O.A.Petrenko, M.R.Lees and G.Balakrishnan

University of W arwick, D epartm ent of Physics, C oventry, C V 4 7AL, UK

(Dated: April 14, 2024)

In their recent communication (Phys. Rev. B 64,060406 (R) (2001)) C omelius and G ardner have reported the results of magnetization and susceptibility studies on single crystals of the pyrochlore $H o_2 T i_2 O_7$. The observed eld dependence of magnetization is totally unexpected, as it seems to suggest that the magnetic moments in this compound do not obey the 'ice-rule'. We have remeasured the magnetization curves for $H o_2 T i_2 O_7$ single crystal for the three principal directions of an applied magnetic eld and found nearly perfect agreement with the predictions for a nearest-neighbor spin-ice model.

PACS num bers: 75.50.-y, 75.60 E j

The pyrochlore compound H $_{02}$ T $_{i2}O_7$ is considered to be a good realization of the spin-ice model, where the magnetic H $_{0^{3^+}}$ ions possess a strong Ising anisotropy and are constrained to point along the local hllli direction¹. This assertion is most vividly corroborated by the elastic neutron scattering patterns obtained in H $_{02}$ T $_{i2}O_7$ at su ciently low temperature². In the spinice model, the following values of saturation magnetization are predicted^{3,4,5}: M $_{\rm H k [100]}^{\rm sat}$ = $\frac{1}{3}$, M $_{\rm H k [111]}^{\rm sat}$ = 2 and M $_{\rm H k [110]}^{\rm sat}$ = $\frac{p}{6}$, where is a full magnetic moment of a H $_{0^{3^+}}^{\rm sat}$ ion (the corresponding spin con gurations are shown in Fig. 1 of R ef. 5).

C omelius and G ardner⁶ have measured the magnetization and susceptibility of single crystals of H $_{02}$ T $_{12}$ O $_{7}$. A lthough the authors claim ed that the observed magnetization isotherms are qualitatively similar to that predicted by the spin-ice model, two major contradictions with the theoretical predictions are obvious. The rst discrepancy is that the saturation magnetic moment⁷ of 5.9 _B per Ho atom is reported to be nearly independent of the orientation of magnetic eld, while in the spin-ice model M $_{111}$, M $_{110}$ and M $_{100}$ must di er. The second discrepancy is that for H k [110] the magnetization is claim ed to be alm ost temperature independent below T = 4 K.

These are rather surprising results, taking into account that the magnetization curves of a similar spin-ice com – pound, $D y_2 T i_2 O_7$, do follow the theoretical predictions quite precisely^{5,8}. In an attempt to clarify the situation we have re-measured the magnetization curves of $H o_2 T i_2 O_7$ for the three principal directions of an applied magnetic eld, [100], [110] and [111].

Single crystals of $Ho_2T i_2O_7$ have been grown by the oating zone technique using an infrared in age fumace³. By measuring the X-ray di raction patterns on powder samples prepared from single crystals, we con med the high purity of the crystals, as no in purity peaks were found. Them agnetisation versus eld data were collected using an O xford Instruments vibrating sample magnetom eter between 1.6 and 18 K in applied elds of up to 12 T.W e have used sm all (5 to 25 mg) samples of various shapes¹⁰. The absolute accuracy of the magnetization



FIG.1: Field dependence of the magnetization of H $o_2 T i_2 O_7$ single crystals at di erent tem peratures.

m easurem ents was of the order of 3% 11 . The principal axes were determ ined using X -ray di raction Laue photographs; the crystals were aligned to within an accuracy of 1-2 .

The results of the measurements are summarized in Fig. 1, where the observed magnetization is plotted against the elective magnetic eld, $H = H_{ext}$ nM, n being the demagnetization factor¹⁰. For the magnetic eld applied along the easy-axis direction, H k [100],

the magnetization curves look rather similar to those reported by Cornelius and Gardner⁶. The only small di erence is in the value of saturation magnetization: (6:22 0:19) $_{\rm B}$ /Ho compared to 5:9 $_{\rm B}$ /Ho in Ref. 6, which could be attributed to the limited experimental accuracy. For T > 2 K Comelius and Gardner⁶ obtained identical results for M 111 and M 100, while our m easurem ents revealed signi cantly di erent values for di erent orientations at all tem peratures. At su ciently low tem perature, T < 2 K, we observed a plateau in M $_{111}$ at 3:6 $_{\rm B}$ /H o in agreement with ref.⁶. The obtained value of saturation m agnetization, M $_{H \ k \ [111]}^{sat}$, is how ever rather di erent: (5:54 0:17) _B per Hoatom . The saturation is reached in a eld of about 3 to 4 T com pared to 7 to 8 T reported previously⁶. Despite the metastable character of the plateau, no signi cant hysteresis in the magnetisation was detected at any tem perature. Note, that the observed ratio M $_{\text{H k}[111]}^{\text{sat}}$ /M $_{\text{H k}[100]}^{\text{sat}}$ = 0.89 0.05 agrees well with the theoretical ratio $\frac{3}{2}$ 0.866.

O ut results for a hard-axis m agnetization, M $_{110}$, are in the sharpest contrast with Cornelius and G ardner report⁶. The low – eld m agnetization (H < 0:3 T) is found to be temperature dependent and similar to that for the other two orientations of m agnetic eld. W ith increasing eld, the m agnetization grows rapidly and reaches a saturation in a eld of about 1.5 T. The value of the saturation m agnetization for H k [110] is (4:43 0:13) B per Ho atom . A gain, the observed ration M $_{\rm H \ k \ [110]}^{\rm sat}/M _{\rm H \ k \ [100]}^{\rm sat} = 0:73 0:04$ com plies with the spin-ice theory predicting $\frac{1}{2}$ 0:707.

From the values of the saturation magnetization for all the three orientations and from the value of M $_{111}$

- ¹ S.T.Bram well and M.J.P.G ingras, Science 294, 1495 (2001).
- ² S. T. Bramwell, M. J. Hannis, B. C. den Hertog, M. J. P. Gingnas, J. S. Gardner, D. F. McMonrow, A. R. Wildes, A. L. Cornelius, J. D. M. Champion, R.G. Melko and T. Fennell, Phys. Rev. Lett. 87, 047205 (2001).
- ³ M.J.Harris, S.T.Bramwell, P.C.W.Holdsworth and J.D.M.Champion, Phys.Rev.Lett. 81, 4496 (1998).
- ⁴ R.Siddharthan, B.S.Shastry and A.P.Ram irez, Phys. Rev.B 63, 184412 (2001).
- ⁵ H.Fukazawa, R.G.Melko, R.Higashinaka, Y.Maeno and M.J.P.G ingras, Phys. Rev. B 65, 054410 (2002).
- ⁶ A. L. Comelius and J. S. Gardner, Phys. Rev. B 64, 060406 (R) (2001).
- ⁷ The eld of 8-9 T where the magnetization curves in R ef. 6 appear to reach their maximum value cannot be labelled as a saturation eld, because the true ferrom agnetic alignment of all the spins is expected to be established only in much higher elds.
- ⁸ K. Matsuhira, Z. Hiroi, T. Tayama, S. Takagi and T. Sakakibara, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 14, L559 (2002).
- 9 G. Balakrishnan, O. A. Petrenko, M. R. Lees and

2

on it plateau, a full m agnetic m om ent on the H o site is = $(10.9 \quad 0.3)_{\rm B}$. This value is consistent with the free ion m om ent for the 5 I₈ state of H o³⁺, = $10.6_{\rm B}$, but is also close to the value expected for an m_J = 8 doublet ground state, = $10.0_{\rm B}$ (Ref. 12).

The lowest temperature available for our measurements, T = 1.6 K, is still relatively high on the scale of the exchange interactions in $Ho_2Ti_2O_7$, therefore we were unable to see the multiple plateaux in magnetization predicted by the Monte Carlo calculations^{4,13} and observed in the spin-ice compound, $Dy_2Ti_2O_7$ (Ref. 14).

One can only speculate why the results of Cornelius and Gardner⁶ are di erent from our results. Their data cannot be explained solely by a small crystal m isalignment, as pointed out in Ref. 5. An important note to make is that due to a signi cant an isotropy and the large m agnetic m om ents involved in a system, it is extrem ely di cult to keep the H k [110] orientation for a sam ple in a high applied eld^5 . One possible explanation is that both for H k [111] and H k [110] orientations the crystal was allowed to rotate in eld and eventually aligned itself with the [100] easy-axis parallel to the eld. This e ect, how ever, does not explain why the low - eld susceptibility for H k [110] is very di erent from the other two directions¹⁶ and why it is almost temperature independent below T = 4 K. Another possibility is that the actual sam ple tem perature was much higher than stated. Judging by the low - eld value of M_{110} , the real tem perature of the sam ple could have been above 20 K .

To conclude, the observed eld dependence of m agnetization for a single crystal of H o_2 T i_2O_7 m atches well the predictions for the spin-ice nearest-neighbor m odel contrary to the report by C ornelius and G ardner⁶.

- D.M[°]K Paul, J.Phys.: Condens.M atter 10, L723 (1998).
 ¹⁰ The estimated dem agnetization factor, n, varied from 0.3 to 0.65 for di erent crystals.
- ¹¹ A lthough the V SM used could potentially be calibrated to better than 1% accuracy for a particular size and shape sam ple, the actual reproducibility of the m easurem ents for di erent sam ples is only about 3%. The background signal from the sam ple holder was negligible (less than 0.5%).
- ¹² S.T.Bram well, M.N.Field, M.J.Harris and I.P.Parkin, J.Phys.: Condens. M atter 12, 483 (2000).
- ¹³ B.S.Shastry, cond-m at/0210230 (unpublished).
- ¹⁴ T. Fennell, O. A. Petrenko, S. T. Bramwell, J.D.M.Champion, B.Fak, M.J.Harris and D.M[°]K Paul, to appear in Appl. Phys. A.M aterial Science & Processing (2002).
- ¹⁵ For a crystal in an unfavorable orientation, even in a moderate eld of 3-4 T the magnetic forces involved are strong enough to break the crystal itself, not to mention the adhesive materials. Special precautions need to be taken to ensure that the crystal does not move in an applied eld.
- ¹⁶ This observation is in contradiction with the cubic sym metry of the crystal.