# FRACTIONAL STOCHASTIC PARTIAL DIFFERENTIAL EQUATION FOR RANDOM TANGENT FIELDS ON THE SPHERE 

VO V. ANH, ANDRIY OLENKO, AND YU GUANG WANG


#### Abstract

This paper develops a fractional stochastic partial differential equation (SPDE) to model the evolution of a random tangent vector field on the unit sphere. The SPDE is governed by a fractional diffusion operator to model the Lévy-type behaviour of the spatial solution, a fractional derivative in time to depict the intermittency of its temporal solution, and is driven by vector-valued fractional Brownian motion on the unit sphere to characterize its temporal long-range dependence. The solution to the SPDE is presented in the form of the Karhunen-Loève expansion in terms of vector spherical harmonics. Its covariance matrix function is established as a tensor field on the unit sphere that is an expansion of Legendre tensor kernels. Approximations to the solutions are studied and convergence rates of the approximation errors are given. It is demonstrated how these convergence rates depend on the decay of the power spectrum and variances of the fractional Brownian motion.


## 1. Introduction

Stochastic partial differential equations (SPDE) on the unit sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ in $\mathbb{R}^{3}$ have many applications in geophysics and environmental modelling [14, 15, [18, 49, 50]. Various fractional versions of SPDEs have also been constructed in diverse applications (9) 10, 6, [12, 21, 23, 29, 30, 31, 35, 37. A distinct merit of these fractional models is that they can be used to maintain long-range dependence in the evolution of complex systems, such as models of climate change and density fluctuations in the primordial universe as inferred from the cosmic microwave background (CMB) [4, 16, 17, 18, 1, 2, 3. 3.

Vector fields defined on a spherical surface have also been extensively studied. Terrestrial processes such as wind fields, oceanic currents, the Earth's electric and magnetic fields are some of the most well-studied examples [11, 44, 51. Because the horizontal scale of the atmosphere and the oceans far exceeds their vertical scale, it is natural to decompose such vector fields into tangential and radial components and treat them separately. For example, in space weather, the Earth's electric and magnetic fields associated with ionospheric electric currents are distinct in the tangential and radial directions, and many of the ionospheric electrodynamic processes can be treated as tangent vector fields on a sphere [43. In meteorology, the wind flow at the Earth's surface level is another example of a tangent vector field defined on a sphere [41.

The theory of general vector temporal-spatial random fields on compact two-point homogeneous spaces (that include the sphere) was developed in [36], which also includes numerous references on the topic. However, the class of tangential random fields requires special attention as, except for the degenerated cases, it is not a subclass of stationary

[^0]vector fields. In the general case, it requires an application of the theory of random sections of vector and tensor bundles over $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. Therefore, this paper explores an approach that is different from [36] as outlined below.

Modeling and analysis of vector fields (not necessarily tangential to a sphere) is facilitated by the celebrated Helmholtz-Hodge decomposition that expresses the vector field as the sum of a curl-free component, a divergence-free component and a component that is the gradient of a harmonic function [25, 28, 32, 34]. The harmonic component vanishes when the domain is a spherical surface and the vector field is tangential to this surface. Scheuerer and Schlather [45] constructed random vector fields that are either curl-free or divergence-free; Schlather et al. 46] introduced a parametric cross-covariance model for these random vector fields. Fan et al. 24] constructed Gaussian tangential vector fields on the unit sphere that are either curl-free or divergence-free, then utilized the Helmholtz-Hodge decomposition to construct general Gaussian tangent vector fields, called Tangent Matérn Model, from a pair of correlated Gaussian scalar potential fields. For computations, a fast algorithm of vector spherical harmonic transforms for tangent vector fields on the two-dimensional sphere was developed in 32 and the tensor needlet approximation for spherical tangent vector fields and its fast transform algorithm were recently established in 34. The latter is an extension of its scalar case 33.

This paper will develop a fractional stochastic partial differential equation to model the evolution of tangent vector fields on the unit sphere. The model will take the following form:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})+\mathrm{d} \mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \quad t \geq 0, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2} . \tag{1.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Here, $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ is a $\mathbb{C}^{3}$-valued random tangent (vector) field on the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2} \subseteq \mathbb{R}^{3}$. The time derivative $\frac{\partial^{\beta} u}{\partial t^{\beta}}$ of order $\beta \in(0,1]$ is defined as

$$
\frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} u(t, x)= \begin{cases}\frac{\partial}{\partial t} u(t, x), & \text { if } \beta=1 \\ \left(\mathcal{D}_{t}^{\beta} u\right)(t, x), & \text { if } \beta \in(0,1)\end{cases}
$$

where

$$
\left(\mathcal{D}_{t}^{\beta} u\right)(t, x)=\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)}\left[\frac{\partial}{\partial t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-\tau)^{-\beta} u(\tau, x) d \tau-\frac{u(0, x)}{t^{\beta}}\right], \quad 0<t \leq T
$$

is the regularized fractional derivative or fractional derivative in the Caputo-Djrbashian sense (see Appendix A of [5]). The operator $\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)$ is the fractional diffusion operator which, for $\alpha \in(0,2]$ and $\alpha+\gamma \in[0,2]$, is the function $\psi(s)=s^{\alpha / 2}(1+s)^{\gamma / 2}$ of the Laplace-Beltrami operator $\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. It is an operator in a $C_{0}$-semigroup on the $L_{2^{-}}$ space of spherical tangent fields with respect to the Lévy measure associated with the function $\psi$ (to be defined in detail in Subsection 4.1). The driving noise $\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ is a tangential fractional Brownian motion on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$, that is defined in terms of the vector spherical harmonics $\left\{\left(\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}, \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right): \ell \geq 1, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell\right\}$ as

$$
\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x}):=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(B_{\ell m}^{1}(t) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+B_{\ell m}^{2}(t) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right), t \geq 0, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}
$$

where $B_{\ell m}^{1}(s)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(s), s \geq 0$, are independent fractional Brownian motions on $\mathbb{R}_{+}$ with Hurst index $H \in[1 / 2,1)$.

Using the expansion

$$
\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\hat{\mathbf{X}}_{\ell m}(t) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\tilde{\mathbf{X}}_{\ell m}(t) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right)
$$

of $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in terms of the vector spherical harmonics $\left\{\left(\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}, \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right): \ell \geq 1, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell\right\}$ (detailed in Section 2), the fractional differential operator and the fractional Brownian motion in Eq. (1.1) can be properly defined.

The solution to the equation (1.1) is then given as an expansion in terms of vector spherical harmonics:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
&\left.+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

where

$$
\begin{equation*}
E_{a, b}(z):=\sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{z^{k}}{\Gamma(a k+b)}, \quad z \in \mathbb{C}, a, b>0 \tag{1.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

is the generalized Mittag-Leffler function with index $a$ and $b$.
Then, the solution to (1.1) under the initial condition $\mathbf{X}(0, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{u}\left(t_{0}, \boldsymbol{x}\right)$ will be consider. Here $\mathbf{u}\left(t_{0}, \boldsymbol{x}\right)$ is the solution at $t=t_{0}$ of the following fractional stochastic Cauchy problem:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} \mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \quad t \geq 0, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2} \tag{1.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is solved under the initial condition $\mathbf{u}(0, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ for a random tangent field $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ on the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$.

Eqs. (1.1) and (1.3) can be used to describe the evolution of two-stage stochastic systems. Eq. (1.3) determines the evolution on the time interval [ $0, t_{0}$ ] while Eq. (1.1) represents the solution for a system perturbed by fractional Brownian motion on the interval $\left[t_{0}, t_{0}+t\right]$. CMB is an example of such systems, as it passed through different formation epochs, inflation, recombinatinon, etc. [20].

Some background materials on vector spherical harmonics, random tangent fields and vector-valued fractional Brownian motion are presented in Sections 2 and 3 to prepare for the formulation of the fractional SPDE model for random tangent fields in Section 4 , Under the initial condition $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{u}\left(t_{0}, \boldsymbol{x}\right)$, the solution of (1.1) is given by

$$
\begin{align*}
\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x}) & =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\left(\widehat{\left(\widehat{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell m} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1}}\right.\right. \\
& \left.\times E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s)\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\left(\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right. \\
& \left.\left.+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right\} \tag{1.4}
\end{align*}
$$

where $\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}$ and $\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}$ are the Fourier coefficients of $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ in terms of the vector spherical harmonics $\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}$ and $\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}$ respectively. The covariance matrix function of (1.4) is then established as a tensor field on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ that is an expansion of Legendre tensor kernels. Approximations to the solutions and their convergence rates are investigated. It is demonstrated how these convergence rates depend on the decay of the power spectrum and variances of the fractional Brownian motion. Section 5 derives an upper bound in
the $L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$-norm of the temporal increments of the solution to Equation (1.1). The result shows the interplay between the exponent $\beta$ of the fractional derivative in time and the Hurst parameter $H$ of the fractional Brownian motion driving the equation.

The symbol $C$ will denote constants which are not important for our exposition. The same symbol may be used for different constants appearing in the same proof.

## 2. Vector Spherical Harmonics

Let $\mathbb{C}^{3}$ be the 3-dimensional complex coordinate space. In this paper, the vectors in $\mathbb{C}^{3}$ are column vectors. For $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{C}^{3}$, the transpose of $\boldsymbol{x}$ is the row vector $\boldsymbol{x}^{T}$. The inner product of two vectors $\boldsymbol{x}=\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\right)^{T}$ and $\boldsymbol{y}=\left(y_{1}, y_{2}, y_{3}\right)^{T}$ in $\mathbb{C}^{3}$ is $\boldsymbol{x} \cdot \boldsymbol{y}:=\boldsymbol{x}^{T} \overline{\boldsymbol{y}}:=$ $\sum_{j=1}^{3} x_{j} \overline{y_{j}}$. The Euclidean norm of $\boldsymbol{x}$ is $|\boldsymbol{x}|=\sqrt{\boldsymbol{x} \cdot \boldsymbol{x}}$. The tensor product of two vectors $\boldsymbol{x}$ and $\boldsymbol{y}$ in $\mathbb{C}^{3}$ is a matrix product of $\boldsymbol{x}$ with the conjugate transpose of $\boldsymbol{y}: \boldsymbol{x} \otimes \boldsymbol{y}=\boldsymbol{x} \overline{\boldsymbol{y}}^{T}$.
2.1. Function Spaces and Vector Spherical Harmonics. Let $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ be the unit sphere of the 3-dimensional real coordinate space $\mathbb{R}^{3}$. Let $L_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right):=L_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}, \omega\right)$ be the $L_{2}$-space of complex-valued functions on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ with the inner product $\langle f, g\rangle_{L_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}=\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} f(\boldsymbol{x}) \overline{g(\boldsymbol{x})} \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x})$ for all $f, g \in L_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$, where $\omega$ is the Riemann surface measure on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. A $\mathbb{C}^{3}$-valued function on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is called a vector field on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. For a vector field $\boldsymbol{f}$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ the fields

$$
\boldsymbol{f}_{\mathrm{nor}}(\boldsymbol{x}):=(\boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x}) \cdot \boldsymbol{x}) \boldsymbol{x}, \quad \boldsymbol{f}_{\mathrm{tan}}(\boldsymbol{x}):=\boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x})-\boldsymbol{f}_{\mathrm{nor}}(\boldsymbol{x}), \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}
$$

are defined to be the normal vector field and tangent vector field of $\boldsymbol{f}$ respectively.
Let $\widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ be the $L_{2}$-space of $\mathbb{C}^{3}$-valued functions on the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ with the inner product

$$
\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle_{\widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} \boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x}) \cdot \boldsymbol{g}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x}), \quad \boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g} \in \widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)
$$

and the induced $L_{2}$-norm $\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\sqrt{\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{f}\rangle_{\widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}}$. The $L_{2}$-space of tangent fields on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is defined as $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right):=\left\{\boldsymbol{f} \in \widetilde{\mathbf{L}}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right): \boldsymbol{f}=\boldsymbol{f}_{\text {tan }}\right\}$ with the (induced) inner product

$$
\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle:=\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} \boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x}) \cdot \boldsymbol{g}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x}), \quad \boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)
$$

and $L_{2}$-norm $\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\sqrt{\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{f}\rangle}$.
This paper will focus on tangent vector fields and their temporal evolution. For a tangent vector field $\boldsymbol{f}=\left(f_{1}, f_{2}, f_{3}\right)^{T} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$, the integral $\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} \boldsymbol{f}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x})$ of $\boldsymbol{f}$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is the vector

$$
\left(\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} f_{1}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x}), \int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} f_{2}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x}), \int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} f_{3}(\boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x})\right)^{T} .
$$

A $\mathbb{C}^{3 \times 3}$-valued tensor field $\mathbf{u}$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is a $\mathbb{C}^{3 \times 3}$-valued function on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. The tensor field $\boldsymbol{u}$ can be written as $\mathbf{u}=\left(\boldsymbol{u}_{1}, \boldsymbol{u}_{2}, \boldsymbol{u}_{3}\right)$, where each $\boldsymbol{u}_{i}, i=1,2,3$, is a vector field on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$.

Let $\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}$ be the Laplace-Beltrami operator on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. Let $Y_{\ell, m}, \ell \in \mathbb{N}_{0}, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell$, be an orthonormal basis of complex-valued spherical harmonics of $L_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$. The functions $Y_{\ell, m}, \ell \in \mathbb{N}_{0}, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell$, are eigenfunctions of $\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}$ with eignvalues $\lambda_{\ell}:=\ell(\ell+1)$ satisfying

$$
\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} Y_{\ell, m}=-\lambda_{\ell} Y_{\ell, m} .
$$

Let $\nabla$. be the gradient on $\mathbb{R}^{3}$. The surface-gradient on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is $\nabla_{*}:=\left(\nabla_{*}\right)$. $:=P . \nabla$. with the matrix $P_{\boldsymbol{x}}:=I-\boldsymbol{x} \otimes \boldsymbol{x}$, where $I$ is the $3 \times 3$ identity matrix and $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$. The surface-curl on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is $\mathbf{L}:=\mathbf{L} .:=Q . \nabla$. with the matrix

$$
Q_{\boldsymbol{x}}:=\left(\begin{array}{ccc}
0 & -x_{3} & x_{2} \\
x_{3} & 0 & -x_{1} \\
-x_{2} & x_{1} & 0
\end{array}\right) .
$$

Then, it holds that $\nabla_{*} \cdot \nabla_{*}=\mathbf{L} \cdot \mathbf{L}=\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}$ (see, e.g., [25, Chapter 2]).
For degree $\ell \geq 1$, the divergence-free vector spherical harmonic is

$$
\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}=\mathbf{L} Y_{\ell, m} / \sqrt{\lambda_{\ell}}
$$

and the curl-free vector spherical harmonic is

$$
\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}=\nabla_{*} Y_{\ell, m} / \sqrt{\lambda_{\ell}}
$$

The set $\left\{\left(\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}, \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right): \ell \geq 1, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell\right\}$ forms an orthonomal basis of $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ (see, e.g., [26] and also [25, Chapter 5]). Let $\widehat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m}:=\left\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}\right\rangle$ and $\widetilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m}:=\left\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right\rangle$ be the divergence-free and curl-free Fourier coefficients of $f \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$. For $f \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$, the representation

$$
\boldsymbol{f}=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\hat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}+\tilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right)
$$

holds in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ sence, and the following Parseval identity is satisfied

$$
\begin{equation*}
\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2}=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\left|\widehat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m}\right|^{2}+\left|\widetilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m}\right|^{2}\right) \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

For $\ell \geq 0$, let $P_{\ell}(t), t \in[-1,1]$, be the Legendre polynomial of degree $\ell$. The divergencefree and curl-free Legendre (rank-2) tensor kernels of degree $\ell$ are
$\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})=\frac{2 \ell+1}{4 \pi \lambda_{\ell}} \mathbf{L}_{\boldsymbol{x}} \otimes \mathbf{L}_{\boldsymbol{y}} P_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x} \cdot \boldsymbol{y}), \quad \mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})=\frac{2 \ell+1}{4 \pi \lambda_{\ell}}\left(\nabla_{*}\right)_{\boldsymbol{x}} \otimes\left(\nabla_{*}\right)_{\boldsymbol{y}} P_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x} \cdot \boldsymbol{y}), \quad \boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$, see [25, Chapter 5].

The following addition theorem holds for vector spherical harmonics and Legendre tensor kernels (see [25, Theorem 5.31]). For $\ell \geq 1$ and $\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})=\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y}), \quad \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})=\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y}) \tag{2.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

## 3. Random Tangent Fields and Fractional Brownian Motion

Let $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathrm{P})$ be a probability space, where $\mathcal{F}$ is the Borel algebra on $\Omega$ with probability measure P. Let $\mathscr{B}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ be the Borel algebra on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. An $\mathcal{F} \otimes \mathscr{B}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$-measurable function $T: \Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2} \rightarrow \mathbb{C}$ is called a complex-valued random field on the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. For a random variable $X$ on $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathrm{P})$, let $\mathbb{E}[X]$ be the expectation of $X$. For $\mathbb{C}^{3}$-valued random vectors $\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{Y}$ on $\Omega$, the expectation $\mathbb{E}[\mathbf{X}]$ is a vector of expectations of components of $\mathbf{X}$, and the covariance matrix of $\mathbf{X}$ and $\mathbf{Y}$ is $\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{Y}]=\mathbb{E}[(\mathbf{X}-\mathbb{E}[\mathbf{X}]) \otimes(\mathbf{Y}-\mathbb{E}[\mathbf{Y}])]$. The variance matrix of $\mathbf{X}$ is $\operatorname{Var}[\mathbf{X}]=\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{X}]$. Let $L_{2}(\Omega):=L_{2}(\Omega, \mathrm{P})$ be the complexvalued $L_{2}$-space on $\Omega$ with respect to the probability measure P , endowed with the norm $\|\cdot\|_{L_{2}(\Omega)}$. Let $L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right):=L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}, \mathrm{P} \otimes \omega\right)$ be the complex-valued $L_{2}$-space on the product space of $\Omega$ and $\mathbb{S}^{2}$, where $\mathrm{P} \otimes \omega$ is the corresponding product measure. If it does not cause confusion, the notation $\otimes$ will be also used as the tensor of two vectors.
3.1. Random Tangent Fields. $\mathbf{Z}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x}), \xi \in \Omega, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$, is called a complex-valued random tangent (vector) field on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ if the components of $\mathbf{Z}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})$ are complex-valued random fields on the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ and $\mathbf{Z}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{Z}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})_{\tan }$. We will denote $\mathbf{Z}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})$ by $\mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x})$, or $\mathbf{Z}$ for brevity if no confusion arises. For a random tangent field $\mathbf{Z}$, its covariance matrix function is $\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{y})]$. Its variance matrix function is $\operatorname{Var}[\mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x})]:=\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x})]$. A random tangent field $\mathbf{Z}$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ is Gaussian if the random vector $\mathbf{Z}(\boldsymbol{x})$ follows a 3 -variate normal distribution for each $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$.

Let $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right):=\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}, \mathrm{P} \otimes \omega\right)$ be the $L_{2}$-space of random tangent fields with the product measure $\mathrm{P} \otimes \omega$, endowed with inner product

$$
\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\int_{\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}} \boldsymbol{f}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x}) \cdot \boldsymbol{g}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x}) \mathrm{dP} \otimes \omega(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})
$$

and induced $L_{2}$-norm $\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}:=\sqrt{\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{f}\rangle_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}}$ for $\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$.
By Fubini's theorem,

$$
\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}=\mathbb{E}\left[\int_{\mathbb{S}^{2}} \boldsymbol{f}(\cdot, \boldsymbol{x}) \overline{\boldsymbol{g}(\cdot, \boldsymbol{x})}^{T} \mathrm{~d} \omega(\boldsymbol{x})\right]=\mathbb{E}\left[\langle\boldsymbol{f}, \boldsymbol{g}\rangle_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}\right] .
$$

In particular,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2}=\mathbb{E}\left[\|\boldsymbol{f}\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2}\right] \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

which implies $\boldsymbol{f}(\xi, \cdot) \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right) \mathrm{P}$-a.s..
3.2. Vector-valued Fractional Brownian Motion. Let $H \in[1 / 2,1)$ and $\sigma>0$. A real-valued fractional Brownian motion $\widetilde{B}^{H}(t), t \geq 0$, with the Hurst index $H$ and variance $\sigma$ at $t=1$ is a (real-valued) centred Gaussian process satisfying

$$
\widetilde{B}^{H}(0)=0, \quad \mathbb{E}\left[\left|\widetilde{B}^{H}(t)-\widetilde{B}^{H}(s)\right|^{2}\right]=|t-s|^{2 H} \sigma^{2}
$$

see, for example, 13 .
A complex-valued Brownian motion $B^{H}(t), t \geq 0$ with the Hurst index $H$ and variance $\sigma$ at $t=1$ is given by

$$
B^{H}(t)=\widetilde{B}^{1}(t)+\mathrm{i} \widetilde{B}^{2}(t)
$$

where $\widetilde{B}^{1}(t)$ and $\widetilde{B}^{2}(t)$ are two independent real-valued fractional Brownian motions with the Hurst index $H$ and variance $\sigma$ at $t=1$.

For $H \in[1 / 2,1)$, let $B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)$ be independent centred complex-valued fractional Brownian motions with the Hurst index $H$ and variances $A_{\ell}^{1}$ and $A_{\ell}^{2}$ at $t=1$ satisfying

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{\ell=0}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{1}<\infty \quad \text { and } \quad \sum_{\ell=0}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{2}<\infty \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

respectively. Following [27, Definition 2.1] and also [4], we define an $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$-valued fractional Brownian motion $\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ as an expansion with respect to vector spherical harmonics with $B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)$ as coefficients, i.e.,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x}):=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(B_{\ell m}^{1}(t) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+B_{\ell m}^{2}(t) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right), t \geq 0, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2} \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

For a measurable function $g$ on $\mathbb{R}_{+}$, the stochastic integral of $g$ with respect to a complex-valued fractional Brownian motion $B^{H}(t)$ is

$$
\int_{0}^{t} g(s) \mathrm{d} B^{H}(s):=\int_{0}^{t} g(s) \mathrm{d} \widetilde{B}^{1}(s)+\mathrm{i} \int_{0}^{t} g(s) \mathrm{d} \widetilde{B}^{2}(s)
$$

where each integral $\int_{0}^{t} g(s) \mathrm{d} \widetilde{B}^{i}(s), i=1,2$, is defined as a Riemann-Stietjes integral.

## 4. Fractional Stochastic Partial Differential Equations for Tangent Fields

This section presents the solution to Eq. (1.1) given as an expansion with respect to vector spherical harmonics. Before solving the equation, a proper definition of the fractional diffusion operator $\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)$ is presented.
4.1. Fractional Diffusion Operator for Random Tangent Fields. The fractional diffusion operator for vector fields is defined as an operator in a $C_{0}$-semigroup on the $L_{2^{-}}$ space of spherical tangent fields $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ as follows. By [7, Section 4.1], for $\alpha+\gamma \in(0,2]$, there exists a Lévy measure $\nu(\mathrm{d} t)$ on $[0, \infty)$ such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\psi(z)=\int_{0}^{\infty}\left(1-e^{-t z}\right) \nu(\mathrm{d} t) \tag{4.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

For $t \geq 0$, we define the operator

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{P}_{t} \boldsymbol{f}:=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\hat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}+\widetilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right) e^{-t \lambda_{\ell}}, \quad \boldsymbol{f} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right) \tag{4.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then $\left\{\mathrm{P}_{t}\right\}_{t \geq 0}$ forms a $C_{0}$-semigroup for the $L_{2}$ space of spherical tangent fields $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$. We define the operator $\mathrm{D}^{\psi}$ using the semigroup $\left\{\mathrm{P}_{t}\right\}_{t \geq 0}$ and Lévy measure $\nu(\mathrm{d} t)$ associated with $\psi$ by

$$
\mathrm{D}^{\psi} \boldsymbol{f}:=\int_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathrm{P}_{t} \boldsymbol{f}-\boldsymbol{f}\right) \nu(\mathrm{d} t), \quad \boldsymbol{f} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right)
$$

By the orthonormality of $\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}$ and $\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}$ and (4.1) and (4.2), for $\ell \geq 1$ and $m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell$,

$$
\mathrm{D}^{\psi} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}=\int_{0}^{\infty} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}\left(e^{-t \lambda_{\ell}}-1\right) \nu(\mathrm{d} t)=-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}
$$

and similarly,

$$
\mathrm{D}^{\psi} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}=-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m} .
$$

We can thus write

$$
\begin{equation*}
\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \boldsymbol{f}:=-\mathrm{D}^{\psi} \boldsymbol{f}:=-\int_{0}^{\infty}\left(\mathrm{P}_{t} \boldsymbol{f}-\boldsymbol{f}\right) \nu(\mathrm{d} t), \quad \boldsymbol{f} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right) \tag{4.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

and call $\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)$ fractional diffusion operator for tangent vector fields on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$. For $\mathbf{Z} \in$ $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right), \mathbf{Z}(\xi, \cdot) \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\mathbb{S}^{2}\right) \mathrm{P}$-a.s., then, one can define $\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{Z}$ for a random tangent field $\mathbf{Z} \in \mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ by $\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{Z}(\xi, \cdot)$ as given by (4.3) for $\xi \in \Omega$.

Remark 4.1. The expansion of the operator $D^{\psi} \boldsymbol{f}(\mathbf{x})$ in terms of the vector spherical harmonics $\left.\left\{\mathbf{y}_{l, m}, \mathbf{z}_{l, m}\right): \ell \geq 1, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell\right\}$ involves the Laplace exponent of a Lévy subordinator in its coefficients. In fact, from the Lévy measure $\nu(d t)$ defined by the equation

$$
z^{\alpha / 2}(1+z)^{\gamma / 2}=\int_{0}^{\infty}\left(1-e^{-t z}\right) \nu(d t)
$$

we define a Lévy subordinator (i.e. a non-decreasing Lévy process) $Z(t)$ with characteristic function

$$
\mathrm{E} e^{i \xi Z(t)}=e^{-t \int_{0}^{\infty}\left(e^{i \xi \lambda}-1\right) \nu(d \lambda)}
$$

The Laplace transform of the distribution of this subordinator then can be written as

$$
\mathrm{E} e^{-t \Psi(\xi)}=e^{-t \int_{0}^{\infty}\left(1-e^{-\xi \lambda}\right) \nu(d \lambda)},
$$

where $\Psi(\xi)$ is known as the Laplace exponent or the symbol of the subordinator. As defined above,

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathrm{D}^{\psi} \boldsymbol{f}(\mathbf{x}) & =\int_{0}^{\infty}\left(P_{t} \boldsymbol{f}(\mathbf{x})-P_{0} \boldsymbol{f}(\mathbf{x})\right) \nu(d t) \\
& =\sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^{l}\left(\widehat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{y}_{l, m}(\mathbf{x})+\widetilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{z}_{l, m}(\mathbf{x})\right) \int_{0}^{\infty}\left(e^{-t \lambda_{l}}-1\right) \nu(d t) \\
& =-\sum_{l=0}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-l}^{l}\left(\widehat{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{y}_{l, m}(\mathbf{x})+\widetilde{\boldsymbol{f}}_{\ell m} \mathbf{z}_{l, m}(\mathbf{x})\right) \Psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

This result indicates that fractional diffusion operators can also be generated by using symbols of Lévy subordinators.

Remark 4.2. Of the same form as $-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)$, the operator $-(-\Delta)^{\alpha / 2}(I-\Delta)^{\gamma / 2}$ on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ was investigated in [10. The fractional diffusion operator $-(-\Delta)^{\alpha / 2}(I-\Delta)^{\gamma / 2}$, which is the inverse of the composition of the Riesz potential $(-\Delta)^{-\alpha / 2}, \alpha \in(0,2]$, defined by the kernel

$$
J_{\alpha}(x)=\frac{\Gamma(n / 2-\alpha)}{\pi^{n / 2} 4^{\alpha} \Gamma(\alpha)}|x|^{2 \alpha-n}, \quad x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}
$$

and the Bessel potential $(I-\Delta)^{-\gamma / 2}, \gamma \geq 0$, defined by the kernel (see 48)

$$
I_{\gamma}(x)=\left[(4 \pi)^{\gamma} \Gamma(\gamma)\right]^{-1} \int_{0}^{\infty} e^{-\pi|x|^{2} / s} e^{-s / 4 \pi} s^{(-n / 2+\gamma)} \frac{d s}{s}, \quad x \in \mathbb{R}^{n}
$$

is the infinitesimal generator of a strongly continuous bounded holomorphic semigroup of angle $\pi / 2$ on $L^{p}\left(\mathbb{R}^{n}\right)$ for $\alpha>0, \alpha+\gamma \geq 0$ and any $p \geq 1$ ([10]). This semigroup defines the Riesz-Bessel distribution (and the resulting Riesz-Bessel motion) if and only if $\alpha \in(0,2], \alpha+\gamma \in[0,2]$. When $\gamma=0$, the fractional Laplacian $-(-\Delta)^{\alpha / 2}, \alpha \in(0,2]$, generates the Lévy $\alpha$-stable distribution. While the exponent of the inverse of the Riesz potential indicates how often large jumps occur, it is the combined effect of the inverses of the Riesz and Bessel potentials that describes various non-Gaussian behaviours of the process [10, 9]. For example, depending on the sum $\alpha+\gamma$ of the exponents of the inverses of the Riesz and Bessel potentials, the Riesz-Bessel motion will be either a compound Poisson process, a pure jump process with jumping times dense in $[0, \infty)$ or the sum of a compound Poisson process and an independent Brownian motion.
4.2. Fractional SPDE and Solution. Using the fractional diffusion operator and vector-valued fractional Brownian motion as defined above, the fractional stochastic equation (1.1) is well-defined. The solution of (1.1), as shown by the following theorem, can be written as an expansion in terms of vector spherical harmonics.

Theorem 4.3. Let $\alpha \in(0,2], \alpha+\gamma \in[0,2], \beta \in(0,1]$ and $H \in[1 / 2,1)$. Let Eq. (1.1) be defined with the fractional diffusion operator (4.3), fractional Brownian motion (3.3), Hurst index $H$ and variances $A_{\ell}^{1}$ and and $A_{\ell}^{2}$ at $t=1$ satisfying

$$
\sum_{\ell \geq 1}(2 \ell+1)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau} A_{\ell}^{1}<\infty \quad \text { and } \quad \sum_{\ell \geq 1}(2 \ell+1)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau} A_{\ell}^{2}<\infty
$$

respectively for $\tau:=\max \left\{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H), 0\right\}$. Then, the solution to (1.1) is given by

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
& \left.\quad+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \tag{4.4}
\end{align*}
$$

where the above expansion is convergent in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$.
Proof. Let $\delta(t)$ be the Dirac delta function and $\lambda \in \mathbb{R}$. By [42, Chapter 5], for $\beta \in(0,1]$, the solution to the fractional equation

$$
\frac{\mathrm{d}^{\beta} f(t)}{\mathrm{d} t^{\beta}}+\lambda f(t)=\delta(t)
$$

is

$$
\begin{equation*}
G_{\lambda}(t)=t^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-\lambda t^{\beta}\right), \quad t \geq 0 \tag{4.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $E_{\beta, \beta}(\cdot)$ is the generalized Mittag-Leffler function given by (1.2). Using this result and taking the fractional-in-time derivatives of both sides of Eq. (4.4) one obtains

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})= \frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\int_{0}^{t} G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
&\left.+\int_{0}^{t} G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
&= \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)+\delta(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
&\left.+\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)+\delta(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
&=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s)+\mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
&\left.+\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s)+\mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

where the last equality uses the the property of convolution of the Dirac delta function. On the other hand, the right-hand side of (1.1) is

$$
\begin{aligned}
&-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})+ \mathrm{d} \mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x}) \\
&=-\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}( \int_{0}^{t} G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \\
&\left.\quad+\int_{0}^{t} G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right)+\mathrm{d} \mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x}) \\
&=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s)+\mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
&\left.+\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) G_{\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)}(t-s)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s)+\mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

where the last equality uses the expansion of $\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (3.3). Thus, the random field defined by (4.4) satisfies Eq. (1.1).

We now prove that the expansion (4.4) converges in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$. By (3.1) and (2.1) and [39, Theorem 1.1], there exist constants $C_{H}^{1}$ and $C_{H}^{2}$ such that

$$
\begin{aligned}
\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2}= & \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right|^{2}\right]\right. \\
& \left.+\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right|^{2}\right]\right\}^{2} \\
\leq & \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{C_{H}^{1} A_{\ell}^{1}\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left|(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} s\right)^{2 H}\right. \\
& \left.+C_{H}^{2} A_{\ell}^{2}\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left|(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} s\right)^{2 H}\right\}^{2 H} \\
= & \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{C_{H}^{1} A_{\ell}^{1}\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left|s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} s\right)^{2 H}\right. \\
& \left.+C_{H}^{2} A_{\ell}^{2}\left(\int_{0}^{t}\left|s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} s\right)^{2 H}\right\} \\
= & C_{H}^{1} \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{1}\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}\left(\int_{0}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}\left|u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H} \\
& +C_{H}^{2} \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{2}\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}\left(\int_{0}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}\left|u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H} \\
\leq & C_{H}^{1} \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{1}\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}\left(\int_{0}^{\infty}\left|G_{1}(u)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H} \\
& +C_{H}^{2} \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1) A_{\ell}^{2}\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}\left(\int_{0}^{\infty}\left|G_{1}(u)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H}<\infty
\end{aligned}
$$

where the last inequality uses the property that for $H \in[1 / 2,1)$ the function $G_{1}(t)$ defined by (4.5) is in $L_{1 / H}\left(\mathbb{R}_{+}\right)$(see [19, Theorem 1.3-3]). This means that the expansion in (4.4) converges in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ and $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ defined by (4.4) is the solution to the vector-valued fractional SPDE (1.1), which completes the proof.

Let us consider the approximation $\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ of truncation degree $L \in \mathbb{N}$ to the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (4.4) defined by

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} & \left(\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
& \left.+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right), \quad t>0
\end{aligned}
$$

The following result gives the convergence rate of the approximation $\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ to the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$. It demonstrates how the convergence rate is determined by the magnitudes of variances $A_{\ell}^{1}$ and and $A_{\ell}^{2}$. We also give its asymptotic for an important specific scenario of the algebraic decay.
Corollary 4.4. Let the conditions of Theorem 4.3 be satisfied and $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ be the solution to the equation (1.1). Then,
(i) For $t>0$, the truncation error is bounded by

$$
\left\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C\left(\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(A_{\ell}^{1}+A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau}\right)^{1 / 2}
$$

(ii) For the magnitudes of variances that decay algebraically with order $\nu>2$, that is, there exist constants $C>0$ and $\ell_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $\left(A_{\ell}^{1}+A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau} \leq C \cdot \ell^{-\nu}$ for all $\ell \geq \ell_{0}$, it holds

$$
\left\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C L^{-\frac{\nu-2}{2}}
$$

(iii) The estimates in (i) and (ii) are also valid uniformly over $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$ for the root mean squared truncation error

$$
\begin{aligned}
\boldsymbol{\operatorname { R M S E }}\left(\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right) & =\operatorname{Var}^{1 / 2}\left(\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
& =\left\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{L_{2}(\Omega)}
\end{aligned}
$$

(iv) Under conditions of the algebraic decay in (ii), for any $\varepsilon>0$ it holds

$$
\mathbf{P}\left(\left|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right| \geq \varepsilon\right) \leq \frac{C}{L^{\nu-2} \varepsilon^{2}}
$$

Proof. Noting that

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x}) & =\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right. \\
& \left.+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right), \quad t>0
\end{aligned}
$$

the proof of statement (i) is analogous to the derivations (4.6) in the proof of Theorem4.3 with

$$
C=\max \left(\sqrt{C_{H}^{1}}, \sqrt{C_{H}^{2}}\right)\left(\int_{0}^{\infty}\left|G_{1}(u)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{H}<\infty
$$

The statement (ii) follows from (i) and the estimate

$$
\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(A_{\ell}^{1}+A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau} \leq C \sum_{l=L+1}^{\infty} l^{-(\nu-1)} \leq C L^{-(\nu-2)}
$$

Note that the proofs of (4.6) in Theorem 4.3 and statements (i) and (ii) of this Corollary do not depend on $\boldsymbol{x}$. Therefore, they also uniformly hold in the $L_{2}(\Omega)$-norm over the sphere $\mathbb{S}^{2}$.

Applying the estimate in (ii) and Chebyshev's inequality, one gets the upper bound in (iv).

In the following, to introduce the initial conditions for the stochastic Cauchy problem (1.3) we will use a centred random tangent field $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$. Note that, in the classical scalar and vector cases initial conditions are usually given by stationary random fields. However, the class of stationary tangent random fields is degenerate and consists of almost sure constant fields. To provide more comprehensive initial conditions one needs
a non-degenerate equivalent of the stationarity concept for tangent random fields. We introduce it via properties of the Fourier coefficients of $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$, which coincides with corresponding properties of spectral coefficients of scalar and vector stationary fields.

Namely, let us consider a series representation of $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ in terms of the vector spherical harmonics $\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}$ and $\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}$. The Fourier coefficients of $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ in this representation will be


$$
\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}=\left\langle\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}\right\rangle \quad \text { and } \quad \widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}=\left\langle\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}\right\rangle
$$

We assume that these coefficients are uncorrelated, i.e. for $\ell, \ell^{\prime} \geq 1, m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell$, $m^{\prime}=-\ell^{\prime}, \ldots, \ell^{\prime}$ it holds that

$$
\begin{gather*}
\mathbb{E}\left[\left(\widehat{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell m}\left({\left.\widetilde{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}}\right]=0\right.  \tag{4.7}\\
\mathbb{E}\left[\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \widehat{\left(\widehat{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}}\right]=\delta_{\ell \ell^{\prime}} \delta_{m m^{\prime}} \widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2} \quad \text { and } \quad \mathbb{E}\left[\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}}\right]=\delta_{\ell \ell^{\prime}} \delta_{m m^{\prime}} \widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2} \tag{4.8}
\end{gather*}
$$

where $\delta_{\ell \ell^{\prime}}$ is the Kronecker delta function.
The coefficients $\left\{\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}: \ell \geq 1\right\}$ and $\left\{\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}: \ell \geq 1\right\}$ are divergence-free and curl-free power spectra of $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ satisfying

$$
\sum_{\ell \geq 1}(2 \ell+1) \widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}<\infty \quad \text { and } \quad \sum_{\ell \geq 1}(2 \ell+1) \widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}<\infty
$$

respectively.
Theorem 4.5. Let $\beta \in(0,1]$ and $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})$ be a random tangent field in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$ satisfying (4.7) and (4.8). Then, for $t \geq 0$ and $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$ the solution of the fractional stochastic Cauchy problem (1.3) with the initial condition $\mathbf{u}(0, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ is given in terms of vector spherical harmonics as

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \tag{4.9}
\end{equation*}
$$

which is convergent in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$.
Remark 4.6. Theorem 4.5 is an extension of [22, Theorem 1] to the vector case of fractional stochastic Cauchy problem on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$.

Remark 4.7. An equation of the form (1.3) on $\mathbb{R}^{n}$ was investigated in (5]. Eq. (1.1) is an (infinite-dimensional) spatiotemporal version of the 2-term fractional differential equation investigated in [8]. There, the roles of the fractional derivatives were studied more generally for multi-term time-fractional differential equations. Especially, for the 2 -term equation such as (1.1), the order $\beta$ signifies the extent of intermittency in its solution. Apart from the fractional diffusion operator and the long-range dependence depicted by the Hurst index $H$ in the range $1 / 2<H<1$ in Eq. (1.1), this intermittency is another important feature which characterizes the temporal evolution of the solution.

Proof of Theorem 4.5. The proof is similar to Theorem 4.3. By [19], for $\beta \in(0,1]$, the solution to the fractional equation

$$
\frac{\mathrm{d}^{\beta} f(t)}{\mathrm{d} t^{\beta}}+\lambda f(t)=0
$$

is $E_{\beta, 1}\left(-\lambda t^{\beta}\right), t \geq 0$. By this result, taking the fractional-in-time derivatives on both sides of (4.9) one obtains

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{\partial^{\beta}}{\partial t^{\beta}} \mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(-\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right) E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
& =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\left(-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\left(-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
& =-\psi\left(-\Delta_{\mathbb{S}^{2}}\right) \mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x}),
\end{aligned}
$$

which verifies that $\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (4.9) satisfies the equation (1.3).
By (2.1) and (3.1),

$$
\begin{align*}
\|\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} & =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left|E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{2} \mathbb{E}\left[\left(\left|\widehat{\left.\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\right|^{2}+\left|\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\right|^{2}\right)\right] \\
10) & \leq \mathbb{E}\left[\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left(\left|\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\right|^{2}+\left|\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\right|^{2}\right)\right]=\left\|\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2}<\infty, \tag{4.10}
\end{align*}
$$

where it was used that $0<E_{\beta, 1}(-z) \leq 1$ for $z \geq 0$ (see [47, Theorem 4]). This shows that the expansion of $\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (4.9) converges in $\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$. Thus, (4.9) is the solution to (1.3).

Let us consider the approximation $\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ of truncation degree $L \in \mathbb{N}$ to the solution $\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (4.9) defined by

$$
\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=1}^{L} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+{\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}}_{\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}}(\boldsymbol{x})\right), \quad t \geq 0, \boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}
$$

The following result gives the convergence rate of the approximation $\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ to the solution $\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in terms of the divergence-free and curl-free power spectra.

Corollary 4.8. Let the conditions of Theorem 4.5 be satisfied and $\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ be the solution to the equation (4.9). Then, we have the following estimates.
(i) For $t>0$, the truncation error is bounded by

$$
\left\|\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C\left(\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\right)\right)^{1 / 2}
$$

(ii) For the magnitudes of variances that decay algebraically with order $\nu>2$, that is, there exist constants $C>0$ and $\ell_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $\left(\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\right) \leq C \cdot \ell^{-\nu}$ for all $\ell \geq \ell_{0}$, it holds that

$$
\left\|\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C L^{-\frac{\nu-2}{2}}
$$

(iii) The estimates in (i) and (ii) are also valid uniformly over $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$ for the root mean square truncation error

$$
\begin{aligned}
\boldsymbol{\operatorname { R M S E }}\left(\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right) & =\operatorname{Var}^{1 / 2}\left(\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right) \\
& =\left\|\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{L_{2}(\Omega)}
\end{aligned}
$$

(iv) Under the conditions of the algebraic decay in (ii), for any $\varepsilon>0$, it holds that

$$
\mathbf{P}\left(\left|\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right| \geq \varepsilon\right) \leq \frac{C}{L^{\nu-2} \varepsilon^{2}}
$$

Proof. The proof uses the representation

$$
\mathbf{u}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{u}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})=\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right)
$$

the estimate (4.10), the property (4.8), and is analogous to the proof of Corollary 4.4.

If the Fourier coefficients $\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}$ and $\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}$ are uncorrelated with $B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)$, then Theorems 4.3 and 4.5 yield the solution of (1.1) with initial condition $\mathbf{X}(0, \boldsymbol{x})=$ $\mathbf{u}\left(t_{0}, \boldsymbol{x}\right)$.

Corollary 4.9. Let the conditions of Theorems 4.3 and 4.5 be satisfied and $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\boldsymbol{x})$ is uncorrelated with $\mathbf{B}^{H}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$. Then, the solution of the SPDE (1.1) with the initial condition $\mathbf{X}(0, \boldsymbol{x})=\mathbf{u}\left(t_{0}, \boldsymbol{x}\right), t_{0}>0$, is given by (1.4).
4.3. Covariance Function. This subsection derives an explicit formula for the covariance matrix function of the solution (4.4) in terms of the Legendre tensor kernels.

For $\beta \in(0,1], H \in[1 / 2,1)$, let us define

$$
\begin{equation*}
E_{\beta, H}^{*}(t, z):=\Gamma(2 H+1) \int_{0}^{t} u^{2 \beta+2 H-3} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta} z\right) E_{\beta, \beta+2 H-1}\left(-u^{\beta} z\right) \mathrm{d} u, \quad t, z \in \mathbb{R} \tag{4.11}
\end{equation*}
$$

We will need the following convolution property of the generalized Mittag-Leffler function ([38, Eq. (2.2.14)]):

$$
\begin{equation*}
\int_{0}^{1} z^{\beta-1}(1-z)^{\sigma-1} E_{\alpha, \beta}\left(x z^{\alpha}\right) d z=\Gamma(\sigma) E_{\alpha, \sigma+\beta}(x) \tag{4.12}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\alpha>0, \beta, \sigma \in \mathbb{C}, \Re(\beta)>0, \Re(\sigma)>0$.
Proposition 4.10. Let the conditions of Theorems 4.3 and 4.5 be satisfied and the centred random tangent field $\mathbf{Z}_{0}(\xi, \boldsymbol{x})$ on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ have normally distributed Fourier coefficients ${\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)}}_{\ell m}$ and $\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}$ with mean zero and variances $\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}$ and $\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}$ respectively. Then, the covariance matrix function of the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})$ in (1.4) is a tensor field on $\mathbb{S}^{2}$ given by

$$
\begin{aligned}
\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{y})]=\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} & \left\{\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{1} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right. \\
& \left.+\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{2} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right\}
\end{aligned}
$$

where $\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})$ and $\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})$ are the Legendre tensor kernels given by (2.2).
Proof. By assumption, $\mathbb{E}[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})]=0$ for $t \geq 0$ and $\boldsymbol{x} \in \mathbb{S}^{2}$. Then, by (1.4) and the uncorrelatedness of $\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}, \widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}, B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)$ for $\ell \geq 1$ and $m=-\ell, \ldots, \ell$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{Cov} {[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{y})]=\mathbb{E}[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{y})] } \\
&= \mathbb{E}\left[\sum _ { \ell = 1 } ^ { \infty } \sum _ { m = - \ell } ^ { \ell } \sum _ { \ell ^ { \prime } = 1 } ^ { \infty } \sum _ { m ^ { \prime } = - \ell ^ { \prime } } ^ { \ell ^ { \prime } } \left\{\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right.}\right)_{\ell m} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right.\right. \\
&\left.\times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s)\right) \mathbf{y} \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})+\left(\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right. \\
&\left.\left.\quad \times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right\} \otimes\left\{\left(\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right.}\right)_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell^{\prime}}\right)\right)+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell^{\prime}}\right)\right)\right.
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
& \left.\times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}^{1}(s)\right) \mathbf{y}_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}\left(\boldsymbol{y}+\left(\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell^{\prime}}\right)\right)+\int_{0}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell^{\prime}}\right)\right)\right.\right. \\
& \left.\left.\left.\times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}^{2}(s)\right) \mathbf{z}_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}(\boldsymbol{y})\right\}\right]=\mathbb{E}\left[\sum _ { \ell = 1 } ^ { \infty } \sum _ { m = - \ell } ^ { \ell } \left\{\left.\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})\left(\mid \widehat{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell m} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{2}\right.\right. \\
& \times \int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(u) \\
& \left.\times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(v)\right)+\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})\left(\left|\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}} E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right|^{2}+\int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}\right. \\
& \left.\left.\left.4.13) \quad \times(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(u) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(v)\right)\right\}\right], \tag{4.13}
\end{align*}
$$

where the first equality uses that $\widehat{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}, \widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}, B_{\ell m}^{1}(t)$ and $B_{\ell m}^{2}(t)$ are centred and the third equality uses their uncorrelatedness.

By [39, Eq 1.3], the expectation of each double stochastic integral in (4.13) becomes

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \mathbb{E}\left(\int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}^{1}(u)\right. \\
&\left.\times \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(v)\right)=A_{\ell}^{1} H(2 H-1) \int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \\
& \quad \times E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)|u-v|^{2 H-2} \mathrm{~d} u \mathrm{~d} v=A_{\ell}^{1} H(2 H-1) \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1} \\
& \quad \times E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} u\left(\int_{0}^{u}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)(u-v)^{2 H-2} \mathrm{~d} v\right. \\
&\left.14) \quad+\int_{u}^{t}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)(v-u)^{2 H-2} \mathrm{~d} v\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

The first integral in the large brackets reads

$$
\begin{gathered}
\int_{0}^{u}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(t-v-(t-u))^{2 H-2} d v \\
\quad=\int_{t-u}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-(t-u))^{2 H-2} d z
\end{gathered}
$$

by the change of variable $t-v=z$. Thus,

$$
\begin{align*}
& \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{0}^{u}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(u-v)^{2 H-2} d v\right) d u \\
& =\int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{t-u}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-(t-u))^{2 H-2} d z\right) d u \\
& =\int_{0}^{t} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{s}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-s)^{2 H-2} d z\right) d s \\
& (4.15) \quad=\int_{0}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{0}^{z} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-s)^{2 H-2} d s\right) d z, \tag{4.15}
\end{align*}
$$

by the change of variable $t-u=s$ and changing the order of integration.
For the second integral in the large brackets, with $v-u=t-u-(t-v)$ and the change of variable $t-v=s$, we get

$$
\int_{u}^{t}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(v-u)^{2 H-2} d v
$$

$$
=\int_{0}^{t-u} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(t-u-s)^{2 H-2} d s
$$

Thus,

$$
\begin{align*}
& \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{u}^{t}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(v-u)^{2 H-2} d v\right) d u \\
& =\int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{0}^{t-u} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(t-u-s)^{2 H-2} d s\right) d u \\
& (4.16) \quad=\int_{0}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{0}^{z} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-s)^{2 H-2} d s\right) d z \tag{4.16}
\end{align*}
$$

by the change of variable $t-u=z$. In view of (4.15), (4.16) and (4.14), we then obtain
$\mathbb{E}\left(\int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}^{1}(u) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(v)\right)$

$$
\begin{equation*}
=2 A_{l}^{1} H(2 H-1) \int_{0}^{t} z^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)\left(\int_{0}^{z} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-s)^{2 H-2} d s\right) d z \tag{4.17}
\end{equation*}
$$

With a rescaling $w=\frac{s}{z}$, we get

$$
\begin{gather*}
\int_{0}^{z} s^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-s^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right)(z-s)^{2 H-2} d s \\
=z^{\beta+2 H-2} \int_{0}^{1} w^{\beta-1}(1-w)^{2 H-2} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right) w^{\beta}\right) d w \\
=z^{\beta+2 H-2} \Gamma(2 H-1) E_{\beta, \beta+2 H-1}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right) \tag{4.18}
\end{gather*}
$$

using the convolution property (4.12) of the generalized Mittag-Leffler function. Putting (4.18) into (4.17) we finally obtain

$$
\begin{gathered}
\mathbb{E}\left(\int_{0}^{t} \int_{0}^{t}(t-u)^{\beta-1}(t-v)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-u)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-v)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell^{\prime} m^{\prime}}^{1}(u) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(v)\right) \\
=A_{l}^{1} \Gamma(2 H+1) \int_{0}^{t} z^{2 \beta+2 H-3} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right) E_{\beta, \beta+2 H-1}\left(-z^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{l}\right)\right) d z
\end{gathered}
$$

which is the expression (4.11) with an according change of notation.
Using the notation of (4.11), it follows from (4.13) and (4.14) that
$\operatorname{Cov}[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{y})]$

$$
\begin{align*}
& =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})\left(\left.\mathbb{E}\left[\mid \widehat{\mathbf{Z}_{0}}\right)_{\ell m}\right|^{2}\right]\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{1} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right) \\
& \quad+\mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x}) \otimes \mathbf{z}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{y})\left(\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\widetilde{\left(\mathbf{Z}_{0}\right)_{\ell m}}\right|^{2}\right]\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{2} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right\} \\
& =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}\left\{\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{1} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right. \\
& \text { (4.19) } \left.\quad+\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{2} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right\}, \tag{4.19}
\end{align*}
$$

where the last equality uses the addition theorem (2.3) for vector spherical harmonics.

Corollary 4.11. Let the conditions of Proposition 4.10 be satisfied. Then, we have the following estimates.
(i) For $t>0$ the truncation error is bounded by
$\left\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C\left(\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\left(A_{\ell}^{1}+A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau}\right)\right)^{1 / 2}$.
(ii) For the magnitudes of variances that decay algebraically with order $\nu>2$, that is, there exist constants $C>0$ and $\ell_{0} \in \mathbb{N}$ such that $\widehat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\widetilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}+\left(A_{\ell}^{1}+A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\tau} \leq$ $C \cdot \ell^{-\nu}$ for all $\ell \geq \ell_{0}$, it holds

$$
\left\|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C L^{-\frac{\nu-2}{2}}
$$

(iii) Under conditions of the algebraic decay in (ii), for any $\varepsilon>0$ it holds that

$$
\mathbf{P}\left(\left|\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right| \geq \varepsilon\right) \leq \frac{C}{L^{\nu-2} \varepsilon^{2}}
$$

Proof. One needs to use the following modification of the result in (4.19):

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \operatorname{Cov}\left[\mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x}), \mathbf{X}(t, \boldsymbol{x})-\mathbf{X}_{L}(t, \boldsymbol{x})\right] \\
& \begin{aligned}
=\sum_{\ell=L+1}^{\infty} & \left\{\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\hat{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{1} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right. \\
& \left.+\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\left(\tilde{\sigma}_{\ell}^{2}\left(E_{\beta, 1}\left(-t_{0}^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)^{2}+A_{\ell}^{2} E_{\beta, H}^{*}\left(t, \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)\right)\right\}
\end{aligned}
\end{aligned}
$$

The statements of the Corollary then follow from the estimates of the Mittag-Leffler function for $z \geq 0$ :

$$
\begin{aligned}
& 0<E_{\beta, 1}(-z) \leq 1 \\
& E_{\beta, H}^{*}(t, z)=\frac{\Gamma(2 H+1)}{z^{\frac{2}{\beta}(\beta+H-1)}} \int_{0}^{t z^{1 / \beta}} u^{2 \beta+2 H-3} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right) E_{\beta, \beta+2 H-1}\left(-u^{\beta}\right) \mathrm{d} u \\
& \leq \frac{\Gamma(2 H+1)}{z^{\frac{2}{\beta}(\beta+H-1)}}\left(\int_{0}^{+\infty}\left(u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right)^{2} \mathrm{~d} u \int_{0}^{+\infty}\left(u^{\beta+2 H-2} E_{\beta, \beta+2 H-1}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right)^{2} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{1 / 2} \\
& \leq C z^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}
\end{aligned}
$$

and the upper bounds for the norms of the divergence-free and curl-free Legendre tensor kernels

$$
\left\|\mathbf{q}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C(2 \ell+1), \quad\left\|\mathbf{p}_{\ell}(\boldsymbol{x}, \boldsymbol{y})\right\|_{\mathbf{L}_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)} \leq C(2 \ell+1)
$$

Then the proof is similar to the proof of Corollary 4.4.

## 5. Analysis of temporal increments

This section derives an upper bound in the $L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)$-norm of the temporal increments of the solution to Equation (1.1). The result shows the interplay between the exponent $\beta$ of the fractional derivative in time and the Hurst parameter $H$.

Proposition 5.1. Let the conditions of Theorem4.3 be satisfied and $1-H<\beta<1$. Then, for any $t, \tau \geq 0$, which are not simultaneously equal to zero, the norm of the temporal increments of the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})$ to Equation (1.1) is bounded as

$$
\|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(\tau, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} \leq C \frac{|t-\tau|^{2 H}}{(t+\tau)^{2(1-\beta)}}
$$

where $C$ is a positive constant.

Proof. Due to the symmetry, we consider only the case $t>\tau \geq 0$. Using the representation (4.4) of the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})$ and repeating first steps in the proof of (4.6) one obtains

$$
\begin{align*}
& \|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(\tau, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} \\
& =\sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell}\left\{\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\int_{\tau}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{1}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right|^{2}\right]\right. \\
& \left.\quad+\mathbb{E}\left[\left|\int_{\tau}^{t}(t-s)^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-(t-s)^{\beta} \psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right) \mathrm{d} B_{\ell m}^{2}(s) \mathbf{y}_{\ell, m}(\boldsymbol{x})\right|^{2}\right]\right\} \\
& (5.1) \leq \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(C_{H}^{1} A_{\ell}^{1}+C_{H}^{2} A_{\ell}^{2}\right)\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(1-\beta-H)}\left(\int_{\tau\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}\left|u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H} \tag{5.1}
\end{align*}
$$

By the inequality

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left|E_{\alpha, \beta}(-z)\right| \leq \frac{C}{1+z}, \quad \alpha<2, \beta \in \mathbb{R}, z \geq 0 \tag{5.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

see [42, Theorem 1.6], it follows that $\left|E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right| \leq C$ and

$$
\begin{gathered}
\int_{\tau\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}\left|u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u \leq C \int_{\tau\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}} u^{\frac{\beta-1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u \\
\leq C \frac{\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}+\frac{\beta-1}{\beta H}}}{1+\frac{\beta-1}{H}}\left(t^{1+\frac{\beta-1}{H}}-\tau^{1+\frac{\beta-1}{H}}\right)
\end{gathered}
$$

Now, by applying the inequality, see [40, 3.6.24],

$$
z^{a}-1 \leq(z+1)^{a-1}(z-1), \quad z \geq 1, a \in(0,1)
$$

to the right-hand side above one obtains

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(\int_{\tau\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}^{t\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{1}{\beta}}}\left|u^{\beta-1} E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right|^{\frac{1}{H}} \mathrm{~d} u\right)^{2 H} \leq C\left(\psi\left(\lambda_{\ell}\right)\right)^{\frac{2}{\beta}(\beta+H-1)} \frac{(t-\tau)^{2 H}}{(t+\tau)^{2(1-\beta)}} \tag{5.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, by (5.1) and (5.3) it follows

$$
\|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(\tau, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} \leq C \sum_{\ell=1}^{\infty}(2 \ell+1)\left(C_{H}^{1} A_{\ell}^{1}+C_{H}^{2} A_{\ell}^{2}\right) \frac{(t-\tau)^{2 H}}{(t+\tau)^{2(1-\beta)}}
$$

which by (3.2) completes the proof.
Remark 5.2. Note that if the distance $|t-\tau|$ is bounded, then

$$
\lim _{t, \tau \rightarrow \infty}\|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(\tau, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}=0
$$

If $\tau=0$, then the deviations of the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})$ at time $t$ from the initial condition $\mathbf{X}(0, \mathbf{x})$ are bounded as

$$
\|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(0, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} \leq C t^{2(H+\beta-1)}
$$

As $1-H<\beta$, the above upper bound approaches zero when $t \rightarrow 0$.
Corollary 5.3. Let the conditions of Proposition 5.1 be satisfied. Then, for any $t, \tau>0$, the norm of the temporal increments of the solution $\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})$ to Equation (1.1) is bounded as

$$
\|\mathbf{X}(t, \mathbf{x})-\mathbf{X}(\tau, \mathbf{x})\|_{L_{2}\left(\Omega \times \mathbb{S}^{2}\right)}^{2} \leq C \frac{|t-\tau|^{2 H}}{(t+\tau)^{4}}
$$

where $C$ is a positive constant.
Proof. The proof is analogous to the proof of Propositions 5.1 if for $u>0$ one applies the estimate $\left|E_{\beta, \beta}\left(-u^{\beta}\right)\right| \leq C / u^{\beta}$, which follows from (5.2).

The upper bound in Corollary 5.3 is preferable to Proposition 5.1 for large values of $t$ and $\tau$.

## Acknowledgments

This research was partially supported under the Australian Research Council's Discovery Projects funding scheme (project number DP160101366). Yu Guang Wang acknowledges the support of funding from the European Research Council (ERC) under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme (grant agreement $\mathrm{n}^{\circ} 757983$ ). The authors are also grateful to the referees for their constructive comments and suggestions that helped improve the paper.

## Bibliography

1. R. Adam and et al., Planck 2015 results - I. Overview of products and scientific results, Astronomy \& Astrophysics 594 (2016), A1.
2. _, Planck 2015 results - IX. Diffuse component separation: CMB maps, Astronomy \& Astrophysics 594 (2016), A9.
3. N. Aghanim and et al., Planck 2015 results - XI. CMB power spectra, likelihoods, and robustness of parameters, Astronomy \& Astrophysics 594 (2016), A11.
4. V. V. Anh, P. Broadbridge, A. Olenko, and Y.G. Wang, On approximation for fractional stochastic partial differential equations on the sphere, Stochastic Environmental Research and Risk Assessment 32 (2018), no. 9, 2585-2603.
5. V. V. Anh and N. Leonenko, Spectral analysis of fractional kinetic equations with random data, Journal of Statistical Physics 104 (2001), no. 5, 1349-1387.
6. V. V. Anh, N. Leonenko, and M. D Ruiz-Medina, Fractional-in-time and multifracational-in-space stochastic partial differential equations, Fractional Calculus and Applied Analysis 19 (2016), no. 6.
7. V. V. Anh and R. McVinish, The Riesz-Bessel fractional diffusion equation, Applied Mathematics and Optimization 49 (2004), no. 3, 241-264. MR 2041851
8. V.V. Anh, C.C. Heyde, and N. Leonenko, Dynamic models of long-memory processes driven by Lévy noise, Journal of Applied Probability (2002), 730-747.
9. V.V. Anh, N. Leonenko, and A. Sikorskii, Stochastic representation of fractional Bessel-Riesz motion, Chaos, Solitons \& Fractals 102 (2017), 135-139.
10. V.V. Anh and R. McVinish, The Riesz-Bessel fractional diffusion equation, Applied Mathematics and Optimization 49 (2004), no. 3, 241-264.
11. R. Atlas, R.N. Hoffman, S.M. Leidner, J. Sienkiewicz, T.W. Yu, S.C. Bloom, E. Brin, J. Ardizzone, J. Terry, D. Bungato, et al., The effects of marine winds from scatterometer data on weather analysis and forecasting, Bulletin of the American Meteorological Society 82 (2001), no. 9, 1965-1990.
12. A. Beskos, J. Dureau, and K. Kalogeropoulos, Bayesian inference for partially observed stochastic differential equations driven by fractional Brownian motion, Biometrika 102 (2015), no. 4, 809-827.
13. F. Biagini, Y. Hu, B. Øksendal, and T. Zhang, Stochastic calculus for fractional Brownian motion and applications, Springer-Verlag London, Ltd., London, 2008. MR 2387368
14. D. Bolin and F. Lindgren, Spatial models generated by nested stochastic partial differential equations, with an application to global ozone mapping, The Annals of Applied Statistics (2011), 523-550.
15. D. R. Brillinger, A particle migrating randomly on a sphere, Journal of Theoretical Probability 10 (1997), no. 2, 429-443. MR 1455152
16. P. Broadbridge, A. Kolesnik, N. Leonenko, and A. Olenko, Random spherical hyperbolic diffusion, Journal of Statistical Physics 177 (2019), no. 5, 889-916.
17. P. Broadbridge, A. Kolesnik, N. Leonenko, A. Olenko, and D. Omari, Spherically restricted random hyperbolic diffusion, Entropy 22 (2020), no. 2, 217.
18. S. Castruccio and M. L. Stein, Global space-time models for climate ensembles, The Annals of Applied Statistics (2013), 1593-1611.
19. M. M. Djrbashian, Harmonic analysis and boundary value problems in the complex domain, Birkhäuser Verlag, Basel, 1993. MR 1249271
20. S. Dodelson, Modern Cosmology, Academic press, 2003.
21. M. D'Ovidio, Coordinates changed random fields on the sphere, Journal of Statistical Physics 154 (2014), 1153-1176.
22. M. D'Ovidio, N. Leonenko, and E. Orsingher, Fractional spherical random fields, Statistics \& Probability Letters 116 (2016), 146-156. MR 3508533
23. M. D'Ovidio and E. Nane, Fractional Cauchy problems on compact manifolds, Stochastic Analysis and Applications 34 (2016), no. 2, 232-257.
24. M. Fan, D. Paul, T. C.M. Lee, and T. Matsuo, Modeling tangential vector fields on a sphere, Journal of the American Statistical Association 113 (2018), no. 524, 1625-1636.
25. W. Freeden and M Schreiner, Spherical functions of mathematical geosciences: a scalar, vectorial, and tensorial setup, Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, 2009.
26. E. J. Fuselier and G. B. Wright, Stability and error estimates for vector field interpolation and decomposition on the sphere with RBFs, SIAM Journal on Numerical Analysis 47 (2009), no. 5, 3213-3239. MR 2551192
27. W. Grecksch and V. V. Anh, A parabolic stochastic differential equation with fractional Brownian motion input, Statistics \& Probability Letters 41 (1999), no. 4, 337-346. MR 1666072
28. S. K. Harouna and V. Perrier, Helmholtz-Hodge decomposition on $[0,1]^{d}$ by divergence-free and curl-free wavelets, International Conference on Curves and Surfaces, Springer, 2010, pp. 311329.
29. D. T. Hristopulos, Permissibility of fractal exponents and models of band-limited two-point functions for fgn and fbm random fields, Stochastic Environmental Research and Risk Assessment 17 (2003), no. 3, 191-216.
30. Y. Hu, Y. Liu, D. Nualart, et al., Rate of convergence and asymptotic error distribution of euler approximation schemes for fractional diffusions, The Annals of Applied Probability 26 (2016), no. 2, 1147-1207.
31. Y. Inahama et al., Laplace approximation for rough differential equation driven by fractional Brownian motion, The Annals of Probability 41 (2013), no. 1, 170-205.
32. Q. T. Le Gia, M. Li, and Y. G. Wang, FaVeST: fast vector spherical harmonic transforms, ACM Transactions on Mathematical Software (2021, in press).
33. Q. T. Le Gia, I. H. Sloan, Y. G. Wang, and R. S. Womersley, Needlet approximation for isotropic random fields on the sphere, Journal of Approximation Theory 216 (2017), 86-116.
34. M. Li, P. Broadbridge, A. Olenko, and Y. G. Wang, Fast tensor needlet transforms for tangent vector fields on the sphere, arXiv preprint arXiv:1907.13339 (2019).
35. T. J. Lyons, Differential equations driven by rough signals, Revista Matemática Iberoamericana 14 (1998), no. 2, 215-310.
36. C. Ma and A. Malyarenko, Time-varying isotropic vector random fields on compact two-point homogeneous spaces, Journal of Theoretical Probability 33 (2020), 319-339.
37. B. I. Manikin and V. M. Radchenko, Approximation of the solution to the parabolic equation driven by stochastic measure, Theory of Probability and Mathematical Statistics 102 (2020), 145-156.
38. A. M. Mathai and H. J. Haubold, Special functions for applied scientists, Springer, 2008.
39. J. Mémin, Y. Mishura, and E. Valkeila, Inequalities for the moments of Wiener integrals with respect to a fractional Brownian motion, Statistics \& Probability Letters 51 (2001), no. 2, 197-206. MR 1822771
40. D. S. Mitrinovic, Analytic inequalities, Springer, Berlin, 1970.
41. J. Pan, X.-H. Yan, Q. Zheng, and W T. Liu, Vector empirical orthogonal function modes of the ocean surface wind variability derived from satellite scatterometer data, Geophysical Research Letters 28 (2001), no. 20, 3951-3954.
42. I. Podlubny, Fractional differential equations, Academic Press, Inc., San Diego, CA, 1999. MR 1658022
43. A.D. Richmond and Y. Kamide, Mapping electrodynamic features of the high-latitude ionosphere from localized observations: Technique, Journal of Geophysical Research: Space Physics 93 (1988), no. A6, 5741-5759.
44. T. J. Sabaka, G. Hulot, and N. Olsen, Mathematical properties relevant to geomagnetic field modeling, Handbook of Geomathematics, Springer, 2010.
45. M. Scheuerer and M. Schlather, Covariance models for divergence-free and curl-free random vector fields, Stochastic Models 28 (2012), no. 3, 433-451.
46. M. Schlather, A. Malinowski, P. J Menck, M. Oesting, and K. Strokorb, Analysis, simulation and prediction of multivariate random fields with package random fields, Journal of Statistical Software.
47. T. Simon, Comparing Fréchet and positive stable laws, Electronic Journal of Probability 19 (2014), no. 16, 1-25. MR 3164769
48. E. M Stein, Singular integrals and differentiability properties of functions, vol. 2, Princeton University Press, 1970.
49. M. L. Stein, J. Chen, and M. Anitescu, Stochastic approximation of score functions for Gaussian processes, The Annals of Applied Statistics 7 (2013), no. 2, 1162-1191.
50. M. L. Stein et al., Spatial variation of total column ozone on a global scale, The Annals of Applied Statistics 1 (2007), no. 1, 191-210.
51. Z. Zhang, D. Beletsky, D. J. Schwab, and M. L. Stein, Assimilation of current measurements into a circulation model of Lake Michigan, Water Resources Research 43 (2007), no. 11.

Faculty of Science, Engineering and Technology, Swinburne University of Technology, PO Box 218, Hawthorn, Victoria 3122, Australia

E-mail address: vanh@swin.edu.au
Department of Mathematics and Statistics, La Trobe University, Melbourne, ViC, 3086, Australia

E-mail address: a.olenko@latrobe.edu.au
Max Planck Institute for Mathematics in the Sciences, Inselstrasse 22, 04103 Leipzig, Germany

Current address: Institute of Natural Sciences, School of Mathematical Sciences, and Key Laboratory of Scientific and Engineering Computing of Ministry of Education (MOE-LSC), Shanghai Jiao Tong University, Shanghai 200240, China

E-mail address: yuguang.wang@mis.mpg.de


[^0]:    1991 Mathematics Subject Classification. Primary 35R60, 60H15, 35R11; Secondary 60G60, 33C55, 60G22.

    Key words and phrases. Fractional stochastic partial differential equation, random tangent field, vector spherical harmonics, fractional Brownian motion.

