Negative group velocity and Kelvin-like wake in superfluid $^4$He

Eugene B. Kolomeisky$^1$, Jonathan Colen$^2$, and Joseph P. Straley$^3$

$^1$Department of Physics, University of Virginia, P. O. Box 400714, Charlottesville, Virginia 22904-4714, USA
$^2$Department of Physics, University of Chicago, 5720 South Ellis Ave, Chicago, Illinois 60637, USA
$^3$Department of Physics and Astronomy, University of Kentucky, Lexington, Kentucky 40506-0055, USA

(Dated: June 15, 2021)

The dispersion law $\Omega(k)$ of elementary excitations in superfluid $^4$He is a non-monotonic function of the wave number $k$. After an initial increase, the function $\Omega(k)$ reaches a maximum followed by a "roton" minimum at finite $k$. As a result, there is a range of $k$ between these extrema where the elementary excitations have negative group velocity. These excitations are generated when a fast heavy impurity travels through the superfluid or the latter flows past an obstacle with the speed exceeding 60 m/s. Their interference leads to a pattern resembling the Kelvin ship wake.

Physics experiments typically measure a response of a system to an external disturbance. A familiar type of disturbance is an object traveling uniformly relative to a medium. This can give rise to a range of effects including Mach waves behind a supersonic projectile [1], Cherenkov radiation emitted by a rapidly moving charge [2], and ship waves [3, 4], all of which are examples of coherent emission of their medium’s collective excitations [3].

If the disturbance is weak, the response is proportional to it and dictated by the properties of the medium. This is the case for far-field wake patterns that are governed by the frequency spectrum $\Omega(k)$ of the relevant collective excitations of the medium (here $k$ is the wave vector). For any physical system, the wake is present if there is a wave mode whose phase velocity $\Omega/k$ (here $k=|k|$ is the wave number) matches the projection of the velocity of the source $v$ onto the direction of radiation $k/k$ [4] [5]. For a source moving in the $+x$ direction with velocity $v$, this requires the existence of a wave vector $k$ satisfying

$$\Omega(k) = k \cdot v \equiv kv \cos \varphi \equiv k_x v$$

(1)

where $v = |v|$ and $\varphi$ is the angle between the vectors $k$ and $v$. The condition [1] is the Mach-Cherenkov-Landau (MCL) radiation constraint, which also holds for the onset of Landau damping in plasma [6] and the breakdown of superfluidity [7].

When the excitation spectrum is linear,

$$\Omega = uk$$

(2)

where $u$ is the speed of sound (or light), the MCL condition [1] becomes $\cos \varphi = u/v$. It can be satisfied only if $u \leq v$, i.e. if the source is supersonic (or superluminal).

Contrarily, the spectrum of gravity waves is [1] [4]

$$\Omega^2 = gk$$

(3)

where $g$ is the free fall acceleration. Now the MCL condition [1] becomes $\cos \varphi = \sqrt{g/kv^2}$ and can always be satisfied for sufficiently large $k$. As a result, the wake appears for any velocity.

The complexity of wake patterns is governed by the spatial dispersion, i.e. by a difference between the group and the phase velocities. Specifically, the simple cone geometry of Mach-Cherenkov wakes occurs for the dispersionless spectrum [2] while the "feathered" appearance of ship wakes has its origin in the dispersive character of gravity waves [3].

Here we show that in superfluid $^4$He a Kelvin-like wake pattern will be found if the speed of the source (or equivalently the speed of the flow past a fixed obstacle) exceeds about 60 m/s. This effect is caused by superfluid excitations with negative group velocity and has been overlooked in past studies of wakes in superfluid $^4$He [8,9]. The phenomenon described below is different from a reversed Cherenkov effect in electrodynamics [10].

For small wave numbers $k$ the collective (or elementary) excitations in Bose liquids correspond to hydrodynamic sound waves with a linear spectrum [2] [7]. In liquid $^4$He the function $\Omega(k) \equiv \Omega(k)$ reaches a maximum after an initial increase, followed by a "roton" minimum at some $k_0$ [7]. The excitations with wave numbers sandwiched between these extrema are characterized by a negative group velocity $d\Omega/dk \equiv \Omega'(k) < 0$.

In the vicinity of $k = k_0$ it is customary to expand the function $\Omega(k)$ in powers of $k - k_0$:

$$\Omega = \frac{\Delta}{h} + \frac{h(k - k_0)^2}{2\mu}$$

(4)

where $\Delta$, $\mu$ and $k_0$ are empirically known parameters [7] which can be assembled into a dimensionless combination

$$a = \frac{h^2k_0^2}{\mu\Delta} \approx 31.$$  

(5)

Additionally, it is useful to introduce a velocity scale

$$v_0 = \frac{\Delta}{hk_0} \approx 60 \text{ m/s},$$

(6)

which is the slope of a straight line connecting the origin $\Omega(0) = 0$ to the roton minimum $\Omega(k_0) = \Delta/h$.

The excitation spectrum of superfluid $^4$He is known to end at $\Omega = 2\Delta/h$, $k = k_c \approx 3 \times 10^8 \text{ cm}^{-1}$ [7]. Below we largely focus on the source velocities $v \leq 2\Delta/hk_c \approx 76 \text{ m/s}$ so that the end part of the spectrum does not contribute into the wake pattern.
Hereafter it is convenient to measure the wave number and the source velocity in units of $k_0$ and $v_0$, respectively. The roton part of the spectrum (4) will then be given by

$$\Omega = 1 + \frac{1}{2} a (k - 1)^2.$$  \hspace{1cm} (7)

The MCL requirement (1) is satisfied for the first time at a critical velocity $v_c$, such as $\Omega = kv$ and $\Omega' = v$. Subjecting Eq. (7) to these conditions determines the threshold velocity to generate a wake which is also Landau’s critical roton velocity to destroy superfluidity in $^4$He:

$$v_c = a \left( \sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{a} - 1} \right) \approx 0.98 \text{ (59 m/s, original units)}$$  \hspace{1cm} (8)

These conditions also define a critical wave number where the group and the phase velocities coincide, $\Omega' = \Omega/k$,

$$k_c = \sqrt{1 + \frac{2}{a}} \approx 1.03.$$  \hspace{1cm} (9)

Thanks to the very large parameter $a$, the velocities $v_0$ (9) and $v_c$ (8), and respective wave numbers $k_0$ and $k_c$, are extremely close to each other.

Superfluidity can also be destroyed by vortex loop excitations above some critical velocity that depends on specific conditions of the flow. In the past this made it impossible to attain the critical velocity (8) in practice. Subsequent experiments with isotopically pure $^4$He [11] indicated that the critical velocity of vortex nucleation $v_c$ is significantly larger than the Landau value (8). There also is numerical indication [9] relating $u_c$ to the speed of sound $u$ (2). Thus, vortex loop excitations are neglected here.

When $v > v_c$, the MCL condition (1) holds within a range of the wave numbers $[k_-, k_+]$. In the roton approximation (7) the bounds $k_{\pm}$ are given by

$$k_{\pm} = 1 + \frac{1}{a} \left( v \pm \sqrt{v^2 + 2a(v - 1)} \right).$$  \hspace{1cm} (10)

This shows the significance of the velocity $v_0$ (6): if $v_c < v < v_0 (= 1)$, one has $k_- > k_0 (= 1)$ and all the waves with wave numbers in the $[k_-, k_+]$ range have positive group velocity (inset to Figure 3). As the source velocity increases, the $[k_-, k_+]$ interval widens and at $v = v_0 (= 1)$ one finds that $k_- = k_0 (= 1)$. For $v > v_0$ the wave numbers in the $[k_-, k_0]$ segment correspond to waves with negative group velocity (inset to Figure 2).

The resulting wake patterns can be understood through linear response theory [12, 13]. We suppose [7] that every particle of the liquid is perturbed by a traveling external field of the potential energy $U(r - vt)$. Then the average value of the Fourier transform of induced density due to the perturbation is given by $\delta \hat{n}(v, k) = -2\pi \alpha(v \cdot k) U(k) \delta(\omega - k \cdot v)$ where $\alpha(\omega, k)$ is a generalized susceptibility [7, 12, 13] and $U(k)$ is the Fourier transform of $U(r)$. Performing the inverse Fourier transform and changing the frame of reference to that of the source, $\mathbf{r} - vt \rightarrow \mathbf{r}$, the induced density is given by

$$\delta \hat{n}(r) = -\int \frac{d^3k}{(2\pi)^3} \alpha(k \cdot v + i0, k) U(k)e^{ik \cdot r}$$  \hspace{1cm} (11)

where $d$ is the space dimensionality and in the integrand the first argument of the generalized susceptibility is written as $k \cdot v + i0$ to emphasize the requirement of causality [12]. This is needed to assign meaning to the integral because the susceptibility $\alpha(\omega, k)$ has a pole at $\omega = k \cdot v = \Omega(k)$ [7, 13] which is the MCL condition (1).

The wake pattern due to a point source ($U(k) = \text{const}$) will be determined by a combination of Kelvin’s stationary phase argument [3, 5] and numerical evaluation of the integral (11) [15], with generalized susceptibility

$$\alpha(\omega, k) \propto \frac{1}{\omega^2 - \Omega^2(k)}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (12)

Far from the source, the phase $f = k \cdot r$ is large and the exponential in (11) is highly oscillatory. This is where contributions of elementary plane waves interfere destructively leaving almost no net result, unless their wave vectors satisfy the MCL condition (1) and have a phase which is stationary with respect to $k$. This is the condition of constructive interference leading to a wake.

We start by discussing two-dimensional wave patterns assuming that the dispersion law of excitations is isotropic, $\Omega(k) = \Omega(k)$. The wave is formed by interference of plane waves with positive $x$-components of the wave vector, $k_x > 0$. We take $k_y > 0$ ($k_y < 0$ contributions can be found via reflection $y \rightarrow -y$). Then the wake is found at $y > 0$ if the group velocity is positive or at $y < 0$ if the group velocity is negative. The phase is given by

$$f = k \cdot r = k_x x + k_y y = \frac{\Omega(k)}{v} x + \sqrt{k^2 - \Omega^2(k)} y$$  \hspace{1cm} (13)

where we used the MCL condition (1) and $k^2 = k_x^2 + k_y^2$ to re-express $x, y$ in terms of $k$. Therefore the stationary phase condition $df/dk = 0$ becomes

$$\frac{y}{x} = \frac{\Omega' \sqrt{v^2k^2 - \Omega^2}}{\Omega \sqrt{v^2 - \Omega^2}}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (14)

Since the phase $f$ is constant along the wavefront, Eqs. (13) and (14) can be solved to give equations of the wavefronts in the parametric form:

$$x(k) = \frac{\Omega' \sqrt{v^2k^2 - \Omega^2}}{vk(\Omega' k - \Omega)} f, \quad y(k) = \frac{\Omega' \sqrt{v^2k^2 - \Omega^2}}{vk(\Omega' k - \Omega)} f.$$  \hspace{1cm} (15)

Not only do Eqs. (13)–(15) encompass wake patterns in two dimensions [3, 5, 13, 15], they also apply to the three-dimensional case. The difference is that the $xy$
FIG. 1: The right-hand side of the equation of the stationary phase (14) in the roton approximation (7) with \( v \) and \( k \) measured in units of \( v_0 \) and \( k_0 \). (a) Source velocity \( v = 0.99 \) \((v_c < v < 1)\) versus (b) source velocity \( v = 1.15 \) \((v > 1)\). Insets illustrate the spectrum \( \Omega(k) \) and the origin of the critical wave number \( k_c \) (orange) (9) and boundary values \( k_{\pm} \) (10) as solutions to \( \Omega(k) = kv \). (b) includes waves with negative group velocity whose interference is responsible for transverse \((t)\) and divergent \((d)\) parts of the Kelvin-like wake in Figure 2b.

The right-hand side (rhs) of Eq.(14) diverges at a wave number \( k \) that can be bounded by evaluating \( \Omega(k_c)\Omega'(k_c) - v^2 k_c = k_c(v_c^2 - v^2) \lesssim 0 \) and \( \Omega(k_+)\Omega'(k_+) - v^2 k_+ = k_+ v[\Omega'(k_+) - v] \gtrsim 0 \), meaning that \( k_c \leq k_v \leq k_+ \).

If the source velocity belongs to the \([v_c, v_0]\) interval, the group velocity \( \Omega' \) is positive in the \([k_-, k_v]\) range where \( y/x < 0 \) and in the \([k_v, k_+]\) interval where \( y/x > 0 \). Thus the wake is present both ahead \((x > 0)\) and behind \((x < 0)\) the source.

Moreover, since for \( k > k_c \) the group velocity \( \Omega' \) is larger than the phase velocity \( \Omega/k \), while for \( k < k_c \), the opposite is true, \( \Omega' < \Omega/k \), and signs of \( y \) and \( \Omega' \) coincide, the second of Eqs.(15) implies that there are two families of wavefronts distinguished by the choice of the phase:

\[
\begin{align*}
  f &= 2\pi n, \text{ if } k \in [k_c, k_+] \ (\Omega' > \Omega/k) \quad (16) \\
  f &= -2\pi n, \text{ if } k \in [k_-, k_c] \ (\Omega' < \Omega/k) \quad (17)
\end{align*}
\]

where \( n \) takes on positive integers. Since for the first of these the rhs of the stationary phase condition (14) can be both positive and negative (blue-colored parts of the curves in Figure 1a), the wavefronts (15) and (16) are found both at \( x < 0 \) and \( x > 0 \). Specifically, \( k = k_v \), the point of divergence of \( y/x \), corresponds to \( x = 0 \). On the other hand, the wavefronts described by Eqs.(15) and (17) are only found at \( x < 0 \) because in the range of wave numbers (17) the rhs of Eq.(14) is negative (green-colored part of the curves in Figure 1b).

The spatial periodicities along the central line \( y = 0 \) can be found by setting \( k = k_{\pm} \) in the first of Eqs.(15):

\[
\Delta x_{\pm} = \frac{2\pi}{k_{\pm}},
\]

(18)

The two wavefront families are separated by a marginal wavefront that can be obtained by evaluating Eq.(14) at \( k = k_c \) (orange dot in Figure 1a):

\[
\frac{y}{x} = -\frac{v_c}{\sqrt{v^2 - v_c^2}}.
\]

(19)

This is a Mach-Cherenkov cone with the Landau critical roton velocity playing a role of the limiting velocity. The same equation describes the asymptotic behavior of the wavefronts (15), (16) and (17) far away from the source.

The resulting wake pattern is shown in Figure 2a where predictions of the stationary phase analysis, Eqs. (15), (16), (17), and (19) (color matching Figure 1a) are overlaid.
note that the rhs of Eq.(14) is positive in the $\kappa$. To better understand implications of this we
with $\Delta x = 2\pi/k_\kappa$, a pattern of induced density $\delta\rho(x)$ predicted to occur in superfluid $^4He$ when the flow velocity slightly exceeds the Landau critical roton velocity $v_0$. A wake similar to the one in Figure 2a is observed in water at source velocities slightly in excess of $v_0 \approx 23 \text{ cm/s} \ [4]$. As $v \to v_0$, the wake in Figure 2b transforms into a one-dimensional periodic structure with the period $\Delta x = 2\pi/k_\kappa$, which is represented in Figures 1a and 1b. Kelvin-like wakes highlighted by a series of red triangles tracing wavecrests are visible in parts (b) and (c) for $x < 0$.

The behavior of $y/x$ in the $[k_-, k_0]$ range is qualitatively the same as that in Figure 1a. This explains a part of the wake pattern in Figure 2a that is qualitatively similar to that in Figure 2b. The rhs of Eq.(14) in the $[k_-, k_0]$ range of the wave numbers is shown in Figure 1a, in red where it is positive and has a maximum at a wavenumber $k^\ast$. If $0 < y/x < (y/x)^\ast \equiv (y/x)(k^\ast)$ (shown in Figure 1a as a dashed horizontal line) Eq.(14) has three solutions. One of them immediately to the left of $k = k_+$ corresponds to already discussed wavefronts [15] and [16]. The remaining two solutions within the $[k_-, k_0]$ interval, one to the left and one to the right of $k = k_+$, are new. As $y/x$ increases approaching $(y/x)^\ast$ the two solutions tend to each other, join at $y/x = (y/x)^\ast$, and none are found if $y/x > (y/x)^\ast$. This part of the wake pattern confined within an angle $2\arctan(y/x)^\ast$ is represented in Figures 2b and 2c by a series of curved red triangles.

There is a great deal of similarity between this pattern and the classic Kelvin ship wake formed behind a point pressure source uniformly traveling a calm water surface [3, 4]. Both patterns are formally due to existence of an extremum in $y/x$ - in Kelvin’s case $y/x$ has a minimum and is negative [15] while in $^4He$ the ratio $y/x$ has a maximum and is positive. Additionally Kelvin’s terminology of “transverse” and “divergent” [3] wavefronts applies. Specifically, interfering excitations with wave numbers in the $[k^\ast, k_0]$ range produce the transverse wavefronts which smoothly connect the edges of the pattern $y/x = \pm(y/x)^\ast$ across the central line $y = 0$. Likewise, waves with wave numbers in the $[k^\ast, k_0]$ range are responsible for the divergent wavefronts which connect the edges of the pattern across the central line with discontinuous slope. Kelvin’s triangles in $^4He$ consisting of two divergent and one transverse wavefronts are formed by elementary waves with negative group velocity. That is why they face away from the source which is
in contrast to their ship counterparts.

Like the Landau critical roton velocity \( v = v_c \), the instant \( v < v_0 \) where elementary waves having negative group velocity start participating in forming wake pattern, represents a critical phenomenon. It is expected that it will be accompanied by an increase in the wave resistance which we are planning to study in the future.

As the source velocity increases beyond \( v = v_0 \), the size of the waves increases, the opening angle of the Kelvin-like wake grows and the roton approximation \([1]\) eventually breaks down. However qualitatively the wake pattern will not change as long as \( v < 76 \text{ m/s} \); the pattern in Figure 2 corresponds to \( v = 76 \text{ m/s} \). At larger velocities the wake pattern will acquire new elements due to contributions coming from the end part of the spectrum. However the Kelvin-like feature will persist and widen with \( v \) until the source velocity exceeds about \( 167 \text{ m/s} \). This is when the lower bound of the MCL interval \( k_c \) coincides with the maximum of \( \Omega(k) \) and the range of wave numbers with \( \Omega(k) < 0 \) is largest.

To summarize, we demonstrated that a sufficiently fast heavy impurity traveling through superfluid \( ^4 \text{He} \) will generate a Kelvin-like wake. This effect should be commonplace because the Landau critical roton velocity of \( v_c = 59 \text{ m/s} \) is extremely close to the Kelvin threshold of \( v_0 = 60 \text{ m/s} \); the Kelvin wake is always present except when the source velocity is sandwiched between these two very close values. At the same time the details of the Kelvin feature may be somewhat obscured due to interference with overlapping "green" family of wavefronts, Figures 2 and 3. A Kelvin-like wedge should be observable by light scattering techniques while the fine structure of all the discussed wake patterns can be only resolved with the help of X-ray or neutron scattering.

---