# H ofstadter butter ies of bilayer graphene 

N orbert Nem ec and G ianaurelio C uniberti<br>Institute for $T$ heoretical Physics, U niversity of Regensburg, D -93040 Regensburg, G em any

## (D ated: Septem ber 29, 2021)


#### Abstract

W e calculate the electronic spectrum of bilayer graphene in perpendicular magnetic elds nonperturbatively. To accom odate arbitrary displacem ents betw een the two layers, we apply a periodic gauge based on singular ux vortioes of phase 2 . T he resulting H ofstadter-like butter y plots show a reduced sym $m$ etry, depending on the relative position of the two layers against each other. T he split of the zero-energy relativistic Landau leveldi ers by one order of $m$ agnitude betw een Bemal and non-Bemal stacking.


PACS num bers: $73.22 .-\mathrm{f}, 71.15 \mathrm{D} \times, 71.70 \mathrm{D} \mathrm{i}, 81.05 \mathrm{U}$ w

A fter the theoretical prediction of the peculiar electronic properties of graphene in 1947 by $W$ allace ${ }^{1}$ and the subsequent studies of its $m$ agnetic spectrum $\stackrel{2}{1,3}$ it took half a century until single layers of graphene could be isolated in experim ent ${ }^{4}$ and the novelm esoscopic properties of these two-dim ensional (2D ) D irac-like electronic system $s$, e.g., their anom alous quantum H all e ect, could be $m$ easured $5,6,7$ Inspired by this experim ental success, graphene has becom e the focus of num erous theoretical works $8,9,10,11,12$ For bilayers of graphene, an additionaldegeneracy of the Landau levels and a B erry phase of 2 were predicted to lead to an anom alous quantum Halle ect, di erent from either the regularm assive electrons or the special D irac-type electrons of single-layer graphene, ${ }^{13}$ which was con m ed in experim ent shortly afterw ards ${ }^{14}$ and used for the characterization of bilayer sam ples. ${ }^{15}$

The low-energy electronic structure of a single layer of graphene is well described by a linearization near the corner points of the hexagonal Brillouin zone ( $K$ points), resulting in an e ective H am iltonian form ally equivalent to that of $m$ assless $D$ irac particles in two dim ensions. $\frac{16}{}$ A related H am iltonian can be constructed featuring a supersym $m$ etric structure which can be exploited to derive the electronic spectrum in the presence of an extemal m agnetic eld 17 The level at zero energy, characteristic for any supersym $m$ etric system, $m$ aps directly to a spe-cialhalf- led Landau level xed at the Ferm ienergy F , henceforth called the supersym $m$ etric Landau level (SU SYLL).

In this R apid Comm unication, we use the nonperturbative $m$ ethod pioneered in 1933 by Peierls ${ }^{18}$ for the im plem entation of a magnetic eld in a model, which led H ofstadter, in 1976, to the discovery of the fractal spectrum of 2D lattice electrons in a magnetic eld $\frac{19}{9}$ Since its discovery, various aspects of the so-called H ofstadter butter $y$ have been studied, ${ }^{20,21}$ particularly in relation to graphenelike honeycom b structures. ${ }^{12,22,23}$ Featuring a large variety of topologies, all these system $s$ have in com m on that the atom s inside the unit cell are located on discrete coordinates. A 11 closed loops have com $m$ ensurate areas, and the atom ic netw ork is regular enough that the $m$ agnetic phases of all links can be determ ined individually $w$ thout the need of a continuously de ned gauge eld. For bilayer graphene, such a direct schem e


FIG. 1: (C olor online) H ofstadter butter $y$ of a bilayer graphene in the Bemal stacking con guration. The band structure at zero $m$ agnetic eld is rotationally sym m etric in good approxim ation for an area around the $K$ point and shows a split into four $m$ assive bands, $w$ ith the two middle ones touching at $E_{F}$. The density of states (D O S ) of a nitew idth ribbon [a pair of $(200,0)$ zigzag ribbons] in the sam e con guration shows the SUSYLL em erging at nite magnetic eld. The split of the SU SY LL (discussed below) is not visible due to the lim ited resolution of the plot.
for implem enting a magnetic eld is possible only for highly sym m etric con gurations like Bemalstacking ${ }^{13,24}$ To handle more general con gurations, such as continuous displacem ents betw een the layers, it is in general unavoidable to choose a continuously de ned gauge that xes the phase for arbitrarily placed atom s . T he di culty that arises can be seen im m ediately: For any gauge eld that is periodic in two dim ensions, the $m$ agnetic phase of a closed loop around a single unit cellm ust cancelout exactly, corresponding to a vanishing totalm agnetic ux. $C$ onversely, this $m$ eans that any gauge eld that results in a nonzero hom ogeneous $m$ agnetic eld will invariably break the periodicity of the underlying system .

A possible w ay to bypass this problem isbased on de ning a magnetic ux vortex, here oriented in the $z$ direction and located in ( $\mathrm{x}_{0} ; \mathrm{y}_{0}$ ), as. ${ }^{25,26}$

$$
B(x ; y ; z)=0 \quad\left(x \quad x_{0}\right) \quad\left(y \quad y_{0}\right) e_{z} ;
$$

where $0=h=e$ is the ux quantum. Physically, such a vortex is equivalent to a vanishing $m$ agnetic eld, since it leaves the phase of any possible closed path unchanged modulo 2 . O ne possible gauge eld resulting in such a single ux vortex can be w ritten as

$$
A(r)=\frac{0\left(e_{z} r\right)}{2 \dot{\jmath}_{z} r \jmath^{2}}:
$$

Finding a periodic gauge follows straightforw ardly. To the hom ogeneous $m$ agnetic eld, we add a periodic array of $u x$ vortioes $w$ th a density such that the average $m$ agnetic eld is exactly zero. For the resulting eld, which is physically equivalent to the original, it is now possible to nd a gauge eld w ith the sam e periodicity as the array of vortices. If the underlying system is periodic and the array of ux vortioes has com m ensurate periodicity, there exists a superoell where the $m$ agnetic H am iltonian is periodic. O ne possible periodic gauge that is especially advantageous for num erical im plem entation consists in a two-dim ensional periodic system with lattice vectors $a_{x}$ and $a_{y}$. The reciprocal lattice vectors (scaled by 2 ) are $a_{i}$ such that $a_{i} \quad a_{j}={ }_{i j}$. Themagnetic eld is $B={ }^{\prime} 0\left(a_{x} \quad a_{y}\right)$ with 'integer. The usual linear| but aperiodic| gauge for this eld would be $A_{\operatorname{lin}}(r)=$ ' $0\left(r a_{x}\right) a_{y}$. A periodic gauge can now be de ned as:

$$
A(r)=10 \llbracket r a_{x} \rrbracket\left(a_{y} \quad\left(\llbracket r a_{y} \rrbracket\right) a_{x}\right)
$$

where 【】 denotes the fractional part of a real num ber. To make sure that the phase of every link between two atom s is well de ned, the gauge eld is displaced by an in nitesim al am ount such that every atom is either left or right of the divergent line.
The Ham iltonian w thout magnetic eld | based on a tight-binding param etrization originally used for multiw alled carbon nanotubes ${ }^{23,27}$ | consists of a contribution for nearest neighborsw ithin a layerhi; ji and one forpairs of atom s located on di erent sheets him; jii:

In absence of a magnetic eld, the intralayer hopping is xed to $\underset{i ; j}{\text { intra }}=0=2: 66 \mathrm{eV}$, while the interlayer hopping depends on the distance only,

$$
\underset{i ; j}{\text { inter }}=\exp \underline{a \dot{j}_{i} r_{j} j} ;
$$

w ith $=0=8, \mathrm{a}=3: 34 \mathrm{~A}$, and $=0: 45 \mathrm{~A}$. A cut0 is chosen as $r_{\text {cuto }}=a+5$. Follow ing the $P$ eierls substitution, 18 the $m$ agnetic eld $B$ is now implem ented by multiplying a m agnetic phase factor to each link betw een two atom siand j:

$$
i ; j(B)=i_{i j}(B=0) \exp i \frac{2^{Z} r_{j}}{r_{i}} A_{B}(r) \quad d r \text {; }
$$



FIG. 2: (C olor online) Hofstadter butter y of a bilayer graphene in tw o di erently shifted con gurations. Top panel: A A stacking (tw o layers exactly aligned). T he band structure for this highly sym $m$ etric stacking (sam e rotationalsym $m$ etry as for Bemal stacking in $F$ ig. (1) show $s$ the single-layer cone sim ply split up in energy. B ottom panel: Interm ediate position betw een Bemal and AA stacking. T he rotational sym $m$ etry is broken and the bands split into tw o cones at di erent o sets from the $K$ point and di erent energies. T he straight lines overlaid at the energy $m$ inim um and $m$ axim um are the regular Landau levels of the $m$ assive bands. $N$ ear $E_{F}$, one can $m$ ake out the parabolic traces of the relativistic Landau levels and the horizontal lines of the SU SY LLs (see text). Insets at the lower right of each panel: D O S of a nite-w idth ribbon show s the corresponding behavior in each case.


F IG . 3: (C olor online) Evolution of the split of the supersym $m$ etric Landau levelas a function of the displacem ent betw een the tw o graphene layers. Top panel: $M$ agnitude of the split for displacem ents in tw o directions. T he light spots corresp ond to Bemal stack ing where the level is nearly degenerate. B ottom panel: Sam e data along a cut at $y=0$. The sm all rem aining split at the Bemal stacking con guration originates in the long-range interlayer hoppings contained in the param etrization. The sm all discontinuities are caused by the cuto $r_{\text {cut }}$. The calculation here was done at $=0=256$, but proved to be independent of them agnetic eld forvalues up to $0: 050$.
where the integral is com puted on a straight line betw een the atom ic positions $r_{i}$ and $r_{j}$.
For the bilayer graphene, we arrive thus at a periodic H am iltonian with a two-dim ensional unit cell containing four atom $s$ and spanning the area of one hexagonal graphene plaquette: $A_{\text {plaquette }}=\left(3^{P} \overline{3}=2\right) d_{C C}^{2}$, where $\mathrm{d}_{\mathrm{C}}=1: 42 \mathrm{~A}$ is the intralayer distance betw een neighboring carbon atom $s$. Thee ect of penpendicularm agnetic
eld, $m$ easured in ux per plaquette $=A_{\text {Plaquette }} B$, can be calculated for com $m$ ensurate values $=(p=q) 0$ ( $p, q$ integers) by constructing a supercell of $q$ unit cells. The corresponding Bloch H am iltonian $H(k)$ is a 4q 4q m atrix that can be diagonalized for arbitrary values of $k$ in the two-dim ensional Brillouin zone of area $4^{2}=q A_{\text {plaquette }}$.

To obtain the butter y plots as displayed in F igs 1 and 2, we chose 06 p $6 \mathrm{q}=512$, reducing the fraction $\mathrm{p}=\mathrm{q}$ for e ciency. For each value of the density of states w as calculated from a histogram over the spectral values for a random sam pling of $k$ over the $B$ rillouin zone. T he num ber of sam pling points was chosen individually for di erent values of $p$ to achieve convergence. In F igs. 1 and 2, the H ofstadter spectra of three di erently aligned
graphene bilayers are presented. The Bemal stacking ( $F$ ig. (1) stands out, as it is the con guration of layers in natural graphite. 24,28 A ltemative con gurations like A A stacking were found in ab in itio calculations to be energetically unfavorable, ${ }^{29}$ they can, how ever, be thought of as either $m$ echanically shifted sam ples or sections of curved bilayers (e.g., sections oftw o shells in a large m ultiw all carbon nanotube) where the alignm ent unavoidably varies over distance. C om pared to the $H$ ofstadter butter $y$ ofa single sheet ofgraphene, ${ }^{22}$ tw o asym m etries are visible in all three plots: T he electron-hole sym me etry ( $E \quad \mathrm{E}$ ) is broken dow $n$ by the interlayer coupling already at zero $m$ agnetic eld: while the low est-energy states of a single graphene layer have constant phase over all atom $s$ and can couple e ciently into sym $m$ etric and antisym $m$ etric hybrid states of the bilayer system, the states at high energies have altemating phases for neighboring atom s , so interlayer hybridization is prohibited by the second-nearest-neighbor interlayer coupling. For low magnetic elds, tw o sets of Landau levels can therefore be observed at the bottom of the spectrum, indicating a split of the $m$ assive band of graphene at the point ( $E_{m \text { in }}^{0}=30, m_{0}=2 \sim^{2}=30 d_{C C}^{2}$ ) into two bands at di erent energies and $w$ th di erent e ective $m$ asses $\mathbb{E}_{\mathrm{m} \text { in }} \quad \mathrm{E}_{\mathrm{m} \text { in }}^{0} 1: 1 \mathrm{eV}, \mathrm{m} \quad \mathrm{m}_{0}=(1 \quad 2: 1=0)$, independent of the relative shift of the tw o layers; see the straight lines overlaid in the bottom panel of $F$ ig. [2]. At the top of the spectrum, where the split is prohibited, only one degenerate set ofLandau levels appears, as in single-layer graphene. The original periodic sym $m$ etry along the $B$ -
eld axis at one ux quantum per graphene plaquette is broken down due to the sm aller areas form ed by interlayer loops. The breaking of this sym $m$ etry is com parably sm all in the AA stacking con guration (Fig. 2, top) where loops of the full plaquette area are dom inant. In the tw o other con gurations sm aller loops arem ore dom inant, so the periodicity is perturbed $m$ ore severely. In the interm ediate con guration ( $F$ ig. . 2, bottom ), the fractal pattems appear slightly sm eared out for high $m$ agnetic elds, due to the reduced sym $m$ etry of the system.
The right insets of F igs. 1 and 2 display the spectra of $(200,0)$ bilayer graphene nanoribbons, 30 each in a corresponding con guration, obtained by a $m$ ethod described before ${ }^{23}$ that allow s handling of continuous magnetic elds. ${ }^{34}$ For low magnetic elds, these spectra are strongly in uenced by nite-size e ectst. Only form agnetic elds larger than B $40=d^{2}$, which for a ribbon of width $d=50 \mathrm{~nm}$ relates to 7 T , do the spectra oftw o-dim ensionalbilayer graphene begin to em erge. $P$ rom inent in all three insets are the dark, horizontalpains of lines at the center, the supersym $m$ etric Landau levels. W hile these represent discrete levels in tw o-dim ensional graphene sheets, they are broadened by the nite width of the ribbon to a peak of the same shape as in carbon nanotubes. ${ }^{23,32} \mathrm{~T}$ he m esoscopic character of these split SU SY LLs in dependence on the w idth $W$ of the ribbon is captured by the functional form of the density of states:

$$
(\mathrm{E} ; \mathrm{B} ; \mathrm{W})=\mathrm{f}\left(\mathrm{E} \quad \mathrm{E}_{0}\right) \mathrm{W} ; \mathrm{B} \mathrm{~W}^{2}
$$

$w$ here $E_{0}$ is the position of the $m$ axim um .

Single-layer graphene is known to feature an anom alous supersym $m$ etric Landau level at the Ferm i energy ${ }^{2,8,17}$ N eglecting Zeem an splitting, this level is fourfold degenerate (tw ice spin, tw ice valley) and half lled. Forbilayer graphene in Bemalstacking ( $F$ ig. (1) the SU SY LLs of the two layers have been show $n$ to be protected by sym $m$ etry and to rem ain degenerate, giving in totalan eightfold degeneracy ${ }^{\frac{13}{}{ }^{3}}$ In F ig. 2 2 , this degeneracy can be observed to be lifted for displaced bilayers, leading to a split of the SU SY LL into a bonding and an antibonding hybrid state in the tw o layers, each fourfold degenerate. The continuous evolution of the split for varying displacem ent of the two layers against each other is displayed in $F$ ig. 3. T he split reaches its maxim um of $\mathrm{E} \quad 0: 3 \mathrm{eV}$ for the $A \mathrm{~A}-$ stacking con guration and ism inim alforBemalstacking. For sim pler tight-binding param etrizations that take into account only rst-and second-nearest-neighb or interlayer hoppings, the degeneracy in the Bemal con guration is known to be exact. ${ }^{13}$ Here, in contrast, this degeneracy is split by $\mathrm{E} \quad 0: 01 \mathrm{eV}$ due to interlayer hoppings of a longer range, sim ilar to the e ect caused by second-nearest-neighbor interactions w thin one layer. ${ }^{33}$

In conclusion, we have developed a m ethod that allow s the nonperturbative im plem entation of a $m$ agnetic eld in periodic system $s$ w ith arbitrarily positioned atom s . A
onbital param etrization for graphitic interlayer interactions w ith arbitrary displacem ents was then used to calculate the H ofstadter spectrum of bilayer graphene in various con gurations, revealing com $m$ on features like electron-hole sym $m$ etry breaking, and di erences, especially in the breaking of the $m$ agnetic- eld periodicity. A close look at the supersym $m$ etric Landau level at low
elds near the Ferm i energy revealed a breaking of the previously found symmetry, resulting in a split of the level, depending on the lateral displacem ent of the two graphene layers against each other.

W e acknow ledge fruitfuldiscussions w ith I. A dagideli, C . Berger, V. Fal'ko, F. Guinea and H. Schom erus. This work was funded by the Volksw agen Foundation under G rant No.I/78 340 and by the E uropean U nion program CARDEQ under Contract No. IST-021285-2. Support from the $V$ ielberth Foundation is also gratefully acknow ledged.
${ }^{1}$ P. R.W allace, Phys. Rev. 71, 622 (1947).
${ }^{2}$ J.W. . M CC lure, Phys. Rev. 104 , 666 (1956).
${ }^{3}$ Y. Zheng and T.Ando, Phys. Rev.B 65, 245420 (2002).
${ }^{4}$ K . S . N ovoselov, D . Jiang, F. Schedin, T. J. B ooth, V . V . K hotkevich, S.V.M orozov, and A. K. G eim , P roc. N atl. A cad. Sci. 102, 10451 (2005).
${ }^{5}$ Y. Zhang, Y.W.Tan, H.L.Stom er, and P. K im , N ature 438,201 (2005).
${ }^{6}$ K . S . N ovoselov, A . K . G eim, S. V . M orozov, D . Jiang, M . I. K atsnelson, I. V . G rigorieva, S.V.D ubonos, and A. A. F irsov, N ature 438, 197 (2005).
${ }^{7}$ Y . Zhang, Z. Jiang, J.P.Sm all, M . S.P urew al, Y.-W .Tan, M .Fazlollahi, J.D . C hudow , J.A . Jaszczak, H .L.Storm er, and P.K im, Phys. Rev.Lett. 96, 136806 (2006).
${ }^{8}$ V. P. Gusynin and S. G. Sharapov, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 146801 (2005).
${ }^{9}$ C.L. K ane and E. J. M ele, Phys. Rev. Lett. 95, 226801 (2005).
${ }^{10}$ N.M.R.Peres, F. G uinea, and A. H. C astro N eto, P hys. Rev. B 73, 125411 (2006).
${ }^{11}$ F. G uinea, A. H. C astro N eto, and N.M.R. Peres, P hys. Rev. B 73, 245426 (2006).
12 Y. H asegaw a and M . K ohm oto, Phys. Rev. B 74, 155415 (2006).
${ }^{13}$ E. M CC ann and V. I. Falko, P hys. R ev. Lett. 96, 086805 (2006).
${ }^{14}$ K.S.N ovoselov, E. M CC ann, S.V.M orozov, V . I. Fal'ko, M . I. K atsnelson, U . Zeitler, D. Jiang, F. Schedin, and A. K. G eim, N at. Phys. 2, 177 (2006).

15 T. O hta, A . B ostw ick, T . Seyller, K . H om, and E . R otenberg, Science 313, 951 (2006).
${ }^{16}$ D. P. D iV incenzo and E. J. M ele, Phys. Rev. B 29, 1685 (1984).
${ }^{17}$ M. E zaw a, unpublished, cond-m at/0606084.
${ }^{18}$ R . P eierls, Z. Phys. 80, 763 (1933).
19 D.R.H ofstadter, Phys. R ev.B 14, 2239 (1976).
${ }^{20}$ C. A lbrecht, J. H. Sm et, K . von K litzing, D. W eiss, V. Um ansky, and H. Schw eizer, P hys. R ev. Lett. 86, 147 (2001).

21 J. G. A nalytis, S. J. B lundell, and A. A rdavan, A m . J. Phys. 72, 613 (2004).
${ }^{22}$ R.Ram m al, J. Phys. (P aris) 46, 1345 (1985).
${ }^{23}$ N. Nem ec and G. Cuniberti, P hys. Rev. B 74, 165411 (2006).

24 J.D .Bemal, P roc. R . Soc.London, Ser.A 106, 749 (1924).
${ }^{25}$ A. T rellakis, P hys. R ev. Lett. 91, 056405 (2003).
${ }^{26}$ W . C ai and G. G alli, P hys. Rev. Lett. 92, 186402 (2004).
${ }^{27}$ P. Lam bin, J. Charlier, and J. M ichenaud, Electronic Structure of C oaxialC arbon Tubules (W orld Scienti C, S ingapore, 1994), pp. $130\{134$, ISBN 981-021887-7.
${ }^{28}$ S. Hem bacher, F. J. G iessibl, J. M annhart, and C. F. Q uate, Proc. N atl. A cad. Sci. 100, 12539 (2003).
${ }^{29}$ M . A oki and H.Am aw ashi, Solid State C om m . 142, 123 (2007).
${ }^{30}$ K . N akada, M . Fu j̈ta, G . D resselhaus, and M . S . D resselhaus, Phys. Rev.B 54, 17954 (1996).
${ }^{31}$ K . W akabayashi, M . Fu j̈ta, H. A 前i, and M. Sigrist, P hys. Rev. B 59, 8271 (1999).
${ }^{32}$ H. .W . Lee and D. S. N ovikov, P hys. Rev. B 68, 155402 (2003).
${ }^{33}$ E. M CC ann, Phys. Rev.B 74, 161403 (R) (2006).
34 A dapting the conventional notation for carbon nanotubes, an $(n, 0)$ ribbon has a w idth of $n$ hexagons and am chair edges.

