arXiv:2203.07592v1 [math.GR] 15 Mar 2022

A classification of finite p-groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup*

Jixia Gao[1], Dandan Zhang[1], Haipeng Qu[1,2†]

1. *School of Mathematics and Statistics, Lanzhou University,*
Lanzhou Gansu 730000, P. R. China
e-mail: orcawhale@163.com

2. *School of Mathematics and Computer Science, Shanxi Normal University,*
Taiyuan Shanxi 030032, P. R. China

Abstract

Finite p-groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup are classified up to isomorphism. A problem proposed by Berkovich and Janko is solved.

Keywords Finite p-groups, $\mathcal{A}_t$-groups, $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups

2020MSC 20D15

1 Introduction

In this paper, p is a prime, all groups considered are finite p-groups (in brief, p-groups), where p-groups are the groups of prime power order. A finite group G is said to be minimal non-abelian if G is non-abelian but all its proper subgroups are abelian. Berkovich and Janko in their long paper [5] introduced a more general concept than that of minimal non-abelian p-groups. A finite non-abelian p-group is called an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group, t is a positive integer, if it has a non-abelian subgroup of index p^{t-1} but all its subgroups of index p^t are abelian. Obviously, $\mathcal{A}_1$-groups are exactly minimal non-abelian p-groups, which were classified by Rédei in [9]. For $t = 2, 3$, $\mathcal{A}_t$-groups were classified by Zhang et al. in [16, 17], respectively. Obviously, given a non-abelian p-group G, there is a $t \in \mathbb{N}$ such that G is an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group. Hence the study of finite non-abelian p-groups can be regarded as that of $\mathcal{A}_t$-groups for some $t \in \mathbb{N}$. We use $G \in \mathcal{A}_t$ to denote G is an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group.

As numerous results show, the structure of a p-group depends essentially on its $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroups. Indeed, the structure of a p-group also depends essentially on the $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups contained there. Recently, some scholars studied the structure of p-groups by imposing restrictions on their $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups, see [6, 14, 15]. In this paper, we study the structure of p-groups by imposing restriction on the number of their $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups.

Following the notation of [3], $\alpha_k(G)$ denotes the number of $\mathcal{A}_k$-subgroups of a non-abelian p-group G. An and Qu et al. in a series of papers [1, 2, 10, 11, 12] classified

*This research was partially supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (nos. 11771258, 11971280)

†corresponding author

the p-groups with an $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p. Naturally, we wish to classify the p-groups with an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of index p. Such a class of p-groups contains at least $\mathcal{A}_3$-groups as its subclass. Hence such a class of p-groups is quite large, and this classification is an enormous work! In this paper, we classify the p-groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup. In other words, we classify the p-groups with $\alpha_2(G) = 1$. Thus [4, Problem 895] are solved. Due to the classification of $\mathcal{A}_3$-groups and the classification of the p-groups obtained by An and Qu et al., the classification of the p-groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup is completed in a very short length.

2 Preliminaries

Let G be a finite p-group. We use $c(G)$, $\exp(G)$ and $d(G)$ to denote the nilpotency class, the exponent and the minimal cardinality of generating set of G, respectively. We use C_{p^n} and $\mathrm{C}_{p^n}^m$ to denote the cyclic group of order p^n and the direct product of m copies of C_{p^n}, respectively. The group G is the central product, $G = A * B$, of the two subgroups A and B if $G = AB$ and $[A, B] = 1$.

For any positive integer s, we define

$$\Omega_s(G) = \langle a \in G \mid a^{p^s} = 1 \rangle \text{ and } \mho_s(G) = \langle a^{p^s} \mid a \in G \rangle.$$

The Frattini subgroup $\Phi(G)$ of G is equal to $G'\mho_1(G)$.

We use $\mathrm{M}_p(n, m)$ to denote the p-groups

$$\langle a, b \mid a^{p^n} = b^{p^m} = 1,\ [a, b] = a^{p^{n-1}} \rangle,\ \text{where } n \geqslant 2,\ m \geqslant 1.$$

We use $\mathrm{M}_p(n, m, 1)$ to denote the p-groups

$$\langle a, b, c \mid a^{p^n} = b^{p^m} = c^p = 1,\ [a, b] = c,\ [c, a] = [c, b] = 1 \rangle,$$

where $n \geqslant m \geqslant 1,$ and if $p = 2,$ then $m + n \geqslant 3$.

For any undefined notations and terminologies, the reader is referred to [3] .

Lemma 2.1. ([13, Lemma 2.2]) *Let G be a finite p-group. Then the following propositions are equivalent*:

(1) *G is a minimal non-abelian p-group*;

(2) *$d(G) = 2$ and $|G'| = p$*;

(3) *$d(G) = 2$ and $Z(G) = \Phi(G)$.*

Lemma 2.2. ([2, Corollary 2.4]) (1) *Let M be an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group and A be an abelian group of order p^k. Then $G = M \times A$ is an $\mathcal{A}_{t+k}$-group.*

(2) *Let M be an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group with $|M'| = p$, $G = M * A$, where A is abelian with order p^{k+1} and $M \cap A = M'$. Then G is an $\mathcal{A}_{t+k}$-group.*

Lemma 2.3. ([17, Lemma 2.15]) *Suppose that G is a finite p-group. M_1 and M_2 are two distinct maximal subgroups of G. Then $|G'| \leqslant p|M_1'M_2'|$.*

Lemma 2.4. ([3, Lemma 1.4]) *Let G be a p-group and $N \trianglelefteq G$. If N has no abelian G-invariant subgroups of type (p,p), then N is either cyclic or a 2-group of maximal class. If, in addition, $N \leq \Phi(G)$, then N is cyclic.*

Lemma 2.5. ([3, Proposition 1.13]) *Let G be a p-group and let $N \leq \Phi(G)$ be G-invariant. If $Z(N)$ is cyclic, then N is also cyclic.*

3 A classification of p-groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup

In the following we always assume G is an $\mathcal{A}_t$-group with $t \geqslant 3$. We discuss in two cases: $|G'| = p$ and $|G'| \geqslant p^2$.

Theorem 3.1. *Let G be a finite p-group with $|G'| = p$. Then G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup if and only if $G = H * C$, where H is a non-abelian subgroup of order p^3 and C is cyclic.*

Proof. ($\Leftarrow$) Since $|G'| = p$, $M' = G'$ for any non-abelian subgroup M of G. Let $L/G' = \Omega_1(G/G')$. Then $L/G' \cong \mathrm{C}_p^3$. Let K be an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G. Then $d(K) \geqslant 3$ by Lemma 2.1. It follows that $|\Omega_1(K/K')| \geqslant p^3$. This forces that $\Omega_1(K/G') = \Omega_1(K/K') = \Omega_1(G/G')$. Hence $L/G' \leq K/G'$. Thus $L \leq K$. Notice that $H < L$. We have $H < K$. Since K is an $\mathcal{A}_2$-group, $|K/H| = p$. This forces $K = L$. That is, G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup.

($\Rightarrow$) Suppose that H is a non-abelian subgroup of minimum order of G. Since $|G'| = p$, $H' = G'$. In particular, $H \trianglelefteq G$. If K/H is a subgroup of G/H of order p, then $|K : H| = p$. By the minimality of H, each subgroup of K of index $\geqslant p^2$ is abelian. Hence K is an $\mathcal{A}_2$-group. Since G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup, G/H has a unique subgroup of order p. Obviously, G/H is abelian. Hence G/H is cyclic. By the minimality of H, $d(H) = 2$. Thus $d(G) \leqslant 3$. By Lemma 2.1, $d(G) \neq 2$. Hence $d(G) = 3$. Fortunately, the p-groups G with $d(G) = 3$ and $|G'| = p$ were classified, which are listed in [2, Lemma 3.1]. The conclusion follows by a simple checking. □

Corollary 3.2. *Let G be a finite p-group with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup K and $|G'| = p$. Then $K \nleq \Phi(G)$.*

Lemma 3.3. *Let G be a finite p-group with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup K and $|G'| \geqslant p^2$. Then $K \nleq \Phi(G)$ if and only if G has an $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p.*

Proof. ($\Leftarrow$) Let M be an $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p of G. Then $K \nleq M$. Hence $K \nleq \Phi(G)$.

($\Rightarrow$) Let M be a maximal subgroup of G. If M is neither abelian nor minimal non-abelian, then $K \leq M$. Moreover, $K\Phi(G) \leq M$. Let $d(G) = d$ and $d(G/K\Phi(G)) = k$. Since $K \nleq \Phi(G)$, $k < d$. Notice that G has $1 + p + \cdots + p^{d-1}$ maximal subgroups and $G/K\Phi(G)$ has $1 + p + \cdots + p^{k-1}$ maximal subgroups. Thus G has at least p^{d-1} maximal subgroups which are abelian or minimal non-abelian. It follows from $|G'| \geqslant p^2$ and Lemma 2.3 that G has at most one abelian maximal subgroup. Thus G has at least $(p^{d-1} - 1)$ $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p. □

By the proof process ($\Rightarrow$) of Lemma 3.3, we have

Corollary 3.4. *Assume a p-group G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup A of index p and $|G'| \geqslant p^2$. If G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup, then G is a two-generator 2-group with an abelian maximal subgroup. In particular, G/A' has at least two abelian maximal subgroups.*

Lemma 3.5. *Assume G is a finite p-group, $d(G) = 3$, $\Phi(G) \leq Z(G)$ and $G' \cong \mathrm{C}_p^3$. Let $\overline{G} = G/G' = \langle \overline{a_1},\ \overline{a_2},\ \overline{a_3} \rangle$, where $o(\overline{a_i}) = p^{m_i}$, $i = 1, 2, 3$ and $m_1 \geqslant m_2 \geqslant m_3$. Let $\omega(G) = (\omega_{ij})$ be a 3×3 matrix over $GF(p)$ and $a_i^{p^{m_i}} = x^{\omega_{i1}} y^{\omega_{i2}} z^{\omega_{i3}}$, where $x = [a_2, a_3]$, $y = [a_3, a_1]$, $z = [a_1, a_2]$. If $\omega(G)$ has at least two principal minors to be equal 0, then G has at least two $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups.*

Proof. Without loss of generality assume $\left| \begin{smallmatrix} \omega_{11} & \omega_{12} \\ \omega_{21} & \omega_{22} \end{smallmatrix} \right| = \left| \begin{smallmatrix} \omega_{22} & \omega_{23} \\ \omega_{32} & \omega_{33} \end{smallmatrix} \right| = 0$. Let $H = \langle a_1, a_2 \rangle$. Notice that $G' \leq \Phi(G) \leq Z(G)$. We have $H' = \langle [a_1, a_2] \rangle$. Moreover, $|H'| = p$. Then $H \in \mathcal{A}_1$ by Lemma 2.1. We claim $H \cap G' = \langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle$. In fact, take $g \in H \cap G'$. Then $g = a_1^i a_2^j z^k$. Moreover, $\overline{1} = \overline{g} = \overline{a_1}^i \overline{a_2}^j$. It follows from $\langle \overline{a_1},\ \overline{a_2},\ \overline{a_3} \rangle$ being a basis of $\overline{G}$ that $\overline{a_1}^i = \overline{a_2}^j = \overline{1}$. Hence $p^{m_1} | i$ and $p^{m_2} | j$. Thus $g \in \langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle$. That means $H \cap G' \leq \langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle$. Obviously, $\langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle \leq H \cap G'$. Thus $H \cap G' = \langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle$. Since $\left| \begin{smallmatrix} \omega_{11} & \omega_{12} \\ \omega_{21} & \omega_{22} \end{smallmatrix} \right| = 0$, $|\langle a_1^{p^{m_1}}, a_2^{p^{m_2}}, z \rangle| \leqslant p^2$. Since $G' \cong \mathrm{C}_p^3$, there exists $c \in G' \setminus H$. By Lemma 2.2(1), $H \times \langle c \rangle$ is an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G. Similarly, there exists $d \in G' \setminus \langle a_2, a_3 \rangle$ such that $\langle a_2, a_3 \rangle \times \langle d \rangle$ is also an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G. Clearly, $\langle a_1, a_2 \rangle \times \langle c \rangle \neq \langle a_2, a_3 \rangle \times \langle d \rangle$. Thus G has at least two $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups. □

In following we classify the p-groups G with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup K in two cases: $K \not\leq \Phi(G)$ and $K \leq \Phi(G)$.

If $K \not\leq \Phi(G)$ and $|G'| \geqslant p^2$, then, by Lemma 3.3, G has an $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p. Fortunately, such p-groups have been classified up to isomorphism in [1, 2, 10, 11, 12]. The classification results are listed in [1, Theorem 7.1], [2, Theorem 4.12], [10, Lemma 2.12, Corollary 3.5, Theorem 3.8, 3.9], [11, Theorem 3.1, 4.1, 5.1, 6.1, 7.1, 7.6] and [12, Theorem 5.1, 5.3]. In this case, what we need to do is to pick out the groups with a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup from the groups listed in the theorems mentioned above. Although there are a lot of the p-groups with an $\mathcal{A}_1$-subgroup of index p, the process of checking can be greatly reduced by Corollary 3.4 and Lemma 3.5. For the remaining cases, the process of checking is simple but tedious. The details are omitted. Now we list the groups with $K \not\leq \Phi(G)$ and $|G'| \geqslant p^2$ as follows. In particular, we also list some information of these groups, which are used in the proof of Theorem 3.7.

Theorem 3.6. *Let G be a finite p-group with $|G'| \geqslant p^2$. Then G has a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup K and $K \not\leq \Phi(G)$ if and only if G is one of the following non-isomorphic groups*:

(1) $\langle a, b, c \mid a^4 = b^4 = c^2 = 1,\ [b, c] = 1,\ [c, a] = b^2,\ [a, b] = a^2 \rangle$; *moreover, $G \in \mathcal{A}_3$, $|G| = 2^5$, $K = \langle ab, c \rangle \times \langle a^2 \rangle \cong \mathrm{D}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.*

(2) $\langle a,b,c,x \mid a^4 = b^2 = x^2 = 1,\ [a,b] = x,\ [a,c] = a^2 = c^2,\ [b,c] = [x,a] = [x,b] = [x,c] = 1\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^5,\ K = \langle a,c\rangle \times \langle x\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(3) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^8 = c^2 = 1,\ b^2 = a^4,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = b^2,\ [c,b] = 1\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^5,\ K = \langle a^2,b\rangle \times \langle c\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(4) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^8 = c^4 = 1,\ b^2 = a^4,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = a^4,\ [c,b] = c^2\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^6,\ K = \langle a^2,b,c\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(2,2,1).\mathrm{C}_2$.

(5) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{2^{n+1}} = b^2 = c^2 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = a^{2^n},\ [c,b] = 1\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle a^2,b\rangle \times \langle c\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(n,1) \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(6) $\langle a,b,c,d \mid a^{2^n} = b^2 = c^2 = d^2 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = d,\ [c,b] = [d,a] = [d,b] = 1\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle a^2,b\rangle \times \langle c\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(n-1,1,1) \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(7) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{2^n} = b^4 = c^2 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = b^2,\ [c,b] = 1\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 3$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle b,a^2\rangle \times \langle c\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(2,n-1) \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(8) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^8 = b^4 = c^4 = 1,\ [b,c] = a^4,\ [c,a] = b^2,\ [a,b] = b^2c^2\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 2^7,\ K = \langle b,c\rangle * \langle a^2\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(2,2,1) * \mathrm{C}_4$.

(9) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^4 = b^4 = c^4 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = b^2,\ [c,b] = c^2\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_4,\ |G| = 2^6,\ K = \langle c,a^2b\rangle \times \langle b^2\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(10) $\langle a,b,c \mid b^2 = c^4 = 1,\ a^{2^n} = c^2,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = [c,b] = c^2\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle * \langle a^{2^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{D}_8 * \mathrm{C}_4$.

(11) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{2^n} = b^2 = c^4 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = [c,b] = c^2\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle \times \langle a^{2^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{D}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(12) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{2^n} = c^4 = 1,\ b^2 = c^2,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = [c,b] = c^2\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = 2^{n+3},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle \times \langle a^{2^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(13) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^4 = b^{2^{n+1}} = c^4 = 1,\ [b,c] = 1,\ [c,a] = a^2 = c^2,\ [a,b] = b^{2^n}\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+2},\ |G| = 2^{n+4},\ K = \langle a,c\rangle \times \langle b^{2^n}\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(14) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{2^{n+1}} = b^4 = 1,\ c^2 = b^2,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = a^{2^n},\ [c,b] = c^2\rangle$, *where* $n \geqslant 3$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+2},\ |G| = 2^{n+4},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle \times \langle a^{2^n}\rangle \cong \mathrm{Q}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$.

(15) $\langle a,b,c,d \mid a^9 = c^3 = d^3 = 1,\ b^3 = a^3,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = d,\ [c,b] = a^3,\ [d,a] = [d,b] = 1\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 3^5,\ K = \langle b,c\rangle \times \langle d\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_3(2,1) \times \mathrm{C}_3$.

(16) $\langle a,b,c,d \mid a^9 = b^3 = c^3 = d^3 = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = d,\ [c,b] = a^{-3},\ [d,a] = [d,b] = 1\rangle$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = 3^5,\ K = \langle c,b\rangle \times \langle d\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_3(1,1,1) \times \mathrm{C}_3$.

(17) $\langle a,b,c,d \mid a^p = b^{p^2} = c^p = d^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = b^{\nu p},\ [c,b] = d,\ [d,a] = [d,b] = 1\rangle$, *where* $p > 3$, $\nu = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^5,\ K = \langle a,c\rangle \times \langle d\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(18) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^p = b^{p^2} = c^{p^2} = 1,\ [b,c] = 1,\ [c,a] = b^p c^p,\ [a,b] = b^{-p}\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^5,\ K = \langle b,a\rangle \times \langle c^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(19) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^2} = b^{p^2} = c^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = a^p b^{\nu p},\ [c,b] = b^p\rangle$, *where* $p > 3,\ \nu = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^5,\ K = \langle b,c\rangle \times \langle a^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(20) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^p = b^{p^3} = c^{p^2} = 1,\ [b,c] = 1,\ [c,a] = b^{p^2},\ [a,b] = c^{\nu p}\rangle$, *where* $\nu = 1$ *or a fixed square non-residue modulo* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^6,\ K = \langle c,a\rangle * \langle b^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1,1) * \mathrm{C}_{p^2}$.

(21) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^3} = b^{p^2} = c^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c, [c,a] = b^{\nu_1 p}, [c,b] = a^{-\nu_2 p^2}\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$, $\nu_1, \nu_2 = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^6$, $K = \langle c,b\rangle * \langle a^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1,1) * \mathrm{C}_{p^2}$.

(22) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^2} = b^{p^2} = c^{p^2} = 1,\ [b,c] = a^p, [c,a] = c^{-p}, [a,b] = b^p c^{\nu p}\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$, $\nu = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p, $-\nu$ *is a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^6,\ K = \langle c,a\rangle \times \langle b^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,2) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(23) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^3} = b^{p^2} = c^{p^2} = 1,\ [b,c] = a^{p^2}, [c,a] = b^p, [a,b] = c^{\nu p}\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$, $\nu = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p, $-\nu$ *is a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^7,\ K = \langle b,c\rangle * \langle a^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,2,1) * \mathrm{C}_{p^2}$.

(24) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^3} = b^{p^2} = c^{p^2} = 1,\ [b,c] = a^{p^2}, [c,a]^{1+r} = b^{rp} c^{-p}, [a,b]^{1+r} = b^p c^p\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$, $r = 1, 2, \cdots, p-2$ *and* $-r$ *is a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_3,\ |G| = p^7,\ K = \langle b,c\rangle * \langle a^p\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,2,1) * \mathrm{C}_{p^2}$.

(25) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^{n+1}} = b^p = c^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c, [c,a] = 1, [c,b] = a^{\nu p^n}\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$ *and* $n \geqslant 2$, $\nu = 1$ *or a fixed quadratic non-residue modular* p; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = p^{n+3},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle * \langle a^{p^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1) * \mathrm{C}_{p^2}$.

(26) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^n} = b^{p^2} = c^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = 1,\ [c,b] = b^p\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$ *and* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = p^{n+3},\ K = \langle b,c\rangle \times \langle a^{p^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(27) $\langle a,b,c,d \mid a^{p^n} = b^p = c^p = d^p = 1,\ [a,b] = c,\ [c,a] = 1,\ [c,b] = d,\ [d,a] = [d,b] = 1\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$ *and* $n \geqslant 2$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+1},\ |G| = p^{n+3},\ K = \langle c,b\rangle \times \langle a^{p^{n-1}}\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

(28) $\langle a,b,c \mid a^{p^2} = b^p = c^{p^{n+1}} = 1,\ [b,c] = 1,\ [c,a] = c^{p^n},\ [a,b] = a^p\rangle$, *where* $p \geqslant 3$; *moreover,* $G \in \mathcal{A}_{n+2},\ |G| = p^{n+4},\ K = \langle a,b\rangle \times \langle c^{p^n}\rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

Theorem 3.7. *Let* G *be a finite* p*-group with* $|G'| \geqslant p^2$. *Then* G *has a unique* $\mathcal{A}_2$*-subgroup* K *and* $K \leq \Phi(G)$ *if and only if* $G = \langle a,b,c,d \mid a^4 = b^4 = c^2 = d^2 = 1,\ [b,a] = c,\ [c,a] = d,\ [d,a] = b^2,\ [c,b] = [d,b] = [d,c] = 1\rangle$.

Proof. ($\Leftarrow$) In fact, $G = A \rtimes_\varphi \langle a \rangle$, where $A = \langle b \rangle \times \langle c \rangle \times \langle d \rangle \cong \mathrm{C}_4 \times \mathrm{C}_2^2$, $a^\varphi = \alpha$: $b^\alpha = bc$, $c^\alpha = cd$, $d^\alpha = db^2$ and $\alpha \in \mathrm{Aut}\,(A)$. Now we have $|G| = 2^6$ and $\Phi(G) = \langle a^2, c \rangle \times \langle d \rangle \cong \mathrm{D}_8 \times \mathrm{C}_2$ is an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G. It follows that G is an $\mathcal{A}_4$-group and all maximal subgroups of G are $\mathcal{A}_3$-groups. Hence the $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups of G must have order 16. It is easy to verify G satisfies the hypothesis of the theorem by calculations.

($\Rightarrow$) We discuss in two cases: $p = 2$ and $p > 2$.

Case 1. $p = 2$

Using Magma [8] to check the SmallGroups Database [7], we know that if $|G| < 2^8$, then G is exactly the group in the theorem. Assume $|G| \geqslant 2^8$. We will prove there is no group satisfying the hypothesis in the theorem by counterexample.

Assume that G is a counterexample of minimal order. Let M be a maximal subgroup of G. We assert that $K \nleq \Phi(M)$. If not, since K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G, K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of M. By Corollary 3.2, $|M'| \geqslant 2^2$. Thus M satisfies the conditions of the theorem. By the minimality of G, M satisfies the conclusion of the theorem. Thus M is the group in the theorem. That is, $|M| = 2^6$. This contradicts $|G| \geqslant 2^8$. Thus the assert holds. Now we have M is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 and Theorem 3.6. By Lemma 2.5, $Z(K)$ is non-cyclic. Thus M is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 with $H \cap C = 1$ or the groups $(5-8)$ and $(11-14)$ in Theorem 3.6.

We assert that M cannot be the group (5) in Theorem 3.6. If not, then $|M| = 2^{n+3}$ and $K = \langle a^2, b, c \rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_2(n,1) \times \mathrm{C}_2$. It follows from $|M| \geqslant 2^7$ that $n \geqslant 4$. Since K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G and $K \leq \Phi(G)$, K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of any maximal subgroup T of G. Same as M, T is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 with $H \cap C = 1$ or the groups $(5-8)$ and $(11-14)$ in Theorem 3.6. Now T and K are known. From this we know only the $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of the group (5) is isomorphic to $\mathrm{M}_2(n,1) \times \mathrm{C}_2$, where $n \geqslant 4$. Thus T is isomorphic to the group (5). By calculation, $Z(T)$ is cyclic. On the other hand, since K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G, $K \trianglelefteq G$. By $K \leq \Phi(G)$ and Lemma 2.4, there exists $N \trianglelefteq G$ and $N \leq K$ such that $N \cong \mathrm{C}_2 \times \mathrm{C}_2$. Notice that $G/C_G(N) \lesssim \mathrm{Aut}\,(N)$. We have $|G : C_G(N)| \leqslant 2$. Thus there exists a maximal subgroup M_1 of G such that $N \leq M_1 \leq C_G(N)$. Moreover, $N \leq Z(M_1)$ and hence $Z(M_1)$ is non-cyclic. This contradicts $Z(T)$ is cyclic for any maximal subgroup T of G.

We assert that M cannot be the groups (6) and (7) in Theorem 3.6. If not, then $K = \langle a^2, b, c \rangle$ and $|M : K| = 2$. By calculation, $\mho_2(K) = \langle a^8 \rangle$ and $|K : \mho_2(K)| = 2^5$. Let $\overline{G} = G/\mho_2(K)$. Then $|\overline{G}| = 2^7$. Since $K \in \mathcal{A}_2$, $\overline{K} \in \mathcal{A}_i (i \leqslant 2)$. Clearly, $|\overline{K}'| = 2$ and $d(\overline{K}) = 3$. Moreover, $\overline{K} \in \mathcal{A}_2$. We assert that $\overline{K}$ is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of $\overline{G}$. If not, let $\overline{A}$ be an $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of $\overline{G}$ and $\overline{A} \neq \overline{K}$. It follows from $\overline{A} \in \mathcal{A}_2$ that $A \in \mathcal{A}_t (t \geqslant 2)$. Since K is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of G, $K \leq A$. Moreover, $\overline{K} \leq \overline{A}$. This contradicts that $\overline{A}$ and $\overline{K}$ are two different $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups of $\overline{G}$. Thus $\overline{K}$ is a unique $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup of $\overline{G}$. Since $K \leq \Phi(G)$, $\overline{K} \leq \overline{\Phi(G)} = \Phi(\overline{G})$. By Corollary 3.2, $|\overline{G}'| \geqslant p^2$. Thus $\overline{G}$ satisfies the conditions of the theorem. By the minimality of G, $\overline{G}$ satisfies the conclusion of the theorem. Thus $\overline{G}$ is the group in the theorem. That is, $|\overline{G}| = 2^6$. This contradicts

$|\overline{G}| = 2^7$.

If M is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 with $H \cap C = 1$ or the groups (8) and $(11-14)$ in Theorem 3.6, then $Z(K) \leq Z(M)$ and $\mho_1(K) \leq Z(M)$. K is isomorphic to one of the following groups:

(i) $H \times \langle x \rangle$, where $H \cong \mathrm{Q}_8$ or D_8, $|\langle x \rangle| = 2$;

(ii) $H * \langle x \rangle$, where $H \cong \mathrm{M}_2(2,2,1)$, $|\langle x \rangle| = 4$ and $H \cap \langle x \rangle = H'$.

Same as M, $Z(K) \leq Z(L)$ and $\mho_1(K) \leq Z(L)$ for any maximal subgroup L of G. It follows that $Z(K) \leq Z(G)$ and $\mho_1(K) \leq Z(G)$.

If K is isomorphic to the group (i), then, let $\overline{G} = G/\langle x \rangle$. Thus $\overline{K} \cong H$. If K is isomorphic to the group (ii), then, let $\overline{G} = G/\mho_1(H)$. Thus $\overline{K} \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1) * \langle x \rangle$. In either case, we have $Z(\overline{K})$ is cyclic and $\overline{K}$ is non-cyclic. On the other hand, since $K \leq \Phi(G)$, $\overline{K} \leq \overline{\Phi(G)} = \Phi(\overline{G})$. Now it follows from Lemma 2.5 that $\overline{K}$ is cyclic. This is a contradiction.

To sum up, the counterexample of minimal order does not exist. The conclusion follows.

Case 2. $p > 2$

In this case, we prove that there is no group satisfying the conditions in Theorem 3.7. Let L be a subgroup of minimum order of G such that $K \leq \Phi(L)$. Then $K \nleq \Phi(M)$ for any maximal subgroup M of L. Hence M is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 and Theorem 3.6. By Lemma 2.5, $Z(K)$ is non-cyclic. Thus M is one of the groups in Theorem 3.1 with $H \cap C = 1$ or the groups $(15-24)$ and $(26-28)$ in Theorem 3.6. Now we have $Z(K) \leq Z(M)$ and $\mho_1(K) \leq Z(M)$. It follows that $Z(K) \leq Z(L)$ and $\mho_1(K) \leq Z(L)$. It is easy to see that K is isomorphic to one of the following groups:

(i) $H \times \langle x \rangle$, where $H \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1)$ or $\mathrm{M}_p(2,1)$ and $|\langle x \rangle| = p$;

(ii) $H * \langle x \rangle$, where $H \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1,1)$ or $\mathrm{M}_p(2,2,1)$, $|\langle x \rangle| = p^2$ and $H \cap \langle x \rangle = H'$;

(iii) $\langle c, a \rangle \times \langle b^p \rangle \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,2) \times \mathrm{C}_p$.

If K is isomorphic to the group (i), then, let $\overline{L} = L/\langle x \rangle$. Thus $\overline{K} \cong H$. If K is isomorphic to the group (ii), then, let $\overline{L} = L/\mho_1(H)$. Thus $\overline{K} \cong \mathrm{M}_p(1,1,1) * \langle x \rangle$. If K is isomorphic to the group (iii), then, let $\overline{L} = L/\langle a^p, b^p \rangle$. Thus $\overline{K} \cong \mathrm{M}_p(2,1)$. In either case, we have $Z(\overline{K})$ is cyclic and $\overline{K}$ is non-cyclic. On the other hand, since $K \leq \Phi(L)$, $\overline{K} \leq \overline{\Phi(L)} = \Phi(\overline{L})$. Now it follows from Lemma 2.5 that $\overline{K}$ is cyclic. This is a contradiction. □

References

[1] L.J. An, R.F. Hu and Q.H. Zhang, Finite p-groups with a minimal non-abelian subgroup of index p (IV), *J. Algebra Appl.*, **14**(2), 1550020 (54 pages), (2015).

[2] L.J. An, L.L. Li, H.P. Qu and Q.H. Zhang, Finite p-groups with a minimal non-abelian subgroup of index p (II), *Sci. China Ser. A*, **57**(4), 737–753, (2014).

[3] Y. Berkovich, Groups of Prime Power Order Vol.1, Berlin-New York: *Walter de Gruyter*, 2008.

[4] Y. Berkovich and Z. Janko, Groups of Prime Power Order Vol.2, Berlin: *Walter de Gruyter*, 2008.

[5] Y. Berkovich and Z. Janko, Structure of finite p-groups with given subgroups, *Contemp. Math.*, **402**, 13–93, (2006).

[6] Y. Berkovich and Q.H. Zhang, On $\mathcal{A}_1$- and $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups of finite p-groups, *J. Algebra Appl.*, **13**(2), 1350095 (26 pages), (2014).

[7] H.U. Besche, B. Eick and E.A. OBrien, A millennium project: Constructing small groups, *Internat. J. Algebra Comput.*, **12**(5), 623–644, (2002).

[8] W. Bosma, J. Cannon and C. Playoust, The MAGMA algebra system I: The user language, *J. Symbolic Comput.*, **24**(3–4), 235–265, (1997).

[9] L. Rédei, Das schiefe Product in der Gruppentheorie, *Comment. Math. Helv.*, **20**, 225–267, (1947).

[10] H.P. Qu, S.S. Yang, M.Y. Xu and L.J. An, Finite p-groups with a minimal non-abelian subgroup of index p (I), *J. Algebra*, **358**, 178–188, (2012).

[11] H.P. Qu, M.Y. Xu and L.J. An, Finite p-groups with a minimal non-abelian subgroup of index p (III), *Sci. China Ser. A*, **58**(4), 763–780, (2015).

[12] H.P. Qu, L.P. Zhao, J. Gao and L.J. An, Finite p-groups with a minimal non-abelian subgroup of index p (V), *J. Algebra Appl.*, **13**(7), 1450032 (35 pages), (2014).

[13] M.Y. Xu, L.J. An and Q.H. Zhang, Finite p-groups all of whose non-abelian proper subgroups are generated by two elements, *J. Algebra*, **319**(9), 3603–3620, (2008).

[14] D.D. Zhang, H.P. Qu and Y.F. Luo, Finite p-groups G with $H' = G'$ for each $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroup H, *Algebra Colloq.*, accepted.

[15] L.H. Zhang and J.Q. Zhang, Finite p-groups all of whose $\mathcal{A}_2$-subgroups are generated by two elements, *J. Group Theory*, **24**(1), 177–193, (2021).

[16] Q.H. Zhang, X.J. Sun, L.J. An and M.Y. Xu, Finite p-groups all of whose subgroups of index p^2 are abelian, *Algebra Colloq.*, **15**(1), 167–180, (2008).

[17] Q.H. Zhang, L.B. Zhao, M.M. Li and Y.Q. Shen, Finite p-groups all of whose subgroups of index p^3 are abelian, *Commun. Math. Stat.*, **3**(1), 69–162, (2015).