Thermal quantum correlations in two gravitational cat states

Moises Rojas$^{1,*}$ and Iarley P. Lobo$^{2,1,†}$

$^1$Department of Physics, Federal University of Lavras, Caixa Postal 3037, 37200-900 Lavras-MG, Brazil
$^2$Department of Chemistry and Physics, Federal University of Paraíba, Rodovia BR 079 - Km 12, 58397-000 Arua-PB, Brazil

We consider the effect of a thermal bath on quantum correlations induced by the gravitational interaction between two massive cat states. Entanglement (measured by the concurrence) and quantum coherence (measured by the $l_1$-norm) are analyzed from the thermal quantum density operator. We investigate and discuss the behavior of these quantities under temperature variations in different regimes, including some that are expected to be experimentally feasible in the future.

I. INTRODUCTION

The quantization of the gravitational interaction has occupied a prominent space in the research of gravity and quantum field theory in the past decades. This quest has been mainly focused on efforts to coherently quantize the gravitational field or the spacetime geometry [1–4]. Since the beginning of the XXI century, the research in quantum gravity has entered a new era in which phenomenological approaches to this problem have arisen due to technological advances that have allowed experimental bounds on predictions with Planck scale sensitivity [5]. Besides constraints from observations of astrophysical events [6, 7], underground and laboratory-based measurements have been considered in recent investigations (see for instance [8–11].)

Recently, a more fundamental question regarding this problem has been matter of debate: how can one verify if the gravitational interaction indeed needs to be quantized [12]? Besides that, is there a model-independent experimental protocol that can assure whether gravity is an interaction of quantum mechanical nature [13, 14]? In these approaches, based on the theory of quantum information, it is argued that an interaction that is responsible for creating entanglement between two systems must be of quantum nature. Therefore, a sufficient evidence of quantum gravity would be the detection of entanglement between massive states induced by the gravitational interaction.

Despite the ongoing debate on the matter [15–18], the existence of entanglement (besides other correlations) between massive states constitutes an exciting topic to be analysed by itself. In this paper we do not aim to discuss the issue whether the detection of gravity-induced entanglement represents a test of the quantum nature of the gravitational interaction, instead we simply pose a very simple question that we believe has not been sufficiently discussed in the literature: how do the entanglement and other quantum correlations in this scenario are affected by the environment? The subject of some environmental effects in this setup has been analysed previously for the case of the decoherence time necessary to observe entanglement [20], and its robustness against stochastic fluctuations was verified [21].

The quantum entanglement plays an important role in quantum computation and quantum information [22–24], which is a tool that has been recently explored for simulating properties of a quantum spacetime [25, 26]. In a similar manner, quantum coherence [32, 33] is also a central concept in quantum mechanics and has been extensively explored in the context of quantum information processing [33], quantum metrology [28, 29], thermodynamics [30, 31], among others.

Moreover, the quantum coherence, is a fundamental measure of the quantum nature of a given phenomenon, for instance, it governs effects like interference of states and provides important tools for quantum optics [34, 35]. Besides that, it has been recently shown a close relation between quantifiers of coherence and entanglement [36]. In recent years, employing quantum coherence as a resource, several interesting results have been obtained in different quantum systems, among them, in quantum thermodynamics [37], quantum dots [38] and Heisenberg spin chains [39].

Several quantities have been proposed as candidate measures of quantum coherence. In particular, Baumgratz et al. [32] introduced the $l_1$-norm of coherence and the relative entropy of coherence as measures of this property. In the present work, we confine ourselves to utilize the $l_1$-norm of coherence.

In this paper, we aim to contribute to the research on the use of these quantum correlations in quantum gravity, by investigating the way temperature (induced by a thermal bath) impacts quantifiers of entanglement and quantum coherence.

The present paper is structured as follows. In Sec. II, we present the model describing the gravitational interaction that generates two qubits and we introduce the thermal density operator due to the thermal bath. Subsequently, in Sec. III, we present thermal concurrence as a quantifier of entanglement and the $l_1$-norm as a quantifier of quantum coherence (both depend on the temperature of the thermal bath). In Sec. IV, we present the evolution of these quantum correlations as a function of the temperature and the different parameters of the model. Finally in Sec. V, our conclusions and further
II. THE MODEL

The model consists of a set of two particles of mass \( m \), each one in a one dimensional double-well potential, with local minima at \( x = \pm L/2 \), which we will call gravitational cats. The potential is even and is such that we can associate two eigenstates for each particle describing its localization in each of the minima \(|\pm\rangle\), where \( \hat{x}|\pm\rangle = \pm \frac{L}{2}|\pm\rangle \). From the Landau-Lifschitz approximation [19], they can be written in terms of the ground \(|1\rangle\) and first excited states \(|0\rangle\) as

\[
|\pm\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|1\rangle \pm |0\rangle).
\]

The experimental setup that could be modeled as above can be found in some references in this subject, for instance [13, 14, 41], like massive molecules, nanomechanical oscillators, diamond microspheres, optomechanical systems, etc.

The Hamiltonian \( \mathcal{H} \) for this model has been analyzed in [19] and can be written as

\[
\mathcal{H} = \frac{w}{2} (\sigma_z \otimes \mathbb{I} + \mathbb{I} \otimes \sigma_z) - \Delta (\sigma_x \otimes \sigma_x),
\]

where \( \sigma_{x,z} \) are usual Pauli matrices, \( w \) is energy difference between the ground and first excited states and furnishes the energy scale of this setup.\(^1\) We also have a quantity \( \Delta \) that measures the intensity of the gravitational interaction between the states with masses \( m \), and is given by

\[
\Delta = \frac{\alpha}{2} \left( \frac{1}{d} - \frac{1}{d'} \right),
\]

where \( \alpha = Gm^2 \), \( G \) is universal gravitational constant, besides that, \( d \) and \( d' \) are the relative distances between the two masses, as depicted in Fig.(1).

After the diagonalization of the Hamiltonian, we obtain the following eigenvalues

\[
\begin{align*}
\varepsilon_1 &= -\Delta, \\
\varepsilon_2 &= \Omega, \\
\varepsilon_3 &= -\Omega, \\
\varepsilon_4 &= \Delta,
\end{align*}
\]

where \( \Omega^2 = \Delta^2 + w^2 \). Their corresponding eigenstates are described in terms of the standard basis, respectively, by

\[
\begin{align*}
|\varphi_1\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|01\rangle + |10\rangle), \\
|\varphi_2\rangle &= \sin(\theta_+)|00\rangle + \cos(\theta_+)|11\rangle, \\
|\varphi_3\rangle &= \sin(\theta_-)|00\rangle + \cos(\theta_-)|11\rangle, \\
|\varphi_4\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (|01\rangle - |10\rangle),
\end{align*}
\]

where \( \theta_\pm = \arctan \left( \frac{\Delta \pm \Omega}{w} \right) \).

A. Thermal density operator

In order to study the thermal effects on the quantum correlations of our model, we consider the system in thermal bath, the system state in the thermal equilibrium is described by \( \rho(T) = \frac{\exp(-\beta \mathcal{H})}{Z} \), where \( \beta = \frac{1}{k_B T} \), with \( k_B \) being the Boltzmann’s constant, \( T \) is absolute temperature, and the partition function of the system is defined by \( Z = \text{Tr} [\exp (-\beta \mathcal{H})] \). The thermal state of this system can be described by the quantum density operator

\[
\rho = \begin{bmatrix}
\rho_{1,1} & 0 & 0 & \rho_{1,4} \\
0 & \rho_{2,2} & \rho_{2,3} & 0 \\
0 & \rho_{2,3} & \rho_{2,2} & 0 \\
\rho_{1,4} & 0 & 0 & \rho_{4,4}
\end{bmatrix},
\]

whose elements are expressed by

\(^1\) We assume \( \hbar = 1 \).
\[ \rho_{1,1} = \frac{1}{Z} \left( e^{-\beta \epsilon_2} \sin^2 \theta_- + e^{-\beta \epsilon_3} \sin^2 \theta_+ \right), \]
\[ \rho_{1,4} = \frac{1}{Z} \left( e^{-\beta \epsilon_2} \sin (2\theta_-) + e^{-\beta \epsilon_3} \sin (2\theta_+) \right), \]
\[ \rho_{2,2} = \frac{1}{Z} \left( \frac{e^{-\beta \epsilon_1} + e^{-\beta \epsilon_4}}{2} \right), \]
\[ \rho_{2,3} = \frac{1}{Z} \left( \frac{e^{-\beta \epsilon_1} - e^{-\beta \epsilon_4}}{2} \right), \]
\[ \rho_{4,4} = \frac{1}{Z} \left( e^{-\beta \epsilon_2} \cos^2 \theta_- + e^{-\beta \epsilon_3} \cos^2 \theta_+ \right), \]
where \( Z = \sum_i \exp(-\beta \xi_i). \) Since \( \rho(T) \) describes a thermal state, correlations of this system are called thermal quantum correlations.

### III. THERMAL QUANTUM CORRELATIONS

In this section, we discuss the thermal entanglement and quantum coherence for two-gravcats in contact with a thermal bath.

#### A. Thermal entanglement

To describe the thermal entanglement of the state \( \rho \), we use the concurrence defined by Wootters [42, 43], which is given by

\[ C = \max \{ \sqrt{\lambda_1} - \sqrt{\lambda_2} - \sqrt{\lambda_3} - \sqrt{\lambda_4}, 0 \}, \]

assuming \( \lambda_i \) are the eigenvalues in decreasing order of the matrix

\[ R = \rho (\sigma_y \otimes \sigma_y) \rho^* (\sigma_y \otimes \sigma_y), \]

where \( \rho^* \) denotes the complex conjugation of \( \rho \) and \( \sigma_y \) is a Pauli matrix.

In our model, the concurrence of the state can be obtained from Eq. (10), which results in

\[ C = 2 \max \{ |\rho_{2,3}| - \sqrt{\rho_{1,4} \rho_{3,4}}, |\rho_{1,4}| - |\rho_{2,2}|, 0 \}. \]

#### B. Quantum coherence

It is well known that quantum coherence is an important physical resource in different quantum information processing tasks. An intuitive and computable measure quantum coherence is the \( l_1 \)-norm of coherence [32]. This measure of quantifies coherence by using the minimal distance between the quantum state and the set of incoherent states. The \( l_1 \)-norm coherence of the quantum state

\[ \rho = \sum_{i,j} \rho_{i,j} |i\rangle \langle j| \] is the sum of the absolute values of all off-diagonal elements entries

\[ C_{l_1}(\rho) = \sum_{i \neq j} |\rho_{i,j}|. \]

Calculating the \( l_1 \)-norm for the two gravitational cat states is straightforward and results

\[ C_{l_1}(\rho) = 2|\rho_{2,3}| + 2|\rho_{1,4}|. \]

In the next section, we review and discuss the main results.

### IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

In what follows we focus on the thermal quantum correlations of two gravitational cat states with gravitational interaction between the states. In what follows, unless stated the opposite, we shall consider \( k_B = 1 \).

In Fig. (2) it is shown the concurrence \( C \) as a function of temperature \( T \) in the logarithmic scale, at a fixed value of \( \Delta = 0.01 \) and \( w = 0.1 \) (green curve), \( \Delta = 0.3 \) and \( w = 1.0 \) (red curve), \( \Delta = 1.2 \) and \( w = 2.0 \) (blue curve), \( \Delta = 3.0 \) and \( w = 3.0 \) (black curve). Initially, one can observe that when \( \Delta < w \), the concurrence is weak \( C \approx 0.1 \), (green curve), \( C \approx 0.28 \) (red curve) and \( C \approx 0.51 \) (blue curve). In addition, it can be observed that the concurrence decreases with the increasing of temperature \( T \). On the other hand, when we consider \( w = \Delta \), the entanglement is more robust at low temperatures \( C = \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2} \) (black curve). By analyzing the matrix
elements of the density operator, it is observed that the only single non-zero state vector in this case is given by \( |\varphi_3\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\sqrt{2}+\sqrt{2}}} (|100\rangle + (1+\sqrt{2})|11\rangle) \), at \( T = 0 \).

In Fig.(3), assuming \( \Delta > w \), we observe a significant increase in the concurrence. In fact, the concurrence reaches its maximum value when the Newton potential parameter \( \Delta \) significantly increases in comparison to the energy parameter \( w \). However, as the temperature rises, the concurrence decreases until it finally disappears.

The \( l_1 \)-norm of coherence \( C_{l_1} \) is an important quantity to study quantum coherence. In order to investigate the relation of entanglement and quantum coherence, here we consider the concurrence and \( l_1 \)-norm. In Fig.(4), we illustrate the concurrence \( C \) and \( C_{l_1} \) as a function of \( T \) in the logarithmic scale for \( \Delta < w \). In particular here we consider \( w = 1 \) and \( \Delta = \{0.05,0.1,0.2\} \). We note that for low temperatures there is an overlap between the \( l_1 \)-norm of coherence \( C_{l_1} \) (dashed curve) and the thermal entanglement (solid curve). This is due to the fact that the quantum coherence and the thermal entanglement have the same order of magnitude in the low temperature regime, i.e., the quantum coherence is composed solely of non-local correlations, which is consistent with the previous result [40]. As the temperature increases, thermal fluctuations generate an increasing of the quantum coherence, while the thermal entanglement decreases until it vanishes at a threshold temperature. On the other hand, it is clear from the figure (4), that when we increase the Newton potential \( \Delta \), the quantum correlations are more robust.

In Fig.(5) it is shown another plot of concurrence \( C \) and \( C_{l_1} \) norm of coherence as a function of the temperature \( T \) in the logarithmic scale. In this figure, we compare the thermal quantum correlations in three cases, namely \( \Delta = \{0.05,0.1,0.5\} \). For all cases, we consider \( \Delta = w \) as can be seen, the thermal quantum coherence for low temperatures is \( C = C_{l_1} = \frac{\sqrt{2}}{2} \). As the temperature increases, thermal fluctuations are introduced into the system, this should generate an increment in non-entangled quantum correlations, signaled by a growth in quantum coherence, which then shortly afterwards decreases monotonically as the temperature increases.

In Fig.(6), we compare the behavior of the concurrence and quantum coherence versus the temperature in the logarithmic scale for different values of the Newton potential \( \Delta \) and assuming a fixed value of the energy parameter \( w = 3.0 \), here we consider \( \Delta > w \). It is easy to see a significant increase in the thermal quantum correlations, the entanglement is \( C \approx 1 \) for \( \Delta > w \) \( (C = 1 \) when \( \Delta \gg w \) \) for low temperatures. The \( C_{l_1} \) norm of coherence shows a similar behavior.

In the following we will study the thermal quantum correlations for the parameters suggested in [13] and [44]. First, we analyze the thermal entanglement and quantum coherence, namely the \( C_{l_1} \) norm, with two mesoscopic test masses \( m_1 \approx m_2 \approx 10^{-12} \text{kg} \) separated by \( d = 1.0 \mu\text{m} \) (see [13]) and \( L = \frac{d}{2} \). In what follows, we shall recover the Boltzmann constant \( k_B \approx 1.4 \times 10^{-23} \text{J} \cdot \text{K}^{-1} \). In Fig.(7) we illustrate the thermal entanglement and quantum coherence as a function of the temperature in the logarithmic scale with \( \frac{w}{k_B} = 0.015 \) and \( \frac{\Delta}{k_B} = 0.5101 \times 10^{-6} \). From the figure, one can see that the concurrence (red curve) is significantly weak \( (C \approx 3.4 \times 10^{-5}) \) at \( T = 0 \). Then,
the thermal entanglement monotonically decreases with increasing temperature until it rapidly drops to the zero value at the threshold temperature $T_{th} \approx 0.0013658$. On the other hand, we can see in the figure that the quantum coherence (blue curve) is equal to the concurrence at the low temperature region, that is, the quantum coherence captures the total thermal entanglement. Soon afterwards, as the temperature increases, the thermal fluctuations generate an increased quantum coherence, while the thermal entanglement decreases until it vanishes at the threshold temperature. Finally, the quantum coherence monotonously fades out.

The second setup we consider was recently proposed by Krisnanda et al. [44]. Here we consider the masses $m_1 \approx m_2 \approx 10^{-7}$ kg separated by $d = 0.3$ mm and $L = d^{2}$. The configuration is schematically depicted in Fig. (8) with $\Delta/k_B = 17.0072$, $\Delta/k_B = 0.015$. Our results show that the curves for the concurrence $C$ and quantum coherence $C_l_1$ behave similarly to the Fig. (7), but the concurrence in this case is $C \approx 0.9999996$ at $T = 0$. While, with an increase of the temperature, suddenly the concurrence decreases until it disappears close to the threshold temperature at $T_{th} \approx 2.485053$ (see Fig. (8(a))).

To better understand the behavior of quantum coherence after the thermal entanglement begins to decrease, we have plotted the entanglement and quantum coherence vs temperature in Fig. (8(b)). We can see clearly from figure, that the $l_1$-norm slightly increases due to the thermal fluctuations, then decreases monotonically as soon as temperature $T$ increases.

V. CONCLUSIONS

In this article, we have studied the effect of temperature produced by a thermal bath in the entanglement and quantum coherence induced by the gravitational interaction of a system of two massive particles confined in
two distinct double-well potentials.

We verified the decay of these quantum correlations with the growth of the thermal bath’s temperature. For low temperatures, the quantum correlations described by the quantum coherence coincide with the entanglement, i.e., all quantum correlations are entangled in this regime, this is due to the form of the thermal density operator of our model and is consistent with results found in [40]. Following the decay of the concurrence, the \( l_1 \)-norm slightly grows due to thermal fluctuations. Which afterwards monotonically decays with the growth of the temperature.

We have also analyzed the thermal effects on these quantifiers for the parameters suggested in the setups of Marletto et. al [13] and Krisnanda et. al [44]. In the first setup, our results show that the concurrence and \( l_1 \)-norm of quantum coherence is particularly weak assuming such parameters, but non-null. Thus demonstrating the existence of thermal entanglement between massive particles mediated by the Newtonian interaction in a thermal bath model. In the second setup, the thermal concurrence and \( l_1 \)-norm of quantum coherence turn out robust against decoherence for low temperatures. This is due to fact that the latter case proposes states with masses that are 5 orders of magnitude larger than the former. It is also interesting to verify that entanglement reaches almost maximal values when \( \Delta > w \) at low temperatures, which was also observed in previous cases analysed in this paper.

This analysis can impact modern searches for traces of the quantum nature of the gravitational field using underground or tabletop experiments. Future explorations of this work could include further thermodynamic applications of this system.

Acknowledgments

This work was partially supported by CNPq, CAPES and FAPEMIG. M. Rojas would like to thank National Council for Scientific and Technological Development-CNPq grant 432878/2018-1. IPL would like to acknowledge the contribution of the COST Action CA18108 and National Council for Scientific and Technological Development - CNPq grant 306414/2020-1.

---


