Propagation of First and Second Sound in a Two-Dimensional Fermi Superfluid

A. Tononi,1 A. Cappellaro,1 G. Bighin,2 and L. Salasnich1,3,4

1Dipartimento di Fisica and Astronomia “Galileo Galilei”,
Università di Padova, via Marzolo 8, 35131 Padova, Italy
2IST Austria (Institute of Science and Technology Austria), Am Campus 1, 3400 Klosterneuburg, Austria

3Istituto Nazionale di Ottica (INO) del Consiglio Nazionale delle Ricerche (CNR),
via Nello Carrara 1, 50125 Sesto Fiorentino, Italy
4Istituto Nazionale di Fisica Nucleare (INFN), Sezione di Padova, via Marzolo 8, 35131 Padova, Italy

(Dated: September 15, 2020)

Sound propagation is a macroscopic manifestation of the interplay between the equilibrium thermodynamics and the dynamical transport properties of fluids. Here, for a two-dimensional system of ultracold fermions, we calculate the first and second sound velocities across the whole BCS-BEC crossover and we analyze the system response to an external perturbation. In the low-temperature regime we reproduce the recent measurements [Phys Rev. Lett. 124, 240403 (2020)] of the first sound velocity, that, due to the decoupling of density and entropy fluctuations, is the sole mode excited by a density probe. Conversely, a heat perturbation excites only the second sound, that, being sensitive to the superfluid depletion, vanishes in the deep BCS regime, and jumps discontinuously to zero at the Berezinskii-Kosterlitz-Thouless superfluid transition. A mixing between the modes occurs only in the finite-temperature BEC regime, where our theory converges to the purely bosonic results.

Introduction.— Investigations on the propagation of sound through a medium allow to test the microscopic theories on the structure of matter and to develop new theoretical ideas [1–7]. Along the historical development of physics, the concept itself of sound – along with other physical entities – has evolved and expanded to describe the new experimental evidences, refining our understanding of Nature.

As a remarkable example of this process, we consider the propagation of sound in quantum liquids. The two-fluid theory of Tisza and Landau [8, 9] explained the low-temperature experiments with 4He [10] describing it as a mixture of a normal (viscous) component and of a superfluid (non-viscous) one. The in-phase oscillation of these components, corresponding to the usual density wave and excited by a density perturbation, was denoted as the first sound. The out-of-phase oscillation, corresponding to a heat wave and excited by a local heating of the fluid, was called the second sound [11–13]. This approximate description in which density and heat waves are decoupled holds for strongly-interacting superfluids like 4He and unitary Fermi gases [14–16]. However, it fails for weakly-interacting quantum gases, where the isothermal and adiabatic compressibilities substantially differ [14]. In these systems, an experimental protocol consisting either of a density probe or of a heat one excites – with different amplitudes – both the first and the second sound: the sound modes are thus mixed (or hybridized) and the full solution of the Landau equation of sound is required.

In uniform quantum gases, the richest phenomenology regarding sound propagation is offered by Fermi gases across the Bardeen-Cooper-Schrieffer (BCS) to Bose-Einstein condensate (BEC) crossover [17], in which the fermionic attractive interaction can be tuned from BCS weakly-bound pairs to a BEC of composite bosons. Up to now, the experiments have focused on three-dimensional fermions in cigar-shaped external potentials, at unitarity [18] and across the whole crossover [19]. As far as two-dimensional systems are concerned, a thorough theoretical description of sound propagation, including the physics of the Berezinskii-Kosterlitz-Thouless (BKT) transition mediated by the unbinding of the vortex-antivortex dipoles [20–22], is currently lacking. Understanding whether and how mixing of the sound modes occurs is particularly important to benchmark the recent [23] and forthcoming investigations on 2D fermionic gases.

Here we describe the propagation of sound modes across the two-dimensional BCS-BEC crossover, developing a theoretical framework which relies on the beyond-mean-field equation of state and takes into account the pair fluctuations of the order parameter. Moreover, we consider the renormalization of the bare superfluid density due to the screening of the interaction between quantized vortices. In the low-temperature collisional regime (for the noncollisional one see Refs. [24–27]), the comparison with recent measurements [23] of the first sound velocity shows a good agreement. Confirming the experimental outcome, we find that an excitation protocol consisting of a density probe excites almost exclusively the first sound, a clear signal of the decoupling of density and entropy modes across the whole BCS-BEC crossover. This scheme changes slightly around the BKT critical temperature, where a partial mixing of the modes occurs in the BEC regime: we expect the hybridization to become more relevant as the system goes deeper into the BEC regime, reconnecting our theory to the framework of bosonic systems [14, 28]. We predict that a heat perturbation, due to the overall limited mixing, can easily excite the second sound: our results offer a solid benchmark for the future measurements of the velocity of second sound, which is an excellent and explicit probe of the BKT transition in uniform two-dimensional Fermi gases.

First and second sound.— We consider a uniform two-dimensional superfluid at thermodynamic equilibrium. A local perturbation excites two wave-like modes – the first and the second sound – which propagate with velocities \( u_1 \) and \( u_2 \). Within the framework of Landau and Tisza two-fluid theory...
In liquid helium and in unitary Fermi gases, where the approximative equality of the adiabatic and isothermal compressibilities implies that \( c_{10} \approx c_T \) [14], the sound modes of Eq. (2) can be interpreted as a pure pressure-density wave and a pure entropy-temperature wave. The first sound, propagating with a velocity \( c_T \approx c_{10} \), is thus characterized by an in-phase oscillation of the superfluid and of the normal fluid, while, as a result of the out-of-phase oscillation of these components, the second sound propagates with a velocity \( c_{20} \approx c_{20} \).

The simple picture of helium is no longer valid for Fermi gases in the deep BEC regime and for weakly-interacting Bose gases, where the \( c_{10} \approx c_T \) approximation breaks down due to the high compressibility of the system [14]. In this case, an external perturbation of the fluid induces a response in which the density-pressure and the temperature-entropy fluctuations are mixed. Then, according to the solution of Eq. (2), a density probe, specified by a proper protocol, can excite both modes [19]. It is worth stressing that the current experiments with ultracold atoms can access both the amplitude and the velocity of propagating sound waves. In particular, if we consider the density response to an external perturbation, i.e. \( \rho \), the Landau two-fluid model predicts \( \rho(\rho, t) = W_1 \rho_1(t \pm u_{1t}) + W_2 \rho_2(t \pm u_{2t}) \), with \( W_1 \) the amplitude of the first sound mode and \( W_2 \) the amplitude of the second one [13, 29]. Here, the relevant experimental parameters are the relative amplitudes \( W_{1,2} = W_{1,2} / (W_1 + W_2) \), weighing the response of the system: these weights can be computed in terms of the sound velocities of Eqs. (2), (3) as [14, 30]

\[
W_1 = \frac{(u_{10}^2 - c_{10}^2)}{(u_{10}^2 - u_{30}^2)} u_{30}^2, \quad W_2 = \frac{(u_{20}^2 - u_{30}^2)}{(u_{10}^2 - u_{30}^2)} c_{20}^2.
\]

By definition, these complementary ratios add up to 1, and the larger contribution among the two represents which mode is easier to detect by means of a density excitation protocol. In the following, after a microscopic derivation of the system thermodynamics, we will calculate the sound velocities \( u_1 \) and \( u_2 \) for two-dimensional uniform fermions across the whole BCS-BEC crossover.

**Gaussian-pair fluctuations theory.**— A mean-field description of a 2D fermionic gas is quantitatively accurate only in the BCS limit, and becomes extremely unreliable even in the intermediate interaction regime. The order parameter fluctuations, neglected in the mean-field theory, are crucial to describe the full crossover at zero-temperature [31], and particularly to recover the correct composite-boson limit in the deep-BEC regime [32]. In this paper we adopt the Gaussian pair fluctuations (GPF) approach [33, 34], which has been also used to determine the bare [37] and renormalized [38] superfluid density in the 2D BCS-BEC crossover.

A two-component 2D dilute Fermi gas can be described, in second quantization, by the Hamiltonian

\[
\hat{H} = \sum_{\sigma, \ell} \int d^2r \left( \hat{\psi}_\sigma^\dagger(\mathbf{r}) \left( -\frac{\hbar^2}{2m} \nabla^2 - \mu \right) \hat{\psi}_\sigma(\mathbf{r}) + + g \hat{\psi}_\uparrow(\mathbf{r}) \hat{\psi}_\downarrow(\mathbf{r}) \hat{\psi}_\downarrow(\mathbf{r}) \hat{\psi}_\uparrow(\mathbf{r}) \right),
\]

where \( \hat{\psi}_\sigma(\mathbf{r}) \) is the fermionic field operator which annihilates a fermion at position \( \mathbf{r} \) with pseudo-spin \( \sigma \). Here \( m \) is the mass of a fermion and \( g < 0 \) is the strength of the attractive contact interaction between atoms with opposite spins. The constraint \( N = \sum \int d^2r \left( \hat{\psi}_\uparrow(\mathbf{r}) \hat{\psi}_\downarrow(\mathbf{r}) \right) \) imposes the conservation of the particle number \( N \), and the interaction parameter \( g \) can be related to the energy \( E_0 \) of a fermion-fermion bound state state, see Ref. [39]. To study the superfluid phase [1], one introduces the pairing field \( \Delta(\mathbf{r}) = g \hat{\psi}_\downarrow(\mathbf{r}) \hat{\psi}_\uparrow(\mathbf{r}) \), corresponding to a Cooper pair. In a mean-field treatment, the pairing field \( \Delta(\mathbf{r}) \) is approximated with a constant real parameter, the pairing gap \( \Delta_0 \), which approximates leads to the mean-field thermodynamic grand potential \( \Omega_{mf} = \beta^{-1} \sum \left[ \ln(2 \cosh[\beta E_{sq}(k)]) - E_k \right] - \Delta_0^2/2 \) with the usual definition of BCS fermionic elementary excitations \( E_{sq}(k) = (\xi_k^2 + \Delta_0^2)^{1/2} \), from the poles of the inverse pair fluctuation propagator, namely, by solving the equation \( \det(\Omega(\mathbf{q}, \omega)) = 0 \). The general procedure is then given by the sum of the mean-field and
Gaussian contributions, \( \Omega(\mu, T, L^2, \Delta_0) = \Omega_{mf}(\mu, T, L^2, \Delta_0) + \Omega_{g}(\mu, T, L^2, \Delta_0) \), from which it is possible to derive the gap equation, \((\partial \Omega_{mf}/\partial \Delta_0)_{\mu,T,L^2} = 0 \), and the number density, \( n = L^{-2} (\partial \Omega/\partial \mu)_{T,L^2} \), with \( n \) being the fermion density. Notice that the number equation is solved taking into account that \( \Delta_0 \) depends on \( \mu \) [36].

We derive the thermodynamic potential \( \Omega \) by using, as input information, the chemical potential \( \mu \) and \( \Delta_0 \) from the zerotemperature equation of state (EoS). The temperature dependence of \( \Omega \) is encoded in the contributions related to the single-particle and pair fluctuation excitation spectra, i.e., respectively, the first term in \( \Delta \rho \) and knowing \( \rho \) and \( \Delta \).

In the experiments, \( u_1 \) (red solid line) and \( u_2 \) (blue dashed line) are the experimental measurements of the first sound velocity at \( T = 0.1 \times T_F \), where \( T_F \) is the Fermi temperature. The sound modes are plotted at a fixed temperature \( T/T_F = 0.01 \), with \( T_F = \epsilon_F/k_B \), and the velocities are expressed in units of the Fermi velocity \( v_F = \sqrt{2\epsilon_F/m} \). The green diamonds are the experimental measurements of the first sound of Ref. [23], in good agreement with the theoretical prediction. Inset: relative contribution to the density response of \( u_1 \) (red solid line) and \( u_2 \) (blue dashed line), see Eq. (4), computed throughout the crossover at \( T/T_F = 0.01 \).

![Graph](image)

**FIG. 1.** Evolution of the first sound velocity \( u_1 \) (red solid line) and of the second sound velocity \( u_2 \) (blue dashed line) along the whole BCS-BEC crossover, calculated from Eq. (2). The crossover is parametrized in terms of \( \ln(\epsilon_B/\epsilon_F) \), where \( \epsilon_B = \hbar^2 \pi n/m \) is the Fermi energy. The sound modes are plotted at a fixed temperature \( T/T_F = 0.01 \), with \( T_F = \epsilon_F/k_B \), and the velocities are expressed in units of the Fermi velocity \( v_F = \sqrt{2\epsilon_F/m} \). The green diamonds are the experimental measurements of the first sound of Ref. [23], in good agreement with the theoretical prediction. Inset: relative contribution to the density response of \( u_1 \) (red solid line) and \( u_2 \) (blue dashed line), see Eq. (4), computed throughout the crossover at \( T/T_F = 0.01 \).
We report the relative contributions to the density responses $W_1/\rho$ of the interaction regime, and $\ln(\rho/\rho_F)$, of the interaction parameter. Insets: relative contribution to the density responses $W_{1,2} / (W_1 + W_2)$ of $u_1$ (red solid line) and $u_2$ (blue dashed line) for the same three values of the interaction parameter.

$W_2 / (W_1 + W_2) \approx 0$. These values of the ratios are a clear signal of the absence of mixing between the sound modes, and, therefore, that the sound velocities at low temperatures are well approximated by the expressions valid for liquid helium: $u_1 \approx c_{10}$ and $u_2 \approx c_{20}$ [43]. As a prediction for the forthcoming experiments, we expect that a heat probe can easily and almost exclusively excite the second sound, for which we make a concrete quantitative prediction in Fig. 1.

The role of quantized vortices.— To extend the previous results outside the low-temperature regime of two-dimensional systems, we must take into account the phenomenology of the BKT transition. At higher temperatures, due to the screening of the vortex-antivortex interaction [21], the bare superfluid density $\rho_s^{(0)}$ is renormalized to $\rho_s^{(R)}$. We calculate the renormalized superfluid density by jointly solving the Nelson-Kosterlitz renormalization group equations [22] $\frac{dK(\ell)}{d\ell} = -4\pi^2 K(\ell)^2 y(\ell)^2$ and $dy(\ell)/d\ell = (2 - \pi K(\ell)) y(\ell)$ for the running variables $K(\ell)$ and $y(\ell)$, where $\ell$ is the adimensional scale. In the solution, we fix the initial conditions $K(\ell = 0) = \beta J = \beta \mu(4m^2)$ and $y(\ell = 0) = \exp(-\mu \ell)$, with $J$ being the phase stiffness of the usual XY model, defined as $J = \hbar^2 \mu(4m^2)$ [46] and $\mu = \pi^2 J/4$ being the vortex energy [47]. Since the flowing stiffness displays a universal jump at the transition, the renormalized superfluid density is given by $\rho_s^{(R)} = (4m^2/\hbar^2) \beta K(\ell = +\infty)$.

The impact on the sound velocities of the BKT-driven renormalization of the superfluid density is clearly visible in Fig. 2 where, considering three different values of the crossover parameter $\ln(\rho_F/\rho_F) = [-5, 0, +5]$, we plot $u_1$ and $u_2$ as a function of the temperature $T/T_F$. In every interaction regime, although with a different qualitative behavior, the mode $u_2$ disappears discontinuously at the critical temperature $T_{BKT}$. In addition, since due to the mixing both sounds depend on the superfluid density, also $u_1$ is discontinuous in the BEC regime, as can be seen in the right panel of Fig. 2. The jump of the first sound becomes more pronounced for larger values of $\ln(\rho_F/\rho_F)$, as one can expect from purely bosonic works [14, 28], but here we limit to show interaction regimes which can be conveniently reached in fermionic experiments ($\ln(\rho_F/\rho_F) \lesssim 10$, see Ref. [48]). We thus conclude that the discontinuities of the sound modes can probe the BKT transition in ultracold Fermi gases [24, 25, 49]. We also emphasize that, in the deep BEC limit, our theory provides a reasonable agreement with the BKT critical temperature obtained with purely bosonic theories [44].

In the insets of Fig. 2 we report the relative contributions to the density response, see Eq. (4), whose general behavior is similar to that of the low-temperature regime, with a slight dependence on the interaction regime. Indeed, as before, the amplitude of the second sound $W_2 / (W_1 + W_2)$ is practically zero in the BCS regime and at unitarity. However, in the BEC regime the mixed response of the system emerges: $W_2 / (W_1 + W_2)$ increases with the temperature up to the value of 0.15, and jumps to zero in a sharp region around the critical $T_{BKT}$ temperature. Indeed, at $T > T_{BKT}$ only $u_1$ survives, corresponding to the standard propagation of sound in a normal fluid.

Conclusions.— We have calculated the first and the second sound velocities for a 2D Fermi gas across the whole BCS–BEC crossover, deriving the thermodynamics from the Gaussian pair fluctuations approach. Similarly to what happens in liquid helium, the second sound vanishes at the Berezinskii-Kosterlitz-Thouless temperature, where the superfluid component vanishes, heat propagation becomes purely diffusive, and the system supports only the usual (first) sound mode. In the low temperature regime, in accordance with the recent experimental evidences, we do not observe the mixing of pressure-density oscillations and of entropy-temperature ones: a density probe excites only the first sound. Our theory reproduces the recently measured values of the first sound velocity and opens new experimental perspectives: we expect that a heat probe will excite only the second sound, for which we offer testable values and predictions, as a vanishing velocity in the deep BCS regime. We also discuss the thermal behavior of the sound modes, showing that, as can be expected from purely bosonic theories, a mixed response occurs only at finite temperatures and in the BEC regime, signalling the emergence of...
a bosonic character from a system of composite bosons.

G.B. acknowledges support from the Austrian Science Fund (FWF), under Project No. M2641-N27. This work was partially supported by the University of Padua, BIRD project “Superfluid properties of Fermi gases in optical potentials”. The authors thank Miki Ota, Tomoki Ozawa, Sandro Stringari, Tilman Enss and Nicolò Defenu for fruitful discussions. The authors thank Henning Moritz and Markus Bohlen for providing their experimental data.

* These authors have contributed equally.

[44] See Supplemental Material at [URL will be inserted by publisher] for the plots of the thermodynamic functions, for the sound velocities of helium and for some comments about the composite-boson limit of the BEC regime. Ref. [45] is included.
SUPPLEMENTAL MATERIAL FOR “PROPAGATION OF FIRST AND SECOND SOUND IN A TWO-DIMENSIONAL FERMI SUPERFLUID”

Thermodynamic functions

The solution of the equation of sound requires the knowledge of the thermodynamic functions of the system. In particular, in Fig. S1 we show the entropy $S$ and the specific heat at constant volume $c_V$, rescaled with $Nk_B$.

![Fig. S1. Plots of the equilibrium thermodynamic functions, the entropy $S$ and the specific heat at constant volume $c_V$, used to derive the low-temperature results of the main text. The temperature is fixed to $T/T_F = 0.01$.](image)

The thermodynamic variables shown here are calculated at a temperature of $T/T_F = 0.01$. In this temperature regime the superfluid fraction is equal to 1 for any interaction between the fermions, except in the deep BCS regime, for $\ln(\epsilon_B/\epsilon_F) = -6$, where it is around 0.999.

Moreover, to obtain the full solutions $u_1$ and $u_2$ of the equation of sound, it is necessary to calculate the adiabatic sound velocity $c_{10}$, the isothermal sound velocity $c_T$, and the entropic sound velocity $c_S$, whose definitions are given in the main text. These velocities, obtained across the whole BCS-BEC crossover, are shown in Fig. S2 for the same fixed temperature of Fig. 1 in the main text. Notice that, even adopting a logarithmic scale in the vertical axis, in the low-temperature regime one finds that $c_{10}$ is practically equal to $c_T$.

![Fig. S2. Plots of the sound velocities, defined in the main text, as a function of the crossover parameter $\ln(\epsilon_B/\epsilon_F)$ and at a fixed temperature of $T/T_F = 0.01$.](image)

**Composite boson limit**

In the deep-BEC limit the fermionic system can be mapped onto a system of interacting bosons with density $n_B = n_F/2$, mass $m_B = 2m_F$, and chemical potential $\mu_B = (2\mu_F - \epsilon_B)/2$: the so-called ‘composite boson’ limit; in this Section we use explicit ‘F’ and ‘B’ subscripts to distinguish between bosonic and fermionic quantities. The bosonic and fermionic scattering lengths are related by the equation $a_B = \lambda a_F$ where $\lambda = 0.551$ [1]. Therefore, the dimensionless coupling constant of a 2D Bose gas, $g_B$, is related to the fermionic quantities by the equation

$$g_B = -\frac{4\pi}{2\ln(k_F a_F) + \ln(\lambda^2/4\pi)}$$

with $\gamma \approx 0.557$ being the Euler-Mascheroni constant. Another quantity which we need to map is the critical temperature $T_{\text{BKT}}^{(B)}$ of the system of composite bosons. As before, the superscript $B$ underlines that $T_{\text{BKT}}^{(B)}$ is the critical temperature of the Bose system to which the fermionic system in the BEC side of the crossover can be mapped. To identify the temperature of the transition, quantum Monte Carlo simulations [2,3] of 2D Bose gases provide the universal relation

$$\frac{T_{\text{BKT}}^{(B)}}{T_F} = \frac{1}{2\ln\left[\frac{\xi}{4\pi} \ln\left(\frac{\pi}{e^{-2\gamma-1/2} \epsilon_B/\epsilon_F}\right)\right]}$$

with $\xi \approx 554$ [3].

In current experimental setups the crossover parameter can reach, at most, values around $\ln(\epsilon_B/\epsilon_F) \sim 10$ [4]. In this interaction range, the agreement between the bosonic theory and the composite boson limit is not complete [3]. We have verified it employing our finite-temperature theory for $\ln(\epsilon_B/\epsilon_F) = 10$, which, according to Eq. (A1), corresponds to the case of $g_B \approx 1$ considered in Ref. [5]. While the critical temperature is reasonably well reproduced by our theory, the agreement of the sound velocities with the purely bosonic theory is only qualitative.
These authors have contributed equally.


