# A new dim ension to Turing patterns 

Teem u Leppanen, M ikko K arttunen, and K immo K aski
Research C entre for C om putational Science and Engineering, Helsinki U niversity of Technology, P.O. Box 9400, F IN -02015 H U T, Finland

## R afael A. B arrio

Instituto de F sica, U niversidad N acional A utonom a de M exico (UNAM) A partado P ostal 20-364, 01000, M exico D F., MEXICO

Lim ei Zhang
D epartam ento de Fisiolog a Celular, Facultad de M edicina, U niversidad $N$ acional A utonom a de M exico, 04510, M exico D F., M EX IC O


#### Abstract

It is well known that sim ple reaction-di usion system $s$ can display very rich pattern form ation behavior. H ere we have studied two exam ples of such system $s$ in three dim ensions. First we investigate the $m$ orphology and stability of a generic Turing system in three dim ensions and then the well-know n G ray-Scott m odel. In the latter case, we added a sm all num ber of m onphogen sources in the system in order to study its robustness and the form ation of connections betw een the sources. O ur results raise the question of whether Turing patteming can produce an inductive signaling $m$ echan ism for neuronal grow th.


PACS num bers: 82.40 .C $k, 47.54 .+r, 05.45 .-a$

## I. INTRODUCTION

F ifty years ago A lan Turing proposed the now fam ous reaction-di usion system involving tw o chem icals 战 to model biologicalpattem form ation, and \m_orphogenesis". Since then, it hasbeen extensively used in studying various speci c
 references therein. In Turing system s nonoscillatory (in tim e) bifurcations occur provided that there is a substantial di erence in the di usion rates of the two substances. The appearance of a spatial pattem from the destabilization of a hom ogeneous state in the absence of di usion is known as di usion-driven instability.
$T$ he validity of the Turing $m$ odels for describing developm ental, ecologicaland chem ical processes has been a $m$ atter of debate due to the di culty of nding and identifying the morphogens, and it was not before 1989 that the rst observation of a non-oscillatory steady pattem was found in a realchem ical reaction [4] $]$. M ore recently, it w as pointed out by $K$ ondo and A sai $\left[\bar{F}_{1}^{\prime}\right]$ that the stripes on the skin of the sh P om acanthus Im perator had the characteristics of a Turing pattem, and this w as veri ed later by tw o-dim ensional num erical studies of grow ing dom ains [G]
$T$ he real problem $w$ ith Turing $m$ odels is that bifurcation analysis and num erical calculations in one and two di$m$ ensions tend to produce very sim ilar pattems, for a wide variety of $m$ odels. A detailed study of pattems found in two dim ensions [T] revealed that a cubic term favors striped pattems, while a quadratic term produces spots, the latter being $m$ ore robust. H_ow ever, 迆 is possible to produce m ore com plicated shapes by coupling_a Turing system
 pattems bare striking resem blance to the ones found in the corresponding biological system s. A sit is not easy to experim entally set up the stringent conditions for the appearance of a Turing instability, nam ely, spatialhom ogeneity and a very large ratio of the di usion constants, there has been a lot of research tow ards investigating the e ect on pattems due to selection of having an inhom ogeneous dom ain [1] di erent boundary conditions $[1]$, the presence of


R ecently there has been a suggestion that the concepts of positional inform ation and chem ical signaling present in the Turing system scould play an im portant role as an inductive $m$ echanism for neuronal connections [15] . W e are particularly interested in pursuing this idea, but any speci cmechanism for Turing patteming in a realtissue has to happen in three dim ensions. Since there have been relatively few system atic studies of three-dim ensional pattems, we have recently done som e prelim inary num erical calculations in three dim ensions [16]. The results are analogous to the pattems in tw o dim ensions, although it is not obvious that the pattem selection should be the sam e as in tw o dim ensions.

In this paper we present a series of num erical calculations carried out in a cube w ith periodic boundary conditions. $W$ e have chosen two sim ple generic $m$ odels for this punpose: a well know $n$ version of the $G$ ray-Scott $m$ odel $\left[\begin{array}{l}{[1} \\ \hline\end{array}\right]$, and a general Turing $m$ odel analyzed by B arrio et al. [1] that allow $s$ the investigation of quadratic and cubic tem $s$ separately.

## II. THE MODELS

In this paper we are going to study these tw m odels m ainly num erically in three dim ensions. In its general form the Turing system form odelling the evolution of the concentrations of two chem icals is given as

$$
\begin{align*}
& @_{\mathrm{t}} \mathrm{U}=\mathrm{D}_{\mathrm{U}} \mathrm{r}^{2} \mathrm{U}+\mathrm{f}(\mathrm{U} ; \mathrm{V}) \\
& @_{\mathrm{t}} \mathrm{~V}=\mathrm{D}_{\mathrm{V}} \mathrm{r}^{2} \mathrm{~V}+\mathrm{g}(\mathrm{U} ; \mathrm{V}) \tag{1}
\end{align*}
$$

where $U \quad U(x ; t)$ and $V \quad V(x ; t)$ are the concentrations, and $D_{U}$ and $D_{V}$ the respective di usion constants. The reactions are $m$ odeled by the functions $f$ and $g$ which are typically non-linear.

A s has been pointed out earlier $\left[\underline{Z}_{1}\right]$ in relation to the studies of tw $o$ dim ensional system $s$, there $m$ ay exist a num ber of di erent adm issible $m$ odes having the sam e wave num ber. In three dim ensions, as studied here, this degeneracy occurs already at sm allw ave num bers and the question of which $m$ ode $w$ ill dom inate the evolution becom es even $m$ ore di cult to answer. $T$ his is obvious when one recalls that in a nite grid the adm issible $m$ odes are not continuous but discrete, i.e.,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\tilde{\kappa} j=2 \stackrel{s}{\frac{n_{x}}{L_{x}}}{ }^{2}+{\frac{n_{y}}{L_{y}}}^{2}+{\frac{n_{z}}{L_{z}}}^{2} ; \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

$w$ here $L_{x=y=z}$ denote the system size in respective directions and $n_{x=y=z}$ the respective wave num ber indiges.

## A. G eneral Turing system

A s our rst m odel, we studied a general Turing system proposed by B arrio et al. $\overline{71} 1 \mathrm{l}$. The equations ofm otion are obtained by Taylor expansion around the stationary uniform solution ( $U_{C} ; V_{C}$ ). K eeping term $s$ up to cubic order, the equations ofm otion read as follow s

$$
\begin{align*}
& @_{t} u=D r^{2} u+u\left(1 \quad r_{1} v^{2}\right)+v\left(1 \quad r_{2} u\right) \\
& @_{t} v=r^{2} v+v\left(+r_{1} u v\right)+u\left(+r_{2} v\right) \tag{3}
\end{align*}
$$

where $u=U \quad U_{c}$ and $v=V \quad V_{c} m$ aking the point $(u ; v)=(0 ; 0)$ a stationary solution. The constant is a scaling factor and $D$ is the ratio betw een the di usion constants of the tw o chem icals. It is im portant to notice that $D \in 1$ is required for the di usion-driven instability to occur. $T$ he param eters $r_{1}$ and $r_{2}$ of the non-linear interactions correspond to, as can be veri ed by sym $m$ etry argum ents, stripes and spot pattems, respectively.
$T$ he linear analysis for this system was done by B arrio et al. $[\vec{l}]$. For com pleteness, the results that are relevant for this study are sum $m$ arized here. The system described by Eq. (3i) has a stationary solution for (u;v) $=(0 ; 0)$ and a second solution for

$$
v=\frac{(+)}{+1} u:
$$

By setting $=$ it is possible to enforce $(0 ; 0)$ as the only stationary solution. $T$ he dispersion relation for the linearized equation can be found by noticing that the spatial variation of $u$ and $v$ can be given in a plane wave form, and in order to nd the eigenvalues standard $F$ loquet analysis $w$ ith $u=u_{0} \exp (t)$ and $v=v_{0} \exp (t)$ is used. This leads to

$$
\begin{equation*}
2 \quad B+C=0 \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $B=\left(+\quad k^{2}(1+D)\right), C=\left(\quad D k^{2}\right)\left(\quad k^{2}\right)+$, and $k^{2}=\mathbb{K} \mathbb{K}$.
Thep onset of instability is sub ject to the follow ing conditions: if 0 then , if 0 then 1 , and 2 D $>\mathrm{D} . \mathrm{W}$ th these conditions, the $w$ avenum ber of the $m$ ost unstable $m$ ode is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\mathrm{k}_{\mathrm{c}}^{2}=\frac{\mathrm{D}(\quad)(\mathrm{D}+1)^{\mathrm{p} \overline{\mathrm{D}}}}{\mathrm{D}(\mathrm{D} \mathrm{1)}}: \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

$T$ his equation was used to select param eters for the sim ulations. It is worth noticing that the algebraic form $s$ of $B$ and C in Eq. $(\underline{4})$ ) m ake it di cult to analyze the system further. This is why Eq. ( $\overbrace{2}^{-1}$ real parts of the eigenvalues plotted against the wave num ber $k$ for the three $m$ odes we have used.


FIG. 1: The dispersion relation of Eq. $\overline{(\overline{3})}$ ) for selected m odes. The param eters were $\mathrm{D}=0: 516,=0: 899,=0: 91$ and $=2$ for $\mathrm{k}=0: 45$ (dashed line), $\mathrm{D}=0: 122,=0: 398,=0: 4$ and $=2$ for $\mathrm{k}=0: 84$ (dash-dot line), $\mathrm{D}=0: 516,=0: 89$, $=0: 99$ and $=: 25$ for $\mathrm{k}=0: 96$ (solid line). The region above $(\mathrm{k})=0$ bounds the w ave num ber values for unstable m odes.
B . G ray-S cott m odel

The second system we study is the G ray-Scott [1] $\overline{1}] \mathrm{m}$ odel corresponding to tw o irreversible chem ical reactions

$$
\begin{array}{rll}
U+2 V & ! & 3 V \\
V & ! & P ; \tag{6}
\end{array}
$$

i.e., the reaction of chem ical U w ith two parts of V produces three parts of V. D ue to the irreversible nature of the reactions, chem ical $P$ is an inert product. To write down the di erential equations for the process, it is assum ed that chem icalU is fed in the reaction $w$ ith constant rate $F$, the inert product is rem oved from the system, and that the second reaction is described by the rate constant K . T he equations of $m$ otion for the concentrations of the tw o chem icals $u \quad u(x ; t)$ and $v \quad v(x ; t)$ in dim ensionless units are as follow $s$

$$
\begin{align*}
& @_{t} u=D_{u} r^{2} u \quad u v^{2}+F\left(\begin{array}{ll}
1 & u
\end{array}\right) \\
& @_{t} v=D_{v} r^{2} v+u v^{2} \quad(F+K) v ; \tag{7}
\end{align*}
$$

where it has been further assum ed that chem icalU is being consum ed by the reaction at a rate that is proportional to $u v^{2}$. The di usion coe cients for the two chem icals are $D_{u}$ and $D_{v}$, respectively.

The G ray-Scott m odel was studied analytically, and num erically in two dim ensions, by P earson [1] $\bar{\eta}_{1}$ w ho m apped the phase diagram for the system in term $s$ of the two rate constants for the reactions. This $m$ odel exhibits a very rich behavior ranging from tim e-independent steady solutions to chaotic, oscillatory, and to tim e-dependent phase turbulent behavior. Furthem ore, Vastano et al. [1] [] have show $n$ that the system develops spatially steady pattems even when the two di usion constants are equal. This behavior is particular to the one-dim ensional case and it has not been observed in other dim ensions.

In this study，we rst perform ed num erical sim ulations of the $G$ ray－Scott m odelin three dim ensions．A fter that，we random ly added a sm all num ber of souroes for chem icalV．The m otivation for adding the sources was to investigate the robustness of pattems and the form ation of connections between the sources，thus attem pting to m im ic the developm ent of a biologicalnetw ork，e．g．，the form ation of synaptic contacts betw een neurons．C urrently，it is unclear whether Turing system s can produce such an inductive signaling $m$ echanism for neuralpatteming $[10$ idea is nevertheless plausible．

## III．NUMERICALCALCULATIONS

First，we will present results from the num erical sim ulations of the general Turing system as given by Eq．（ᄌᄌ3）． Unless otherw ise $m$ entioned，all the sim ulations were perform ed in a cubic dom ain of grid size $50 \quad 50 \quad 50$ using periodic boundary conditions．The well－know $n$ Euler algorithm was used for tim e integration with tim e step dt＝0：05 for the general Turing system and $d t=1: 0$ for the $G$ ray－Scott $m$ odel．

In addition，to test the robustness of the pattems，we perform ed a sm all num ber of sim ulations using Eq．（⿳一人⿴囗十刂 an added uncorrelated G aussian noise source $(x ; t) w$ ith the rst and second $m$ om ents de ned ash $(x ; t) i=0$ and $h(x ; t) \quad\left(x^{0} ; t^{0}\right) i=2^{\prime \prime}\left(x \quad x^{0}\right) \quad(t \quad t)$ ．The angular brackets denote an average and＂is the intensity of the noise．

## A．G eneral Turing sy stem

In their study of the tw o－dim ensionalTuring system B arrio et al．［7］pointed out that the quadratic term in Eq．［उ］） favors spots whereas the cubic term enhances stripes．They also noticed that the spots were m ore robust．

Fig． 1211 show s pattems obtained from sim ulations of the three－dim ensional system．In the top row，the param eters were chosen to favor lam ellar pattems，i．e．，$r_{2}=0$ ．The gures im ply that starting from com pletely random initial conditions，it is not likely for the system to converge into a purely lam ellar state． T his w as con m ed by a num ber of extensive sim ulation runs．

The di erence betw een Fig．$\overline{2}$ and $F$ ig．$\overline{2}$ b is that the param eters and have been selected in such a way as to enhance $m$ odes $w$ th $w$ avenum bers $k=0: 45$ and $k=0: 84$ ，respectively．These are the $m$ ost unstable $m$ odes in the sense of the linear approxim ation for param eter sets $=0: 899,=0: 91,=2, D=0: 516$ ，and $=0: 398$ ，
$=0: 40$ ，$=2$ ，and $D=0: 122$ ，respectively．$T$ hese particular choices of param eters w ere $m$ ade in order to facilltate the com parison $w$ ith the 2 D results．The reason for these choioes is that in the rst case，in the sense of the linear analysis，there are very few adm issible m odes w ith positive grow th rates and zero wavenum ber degeneracy．A $s$ it is clear from Eq．（Z，$\overline{1})$ ，degeneracy becom es increasingly im portant at higher w avenum bers．Ideally，the choice $\mathrm{k}=0: 45$ should produce pattems w ith w ave vector $\widetilde{K}=2\left(n_{x}=L ; 0=L ; 0=L\right)$ ，i．e．，favoring strongly the lam ellar phase when $r_{2}=0$ ．H ow ever，as seen in Fig．＇1，＇1a，the system has not reached a lam ellar state even after 500000 tim e steps but it has converged to a $m$ ixed state instead．The sim ulations con $m$ ed that to be the stable nal state．

Fig．${ }_{1}^{2}+1 / \mathrm{b}$ displays the situation where $\mathrm{k}=0: 84$ is favored．In this case，there are m ore closely spaced adm issible $m$ odes leading to a com petition betw een them．It is im portant to notioe that the system has a nite size and thus there are，in the sense of the linear analysis，only certain adm issible modes（Eq．（i））．

From the topm ost gures of $F$ ig．ith is clear that the com petition betw een the $m$ odes in the three－dim ensional Turing system can lead to very interesting morphologies．In two dim ensions，as studied by B arrio et al．$\overline{1}]$（ $F$ igs．2a and 2 b therein），the corresponding pattems display stripes w ith a very sm all（or zero）num ber of topologicaldefects． $T$ he defects can be considered as rem iniscents of the $m$ ore com plicated pattem selection in 3 D since the 2D stripe pattems can be seen as cuts from a 3D lam ellar system．H ow ever，as seen in F igs．$\overline{\mathrm{Z}} \mathrm{l}$ and b ，the 3D case displaysm uch richer behavior and it is very di cult to obtain a purely lam ellar pattem starting from random initial conditions．It should also be observed that the di erence betw een Figs．2a and 2b in length（ ）．H ow ever，in three dim ensions the qualitative di erence of the tw o quantitatively di erent cases is clearer （Figs．＇2， l a and b）．

In the bottom row of $F$ ig．$\overline{11}$, the param eters $r_{1}$ and $r_{2}$ have been selected to favor spots，or spherical shapes（these can be com pared directly to $\bar{F}$ igs． $2 e$ and $2 f$ in $B$ arrio et al．$[\bar{T}, \overline{1})$ ．The sphericalpattems tumed out to be very robust． In the sim ulations，these $m$ orphologies developed very fast and were also stable against random $G$ aussian uctuations that w ere used to test the stability of the pattems against perturbations as discussed earlier．

To study whether it is possible to obtain pure m odes，we set up the system in such a way that the in itialconditions should favour only one selected mode．Fig．Wha show s a situation where the system was prepared in such a way that a layer of chem icalU w as set only in the $m$ idplane of the sim ulation box to provide favorable initial conditions for the lam ellar structure to develop．The param eters are the sam e as used in Fig． 12 p ．In F ig．． only in locations corresponding to the 111－plane in a triangular m esh，i．e．，favoring hexagonalsym $m$ etry of the spots


FIG .2: P attems obtained from sim ulations of the generalTuring m odelafter 500000 iterations using random in itialconditions on every site of the lattice: $u_{0} ; v_{0} 2(0 ; 1)$. Top row : $r_{1}=3: 5$ and $r_{2}=0 ;$ bottom row : $r_{1}=0: 02$ and $r_{2}=0: 2$. Left colum $n$, the param eters w ere chosen to favor $\mathrm{k}=0: 45$; in right colum n to favor $\mathrm{k}=0: 84$.
obtained as in F ig. these pattems w as also tested against $G$ aussian uctuations and both of them tumed out to be robust, although the planes tended to align in a di erent $w$ ay and curve slightly when a substantial am ount of noise was used.

To explore the e ects ofm ultiple modes on the monphology of the system, we tuned the param eters in such a w ay that $m$ ode $k=0: 96 \mathrm{w}$ as the m ost unstable one. In the sim ulations we used param eters $=0: 89,=0: 99$, $=0: 25$; $D=0: 516$. T he non-linear param eters were $r_{1}=0: 02$ and $r_{2}=0: 2$ corresponding to spotty pattems. Fig. $1.417 a$ show a stabilized con guration where the pattem show s a tubular-like structure.

To observe com petition betw een spherical and lam ellar structures we isolated mode $k=0: 45$ and set both $r_{1}$ and $r_{2}$ di erent from zero. U sing non-linear param eters $r_{1}=3: 5$ and $r_{2}=0: 2$ resulted in the com petition clearly seen in Fig. ${ }^{1}+\mathrm{l}+\mathrm{b} 0$. It took 2000000 tim e steps to stabilize the structure.

$$
\text { B. G ray-S cott } m \text { odel }
$$

$F$ inally, we perform ed sim ulations in two and three dim ensions using the G ray-Scott model of Eq. (7, 1 ) . In these sim ulations we have used $D_{u}=0: 125$ and $D_{v}=0: 05$ for the two di usion constants. By scanning the phase space we


FIG. 3: Pattems obtained from sim ulation of the general Turing m odel after 500000 iterations. Left: In itial conditions: chem ical U set in midplane, b) in itial conditions: chem ical U placed on 111-plane in a triangular $m$ esh.


F IG . 4: Pattems obtained using Eq. (31) . a) A fter 500000 tim e steps. The isolated mode w as $\mathrm{k}=0: 96$ and non-linear param eters $r_{1}=0: 02$ and $r_{2}=0: 2$, and b) after 2000000 tim e steps, $k=0: 45, r_{1}=3: 5$ and $r_{2}=0: 2$.
obtained very rich behavior. H ow ever, com plexity and tim e dependence of som e of the solutions caused di culties in visualising the resulting pattems in three dim ensions. The three-dim ensionalG ray-Scott m odel show ed disordered lam ellar-like and spotty-like phases. W e also studied the case in which we distributed random ly four sources of chem ical $V$ in the system. The sources feed the chem ical at a constant rate ( $+0: 01$ ). T he shape of these sources is cross-like, having six branches in three dim ensions to $x, y$ and $z$-directions, respectively.

A s discussed before, the $m$ otivation for including the sources is to investigate if the Turing $m$ echanism could be considered as a candidate for a m echanism describing neuronal grow th. Should that be the case, the sources can be thought of as representing neurons whereas the grow ing dendrites $m$ ust connect them. In the sense of pattem form ation in 3D system $s$, one requirem ent is the form ation of stable tubular pattems. $T$ he $G$ ray-Scott $m$ odel clearly
 appearance of these tubular shapes seem s characteristic for the $G$ ray-Scott $m$ odel whereas it was di cult to obtain in the case of the general Turing system. A system atic study is on the way to address these issues [2d].


FIG.5: a) Pattem obtained in a $120 \quad 120$ lattice w ith periodic boundary conditions using the two-dim ensional G ray-Scott m odel in the presence of eight sources of $m$ orphogen $V \mathrm{w}$ ith param eters $\mathrm{F}=0: 065, \mathrm{~K}=0: 0625, \mathrm{D} u=0: 125, \mathrm{D} v=0: 05$. T he sources appear as \cross-like" pattems. b) P attem obtained using the three-dim ensional G ray-Scott $m$ odel w ith four sources of $V, F=0: 045, K=0: 065, D_{u}=0: 125, D_{v}=0: 05$.

## IV . D ISC U SSIO N

In this paper, we have studied tw o reaction-di usion models of Turing type in three dim ensions. The rst $m$ odel is the generalm odel obtained by Taylor expansion and the other the well-know n G ray-Scott m odel.
$W$ e have shown that by enhancing more than one mode we can clearly see the com petition between di erent m odes. T his is m anifested as defects in the topology of the three-dim ensionalstructures, whereas the pattems in tw o dim ensions have very few defects. In tum this is due to the di culty of aligning planes com pared w ith aligning lines in parallel. A lso the spots appear to be less regular in the case where there are more $m$ odes com peting. By favoring certain con gurations w ith the choice of initial conditions we were able to drive the system to a purely lam ellar structure or hexagonalsym $m$ etry. W e tested the results against $G$ aussian noise and found the spots $m$ ore robust in all cases. To obtain chaotic behavior and com petition we used wide window of values for the wave vector and adjusted non-linear param eters.

The long range goal of our three-dim ensional sim ulations is to model real biological developm ent, which can be done only in three dim ensions. T here are num erous exam ples of lam ellar structures in nature, e.g. the skin and brain are form ed out of layers. A s we show ed the G ray-Scott m odelproduces com plex and stable tubular structures, where the tubes show bifurcations. In light of the results in tw o dim ensions we believe that the branches connect the sources also in three dim ensions. It is known that neurons do not alw ays form connections w ith the nearest neurons, but w ith neurons far aw ay, behind other cells. W e believe that Turing pattems could explain this spatial selectivity by providing the signaling pathw ays for neurotrophic factors. Sim ple di usion of these substances cannot explain the com plexity of neuronalpatteming.

A cknow ledgm ents. W e would like to thank Prof. P K. M aini ( O xford, UK) for usefiul discussions and Jarm o $P$ irhonen of the $C$ entre for Scienti c Computing ( $E$ spoo, $F$ inland) for his help in visualization of the $3 D$ Turing system s. This work was supported by D GAPA UNAM through project $\mathbb{N} 104598$ and by the $A$ cadem $y$ of $F$ in land through its C entre ofE xcellence P rogram me. O ne ofus (RAB) thanks the D epartm ent of heoreticalP hysics, O xford U niversity of the hospitality during the preparation of this w ork.
[1] A M . Turing, P hil. Trans. R . Soc. Lond., B 237, 37-72 (1952).
[2] JD.M urray, M athem atical B iology, 2nd. ed., (Springer Verlag, B erlin 1993).
[3] P K.M aini, K J. Painter, and H N P. Chau, J. Chem . Soc., Faraday Trans. 93, 3601 (1997).
[4] V. C astets, E. D ulos, J. B oissonade and P. de K epper, P hys. Rev. Lett. 64 (3), 2953 (1990).
[5] S. K ondo, and R.A sai, N ature, 376, 678 (1995).
[6] C . V area, J.L. A ragon, and R A. B arrio, P hys. Rev. E, 36 (1), 1250 (1997).
[7] R A. B arrio, C . V area, J L. A ragon, and P K .M aini, B ull. M ath. B iol, 61, 483 (1999).
[8] L J. Shaw, and J.D .M urray, SIA M J. A ppl. M ath. 50 (2), 628 (1990).
[9] K J. P ainter, P K .M aini, and H .G . O thm er, P roc. N atl. A cad. Sci., U SA , 96, 5549 (1999).
[10] D L. Benson, JA. Sherratt, and P K.M aini, Bull M ath. B iol, 55 (2), 365 (1993).
[11] R A. B arrio, J.L. A ragon, M. Torres, and P K .M aini (in th is volum e)
[12] J L. A ragon, C. V area, R A. B arrio, and P K .M aini, FORM A, 13, 213 (1998).
[13] C.V area, J.L.A ragon, and R A.Barrio, P hys. Rev. E, 60 (4) 4588 (1999).
[14] P. P adilla, R. P laza, F. Sanchez-G arduno, P K . M aini, and R A. Barrio, The E ect of grow th and curvature on pattern form ation,(to be published).
[15] R A. B arrio, and L. Zhang, P roc. IV C ongreso N acional de B iolog a del D esarrollo, Bol. Ed. B ioquim . 18, 32 (1999); L. O livarese uiroz, and R A. B arrio T PP, revista especializada en C iencias Qu mion B iologicas 3 (1), 5 (2000).
[16] T . Leppanen, R A. B arrio, M . K arttunen, K . K aski, P attern Form ation in Turing System S, P roc. $35^{\text {th }}$ A nnualm eeting of the $F$ innish Phys. Soc. (2001).
[17] J. . P earson, Science, 261, 189 (1993).
[18] P. G ray, S K . Scott, C hem . Eng. Sci., 38, 29 (1983).
[19] JA. Vastano, J E. P earson, W . H orsthem ke, H L. Sw inney, P hys. Lett. A , 124, 6 (1987).
[20] T . Leppanen, M . K arttunen, R A. B arrio, L. Zhang, K . K aski in progress.

