

# CRITICAL METRICS OF THE VOLUME FUNCTIONAL ON THREE-DIMENSIONAL MANIFOLDS

HUIYA HE\*

ABSTRACT. In this paper, we prove the three-dimensional *CPE* conjecture with non-negative Ricci curvature. Moreover, we establish a classification result on three-dimensional vacuum static space with non-negative Ricci curvature. Finally, we show that a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected Miao-Tam critical metric with smooth boundary, non-negative Ricci curvature and non-negative potential function is isometric to a geodesic ball in a simply connected space form  $\mathbb{R}^3$  or  $\mathbb{S}^3$ .

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Let  $(M^n, g)$  be a compact, oriented, connected Riemannian manifold with dimension  $n$  at least three,  $\mathcal{M}$  be the set of Riemannian metrics on  $M^n$  of unitary volume,  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{M}$  be the set of Riemannian metrics with constant scalar curvature. Define the total scalar curvature functional  $\mathcal{R} : \mathcal{M} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  as

$$\mathcal{R}(g) = \int_{M^n} R_g dM_g,$$

where  $R_g$  is the scalar curvature on  $M^n$ . It is well-known that the formal  $L^2$ -adjoint of the linearization of the scalar curvature operator  $\mathfrak{L}_g$  at  $g$  is defined as

$$\mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) := -(\Delta_g f)g + Hess_g f - f Ric_g,$$

where  $f$  is a smooth function on  $M^n$ , and  $\Delta_g$ ,  $Hess_g$  and  $Ric_g$  stand for the Laplacian, the Hessian form and the Ricci curvature tensor on  $M^n$ , respectively. An Euler-Lagrange equation is given by

$$(1.1) \quad \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) = Ric_g - \frac{R_g}{n}g.$$

As the terminology used in [2, 15, 33], a *CPE* metric can be defined as follows.

**Definition 1.** A *CPE* metric is a three-tuple  $(M^n, g, f)$  ( $n \geq 3$ ), where  $(M^n, g)$  is a compact (without boundary), oriented Riemannian manifold with constant scalar curvature and  $f : M^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is a non-constant smooth function satisfying equation (1.1). Such a function  $f$  is called a potential function.

Besse [2] first posed the following conjecture on *CPE* metrics:

**CPE Conjecture.** A *CPE* metric is always Einstein.

In last decades, many researchers tried to solve this conjecture, but only partial results were proved. In 1983, Lafontaine [27] showed the *CPE* conjecture under a locally conformally flat assumption and  $Ker \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) \neq 0$ . Chang, Hwang and Yun [15] avoided the condition on  $Ker \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f)$ . In 2000, Hwang [19] obtained the conjecture provided  $f \geq -1$ . In 2013, Qing and Yuan [33] obtained a positive answer

for Bach-flat *CPE* metrics manifolds. For more references on *CPE* metrics, see [14, 16, 18, 29] and references therein.

When the dimension  $n = 3$ , Baltazar [3] proved that the *CPE* conjecture is true for three-dimensional manifolds with non-negative sectional curvature. In this paper, we are able to prove that the *CPE* conjecture is true for three-dimensional manifolds with non-negative Ricci curvature.

One of our main results is the following:

**Theorem 1.1.** *Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected *CPE* metric with non-negative Ricci curvature. Then  $M^3$  is isometric to a standard sphere  $\mathbb{S}^3$ .*

In this article, we also pay attention to another kind of critical point equation. As in [8, 13, 25], we say that  $g$  is a  $V$ -static metric if there is a smooth function  $f$  on  $M^n$  and a constant  $\kappa$  satisfying the  $V$ -static equation

$$(1.2) \quad \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) = \kappa g.$$

On the one hand, when  $\kappa = 0$  in (1.2), as in [20, 24], we can have the definition of vacuum static space.

**Definition 2.** A vacuum static space is a three-tuple  $(M^n, g, f)$  ( $n \geq 3$ ), where  $(M^n, g)$  is a compact, oriented, connected Riemannian manifold with a smooth boundary  $\partial M$  and  $f : M^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is a smooth function such that  $f^{-1}(0) = \partial M$  satisfying the overdetermined-elliptic system

$$(1.3) \quad \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) = 0.$$

Such a function  $f$  is called a potential function.

Kobayashi and Obata [24] (for dimension  $n = 3$ , see [26]) proved that a static metric  $g$  is isometric to a warped-product metric of constant scalar curvature near the hypersurface  $f^{-1}(c)$  for a regular value  $c$  provided  $g$  is locally conformally flat. In the paper [17], Fischer and Marsden showed the local surjectivity for the scalar curvature as a map from the space of metrics to the space of functions at a non-static metric on a closed manifold and raised the possibility of identifying all compact vacuum static spaces.

Obata [32] showed that the only compact Einstein manifold which satisfies (1.3) is the standard sphere. Locally conformally flat vacuum static spaces have been completely classified in [23] and [27] independently. When dimension  $n = 3$ , as Ambrozio state in [1], the classification of locally conformally flat vacuum static spaces is as follows.

**Theorem A** (Kobayashi [23], Lafontaine [27]). *Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a vacuum static space with positive scalar curvature. If  $(M^3, g)$  is locally conformally flat, then  $(M^3, g, f)$  is covered by a static space that is equivalent to one of the following tuples:*

i) *The standard round hemisphere*

$$(\mathbb{S}_+^3, g_{can}, f = x_{n+1}),$$

where  $g_{can}$  is the metric of standard unit round sphere.

ii) *The standard cylinder over  $\mathbb{S}^2$  with the product metric*

$$\left( \left[ 0, \frac{\pi}{\sqrt{3}} \right] \times \mathbb{S}^2, g_{prod} = dt^2 + \frac{1}{3} g_{can}, f = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} \sin(\sqrt{3}t) \right).$$

iii) For some  $m \in \left(0, \frac{1}{3\sqrt{3}}\right)$ , the tuple

$$\left( [r_h(m), r_c(m)] \times \mathbb{S}^2, g_m = \frac{dr^2}{1 - r^2 - \frac{2m}{r}} + r^2 g_{can}, f_m = \sqrt{1 - r^2 - \frac{2m}{r}} \right),$$

where  $r_h(m) < r_c(m)$  are the positive zeroes of  $f_m$ .

Based on a similar idea from [10, 12], Qing and Yuan [33] obtained a classification result for Bach-flat vacuum static spaces in any dimension. Ambrozio [1] got some classification results for compact simply connected static three-manifolds with positive scalar curvature. Baltazar-Ribeiro [8] gave a classification theorem for compact static three-manifolds with non-negative sectional curvature. For more information, see [22, 28, 34, 36] and references therein.

In this paper, we are able to prove the following theorem on three-dimensional V-static space with non-negative Ricci curvature.

**Theorem 1.2.** *Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected V-static metric with smooth boundary  $\partial M$  and non-negative Ricci curvature. If  $f$  and  $\kappa$  satisfy one of the following conditions:*

- (i)  $\kappa \geq 0$  and  $f > 0$ ;
- (ii)  $\kappa \leq 0$  and  $f < 0$ .

Then  $M^3$  is locally conformally flat.

Specifically, when  $\kappa = 0$ , we can get the following corollary.

**Corollary 1.3.** *Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected vacuum static space with smooth boundary  $\partial M$ , non-negative Ricci curvature and positive  $f$ . Then  $(M^3, g, f)$  is covered by a static space that is equivalent to one of the following tuples:*

i) *The standard round hemisphere*

$$(\mathbb{S}_+^3, g_{can}, f = x_{n+1}),$$

where  $g_{can}$  is the metric of standard unit round sphere.

ii) *The standard cylinder over  $\mathbb{S}^2$  with the product metric*

$$\left( \left[0, \frac{\pi}{\sqrt{3}}\right] \times \mathbb{S}^2, g_{prod} = dt^2 + \frac{1}{3}g_{can}, f = \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}}\sin(\sqrt{3}t) \right).$$

On the other hand, when  $\kappa \neq 0$  in (1.2), in [30], Miao and Tam have studied the volume functional on the space of constant scalar curvature metrics with a prescribed boundary metric, and derived sufficient or necessary condition for a metric to be a critical point. As in [25, 31], we can define Miao-Tam critical metric as follows.

**Definition 3.** A Miao-Tam critical metric is a three-tuple  $(M^n, g, f)$  ( $n \geq 3$ ), where  $(M^n, g)$  is a compact, oriented, connected Riemannian manifold with a smooth boundary  $\partial M$  and  $f : M^n \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  is a smooth function such that  $f^{-1}(0) = \partial M$  satisfying the overdetermined-elliptic system

$$(1.4) \quad \mathfrak{L}_g^*(f) = g.$$

Such a function  $f$  is called a potential function.

In [31], Miao-Tam studied these critical metrics under Einstein condition. More precisely, they obtained the following result.

**Theorem B** (Miao-Tam [31]). *Let  $(M^n, g, f)$  be a connected, compact Einstein Miao-Tam critical metric with smooth boundary  $\partial M$ , then  $M^n$  is isometric to a geodesic ball in a simply connected space form  $\mathbb{R}^n$ ,  $\mathbb{H}^n$  or  $\mathbb{S}^n$ .*

In the same article they obtained the same result under the assumption that the metric is locally conformally flat instead of Einstein. Based on a work of Cao-Chen [11], Barros-Diogenes-Ribeiro [5] showed that a 4-dimensional Bach-flat simply connected, compact Miao-Tam critical metric with boundary isometric to a standard sphere  $\mathbb{S}^3$  must be isometric to a geodesic ball in a simply connected space form  $\mathbb{R}^4$ ,  $\mathbb{H}^4$  or  $\mathbb{S}^4$ .

It is important to note that Baltazar-Ribeiro [8] provided a general Bochner type formula to show that a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected Miao-Tam critical metric  $(M^3, g, f)$  with smooth boundary  $\partial M$  and non-negative sectional curvature, with  $f$  assumed to be non-negative, is isometric to a geodesic ball in a simply connected space form  $\mathbb{R}^3$  or  $\mathbb{S}^3$ . We refer to [4, 6, 7, 35] for more related results.

Similar to our theorem on *CPE* metric, we can establish the following result.

**Theorem 1.4.** *Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected Miao-Tam critical metric with smooth boundary  $\partial M$ , non-negative Ricci curvature and non-negative  $f$ . Then  $M^3$  is isometric to a geodesic ball in a simply connected space form  $\mathbb{R}^3$  or  $\mathbb{S}^3$ .*

*Remark 1.5.* As a direct corollary of Theorem 1.2, a classification result of Miao-Tam critical metric under the condition of  $f > 0$  can be deduced. In Theorem 1.4, we optimize this condition to  $f \geq 0$ .

The organization of the paper is as follows. In section 2, we unify the form of equation of *CPE* metric, Miao-Tam critical metric and vacuum static space. Moreover, we state four lemmas as the preparation. In section 3, we give the proof of our main theorems.

Acknowledgement: The author is very grateful to Professor Haizhong Li and Professor Hongwei Xu for their guidance and constant support.

## 2. PRELIMINARIES

Let  $(M^n, g)(n \geq 3)$  be an  $n$ -dimensional compact, orientable Riemannian manifold. In what follows, we adopt, without further comment, the moving frame notation. For any  $p \in M^n$ , we choose  $e_1, \dots, e_n$  as a local orthonormal frame field at  $p$ ,  $\omega_1, \dots, \omega_n$  as its dual coframe field,  $g_{ij} = \delta_{ij}$ . Here and hereafter the Einstein convention of summing over the repeated indices will be adopted.

The decomposition of the Riemannian curvature tensor into irreducible components yields

$$(2.1) \quad \begin{aligned} R_{ijkl} &= W_{ijkl} + \frac{1}{n-2}(R_{ik}\delta_{jl} - R_{il}\delta_{jk} + R_{jl}\delta_{ik} - R_{jk}\delta_{il}) \\ &\quad - \frac{R}{(n-1)(n-2)}(\delta_{ik}\delta_{jl} - \delta_{il}\delta_{jk}), \end{aligned}$$

where  $R_{ijkl}$  are the components of the Riemannian curvature tensor,  $W_{ijkl}$  are the components of the Weyl tensor,  $R_{ij} := \sum_{kl} R_{ikjl}g_{kl}$  are components of Ricci curvature tensor and  $R := \sum_{ij} R_{ij}g_{ij}$  is the scalar curvature of  $M^n$ .

Let  $\phi = \sum_{i,j} \phi_{ij} \omega_i \otimes \omega_j$  be a symmetric (0,2)-type tensor defined on  $M^n$ . By letting  $\phi_{ij,k} := \nabla_k \phi_{ij}$ ,  $\phi_{ij,kl} := \nabla_l \nabla_k \phi_{ij}$ , where  $\nabla$  is the operator of covariant differentiation on  $M^n$ , we have the following Ricci identities

$$(2.2) \quad \phi_{ij,kl} - \phi_{ij,lk} = \phi_{mj} R_{mikl} + \phi_{im} R_{mjkl}.$$

The norm of a (0,4)-type tensor  $T$  is defined as

$$|T|^2 = |T_{ijkl}|^2 = T_{ijkl} T_{ijkl}.$$

By the second Bianchi identity

$$R_{imkl,j} + R_{imlj,k} + R_{imjk,l} = 0,$$

we have

$$(2.3) \quad R_{ij,k} - R_{ik,j} = R_{likj,l}$$

and

$$(2.4) \quad R_{ik,i} = \frac{1}{2} R_{,k}.$$

A Cotton tensor  $C_{ijk}$  is given by

$$(2.5) \quad C_{ijk} = R_{jk,i} - R_{ik,j} - \frac{1}{2(n-1)} (R_{,i} \delta_{jk} - R_{,j} \delta_{ik}).$$

From Definition 1 we know that a *CPE* metric  $(M^n, g, \tilde{f})$  satisfies

$$(2.6) \quad -(\Delta \tilde{f}) \delta_{ij} + \tilde{f}_{,ij} - \tilde{f} R_{ij} = Ric - \frac{R}{n} \delta_{ij},$$

where  $R$  is a constant. Replacing  $\tilde{f}$  by  $f - 1$ , we can rewrite (2.6) as

$$(2.7) \quad -(\Delta f) \delta_{ij} + f_{,ij} - f R_{ij} = -\frac{R}{n} \delta_{ij},$$

where  $-\frac{R}{n}$  is a constant. Obviously, (2.7) is a V-static equation. Then we can unify the equation of *CPE* metric, Miao-Tam critical metric and vacuum static space into the following form:

$$(2.8) \quad -(\Delta f) \delta_{ij} + f_{,ij} - f R_{ij} = \kappa \delta_{ij},$$

where  $\kappa$  is a constant. By tracing the above formula, we can get

$$(2.9) \quad \Delta f = \frac{fR + n\kappa}{1 - n}.$$

Substituting (2.9) into (2.8), we have

$$(2.10) \quad f R_{ij} - f_{,ij} - \frac{fR}{n-1} \delta_{ij} = \frac{\kappa}{n-1} \delta_{ij}.$$

Now we present four lemmas as the preparation for proving our main theorems.

**Lemma 2.1.** *Let  $(M^n, g)$  ( $n \geq 3$ ) be an  $n$ -dimensional Riemannian manifold,  $f$  be a smooth solution to (2.8). Then  $g$  has constant scalar curvature.*

*Proof.* As the proof of Theorem 7 in Miao-Tam [30], differentiating (2.8), we get

$$(2.11) \quad -f_{,kkj} \delta_{ij} + f_{,ijj} - f_{,j} R_{ij} - f R_{ij,j} = 0.$$

From Ricci identity and (2.4), we can derive that scalar curvature  $R$  is constant. Hence we complete the proof of Lemma 2.1.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.2.** *Let  $(M^n, g)(n \geq 3)$  be an  $n$ -dimensional Riemannian manifold,  $f$  be a smooth solution to (2.8). Then*

$$(2.12) \quad fC_{kij} = f_{,h}R_{hjik} + \frac{R}{n-1}(f_{,k}\delta_{ij} - f_{,i}\delta_{kj}) - (f_{,k}R_{ij} - f_{,i}R_{kj}).$$

*Remark 2.3.* As in [5] and [7], we can derive

$$(2.13) \quad fC_{kij} = T_{kij} + W_{kij}f_{,s}$$

from (2.1) and Lemma 2.2, where  $T_{kij}$  is defined as

$$\begin{aligned} T_{kij} &= \frac{n-1}{n-2}(R_{jk}f_{,i} - R_{ij}f_{,k}) - \frac{R}{n-2}(\delta_{jk}f_{,i} - \delta_{ij}f_{,k}) \\ &\quad + \frac{1}{n-2}(\delta_{jk}R_{is}f_{,s} - \delta_{ij}R_{ks}f_{,s}). \end{aligned}$$

*Proof.* Differentiating (2.10), we get

$$(2.14) \quad fR_{ij,k} = f_{,ijk} + \frac{Rf_{,k}}{n-1}\delta_{ij} - f_{,k}R_{ij}.$$

Combining this equation with Ricci identity, we have

$$\begin{aligned} fC_{kij} &= f(R_{ij,k} - R_{kj,i}) \\ &= f_{,ijk} - f_{,kji} + \frac{R}{n-1}(f_{,k}\delta_{ij} - f_{,i}\delta_{kj}) - (f_{,k}R_{ij} - f_{,i}R_{kj}) \\ &= f_{,h}R_{hjik} + \frac{R}{n-1}(f_{,k}\delta_{ij} - f_{,i}\delta_{kj}) - (f_{,k}R_{ij} - f_{,i}R_{kj}). \end{aligned}$$

Hence we complete the proof of Lemma 2.2.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.4.** *Let  $(M^n, g)(n \geq 3)$  be an  $n$ -dimensional Riemannian manifold,  $f$  be a smooth solution to (2.8). Then*

$$(2.15) \quad \begin{aligned} fR_{ij}C_{kij,k} &= fR_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - fR_{ij}R_{hk}R_{ikjh} - \frac{1}{2} \langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle \\ &\quad - 2R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} + \frac{n\kappa}{n-1}|Ric|^2. \end{aligned}$$

*Proof.* According to Lemma 2.2, we have

$$\begin{aligned} fR_{ij}C_{kij,k} &= R_{ij}(fC_{kij})_{,k} - R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} \\ &= R_{ij} \left[ f_{,h}R_{hjik} + \frac{R}{n-1}(f_{,k}\delta_{ij} - f_{,i}\delta_{kj}) - (f_{,k}R_{ij} - f_{,i}R_{kj}) \right]_{,k} \\ &\quad - R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} \\ &= R_{ij}f_{,hk}R_{hjik} + R_{ij}f_{,h}R_{hjik,k} + \frac{R^2}{n-1}\Delta f - \frac{R}{n-1}f_{,ij}R_{ij} \\ &\quad - \Delta f |Ric|^2 - R_{ij}f_{,k}R_{ij,k} + R_{ij}f_{,ik}R_{kj} - R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij}. \end{aligned}$$

From (2.3), (2.5) and the fact  $R$  is a constant, we know that  $R_{hjik,k} = C_{jhi}$ . Substituting this equation, (2.9) and (2.10) into equation above, we have

$$\begin{aligned} fR_{ij}C_{kij,k} &= R_{ij}(fR_{hk} - \frac{fR}{n-1}\delta_{hk} - \frac{\kappa}{n-1}\delta_{hk})R_{hjik} + R_{ij}f_{,h}C_{jhi} \\ &+ \frac{R^2}{n-1}\frac{fR+n\kappa}{1-n} - \frac{R}{n-1}(fR_{ij} - \frac{fR}{n-1}\delta_{ij} - \frac{\kappa}{n-1}\delta_{ij})R_{ij} \\ &- \frac{fR+n\kappa}{1-n}|Ric|^2 - R_{ij}f_{,k}R_{ij,k} + R_{ij}(fR_{ik} - \frac{fR}{n-1}\delta_{ik} \\ &- \frac{\kappa}{n-1}\delta_{ik})R_{kj} - R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij}. \end{aligned}$$

That is

$$\begin{aligned} fR_{ij}C_{kij,k} &= fR_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - fR_{ij}R_{hk}R_{ikjh} - \frac{1}{2}\langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle \\ &- 2R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} + \frac{n\kappa}{n-1}|Ric|^2 - \frac{R^2\kappa}{n-1}. \end{aligned}$$

Thus we complete the proof of Lemma 2.4.  $\square$

**Lemma 2.5.** *Let  $(M^3, g)$  be a three-dimensional Riemannian manifold with non-negative Ricci curvature. Then*

$$6R_{ij}R_{hj}R_{hi} - 5R|Ric|^2 + R^3 \geq 0.$$

*Proof.* For any fixed point  $p \in M$ , we choose an orthonormal basis  $\{e_i\}_{i=1}^3$  in  $T_pM$  such that

$$R_{ij} = \rho_i\delta_{ij}, \quad R = \rho_1 + \rho_2 + \rho_3.$$

Without loss of generality, we can assume  $0 \leq \rho_1 \leq \rho_2 \leq \rho_3$ .

Similar to the proof of Lemma 2.2 in [21], we can compute that

$$\begin{aligned} 6R_{ij}R_{hj}R_{hi} - 5R|Ric|^2 + R^3 &= 6\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i^3 - 5\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i\sum_{j=1}^3\rho_j^2 + (\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i)^3 \\ &= 9\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i^3 - 6\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i\sum_{j=1}^3\rho_j^2 + (\sum_{i=1}^3\rho_i)^3 \\ &\quad - \sum_{i=1}^3\left(3\rho_i^3 - \rho_i\sum_{j=1}^3\rho_j^2\right) \\ &= \sum_{i,j,k=1}^3\rho_i(\rho_i - \rho_j)(\rho_i - \rho_k) - \sum_{i,j=1}^3\rho_i(\rho_i - \rho_j)^2 \\ &= \sum_i\sum_{j \neq k}\rho_i(\rho_i - \rho_j)(\rho_i - \rho_k) \\ &= \sum_{i,j,k \neq} \rho_i(\rho_i - \rho_j)(\rho_i - \rho_k) \\ &= 2[\rho_1(\rho_1 - \rho_2)(\rho_1 - \rho_3) + \rho_2(\rho_2 - \rho_1)(\rho_2 - \rho_3) \\ &\quad + \rho_3(\rho_3 - \rho_1)(\rho_3 - \rho_2)] \\ &= 2[\rho_1(\rho_1 - \rho_2)(\rho_1 - \rho_3) \\ &\quad + (\rho_2 - \rho_3)^2(\rho_2 + \rho_3 - \rho_1)] \geq 0. \end{aligned}$$

Thus we complete the proof of Lemma 2.5.  $\square$

### 3. PROOF OF MAIN THEOREMS

In this section, we prove the main theorems of our paper. Let  $(M^n, g)(n \geq 3)$  be an  $n$ -dimensional compact, oriented, connected Riemannian manifold,  $f$  be a smooth solution to (2.8). From a direct computation and the definition of  $C_{ijk}$ , we get

$$\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div} \left( f^2 \nabla |Ric|^2 \right) &= 2f \langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle + f^2 \Delta |Ric|^2 \\
&= 2f \langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 + 2f^2 R_{ij} R_{ij, kk} \\
&= 2f \langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 + 2f^2 R_{ij} (C_{kij} + R_{jk, i}),_k \\
&= 2f \langle \nabla f, \nabla |Ric|^2 \rangle + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 + 2f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij, k} \\
&\quad + 2f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk, ik}.
\end{aligned}$$

Combining equation above with Lemma 2.4 and Ricci identity, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div} \left( f^2 \nabla |Ric|^2 \right) &= 4f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - 4f^2 R_{ij} R_{hk} R_{ikjh} - 8f R_{ij} f_{,k} C_{kij} \\
&\quad + \frac{4n\kappa f}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 - 4f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij, k} + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 \\
&\quad + 2f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij, k} + 2f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk, ik} \\
&= 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{hk} R_{ikjh} - 8f R_{ij} f_{,k} C_{kij} \\
(3.1) \quad &\quad + \frac{4n\kappa f}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 - 2f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij, k} + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2.
\end{aligned}$$

Since

$$(f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij}),_k = 2f f_{,k} R_{ij} C_{kij} + f^2 R_{ij, k} C_{kij} + f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij, k},$$

it follows that

$$\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{div} \left( f^2 \nabla |Ric|^2 \right) &= 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{hk} R_{ikjh} - 4f R_{ij} f_{,k} C_{kij} \\
&\quad + \frac{4n\kappa f}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 + 2f^2 R_{ij, k} C_{kij} - 2(f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij}),_k \\
&\quad + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 \\
&= 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - 6f^2 R_{ij} R_{hk} R_{ikjh} - 4f R_{ij} f_{,k} C_{kij} \\
&\quad + \frac{4n\kappa f}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 + f^2 |C|^2 - 2(f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij}),_k + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2.
\end{aligned}$$

According to (2.13) and the fact that  $W_{ijkl} = 0$  when  $n = 3$ , we have

$$f C_{kij} = T_{kij},$$

then from the definition of  $T_{kij}$ , we can get

$$(3.2) \quad f |C|^2 = T_{kij} C_{kij} = -4C_{kij} R_{ij} f_{,k}.$$

Besides, from (2.1) we know that

$$(3.3) \quad R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - R_{ijkl} R_{ik} R_{jl} = 3R_{ij} R_{jk} R_{ki} - \frac{5R}{2} |Ric|^2 + \frac{R^3}{2}.$$

Thus we can conclude that when  $n = 3$ ,

$$(3.4) \quad \begin{aligned} \operatorname{div} \left( f^2 \nabla |Ric|^2 \right) &= 3f^2 (6R_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - 5R|Ric|^2 + R^3) + 6\kappa f |\mathring{Ric}|^2 + 2f^2 |C|^2 \\ &\quad - 2(f^2 R_{ij} C_{kij})_{,k} + 2f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2. \end{aligned}$$

To prove Theorem 1.1, we need the following results by Hwang [19] and Cheng [9].

**Proposition 3.1** ([19]). *Let  $(M^n, g, f)$  be a CPE metric with  $f$  non-constant. Then the set  $\{x \in M^n : f(x) = -1\}$  has measure zero.*

**Proposition 3.2** ([9]). *Let  $M^n$  be a compact connected oriented locally conformally flat  $n$ -dimensional Riemannian manifold with constant scalar curvature. If the Ricci curvature of  $M^n$  is non-negative, then  $M^n$  is isometric to a space form or a Riemannian product  $\mathbb{S}^{n-1}(c) \times \mathbb{S}^1$ , where  $c$  is the sectional curvature of  $\mathbb{S}^{n-1}$ .*

*Proof of Theorem 1.1.* Let  $(M^3, g, \tilde{f})$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected CPE metric with non-negative Ricci curvature. Then  $\tilde{f}$  is a non-constant solution to (2.6). Hence  $f = 1 + \tilde{f}$  satisfies (2.8) with  $\kappa = -\frac{R}{3}$ . From Lemma 2.5 and (3.4) we have

$$\begin{aligned} \operatorname{div} \left( (1 + \tilde{f})^2 \nabla |Ric|^2 \right) &\geq -2R(1 + \tilde{f}) |\mathring{Ric}|^2 + 2(1 + \tilde{f})^2 |C|^2 \\ &\quad - 2((1 + \tilde{f})^2 R_{ij} C_{kij})_{,k} + 2(1 + \tilde{f})^2 |\nabla Ric|^2. \end{aligned}$$

According to a direct computation on (2.6), we can see that  $(1 + \tilde{f}) |\mathring{Ric}|^2 = \tilde{f}_{,ij} \mathring{R}_{ij}$ , and from (2.4) and the fact that  $M^3$  has no boundary it is easy to know that  $\int_{M^3} (1 + \tilde{f}) |\mathring{Ric}|^2 dM_g = 0$ . Integrating the inequality above, we can derive that

$$0 \geq \int_{M^3} 2(1 + \tilde{f})^2 |C|^2 dM_g + 2 \int_{M^3} (1 + \tilde{f})^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 dM_g.$$

From Proposition 3.1, we can see that  $M^3$  is a locally conformally flat manifold and  $\nabla Ric = 0$ .

Taking trace of (2.6), we have

$$(3.5) \quad \Delta \tilde{f} = -\frac{R}{2} \tilde{f}.$$

Multiply both sides of this equation by  $\tilde{f}$  and integrate on  $M^3$ , then we can get

$$-\int_{M^3} |\nabla \tilde{f}|^2 dM_g = \int_{M^3} (\Delta \tilde{f}) \cdot \tilde{f} dM_g = -\frac{R}{2} \int_{M^3} \tilde{f}^2 dM_g.$$

According to the fact that  $\tilde{f}$  is not a constant, we can conclude that the scalar curvature  $R$  is a positive constant.

By using Proposition 3.2, we can conclude that  $M^3$  is isometric to a standard sphere  $\mathbb{S}^3$  or a Riemannian product  $\mathbb{S}^2(c) \times \mathbb{S}^1$ , where  $c$  is the sectional curvature of  $\mathbb{S}^2$ .

Here if  $M^3$  is isometric to  $\mathbb{S}^2(c) \times \mathbb{S}^1$ , we have

$$(R_{ij})_{3 \times 3} = \begin{pmatrix} c & & \\ & c & \\ & & 0 \end{pmatrix}_{3 \times 3},$$

and  $R = 2c$ . Substituting (3.5) into (2.6), we can deduce that

$$\tilde{f}(c\delta_{ij} - R_{ij}) + \tilde{f}_{,ij} = R_{ij} - \frac{2c}{3}\delta_{ij}.$$

Then  $\tilde{f}_{,11} = \frac{c}{3}$ ,  $\tilde{f}_{,22} = \frac{c}{3}$ ,  $\tilde{f}_{,33} = -c\tilde{f} - \frac{2c}{3}$ . Thus for any  $q \in \mathbb{S}^1$ , we can get that  $\int_{\mathbb{S}^2 \times \{q\}} \Delta_{\mathbb{S}^2 \times \{q\}} \tilde{f} d\text{vol} = \int_{\mathbb{S}^2 \times \{q\}} \frac{2c}{3} d\text{vol} \neq 0$ , which is a contradiction.

Thus we finish the proof of Theorem 1.1.  $\square$

*Remark 3.3.* In the process of proving Theorem 1.1, after getting the result that  $M^3$  is a locally conformally flat manifold, we can also deduce that  $M^3$  is isometric to a standard sphere  $\mathbb{S}^3$  by using Corollary 1.3 in [15].

Similarly, we can prove a three-dimensional V-static metric is locally conformally flat under some suitable conditions.

*Proof of Theorem 1.2.* Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected V-static metric with smooth boundary  $\partial M$  and non-negative Ricci curvature. Integrating (3.4), we can deduce

$$(3.6) \quad 0 \geq 6\kappa \int_{M^3} f |\mathring{Ric}|^2 dM_g + 2 \int_{M^3} f^2 |C|^2 dM_g + 2 \int_{M^3} f^2 |\nabla Ric|^2 dM_g$$

from Lemma 2.5. Then if  $\kappa \geq 0$ ,  $f > 0$  or  $\kappa \leq 0$ ,  $f < 0$ ,  $M^3$  is locally conformally flat. Thus we complete the proof of Theorem 1.2.  $\square$

When  $\kappa = 0$ , Corollary 1.3 can be directly deduced from Theorem 1.2 and Theorem A.

When  $\kappa = 1$ , from (3.1), we can prove Theorem 1.4 on the basis of the following calculation

$$\begin{aligned} \text{div}(f\nabla|Ric|^2) &= \frac{1}{f} \text{div}(f^2 \nabla|Ric|^2) - \langle \nabla f, \nabla|Ric|^2 \rangle \\ &= 6fR_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - 6fR_{ij}R_{hk}R_{ikjh} - 8R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} \\ &\quad + \frac{4n\kappa}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 - 2fR_{ij}C_{kij,k} + 2f|\nabla Ric|^2 - \langle \nabla f, \nabla|Ric|^2 \rangle. \end{aligned}$$

Using Lemma 2.4 again, we have

$$(3.7) \quad \begin{aligned} \text{div}(f\nabla|Ric|^2) &= 4fR_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - 4fR_{ij}R_{hk}R_{ikjh} \\ &\quad - 4R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} + \frac{2n\kappa}{n-1} |\mathring{Ric}|^2 + 2f|\nabla Ric|^2. \end{aligned}$$

*Proof of Theorem 1.4.* Let  $(M^3, g, f)$  be a three-dimensional compact, oriented, connected Miao-Tam critical metric with smooth boundary  $\partial M$ , non-negative Ricci curvature and non-negative  $f$ . Then  $f$  is a non-constant solution to (1.4). That is  $f$  satisfies (2.8) with  $\kappa = 1$ .

$$\begin{aligned} \text{div}(f\nabla|Ric|^2) &= 4fR_{ij}R_{jk}R_{ki} - 4fR_{ij}R_{hk}R_{ikjh} \\ &\quad - 4R_{ij}f_{,k}C_{kij} + 3|\mathring{Ric}|^2 + 2f|\nabla Ric|^2. \end{aligned}$$

As the proof of Theorem 1.1, integrating this equation, we can derive that

$$0 \geq \int_{M^3} f(2|\nabla Ric|^2 + |C|^2) dM_g + \int_{M^3} 3|\mathring{Ric}|^2 dM_g$$

from (3.2), (3.3) and Lemma 2.5. Hence  $M^3$  is an Einstein manifold. Thus from Theorem B we can complete the proof of Theorem 1.4.  $\square$

*Remark 3.4.* From the proof of Theorem 1.4 we can deduce that, when  $\kappa > 0$ , a V-static metric is Einstein under the condition of  $Ric \geq 0$  and  $f \geq 0$ .

## REFERENCES

- [1] L. Ambrozio, *On static three-manifolds with positive scalar curvature*. J. Differential Geom. **107** (2017), no. 1, 1-45.
- [2] A.L. Besse, *Einstein Manifolds*. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1987.
- [3] H. Baltazar, *On critical point equation of compact manifolds with zero radial weyl curvature*. Geom. Dedic. **202** (2019), 337-355.
- [4] A. Barros and A. da Silva, *Rigidity for critical metrics of the volume functional*. Math. Nachr. **292** (2019), no. 4, 709-719.
- [5] A. Barros, R. Diógenes and E. Ribeiro Jr., *Bach-Flat Critical Metrics of the Volume Functional on 4-Dimensional Manifolds with Boundary*. J. Geom. Anal. **25** (2015), 2698-2715.
- [6] R. Batista, R. Diógenes, M. Ranieri and E. Ribeiro Jr., *Critical metrics of the volum functional on compact three-manifolds with smooth boundary*. J. Geom. Anal. **27** (2017), 1530-1547.
- [7] H. Baltazar and E. Ribeiro Jr., *Critical metrics of the volume functional on manifolds with boundary*. Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **145** (2017), 3513-3523.
- [8] H. Baltazar and E. Ribeiro Jr., *Remarks on critical metrics of the scalar curvature and volume functionals on compact manifolds with boundary*. Pacific J. Math. **297(1)** (2018), 29-45.
- [9] Q. M. Cheng, *Compact locally conformally flat Riemannian manifolds*. Bull. London Math. Soc. **33** (2001), no. 4, 459-465.
- [10] H.-D. Cao and Q. Chen, *On locally conformally flat gradient steady solitons*. Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **364** (2012), 2377-2391.
- [11] H.-D. Cao and Q. Chen, *On Bach-flat gradient shrinking Ricci solitons*. Duke Math. J. **162** (2013), 1149-1169.
- [12] H.-D. Cao, G. Catino, Q. Chen, C. Mantegazza and L. Mazziere, *Bach-flat gradient steady Ricci solitons*. Calc. Var. PDE. **49** (2014), 125-138.
- [13] J. Corvino, M. Eichmair, and P. Miao, *Deformation of scalar curvature and volume*. Math. Ann. **357** (2013), 551-584.
- [14] J. Chang, S. Hwang and G. Yun, *Critical point metrics of the total scalar curvature*. Bull. Korean Math. Soc. **49** (2012), 655-667.
- [15] J. Chang, S. Hwang and G. Yun, *Total scalar curvature and harmonic curvature*. Taiwanese J. Math. **18** (2014), 1439-1458.
- [16] J. Chang, S. Hwang and G. Yun, *Erratum to: Total scalar curvature and harmonic curvature*. Taiwanese J. Math. **20(3)** (2016), 699-703.
- [17] A. Fischer and J. Marsden, *Deformations of the scalar curvature*. Duke Math. J. **42** (1975), 519-547.
- [18] Y. Fang and W. Yuan, *Brown-York mass and positive scalar curvature II-Besses conjecture and related problems*. Ann. Global Anal. Geom. **56** (2019), no. 1, 1-15.
- [19] S. Hwang, *Critical points of the total scalar curvature functional on the space of metrics of constant scalar curvature*. Manuscripta Math. **103** (2000), 135-142.
- [20] S. Hawking and G. Ellis, *The Large Scale Structure of Space-Time*. Cambridge University Press, 1975.
- [21] Z.J. Hu, H. Li and Udo Simon, *Schouten curvature functions on locally conformally flat Riemannian manifolds*. J. Geom. **88** (2008), 75-100.
- [22] G. Huang and F. Zeng, *The classification of static spaces and related problems*. Colloq. Math. **151** (2018), no. 2, 189-202.
- [23] O. Kobayashi, *A differential equation arising from scalar curvature function*. J. Math. Soc. Japan. **34** (1982), no. 4, 665-675.
- [24] O. Kobayashi and M. Obata, *Conformally-flatness and static space-time, in: Manifolds and Lie Groups*. Progr. Math. **14** (1981), Birkhäuser, 197-206.

- [25] J. Kim and J. Shin, *Four dimensional static and related critical spaces with harmonic curvature*. Pacific J. Math. **295(2)** (2018), 429-462.
- [26] L. Lindblom, *Some properties of static general relativistic stellar models*. J. Math. Phys. **21** (1980), 1455-1459.
- [27] J. Lafontaine, *Sur la géométrie d'une généralisation de l'équation différentielle d'Obata*. J. Math. Pures Appl. **62** (1983), 63-72.
- [28] J. Lafontaine, *A remark about static space times*. J. Geom. Phys. **59** (2009), 50-53.
- [29] B. Leandro, *A note on critical point metrics of the total scalar curvature functional*. J. Math. Analysis and App. **424** (2015), 1544-1548.
- [30] P. Miao and L.-F. Tam, *On the volume functional of compact manifolds with boundary with constant scalar curvature*. Calc. Var. PDE. **36** (2009), 141-171.
- [31] P. Miao and L.-F. Tam *Einstein and conformally flat critical metrics of the volume functional*. Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **363** (2011), 2907-2937.
- [32] M. Obata, *Certain conditions for a Riemannian manifold to be isometric with a sphere*. J. Math. Soc. Japan **14(3)** (1962), 333-340.
- [33] J. Qing and W. Yuan, *A note on static spaces and related problems*. J. Geom. Phys. **74** (2013), 18-27.
- [34] J. Qing and W. Yuan, *On scalar curvature rigidity of vacuum static spaces*. Math. Ann. **365** (2016), no. 3-4, 1257-1277. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00208-015-1302-0>
- [35] W. Sheng and L. Wang, *Critical metrics with cyclic parallel Ricci tensor for volume functional on manifolds with boundary*. Geom. Dedic. **201** (2019), 243-251.
- [36] W. Yuan, *The geometry of vacuum static spaces and deformations of scalar curvature*. Ph.D. thesis at UC Santa Cruz (2015).

CENTER OF MATHEMATICAL SCIENCES, ZHEJIANG UNIVERSITY, HANGZHOU 310027, P. R. CHINA  
Email address: [hehuiya2019@163.com](mailto:hehuiya2019@163.com)