q| \geq |A|$ for some maximal Abelian p -subgroup A of G .*

Proof: Let S be a simple module such that the projective cover of S occurs with non-zero multiplicity in $\text{St}_p(G)$. Then there is a chain σ such that the projective cover of S occurs as a summand of $\text{Ind}_{G_\sigma}^G(F)$, and σ may be chosen to consist of elementary Abelian p -subgroups.

Then the projective cover of the trivial module occurs as a summand of $\text{Res}_{G_\sigma}^G(S)$, since $\text{Ind}_{G_\sigma}^G(F \otimes \text{Res}_{G_\sigma}^G(S^*))$ has the projective cover of the trivial module as a direct summand, and the multiplicity of the projective cover of the trivial module as a summand is preserved by induction of modules.

Hence the first claim follows. If we choose σ to consist of elementary Abelian subgroups, and we choose a maximal Abelian p -subgroup A of G containing the largest subgroup of the chain, then $A \leq G_\sigma$ and $|Q| \geq |A|$.

Next, we observe that when $F^*(G)$ is a p' -group, (in particular, when G is p -solvable with $O_p(G) = 1$), then we can do somewhat better.

Corollary 2: *Let G be a finite group such that $F^*(G)$ is a p' -group, and let A be an Abelian p -subgroup of G of maximal order. Then $m_s(G) \geq |A|$.*

Proof: It suffices to prove that $m_s(O_{p'}(G)A) \geq |A|$, so we may suppose that $G = O_{p'}(G)A$, since $O_p(O_{p'}(G)A) = 1$.

But in this case, a Theorem of Hawkes and Isaacs ([4]) applies, and allows us to conclude that the virtual module $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$. In fact, Hawkes and Isaacs even prove that the reduced Euler characteristic of \mathcal{P} is non-zero, and the reduced Euler characteristic of \mathcal{P} is the virtual dimension of $\text{St}_p(G)$. Hence Lemma 1 applies to G (note that, under current assumptions, every maximal Abelian p -subgroup of G is conjugate to A).

In the paper [1] of Aschbacher-Kleidman, they establish a condition which, using a previous result of the present author, ensures that for any finite almost simple group G with $F^*(G) \not\cong \text{PSL}(3, 4)$, we have $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$. They obtain the same conclusion when G is the simple group $\text{PSL}_3(4)$, but the condition may fail for certain subgroups of $\text{Aut}(\text{PSL}(3, 4))$. This yields:

Corollary 3: *Let G be a finite non-Abelian simple group. Then $m_s(G) \geq |A|$ for some maximal Abelian p -subgroup A of G .*

Proof: By a Theorem of Aschbacher-Kleidman ([1]), we have $\text{St}_p(G) \neq 0$. Hence Lemma 1 may be applied to G , and $m_s(G) \geq |A|$ for some maximal Abelian p -subgroup of G .

5 Proof of Theorem 1

By the results of Granville and Ono [2], Michler [5], and Willems [9], whenever G is a finite non-Abelian simple group and p is a prime greater than 3, the group G has a p -block of defect zero. However, for both $p = 2$ and $p = 3$, there are alternating groups and sporadic simple groups which have no p -block of defect zero.

By the proof of Lemma 2.3 of Guralnick and Robinson [3], whenever p is an odd prime which is not Mersenne, and $q \neq p$ is a prime, then a Sylow p -subgroup R of $G = \text{GL}(n, q)$ has at least two regular orbits on the natural module for G . When $q = 2$ and p is not Mersenne, we need to adapt the latter proof as follows: In the case that R is Abelian of order p^r and the action of R on the natural module for G is irreducible, all orbits of R on non-zero vectors are regular, but we don't have $2^n - 1 = p^r$, since that equality would force r to be odd and $p + 1$ to be a power of 2, contrary to the fact that p is not a Mersenne prime. Hence there are at least two regular orbits of R on the non-zero vectors of the natural module for G . Then the inductive argument proceeds in a manner similar to that of Lemma 2.3 of [3].

The proof of our main result subdivides naturally according to whether $F^*(G)$ is a p' -group or not.

Lemma 2 : *Let G be a finite group such that $F^*(G)$ is a p' -group, where p is an odd prime which is not Mersenne. Then $m_s(G) \geq |P|$, where $P \in \text{Syl}_p(G)$.*

Proof: As in earlier arguments, we may assume that $\Phi(G) = 1$ and that $G = PF^*(G)$. We may also assume that P does not act faithfully on any proper P -invariant subgroup of $F^*(G)$. By Theorem 1.2 of Moret -Navarro [6], we see that $F^*(G)$ is nilpotent (and even Abelian of squarefree exponent, since $\Phi(G) = 1$).

Now it follows that P has a regular orbit on the Abelian group $F^*(G) = F(G)$, and on the dual group, which is the group of irreducible characters of $F(G)$. Hence $PF(G)$ has a p -block of defect zero and there is a simple

FG -module of dimension $|P|$. Thus $m_s(G) \geq |P|$ (in fact, equality holds in this residual configuration).

Conclusion of Proof of Theorem 1: i) Suppose that p is neither 2 nor a Mersenne prime, and that $O_p(G) = \Phi(G) = 1$. Let $X = O^{p'}(E(G))$. Then X is the normal subgroup of $E(G)$ generated the p -element of $E(G)$, and is the direct product of the components of G of order divisible by p (or is the identity subgroup if there is no such component)

It follows from remarks at the beginning of this section that X has a p -block of defect zero, since $p \geq 5$. Now $C \cap X = 1$, where $C = C_G(X)$, and we note that $F^*(C)$ is a p' -group. By the previous Lemma, we have $m_s(C) \geq |C|_p$ so that we have $m_s(G) \geq m_s(XC) \geq |XC|_p$. Note that $C = G$ if $X = 1$.

Now G/XC is isomorphic to a subgroup of $\text{Out}(X)$, and we denote this subgroup by $\text{Out}_G(X)$. Now we have $m_s(G) \geq |XC|_p = \frac{|G|_p}{|\text{Out}_G(X)|_p}$.

ii) If $p = 2$ or a Mersenne prime, then we may argue in a fashion similar to i), but making use instead of Corollaries 2 and 3.

References

- [1] Aschbacher, M.; Kleidman, P. : *On a conjecture of Quillen and a Lemma of Robinson*, Arch. Math. (Basel) 55,(1990),3, 209-217.
- [2] Granville, A. ; Ono, K. : *Defect zero blocks for finite simple groups* , Trans. Amer. Math. Soc., 348,1,(1996),331-347.
- [3] Guralnick, R. ; Robinson, G. : *Some variants of the Brauer-Fowler Theorems*, J. of Algebra, 558,(2020),453-484.
- [4] Hawkes, T.; Isaacs, I.M.: *On the poset of p -subgroups of a p -solvable group*, J.London Math. Soc., 38,(1988), 77-86.
- [5] Michler, G. : *A finite simple group of Lie type has p -blocks with different defects, $p \neq 2$* , J. Algebra 104, (1986), 220-230.
- [6] Moretó, A. ; Navarro, G. : *Heights of characters in blocks of p -solvable groups*, Bull. LMS, 37,(2008),373-380.
- [7] Quillen, D. : *Homotopy properties of the poset of non-trivial p -subgroups*, Adv. in Math. 88, (1978),101-128.
- [8] Webb, P.J. : *Complexes, group cohomology and an induction theorem for the Green ring*, J. Algebra 104,(1986), 351-357.
- [9] Willems, W. : *Blocks of defect zero for finite simple groups of Lie type*, J. Algebra, 113, 2, (1988), 511-522.