# Inverse problem for the Landau-Zener e ect 

D.A. Garanin and R. Schilling<br>Institut fur P hysik, U niversitat M ainz, D -55099 M ainz, G erm any<br>(received ; accepted )<br>PACS.03.65.w \{ $Q$ uantum mechanics.<br>PACS. 75.10.Jm \{ Q uantized spin m odels.<br>PACS.03.67.Lx \{ Q uantum computation.


#### Abstract

We consider the inverse Landau-Zener problem which consists in nding the energy-sw eep functions $W$ ( $t$ ) $\quad "_{1}(t) \quad "_{2}(t)$ resulting in the required tim e dependences of the levelpopulations for a tw o-level system crossing the resonance one or m ore tim es during the sweep. $W$ e nd sw eep functions of particular form sthat let $m$ anipu late the system in a required w ay, including com plete sw itch ing from the state 1 to the state 2 and preparing the system at the exact ground and excited states at resonance.


The Landau-Zener (LZ) e ect $\overline{12}_{1}^{2}$ betw een the tw o tim e-dependent levels of a tw o-levelsystem (states 1 and 2) caused by crossing the resonance, is a well know $n$ phenom enon in $m$ any areas of physics. W ell know $n$ applications
 been used to $m$ easure the tunnel splitting in $m$ olecular $m$ agnets $w$ hereby detecting topological interference e ects $\left[\frac{6}{6}\right]$ 1 before crossing the resonance, then, for a constant sw eep rate $v$, the probabillity to stay in this state after crossing the resonanœ is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
P=\exp \quad \frac{2}{2 h v} ; \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

 W ( 1 ) = 1 and is the tunnel level splitting. For fast energy sw eep rates $v$ the system spends too little time in the vicinity of the resonance so that the tunneling $m$ atrix elem ent $h_{1} \hat{H} \hat{j}_{2} i$ cannot bring the system into the state 2 (say, onto the other side of a potential barrier), and the system rem ains in the in itial state 1. For slow sw eep rates the probability to rem ain in the in itial state becom es exponentially sm all, and the system travels into the state 2 rem aining on the low er exact energy term " ( t ) of

$$
\begin{equation*}
" \quad(t)=\frac{1}{2}^{h} "_{2}(t)+"_{1}(t) \quad \mathrm{p}{\overline{W^{2}}(t)+2^{2}}^{i}: \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

$T$ he corresponding adiabatic tim e dependence of the probability to be in state 1 is given by

[^0]In the case where $h v{ }^{2}$ and $v$ is constant, the solution of the Schrodinger equation for
 given by Eq. (1, (1, ) att! 1 .
$T$ he know $n$ results above are valid for the linear energy sw eep, $W$ ( $t$ ) = vt: $O$ ne can consider, how ever, other sw eep functions $W$ ( $t$ ) that behave nonlinearly in the vicinity of the resonance, W . If the tunneling resonance is not too narrow and its position is wellde ned, nonlinear sweeps of a controlled form can be realized experim entally. A though no general analytical solution of the Schrodinger equation is know $n$ for the LZ problem $w$ ith an arbitrary $W$ ( $(t)$; one can look for the functions $W$ ( $t$ ) that result in a desired tim e dependence of the probabillity $\dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1}(\mathrm{t}){ }^{?}$, thus solving the inverse LZ problem. It is the m ain $m$ otivation of this Letter to study this inverse problem which, for instance, $w$ ill allow to determ ine $W$ ( $t$ ) needed to $m$ anipulate and to prepare a quantum system in a speci c state.

O ne class of solutions of the tim e-dependent Schrodinger equation are sm ooth, nonoscillating functions of tim e that describe the com plete sw itching of the system from the state 1 to the state 2, e.g., Eq. ( resonance and ending in a given superposition of the exact states at resonance $W \mathbf{W}$ ( t ) $=0$ fort 0]. The m ost interesting variants of the latter are the system in the ground state at resonance and in the excited state + at resonance. T hese possibilities to $m$ anipulate the system in a required way could prove to be useful for the quantum com puting (Q C). A nother interesting possibility is to sweep at a high rate (nonlinearly in tim e) far from the resonance thus $m$ aking the whole process of crossing the resonance $m$ uch shorter. Exploring these new types of solution of the LZ problem is the aim of this Letter.

To this end, we consider the Schrodinger equation for the coe cients in the wave function $(t)=c_{1}(t) 1_{1}+c_{2}(t) 2$ that can be w ritten in the form

$$
\begin{align*}
\text { hp }(t) & =\frac{i}{2} q(t) ; & p(1)=1 \\
\text { hq(t) }= & i W \operatorname{lt}) q(t) \quad \frac{i}{2} p(t) ; & q(1)=0 ; \quad W(1)=1 \tag{4}
\end{align*}
$$

$w$ th $p(t) \quad e^{"_{1} t} C_{1}(t)$ and $q(t) \quad e^{j_{1} t} C_{2}(t)$. W e are looking for sweep functions $W$ ( $t$ ) that result in a required tim e dependence of the state populations. Before solving this inverse LZ problem analytically, we w ill illustrate num erically the possibility of tim e-sym $m$ etric solutions of Eq. $\left(\overline{4} \underline{1}^{\overline{1}}\right)$ going from $p(1)=1$ to $p(1)=0$ for strongly nonlinear sweep functions $W$ (t). $T$ he sim plest of these cases is the cubic-parabola sw eep with $W(t)=2: 5 t+1: 83 t^{3}$ where we have set $=h=1$ in Eq. (4). The tim e dependence of the probability $\dot{p}(t) j^{2}$ show $n$ in $F$ ig. ${ }_{1}^{11}$ can be tted by $\dot{p} \mathcal{J}^{2}(t)=[1 \quad \tanh (\sinh (t))]=2 w h i c h$ is, how ever, not the analytical solution of Eq. (4,

To nd analytical solutions of the inverse LZ problem, one should rew rite Eq. ( $\overline{4} \overline{4})$ in term s of the probability m j’ and som e phase variable. W e thus de ne

$$
\begin{equation*}
p={ }^{p} \bar{m} \exp \left(i^{\prime}{ }_{p}\right) ; \quad q=\frac{p}{1 \quad m} \exp \left(i^{\prime}{ }_{q}\right) \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

 and the resulting Schrodinger equation can be form ulated in term $s$ of $m$ and the phase di erence' $={ }^{\prime}{ }_{q}{ }^{\prime}{ }_{\mathrm{p}}$ :

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathrm{h} \underline{\mathrm{~m}}=\mathrm{p} \overline{\mathrm{~m}(1 \mathrm{~m}) \sin } \\
& \mathrm{h}_{-}^{\prime}=\mathrm{W}+\frac{1}{2} \mathrm{P} \frac{12 \mathrm{~m}}{\mathrm{~m}(1 \mathrm{~m})}  \tag{6}\\
& \cos ^{\prime}:
\end{align*}
$$



Fig. 1. \{ The cubic-parabola energy sweep $w$ ith $W(t)=2: 5 t+1: 83 t^{3}$ and $=h=1$. $T$ ime dependence of the probability $\dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1}(t) \mathcal{J}=\dot{p}(t) f$ can be tted $w$ ith $\dot{p} \dot{j}=[1 \quad \tanh (\sinh t)]=2 w$ ith graphic accuracy. The function $\dot{p} \jmath^{\jmath}=[1 \quad \tanh t]=2$ is shown for com parison.

This system of equations can be brought into a $m$ ore elegant form by introducing

$$
\begin{align*}
& \mathrm{x} \quad 2 \mathrm{~m} \quad 1 ; \quad 1<\mathrm{x}<1 \text {; }  \tag{7}\\
& \mathrm{y} \quad \arcsin \mathrm{x} ; \quad=2<\mathrm{y}<=2 \text {; } \tag{8}
\end{align*}
$$

and the reduced variables

$$
\begin{equation*}
(=h) t_{i} \quad \bar{W} \quad W=: \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

$T$ hen Eqs. (ī) can be put into the reduced form

$$
\begin{align*}
& \text { @ } y=\sin ^{\prime} \\
& @ \quad=\frac{\mathrm{W}}{} \quad \tan y \cos ^{\prime}: \tag{10}
\end{align*}
$$

The boundary condition for this equation is $y(1)==2$ whereas the value of ' (1) is irrelevant. In general, far from the resonance' ( ) strongly oscillates $w$ ith tim e and the derivative @ $y$ is not sm all. Below we will consider special kinds of solutions of Eq. (1]) which are characterized by a sm ooth, non-oscillating dependence $\sin ^{\prime}()$ and $@ y(1)=0$. Wew ill solve the inverse problem for Eq. (1 ${ }^{-1}$ ) which consists in nding $\bar{W}()$ resulting in a required function $x()$. O ne easily obtains from Eq. (10 $\underline{1}_{1}^{-1}$ ) a general form ula

$$
\begin{equation*}
\overline{\mathrm{W}}()=@{ }^{\prime}+\tan y \cos ^{\prime}=@^{2} y / \cos ^{\prime}+\tan y \cos ^{\prime} ; \quad \cos ^{\prime}=\quad \mathrm{p} \overline{1} \overline{(@ y)^{2}}: \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

The sign in front of cos' determ ines the sign of the function $\bar{W}() . \operatorname{Since} \dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1}(1) \hat{j}=1$ and thus $\mathrm{x}(1)=1$ and $\mathrm{y}(1)==2$ one has $\tan y(1)=1$. To comply w th the condition W $(1)=1$ one has to choose, in general, the negative sign:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=@^{2} \cdot \frac{p}{1} \overline{(@ y)^{2}} \quad \tan y \overline{1} \quad(@ y)^{2}: \tag{12}
\end{equation*}
$$

Before considering particular cases, we will com ment on som e general properties of the functions x() and $\overline{\mathrm{W}}(\mathrm{)}$. If $\mathrm{x}(\mathrm{)}$ is an odd fiunction oftim e then y() is also odd and @ y() is even, whereas $@^{2} y()$ and $\tan y()$ are odd. Then from the rst of Eqs. (1 $\left.10_{0}^{\prime}\right)$ follow $s$ that $\sin ^{\prime}()$ is even. If the sign of cos' does not change, which is the generic situation, cos' ( )
is even. Then from Eq. ( $\left.\underline{1}_{1}^{1} \underline{1}_{-}^{\prime}\right)$ follow $s$ that $\bar{W}()$ is odd. In a sim ilar way one can show that if $x()$ is even (the system retums into the initial state 1 after crossing the resonance) then $\overline{\mathrm{W}}(\mathrm{)}$ is even, too.
$T$ here is an im portant special case, how ever, which is realized if the derivative @y at som e point 0 attains its $m$ axim al value $j_{0} y j=1$ which follows from the rst of Eqs. (10). At this point cos' tums to zero and changes its sign to positive. The latter corresponds to the phase' going from the interval $=2<1<$ into the interval $0<1<=2$. N ote that $\mathrm{@}^{2} \mathrm{y}=0$ at $=0$ thus Eq. (1) does not diverge. If $0=0$ then $\cos ^{\prime}(\mathrm{l})$ is an odd fiunction: $\mathrm{cos}^{\prime}<0$ for $<0$ and cos ${ }^{\prime}>0$ for $>0$. As a result, the parity of $\bar{W}()$ becom es inverse to the parity of $x()$. If $0 \in 0$ then for a sym $m$ etric function $x()$ the sim ilar happens at $=0$. That is, cos' ( ) changes sign two tim es and is an even function, thus the parity of $\bar{W}()$ coincides $w$ th that of $x()$. It should be noted that parity considerations for the direct LZ problem do not apply: Sym $m$ etric form $s$ of $\bar{W}()$ do not necessarily result in sym $m$ etric solutions x ( ) . If, how ever, the solution $\mathrm{x}(\mathrm{)}$ satis $\operatorname{es} \mathrm{x}(1)=1 \operatorname{orx}(1)=1$ and $\bar{W}$ ( ) is tim e sym $m$ etric, then $x()$ is also sym $m$ etric. This follow from the tim e reversibility of the Schrodinger equation and the sym $m$ etry of the boundary values of $x()$.

A nother im plication of this analysis is the existence of the $m$ axim al rate of the probability change. We have seen that ja yj 1 , then from $@ x=\frac{P}{1} x^{2} @ y$ follows ja $x j$ 1. This lim itation is physically clear: Since tunneling between 1 and 2 is caused by the $m$ atrix elem ent $\quad 2 h_{1} \hat{\mathrm{H}} \hat{j}_{2} i$, the latter sets up the natural scale for the tunneling rate, see Eq. $(\overline{9})$. To completely tunnel from 1 to 2 , the system should spend som em inim altim e in the vicinity of the resonance, that is, the sw eep cannot be too fast. Below wew ill discuss tw o m ost im portant fam ilies of the functions $x()$ and corresponding $\bar{W}()$ which depend on in the com bination $u=a$, the param eter a being the $m$ easure of the sweep rate. $W$ e $w i l l$ see that there is a maxim alvalue $a=a_{m}$ ax forwhich $j \mathrm{yj}=1$ at some $=0 . \mathrm{Wewill}$ also see that although the functions $x()$ do form ally exist for $a>a_{m a x}$, one cannot extend $\bar{W}()$ into this region, as a result of the physical lim itation on the tunneling rate. Thus solutions x ( ) w ith $a>a_{m}$ ax are not realizable.

O ne of possible solutions is of the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
x=(1)^{n} p \frac{u^{n}}{1+u^{2 n}} ; \quad u \quad a: \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

For $n$ odd it describes sw itching of the probability from 1 to 2 , whereas for $n$ even the system retums into the in
 realized w th the very slow sweep $\bar{W}$ ( ) of an arbitrary functional form, whereas Eq. (13) is valid for a particular form of $\bar{W}()$ which is not necessarily slow. O ne obtains from Eqs. (ig) and (13)

$$
\begin{align*}
& a y=\frac{1}{1 x^{2}} @ x=(1)^{n} \frac{a n u^{n} 1}{1+u^{2 n}} \\
& @^{2} y=(1)^{n} \frac{a^{2} n u^{n} 2 n \quad 1 \quad(n+1) u^{n}}{\left(1+u^{2 n}\right)^{2}} ; \tag{14}
\end{align*}
$$

whereas $\tan y=x={ }^{p} \overline{1 \quad x^{2}}=(1)^{n} u^{n}$. The derivative @ $y$ has a chance to attain the value 1 at its $m$ axim um that is determ ined by $@^{2} y=0$, i.e., at

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{u}=\mathrm{u}_{\mathrm{max}}=\frac{\mathrm{n} \quad 1}{\mathrm{n}+1}^{1=(2 \mathrm{n})}: \tag{15}
\end{equation*}
$$

At this point one has

$$
\begin{align*}
& \text { ( } \\
& j(@ y)_{m a x} j=  \tag{16}\\
& \begin{array}{lll}
a ; & & n=1 \\
a^{\frac{n+1}{2}} \quad \frac{n \quad 1}{n+1} & (n \quad 1)=(2 n) & \quad n>1 ;
\end{array}
\end{align*}
$$

thus the condition

$$
\begin{array}{lll}
1 ; & & n=1  \tag{17}\\
\frac{2}{n+1} \frac{n 1}{n+1}^{2 n=\left(\begin{array}{ll}
n & 1
\end{array}\right)} ; & n>1
\end{array}
$$

should be ful led. For $a<a_{m}$ ax Eq. ( $\left(\underline{1} \overline{2}_{1}^{\prime}\right)$ yields

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=\frac{(1)^{1}{ }^{1} u^{n}}{1 \quad\left[a n u^{n}{ }^{1}=\left(1+u^{2 n}\right)\right]^{2}} 1 \frac{a^{2} n(2 n+1) u^{2 n}{ }^{2} \quad(n \quad 1) u^{2}}{\left(1+u^{2 n}\right)^{2}} ; \quad u=a \text { : } \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

$T$ his function is plotted for $n=1$ and $n=5$ and di erent values of the param eter a in
 discontinuities result from the invariably negative choice for cos'. For $a=a_{m}$ ax the sign of $\cos ^{\prime}$ can change at $u \overline{\bar{n}} u_{m a x}$ and then these discontinuities disappear. This form of $\bar{W}()$ includes the factor sgn $1+u^{2 n} \quad a n u^{n} 1^{2}$, in addition to Eq. (1") $N$ ote that Eq. (1]
 The sm all- and large-argum ent form $s$ of $\overline{\mathrm{W}}()$ are

$$
\bar{W}() /(1)^{n} 1 \begin{array}{llll}
u^{n} ; & j u j & 1  \tag{19}\\
u^{n}{ }_{2}^{2} ; & j u j & 1 ; & n>1
\end{array}:
$$

In the case $n=1$, Eq. (18) sim pli es to

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=\frac{u}{1+u^{2}} \stackrel{1}{p} \frac{3 a^{2}+2 u^{2}+u^{4}}{1 \quad a^{2}+2 u^{2}+u^{4}}: \tag{20}
\end{equation*}
$$

O ne can see that for $u \quad 1$ the function $\bar{W}()$ describes a linear energy sw eep $w$ ith the velocity $\mathrm{v}=\mathrm{a}$. For $\mathrm{u} \quad 1$ the form of $\bar{W}()$ is nonlinear and for $\mathrm{a}<\mathrm{a}_{\mathrm{n}} \mathrm{ax}=1$ the resonance is crossed


$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=\frac{22^{2}{ }^{4}}{\left(1+{ }^{2}\right)^{2}} \tag{21}
\end{equation*}
$$

This sw eep crosses the resonance two tim es, in the forw ard and backw ard directions, which $m$ eans that the system is in the excited state 2 at the end of the $s w e e p$ at $t=1$. For a < 1 and far from the resonance Eq. (20) has the form

$$
\begin{equation*}
W(t)=\bar{W}()=a={ }^{2} a=h t ; \tag{22}
\end{equation*}
$$

thus the corresponding linear sweep rate is $v={ }^{2} a=h$. Them axim alsw eep rate that ensures the complete switching to 2 is realized at $a=1$ is $v_{m a x}={ }^{2}=h$. For a com parison, in the regular LZ e ect w ith the probability to stay in the in itial state given by Eq. (ili) the sw eep rate $v \quad{ }^{2}=(2 \mathrm{~h})$ is required for a com plete sw itching. For $v={ }^{2}=h$ the probability to stay in the in itial state is still $P=0: 208$.

A nother solution that describes sw itching from state 1 to state 2 is

$$
\begin{equation*}
x=\tanh u ; \quad u=a: \tag{23}
\end{equation*}
$$


 of the sw eep rate a.b $\left\{T\right.$ he same $w$ ith $n=5$. c $\{\bar{T} \text { he population of the exact excited level, } \dot{J}+\}^{2}$, for $n=1$ and di erent values of $a . d\{T$ he sam efor $n=5 . D$ ashed lines in all graphs correspond to $a=a_{m}$ ax and $\bar{W}()$ without jum ps [see, e.g., Eq. (211) $)$.

H ere the sw eep function determ ined from Eq. (12른) reads

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=\frac{\sinh u}{1 a^{2}=\cosh ^{2} u} 1 \frac{2 a^{2}}{\cosh ^{2} u}: \tag{24}
\end{equation*}
$$

In the range $1={ }^{P} \overline{2}<a<1$ the function $\bar{W}()$ changes its sign three tim es and its derivative at $=0$ is negative. $W$ ith a! 1 this derivative increases unlim itedly and a jum pof $\bar{W}()$ at
$=0$ is form ed. For $a=a_{m a x}=1$ the solution $w$ th elm inated jump is an even function

$$
\begin{equation*}
\bar{W}()=\frac{2}{\cosh } \quad \cosh : \tag{25}
\end{equation*}
$$

This sw eep function crosses the resonance two tim es. A gain, Eq. $\left(\underline{2} \overline{4} \overline{1}^{\prime}\right)$ cannot be continued into the region $a>1$.

N ow we retum to the solution for the probability $x$ described by Eq. (13) and analyze its behavior for large $n$. It has a form of three plateaus $x=1$ for $u<1, x=0$ for $1<u<1$, and $\mathrm{x}=1$ for $1^{<} \mathrm{u} w$ th two narrow transition regions between them. In the central region
$1^{<} u<1$ one has $\dot{\mathcal{j}}_{2} \jmath=\dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1} \mathcal{J}=(1+\mathrm{x})=2=1=2$, i.e., the system is in the $m$ ixture of the states 1 and 2 W th equalweights. The sweep function $\bar{W}$ ( ) ofE $q$. ( $1 \mathbf{1}$ ) is fast approaching the resonance at $u=1$ and rem aining in the close vicinity of the latter until $u=1$. Since
the probabilities $\dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1} \jmath=\dot{\mathcal{J}}_{2} \mathfrak{\jmath}=1=2$ do not oscillate in the range $1<u<1$ (unlike the case in which the system is instantaneously brought into resonance), one is lead to the conclusion that the system is in one of the exact quantum states or +. It is naturally of interest to question in which of these exact states does the system com e under the in uence of the energy sw eep described by Eq. (1]). We w ill see below that both variants can be realized. $T$ his opens a possibility to prepare the system in the ground or excited state in resonance by the appropriate choige of $\bar{W}()$. Indeed, for $n \quad 3$ one has $\bar{W}()=@ y=@^{2} y=0$ at $=0$; thus from Eq. (1]) one can see that the sw eep can be stopped at $=0$ and the system w ill rem ain in this state. To dem onstrate this behavior one should rew rite the wave fiunction of the system $=c_{1}(t)_{1}+C_{2}(t) \quad 2$ determ ined above in the basis of the exact states
corresponding to the tim e-dependent \energy eigenvalues" of Eq. $\left.\underline{Z}_{-1}\right)$ as $=C_{+}(t)+(t)+$ c ( t ) ( t . . The corresponding probabillities are given by

O ne can see that in resonance at $\left.t=0 \overline{(\mathbb{W}}=x=0, \cos ^{\prime}=1\right)$ the situation depends on the sign of cos' . For sw eep functions given by Eq. (1d) with $a<a_{m}$ ax one hascos' $=1$ and the system is in the ground state ( $\dot{j}(t) \hat{\jmath}=1, \dot{j}+(t) \hat{j}=0)$. For the specialsw eep functions $w$ ith $a=a_{m}$ ax one has $\cos ^{\prime}=1$ and the system is in the excited state ( $\left.\dot{\mathcal{c}}(\mathrm{t}) \hat{\jmath}=0 ; \dot{j}_{+}(\mathrm{t}) \hat{j}=1\right)$, the transition from the ground state $(t)$ to the excited state $+(t)$ occuring for $n \quad 1$ in the vicinity of $u=u_{m}$ ax of Eq. (15). These features are illustrated for the sw eep functions of Fqs .
 Eq. (211) retums to $\overline{1}$ at $=1$ and the system ends up in the excited state $+=2$.

To conclude, we have solved the inverse Landau-Zener problem for a two-level system, i.e., we have established the form of the sw eep function $W$ ( $t$ ) $="_{1}(t) \quad "_{2}(t)$ needed to insure a given probability $\dot{\mathcal{C}}_{1}(t) \jmath$ 予 to be in the state 1 at timet. $W$ e have discussed two exam ples for which the system perform s a complete transition from 1 to 2 . In contrast to the direct LZ problem with a linear sweep, this can be accom plished by a nite sweeping rate. Further we have found such sw eep functions that prepare the system in its exact ground state or in its exact excited state at resonance. It is not di cult to nd $W$ ( $t$ ) that prepare the system in an arbitrary $m$ ixture of the exact states at resonance, which can be potentially used in quantum com puting based on tunneling units.

## REFERENCES

[1] L. D. Landau, Phys. Z. Sow jetunion 2, 46 (1932).
[2] C. Zener, Proc. R. Soc. London A 137, 696 (1932).
[3] V. V.D obrovitskiand A. K . Zvezdin, Europhys. Lett. 38, 377 (1997).
[4] L.D.Landau and E.M . Lifshitz, Q uantum M echanics (Pergam on, London, 1965).
[5] D.S.F.C rothers and J. G H uges, J. Phys. B 10, L557 (1977).
[6] W .W emsdorfer and R . Sessoli, Science 284, 133 (1999).
[7] D . Loss, D.P.D iV incenzo, and G . G rinstein, Phys. Rev. Lett. 69, 3232 (1992).
[8] J. von Delft and C.L.H enley, Phys. Rev. Lett. 69, 3236 (1992).
[9] A. G arg, Europhys. Lett. 22, 205 (1993).


[^0]:    Typeset using EURO-TEX

