Comment on "Dephasing Times in Quantum Dots due to Elastic LO Phonon-Carrier Collisions"

In a Letter [1] Uskov et al. proposed a second-order elastic interaction between quantum dot (QD) charge carriers and longitudinal optical (LO) phonons as an intrinsic mechanism for dephasing in QDs. It was claimed in Ref. [1] that this coupling may lead to dephasing times of the order of 200 fs at $T=300 \mathrm{~K}$ and to a Gaussian absorption lineshape.

In the present Comment we show that this result by Uskov et al. is incorrect. We demonstrate that (i) the level-diagonal quadratic coupling to dispersionless LO phonons leads in QDs to no dephasing at all, and (ii) the spectrum consists exclusively of discrete lines.

In order to make things more clear, we disregard completely the linear coupling $\hat{H}^{(1)}$ which is indeed zero if the electron and hole confined functions are identical, as done in Ref. 1], and we neglect any phonon damping. We use $\hat{H}^{(2)}=-\sum_{\mathbf{q}, \mathbf{q}^{\prime}} F\left(\mathbf{q}, \mathbf{q}^{\prime}\right)\left(a_{\mathbf{q}}+a_{-\mathbf{q}}^{\dagger}\right)\left(a_{-\mathbf{q}^{\prime}}+a_{\mathbf{q}^{\prime}}^{\dagger}\right)$ as quadratic coupling with a factorizable function $F\left(\mathbf{q}, \mathbf{q}^{\prime}\right)$ (assuming only one electron and one hole excited state). Then, as shown in 2], the linear optical polarization can be given exactly by $P(t)=\exp \{K(t)\}$ with the cumulant $K(t)$ being an infinite sum of all-order diagrams,

$$
\begin{equation*}
K(t)=-\frac{1}{2} \sum_{j=1}^{\infty} \ln \left[1-i \varkappa \lambda_{j}(t)\right] \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $\varkappa=(2 / \hbar) \sum_{\mathbf{q}} F(\mathbf{q}, \mathbf{q}) . \lambda_{j}$ are all possible eigenvalues of the Fredholm problem, Eq. (10) of Ref. [2]. For the present case of dispersionless LO phonons,


FIG. 1: Absorption spectrum and polarization amplitude (inset) calculated exactly, using Eq. (1), and up to second order in the cumulant, Eq. (3), as done in Ref. [1]. Parameter values are the same as in Ref. [1]: $T=300 \mathrm{~K}, \hbar \omega_{\mathrm{LO}}=36 \mathrm{meV}$, $\hbar \sigma=\hbar \varkappa \sqrt{\bar{n}(\bar{n}+1)}=2.2 \mathrm{meV}$.
the eigenvalues can be obtained straightforwardly: $\omega_{\mathrm{LO}} \lambda_{j}=2 i /\left(s_{j}^{2}-1\right)$, where $s_{j}$ are the solutions of

$$
\begin{equation*}
\tan \left(\frac{s \omega_{\mathrm{LO}} t+\pi}{2}\right)=s \tan \left(\frac{\omega_{\mathrm{LO}} t+\pi+i \beta}{2}\right) \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

for even eigenfunctions $\left(\beta=\hbar \omega_{\mathrm{LO}} / k_{B} T\right)$. For the odd solutions, drop $\pi$ in Eq. (2). The inclusion of two degenerate excited states for both carriers (as done in Ref. [1]) will lead only to an additional factor of 2 in Eq. (1).

Uskov et al. calculated the same cumulant only up to second order (see Eq. (12) in Ref. [1]), which would read

$$
\begin{equation*}
K^{\prime}(t)=\sum_{j=1}^{\infty}\left[\frac{i \varkappa \lambda_{j}(t)}{2}-\frac{\varkappa^{2} \lambda_{j}^{2}(t)}{4}\right] . \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then the amplitude of the polarization $P^{\prime}(t)=$ $\exp \left\{K^{\prime}(t)\right\}$ is a rapidly decaying (nearly Gauss) function (dashed curve in the inset of Fig.1), while the exact polarization is almost perfectly periodic (full curve). In order to check that the full solution indeed does not lead to any dephasing we have also diagonalized exactly the Hamiltonian in the spirit of Ref. [3]. The only phonon mode which couples to the electronic system carries a renormalized frequency $\tilde{\omega}_{\mathrm{LO}}=\sqrt{\omega_{\mathrm{LO}}^{2}-2 \varkappa \omega_{\mathrm{LO}}}$, and the absorption (Fig.1) represents a set of discrete delta-lines, $\alpha(\omega)=\sum_{n, m=0}^{\infty} \alpha_{n m} \delta\left(\omega-n \tilde{\omega}_{\mathrm{LO}}+m \omega_{\mathrm{LO}}\right)$, in agreement with Ref. [3] where the full problem of a few electronic and hole levels in a QD coupled to LO-phonons is solved exactly. Note the fine structure of satellites separated by $\delta=\left|\omega_{\mathrm{LO}}-\tilde{\omega}_{\mathrm{LO}}\right|$, in addition to the standard two-phonon satellites asymmetrically positioned around the zero-phonon line. In contrast, the Gauss-like spectrum found by Uskov et al. (dashed curve) has a finite linewidth.

In conclusion, we have shown that the finite dephasing times in QDs derived in Ref. [1] are an artefact due to a truncation of the infinite series in the cumulant. Dispersionless LO phonons quadratically coupled to a single QD transition produce no dephasing, but a rich line spectrum, in agreement with a more general approach [3].
E. A. Muljarov and R. Zimmermann

Institut für Physik
Humboldt-Universität zu Berlin
Newtonstrasse 15, D-12489 Berlin, Germany
27 September 2005
PACS numbers: $63.20 . \mathrm{Kr}, 71.38 .-\mathrm{k}, 78.67 . \mathrm{Hc}, 78.55 . \mathrm{Cr}$
[1] A. V. Uskov, A.-P. Jauho, B. Tromborg, J. Mørk, and R. Lang, Phys. Rev. Lett. 85, 1516 (2000).
[2] E. A. Muljarov and R. Zimmermann, Phys. Rev. Lett. 93, 237401 (2004).
[3] T. Stauber, R. Zimmermann, and H. Castella, Phys. Rev. B 62, 7336 (2000); arXiv:cond-mat/0506408

