

Noether's 1st theorem with local symmetries

Sinya Aoki¹

¹ *Center for Gravitational Physics and Quantum Information,
Yukawa Institute for Theoretical Physics, Kyoto University,
Kitashirakawa Oiwakecho, Sakyo-Ku, Kyoto 606-8502, Japan* *

We propose a general method to derive a conserved current associated with a global symmetry which is a part of local symmetries. While a current derived from local symmetries of a matter sector with a covariant background gauge field is not conserved in general, we show that the current associated with a special type of global transformations is on-shell conserved. We also point out that the conserved current can be modified by adding a current trivially conserved as a constraint by the Noether's 2nd theorem. We apply this derivation to a $U(1)$ gauge theory, general relativity and a non-abelian gauge theory. In general relativity, the associated conserved charge agrees with the one recently proposed from a different point of view.

PACS numbers:

1. INTRODUCTION

While the Noether's 1st theorem tells us how to define a conserved current if a theory is invariant under global continuous transformation, her 2nd theorem concludes that, if a symmetry is local, a conservation of a current is an identity or constraint rather than a consequence from a time evolution of a system[1]. The Noether's 2nd theorem is applied also to a global symmetry which is a part of some local symmetry[1–3]. This fact prevents us from defining a conserved energy properly in general relativity[1]. Indeed existing definitions of energy in general relativity correspond to conserved charges of the Noether's 2nd theorem[3]. Furthermore it also brings us a question what is a conserved electric charge in electrodynamics, which has the local $U(1)$ gauge invariance.

In this letter, we propose a general method to derive a conserved current associated with a global symmetry which is a part of a local symmetry. In Sec. 2, while a total system suffers from a Noether's 2nd theorem, a matter sector, which is invariant under the local transformation in the presence of a covariant background gauge field, is shown to have a conserved current of the Noether's 1st theorem for a special type of global symmetries. We apply the general method to three examples, a $U(1)$ gauge theory, general relativity and a non-abelian gauge theory in Sec. 3. We show that an electric charge in the $U(1)$ gauge theory is conserved due to a constant $U(1)$ transformation of the matter sector. In the case of general relativity, on the other hand, the vector for the global transformation giving a conserved current explicitly depends on the background metric in the matter Lagrangian, for example, like a Killing vector. We show that our definition of a conserved charge in general relativity is nothing but the one recently proposed by a collaboration including the present author without using global symmetries[4, 5]. A background field dependence of the global transformation plays an important role in the non-abelian gauge theory as well. In Sec. 4,

our conclusions and discussions are given. In particular, we stress that a difference between $U(1)$ gauge theory and others is a fact that local gauge transformations are field independent only in the $U(1)$ gauge theory, which is related to an absence of non-linear terms in the gauge Lagrangian.

2. NOETHER'S 1ST THEOREM IN A THEORY WITH LOCAL SYMMETRIES

We consider a theory with local symmetries, whose Lagrangian density with a parameter λ is given by

$$L_\lambda = L_G(g, g_{,\alpha}, g_{,\alpha\beta}) + \lambda \sum_n L_n(g, h_n, h_{n,\alpha}), \quad (1)$$

where $g = \{g_j\}$ is a gauge field, $h_n = \{h_n^j\}$ represents a matter field coupled to g without its derivatives, and $g_{,\alpha} := \partial_\alpha g$, etc. Here n labels a sector of matter fields such that h_n and h_m has no direct coupling between them if $n \neq m$. We write $E^n \stackrel{h_n}{\approx} 0$ or $E^G \stackrel{g}{\approx} 0$ as an equation of motion (EOM) for h_n or g , respectively, where $\stackrel{\Phi}{\approx}$ means that Φ is on-shell, while \approx means that all fields are on-shell.

We assume that L_G and L_n are scalar density under infinitesimal local transformations generated by ξ^a as $\delta_\xi x^\alpha = X_a^\alpha(x)\xi^a(x)$,

$$\begin{aligned} \delta_\xi g(x) &= G_a(g)\xi^a(x) + G_a^\beta(g)\xi_{,\beta}^a(x), \\ \delta_\xi h_n(x) &= H_{n;a}(h_n, g)\xi^a(x) + H_{n;a}^\beta(h_n, g)\xi_{,\beta}^a(x), \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

where a summation over a or β is implicitly assumed. We also define $\bar{\delta}_\xi \Phi := \delta_\xi \Phi - \Phi_{,\beta}\delta_\xi x^\beta$ with $\Phi = g, h_n$, which satisfies $\bar{\delta}_\xi \Phi_{,\alpha} = \partial_\alpha \bar{\delta}_\xi \Phi$.

2-1. Matter sector

A local symmetry of an action integral for L_n gives

$$\int d^d x \left[\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \bar{\delta}_\xi g + E^n \bar{\delta}_\xi h_n + \partial_\alpha N_n^\alpha[\xi] \right] = 0, \quad (3)$$

where

$$N_n^\alpha[\xi] := \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial h_{n,\alpha}} \bar{\delta}_\xi h_n + L_n \delta_\xi x^\alpha. \quad (4)$$

Thus the current is NOT conserved for a general ξ as

$$\partial_\alpha N_n^\alpha[\xi] = -\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \bar{\delta}_\xi g - E^n \bar{\delta}_\xi h_n, \quad (5)$$

even if the EOM of the matter is employed.

If a vector ζ_n satisfies

$$\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \bar{\delta}_{\zeta_n} g := \sum_j \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g_j} \bar{\delta}_{\zeta_n} g_j \stackrel{h_n}{\approx} 0 \quad (6)$$

for a fixed (background) g , however, $N_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is on-shell conserved as

$$\partial_\alpha N_n^\alpha[\zeta_n] \stackrel{h_n}{\approx} 0. \quad (7)$$

Thus $N_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is a conserved current of the Noether's 1st theorem for a global symmetry generated by a particular $\zeta_n(x)$. Since the EOM for g is not used here, the conservation holds for an off-shell g as well as an on-shell g , as long as g is kept fixed in L_n .

Furthermore, we rewrite (3) as

$$\int d^d x \{ O_{n;a} \xi^a + \partial_\alpha K_n^\alpha[\xi] \} = 0, \quad (8)$$

where $O_{n;a}$ is a ξ -independent function, and

$$K_n^\alpha[\xi] = N_n^\alpha[\xi] + \left(\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} G_a^\alpha + E^n H_{n;a}^\alpha \right) \xi^a. \quad (9)$$

Since the Noether's 2nd theorem for the local symmetry with arbitrary ξ^a implies $O_{n;a} = 0$ and $\partial_\alpha K_n^\alpha[\xi] = 0$ as identities[1, 3, 6], we can define another current as

$$J_n^\alpha[\xi] := N_n^\alpha[\xi] - K_n^\alpha[\xi] = - \left(\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} G_a^\alpha + E^n H_{n;a}^\alpha \right) \xi^a, \quad (10)$$

which satisfies $\partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\xi] = \partial_\alpha N_n^\alpha[\xi]$.

Under (6), the new current $J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is also conserved as

$$\partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n] = -\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \bar{\delta}_{\zeta_n} g - E^n \bar{\delta}_{\zeta_n} h_n \stackrel{h_n}{\approx} 0, \quad (11)$$

where the conserved current $J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is given by

$$J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n] = - \left(\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} G_a^\alpha + E^n H_{n;a}^\alpha \right) \zeta_n^a \stackrel{h_n}{\approx} -\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} G_a^\alpha \zeta_n^a. \quad (12)$$

While $N_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is related to the variation of the matter field in L_n , the on-shell $J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ is determined by couplings between g and h_n in L_n . Since $N_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ and $J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ are physically equivalent, we focus our attention on $J_n^\alpha[\zeta_n]$ in the remaining of this letter. Thus, eqs. (12) and (11), together with (6), are main formulae used in this letter.

2-2. Gauge sector and a total system

For the gauge part L_G , we similarly obtain

$$\partial_\alpha J_G^\alpha[\xi] = \left(-E^G + \lambda \sum_n \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \right) \bar{\delta}_\xi g, \quad (13)$$

$$J_G^\alpha[\xi] = \left(-E^G + \lambda \sum_n \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \right) G_a^\alpha \xi^a. \quad (14)$$

Therefore, if ζ_G satisfies

$$\lambda \sum_n \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \bar{\delta}_{\zeta_G} g \stackrel{g}{\approx} 0, \quad (15)$$

both $N_G^\alpha[\zeta_G]$ and $J_G^\alpha[\zeta_G]$ are on-shell conserved. Once $J_n^\alpha[\xi]$ is known for all n , however, one can easily reconstruct $J_G^\alpha[\xi]$. Thus we do not need to consider $J_G^\alpha[\xi]$ separately.

For the total system L_λ , $J_\lambda^\alpha[\xi] := J_G^\alpha[\xi] + \lambda \sum_n J_n^\alpha[\xi]$ is on-shell conserved for an *arbitrary* ξ as

$$\partial_\alpha J_\lambda^\alpha[\xi] = -E^G \bar{\delta}_\xi g - \lambda \sum_n E^n \bar{\delta}_\xi h_n \approx 0. \quad (16)$$

However the current $J_\lambda^\alpha[\xi]$ becomes on-shell trivial as

$$J_\lambda^\alpha[\xi] = - \left(E^G G_a^\alpha + \lambda \sum_n E^n H_{n;a}^\alpha \right) \xi^a \approx 0, \quad (17)$$

so that N_λ^α is on-shell equivalent to the current from the 2nd theorem as

$$N_\lambda^\alpha[\xi] \approx K_\lambda^\alpha[\xi] := K_G^\alpha[\xi] + \lambda \sum_n K_n^\alpha[\xi]. \quad (18)$$

The Noether's 2nd theorem, instead of the 1st theorem, controls conserved currents for the total system[3], which thus will not be considered anymore.

3. EXAMPLES

We apply the general method for the matter sector in the previous section to three examples.

3-1. $U(1)$ gauge theory

For a $U(1)$ gauge theory, we denote a gauge field A_μ , and a matter field ψ_{nj} , which transform under a $U(1)$

gauge transformation by $\theta(x)$ as

$$\delta_\theta A_\mu = \frac{1}{e}\theta_{,\mu}, \quad \delta_\theta \psi_{nj} = iq_{nj}\theta\psi_{nj}, \quad (19)$$

where $q_{nj} = N_{nj}e$ is a $U(1)$ charge of ψ_{nj} with an integer N_{nj} and a charge unit e .

Eq. (10) leads to

$$J_n^\alpha[\theta] = -\frac{1}{e}\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial A_\alpha}\theta = N_n^\alpha[\theta] = \sum_j iq_{nj}\frac{\partial L_n}{\psi_{nj,\alpha}}\theta, \quad (20)$$

which satisfies

$$\partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\theta] = -\frac{1}{e}\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial A_\alpha}\partial_\alpha\theta - i\sum_j E^{nj}q_{nj}\psi_{nj}\theta, \quad (21)$$

where E^{nj} is an EOM for ψ_{nj} . Therefore, for a constant $\theta(x) = \theta_0$, $J_n^\alpha[\theta_0]$ becomes the on-shell conserved current from the Noether's 1st theorem for a global $U(1)$ symmetry generated by the constant θ_0 , and is equal to (a part of) the current in the EOM for A_μ as

$$\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial A_\mu} - \partial_\alpha \left(\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial A_{\mu,\alpha}} \right) = \lambda e \sum_n J_n^\mu[\theta_0 = 1]. \quad (22)$$

A fact that a global transformation generated by θ_0 is independent of a gauge field A_μ is a reason why a conserved electric charge can be easily defined in electrodynamics at the classical level, and this property of the charge conservation can be faithfully carried over to QED. Note that the electric charge is separately conserved in each n , so that there appears no charge exchange between different sectors labeled by n .

3-2. General relativity

Under a general coordinate transformation by $\delta_\xi x^\alpha = \xi^\alpha$, fields transform as

$$\begin{aligned} \delta_\xi g_{\mu\nu} &= \bar{\delta}_\xi g_{\mu\nu} + g_{\mu\nu,\alpha}\xi^\alpha, \quad \bar{\delta}_\xi g_{\mu\nu} = -(\nabla_\mu \xi_\nu + \nabla_\nu \xi_\mu), \\ \delta_\xi \phi_n &= H_n^\alpha{}_\beta \xi_\alpha^\beta. \end{aligned} \quad (23)$$

A (k, l) tensor $T^A{}_B := T^{a_1 \dots a_k}{}_{b_1 \dots b_l}$ transforms as

$$\delta_\xi T^A{}_B = -\mathcal{L}_\xi T^A{}_B + T^A{}_{B,\alpha}\xi^\alpha, \quad (24)$$

where \mathcal{L}_ξ is the Lie derivative with the vector ξ .

For a matter sector n , eqs. (10) and (11) read

$$\begin{aligned} J_n^\alpha[\xi] &= (2\mathcal{T}_n^\alpha{}_\beta - E^n H_n^\alpha{}_\beta)\xi^\beta \stackrel{\phi_n}{\approx} 2\mathcal{T}_n^{\alpha\beta}\xi_\beta, \\ \partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\xi] &= \mathcal{T}_n^{\alpha\beta}\bar{\delta}_\xi g_{\alpha\beta} - E^n \bar{\delta}_\xi \phi_n \stackrel{\phi_n}{\approx} \mathcal{T}_n^{\alpha\beta}\bar{\delta}_\xi g_{\alpha\beta}, \end{aligned} \quad (25)$$

where E^n is the EOM for the matter ϕ_n , and

$$\mathcal{T}_n^{\alpha\beta} = \sqrt{-g}T_n^{\alpha\beta} := \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g_{\alpha\beta}} \quad (26)$$

is an symmetric energy momentum tensor (density), which appears in the EOM for $g_{\mu\nu}$ as

$$\begin{aligned} E^{g_{\mu\nu}} &:= \frac{\partial L_G}{\partial g_{\mu\nu}} - \partial_\alpha \left(\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial g_{\mu\nu,\alpha}} \right) + \partial_\alpha \partial_\beta \left(\frac{\partial L_G}{\partial g_{\mu\nu,\alpha\beta}} \right) \\ &+ \lambda \sum_n \mathcal{T}_n^{\mu\nu} \stackrel{g_{\mu\nu}}{\approx} 0. \end{aligned} \quad (27)$$

On the other hand, $N_n^\alpha[\xi]$ is consist of the canonical energy momentum tensor, which becomes the symmetric one by subtracting the trivially conserved term $K_n^\alpha[\xi]$.

If a vector ζ^n satisfies

$$\mathcal{T}_n^{\mu\nu}(\nabla_\mu \zeta_\nu^n + \nabla_\nu \zeta_\mu^n) \stackrel{\phi_n}{\approx} 0, \quad (28)$$

$J_n^\alpha[\zeta^n] \stackrel{\phi_n}{\approx} 2\mathcal{T}_n^{\alpha\beta}\zeta_\beta^n$ is an on-shell conserved current, and

$$Q_n[\zeta^n] = 2 \int_\Sigma d\Sigma_\alpha T_n^{\alpha\beta} \zeta_\beta^n, \quad (29)$$

gives a conserved charge of the Noether's 1st theorem for the global symmetry generated by the vector $\zeta^n(x)$ in general relativity with a symmetric energy momentum tensor $T_n^{\alpha\beta}$ for the matter sector n . The integration is performed over a $d-1$ dimensional space-like hyper-surface Σ with the hyper-surface element $d\Sigma_\alpha$, and appropriate boundary conditions are assumed to show the conservation of $Q_n[\zeta^n]$. The condition (28) for the vector ζ^n and the corresponding conserved charge (29) in general relativity are identical to those previously proposed from a completely different argument[4, 5]. Note that $Q_n[\zeta^n]$ is invariant under general coordinate transformations.

If a metric $g_{\mu\nu}$ allows a Killing vector ξ_K , (28) is satisfied by ξ_K , and thus $Q_n[\xi_K]$ is a conserved charge associated with the isometry of $g_{\mu\nu}$ [3, 4]. In this case, ξ_K depends on the metric $g_{\mu\nu}$ only but is independent of matter fields ϕ_n for all n , so that the symmetry generated by ξ_K is a standard type of global symmetries for all matter sectors on the curved spacetime determined by $g_{\mu\nu}$. In particular, if the Killing vector ξ_{K_0} is stationary, $\mathcal{E}_n := Q_n[\xi_{K_0}]$ defines "energy" for the sector n in general relativity[3, 4], which is separately conserved in each sector. Since the $\lambda \rightarrow 0$ limit implies a solution to (27) with zero cosmological constant to be a Minkowski metric, \mathcal{E}_n with an appropriately normalized ξ_{K_0} becomes the standard definition of energy in the flat spacetime as

$$\lim_{\lambda \rightarrow 0} \mathcal{E}_n = \int_{x^0 = \text{fixed}} (d^{d-1}x)_0 T^{00}. \quad (30)$$

Even though a metric $g_{\mu\nu}$ has no Killing vector, we can find a vector ζ^n which satisfies (28)[5], so that (29) defines an associated conserved charge, which is separately conserved in each sector. If ζ^n is time-like, $Q_n[\zeta^n]$ defines energy or its generalization, which may be identified as "entropy" in some cases in general relativity[5]. Note that $\zeta^n \neq \zeta^m$ in general if $n \neq m$.

3-3. Non-abelian gauge theory

For a non-abelian gauge theory, the local gauge transformation by $\theta = \theta^a t_a$ generates

$$\begin{aligned}\delta_\theta A_\mu &= i[\theta, A_\mu] + \frac{1}{g_s} \partial_\mu \theta, \quad A_\mu := A_\mu^a t_a \\ \delta_\theta \psi_{nj} &= i\theta^a t_a^{R_{nj}} \psi_{nj},\end{aligned}\quad (31)$$

where g_s is a coupling constant, t_a is a generator in the fundamental representation of the gauge group with an implicit summation over a , while $t_a^{R_{nj}}$ is a generator in an irreducible representation R_{nj} for a matter j in a sector n , so that $t_a^{R_{nj}}$ and ψ_{nj} implicitly have gauge indices such that $(t_a^{R_{nj}})^A_B$ and $(\psi_{nj})^A$, respectively, where A, B run from 1 to $\dim(R_{nj})$.

For a matter sector n , (10) and (11) imply

$$J_n^\alpha[\theta] := -\frac{1}{g_s} \text{tr}(T_n^\alpha \theta), \quad (T_n^\alpha)^B_A := \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial (A_\alpha)^A_B}, \quad (32)$$

$$\partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\theta] = -\text{tr}(T_n^\alpha \delta_\theta A_\alpha) - \sum_j (E^{nj} \delta_\theta \psi_{nj}), \quad (33)$$

where E^{nj} is an EOM for ψ_{nj} , and T_n^α appears in an EOM for A_μ as $\lambda \sum_n T_n^\mu$.

If $\omega_n = \omega_n^a t_a$ satisfies

$$\text{tr}(T_n^\alpha \delta_{\omega_n} A_\alpha) = \text{tr} T_n^\alpha \left\{ i[\omega_n, A_\alpha] + \frac{1}{g_s} \partial_\alpha \omega_n \right\} = 0, \quad (34)$$

$J_n^\alpha[\omega_n]$ becomes a conserved current as

$$\partial_\alpha J_n^\alpha[\omega_n] \stackrel{\psi_n}{\approx} 0. \quad (35)$$

We then define a conserved non-abelian charge of the Noether's 1st theorem as

$$Q_n[\omega_n] = \int_{x^0=\text{fix}} (d^{d-1}x)_0 J_n^0[\omega_n], \quad (36)$$

which is invariant under the gauge transformation Ω by

$$A'_\mu = \Omega A_\mu \Omega^\dagger - \frac{1}{ig_s} \Omega \partial_\mu \Omega^\dagger, \quad \omega'_n = \Omega \omega_n \Omega^\dagger, \quad (37)$$

since T_n^α and $\delta_{\omega_n} A_\alpha$ are covariant as

$$(T_n^\alpha)' = \Omega T_n^\alpha \Omega^\dagger, \quad (38)$$

$$\delta_{\omega'_n} A'_\alpha = i[\omega'_n, A'_\alpha] + \frac{1}{g_s} \partial_\alpha \omega'_n = \Omega (\delta_{\omega_n} A_\alpha) \Omega^\dagger, \quad (39)$$

so that $J_n^\alpha[\omega_n]$ and the condition (34) are gauge invariant.

Note again that the non-abelian gauge charge is separately conserved in each sector n , so that there appears no non-abelian charge exchange among different sectors.

4. CONCLUSIONS AND DISCUSSIONS

In this letter, we have proposed the general method to define the conserved current/charge for the global symmetry of the matter theory in the presence of local symmetries, which is then applied to the $U(1)$ gauge theory, general relativity, and the non-abelian gauge theory. We have shown that the conserved electric charge in the electrodynamics can be interpreted as this type of the conserved charge for the constant $U(1)$ transformation. It also leads to a new type of conserved charges in general relativity and the non-abelian gauge theory. Indeed, the symmetric argument in our proposal theoretically explains an existence of a new conserved charge in general relativity recently proposed by different considerations[4, 5].

In the standard view, the electric field does not carry an electric charge because of an absence of non-linear terms, while the gravitational field or the gluon carries energy or color, respectively, due to non-linear interactions. In our approach, however, an absence or a presence of non-linear terms in the theory makes gauge transformations field independent or dependent, respectively, so that the global transformation which leads to the conservation is constant and field independent for the $U(1)$ theory but field dependent for others. Regardless of this difference, we stress that the conserved charge in our method is carried only by matter fields for all cases.

We finally point out that our method can be extended to more general cases that the matter sector contains derivatives of gauge fields. For example, in the case that $L_n = L_n(g, g_\alpha, h_n, h_{n,\alpha})$, (12), (11) and (6) still hold under a replacement that

$$\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} \rightarrow \frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g} - \partial_\beta \left(\frac{\partial L_n}{\partial g_{,\beta}} \right). \quad (40)$$

Acknowledgement

This work is supported in part by the Grant-in-Aid of the Japanese Ministry of Education, Sciences and Technology, Sports and Culture (MEXT) for Scientific Research (Nos. JP22H00129). The author thanks Prof. Yoshimasa Hidaka and Mr. Takumi Hayashi for useful discussions.

* Electronic address: saoki@yukawa.kyoto-u.ac.jp
[1] E. Noether, *Gott. Nachr.* **1918** (1918), 235-257 [arXiv:physics/0503066 [physics]].

- [2] A. Deriglazov, Sect. 8.8.2 in “Classical Mechanics: Hamiltonian and Lagrangian Formalism,” (doi:10.1007/978-3-319-44147-4).
- [3] S. Aoki and T. Onogi, “Conserved non-Noether charge in general relativity: Physical definition vs. Noether’s 2nd theorem,” [arXiv:2201.09557 [hep-th]].
- [4] S. Aoki, T. Onogi and S. Yokoyama, *Int. J. Mod. Phys. A* **36** (2021) no.10, 2150098 [arXiv:2005.13233 [gr-qc]].
- [5] S. Aoki, T. Onogi and S. Yokoyama, *Int. J. Mod. Phys. A* **36** (2021) no., 2150201 [arXiv:2010.07660 [gr-qc]].
- [6] R. Utiyama, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* **72** (1984), 83