The Chandra view of the 3C/FR I sample of low lum inosity radio-galaxies

Barbara Balm averde¹, A lessandro Capetti², and Paola G randi³

- ¹ D ipartim ento di Fisica G enerale, U niversita di Torino, V ia P G iuria 1, I-10125 Torino, Italy em ail: balmaverde@ph.unito.it
- ² INAF O sservatorio A stronom ico di Torino, via O sservatorio 20, I-10025 P ino Torinese, Italy e-m ail: capetti@to.astro.it
- ³ IN AF Istituto di Astro sica Spaziale e Fisica Cosmica, Via Gobetti 101, I-40129 Bologna, Italy e-mail:grandi@bo.iasf.cnr.it

Abstract.We present results from Chandra observations of the 3C/FR I sample of low lum inosity radio-galaxies. We detected a power-law nuclear component in 12 objects out of the 18 with available data. In 4 galaxies we detected nuclear X -ray absorption at a level of N_H (0.2 6) 10^{22} cm⁻².X -ray absorbed sources are associated with the presence of highly inclined dusty disks (or dust lam ents projected onto the nuclei) seen in the HST in ages. This suggests the existence of a attened X -ray absorber, but of much lower optical depth than in classical obscuring tori.We thus have an un-obstructed view toward most FR I nuclei while absorption plays only a marginal role in the remaining objects.

Three pieces of evidence support an interpretation for a jet origin for the X -ray cores: i) the presence of strong correlations between the nuclear lum inosities in the radio, optical and X -ray bands, extending over 4 orders of m agnitude and with a much sm aller dispersion (0.3 dex) when com pared to sim ilar trends found for other classes of AGNs, pointing to a common origin for the emission in the three bands; ii) the close sim ilarity of the broad-band spectral indices with the sub-class of BL Lac objects sharing the same range of extended radio-lum inosity, in accord with the FR I/BL Lacs uni ed model; iii) the presence of a common lum inosity evolution of spectral indices in both FR I and BL Lacs.

The low lum inosities of the X-ray nuclei, regardless of their origin, strengthens the interpretation of low e ciency accretion in low lum inosity radio-galaxies.

Key words.galaxies : active { galaxies : BL Lacertae ob jects { galaxies : nuclei { galaxies : jets

1. Introduction

By exploring the properties of low lum inosity radiogalaxies (LLRG) it is possible to extend the study of active galactic nuclei (AGN), and in particular of the radiobud sub-population, toward the lowest level of nuclear lum inosity. This o ers the opportunity to improve our understanding of the mechanism of accretion onto superm assive black holes and of their radiative manifestations. In this respect, it is important to note that LLRG not only represent the bulk of radio-bud active galaxies, due to the steepness of their lum inosity function, but also a substantial fraction of the overall galaxies population. In fact LLRG are associated to a fraction as high as 40 % of all bright elliptical and lenticular galaxies (Sadler et al. 1989; Auriem m a et al. 1977). Thus the presence of a low power radio-galaxy represents by far the most common manifestation of nuclear activity in early type galaxies.

Low lum inosity AGN (LLAGN) also represent a link between the high lum inosity AGN and the population of quiescent galaxies, as it is now widely recognized that most (if not all) galaxies host a super-m assive black-hole (e.g. K orm endy & R ichstone 1995). The com parison of the different m anifestations of nuclear activity across the largest possible range of lum inosity is then a crucial step to unveil the connections (and the diversities) between active and non-active galaxies.

Unfortunately, the study of LLRG has been signi cantly ham pered by the contam ination from host galaxy em ission which, in most observing bands, dom inates the em ission from the AGN. To constrain the physical processes at work in these objects it is clearly necessary to disentangle the AGN and host's contributions via spectral decom position or high resolution in aging. In the last few years, thanks in particular to the Hubble Space Telescope (HST) this has becom e routinely possible.

Send o print requests to: B. Balm averde

An example of the insights that can be obtained following this approach com es from the results derived from the analysis of broad-band HST im aging of a sample of LLRG (Chiaberge et al. 1999). In the majority of the targets, HST in ages revealed the presence of unresolved opticalnuclei. Fluxes and lum inosities of these sources show a tight correlation with the radio cores, extending over four orders of m agnitude. This has been interpreted as being due to a comm on non-therm alem ission process in the radio and optical band, i.e. that we are seeing the optical em ission from the base of a relativistic jet. The low lum inosity of LLRG optical nuclei, and the possible dom in ance of the em ission related to out- owing material, indicates a low level of accretion and/or a low radiative e ciency with respect to classical, more lum inous AGN. The high fraction (85%) of objects with detected optical nuclear sources suggests a general lack of obscuring m olecular tori, a further distinction with respect to other classes of AGN. The tenuous torus structure, when considered together with the low accretion rate, the low mass of the compact em ission line regions $(10 - 10^3 M)$ and the lim its to the mass of the Broad Line Region ($M_{BLR} < 10^{2} M$), indicates that a general paucity of gas in the innerm ost regions of LLRG emerges as the main characterizing difference from more powerfulAGN (Capettiet al. 2005).

The advent of Chandra provides us with the unique opportunity to extend the study of LLRG to the X-ray band since its high spatial resolution enables us to isolate any low power nuclear source associated to LLRG. Furtherm ore, with respect to the optical data, the spectral capabilities of C handra allow us to study directly the spectral behaviour of the X -ray nuclei. This can be used to quantify the e ects of local absorption as well as the slope of their high energy emission as to better constrain the em ission processes at work in these sources, particularly when combined in a multi-wavelength analysis using also optical and radio observations. This approach was already followed by several authors in the past (e.g. Capetti et al. 2000b; Hardcastle & Worrall 2000; Trussoniet al. 2003; Hardcastle et al. 2003) but clearly, the superior capabilities of Chandra warrant to re-explore this issue in much greater depth.

Here we present results obtained from the analysis of Chandra data for the sam ple of LLRG drawn from the 3C catalogue of radio-sources (Bennett 1962), more specifically those with a morphological classi cation as FR I (Fanaro & Riley 1974). Considering LLRG from the 3C sam ple, the sam e studied by Chiaberge et al. (1999) represents an obvious choice. It is the best studied sample of radio-loud galaxies in existence with a vast suite of ground and spaced based observations for comparison at essentially all accessible wavelengths. O ther samples of LLRG have been considered in the literature, but, not surprisingly, the coverage provided by Chandra observations for these samples is severely incomplete. For example, only about 10 % of B2 sam ple of LLRG (Colla et al. 1975) has been observed with Chandra (to be compared to the 55 % for the 3C /FR I sam ple), and the analysis is further

obstructed by the unknown selection biases introduced in the choice of the individual targets. Sim ilarly we preferred to focus on the C handra data alone, to provide the highest possible level of uniform ity in the analysis.

The paper is organized as follows: in Sec. 2 we present the observations and the data reduction that lead to the results described in Sec. 3 and in particular to the detection of X -ray nuclei in most FR I. In Sec. 4 we explore the e ects of the nuclear X -ray absorption, by also relating it to the presence of dust features seen in the HST in ages. The origin of the X -ray nuclei found in LLRG is explored in Sec. 5. The results are discussed and summarized in Sec. 6.

W e adopted $H_o = 75 \text{ km s}^1 \text{ M pc}^1$ and $q_0 = 0.5$.

2. Chandra data analysis

duce the pile-up e ect.

We selected the same sample considered by Chiaberge et al. (1999) form ed by the 33 radio-sources from the 3CR catalogue with FR Im orphology¹.

We searched for Chandra observations available in the public archive up to January 2005 and we found data for 18 objects (see Table 1). All observations we considered were made using the Advanced CCD Imaging Spectrom eter (ACIS-I and ACIS-S) without any transmission grating in place. When more than one observation was available, we generally choose the one with the longer exposure times; only for 3C 338 two observations of approximately equal length were present and they were tted simultaneously. For the brightest objects instead we choose the observation with the lowest time frame, to re-

We reduced all the data using the C handra data analysis C IAO v3.0.2, with the CALDB version 2.25. Therefore, to correct for the QE degradation we create a new ARF (e ective area les) using the new le 'acisD 1999-08-13contam N 0003. ts' released with the CALDB version 2.26 (as recommended by the \AC IS M odeling and A nalysis Team ").We reprocessed all the data from level 1 to level 2, using the C IAO tool acis.process_event with all parameters restored to the default values, i.e. applying the pixels and PHA randomization. The new event lewere ltered selecting a standard set of ASCA grades (02346) and rejecting time interval of high background levels.

O ur aim is the study of the X-ray emission associated to the AGN.For this reason we choose as extracting region a circle of $1^{\circ}2$ radius centered on the emission peak (for the fainter nuclei we checked their position using HST or VLA observation) and as background region a source-centered annulus with radii between $1^{\circ}2$ $2^{\circ}5.$ W hen X-ray emission from an extended jet is present, we excluded from the background region the corresponding angular portion. W ith this strategy we aim at reducing as much as possible

¹ The only addition is 3C 189, which is an FR I part of the 3C sam ple (Edge et al. 1959) but not of its revised version 3CR (Bennett 1962).

Table 1. Log of the observation.

N am e	0 bs Id	Inst	Exp tim e	Fram e tim e
			[ks]	[s]
3C 028	3233	ACIS/I	50.38	3.1
3C 031	2147	ACIS/S	44.98	3.2
3C 066B	828	ACIS/S	45.17	1.5
3C 075	4181	ACIS/I	21.78	3.2
3C 078	3128	ACIS/S	5.23	3.1
3C 083.1	3237	ACIS/S	95.14	3.1
3C 084	3404	ACIS/S	5.86	0.4
3C 189	858	ACIS/S	8.26	0.8
3C 270	834	ACIS/S	35.18	1.8
3C 272.1	803	ACIS/S	28.85	3.2
3C 274	1808	ACIS/S	14.17	0.4
3C 296	3968	ACIS/S	50.08	3.2
3C 317	890	ACIS/S	37.23	3.2
3C 338	497	ACIS/S	19.72	3.2
	498	ACIS/S	19.16	3.2
3C 346	3129	ACIS/S	46.69	0.8
3C 348	1625	ACIS/S	15.00	3.2
3C 438	3967	ACIS/S	47.9	3.1
3C 449	4057	ACIS/S	29.56	3.2

the di use therm alX -ray component, as to maxim ize the nuclear contribution.

A possible drawback of this approach, i.e. a sm all extraction region, is related to the variations of the Point Spread Function with energy. These might cause the inclusion of a varying fraction of the nuclear emission in our aperture in the di erent bands. However, we tested that the PSF e ects are negligible. In particular the fraction of nuclear counts falling in the background annulus decreases 8% in the 0.5-2 keV band to 2% in the only from 2-5 keV band. This has a marginal impact on the derived lum inosities and spectral indices.

The spectra were modeled using XSPEC version 11.3.0.W e used only events with energy > 0:5 keV, where the calibration is best known and the background contribution is negligible. We rebinned the spectrum to a minimum of 25 countsperbin in order to ensure the applicability of the ² statistics. We modeled all the spectra with a superposition of a therm al and a power-law (non-therm al) com ponent. For the therm al com ponent the m etal abundances were xed to 0.5 Fabbiano 1989) and the absorption was set to the galactic value; for the power-law com ponent we allowed for the presence of local absorption. The relative complexity of the model prevents us from obtaining a robust estim ate of all free param eters for the sources with a low count rate. M ore quantitatively, we experim ented that only for the twelve objects for which the spectrum can be regrouped in at least 15 channels, as to leave us with $\ >$ 10 degree of freedom , corresponding to approximately 400 total net counts, the t is su ciently constrained. In the six sources below this threshold we set upper lim its for the non-therm al uxes thing their spectra using only a power-law model (with column density xed at the galactic level). We initially xed the power also directly attested by the in age.

law index to 2 but, to be conservative, we then look for the value of G amm a in the range 1.5 - 2.5 corresponding to the largest ux value.

This is a quite conservative approach but our choice it is supported by the fact that in these objects we cannot accurately disentangle the contribution of the therm aland non-therm alcom ponents; a less cautious analysis is prone to lead to highly uncertain estimates in particular of the AGN X-ray ux. For the 3 brightest sources (3C 78, 3C 84 and 3C 274) we included the correction for the e ects of the pile-up applying the algorithm proposed by D avis (2001). The results of the tare given in Table 2.

For the 12 objects in which we perform ed a two com ponents t, we tested with an F-test that the presence of both a therm alcom ponent and non-therm alalways corresponded to an improvement of the tata level > 95%.

Errors and upper lim its are quoted at 90% con dence for one parameter of interest ($^2 = 2.71$), with the exception of N_{μ}^{Z} and , well known to be strongly coupled, for which we used a 90% con dence level for two parameters of interest ($^2 = 4.61$).

Donato et al. (2004) considered X-ray observations of a sam ple of low lum inosity radio-galaxies, largely overlapping with the objects discussed here. With the exception of 3C 338, 3C 348 and 3C 449, which we more conservatively de ned as upper limits, there is a complete agreem ent between the two lists of detected X -ray nuclei. A lso the tem perature of the therm alcom ponent as well as the power-law spectral index are in very good accord when they are measured from Chandra data. Considering the values of N $_{\rm H}^{\rm Z}$, since we treated more conservatively the errors on this quantity, we obtained upper lim its in a few objects which D onato et al. considered as detection of localabsorption.

3.Results

Before we proceed to discuss our results, it is in portant to note that, since archival data are available for a fraction of about half of the original sam ple of 3C /FR I, it is possible that we are not considering an unbiased sub-sample. We therefore com pared various param eters (e.g. redshift, core and total radio-power) for the 3C /FR I sample as a whole and for our sub-sam ple. A pplying a K olm ogorov-Sm imov test we found that their distributions are consistent with being drawn from the same population with probability always larger than 60 %. Only considering the fraction of optically nucleated galaxies in the Chandra sub-sample is slightly larger, being 83% to be compared to a 70 % for the whole sample (Chiaberge et al. 1999). O verall, it

Protassov et al. (2002) suggested that it might inappropriate to use the F-test to test an added spectral component. However, because at the moment there is not known any other simple alternative method, we decided in any case to apply the F-test, above all considering that the presence of an extended them alem ission and a point-like nuclear source are

Table 2. Results of the t: (1) source name, (2) Galactic hydrogen column density $[10^{2} \text{ cm}^{2}]$, (3) local hydrogen column density $[10^{22} \text{ cm}^2]$, (4) power-law photon index , (5) temperature of the therm al component [keV], (6) observed ux of the therm alcom ponent corrected for G alactic absorption [erg cm 2 s 1], (7) non-therm alnuclear ux (corrected for absorption) at 1 keV [erg cm 2 s 1], (8) 2 /degrees of freedom .W hen the number of d.o.f. was sm aller than 10, no twasperformed.*marks sources a ected by pile-up and corrected with the Davies's algorithm.

N am e	N _H ;gal	N _H		ΚT	F $_{\rm x;ther}$ (0.5–5 keV)	F _{x;nuc} (1 keV)	² =dof
3C 028	0.05	{	{	{	{	< 1 : 5 E-14	{/0
3C 031	0.05	< 0:3	$1:4^{+0:3}_{0:4}$	0:6 ^{+ 0:1}	3:3 ^{+ 0:8} E-14	1:9 ^{+1:0} E-14	29:4=24
3C 066B	0.09	< 0:7	2:4 ^{+ 0:7}	0:3 ^{+ 0:1}	6:2 ^{+1:4} E-14	1:2 ^{+ 0:8} E-13	30 : 3=37
3C 075	0.09	{	{	{	{	< 3 : 6 E-14	{/2
3C 078	0.10	< 0:4	$22^{+0:4}_{0:3}$	$02^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	1:6 ^{+ 0:8} E-13	7:4 ^{+ 4:6} E-13	39 : 4=27
3C 083.1	0.15	2:5 ^{+0:8}	$22^{+0:9}_{0:5}$	$0:5^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	2:7 ^{+ 0:7} _{0:3} E-14	6:3 ^{15:2} E-14	7.19/19
3C 084	0.15	< 0:1	$1:6^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$0:3^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$7:6^{+3:5}_{1:6} E-13$	2 : 8 ^{+ 0:5} E-12	150:1=161
3C 189	0.05	< 0:2	$2:1^{+0:6}_{0:4}$	$0:3^{+0:2}_{0:1}$	$4:5^{+5:4}_{3:4} E-14$	1:3 ^{+ 0:5} E-13	22:7=16
3C 270	0.01	5:7 ^{+ 3:2} 3:4	$0:8^{+0:7}_{0:4}$	$0:5^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$6:6^{+0:7}_{0:6} E - 14$	8:4 ^{13:3} E-14	54.15/50
3C 272.1	0.02	$02^{+0:3}_{0:1}$	$2:1^{+0:2}_{0:3}$	$0:5^{+0:3}_{0:2}$	$1:0^{+1:3}_{0:7} E - 14$	5:1 ^{+ 3:7} E-14	17 : 9=23
3C 274	0.02	< 0:03	$23^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$0.7^{+0.1}_{0.1}$	$12^{+0.4}_{0.4}$ E-13	$72^{+0.9}_{0.5}$ E-13	118 : 6=98
3C 296	0.02	1:0 ^{0:6}	$1:6^{+0:5}_{0:4}$	$0:5^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$32^{+0:3}_{0:4}$ E-14	6:5 ^{+3:4} 2:0 E-14	27:81=33
3C 317	0.03	< 0:1	$2:0^{+0:2}_{0:2}$	$02^{+0.2}_{0.1}$	1:1 ^{+ 0:8} E-14	6:3 ^{+0:9} E-14	33.6/38
3C 338	0.01	{	{	{	{	< 3:3 E-14	{/8
3C 346	0.05	< 0:1	$1:7^{+0:1}_{0:1}$	$0:6^{+0:6}_{0:3}$	1:5 ^{+ 1:1} E-14	1:5 ^{+ 0:1} E-13	92.1/89
3C 348	0.06	{	{	}	{	< 3:1 E-14	{/0
3C 438	0.21	{	{	{	{	< 1:5 E-14	{/0
3C 449	0.11	{	{	{	{	< 2:1 E-14	{ /0

Table 3. Sum mary of radio, optical and X-ray data of the sam ple: (1) source name, (2) redshift of the galaxy, (3) nuclear radio ux at 5 GHz [m Jy], (4) nuclear radio lum inosity at 5 GHz [erg s¹], (5) extended radio lum inosity at 178 M H z [erg s¹], (6) optical nuclear lum inosity at 5500 A [erg s¹], (7) unabsorbed X -ray nuclear ux (0.5-5 keV) [erg cm² s¹], (8) X-ray nuclear lum inosity (0.5-5 keV) corrected for absorption [erg s¹]. Note: Inform ation about redshift, radio core ux, extended radio em ission, optical lum inosities are from Chiaberge et al. (1999). We adopt an optical spectral index $_{0} = 1$.

N am e	Redshift	F _c (5 G H z)	L _c (5 G H z)	L _t (178 M H z)	Lo	F_x (0.5–5 keV)	${\tt L}_{\tt x}$ (0.5–5 keV)
3C 028	0.1952	< 0.2	< 7.3 E 38	2.1 E 42	<13E41	< 3:4 E-14	< 2:5 E 42
3C 031	0.0169	92.0	2.5 E 39	1.6 E40	4.5 E40	6:2 ^{+ 3:1} E-14	$3:4^{+0:2}_{0:1} E 40$
3C 066B	0.0215	182.0	8.0 E 39	3.8 E 40	2.4 E 41	2:4 ^{+ 1:6} E-13	$2:1^{+0:1}_{0:1} E41$
3C 075	0.0232	39.0	2.0 E 39	1.9 E 40	{	< 8:3 E-14	< 8:5 E40
3C 078	0.0288	964.0	7.6 E40	5.5 E 40	2.1 E 42	8:8 ^{+1:5} E-13	1:4 ^{+ 0:1} E 42
3C 083.1	0.0251	21.0	13E39	5.7 E40	9.3 E 39	1:3 ^{+ 3:1} E-13	$1:6^{0:3}_{0:1} E41$
3C 084	0.0176	42370.0	12E42	4.2 e40	4.9 E 42	6:1 ^{+ 0:8} E-12	3:6 ^{+ 0:1} E 42
3C 189	0.043	195	3.4 E40	7.1 E 40	6.2 E 41	2:8 ^{+1:1} E-13	$9:9^{+0:1}_{0:1} E41$
3C 270	0.0074	308.0	1.6 E 39	1.0 E40	2 . 9 E 39	$4:4^{+6:9}_{2:9} E - 13$	$4:6^{+0:8}_{0:3} E40$
3C 272.1	0.0037	180.0	2.3 E 38	9.0 E 38	8.5 E 39	1:5 ^{+ 0:8} E-13	$3:9^{+0:3}_{0:1} E 39$
3C 274	0.0037	4000.0	5.2 E 39	4.9 E 40	5.6 E40	1:3 ^{+ 0:2} E-12	$3:4^{+0:1}_{0:1} E 40$
3C 296	0.0237	77.0	4.1 E 39	2.5 E 40	2.0 E 40	1:8 ^{+1:0} E-13	$1:9^{+0:1}_{0:1} E41$
3C 317	0.0342	391.0	4.4 E40	1.9 E 41	1,2 E 41	1:5 ^{+ 0:2} E-13	$33^{+0.1}_{0.1} E41$
3C 338	0.0303	105.0	92E39	1.4 E 41	9.7 E40	< 7:6 E-14	< 1:3 E 41
3C 346	0.1620	220.0	5.5 E 41	9.7 E41	6.4 E 42	$4:0^{+0:2}_{0:3} E - 13$	$2:0^{+0:1}_{0:1} E 43$
3C 348	0.1540	10.	23E40	2.8 E 43	2.0 E 41	< 7:3 E-14	< 3:3 E 42
3C 438	0.2900	17.0	1.4 E 41	1.3 E 43	< 3.5 E 41	< 3 : 4 E-14	< 5 : 4 E 42
3C 449	0.0181	37.0	1.1 E 39	13E40	6.2 E 40	< 4:8 E-14	< 3:0 E40

appears that the galaxies studied here are well represen- to a higher fraction of objects with classical core-jets FR I tative of the entire 3C /FR I sample. On the other hand, morphology. several galaxies with som ew hat peculiar radio-m orphology are excluded, (e.g. the fat double 3C 314.1, the compact radio-source associated to 3C 293, the X-shaped 3C 305, or the complex radio-source in 3C 433) possibly leading



F ig.1.H istogram of intrinsic absorption in Log N $_{\rm H}^{\rm z}$. The black rectangles represent detections, while the white ones represent upper limits (at 90% con dence level).

3.1. Local absorption in X-ray nuclei

We obtained a statistically signi cant estimate for the local column density in four objects (namely 3C 83.1, 3C 270, 3C 272.1 and 3C 296) with values N $_{\rm H}^{\rm z}$ 0.2 6 10^{22} cm 2 . In the other cases (8/12) we nd an upper limit to N $_{\rm H}^{\rm z}$ (Table2) ranging from 0.03 10^{22} cm 2 to 0.7 10^{22} cm 2 . In Fig.1 we present a histogram of the values of the intrinsic absorption: the white rectangles represent upper limits, while the black ones are the four detections.

3.2. Relations between radio, optical and X-ray em ission.

In Fig. 2 (top left panel) we compare the nuclear uses in the radio and X-ray bands. A strong correlation is present: the generalized (including the presence of upper limits) Spearm an rank correlation coe cient = 0.88corresponding to a probability that the correlation is not present of P = 0.001.

The best linear ts were derived as the bisectrix of the ts using the two quantities as independent variables following the suggestion by Isobe et al. (1990) that this is preferable for problem s needing symmetrical treatment of the variables. The presence of upper limits in the independent variable suggests to take advantage of the methods of survival analysis proposed by e.g. Schmitt (1985). However, the draw backs discussed by Sadler et al. (1989) and, in our speci c case, also the non-random distribution of upper limits, disfavour this approach. We therefore preferred to exclude upper limits from the linear regression

Table 4. Correlations sum m ary

Var.A	Var.B	_{ав} (Р)	AB;z	Slope	m s
Fx	Fr	0.88 (0.001)	{	0.62 0.14	0.27
L_{x}	Lr	0.72 (0.003)	0.67	0.91 0.12	0.39
L_{x}	$L_r corr$	0.79 (0.003)	0.77	0.99 0.11	0.33
L_{x}	Lo	0.71 (0.004)	0.67	0.91 0.16	0.52
Lx	$L_{\circ} \infty rr$	0.86 (0.002)	0.85	1.16 0.09	0.23
Lo	Lr	0.79 (0.002)	0.75	0.98 0.11	0.39
Lo	L_{r} corr	0.79 (0.005)	0.76	0.82 0.11	0.32

 $_{A\,B}$ is the generalized Spearm an's correlation coe cient (com – puted including upper lim its) and in parenthesys the probability that there is no correlation between the variables. $_{A\,B\,;z}$ is the partial rank coe cient having excluded the common dependence of lum inosities A and B from redshift. The 3 X -ray absorbed nuclei are excluded in the analysism arked with 'corr'.

analysis. N onetheless we note that, a posteriori, 1) the objects with undetected nuclear component in the X-ray are consistent with the correlation de ned by the detections only; 2) the application of the Schm idt m ethods provides correlation slopes that agree, within the errors, with our estim ates.

A similarly tight correlation between radio and X-ray nuclear emission is present also considering lum inosities, with = 0.72 corresponding to a probability P = 0.003 (see Fig.2, top right panel); it extends over 4 orders of m agnitude, with a slope of m = 0.91 0.12 and a dispersion of 0.39 dex (see Table 4 for a sum mary of the statistical analysis). We tested the possible in uence of redshift in driving this correlation (both quantities depend on z^2) estimating the Spearm an partial rank coe cient³. The e ect is negligible as the value of is essentially unchanged.

We nd a sim ilarly strong connection between the Xray versus optical nuclear lum inosity (Fig.2, left bottom panel). A gain, all X -ray upper lim its are consistent with the L_0 vs. L_X correlation de ned by the detected objects. Conversely, note that all three sources where we measured the largest X-ray absorbing column densities (namely 3C 83.1, 3C 270 and 3C 296) lie signi cantly above the correlation between ${\tt L}_{\tt O}~$ and ${\tt L}_{\tt X}$. This is not surprising since, while the estim ated X -ray uxes are deabsorbed, the optical measurem ents are not corrected for the presence of local absorption. Indeed, the location of these X-ray absorbed sources in the $L_0 - L_X$ is suggestive of signi cant absorption also in the optical band. We therefore preferred to re-estim ate the correlation om itting these three objects, shown in Fig.2 with a solid line.We obtain a sm aller dispersion of 0.23 dex and a steeper corrected slope, m = 1.16 0.09.

A lso in the radio-optical plane $L_r - L_0$ we nd a strong correlation as already found by Chiaberge et al. (1999),

³ The Spearm an Partial Rank correlation coe cient estimates the linear correlation coe cient between two variables taking into account the presence of a third. If A and B are both related to the variable z, the Spearm an correlation coe cient is $_{AB}_{,z} = \frac{_{AB}_{,a} A_{,z} B_{,z}}{[(1 - \frac{_{AB}_{,a}}{_{,a}})^{1 - 2}}$



Fig.2. Comparison of (top left) radio (5 GHz) and X-ray (0.5 – 5 keV) nuclear uxes, (top right) radio and X-ray lum inosities, (bottom left) optical (5500 A) and X-ray lum inosities, (bottom right) optical and radio lum inosities. The empty circles represent the objects for which we have detected an intrinsic absorption > 10^{22} cm⁻². The solid line reproduces the best linear thaving excluded the 3 X-ray absorbed nuclei, while the dashed line is the t on the whole sam ple.

see Fig. 2, bottom right panel. Again, the 3 X-ray absorbed sources are located below the best t, supporting the interpretation for an optical de cit derived from their location in the $L_0 - L_X$ plane. Sim ilarly, we re-estimated the correlation excluding the potentially absorbed objects in the optical. The slope of the corrected correlation is m = 0.82 0:11 (very similar to the slope of the correlation found by Chiaberge et al. (1999), m = 0.88 0:12,

using the whole 3C /FR I sample) with a dispersion of 0.32 dex.

4. The X-ray absorbing medium in FR Inuclei

In 4 galaxies we obtained a detection of local X -ray absorption. In all cases our estimates of the column density are in close agreement with previously published measure-



Fig.3.HST in ages of the 4 radio-galaxies in which we detected a local X-ray absorption, taken from Chiaberge et al. (1999).

m ents.⁴ It is particularly instructive the inspection of their H ST in ages (see Fig.3) as they unveil a connection between optical and X-ray absorption. The three sources for which we found the largest X-ray absorption show circum – nuclear dusty disk structures, on scales between 300 pc – 1 kpc. All disks are seen at large inclinations, the less inclined being associated to 3C 270 whose axis form with the line of sight an angle 64 (Ja e et al. 1996). The fourth X-ray absorbed galaxy is 3C 272.1: its H ST im – age show the presence of a low optical depth ($A_V = 0.54$, B ower et al. (1997)) lam entary dust lane, directly proiected onto the nucleus.

By no means dust is exclusively found in these 4 sources. The HST images of the remaining radio-galaxies also show the presence of dust, even in the form of disks. For example 3C 66B and 3C 78 have face-on disks (Sparks et al. 2000) while disks at higher inclinations (but still substantially less inclined than in the 3 cases discussed above) are found in 3C 31 and 3C 449.0 -nuclear dust, usually distributed in laments, is seen also in 3C 84, 3C 274, 3C 317 and 3C 338. In most of these sources, the quality of the X-ray spectra is su cient to set stringent limits to the column density, N_H < 10^{22} cm².

Therefore it appears that X-ray absorption is associated with the presence of dust, but only when i) the dust intercepts our line of sight to the nucleus or ii) it takes the form of a highly inclined disk. W hile the rst case is rather obvious, the second situation⁵ indicates that the gas responsible for the X-ray absorption shares the attened distribution of the dust, inducing a dependence of N_H on the view ing angle. Note that evidence for a dependence of absorption on orientation in FR I nuclei was already found by C hiaberge et al. (2002) from the com parison of optical and UV in ages of radio-galaxies.

However, the column densities toward FR Inuclei are much smaller than those of the optical and X-ray ab-

sorbers predicted (and required) by the AGN uni edm odels, i.e. the circum nuclear obscuring tori; as a comparison, in the obscured Seyfert 2 galaxies 75% have N_H > 10^{23} cm² and about half of them are Compton thick (N_H > 10^{24} cm² (R isalitiet al. 1999)). Unfortunately, we cannot constrain the location of the X-ray absorbing gas, other that it must be coplanar with the large scale dust. It might be also cospatial with the dust and thus being distributed on a kpc scale, rather than on the characteristic pc scale of tori in Seyfert galaxies.

Let's now focus on the three sources for which we found the largest X -ray absorption. In Sect.2 we noted that their location with respect to the L_0 vs L_X as well as L_0 vs L_r correlations can be interpreted as due to absorption in the optical band⁶. The optical absorption can be estimated quantitatively from their o sets from the best t relations. 2 4 from the L_0 vs L_X plane and slightly We $nd A_R$ lower values, A_R 3, from the L_0 vs L_R plane. 1:5 The ratios between optical and X-ray absorption are in $(0:7 \quad 3:3) \quad 10^{22} \text{ mag cm}^2$, having the range $A_V = N_H$ transform ed $A_V = 1.34 A_R$ using the Cardelli et al. (1989) extinction law. These values are slightly smaller than the standard galactic ratio, $A_{V} = N_{H}$ $5 10^{22} \text{ mag cm}^2$ (Bohlin et al. 1978). Maiolino et al. (2001) also found evidence for a low $A_{\rm V}=\!\!N_{\rm H}\,$ ratio in AGN, but with values extending down to values as low as $A_V = N_H$ 3 10 24 m ag cm². They interpreted this nding as an evidence for dust in the circum nuclear region of AGNs being di erent from Galactic, possibly due to a dom inance of larger grains. Clearly, our results indicate a much less extreme departure for the $A_V = N_H$ value and consequently from the galactic dust properties.

The fraction of X-ray absorbed sources also sets a lim it to the gas covering factor. Three out of 12 objects (25%) are associated to a column density larger than 10^{22} cm². As a reference values, in the C fA sample of Seyfert galaxies Huchra & Burg (1992) the fraction of obscured objects is 53%, considering only type 2, but it might as high as 78% if also the interm ediate types 1.8 and 1.9 are included O sterbrock & M artel (1993).G iven the sm all (and incom –

 $^{^4}$ See Chiaberge et al. (2002) and Donato et al. (2004) for 3C 270; Harris et al. (2002) and Donato et al. (2004) for 3C 272.1; Hardcastle et al. (2005) for 3C 296

 $^{^5}$ This behaviour is shared also by the radio-galaxy B2 0055+30, with a large column density N $_{\rm H}$ 7 10^{22} cm 2 (D onato et al. 2004) associated to a highly inclined disk in the HST in age (Capetti et al. 2000a).

 $^{^6}$ This interpretation is supported by the extrem ely steep UV/opticalnuclear spectrum of 3C 270 (Capetti et al. 2000b) which must be ascribed to absorption.

plete) sample statistics and the di erent (and som ew hat arbitrary) de nition of 'absorbed' FR Ior Seyfert, a direct com parison is probably not appropriate. Certainly how – ever, although X -ray absorption in FR I is associated to low column densities, it is not a rare phenom enon.

5.A jet-origin for the X-ray cores?

The central issue for our understanding of the properties of LLRG is the origin of their nuclear emission. The analysis of the results presented in Section 3.2 provides several pieces of evidence, presented in the following three subsections, supporting the interpretation that the radio, optical and X -ray cores have a common origin, most likely being produced by the base of a relativistic jet, as already suggested from the analysis of RO SAT and HST data by W orrall & Birkinshaw (1994) and Chiaberge et al. (1999).

5.1. Multiwavelength nuclear correlations

The rst indication comes from the presence of the strong correlations between the nuclear lum inosities in the three available bands.

A connection between the radio, optical and X-ray radiation is observed also in other classes of AGNs including Seyfert galaxies, radio-galaxies and QSO (see e.g. Falcke et al. 1995). However, the dispersion between the em ission in the di erent bands is substantially larger than observed in our sam ple. For exam ple, at a given radio lum inosity, the X-ray em ission spans over 4-5 orders ofm agnitude; even projecting this correlation in a plane considering also the di erent black holem asses, the rm s is still as large as 0.88 dex (M erloni et al. 2003). These results w itness, on the one hand, the close link between accretion and ejection in AGN but, on the other, the relatively large allow ed range for the param eters coupling the two processes and their radiative manifestations, e.g. the strength of the m agnetic eld and the structure of the accretion disk.

Conversely, the m s of the data points for our FR I sample around the best t are typically a mere factor of 2, despite the large range of lum inosities involved. Furtherm ore, concerning the radio-X correlation, it must also be noted that part of the dispersion certainly arises from the (offen substantial) errors associated to (at least) the X-ray lum inosities, see Table 2. If one considers that also other e ects contribute to the dispersion (e.g. variability in non simultaneous observations) the m s value must be considered as a strict upper limit to the intrinsic dispersion.

Thus our results radically di er from a quantitative point of view from the general trend found in other AGNs and point to a much closer connection, such as a common origin for the radio, optical and X -ray em ission.

5.2. Broad band spectral indices

The issue of the origin of the X-ray emission in FR I can also be addressed concentrating on the Spectral Energy

Т	able	5.	. В	road-	band	spe	ectral	ind	iæs.

N am e	ox	ro	rx
3C 028	{	{	{
3C 031	$1:24^{+0:24}_{0:33}$	0:75 0:12	$0:92^{+0:01}_{0:07}$
3C 066B	$1:13^{+0:58}_{0:29}$	0:71 0:01	$0:85^{+0:20}_{0:10}$
3C 075	{	{	> 0:83
3C 078	$1:09^{+0:54}_{0:48}$	0:71 0:01	$0:84^{+0:19}_{0:16}$
3C 083	$0:65^{+2:10}_{0:57}$	0:83 0:01	$0:77^{+0:72}_{0:19}$
3C 84	$1:18^{+0:23}_{0:18}$	0:88 0:09	$0:98^{+0:05}_{0:01}$
3C 189	$1:05^{+0:33}_{0:13}$	0:75 0:01	$0:85^{+0:11}_{0:05}$
3C 270	$0:82^{+1:38}_{0:56}$	0:95 0:01	$0:90^{+0:47}_{0.19}$
3C 272.1	$1:31^{+0:63}_{0:31}$	0:69 0:01	$0.90^{+0.22}_{-0.10}$
3C 274	$1:18^{+0:12}_{0:07}$	0:79 0:02	$0:93^{+0:04}_{0:02}$
3c 296	$0:80^{+0:46}_{0:28}$	0:86 0:04	$0:84^{+0:16}_{0:09}$
3C 317	$0:97^{+0:15}_{0:13}$	0:91 0:04	$0.93^{+0.04}_{-0.03}$
3C 338	> 1:08	0:80 0:04	> 0:90
3C 346	$0:97^{+0:13}_{0:13}$	0 : 79 0 : 06	$0.85^{+0.02}_{-0.02}$
3C 348	> 0:68	0:81 0:06	> 0:77
3C 438	{	> 0:92	> 0:84
3C 449	> 1:2	0:66 0:02	> 0:86

D istributions (SED) of FR I compared to those of other classes of AGNs. As a SED behaviour can be param eterized using the broad-band spectral indices, we combined the available data in the di erent energy bands (scaled to the standard reference values, i.e. the radio at 5 GHz, the optical at 5500 A and X-ray lum inosity at 1 keV) and we calculate the broad-band spectral indices of our objects. They are presented in Table 5 and reproduced graphically in the ($_{\rm ox}$ vs $_{\rm ro}$) plane (see Fig.4). The distribution of spectral indices is in complete agreement with the results obtained by H ardcastle & W orrall (2000), who used RO SAT data for the X-ray m easurements.

AllFR I sources are conned in the upper left region of this plane and show a remarkable hom ogeneity in their spectral shapes with $_{\rm ox}$ = 1:13 0:11, $_{\rm ro}$ = 0:77 0:08, and $_{\rm rx}$ = 0:90 0:05. The quoted uncertainties represent the measured dispersions of each index, not considering the X-ray absorbed sources. These latter objects are slightly o set from the remaining of the sam plebut, as we argued in Sect. 3.2, this can be explained as due to the uncorrected dust absorption for the optical data.

We then compare these values with similar estimates for other classes of AGNs. Not surprisingly, radio quiet quasars have a median values of $_{ro} = 0.1$ and $_{rx} = 0.36$ (E lvis et al. 1994) much lower than our radio loud sources and this applies also to the Seyfert nuclei (H o & Peng 2001). But also the steep spectrum radio loud quasar have signi cantly sm aller values $_{ro} = 0.46$ and $_{rx} = 0.71$. These di erences in spectral indices correspond to an optical (and X-ray) excess for a given radio core power by a factor between 20 and 40.

Conversely, the FR I sources show a substantial overlap with the region of the plane populated by the Low energy peaked BL Lacs (LBL, Padovani & G iom mi (1995)), see Fig. 4. For the com parison with BL Lacs we consider



F ig.4.B road-band spectral indices, calculated with lum in nosity at 5 G H z, 5500 A and 1 keV; the dashed lines represent constant values for the third index $_{\rm rx}$. The solid lines indicate the regions of the plane within 2 from the mean $_{\rm ro}$ and $_{\rm ox}$ for BL Lacs drawn from the Deep X-Ray Radio B lazar Survey (DXRBS) Padovaniet al. (2003). Note that FR I cover approximately the same portion of the plane of LBL.

the radio selected BL Lacs sam ple derived from the 1Jy catalog (Stickel et al. 1991) and the BL Lac sam ple selected from the Einstein Slew survey (Elvis et al. 1992; Perlm an et al. 1996). We used the classi cation into high and low energy peaked BL Lacs (HBL and LBL respectively), as well as their multiwavelength data given by Fossatiet al. (1998). The same result is obtained using BL Lac objects drawn from the Deep X-Ray Radio Blazar Survey (DXRBS) by Padovaniet al. (2003).

In BL Lacs the emission process is well established and the whole nuclear radiation is ascribed to the base of a relativistic jet. The similarity in the spectral indices distributions of FR I and BL Lac provides further support to the idea that also in FR I the nuclear emission is nontherm al emission associated to an out ow.

A more detailed comparison with LBL is particularly instructive. The uni ed model for FR I and BL Lacs predicts that these two classes are drawn from the same population and are just seen at di erent angles with respect to the jet axis. In Fig.5 we compare the spectral indices of the two groups taking also into account the extended radio-lum inosity L_{ext} . Being an isotropic quantity L_{ext} does not depend on orientation and indeed LBL and FR I share the same range of L_{ext} . Thus FR I overlap in the spectral indices plane with the jet-dom inated class with the 'proper' level of radio-lum inosity.

The di erences between FR I and LBL, albeit quite small, warrant further attention to this point. In fact, FR I appear to be located only in the upper left corner characteristic of the LBL region (see Fig. 4). Fig.5 show s that this is not due to a m ism atch of extended radiolum inosity between the two classes. How ever, as already discussed by Chiaberge et al. (2000) and Trussoniet al. (2003), D oppler beam ing not only a ects the angular pattem of the jet em ission, but it also causes a shift in frequency which in turn modi es the observed spectral indices. It is clearly in portant to assess if the observed (sm all) di erences between the spectral indices are consistent with this idea.

In Fig. 6, top panel, we give a simpli ed sketch to graphically illustrate the origin of this e ect; we adopted a SED characteristic of a LBL (solid line), with the synchrotron peak in the FIR-mm region and a at X-ray spectrum. The FR ISED (dotted line, re-norm alized for clarity to have the same level of the synchrotron peak as the BL Lac) is shifted at low er energies and this produces a substantial decrease (relative to the radio) in the optical em ission. Conversely the X-ray em ission is (always relative to the radio) substantially unaltered. Indeed, no signi cant di errences in _{rx} between FR I and LBL are present. Given the relatively large errors in the quantities involved in this comparison, and the possible e ects of optical absorption described above, we prefer to refrain from a quantitative analysis. Nonetheless, this indicates that the small di erences between the spectral indices of FR I and BL Lacs can be qualitatively accounted for with the presence of beam inq.

5.3. Spectral indices evolution with lum inosity

Fig.5 provides a further element in favour of a jet origin for the X-ray cores in FR I. Considering both FR I and LBL, a clear trend of the $_{\rm ro}$ and $_{\rm ox}$ spectral indices with radio luminosity is present: more powerful sources have higher $_{\rm ro}$ (and lower $_{\rm ox}$) with respect to less luminous objects, while no trend between $_{\rm rx}$ and $L_{\rm ext}$ is apparent. FR I thus appear to follow the same evolution of spectral indices with the extended radio luminosity of LBL.

The slopes of the correlations between radio/optical and optical/X nuclear lum inosity provide a di erent view of the same e ect. In Section 3.2 we reported that the dependence of L_o on L_r is atter than unity (m = 0.82 0:11), an indication of an evolution with lum inosity of the radio/optical ratio. The opposite behaviour is displayed by the L_X / L_o relationship, which is steeper than unity (m = 1:16 0:09).

A dependence of the SED on lum inosity, over the whole class of blazar, was recognized by Fossatiet al. (1998) and it is usually referred to as the \blazar sequence". G hiselliniet al. (1998) suggested that this is due to a relationship between the positions of the emission peaks with lum inosity, related to the increasing cooling elects on the relativistic electrons. In particular, the synchrotron peak



F ig.5. B road-band spectral indices plotted versus the extended radio lum inosity at 178 M Hz for FR I (lled circles) and LBL (triangles). (left) radio/X-ray, (m iddle) radio-optical and (right) optical/X-ray. The empty circles represent the FR I sources for which we have detected a large (N_H > 10^{22} cm²) intrinsic X-ray absorption. The solid and dotted lines represent the best linear t for the changes of the spectral indices with L_{ext} for FR I and LBL respectively.

shifts at lower frequencies in the most powerful sources. Here we nd evidence for a similar sequence among LBL, although it must be pointed out that we here consider the extended radio lum inosity while Fossati et al. (1998) used the radio-core lum inosity. The optical emission, which in LBL is associated to the decreasing tail of the synchrotron component, would be increasingly reduced with the respect to the radio when the source lum inosity increases (see Fig.6 for a sketch). This accounts for the trend observed in Fig.5 in LBL. A similar e ect is seen also in FR I and suggests the presence of a similar lum inosity sequence. This adds further weight to the similarity between BL Lacs and FR I and to a jet origin for the nuclei in radio-galaxies.

6.Sum m ary and conclusions

We presented results from Chandra observations of the 3C/FR I sam ple of low lum inosity radio-galaxies.D ata are available for 18 out of the 33 sources of the sam ple and we detected a power-law nuclear component, the characteristic signature of AGN em ission, in 12 objects.

In 4 galaxies we detected nuclear X -ray absorption at $(0.2 \quad 6) \quad 10^{22} \text{ cm}^{-2} \text{ . X-ray absorbed}$ a level of N_H sources are associated with the presence of either highly inclined dusty disks seen in the HST in ages or to dust lam ents directly projected onto the nuclei. Dust is seen also in most of the remaining sources but no X-ray absorption 10^{21} 10^{22} is found with upper lim its in the range N $_{\rm H}$ cm². This suggests an association between dust (optical) and gas (X-ray) absorption but only when the geometry is favourable, supporting the existence of a attened absorber, rem in iscent of the standard thick tori envisaged by the AGN uni ed m odels. How ever, both the X -ray and (the indirect estim ate of) the optical absorption, are substantially smaller when compared to what is typical of e.g. Seyfert galaxies. This indicates that we have an un-



Fig.6. Sketch of the SED evolution related to (top) frequency shift due to relativistic beam ing and (bottom) a change in lum inosity. See text for details.

obstructed view toward most FR Inuclei and that absorption plays only a marginal role in the remaining objects.

Concerning the properties of the obscuring medium, the ratio between optical and X-ray absorption are in the range $A_V = N_H$ (0:7 3:3) 10²² m ag cm², slightly sm aller than the standard galactic value, but not as extrem e as found in other classes of AGN.

The most important issue is clearly the origin of the X-ray cores which can be produced either by the accretion processor by the associated out ow .Three results support the interpretation for a common origin for the radio, opti-

cal and X -ray cores, m ost likely associated to the base of a relativistic jet: i) the presence of strong correlations between the lum inosities in the three bands, extending over 4 orders of magnitude and with a much smaller dispersion (0.3 dex) when compared to sim ilar trends found for other classes of AGNs; ii) the close sim ilarity of the broad-band spectral indices with the sub-class of BL Lacs (for which the jet origin is well established) sharing the same range of extended radio-lum inosity, in accord with the FR I/BL Lacs uni ed model; iii) the presence of a common evolution of spectral indices with lum inosity in both FR I and BL Lacs, most likely due to a shift in the synchrotron em ission peak.

In the fram ework of a jet origin for the optical and X-ray cores, our analysis sets lim its to the em ission re-10 ⁷ of lated to accretion at a fraction as small as the Eddington lum inosity, for a 10^9 M black hole. Thus, regardless of the origin of the optical and X-ray nuclei, the lum inosity of LLRG in the X-ray band provides further evidence for a low level of accretion and/or for a low radiative e ciency of the accretion process. This was already noted by Chiaberge et al. (1999) from the analysis of the optical im ages. The new ly measured X-ray lum inosities point to the sam e conclusion with the substantial advantage of being free from the lingering doubts related to i) obscuration for the optical cores, since the X-ray spectra can be directly modeled accounting for the e ects of absorption and ii) the possibility that, due to a di erent SED behaviour with respect to brighter AGN, most of the nuclear em ission is shifted at higher energies than the optical, as predicted by models of low e ciency accretion (e.g. Narayan et al. 2000; D iM atteo et al. 2000).

A cknow ledgements. We thank M arco Chiaberge for useful comments and discussions during the preparation of the m anuscript and the referee, M artin H ardcastle, for his com - m ents and suggestions which im proved this paper. This work was partly supported by the Italian M IU R under grant C on 2003/2003027534_002.

References

- A uniem m a, C ., Perola, G . C ., Ekers, R . D ., et al. 1977, A & A , 57, 41
- Bennett, A.S. 1962, MmRAS, 68, 163
- Bohlin, R.C., Savage, B.D., & Drake, J.F. 1978, ApJ, 224, 132
- Bower, G.A., Heckman, T.M., Wilson, A.S., & Richstone, D.O. 1997, ApJ, 483, L33+
- Capetti, A., de Ruiter, H. R., Fanti, R., et al. 2000a, A&A, 362, 871
- Capetti, A., Kleijn, G.V., & Chiaberge, M. 2005, A&A, 439, 935
- Capetti, A., Trussoni, E., Celotti, A., Feretti, L., & Chiaberge, M. 2000b, MNRAS, 318, 493
- Cardelli, J.A., Clayton, G.C., & Mathis, J.S. 1989, ApJ, 345, 245
- Chiaberge, M., Capetti, A., & Celotti, A. 1999, A& A, 349, 77
- Chiaberge, M., Celotti, A., Capetti, A., & Ghisellini, G. 2000, A&A, 358, 104

- Chiaberge, M ., M acchetto, F.D., Sparks, W .B., et al. 2002, ApJ, 571, 247
- Colla, G., Fanti, C., Fanti, R., et al. 1975, A & A S, 20, 1
- Davis, J.E. 2001, ApJ, 562, 575
- DiMatteo, T., Quataert, E., Allen, S.W., Narayan, R., & Fabian, A.C. 2000, MNRAS, 311, 507
- Donato, D., Sambruna, R.M., & Gliozzi, M. 2004, ApJ, 617, 915
- Edge, D. O., Shakeshaft, J. R., McAdam, W. B., Baldwin, J. E., & Archer, S. 1959, Mm RAS, 68, 37
- Elvis, M., Plummer, D., Schachter, J., & Fabbiano, G. 1992, ApJS, 80, 257
- Elvis, M ., W ilkes, B . J., M cD owell, J. C ., et al. 1994, ApJS, 95, 1
- Fabbiano, G. 1989, ARA & A, 27, 87
- Falcke, H., Malkan, M.A., & Bierm ann, P.L. 1995, A&A, 298, 375
- Fanaro , B.L. & Riley, J.M. 1974, MNRAS, 167, 31P
- Fossati, G., Maraschi, L., Celotti, A., Comastri, A., & Ghisellini, G. 1998, MNRAS, 299, 433
- Ghisellini, G., Celotti, A., Fossati, G., Maraschi, L., & Comastri, A. 1998, MNRAS, 301, 451
- Hardcastle, M.J. & Worrall, D.M. 2000, MNRAS, 314, 359
- Hardcastle, M .J., W onrall, D .M ., B irkinshaw, M ., & Canosa, C .M .2003, M NRAS, 338, 176
- Ho, L.C. & Peng, C.Y. 2001, ApJ, 555, 650
- Huchra, J. & Burg, R. 1992, ApJ, 393, 90
- Isobe,T.,Feigelson,E.D.,Akritas,M.G.,& Babu,G.J.1990, ApJ, 364, 104
- Ja e, W ., Ford, H ., Ferrarese, L ., van den Bosch, F ., & O'Connell, R .W .1996, ApJ, 460, 214
- Kormendy, J. & Richstone, D. 1995, ARA&A, 33, 581
- M aiolino, R ., M arconi, A ., Salvati, M ., et al. 2001, A & A , 365, 28
- M erloni, A., Heinz, S., & di M atteo, T. 2003, M N R A S, 345, 1057
- Narayan, R., Igum enshchev, I.V., & Abram ow icz, M.A. 2000, ApJ, 539, 798
- O sterbrock, D.E. & Martel, A. 1993, ApJ, 414, 552
- Padovani, P.& Giommi, P.1995, ApJ, 444, 567
- Padovani, P., Perlm an, E.S., Landt, H., G iom m i, P., & Perri, M. 2003, ApJ, 588, 128
- Perlm an, E. S., Stocke, J. T., Schachter, J. F., et al. 1996, ApJS, 104, 251
- Risaliti, G., Maiolino, R., & Salvati, M. 1999, ApJ, 522, 157
- Sadler, E.M., Jenkins, C.R., & Kotanyi, C.G. 1989, MNRAS, 240, 591
- Schm itt, J.H.M.M. 1985, ApJ, 293, 178
- Sparks, W . B., Baum, S. A., Biretta, J., M acchetto, F. D., & M artel, A. R. 2000, ApJ, 542, 667
- Stickel, M., Fried, J. W., Kuehr, H., Padovani, P., & Urry, C.M. 1991, ApJ, 374, 431
- Trussoni, E., Capetti, A., Celotti, A., Chiaberge, M., & Feretti, L. 2003, A & A, 403, 889
- W orrall, D.M. & Birkinshaw, M. 1994, ApJ, 427, 134