

# Comment on “Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet Gravity in Four-Dimensional Spacetime”

Julio Arrechea,<sup>1,\*</sup> Adrià Delhom,<sup>2,†</sup> and Alejandro Jiménez-Cano<sup>3,‡</sup>

<sup>1</sup>*Instituto de Astrofísica de Andalucía (IAA-CSIC), Glorieta de la Astronomía, Granada, Spain*

<sup>2</sup>*Departamento de Física Teórica and IFIC, Centro Mixto Universidad de*

*Valencia - CSIC. Universidad de Valencia, Burjassot-46100, Valencia, Spain*

<sup>3</sup>*Departamento de Física Teórica y del Cosmos and CAFPE, Universidad de Granada, 18071 Granada, Spain*

(Dated: September 23, 2020)

In this Comment, we elaborate on several points raised in Ref. [1]. The authors claimed to have found a four-dimensional gravitational theory which fulfills the assumptions of the Lovelock theorem [2] though not its implications. To that end, they employed a *regularization* procedure already outlined in Ref. [3]. This procedure consists of rescaling the coupling constant of the Gauss-Bonnet (GB) term by  $1/(D-4)$  and taking the  $D \rightarrow 4$  *limit* after varying the Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet (EGB) action. The authors of Ref. [1] claim that the variation of the GB term is proportional to  $(D-4)$ , canceling the  $1/(D-4)$  factor and hence yielding a nonvanishing contribution to the field equations in  $D=4$ . This claim does not stand a thorough analysis given that the variation of the  $k$ th order Lovelock Lagrangian can be decomposed as [4, 5]

$$\frac{1}{\sqrt{|g|}} \frac{\delta S^{(k)}}{\delta g^{\mu\nu}} = (D-2k)A_{\mu\nu}^{(k)} + W_{\mu\nu}^{(k)}, \quad (1)$$

where  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(k)}$  is a tensor from which no  $(D-2k)$  can be extracted and which does not vanish for a general  $D > 2k$ . The GB term is given by  $k=2$ , and the field equations proposed in Ref. [1] for arbitrary dimension are

$$G_{\mu\nu} + \frac{1}{M_{\text{P}}^2} \Lambda_0 g_{\mu\nu} + \frac{2\alpha}{M_{\text{P}}^2} \left( A_{\mu\nu}^{(2)} + \frac{W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}}{D-4} \right) = 0, \quad (2)$$

where the explicit form of  $A_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  and  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  can be found in Ref. [5]. Although the  $1/(D-4)$  rescaling compensates the factor multiplying the  $A_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  term, the same procedure renders the  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  term indeterminate. This owes to the fact that, although  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  vanishes in  $D=4$ , it does so due to algebraic reasons [4, 5] and not because it is proportional to some power of  $(D-4)$ . Hence, the indeterminate term  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}/(D-4)$  renders the field equations (2) ill-defined in four dimensions. Indeed, the first problem to address would be to make sense of the limit of a tensor field [4–8], since these objects are defined for integer values of  $D$  only.

Despite the above discussion, the field equations (2) are well defined in  $D=4$  when constrained to particular geometries in which  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  vanishes in arbitrary dimensions. This is the case, for instance, for all conformally flat geometries, including the Friedmann-Lemaître-Robertson-Walker or maximally symmetric solutions found in Ref. [1]. However, metric perturbations will be sensible to the ill-defined terms, hence rendering these solutions unphysical. Indeed, though linear perturbations around a maximally symmetric background are oblivious to these pathologies [1], they enter at second order through terms proportional to  $1/(D-4)$  [5]. In this direction, other works also showed that an infinitely strongly coupled new scalar degree of freedom appears beyond linear order [9]. These results strongly suggest that Eq. (2) is generally ill-defined in four dimensions.

A possible way to circumvent the pathologies of the above field equations (2) would be to get rid of the  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  term. However,  $A_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  is not divergenceless [5]. Hence, by virtue of the Bianchi identity under diffeomorphisms, we conclude that there is no diffeomorphism-invariant action whose variation gives Eq. (2) without the  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  term.

Regarding spherically symmetric metrics of the form

$$ds^2 = B(r)dt^2 - B^{-1}(r)dr^2 - r^2 d\Omega_{D-2}^2, \quad (3)$$

for them to have a vanishing  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  in arbitrary dimension, there are conditions that  $B(r)$  must fulfill [5]. The spherically symmetric geometries presented in Ref. [1] do not satisfy these requirements and, therefore, cannot be solutions of Eq. (2), since this is not a well-defined set of equations in this case. Indeed, as proven in Ref. [5], they are neither solutions of the truncated equations (2) without the  $W_{\mu\nu}^{(2)}$  term. This is not surprising, since the authors of Ref. [1] derived these geometries by taking  $D=4$  in the  $D \geq 5$  solutions for the EGB theory found in Ref. [10] and then rescaling the GB coupling by  $1/(D-4)$ , instead of finding a solution to the rescaled field equations (2) in  $D=4$ . Furthermore, the authors of Ref. [1] state that the central curvature singularity of these geometries cannot be reached by an observer. Nevertheless, as shown in Ref. [5], radial freely falling observers do reach the singularity in finite proper time, contradicting this claim.

- 
- [1] D. Glavan and C. Lin, *Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet Gravity in Four-Dimensional Spacetime*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **124**, 081301 (2020).
- [2] D. Lovelock, *The four-dimensionality of space and the Einstein tensor*, J. Math. Phys. (N.Y.) **13**, 874 (1972).
- [3] Y. Tomozawa, *Quantum corrections to gravity*, arXiv:1107.1424.
- [4] M. Gurses, T. Cagri Sisman, and B. Tekin, *Is there a novel Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet theory in four dimensions?*, Eur. Phys. J. C **80**, 647 (2020).
- [5] J. Arrechea, A. Delhom, A. Jiménez-Cano, arXiv:2004.12998.
- [6] S. Mahapatra, *A note on the total action of 4D Gauss-Bonnet theory* (2020), arXiv:2004.09214.
- [7] W.-Y. Ai, *A note on the novel 4D Einstein-Gauss-Bonnet gravity*, Commun. Theor. Phys. **72**, 095402 (2020).
- [8] J. Zanelli (private communication).
- [9] J. Bonifacio, K. Hinterbichler, and L. A. Johnson, *Amplitudes and 4D Gauss-Bonnet theory*, Phys. Rev. D. **102**, 024029 (2020).
- [10] D. G. Boulware and S. Deser, *String Generated Gravity Models*, Phys. Rev. Lett. **55**, 2656 (1985).

---

\* arrechea@iaa.es

† adria.delhom@uv.es

‡ alejandrojc@ugr.es