#### ABSTRACT

The one-band Hubbard model at half- lling on a truncated tetrahedron ( $G_2$ ), and on the C<sub>60</sub> m olecule is studied. W ithin the Hartree-Fock approximation, we nd a magneticlike instability of the \Ferm i sea" towards a spin-ordered phase for an intermediate value of the coupling (U=t)<sub>c</sub> 2:6. The ordered phase presents a spin arrangement similar to that of the classical Heisenberg model de ned on the same clusters. We study the linear excitations around the Hartree-Fock ground states using the random -phase approximation. On a nite cluster, we expect that these results signal the presence of a rapid crossover between a paramagnetic region and a regime where spin correlations are important. The relationship with the Heisenberg limit (large U=t) is discussed. Finally, we comment on implications of our results for purely repulsive models of superconductivity in alkalim etaldoped fullerenes. The recent discovery<sup>1</sup> of superconductivity in alkalim etal-doped fullerenes,  $K_{3}C_{60}$ and  $Rb_{3}C_{60}$ , has led to considerable interest in the electronic structure and superconductivity mechanism of this new class of organic solids. The remarkable structure of  $C_{60}$  leads to one active p-orbital per carbon atom, and it has been suggested that a one-band H ubbard model will capture at least some of the physics of the -electrons of the fullerenes.<sup>2,3</sup> The theoretical analysis of this simpli ed model can lead to an understanding of correlation e ects that are beyond the range of one-electron approximations. The same model is currently widely used in the study of the cuprate high- $T_{c}$  superconductors. We have recently begun an investigation of the H ubbard model on fullerene clusters, concentrating in this paper on the H artree-Fock and the R andom P hase approximations. Results obtained using the Q uantum M onte C arbom ethod and the spin-wave approximation in the H eisenberg limit were previously reported in Ref. 4.

In this paper we study the one-band H ubbard m odel at half- lling (one electron per site) for two particular clusters: the truncated tetrahedron  $C_{12}$ , and the truncated icosahedron  $C_{60}$ . Our m ain result is the appearance of a magnetic-like instability beyond a critical value of the H ubbard coupling  $(U=t)_c$  2:6. For larger values of U/t we observe that a generalized spin-density wave state (SDW), i.e. a state with \classical" spin order on the cluster, has an energy lower than the Ferm i sea constructed from the tight-binding eigenstates. This new spin-density wave state reduces, in the U = 1 lim it, to the classical cal spin con guration which m inim izes the antiferrom agnetic H eisenberg H am iltonian on the cluster.<sup>5;4</sup> This con guration is highly non-trivial as was shown in Ref.5. Physical consequences of this instability are discussed at the end of the paper.

C entainly, for a f in ite cluster we do not expect that the exact ground state w ill present a sharp singularity at som e value of U = t (unless a level crossing occurs). This is an artifact

2

of our approximation. There is no phase transition leading to magnetic ordering on a

nite system such as  ${\tt G}_0$  . In the case of C  $_{12}$  it has been show  $n^3$  by exact diagonalization of the Hubbard Ham iltonian that the ground state of the neutral molecule is a singlet for all values of U/t. We also expect this to be true in the case of  $C_{60}$ . However it may very well be that the physics of these nite system s is captured by a broken symmetry state. For example, this is known to happen in the case of the square lattice Heisenberg antiferrom agnet: in the therm odynam ic lim it the quantum ground state is N eel ordered (according to the general belief) and nevertheless the ground state of any nite piece of square lattice is a singlet as dem onstrated long ago. But antiferrom agnetic correlations indicative of N eel order are present in these nite systems as clearly shown by num erical studies.6 The ground state degeneracy that we expect due to broken symmetry appears only in the therm odynam ic lim it. For any nite system vector order parameters will be zero (such as the staggered magnetization of the square lattice magnet) but correlations can be properly studied through the use of singlet correlation function such as  $< S_i \quad \$>$ . Thus, we expect that the exact ground state of C  $_{60}$  or C  $_{12}$  will show indications of the m agnetic instability discussed in this paper by presenting a rapid crossover at  $(U = t)_c$  from nonm agnetic to magnetic dom inated correlations. The ground state will always remain a singlet, but after the crossover a state of spin one will reduce its energy approaching the ground state when the size of the clusters grow.

The Ham iltonian of the Hubbard model is

$$H = t X (c_{i}^{y} c_{j} + hx:) + \frac{U}{2} X c_{i}^{y} c_{i} c_{i}^{y} c_{i} :$$
(1)

The indexes i; j label sites of the cluster (i; j = 1, ..., 60 for  $C_{60}$ ),  $c_i^y$  is the creation operator for an electron on site i with spin , t is the hopping integral that we assume to

be the same for all bonds, U is the on-site repulsion energy, and the st sum runs over all neighbouring sites. It is worth recalling that a simple tight-binding H am iltonian for orbitals reproduces extremely well the order and degeneracies of electronic levels near the Ferm i energy as obtained in more sophisticated molecular orbital calculations.<sup>7</sup> At half-

lling the only parameter of the model is the ratio U/t. Its precise value is unknown, but the intermediate regime U/t 3-5 m ay be realistic<sup>2;3;8</sup> Recently, in the framework of a twoband Hubbard-like model, R. Lofet al.<sup>2</sup> claimed that doped C<sub>60</sub> should be considered as a highly correlated system with U=W comparable to that in high-T<sub>c</sub> superconductors (W being the one hole bandwidth). Then, it is clearly interesting to study strongly correlated electrons de ned on fullerene clusters for all values of U=t.

The HF m ethod searches for the Slater determ inant <sup>1</sup>/<sub>H</sub> F i which m inim izes the energy. This determ inant is built from the lowest eigenstates of the following one-particle Ham iltonian:

$$h = t (c_{i}^{y}c_{j} + h:c:) + U n_{i} c_{i}^{y}c_{i} i; c_{i}^{y}c_{i} : (2)$$

$$h_{i;ji;} i; h_{i;ji} c_{i}^{y}c_{i} i; c_{i}^{y}c_{i} : (2)$$

In this equation,  $i_{j,j} = hHFjr_{j,0}^{v}c_{i}$  jHF i is the one-body density matrix, and  $n_{i}$  $i_{j,i}$ . One possible Ansatz for the density matrix, which always provides a self-consistent solution, is  $n_{i,i} = n_{i,i} = 1=2$  and  $i_{j,i} = 0$ . The interaction term in h, Eq.(2), is then proportional to the particle number operator and the eigenstates of h are those of the tight-binding H am iltonian. We refer to this solution as to the trivial or \non-magnetic" state. Its energy grows linearly with U, starting from the ground state energy of the tight-binding H am iltonian. Its energy per site is, in units of t, -1.5+0.25 (U/t) for C<sub>12</sub> and -1.5527+0.25 (U/t) for C<sub>60</sub>. Of course, the energy of this non-magnetic state is overestim ated by the Hartree Fock approximation. A sU increases, one expects the doubly occupied states to be depleted. The resulting correlations could be taken into account by using a better variational state, e.g. the G utzw iller projection of this Slater determ inant.<sup>8</sup> How ever, when U becomes large enough, it is possible to indicate by the on site repulsion. We turn now to the description of this new solution.

In the strong coupling regime (U/t = 1) the half-led Hubbard model reduces at leading order in perturbation theory to the antiferrom agnetic Heisenberg model (HAF):

$$H_{HAF} = \frac{4t^2}{U} X_{\text{hi;ii}} (S_{i} \quad S_{i} \quad \frac{1}{4});$$
(3)

where  $S_i$  are spin-1=2 operators. To study this quantum model on nite clusters, one can search for the ground state of the corresponding classical model and perform the spinwave expansion around this state. This non-trivial ground state classical spin con guration has been recently discussed.<sup>5;4</sup> For the quantum problem, a spin wave analysis has been performed,<sup>4</sup> leading to a critical spin value (below which spin order is washed out by quantum uctuations) rather close to 1/2. This result was in rough agreement with more sophisticated QMC simulations.<sup>4</sup> Here, we construct a Hartree-Fock solution based on the classical spin con guration obtained by minimizing the Hamiltonian Eq.(3). For this purpose, we de ne a new basis ji i where the quantization axes are site-dependent, and lie in the directions of the classical spins. These directions are specied by polar angles i and i. In this new basis the Hamiltonian reads

$$H = t \begin{pmatrix} X \\ I \\ hi; ji; ; 0 \end{pmatrix} (R_{i}^{y}R_{j}) \circ c_{i}^{y} c_{j} \circ + h::) + \frac{U}{2} \begin{pmatrix} X \\ I \\ i; \end{pmatrix} c_{i}^{y} c_{i} c_{i}^{y} c_{i} ; \qquad (4)$$

where  $R_i$  is an SU (2) m atrix which rotates the original quantization axis at site i into the direction of polar angles i; i. Next, and after the HF approximation is made in Eq.(4), we try an Ansatz for which i; i = 0 and  $n_{i''}$   $n_{i\#}$  is site-independent. This solution, when it exists, will be called the \magnetic'' solution. The corresponding state may be viewed as a generalized spin-density wave de ned on clusters with the topology of a sphere.

The calculation of the classical ground state of the HAF has been carried out for  $C_{12}$  and  $C_{60}$ . Using these results, our HF calculations indicate that there is a magnetic solution beyond a critical value  $(U/t)_c$  2:6 for  $C_{60}$ , and 2:7 for  $C_{12}$  for which the order parameter  $n_{i''}$   $n_{i\#}$  becomes nonzero. For larger values of U=t, the magnetic solution is always lower in energy than the nonmagnetic one. Figure 1 shows the value of  $n_{i''}$  for C <sub>60</sub> as a function of U/t. The curve for  $C_{12}$  has a similar shape. In the limit of large U/t,  $n_{i''}$ ! 1, and thus the spins align in the directions of the classical order (i; i). In the same lim it, the HF energy, which behaves as  $t^2=U$ , tends towards the energy of the ground state of the equivalent classical HAF. Figure 2 shows the energy per site for the  $C_{60}$  cluster, in units oft, as a function of U/t, for both the magnetic and the non-magnetic solutions. The energies per site of the classical ground states are 2.5 (t=U) for C<sub>12</sub>, and 2.809 (t=U) for C<sub>60</sub>, to be compared against the energy per site of the magnetic HF solution calculated for (U=t) = 5 and 100 which are, respectively, 2:395 (t=U) and 2:499 (t=U) for  $C_{12}$ , 2:64 (t=U) and 2:808 (t=U) for C<sub>60</sub>. Finally, the gap between the highest occupied and and the lowest unoccupied orbitals approaches U for increasing values of (U=t) since the excitations in the Hartree Fock approximation correspond to ipping one spin against the m ean eld. Of course, the interaction among these elementary spin ip excitations strongly alters this picture, as revealed by the spin wave analysis or the RPA calculation to be presented below. They clearly show that spin-wave-like states appear in the HF gap.

The magnetic instability that we have found is qualitatively similar to that observed for the Hubbard model on a lattice without nesting of the Ferm i surface, where antiferromagnetism appears only above a critical (non vanishing) value of the on-site repulsion.<sup>9</sup> This is to be contrasted with the case of the square lattice where an antiferrom agnetic instability develops as soon as U is nonzero due to perfect nesting of the Ferm i surface: there, the non-magnetic solution is always unstable against the antiferrom agnetic spindensity wave.

The HF magnetic solution breaks rotational symmetry. This is an artifact of the mean-eld approximation and, of course, the true ground state of a nite system, such as the C<sub>60</sub> cluster, is an eigenstate of the total spin, presumably a singlet. However, the spin correlations present in the Hartree-Fock state may be relevant to the physics of the cluster. They may be found by the use of singlet observables.

Further insight on the spin correlations and the associated instability of the nonm agnetic H artree-Fock solution m ay be obtained from the R andom P hase Approximation (RPA). For C<sub>12</sub>, we have performed a complete RPA calculation in the space of the 144 particle-hole congurations, for both the magnetic and the non-magnetic states. In the case of C<sub>60</sub> we have only determined the lowest spin excited states from a study of the spin susceptibility  $_{ij} = ihT S_1^z$  (t)  $S_j^z$  (0) i; in real (lattice) space, and this only for the nonmagnetic solution. We nd, in both cases of  $G_2$  and  $C_{60}$ , that the non-magnetic solution is stable against particle-hole excitations as long as  $(U=t) < (U=t)_c$ . As (U=t) crosses the critical value, the lowest RPA excitations energies, which are degenerate (at least 3 times; for C<sub>12</sub> the total degeneracy is 9), do vanish and become in aginary. This is illustrated in Fig. 3. This behaviour of the RPA eigenvalues rescats the fact that the non-magnetic HF solution is unstable for couplings (U=t) > (U=t)\_c. We have checked explicitly, in the case of C<sub>12</sub>, that the HF m agnetic solution is stable against sm all am plitude oscillations as given by the RPA .N ote that, in this case, the RPA spectrum contains 3 zero energy modes relecting the breaking of global spin rotational sym metry. We have calculated, again for C<sub>12</sub>, the corrections to the total energy coming from including RPA correlations in the ground state. In the strong coupling limit, we ind that the resulting energy approaches, as expected,<sup>10,11</sup> the linear spin-wave result for the limiting H eisenberg H am iltonian, i.e. 3313(f=U) for C<sub>12</sub>, and 3503(f=U) for C<sub>60</sub>. The values obtained in RPA for U/t= 5 and U/t= 100 are 3203(f=U) and 33127(f=U), respectively. Note that the RPA correlations, or equivalently the spin waves, provide a substantial correction to the H artree Fock or classical energies. In the strong coupling limit, the 144 RPA excitation energies of C<sub>12</sub> separate into a group of 12 lowest lying ones whose values coincide with the spin-wave energies of the equivalent HAF, including the 3 zero energy states, and another group of 132, starting at an energy of order U, which correspond to charge excitations.

Finally, the nature of the instability, as well as the structure of the non trivial H artree-Fock state, m ay be obtained from the RPA calculation in the non-m agnetic sector. To understand this, note that within RPA an instability manifests itself by the divergence of some static susceptibility. In the present case,  $= {}^{0}(1 + U {}^{0}){}^{1}$ , where  ${}^{0}$  denotes the unperturbed spin susceptibility, and the instability occurs when  $D et(1 + U {}^{0}(! = 0)) = 0$ . The particular m ode along which the instability develops is found by the response of the system to a magnetizing eld h pointing locally in the directions ( $_{i}$ ;  $_{i}$ ) of the classical spins. The corresponding response function /  $_{ij}h_i$  h diverges at  $U = U_c$ . There are indeed three degenerate eigenvectors of the matrix  $_{ij} + U {}^{0}_{ij}(! = 0)$  that vanish right at  $U_c$ , whose components can be identified with the vectors h. More precisely, if  $X_i; Y_i; Z_i$  denote the components of these three eigenvectors, we identify  $h_i^x = X_i; h_i^y = Y_i; h_i^z = Z_i$ , while the norm of the vector  $h_i$ , i.e.  $X_i^2 + Y_i^2 + Z_i^2$ , is site independent. The relative angles between the orientations of the magnetizing eld at sites i and j are then given by  $\cos_{ij} = (h_i \quad j) = h^2$ , where h is the strength of the magnetizing eld, common to all sites. Thus, we recover precisely the conguration that is found in the Heisenberg limit and in the HF calculation. We should emphasize that we have done this construction only for the magnetic instability. The possibility of other types of instabilities cannot be excluded. A ctually, we observed in the case of  $C_{12}$ , for which a complete RPA calculation has been performed, the presence of nine RPA eigenvalues which vanish as U approaches  $U_c$ . We still do not have a simple physical interpretation to o er for these extra soft modes and the possible associated instabilities.

To sum marize, we have found and studied a generalized spin-density wave state for the Hubbard model on the clusters  $C_{12}$  and  $C_{60}$ . This state is lower in energy than the norm alferm isea constructed from tight binding orbitals when  $U/t^{>}$  2.6. Qualitatively, it resembles the spin order found by minimizing the energy of the classical Heisenberg model de ned on these clusters. We expect that our approximate broken symmetry solution leads to a smooth crossover towards spin correlations on the nite system as already advocated in ref. 5 on general grounds. This magnetic instability may have an important elect on the elective interaction between valence electrons. We note in this respect that the perturbative calculations presented in Ref. 2 indicate that an attraction sets in for a value of the coupling U/t 3. It has been argued that such an attraction could be the origin of superconductivity in doped  $C_{60}$ . Exact studies<sup>3</sup> of sm all clusters, including  $C_{12}$ , have con med the existence of an intermediate range of values of U/t where the pair-binding energy is positive (equivalent to an e ective attractive interaction between electrons). It is interesting to note that this pairing tendency appears in the range where spin correlations can be expected to appear smoothly in the nite system.

We have checked that the new Hartree Fock ground state is stable against small uctuations as calculated in the RPA. However, this concerns only local stability, and we cannot exclude the possible existence of other m inim a in the Hartree Fock energy. An in portant question regarding the magnetic structure that we have found is whether the spin correlations extend over the whole molecule or if there is a nite spin correlation length smaller than the molecular diameter. This requires further studies. Let us just mention that for the  $C_{12}$  cluster in the Heisenberg limit, we have diagonalized the spin Ham iltonian in the  $S^{z} = 0$  sector and computed the exact spin correlations  $hS_{i}$ Si. For the maximal separation (3 sites), the correlation is reduced by a factor < 5 from the classical value but does not disappear. Thus it seems plausible that the SDW state is not washed out by quantum uctuations on  $G_2$ . For the considerably larger  $C_{60}$  m olecules, the same question has been addressed recently by ab initio techniques such as Quantum M onte-C arlo. There is evidence<sup>4</sup> that the uctuations are stronger in  $G_0$ , leading perhaps to a spin liquid ground state<sup>12</sup> that resembles the SDW here discussed only below the spin correlation length. How ever, the QMC simulations were performed at nite temperature and, as recently remarked in Ref.5, it may occur that reducing further the temperature in those simulations, an ordered state may be reached. This and related issues will be addressed in the future.

The com puter calculations were done at the C ray-Y M P of the F lorida State U niversity C om puting C enter, Tallahasse, F lorida. W e thank this supercom puter center for its support.

10

- [1] A. Hebard et al., Nature (London) 350, 600 (1991); K. Holczer et al., Science 252, 1154 (1991), see also H. K roto et al., Nature (London) 318, 162 (1985).
- [2] S. Chakravarty and S. Kivelson, Europhys. Lett. 16, 751 (1991); S. Chakravarty, M. Gelfand and S. Kivelson, Science 254, 970 (1991); R. W. Lofet al, Phys. Rev. Lett. 68, 3924 (1992); A. Auerbach and G. Murthy, BU preprints; W. Go and P. Phillips, M IT preprint. See also P.W. Anderson, talk at sym posium on C<sub>60</sub> fullerenes, UCLA.
- [3] S.R.W hite, S.Chakravarty, M.P.Gelfand and S.Kivelson, Phys. Rev. B45, 5062 (1992).
- [4] R.T. Scalettar, E. Dagotto, L. Bergom i, Th. Jolic ur, H. Monien, \D isordered G round State of the Hubbard M odel on a C<sub>60</sub> C luster", FSU P reprint, SP hT /92-68.
- [5] D.Co ey and S.Trugman, LA-UR-91-3302 and 92-712, Los A lam os preprints.
- [6] E.Dagotto, Int. J.M od. Phys. B5, 907 (1991) and references therein.
- [7] D A. Bochvar and E G. Gal'pern, Dokl. Akad. Nauk. SSSR 209, 610 (1973); S. Satpathy, Chem. Phys. Lett. 130, 545 (1986).
- [8] P. Joyes and R. Tarento, Phys. Rev. B45, 12077 (1992).
- [9] D. Vollhardt, Rev. M od. Phys. 56, 99 (1984) and references therein.
- [10] J.R.Schrie er, X.G.W en and S.C.Zhang, Phys. Rev. B 39, 11663 (1989).
- [11] A.V.Chubukov and D.M.Frenkel, University of Illinois preprint P/92/34, and references therein.
- [12] L.Pauling, Proc. R. Soc. London A 196, 343 (1949); P.W. Anderson, Science 235, 1196 (1987); S.K ivelson, D. Rokhshar and J. Sethna, Phys. Rev. B 35, 8865 (1987).

#### FIGURE CAPTIONS:

Figure 1: The value of N<sub>z</sub>  $n_{i"}$  as a function of U/t for C<sub>60</sub>. Below  $(U=t)_c$  2.6 the Hartree-Fock ground state is nonmagnetic, and  $n_{i"} = n_{i\#} = 1=2$ . Above the critical value, the quantization axis points in the directions of the classical spins, and  $n_{i"}$  approaches its fully saturated value  $n_{i"} = 1$ , as U ! 1.

F igure 2: The energy per site in units oft for the HF solutions on  $C_{60}$ . The nonm agnetic solution (upper curve) rises linearly with U.Beyond (U/t)<sub>c</sub>, the magnetic solution (lower curve) has lower energy.

F igure 3: The energy, in units of the HF gap, of the three soft RPA modes which vanish at  $(U/t)_c$ , indicating the presence of the magnetic instability.

# GENERALIZED SPIN DENSITY WAVE STATE OF THE HUBBARD MODEL ON C $_{\rm 12}$ AND C $_{\rm 60}$ CLUSTERS.

L.BERGOM I, J.P.BLA ZOT , Th. JOLIC UR\*

## Service de Physique Theorique\*\* C.E.Saclay F{91191 Gif-sur-Yvette Cedex, France

and

### E.DAGOTTO

## D epartm ent of P hysics, C enter for M aterials Research and Technology, and Supercom puter C om putations Research Institute, F brida State University, Tallahasse, FL 32306, USA

Subm itted to: Physical Review B: Rapid Communications

June 1992 PACS No: 74.70, 75.10 J, 75.30 D

SPhT/92-083

<sup>\*</sup> C N R S.Research Fellow

<sup>\*\*</sup> Laboratoire de la Direction des Sciences de la Mati ere du Commissariat a l'Energie Atomique