Rational values of powers of trigonometric functions

Genki Shibukawa

MSC classes: 11J72, 11R18, 33B10

Abstract

We extend the theorem by Olmsted (1945) and Carlitz-Thomas (1963) on rational values of trigonometric functions to powers of trigonometric functions.

1 Introduction

Throughout the paper, we denote the ring of rational numbers by $\mathbb{Q}$, the ring of real numbers by $\mathbb{R}$, the set of positive rational numbers by $\mathbb{Q}_{>0}$ and a $m$th root of unity by $\zeta_m := e^{\frac{2\pi \sqrt{-1}}{m}}$. Olmsted [1] and Carlitz-Thomas [2] determined all rational values of trigonometric functions.

**Theorem 1** (Olmsted (1945), Carlitz-Thomas (1963)). If $\theta \in \mathbb{Q}$, then the only possible rational values of the trigonometric functions are:

$$\sin (\pi \theta), \cos (\pi \theta) = 0, \pm \frac{1}{2}, \pm 1 ; \tan (\pi \theta) = 0, \pm 1.$$

By this Theorem [1] and well-known facts

$$\cos (\pi \theta)^2 = \frac{1 + \cos (2\pi \theta)}{2}, \tan (\pi \theta)^2 = \frac{1}{\cos (\pi \theta)^2} - 1,$$

we have the following result immediately.

**Corollary 2.** If $\theta \in \mathbb{Q}$ and $\cos (\pi \theta)^2 \in \mathbb{Q}$, then the only possible values of the trigonometric functions are:

$$\sin (\pi \theta), \cos (\pi \theta) = 0, \pm \frac{1}{2}, \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}, \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}, \pm 1 ; \tan (\pi \theta) = 0, \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}, \pm 1, \pm \sqrt{3}.$$

In this note, we propose a generalization of Theorem [1] and Corollary [2].

**Theorem 3.** If $N \geq 3$ and $\alpha$ is a positive rational number such that $\alpha^{\frac{1}{N}}, \ldots, \alpha^{\frac{N-1}{N}} \notin \mathbb{Q}$ then for any positive integer $m$ we have

$$\sqrt[N]{\alpha} \notin \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_m).$$

In particular, there is no $\theta \in \mathbb{Q}$ such that $\cos (\pi \theta), \cos (\pi \theta)^2, \ldots, \cos (\pi \theta)^{N-1} \notin \mathbb{Q}$ and $\cos (\pi \theta)^N \in \mathbb{Q}$ (resp. $\tan (\pi \theta), \tan (\pi \theta)^2, \ldots, \tan (\pi \theta)^{N-1} \notin \mathbb{Q}$ and $\tan (\pi \theta)^N \in \mathbb{Q}$).
Theorem 4. If there exists a positive integer $n$ and $\theta \in \mathbb{Q}$ such that $\cos (\pi \theta)^n \in \mathbb{Q}$ (resp. $\tan (\pi \theta)^n \in \mathbb{Q}$), then the only possible values of the trigonometric functions are:

$$
\sin (\pi \theta), \cos (\pi \theta) = \begin{cases} 
0, \pm \frac{1}{2}, \pm 1 & (n: \text{odd}) \\
0, \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}, \pm \frac{1}{2}, \pm \sqrt{2} & (n: \text{even})
\end{cases}
$$

resp.

$$
\tan (\pi \theta) = \begin{cases} 
0, \pm 1 & (n: \text{odd}) \\
0, \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}, \pm 1, \pm \sqrt{3} & (n: \text{even})
\end{cases}
$$

2 Preliminaries

To prove Theorem 3 and Theorem 4, we list some fundamental facts of the cyclotomic fields and Kummer extension in this section. First we mention the Galois group $\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)$ (see [3]).

Lemma 5. The degree of the cyclotomic extension $\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)$ over $\mathbb{Q}$ is $[\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n) : \mathbb{Q}] = \varphi(n) := |\{1 \leq a \leq n \mid \gcd(a,n) = 1\}|$ and its Galois group $\text{Gal}(\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)/\mathbb{Q})$ is

$$(\mathbb{Z}/n\mathbb{Z})^\times \simeq \text{Gal}(\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)/\mathbb{Q}) \ni \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n) \rightarrow \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n),$$

$c \mapsto \tau_c \ni \zeta_n \mapsto \tau_c(\zeta_n) := \zeta_n^c$.

In particular $\text{Gal}(\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)/\mathbb{Q})$ is an abelian extension, and its subfields $L \supset \mathbb{Q}$ are Galois and abelian extension over $\mathbb{Q}$.

Under the following, let $\alpha$ be a positive rational number such that

$$\alpha^{\frac{1}{n}}, \ldots, \alpha^{\frac{n-1}{n}} \notin \mathbb{Q}$$

and $K := \mathbb{Q}(\sqrt[n]{\alpha}, \zeta_n)$.

Proposition 6. (1) The binomial polynomial $x^n - \alpha$ is irreducible over $\mathbb{Q}$ and $[\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt[n]{\alpha}) : \mathbb{Q}] = n$.

(2) For any $n \geq 2$, we have $\sqrt[n]{\alpha} \notin \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n)$.

Proof. (1) We consider the following decomposition of the binomial polynomial:

$$x^n - \alpha = \prod_{i=1}^{n}(x - \sqrt[n]{\alpha}\zeta_n^i) = f_I(x)f_J(x)$$

where $I, J$ are subsets of $[n] := \{1, 2, \ldots, n\}$ such that

$$[n] = I \sqcup J, \quad I \neq \emptyset, \quad J \neq \emptyset, \quad I \cap J = \emptyset$$

and

$$f_I(x) := \prod_{i \in I}(x - \sqrt[n]{\alpha}\zeta_n^i) = x^{|I|} + \cdots + (-1)^{|I|}\alpha^{|I|} \prod_{i \in I}\zeta_n^i \in \mathbb{Q}[x],$$
\[ f_J(x) := \prod_{j \in J} (x - \sqrt[n]{\alpha} \zeta_n^j) = x^{|J|} + \cdots + (-1)^{|J|} \alpha^{|J|} \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j \in \mathbb{Q}[x]. \]

If \( x^n - \alpha \) is reducible over \( \mathbb{Q} \), then \( f_J(x) \) and \( f_J(x) \) are rational coefficient polynomials. Hence, by the definition of \( \alpha \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0} \) and

\[ (-1)^{|J|} \alpha^{|J|} \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j \in \mathbb{Q}, \]

the product

\[ \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j \]

is real. Thus we have

\[ \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j = \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^{-j} \]

and

\[ \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j = \pm 1. \]

From the assumption \( \alpha^{|J|} \notin \mathbb{Q} \), the constant term of \( f_J(x) \)

\[ (-1)^{|J|} \alpha^{|J|} \prod_{j \in J} \zeta_n^j = \pm (-1)^{|J|} \alpha^{|J|} \]

is irrational. It is a contradiction.

(2) If \( \sqrt[n]{\alpha} \in \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n) \), then we have the contradiction

\[ n = [\mathbb{Q}(\sqrt[n]{\alpha}) : \mathbb{Q}] \leq [\mathbb{Q}(\zeta_n) : \mathbb{Q}] = \varphi(n) = n \prod_{p|n} \left( 1 - \frac{1}{p} \right). \]

\[ \square \]

**Lemma 7.** (1) If \( n = p \) is a odd prime, then the binomial type polynomial \( x^p - \alpha \) is irreducible over \( \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_p) \) and \([K : \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_p)] = p\). Its Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/\mathbb{Q}) \) is

\[ \mathbb{Z}/p \mathbb{Z} \times (\mathbb{Z}/p \mathbb{Z})^\times \cong \text{Gal}(K/\mathbb{Q}) \cong K \to K \]

\[ \begin{array}{ccc}
(1, 1) & \mapsto & \sigma \\
(0, c) & \mapsto & \tau_c \\
\end{array} \]

\[ \begin{array}{ccc}
\zeta_n & \mapsto & \zeta_n \\
\sqrt[p]{\alpha} & \mapsto & \sqrt[p]{\alpha} \\
\zeta_p & \mapsto & \zeta_p \\
\sigma(\sqrt[p]{\alpha}) := & \sqrt[p]{\alpha} \\
\zeta_p & \mapsto & \zeta_p \\
\tau_c(\sqrt[p]{\alpha}) := & \sqrt[p]{\alpha} \\
\end{array} \]

In particular, \( \tau_c \sigma = \sigma \tau_c \) and for \( n \geq 3 \) the Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/\mathbb{Q}) \) is non-abelian.

(2) For any \( n \geq 3 \), the Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/\mathbb{Q}) \) is non-abelian.
Proof. (1) We consider the factorization \( x^p - \alpha = f_I(x)f_J(x) \) again. By \( \gcd(|I|, p) = 1 \) and \( \gcd(|J|, p) = 1 \), \( Q(\alpha^{\frac{|I|}{p}}) \) and \( Q(\alpha^{\frac{|J|}{p}}) \) contain \( \sqrt[p]{\alpha} \). Hence, from Proposition 6 (2), \( \alpha^{\frac{|I|}{p}} \) and \( \alpha^{\frac{|J|}{p}} \) are not contained in \( Q(\zeta_p) \). Therefore the binomial polynomial \( x^p - \alpha \) is irreducible over \( Q(\zeta_p) \) and \( [K : Q(\zeta_p)] = p \).

(2) When a odd prime \( p \) divides \( n \), \( K \) contains a non-abelian Galois extension \( Q(\sqrt[p]{\alpha}, \zeta_p) \) over \( Q \), so the Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/Q) \) is non-abelian. If \( n = 2^m \) \((m \geq 2)\), then \( K \) contains a non-abelian Galois extension \( Q(\sqrt[8]{\alpha}, \zeta_4) \) over \( Q \) and \( \text{Gal}(K/Q) \) is also non-abelian. \( \square \)

Remark 8. Lemma 7 (1) is not true in general. For example, when \( n = 8 \) and \( \alpha = 2 \) the polynomial \( x^8 - 2 \) is reducible over \( Q(\zeta_8) \) even though \( 2^{\frac{1}{8}}, \ldots, 2^{\frac{7}{8}} \) are irrational. In fact
\[
x^8 - 2 = (x^4 - \sqrt{2})(x^4 + \sqrt{2}) = (x^4 - \zeta_8 - \zeta_8^{-1})(x^4 + \zeta_8 + \zeta_8^{-1}).
\]

3 Proof of Theorem 3

Assume there exists \( N \geq 3 \), \( \alpha \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0} \) and a positive integer \( m \) such that \( \alpha^{\frac{1}{N}}, \ldots, \alpha^{\frac{N-1}{N}} \notin \mathbb{Q} \) and
\[
\sqrt[N]{\alpha} \in Q(\zeta_m).
\]
Then
\[
Q(\sqrt[N]{\alpha}) \subset Q(\zeta_m).
\]
Although \( Q(\sqrt[N]{\alpha}) \) is not a Galois extension over \( Q \), \( K \) is a Galois extension over \( Q \) and
\[
K \subset Q(\zeta_m, \zeta_N) \subset Q(\zeta_{mN}).
\]
Further the field \( K \) is a subfield of \( Q(\zeta_{mN}) \) and the Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/Q) \) is a normal subgroup of \( \text{Gal}(Q(\zeta_{mN})/Q) \):
\[
\text{Gal}(K/Q) \triangleleft \text{Gal}(Q(\zeta_{mN})/Q) \cong (\mathbb{Z}/mN\mathbb{Z})^\times.
\]
However the Galois group \( \text{Gal}(K/Q) \) is non-abelian. It is a contradiction. Then for any positive integer \( m \),
\[
\sqrt[N]{\alpha} \notin Q(\zeta_m). \quad (5)
\]
For the above \( N \geq 3 \) and positive rational number \( \alpha \in \mathbb{Q}_{>0} \), assume there exists \( \theta \in \mathbb{Q} \) such that
\[
\cos(\pi\theta) = \sqrt[N]{\alpha}.
\]
By \( \theta \in \mathbb{Q} \), there exists a positive integer \( m \) such that
\[
\sqrt[N]{\alpha} = \cos(\pi\theta) \in Q(\zeta_m).
\]
For \( N \geq 3 \), it is contrary to (5). For \( \tan(\pi\theta) \) we prove similarly.
Remark 9. From Theorem 3 if \( n \geq 3 \) then there is no cyclotomic field over \( \mathbb{Q} \) containing \( n \)th root of a positive rational number \( \alpha \) with \( \sqrt[n]{\alpha} \notin \mathbb{Q} \). On the other hand, from Gauss sum’s formulas \([1]\)

\[
\sum_{k=0}^{m-1} \zeta_m^{k^2} = \frac{1 + \sqrt{-1}}{2} (1 + (\sqrt{-1})^m) \sqrt{m} = \begin{cases} 
(1 + \sqrt{-1}) \sqrt{m} & (m \equiv 0 \mod 4) \\
\sqrt{m} & (m \equiv 1 \mod 4) \\
0 & (m \equiv 2 \mod 4) \\
\sqrt{-1} \sqrt{m} & (m \equiv 3 \mod 4)
\end{cases},
\]

\( \zeta_4 = \sqrt{-1}, \quad \zeta_8 + \zeta_8^{-1} = \sqrt{2}, \)

for any \( \alpha \in \mathbb{Q} \) there exists a positive integer \( m \) such that \( \sqrt[n]{\alpha} \in \mathbb{Q}(\zeta_m) \).

4 Proof of Theorem 4

Since the proof of \([2]\) is similar to \([1]\), we only prove \([1]\). The cases of \( n = 1 \) and \( n = 2 \) are Theorem 1 and Corollary 2 respectively. For \( n \geq 3 \), the following three cases are possible:

1) \( \cos(\pi \theta) \in \mathbb{Q} \) and \( \cos(\pi \theta)^2 \in \mathbb{Q} \),

2) \( \cos(\pi \theta) \notin \mathbb{Q} \) and \( \cos(\pi \theta)^2 \in \mathbb{Q} \),

3) \( \cos(\pi \theta) \notin \mathbb{Q} \) and \( \cos(\pi \theta)^2 \notin \mathbb{Q} \).

When 1), from Theorem 1 and Corollary 2, the possible values of \( \cos(\pi \theta) \) (or \( \sin(\pi \theta) \)) are \( 0, \pm \frac{1}{2}, \pm 1 \). Similarly, for 2) the possible values of \( \cos(\pi \theta) \) are \( \pm \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}, \pm \frac{\sqrt{3}}{2} \). Finally, the case of 3) is impossible from Theorem 3 (1). Then we obtain the conclusion \([1]\).

Acknowledgement

We would like to thank Professor Takashi Taniguchi (Kobe University) for his comments on cyclotomic and Kummer extensions.

References


Department of Mathematics, Graduate School of Science, Kobe University, 1-1, Rokkodai, Nada-ku, Kobe, 657-8501, JAPAN
E-mail: g-shibukawa@math.kobe-u.ac.jp