# Sm all param eter for lattice $m$ odels w ith strong interaction 

A N. Rubtsol -<br>D epartm ent of Physics, M oscow State University, 119992 M oscow, Russia


#### Abstract

D iagram series expansion for lattice $m$ odels $w$ ith a localized nonlinearity can be renorm alized so that diagram vertexes becom e irreducible vertex parts of certain im purity m odel. Thus renorm alized series converges well in the very opposite cases of tight and weak binding and pretends to describe in a regular way strong-correlated system $s$ with localized interaction. Benchm ark results for the classicalo $(\mathbb{N}) \mathrm{m}$ odels on a cubic lattice are presented.


O ne of the key problem $s$ of the $m$ odem condensedm atter theoretical physics is the quest for a regular description ofthe strong correlations [1]. R oughly speaking, correlations are strong if the nonlinearity and coupling are com parable, and therefore perturbative approaches $m$ ake no sense.

C onsider a lattice $m$ odel w ith local coupling betw een œlls w ith a nonlinearity localized inside each cell. In the two lim it cases of the weak and tight binding a series expansion can be perform ed in powers of the respective sm all param eters [2]. O ne of a few regular ways to handle the situation of crossover is to em ploy the concept of localized correlations. It basically $m$ eans that interaction ofeach cellw th the rest of the system can approxim ately be described asan interaction $w$ ith certain non-correlated e ective bath [B]. The param eters of this bath are to be found self-consistently. If there is, say, one particle per cell, it $m$ eans that realm ulti-site problem is approxim ated by $m$ uch sim pler single-site one ("im purity problem "). An exam ple of such an approach is the m ean- eld description of the classical statistical ensem bles of interacting particles. In this schem e, interaction of a particle $w$ th its uctuating surrounding is replaced w ith interaction of a particle w ith a constant average eld. There is a self-consistent equation for this eld. An accuracy can be dram atically increased for change the $m$ ean- eld by $G$ aussian-bath approxim ation. In this case, the surrounding is approxim ated by certain $G$ aussian ensem ble. It is im portant that alm ost the sam e argum entation can be presented for very wide class of system s. P articularly, so-called dynam icalm ean- eld theory (DM FT) for strongly interacting ferm ions is essentially a G aussianbath approxim ation [4].

Physically, G aussian-bath approxim ation consists in the assum ption that the irreducible part ofhigh $m$ om enta is localized inside a single site. The strong point of this assum ption is that it is valid for severalvery di erent lim its for system $s$ w ith localized nonlinearity. The approxi$m$ ation reproduces leading-order results of the w eak-and tight-binding series expansion sim ultaneously. Indeed, if the nonlinearity is sm all, the perturbation theory explicitly says that correlations are localized in the rst-order of weak-binding approxim ation. On the other hand, if coupling goes to zero, sites becom e alm ost isolated and correlations are obviously localized, no m atter how strong
the nonlinearity is. O nce the two opposite lim its are described well, their crossover can be expected to be also som ehow depicted. There is som em ore justi cations for the schem e, particularly it becom es exact for a system of an in nite dim ensionality.

Since an analysis of proper im purity problem gives a good understanding of the properties of stronglycorrelated system s , it is desirable to construct a perturbation theory starting from the solution of an im purity problem as a zeroth approxim ation. A theory of this $k$ ind is presented in this paper for lattice $m$ odels $w$ th $a$ localized nonlinearity. W e exactly renom alize diagram expansion so that diagram vertexes becom e irreducible vertex parts of certain impurity problem. An important peculiarity of the proposed approach is that a good convergence is achieved both in tight-binding and weakbinding situations. A s an exam ple, we present the results obtained for quantum Ising $m$ odel in a transverse eld.

We consider statistics of the real vector eld on a discrete lattice with a localized nonlinearity ( ) and the dispersion law. In general, lattioe potential can depend on a num ber of the lattioe site. Through the article we num ber sites by x whereas com ponents of the on-site eld $x$ are num bered by $j$, statistical average is denoted by triangle brackets:

$$
\begin{gather*}
\left\langle:::>=Z_{R}{ }^{1}::: e^{E()} \mathbb{D}\right]  \tag{1}\\
\left.Z=e^{E} e^{E()} \mathbb{D}\right] \\
E()=x_{x}(x)+\frac{1}{2}(\quad):
\end{gather*}
$$

Scalar product ( ) is a sum over both indioes: $x^{0}{ }^{0} j^{0} \quad \mathrm{xj} \mathrm{xx}^{0} \mathrm{jj}^{0} \mathrm{x}^{0} \mathrm{j}^{0}$; below we also use extemalproduct denoted by the dot: . The notation ( x xx x ) is used for $a_{P}$ scalar product in the on-site subspace: ( $x \mathrm{xx} x$ ) $\mathrm{jj}^{0} \mathrm{xj} \mathrm{xxjj}^{0} \mathrm{xj} j^{0}$.

C onsider an auxiliary ensem ble w th energy

$$
\begin{equation*}
E^{\operatorname{aux}}()=X_{x}^{x} \quad x(x)+\frac{1}{2}(A)+\left({ }^{0}(A)\right): \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

W e introduced here vector quantity 0 and a Hem itian tensor A having non-zero term s only at the same $x$-indioes: $A_{x_{x}{ }^{0}}=0$ for $x \notin x^{0}$ (through the text we call such quantities ' $x$-diagonal'). The values of $A$ and ${ }^{0}$ are not speci ed for a while.

Since A is x-diagonal, site oscillators of the auxiliary ensem ble are uncoupled (one can see that $\mathrm{E}^{\text {aux ( ) splits }}$ to a sum of independent single-site energies). Thus, properties of the auxiliary system at each site can be obtained as a solution of a single-site im purity problem.

D enote an average over the auxiliary ensem ble by overline and introduce norm alized two-point correlator and higher-order irreducible vertex parts at the sites of auxiliary system :

$$
\begin{aligned}
& { }_{1^{0}:: n^{0}}^{(n)}=(\quad)^{\mathrm{n}} \mathrm{~g}_{10_{1}}^{1}:: \mathrm{g}_{\mathrm{n}}{ }^{1}{ }_{\mathrm{o}}^{\mathrm{n}} \text { (irreducible part of the } \mathrm{n} \text { th } \mathrm{m} \text { om ent): }
\end{aligned}
$$

To sim plify the notation, we om it site index $x$ and write num bers as subscripts for the on-site coordinates here.

It should be noted that $m$ ean- eld and $G$ aussian-bath approxim ations can be understood as approxim ations of the system (1) by (2) w ith a self-consistent requirem ent ${ }^{0}=-$ and certain choice of $A_{x x}$. Indeed, to obtain the $m$ ean- eld schem e, one should, rst, replace all in E ( ) w ith its average for allcells except just a single one, and, second, use an average over this particular cell as a guess for $<\quad>$. It is easy to check that the $m$ ean- eld corresponds to the simple choice $A_{x x}=x_{x} \cdot G$ aussian-bath approxim ation also reduces the system to a single-site problem. The di erence is that the rem aining degrees of freedom are not frozen in its average positions, but approxim ated w ith harm onic oscillators, form ing $G$ aussian bath. These $G$ aussian degrees of freedom can be integrated out, giving again single-site energy like in (2) w ith certain A. A n approxim ation for the single-site system by a harm onic oscillator can be found from the re-
quirem ent that the approxim ation $m$ im ics $-x$ and $g_{x x}$. T hus obtained param eters of ham onic oscillators are to be used as in the next iteration of the self-consistent loop as param eters of the oscillators form ing the bath. T hese iterations converge to the point where x -diagonal part of the tensor $g+(A)^{1}{ }^{1}$ vanish. This is in fact a condition for A of the G aussian-bath approxim ation.

The aim ofthis paper is to express averages (1) via ${ }^{-}, g$ and ${ }^{(n)}$ by certain regular series. The quantities $A$ and 0 w ill determ ined by certain self-consistent conditions.

F irst, wew ould like to introduce the "dual" variables $f$. Let us consider the basis where $g(A) g$ is diagonaland label the ${ }_{R}$ tates $i_{R}$ this basis by $p$. De ne the integration Df] $\operatorname{df}_{p_{1}}::: \operatorname{df}_{\mathrm{p}_{n}}:::$ in such a way that the path of integration in each integraldepends on a sign ofdiagonal elem ent ( $g(A))_{p p}$ : $f_{p}$ goes from 1 to 1 for ( $g($ A) $g)_{p p} \nwarrow 0$ and from il to il overw ise. $W$ ith thus de ned $\mathbb{D} f]$, the follow ing identity holds:

ـ

Z

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left.e^{\frac{1}{2}\left(\left(0^{0}\right)(A)\left(\quad{ }^{0}\right)\right)}=(\text { factor }) \quad \mathbb{D} f\right] \quad\left(\left(\left({ }^{0}\right) g^{1} f\right) \quad \frac{1}{2}\left(f(g(A) g){ }^{1} f\right)\right): \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

In fact, the path of integration over $f_{p}$ is chosen to deliver the convergence of integrals here. A fter this identity is applied, partition function takes the form

$$
\begin{gather*}
\left.Z=R_{\mathbb{D}}^{R} \mathbb{D} f\right] e \mathrm{E}(; f)  \tag{5}\\
E(; f)=E^{\operatorname{aux}}()+\left(\left({ }^{0}\right) g^{1} f\right) \quad \frac{1}{2}\left(f(g(\quad A) g)^{1} f\right) ;
\end{gather*}
$$

A set of exact relations betw een the averages over in itial and dual ensem ble can be established by the integration by parts in (5) w ith respect to f. P articularly,

$$
\begin{align*}
& \left.g(A)<\quad{ }^{0}>=<f\right\rangle ;  \tag{6}\\
& g(\quad \mathrm{~A})<\left({ }^{0}\right) \quad\left({ }^{0}\right)>( \\
& \text { A) } g=<f \quad f>+{ }^{1} g(\quad A) g:
\end{align*}
$$

The idea of an introduction of new variables is that
energy (5) does not contain direct coupling betw een dif-
a)

b)

c)


FIG. 1: D iagram s contributing ${ }^{0}$ and corresponding coe cients. D iagram (a) is sm all if condition (11) is ful led. Diagram s (b) and (c) describe av ${ }^{2}$ correction to ${ }^{0}$; diagram (c) vanishes for an unordered state of $(\mathbb{N}) \mathrm{m}$ odel.
ferent sites for the initial variable, since $\left(g^{1} f\right)=$ $\left.x_{x}\left(x^{( }{ }^{1} f\right)_{x}\right)$. Therefore $x$ can be integrated out at each site, yielding an an expression for the energy in dual variables E (f):

$$
\begin{align*}
& E(f)=P_{x} V_{x}\left(f_{x}\right)+\frac{1}{2} f^{\sim} f  \tag{7}\\
& \sim=g^{1} \quad g^{1}(A)^{1} g^{1}
\end{align*}
$$

This expression is form ally very sim ilar to an in itial system (1). Physical di erence com es, rst, from the possibility to choose A and ${ }^{0}$ in certain optim al way, and, second, from the the non-trivialw ay of integration over $f$ so that $f$ has an im aginary part. In particular, $\left\langle f_{x j}^{2}\right\rangle$ can be negative or equal zero.
$P$ roperties of the dual potential $V(f)$ are determ ined by the cum ulant expansion (2) for an auxiliary system. The last term in (7) is chosen in such a way that the second derivative of $V$ vanishes; other derivatives are $V^{(1)}=\left({ }^{0}\right) g^{1}$ and $V^{(n)}={ }^{(n)}$ for n 3. To describe e ects due to nonlinearity, we introduce tensor
${ }^{0}$ de ned by equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
<\quad>={ }^{1}\left(g^{1}+A+\right)^{1} ; \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

so that ${ }^{0}$ describes a non-local contribution to the selfenergy of the in itialsystem (1). It follow s from the second line of (6) that dualtw o-point correlator can be expressed via as follow s:

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left.<\mathrm{f} \quad \mathrm{f}>=\frac{1}{\left(\mathrm{~g}^{1}\right.} \mathrm{O}^{0}\right)^{1}+(\mathrm{A})^{1} \mathrm{~g}: \tag{9}
\end{equation*}
$$

A ll expressions presented above are exact. Now, we construct a perturbation theory resulting from the series expansion in powers of $V$. Term s of these series can be expressed by the diagram $s w$ ith ${ }^{(n)}$ standing at vertexes connected w ith lines carrying dualtw o-point correlator < f $\mathrm{f}>$. W e consider the series for ${ }^{0}$. It can be found from the expansion of the left-and right-hand side of (9) in pow ers ofV and ${ }^{0}$, respectively. Som e of those diagram s are presented in $F$ igure 1. E ach diagram is accom panied by an additional factor 1 and a num ericalcoe cient. It can be found from the above-m entioned expansion of (9)

Form ally, single-lag vertexes can occur in the diagram s due to the presence of $V^{(1)}$ in the dual energy (7). We require such ${ }^{0}$ that $\langle\mathrm{f}\rangle=0$ to get rid of them. Then the rst line of (6) requires

$$
\begin{equation*}
<>={ }^{0}: \tag{10}
\end{equation*}
$$

Since ${ }^{(n)}$ of any order can in principle appear in the series, a form al sm all param eter should be introduced to group the term s properly. C onsider a special case of a scalar eld with sm all nonlinearity: $U()={ }^{4}$,
$!+0$. Estim ate how appears in high derivatives of $V(f)$ : ${ }^{(2 n)} /{ }^{n}$ and (2n 1) / $n$. W e propose to group diagram s w th respect to their form al sm allness in powers of. This is clearly a good choice for a weak-binding lim it. C onsider the opposite case of tightbinding ! 0 and suppose that our choice ofA delivers also (A ) ! 0 (note that $m$ ean- eld and $G$ aussianbath schem es satisfy this condition). It is obvious from (7) that bare two-point correlator appears to be a sm all quantity in this case. Since the num ber of lines in a diagram is roughly proportional to its -order, again appears to be a good sm allparam eter. $W$ e conclude that series expansion converges wellboth in tight-binding and weak-binding lim its and therefore expect that the theory is suitable for a crossover situation.

Form ally, series expansion can be constructed for any A, but an appropriate choice should result to better convergence. It is useful to require

$$
{ }^{1} g=<\left(\begin{array}{ll} 
& 0
\end{array} \quad\left(\begin{array}{ll}
0 \tag{11}
\end{array}\right)>_{x x}:\right.
$$

O ne can form ally obtain G aussian-bath approxim ation as a result of $G$ aussian approxim ation for $<\mathrm{f} \quad \mathrm{f}>$ in (9), combined w ith requirem ents (10,11). G aussian approxim ation $m$ eans ${ }^{0}$ order of the theory. H igher term $s$ of an expansion in powers of im prove the result and, in particular, bring non-local correlations on the scene.

To dem onstrate capabilities of the $m$ ethod and to give m ore technical details, we present here the results obtained in an ${ }^{2}$-approxim ation for classicalo ( $\mathbb{N}$ ) m odels at 3D cubic lattice w th the nearest-neighbor coupling. P otentialenergy is

$$
\begin{gather*}
X \\
\left\langle x x^{0}\right\rangle
\end{gather*}\left(\begin{array}{ll}
\left.x x^{0}\right) ; \tag{12}
\end{array}\right.
$$

where x is an N -com ponent vector of the constrained length $\ddot{j} x$ 垪 $=\left(\begin{array}{ll}x & x\end{array}\right)=N$. In the previous notation, dispersion law is $k=\left(\operatorname{cosk}_{\mathrm{x}}+\operatorname{cosk}_{\mathrm{Y}}+\operatorname{cosk}_{\mathrm{z}}\right)$, whereas the constrain $m$ akes the system nonlinear. Sum is over all pairs of the nearest neighbors. C ases of $N=1 ; 2 ; 3$ correspond to Ising, $x y$, and $H$ eisenberg $m$ odels, respectively. In three dim ensions, system (12) show s a secondorder phase transition at nite tem perature for N . The m odel is extensively studied. O ne can note $M$ onte $C$ arlo sim ulations [5, 6], high-tem perature expansion [7] (in
our term inology, this is in fact tight-binding approach), renorm alisation-group $m$ ethods [8] etc. Here we do not pretend to obtain som ething new for the $m$ odel itself. It is used to check ifthem ethod w orks for a realistic system.

For simplicity, let us consider an unordered state < $\quad>=0$, so that only even-lag vertexes appear in diagram $s,(2 n+1)=0$. It can be easily obtained that $g_{12}={ }^{1} 12$ (irrespective on N ) and ${ }_{1234}^{(4)}=$ ${ }_{\mathrm{N}}(1234+1324+1423) \mathrm{w}$ th $\mathrm{N}=1=2=3$; $\mathrm{N}=2=$
$1=2 ; \mathrm{N}=3=2=5$. Here is a K ronecker delta. Tensor structure of $g,{ }^{(4)}$, as well as A, corresponds to the O $(\mathbb{N})$ symm etry of the problem.
$T$ he self-consistent equation for a follow s from (8) and (11) :

$$
\begin{equation*}
g={\frac{1}{(2)^{3}}}^{Z} \frac{d^{3} k}{g^{1}+k^{+}{ }^{0}} \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

Technically, this equation can be solved iteratively, sim ilarly to DM FT-loop technique [4]. Start from certain guess for A and ${ }^{0}$. For a general case, one should calculate $g(A)$ and ${ }^{(n)}(A)$ at this point, but for a particular m odel (12) it is not necessary as $g$ and do not depend on $A$, because of the constrain $\ddot{j} \times \dot{J}=N$. Cal culate $<\mathrm{f}$ f $>$ from ( g ), given $g_{i} A$, and ${ }^{0}$. For thus obtained $<\mathrm{f}$ f $>$ and ${ }^{(n)}$, calculate new guess for ${ }^{0}$ for a given order in (see below expressions for ${ }^{0}$ up to ${ }^{2}$ ). $F$ inally calculate the right-hand side of (13), given $g ; A$, and new ${ }^{0}$. Denote the obtained value by $g$ and take the quantity $A+\left(g^{1} \quad g^{1}\right)$ as new guess for $A$, where . 1 is a num erical factor. Repeat the loop for new A and ${ }^{0}$. For properly chosen intial guess and value of
iterations converge to a xed point satisfying equation (12).

Gaussian-bath approxim ation corresponds to an assumption ${ }^{0}=0$. Corrections are given by the diagram s presented in $F$ igure 1. Lines in these diagram $s$ are thick, i.e. they correspond to the renorm alized correlator $<\mathrm{f}$ f $>$. First-order correction would be given by a sim ple loop show $n$ as diagram (a) in $F$ igure 1. This diagram corresponds to formula $\frac{1}{2}{ }^{(4)}<f_{x}>$. It is how ever absent, because < $f_{x} \quad f>$ equals zero in $G$ aussian-bath approxim ation, as it can be obtained from (6) and (13). So the correction starts actually from ${ }^{2}$ term s.

Strictly speaking, once high-order corrections are taken into account, $<f_{x} \quad f>$ does not vanish anym ore. But it rem ains sm all. It can be show $n$ that sim ple loops does not appear in diagram s up to ${ }^{3}$ order. C onsequently, second-order correction to ${ }^{0}$ can be described by just a single diagram (b) draw $n$ in $F$ igure 1, so that ${ }_{x x^{0}}^{0}=$ $\frac{1}{6}^{2}<\mathrm{f}_{\mathrm{x}} \quad f_{0}>{ }^{3}$. A fter the sum over intemal indices is taken, it gives ${ }_{\mathrm{xx}^{0}}^{0}=\quad 1^{2}(1+\mathrm{N}=2) f_{\mathrm{x} ; \mathrm{x}^{0}}^{3}$, where $f_{x ; x^{0}}$ is a diagonalelem ent of the dual correlator.
$F$ igure 2 shows data for the e ective soft-m ode dispersion $0 \quad(<k=0 \quad k=0>)^{1}$. D ots are num erical data. D ata for the lines are obtained by form ula
$0=\mathrm{g}^{1}+\mathrm{k}=0+0 \mathrm{~A}$. Iteration procedure converges well everyw here except very narrow regions near critical point. Since we were not interested in a description of the critical point itself, we did not put special attention to the source of this divergence.

G aussian-bath approxim ation predicts the same dependence for any $N$, as one can observe from (13) w ith
${ }^{0}=0 . T$ his is a serious qualitative draw back, although the quantitative accuracy is not so bad. So, the dependence of 0 on $N$ in the $m$ odel is related $w$ ith a non-local part of correlations, and should be described by higher term s of -corrections. Indeed, ${ }^{2}$-correction describes the dependence $0(\mathbb{N})$ well. There is also a dram atic increase of the accuracy in the ${ }^{2}$ curves.

For the broken-sym $m$ etry state, the theory can be constructed in a very sim ilar $m$ anner. Iteration loop now includes also a modi cation of ${ }^{0}$ to ful llthe condition (10) at a xed point. D iagram (c) from $F$ igure 1 appears due to the presence of ${ }^{(3)}$. W e do not show num erical results here, because they are very sim ilar to what we obtain for the unordered state.
$T$ he entire plot range of $F$ igure 2 lies w ithin a critical region. For exam ple, all points for Ising $m$ odel obey critical scaling law $\left\langle{ }_{\mathrm{k}=0}^{2}>/(\mathrm{c})^{1: 24} \mathrm{w}\right.$ ith a good accuracy, as the dashed line show $s$. T hus the theory perform $s$ well deep inside the critical region. H ow ever, the very vicinity of the critical point is not correctly described, because we work w ith perturbation theory of a nite order. It would be worth to construct a renorm alizationgroup theory based on the presented perturbation approach. A $n$ attem pt to construct a prim tive approach of this kind starting from $m$ ean- eld theory was perform ed several years ago [10].

There is a comment about an applicability of other approxim ation schem es. The system is strongly nonlinear, so weak-binding approxim ation is clearly not valid here. On the other hand, tight-binding description of a low order fails near the phase transition point because of the critical increase of the correlation length. For exam ple, second order of the tight-binding series gives $0={ }^{1}(1+4)^{1}$. This is very inaccurate; corresponding curve simply lies out of the plot range of $F$ igure 2. $M$ ore sophisticated schem es, for exam ple, cum ulant expansion, also require $m$ uch higher order to achieve an accuracy com parable $w$ ith the presented ${ }^{2}$ results. It is also im portant to recall that G aussian-bath approxi$m$ ation becom es exact in the lim it $N$ ! 1 , and $1=N$ expansion can be constructed at this point [11]. But $1=\mathrm{N}$ approach is essentially based on a very particular O (N) symm etry of system (12). C ontrary, our method is developed for a general case and does not require any special sym $m$ etry.

In conclusion, we presented an exact renom alization of the diagram-series expansion in term $s$ of the selfconsistent im purity $m$ odel. Renorm alized vertexes are irreducible vertex parts of the im purity model. There


FIG.2: E ective soft m ode dispersion for $O(N) m$ odel at $N=1 ; 2 ; 3$. D ashed line: G aussian foath approxim ation. Solid lines: results for the ${ }^{2}$-schem e, from bottom to top: $N=1$ (Ising), $N=2$ ( Ny ), and $N=3$ (Heisenberg). In a narrow region near criticalpoint the teration procedure did not converge, and the lines are not draw $n$. Sym bols are num ericaldata for $N=1 ; 2 ; 3$ : respectively solid circles, open circles and crosses. D otted line is a t corresponding to a purely critical' behavior of < $>$ in Ising m odel.
is an explicit sm all param eter in the theory for weakbinding and tight-binding lim it. A worked example of an ${ }^{2}$-approxim ation for sim ple 3D m odels dem onstrates that the m ethod perform swell for a strong-correlated situation. T he exam ple $m$ odels were chosen because of the physical sim plicity; the $m$ ethod itself looks rather general. It would be particularly im portant to extend it to the system s of identical quantum particles. A nother challenge is a construction of renom alization-group theory based on the $m$ ethod.

T he work was supported by D ynasty foundation and NW O grant 047.016.005. A uthor is grateful to M .I. K atsnelson and O.ILoiko for their interest to this work.

E lectronic address: alex@ shg.ru
[1] P Fulde, E lectron C orrelations in M olecules and Solids,

Springer, B erlin, 2002
[2] R. B alesku, Equilibrium and $N$ onequilibrium Statistical M echanics, W iley, N ew York, 1975.
[3] A D. Bruce and R A. C ow ley Structural phase transitions, T aylor and Francis Ltd., London, 1981.
[4] A. G eorges, G.K otliar, W . K rauth, and M J. R ozenberg, Rev.M od. Phys. 68, 13 (1996).
[5] P . P eczak, A L. Ferrenberg, and D P.Landau, P hys. R ev. B 43, 6087 (1991).
[6] A. M . Ferrenberg and D. P. Landau, Phys. Rev. B 44, 5081 (1991).
[7] M . C am postrini, A . P elissetto, P . R ossi, and E . V icari, Phys. Rev.E 65, 066127 (2002).
[8] A. P elissetto and E.V icari, Physics Reports 368, 549 (2002).
[9] H Li, T. Chen, Z. Phys. B 100, 283 (1996).
[10] A N . Rubtsov, P hys. R ev. B 66,052107-1 (2002).
[11] Y. O kabe, M . O ku, R.Abe, P rogress of Theoretical Physics 59, 1825 (1978).

