An analysis of spectra in the Red Rectangle nebula

Frederic Zagury

Institut Louis de Broglie, 23 rue Marsoulan, 75012 Paris, France

January 18, 2022

A bstract

This paper presents an analysis of a series of spectra in the R ed R ectangle nebula. Only the reddest part of the spectra can safely be attributed to light from the nebula, and indicates R ayleigh scattering by the gas, in conform ity with the large angles of scattering involved and the proxim ity of the star. In the blue, light from HD 44179, refracted or scattered in the atm osphere, dom inates the spectra. This paper questions the reliability of ground-based observations of extended objects in the blue.

1 Introduction

This paper will pursue the investigations initiated in a preceding article (Zagury, 2006) on the e ects of atm ospheric extinction on starlight.

Long slit spectroscopy of a sample of objects (stars, nebulae, galaxies) was used to determ ine the nature of the light received by a telescope at close angular distances from a star, before the spectrum reaches the night sky spectrum. Direct light from the star, refracted by the atm osphere, will be detected over the rst few arcseconds. Over the next few tens of arcseconds, forward scattering of starlight by aerosols will dom inate the spectrum, until it fades out under the night sky spectrum.

Light from the central star, refracted or scattered in the atm osphere, can not be neglected when dealing with spectra of a nebula, since it will compete with the light scattered by the nebula. The continua of the spectra of NGC 6309, NGC 6891, and NGC 2022, for instance, as they are given in the K witter-H enry database (http://oit.william s.edu/nebulae/browse.cfm), m ore likely re ect the spectrum of the central star, than the true nebular spectra (Zagury, 2006).

If this preceding paper emphasized the importance of atm ospheric extinction for our understanding of ground-based observations of nebulae, it was not quantitative enough to separate, in the observed spectrum of a nebula, atm ospheric e ects from true nebular spectrum. This problem will guide the present paper, which will focus on spectra of the R ed R ectangle nebula, observed at di erent positions in the nebula, and at di erent dates.

e-m ail:fzagury@ wanadoo.fr

2 Observations

The observations of the Red Rectangle used in this article come from three observing runs at Fred L.W hipple Observatory, in December 2001, February 2002, and M arch 2003. Spectra were acquired with the FAST spectrograph, m ounted on the Tillinghast 1.5 m eter telescope. Technical informations on FAST will be found in Fabricant et al. (1998).

FAST is a long slit spectrograph, which samples a region 3' long and 3" wide on the sky and covers (in the con guration used for the observations) the [3660A, 7530A] wavelength range, with a spatial resolution of 0.61"/pixel. The slit is oriented E-W. Dierent positions of the slit across the nebula are thus characterized by their declination o set from HD 44179.

The 2-D spectra presented here were binned by two (D ecember 2001, M arch 2003) or by four (February 2002), along their spatial dimension, during the data reduction process (Tokarz & Roll 1997), yielding a nal angular resolution of 1.2" or 2.4" per pixel. 1-D spectra of stars are extracted from the 2-D arrays by adding the spectra far above the background. The wavelength resolution is 1:4A/pix. The seeing during the three observing runs was good, 1-2".

M ain inform ations on the data are grouped in Table 1. Figure 1 shows the projected positions of the slit on the nebula, for each run, and speci es the position on the slit of the pixel with m axim um signal.

An observation will be designated by its position (n1, n2...), as it is given in Table 1, and the date of observation. The spectrum at pixel x', extracted from the 2-D array of an observation, will be noted 5x'. 'stands for the ozone cross-section, and is expressed in cm². Vertical dotted lines on the plots give the lim its of the ozone absorption region.

3 December 2001 observations

3.1 HD 44179

Spectra extracted from the 2-D arrays of HD 44179's observations, at the beginning and at the end of D ecem ber 2001 run, are plotted F igure 2.

For each 2-D array a main spectrum is identified (s61 for the first observation, s64 for the second), which is the direction of HD 44179. On each side of the main pixel the intensity decreases steeply, to less than 1 count/s, over 7 pixels or 8". The shape of the spectra with level above 1 count/s evolves in a regular way, with a system atic increase of the average slope of the spectra with increasing pixel number (see Zagury, 2005). Some spectra, s65 and s64 in the first observation, s60, s59, in the second one, have a slight bum p in the red (the red bum p ism ore pronounced in February 2002 observation, Section 4) which is due to the nebula. 8" away from the direction of HD 44179, the spectra have reached a shape (mentioned as the background on the plots) which is common to the following spectra and to both sides of HD 44179.

The noise level is 0.2 count/s, less but not far from the level of the background. The background spectra of Figure 2 are the average of 8 spectra at a m ean distance of 11" from

HD 44179. The backgrounds, identical in the two observations, are interpreted (Zagury, 2006) as light from HD 44179 scattered by aerosols in the atm osphere, with a spectrum proportional to the spectrum of HD 44179 and to 1 = (Figure 3). Moving away from HD 44179, the background progressively dim inishes in intensity, with a constant shape, which will ultimately also be modiled, because of the attenuation of the scattering and the merging of the night sky spectrum (Figure 3, bottom plot).

Between the beginning and the end of the run the aim as has increased from 1.41 to 1.48. The result is a decrease of the 1-D spectrum of HD 44179 by a factor of 1.15, a slightly more pronounced depression in the ozone absorption region, and an increase of the bending in the blue (a decrease of the blue slope, bottom spectra of Figure 4). These di erences between the spectra can be corrected analytically (top spectra of Figure 4).

3.2 Nebula

The 2-D arrays of the December 2001 nebular spectra are presented in Figures 5 (right column) and 6. Spectra from positions n4 and n5, which are similar to n3's (see below), were not represented. The main spectrum for each observation is in plain line. Its position on the slit, and in the nebula, is marked on Figure 1.

The red bump, characteristic of the Red Rectangle, is present in all 2-D arrays, with a spatial extent that m atches the width of the nebula at the corresponding declination [derived from the red D igital Sky Survey (D SS2) in age].

Due to the long exposure times low level background spectra can be determined with better accuracy than for the 2-D arrays of HD 44179. Two background spectra are represented in solid line on each plot, one immediately outside the nebula, one close to the extremities of the slit. Backgrounds of all nebular observations, taken at the extremities of the slit, are identical (in shape and intensity, Figure 7, left). Their shape matches the night sky spectrum of Massey & Foltz (2000), except in the blue where there is an excess of signal for the backgrounds (Figure 7, middle). This excess is attributed to remaining light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere, and is well tted by the 1-D spectrum of HD 44179 (rst observation of the run) times 1= (and a constant factor, middle plot of Figure 7). Subtraction of the scattered light component will reproduce the K itt Peak night sky spectrum (right plot of Figure 7). Backgrounds taken close to the nebula are equal to the far-away backgrounds with an additional component of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (Figure 8).

The rst position observed in the nebula, 5" north from HD 44179, is close enough to HD 44179 to consider a possible contam ination of the spectra by direct light from HD 44179 [as for NGC 6309 and NGC 6891 in Zagury (2005)]. In the blue, the main spectrum (s56, right plot of Figure 5) of the 2-D array recalls, by its shape as well as by its intensity, spectra of the 2-D arrays of HD 44179 taken at approximately equal distances from the star, s64 and s65 of HD 44179 rst observation, s66 and s67 of the second observation (Figure 9). It is (in the blue) exactly proportional to s65 of the rst observation, and nearly proportional to s67 of the second one (a sm all correction for gas extinction is necessary to superim pose the spectra in the blue); the spectrum of the nebula is superim posed, in the red, on the spectrum of HD 44179. O uside the nebula, still at position n1, the shape of the background spectrum evolves from a predom inance of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (top background spectra of F igure 5, right colum n plots, with a shape identical to the background found for the observation of HD 44179) to a predom inance of the night sky spectrum (bottom background spectra), at the edges of the slit.

The other observations of the nebula are farther away from HD 44179; the proportion of direct light from HD 44179 should be highly dim inished, which explains the important fall in intensity of the spectra (Figures 6, 9, and 10).

M ain spectra at positions 3, 4 and 5 have rigorously identical shapes; they di er by a constant factor close to 1 (dotted spectra of Figure 10). The blue part of n3, n4, n5, 2-D arrays keeps a constant shape in and out of the nebula (Figure 11), with only a dim inution of the magnitude when moving away from it. The spectra are also observed at about the same distance (8"-15") from HD 44179 where the backgrounds for the HD 44179 observations were established (Section 3.1). In the blue they are sim ilar to these backgrounds, both in shape and in magnitude (a few 0.1 count/s). The backgrounds from the observations of HD 44179 would superim pose well, with a scaling factor close to 1, on the blue part of the spectra of Figure 11. On the gure, the backgrounds are tted, in the blue, by the spectrum of scattered light (by atm ospheric aerosols) from HD 44179 (proportional to the product of the spectrum of HD 44179 by 1=).

Spectra from n3, n4, n5, 2-D arrays, in the nebula, are thus made of two components: nebular light in the red, stacked on scattered light (from HD 44179) in the atm osphere, which dom inates in the blue. The red rise is constant for the closest positions to the main pixel, but its slope will dim inish towards the edges of the nebula, because of the increasing proportion, in the spectra, of scattered light in the atm osphere.

The main spectrum (s52) of the 2-D array at position n2 is of higher level. The red rise is as for the main spectra at positions 3, 4, and 5, but the spectra di er in the blue (Figure 10). The blue part of s52 is in-between, and proportional to spectra s67 and s68, from the rst observation of HD 44179 (Figure 12), observed at about the sam e angular distance from HD 44179 as s52 (of n2) is. The blue parts of the other spectra of n2 2-D array are either like that of s52 (for pixel num bers close to 52), or, like the blue part found previously at positions n3, n4, n5.

It will be concluded that for all spectra in the nebula, only the red part of the spectra can safely be attributed to light from the nebula. In the blue, the spectra are dom inated either by direct, refracted, light from HD 44179, or by light from HD 44179 forward scattered by atm ospheric aerosols.

One can wonder why s52 of n2 is three times larger than s48 of n5 (Figure 10), while position n5 is closer to HD 44179 than n2 is. The reason m ight be the increase of airm ass between the two observations (Table 1), which dim in ishes the am ount of direct light from HD 44179 and increases the scattered light in n5 observation.

4 February 2002 observations

There are three February 2002 observations, one of HD 44179, one 5:4" north of HD 44179 (position 1), and one of HD 44113.

The two star observations are plotted on Figure 13. The decrease of the signal, when moving away from the main pixel (s35 and s36 respectively for HD 44179 and HD 44113, solid line on the plots), is similar in both observations, although it is faster for HD 44179 (while HD 44179 and HD 44113 have comparable magnitudes): it occurs within 1-2 pixels (4") from s35 for HD 44179, within 4 pixels (8") for HD 44113 (as for the D ecem ber 2001 observation of HD 44179). This may be related (Zagury, 2006) to the exposure time, which, for HD 44179, has been reduced from 15 seconds in D ecem ber 2001 to 5 seconds in February 2002. The exposure time for HD 44113 is 15 seconds, as it was for the D ecem ber 2001 observations of HD 44179.

The spectrum of the nebula clearly appears in the red, superposed on the spectrum of HD 44179, for spectra s33 and s32, s37 and s38. The nebular contribution to the spectra is far m ore signi cant in this observation than it was for D ecem ber 2001 ones, which, a priori, can be due either to a slightly di erent position of the slit axis (3" w ide) in declination, or, m ore likely, to a di erence in atm ospheric extinction between the two nights [which im plies a lower extinction for February 2002 observations and could be related either to the lower aim ass (Table 1), or, to the sm aller exposure time of these observations]. The nebular spectrum is present in the red only and does not seem to perturbate the spectrum of HD 44179 in the blue.

The nebular 2-D array was presented, along with the one of D ecem ber 2001 observation at the same declination, in Figure 5. Two main spectra (s32 and s33) merge out from the 2-D array (rather than one in D ecem ber 2001 observations), which is to be attributed to the binning by four procedure used in the data reduction of February observations. The shape of s33 (a twillbe proposed Section 6), and the decrease of the spectra on each side of the central pixels, indicate, as for n1 D ecem ber 2001 observation, that the spectra are dom inated in the blue by direct light from HD 44179: the nebular spectra are superposed on HD 44179's spectra, and restricted to the red. The background reaches the night sky spectrum at the edges of the slit.

5 M arch 2003 observations

5.1 HD 44179

The two M arch 2003 observations of HD 44179 are similar, and were discussed in Zagury (2005) (Figures 1 and 2). As for February 2002 observation, direct light from HD 44179 is spread over 8", i.e. 4" (3-4 pixels) on each side of the central pixel. The noise level is 1 count/s, higher than in D ecem ber 2001, which is due to the sm aller exposure time.

5.2 Nebula

On Figure 14, M arch 2003 observations of the Red Rectangle nebula are classied, from left to right and top to bottom, by decreasing importance of the signal. M ain features are the same as for December 2001 observations.

The backgrounds away from the nebula are identical (Figure 15, left), in shape and intensity. The m atch with M assey & Foltz (2000) night sky spectrum is good except in the blue. The excess found in the blue reproduces the background of HD 44179 observations; it is proportional to the product of HD 44179 1-D spectrum (rst observation) by 1 =, and is interpreted as remaining light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (Figure 15, right).

M ain spectra at positions n2, n3, and so2 are identical, up to a constant factor (Figure 16).

In the red (Figure 14), the red bump of the Red Rectangle is present, within the nebula, in all observations. The red rise keeps a constant slope around the main pixel of an observation, and will dim inish toward the edges of the nebula; the bump disappears when the pixel is out of the nebula.

The red rises of the main spectra of all observations (except n1) are proportional (Figure 17, left). n1 main spectrum shares the same slope in the reddest part of the red rise, but is less steep from the ozone absorption region onwards (Figure 17, right).

The shape of the blue spectra, for a given 2-D array of one of the four observations with lower signal (n2, n3, sol, so2), is the same in and out of the nebula, down to the background (Figure 14). All four observations blue spectra are proportional (Figure 18). O ne will deduce that, as for D ecem ber 2001 observations, the blue part of these spectra is mainly light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (Figure 18); and that the di erence between the spectra at sol and at positions n2, n3, so2, is due to the relative proportion in the spectra of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere.

The blue decrease of the main spectrum (s69) at position nlb perfectly reproduces the blue part of spectrum s54 (scaled by a factor of 0.1) of the rst observation of HD 44179 (Figure 19).

n1 (Figure 14) is the nebular observation with the highest signal and the closest to HD 44179. The nebula bum p is perceived from pixel 43 to pixel 56. The main spectrum is s48, which is at in the blue. Such a at blue slope is observed in the February 2002 observation of HD 44179 (s38, Figure 13, for instance), and can be attributed to direct light from HD 44179. Spectra close to s48 di er by a gas extinction factor only (/ $e^{g=4}$, Figure 20), as it was shown to be the case with the spectra from HD 44179's 2-D array (Zagury, 2006). Away from pixel 48, the spectra m atch that of other observations in the nebula, observed at comparable distances from HD 44179: spectrum s52 of n1 for instance is identical (with a scaling factor of 1.3) to the main spectrum, s69, of n1b, the blue part of which was shown to be proportional to s54 from the rst observation of HD 44179 (Figure 19).

As for December 2001 or February 2002, the spectra of the nebula observed in M arch 2003 reveal the light from the nebula in their reddest part (where atm ospheric extinction is m in in ized, before ozone absorption), but are, in the blue (after the ozone absorption region), dom inated by light from HD 44179 -direct light or light scattered in the earth atm osphere.

6 C om parison of the observations at di erent dates

Figure 21 com pares the backgrounds, observed away from HD 44179, of the three observing runs. In the red, a scaling factor close to 1 will give a good superim position of the spectra. In the blue, the three backgrounds di er by the am ount of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere. The di erence between D ecember 2001 and M arch 2003 backgrounds is sm all. It becom es signi cant with the February 2002 background, which is understandable since only the closest position to HD 44179 was observed in February 2002. W e conclude that the night sky was nearly the sam e for the three runs. It in plies that the conditions of observation, the sensitivity of the detector and the atm ospheric extinction are com parable.

The 1-D spectra of HD 44179 observed at di erent dates superim pose well after correction for a di erence of Rayleigh extinction (Figure 22) between the observations.

M ain spectra at positions n2 and n3 are proportional in M arch 2003 (Section 5), while they have di erent shapes in D ecem ber 2001 observations (Section 3). The pointing of the telescope could be responsible for part of this discrepancy, but the m ost reasonable explanation is that the di erence of optical depths (aim ass) between the two dates changes the proportion of refracted and scattered light, from HD 44179, in the spectra. It m eans that the standard way of reducing data, subtraction of a background and norm alization by the spectrum of a reference star, can not be applied to these observations.

A precise position-to-position comparison of December 2001 and M arch 2003 observations (Figure 23), for positions n2 and n3, shows that the red rise of the nebular spectra is identical from one date to the other, while the spectra di er in the blue from the ozone absorption region onwards.

n1 is the nearest position to HD 44179 observed in the nebula, and the one for which direct light from HD 44179, refracted in the atm osphere, enhances the level of the spectrum far above that at the other positions. It is also the position for which di erences between the di erent dates are the most striking (Figure 24). The exact position of the slit axis with respect to HD 44179 can in uence the level of the spectrum. The high airm ass (A M = 1.51, against 1.41 for D ecember 2001 and 1.38 for February 2002) probably contributes to the low level of M arch 2003 spectrum, and its steep rise in the red, which is close to what is observed at larger distances from HD 44179: an increase of extinction dim in ishes the direct light from HD 44179, which is the main component of the n1 spectra in the blue, and the reason for its high level; the R ed R ectangle nebular bum p is then highlighted.

This further raises the question of the in uence of the blue continuum on the slope of the red rise at n1, for D evem ber 2001 and February 2002 observations. Figure 24 (right plot), for instance, shows that it is possible to reproduce February 2002 n1 spectrum by the sum of spectra extracted from the 2-D arrays of D evem ber 2001 observations of

HD 44179 and of position n2. We also note, still concerning the 2-D array of February 2002 observation, that when the blue continuum diminishes, the slope of the red rise increases to its value at positions farther away from HD 44179 (s28 of n1, February 2002 observation, for instance, is identical to the main spectrum s49 of n2, December 2001 run).

7 Discussion

The previous analysis leads to two rst conclusions. One is that the only part of the spectra which can be attributed to light from the nebula is the red bump, the spectrum at sm aller wavelengths being light from HD 44179 refracted or scattered in the atm osphere. The second conclusion is that only the red rise of the bump is not modil ed from one observation to another.

W hat is the meaning of the bump, and where is the light from the central star scattered by the nebula? E ither the light from HD 44179 scattered by the nebula really is reduced to a small o set, in the blue and maybe in the red; or, it is seen in the red only because it is strongly extinguished from the ozone absorption region onwards (and towards the UV).

In the rst case, the red bum p could be, as it has been admitted so far, an emission process due to some kind of particle which would absorb light in the UV and uoresce in the red. Light from HD 44179 scattered by the nebula is then negligible compared to the uorescence process. However, no such particles have ever been synthetized on earth with the required spectrum, and their nature is still today, after some thirty years of research, a speculative subject (Li& D raine 2002; Van W inckel, C ohen & Gull 2002).

A lso in this case, the red bump could result from extinction and scattering by large grains or by the gas [such an explanation was suggested by Cohen et al. (1975), see Section A (Appendix)]. Forward scattering by large grains would give a spectrum / $e^{a=}$ = (a a constant), with a much too large bump to t the data [all spectra of the Red Rectangle nebula found in the litterature give a ratio of FW HM to central wavelength in the range 0.18-0.30, while scattering by large grains would im ply a ratio close to 4]. It is also not compatible with the large angles of scattering involved in the present case. Scattering by gas will have a spectrum / $e^{g=4} = 4$ (Rayleigh, 1871), which im plies a constant ratio of FW HM to central wavelength of 0.66, also too large to m atch the observations.

In addition to the absence of scattered light from the nebula in the blue, if the red bump is a true nebular feature (an emission process or due to scattering), it is still necessary to understand the reasons for the variability of the blue decrease of the bump (Figure 10, Figure 17, Figure 20, Figure 23), while the red rise keeps, in general, a constant slope (m odi cations of the red slope are observed close to HD 44179 only, and m ay be due, as pointed out in Section 6, to the underlying continuum of HD 44179 light, refracted or scattered in the atm osphere). The correlation between the m odi cations of the blue side of the bump, and the ozone absorption region, would have to be pure coincidence, as would have to be the transform ations used to superim pose the m ain spectra of n1 M arch 2003 observation (Figure 20), which attest the role of atm ospheric extinction on the decrease.

On the other hand, atm ospheric extinction would well explain the particularities of the Red Rectangle nebula spectra. The red rise of the bump is constant, within the nebula, in all observations. It corresponds to a wavelength region with no ozone absorption and where Rayleigh extinction is low. The progressive interruption of the red rise, and the blue decrease, both coincide with the wavelength region where ozone absorption operates. At larger wavelengths, Rayleigh extinction by nitrogen (/ $e^{g=4}$) will relay ozone absorption.

If atm ospheric extinction is the explanation of the red bump, the true meaning would be that atm ospheric extinction does not act in the same way for the nebular light as it does for point sources' light, for HD 44179 or HD 44113 for instance. More generally it in plies that extended objects are not extinguished by the atm osphere in the same way as point sources are, atm ospheric extinction being farm ore e cient on the form er. This can only be related to turbulence, and to the structure of the atm osphere, already responsible for such phenom ena as scintillation, which a ects starlight and not the light from planets.

This hypothesis is further supported by the observations presented in Zagury (2005). Faint and extended galaxies observed with FAST (see the FAST database at: http://tdc-www.harvard.edu/arch as UGC11917, also show a strong decrease from the ozone absorption region onwards, and their blue shape is close to that of the night sky. Except for the three nebulae used in Zagury (2005), I didn't have access to the 2-D spectra of the K witter-H enry database, but anyone who considers the continua of the K witter-H enry spectra will observe that they can be classi ed, according to their shape, into one of very few categories (I found 4 well de ned categories, and this classi cation can probably be simplied). M any of these spectra have the same m arked feature in the red as the Red Rectangle has, while others have a star-like spectrum. O ne can sum ise that this classi cation results from the relative proportion, in the spectra, of light from the central star refracted by the atm osphere, scattered light from the central star in the atm osphere, night sky, and nebular light in the red.

The only part of the Red Rectangle nebula spectrum which is reliable, because of the small e ect of atmospheric extinction in this wavelength region, is the red part, under 1.5 m^{-1} (above 6600 A), before ozone absorption modiles the spectrum. To investigate the nature of this part of the spectrum, we need to study its power law dependence when divided by the spectrum of an A 0 star (sam e spectral type as H D 44179, T 7500 K), as H D 44113. Figure 25 shows that the red rise of the nebula spectrum has a 1 = 4 dependence, which indicates Rayleigh scattering by the gas. This would be in conform ity with the conditions which prevail for these observations, i.e. a scattering medium close to the source of light, and large angles of scattering.

The conclusions nally adopted here [that atm ospheric extinction is more e ective on extended objects than it is on point sources, and that the true spectrum of the Red Rectangle nebula re ects scattering by the gas (hydrogen)] can easily be checked by observing the Red Rectangle nebula, and a non-reddened star of A 0 type, as HD 44113, from space, on a large wavelength range. In the absence of atm ospheric extinction, we expect the ratio of the spectra to vary as $1= 4 e^{g^{-4}}$ over all the visible and UV wavelength range. It would also be desirable to observe di erent positions in the nebula, close to, and far from , HD 44179, to determ ine the variations of the intensity of the scattering, and to see if, close to the star, scattering by large grains, with a 1= dependence, is detected.

8 Conclusion

The observations of the R ed R ectangle nebula presented in this paper outline the importance of atm ospheric extinction on the re-distribution of starlight in the vicinity (1') of a star. The spectra of the nebula all appeared to be the superim position of two components, one in the red, clearly associated with the nebula, one in the blue, which is mainly either direct light from HD 44179 refracted by the atm osphere, or light from HD 44179 forward scattered by atm ospheric aerosols (the proportion of direct and scattered lights depends on the distance from HD 44179, and on the degree of atm ospheric extinction).

In none of the spectra, observed at di erent places of the nebula, and at di erent dates, was it possible to detect the spectrum of the nebula in the blue, which m eans that either there is no (or a negligible) nebular continuum in the blue, or, that atm ospheric extinction strongly extinguishes the nebular light from the ozone absorption region on, towards the UV.

The correlation between the decrease (the blue side of the red bum p) of the light from the nebula and the ozone absorption region, and the variations of the spectra at one position from one date to another, naturally favor the second hypothesis. It will then be inferred that faint extended objects are more sensitive to atmospheric extinction than point sources are. H ints to the same conclusion can be found in the spectra of the K witter H enry database, and of faint extended galaxies observed with FAST.

This is the rst and main conclusion of this paper. It implies that it is not possible to obtain a reliable spectrum of faint extended objects, in the visible and in groundbased observations, by the usual way of norm alizing the spectrum by the spectrum of a reference star.

These considerations give an alternative solution to the Red Rectangle problem, and m ore generally to the red bump found in the spectrum of some nebulae. To explain the bump, last thirty years of research have focused on the existence of particles which would absorb UV light and ucresce in the red (Section A). Such particles, which should be abundant enough to account for some 30% of the scattered red light in the galaxy (Szom oru & Guhathakurta 1998), with an intrinsic photon conversion e ciency of the photolum inescence near 100% (Zubko, Sm ith & W itt 1999; Van W inckel, C ohen & G ull 2002), would indeed represent a rem arkable discovery, and it is a puzzling question to understand how particles we are not able to synthetize on earth, can be so abundant in the cold and nearly empty interstellarm edium. How ever, none of the attem pts to identify these particles has given a satisfactory result yet, their existence being as speculative today as it was thirty years ago (Van W inckel, C ohen & G ull 2002). That atm ospheric extinction be responsible for the red bump would certainly lead to a review of the problem on a more simple and pragmatic basis. It will also explain the similarity outlined by Zagury & Fujii (2003) between the spectrum of a red horizon at sunrise and the spectra of red nebulae. Both spectra result from a combination of Rayleigh scattering by a gas (nitrogen for the red horizon, hydrogen for the nebula), and of atm ospheric extinction (Rayleigh extinction and ozone absorption). This is the second conclusion of the paper.

O ne way to verify these two conclusions would be to obtain broad-band spectra of extended objects from space, with the Hubble Space Telescope for instance. Concerning the R ed R ectangle, I expect the ratio of spectra of the nebula and of a non-reddened A 0 star, as HD 44113, to give a 1= ⁴ dependence over the complete visible spectrum. To observe R ayleigh scattering by the gas, observed positions in the nebula should be taken far enough from HD 44179. Close to HD 44179 it is possible that forward scattering by large grains will be more eligent than scattering by the gas, and that a 1= dependence be found. These observations will evidence, for the rst time, R ayleigh scattering by the gas in the interstellar m edium.

A re ned study of the spectra from the K w iter-H enry database, at the early stage of data reduction where atm ospheric extinction is not yet corrected, could also provide valuable inform ation on the relationship between the conditions of observation and the shape of the spectra. As already mentioned in Zagury (2005), there is little doubt that the proximity of the central star, the balance between the proportions of light from the central star refracted or scattered in the atm osphere, and from the night sky, have a determining in uence on the nal shape of the spectra in the blue. For nebulae with a reliable spectrum in the red (where atm ospheric extinction is low), the ratio of scattered light from the nebula to the spectrum of an unreddened star of same spectral type as the central star, should also provide inform ations on the type of particles which scatter starlight (large grains with a 1= dependence, hydrogen for Rayleigh scattering) between the nebula and the star.

A di erence in the e ect of atm ospheric extinction on point sources and on extended objects can only be due to the time-dependent structure turbulence introduces in the atm osphere. The consequences for our understanding of the atm osphere, like the relations which exist between the spectra at very short angular distances from a star, would merit further attention and investigations.

A The Red Rectangle

The large interest (Sim bad quotes som e 320 references to the Red Rectangle) raised in the thirty past years by the Red Rectangle takes its origin in the Cohen et al. (1975) article, The peculiar object HD 44179 ("The Red Rectangle")'. In conclusion of their paper, the authors address several problem swhich concern the star system at the center of the nebula, the nature of the bi-conical nebula, and the reason (s) for its important brightness in the red.

Large advances in the comprehension of the inner part of the nebula have been m ade in the 1990's, from high resolution imaging, with Roddier et al. (1995) who showed that we do not see direct starlight from HD 44179, only scattered light escaping from the poles of an optically thick disc, seen edge-on. The disc, m ore likely a torus (Tuthillet al. 2002), surrounds a spectroscopic binary with an orbital period of 300 days (Van W indkel, W alkens & W aters 1995). The optical light escaping the torus is that of an A 0 star, with e ective temperature 7500 K (W aelkens et al. 1996). A schem atical representation of this inner system (100 m as around HD 44179) can be seen in Figure 3 of W aelkens et al. (1996) or Figure 8 of M en'shchikov et al. (1998). Recent high resolution images (Tuthill et al. 2002; C ohen et al. 2004) of this inner part of the nebula seem to con m this representation.

On a larger scale the nebula is biconical, and occupies 40" 40" on the sky. The question of its red color, addressed by Cohen et al. (1975), is still a subject of debate. The quite logical proposal by Cohen et al. (1975), that it could be light from the central A 0 star extinguished (by sm all and large grains) and scattered by the gas (because of the large angles of scattering), did not attract much attention (except for two papers, G reenstein & O ke 1977; Perkins et al. 1981), on-going research being oriented towards the search of particles which would absorb in the UV and lum inesce in the red (D uley 1985; d'H endecourt et al. 1986; Seahra & D uley 1999). However, the existence of these particles is still in the speculative dom ain (Li & D raine 2002; Van W inckel, C ohen & G ull 2002).

A cknow ledgm ents

This work was made possible thanks to the courtesy of Roc Cutri, and John Huchra. It is most of all indebted to Lucas Macri, for his unfailing kindness in repeating the observations of the Red Rectangle.

References

- [1] Cohen M., et al., 1975, ApJ, 196, 179
- [2] Cohen M., Van Winckel H., Bond H.E., Gull T.R., 2004, Astron. J., 127, 2362
- [3] Duley W W ., 1985, MNRAS, 215, 259
- [4] Fabricant D., et al., 1998, PASP, 110, 79
- [5] G reenstein J.L., O ke J.B., 1977, PASP, 89, 131
- [6] d'Hendecourt L B , L eger A , O lofsson G , Schm idt W , 1986, A & A , 170, 91
- [7] LiA., Draine B.T., 2002, ApJ, 564, 803
- [8] M assey P., Foltz C B., 2000, PASP, 112, 566

- [9] Men'shchikov A B., Balega Y.Y., Osterbart R., Weigelt G., 1998, NewA., 3, 601
- [10] Perkins H G , Scarrott S M , M urdin P , B ingham R G , 1981, M N R A S, 196, 635
- [11] Lord Rayleigh, 1871, Phil. M ag. XLI, 274, 107
- [12] Roddier F., Roddier C., Graves J.E., Northcott M. J., 1995, ApJ, 443, 249
- [13] Seahra S.S., Duley W W., 1999, ApJ, 520, 719
- [14] Szom oru A., Guhathakurta P., 1998, ApJ, 494, L93
- [15] Tokarz S.P., Roll J., 1997, A.S.P. Conference Series, Vol. 125, 1997, Gareth Hunt and H.E. Payne, eds., p. 140.
- [16] TuthillP., et al., 2002, A & A , 389, 889
- [17] Van W inckel H., Walkens C., Waters L.B.F.M., 1995, A&A, 293, L25
- [18] Van W inckel H., Cohen M., Gull T. R., 2002, A&A, 390, L47
- [19] W alkens C., Van W inckel H., W aters L B F M., Bakker E J., 1996, A & A , 314, L17
- [20] Zagury, F., 2006, Spectral analysis of the background in ground-based, long-slit spectroscopy', in press
- [21] Zagury F., FujiM., 2003, NewA, 8, 549
- [22] Zubko V G ., Sm ith T L ., W itt A N ., 1999, ApJ, 511, L57

Position	U.T. ⁽¹⁾	t ⁽²⁾	(3)	AM. ⁽⁴⁾	A准. ⁽⁵⁾
December 2001 (2001-12-22)					
HD 44179-1	08:44:21	15		1.41	44.92
nl	08 : 45 : 08	60	5.4	1.41	44.80
n2	08:46:53	120	9.8	1.42	44.57
n3	08 : 57 : 00	240	14.3	1.45	43.42
n4	09:03:31	120	11.5	1.46	42.96
n5	09 : 07 : 44	120	7	1.48	42.52
HD 44179-2	09:10:04	15		1.48	42.44
February 2002 (2002–02–09)					
HD 44113	5 : 05 : 06	15		1.38	46.28
HD 44179	5:07:24	5		1.37	46.59
nl	5 : 14 : 08	60	5.3	1.38	46.15
M arch 2003 (2003-03-26)					
HD 44179-1	3:10:46	5		1.51	41.40
nl	3:11:46	60	5.4	1.51	41.18
n2	3:13:23	120	9.8	1.52	40.86
n3	3:15:59	240	14.3	1.54	40.30
sol	3:20:33	120	-5.3	1.55	39.97
n1b	3:23:11	240	6.7	1.57	39.36
so2	3:28:09	240	-8.3	1.59	38.71
HD 44179-2	3:33:27	5		1.60	38.52

Table 1:0 bservations

(1) UT HHMM SS at start of exposure.

(2) Duration of exposure (seconds).

(3) Elevation o set from HD 44179.

(4) Airmass.

(5) A ltitude () of the object at time of observation.



Figure 1: Sum m ary of the observations of the Red Rectangle nebula. For each run (one plot per date), the successive positions of the slit (horizontal lines) are projected on a contour plot of the DSS2 red survey in age centered on HD 44179 ($= 06^{h}19^{m} 37^{s}$, $= 10 38^{0}15^{00}$, J2000). The eld is 3.6' 1.8' large. The slit is oriented E-W , i.e. pixel num bers increase with right ascension. On each line, the approxim ate position of the pixel (of the 2-D array) with m axim um signal is m arked by a vertical line.



Figure 2:2-D arrays for the December 2001 rst (left column) and second (right column) observations of HD 44179.



Figure 3: Upper panel: backgrounds (average of eight spectra of the 2-D arrays, at a m ean distance of 11" from HD 44179) for the two observations of HD 44179 have an identical shape, proportional to the spectrum of HD 44179 times 1 = . Lower panel: decrease of the rst observation background with distance from HD 44179. The backgrounds are the average of 8, 22, 40 spectra, taken at m ean distances of 11", 30", and 60", from HD 44179.



Figure 4: Comparison of the two December 2001 1-D spectra of HD 44179. Bottom spectra: between the beginning (dots) and the end (dashes) of the run, the 1-D spectrum of HD 44179 has decreased in intensity. The slope of the spectrum is slightly decreased in the blue. Top spectra: the di erence of atm ospheric extinction between the two observations is corrected by multiplicating the second observation 1-D spectrum by $1.15e^{0.005=~4}e^{8\,10^{18}}$.



Figure 5: December 2001 (right) and February 2002 (left) observations of position n1. Two backgrounds, close to the nebula and at the edges of the slit, are plotted for the December 2001 observation, which show the transition from HD 44179's light scattered in the atm osphere to night sky spectrum.



Figure 6: December 2001 observations of the nebula at positions n2 (left) and n3 (right).



Figure 7: Left: backgrounds, taken at the extrem ities of the slit, from D ecem ber 2001 observations of the nebula (n1 to n5), are all identical. M idlle: these backgrounds correspond to the night sky spectrum (dashes, from M assey & Foltz 2000), superim – posed on an additional component of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (proportional to the spectrum of HD 44179 m ultiplied by 1=), which mainly a ects the blue part of the spectrum. R ight: the K itt Peak night sky is reproduced by the di erence between the background of the nebular observation and a component of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere.



Figure 8: The backgrounds close to the nebula are deduced from the backgrounds away from it by an additional component of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere. Here, the background, close to the nebula, for the D ecem ber 2001 observation at position n3, is tted by the background at the extrem ities of the slit, added to the 1-D spectrum of HD 44179 multiplied by 1:210⁶ = .



Figure 9: Left: main spectrum (s56) of n1 2-D array is in between s64 and s65 of the rst observation of HD 44179, and is in the blue well reproduced by 2:5 s65. Right: s56 of n1 is compared to spectra of the second observation of HD 44179. It is in-between s66 and s67, and nearly proportional to s67 (the t is 1:3e^{0:0075= 4} s67). The spectrum of the nebula appears in the red only, superposed on the spectrum of HD 44179.



Figure 10: C om parison of the main spectra of D ecem ber 2001 observations of the nebula. Positions 3, 4 and 5, in dots, di er by a constant factor only.



Figure 11: Position 3 m ain spectrum (s48, dots), the background close to the nebula in the same observation (times 5.5, solid line), and the t, proportional to the spectrum of HD 44179 (rst observation) and to 1=: the blue part of the nebular spectra n3, n4, n5, is light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere.



Figure 12: The main spectrum, s52, from n2 2-D array, is observed at about the same distance from HD 44179 as s67 and s68, from the rst observation of HD 44179, are. The blue part of the main spectrum s52 at position n2 is in-between the blue parts of s67 and s68. As shown by the plot, it is perfectly reproduced by one of these spectra with an appropriate scalling (here s67 of HD 44179's rst observation times 0.73).



Figure 13: February 2002 observations of HD 44179 (left colum n) and HD 44113 (right colum n). The spectrum of the nebula appears in the red, above the spectrum of HD 44179, for spectra s37, s38, and s33. Two backgrounds are plotted for HD 44113, to illustrate its decrease with distance from the star.



F igure 14: M arch 2003 observations of the R ed R ectangle nebula. P lots are ordered from left to right and top to bottom by decreasing in portance of the signal (i.e. by increasing distance from HD 44179). For sake of clarity, few spectra only, for each observation, are represented.



Figure 15: Left: The backgrounds from Figure 14 (M arch 2003 observations of the nebula) superimpose well, as for December 2001. Right: the night sky spectrum of M assey & Foltz (2000) (dashes) is compared to the average of the background spectra (dots). In the blue the average spectrum presents an excess, due to light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere, tted (solid line) by the spectrum of HD 44179 multiplied by 1= (and a constant factor).



Figure 16: The spectra at positions n2, n3, so2 of M arch 2003 observations are identical, up to a constant factor (n2 = 2.85 n3 = 1.7 so2).



Figure 17: Left: The red slopes of all nebular observations (except n1) are identical. Here, the spectrum of the nebula averaged over positions n2 and so2, dashes, is com – pared, in the red, to the main spectra at positions n1b (solid line) and so1 (dots). Right: the red rise of the main spectrum s48 at n1 is identical to the precedings in its reddest part only. From the ozone absorption region onwards it is less steep.



Figure 18: M ain spectra at positions n2 (s43) and sol (s44) are proportional in the red (Figure 17), but also in the blue. Their blue part reproduces the background of HD 44179 observations; it is here tted by the spectrum of light from HD 44179 scattered in the atm osphere (proportional to 1= and to the spectrum of HD 44179).



Figure 19: The blue part of M arch 2003 observation n1b (s69) is reproduced by spectrum s54 of the observation of HD 44179 (w ith a decrease of 10 in intensity): close to the star, the spectrum of the nebula appears over the spectrum of refracted-scattered (in the atm osphere) light from HD 44179. The same conclusion was reached from the February observations of HD 44179 (see Figure 13). Spectrum s52 (dashes, scaled by a factor 1.3), from n1 observation, superim poses well on n1b's s69.



Figure 20: Bottom spectra: s47, s48, s49, s50 from n1 M arch 2003 observation, scaled to the same value in the red. Top spectra: The blue part of the spectra di er by their blue slope only, which is determined by the Rayleigh extinction in the atm osphere. s48 is well reproduced by $0.9e^{0.018=~4}$ s47, $1.3e^{~0.004=~4}$ s49, $1.6e^{0.006=~4}$ s50.



Figure 21: C om parison of the backgrounds. Upper pbt: D ecem ber 2001 and M arch 2003 backgrounds are identical, except for a sm all di erence in the blue. Lower pbt: February 2002 and M arch 2003 backgrounds di er in the blue, because of the im portance of the scattered light (from HD 44179) in the atm osphere in the February background. February 2002 background is well tted by the sum of M arch 2003 background, and a component of light from HD 44179 scattered by the atm osphere (proportional to the February 1-D spectrum of HD 44179 and to 1=).



Figure 22: The 1-D spectra of HD 44179 for the three runs di er by an atmospheric transformation: 1-D spectra of the rst observations of December 2001 and M arch 2003 superim pose on the February 2002 spectrum after multiplication by $1.24e^{0.008=4}$ (for December 01), and $1.5e^{0.02=4}$ (for M arch 03).



Figure 23: Spectra observed at n2 and n3 on di erent dates are proportional in the red but di er by their blue continuum . n2 and n3 spectra of M arch 2003 have been multiplied by 7 and 3 to m atch D ecember 2001 observations.



Figure 24: M ain spectra at n1 are extremely dimension one date to the other (left). The dimension spectra is explained by the position of the slit and the aim ass, which determine the proportion of refracted and scattered light (in the atm osphere) from HD 44179 in the spectrum. The right plot shows that the main spectrum of February 2001 n1 observation can be reproduced by a combination of spectra from HD 44179, and from the nebula at position n2, from D ecember 2002 observation.



F igure 25: In dots, the red slope of the R ed R ectangle nebula norm alized by the spectrum of the A 0 star H D 44113 (the y-axis is logarithm ic, the scaling is arbitrary). It behaves as 1=4 (solid line), indicating scattering by the gas.