

IN ELASTIC NEUTRON SCATTERING FROM
THE SPIN LADDER COMPOUND $(VO)_2P_2O_7$

R.S.Eccleston,¹ T.Barnes,² J.Brody³ and J.W.Johnson³

¹The ISIS Facility, Rutherford Appleton Laboratory,
Chilton, Didcot, OXON OX11 0QX, UK

²Physics Division and Center for Computationally Intensive Physics,
Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge, TN 37831, USA
and

Department of Physics and Astronomy,
University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN 37996, USA

³Corporate Research Laboratories,
Exxon Research and Engineering Company,
Annandale, NJ 08801, USA

ABSTRACT: We present results from an inelastic neutron scattering experiment on the candidate Heisenberg spin ladder vanadyl pyrophosphate, $(VO)_2P_2O_7$. We find evidence for a spin-wave excitation gap of $E_{\text{gap}} = 3.7 \pm 0.2$ meV, at a band minimum near $Q = 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$. This is consistent with expectations for triplet spin waves in $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ in the spin-ladder model, and is to our knowledge the first confirmation in nature of a Heisenberg antiferromagnetic spin ladder.

PACS Indices: 75.10.Jm, 75.25.+z, 75.30.Ds, 75.50.Ee.

I. Introduction

Many neutron scattering studies of the magnetic excitation spectra of Heisenberg spin chains have been reported since Haldane first suggested that integer- and half-integer spins might lead to qualitatively different physics.^{1,2} This conjecture, that only half-integer-spin chains are gapless, is now generally regarded as experimentally confirmed.

To gain insight into the physics underlying the surprising one-dimensional result, one may study systems intermediate between spin chains and two-dimensional systems, which are gapless for all spins. The simplest of these is the "Heisenberg spin ladder", which has isotropic couplings J_{\parallel} along the chains and J_{\perp} between them. Although this system with both antiferromagnetic³⁻¹⁵ and ferromagnetic¹⁶⁻²⁰ interchain couplings has been the subject of considerable recent theoretical interest, to our knowledge no examples have previously been confirmed in nature.

Copper nitrate, $\text{Cu}(\text{NO}_3)_2 \cdot \frac{5}{2}\text{H}_2\text{O}$, was an early ladder candidate, since a ladder superexchange pathway was evident, and the specific heat and susceptibility could be described by a ladder model. However, theoretical studies showed that ladders and alternating chains lead to very similar thermodynamics,²¹⁻²³ and the issue was finally decided in favor of an alternating chain by proton magnetic resonance²⁴ and elastic neutron scattering²⁵ experiments. Although copper hydrazinium chloride^{26,27} is not a complete spin ladder, it apparently does form a closely related antiferromagnetic "sawtooth", in which Cu^{+2} and Cl^- ions occupy alternate ladder sites.

Recently two other candidate ladder systems have been discussed in the literature, a $\text{Sr}_{n-1}\text{Cu}_{n+1}\text{O}_{2n}$ series^{28,29} (expected to consist of coupled ladders with a frustrated "trellis" coupling¹¹), a $\text{La}_{4+4n}\text{Cu}_{8+2n}\text{O}_{14+8n}$ series³⁰ (another coupled-ladder system), and the isolated-ladder antiferromagnetic vanadyl pyrophosphate,³¹⁻³⁹ $(\text{VO})_2\text{P}_2\text{O}_7$, which is the subject of this study.

A ladder configuration of $S = 1/2 V^{+4}$ ions is clearly evident in the crystal structure of $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ ^{35;37;39} (see especially Fig.2 of Ref.[39]), with spacings of 3.19(1) Å between rung ions and 3.864(2)Å between chain ions. The susceptibility of this material is fitted surprisingly well by an alternating chain model³⁹ with $J_1 = 11.3$ meV and $J_2 = 7.9$ meV, but this need not eliminate the ladder model if the thermodynamic similarities previously noted for $Cu(NO_3)_2 \cdot \frac{5}{2}H_2O$ apply in the $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ parameter regime as well. A recent theoretical study⁸ confirmed this similarity and found that the $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ susceptibility was also accurately described by a ladder model with nearly equal interactions, $J_{jj} = 7.76$ meV and $J_z = 7.82$ meV. The singlet-triplet gap at $J_z = J_{jj} = 1.0077$ is given by⁴⁰ $E_{gap} = J_{jj} = 0.50759(1)$, corresponding to $E_{gap} = 3.94$ meV with these parameters.

One may test the ladder model of $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ directly in a neutron scattering experiment, through a determination of characteristic properties of the spin-wave excitation spectrum. In the ladder model with the parameters quoted above the singlet-triplet gap was predicted⁸ to be 3.9 meV at a momentum transfer of $Qa = \frac{1}{2}$ (equivalent to $Q = 0.813 \text{ Å}^{-1}$ in $(VO)_2P_2O_7$). This one-magnon band reaches a maximum energy of 16 meV near 0.3 Å^{-1} and 1.3 Å^{-1} , and a crossing spin-triplet two-magnon band gives a secondary gap of 7.9 meV at $Qa = 0$ and 2 and a broad plateau at 17-18 meV centered on $Qa = \frac{1}{2}$. (See Fig.6 of Ref.[8].) Structure factor calculations on finite clusters⁴¹ indicate that the strongest neutron scattering should occur near $Qa = \frac{1}{2}$, and higher levels above these two triplet bands should not be strongly excited. In contrast, a fit of the alternating chain model to the susceptibility predicts a somewhat higher gap of 4.9 meV, and the associated momentum transfer is problematical (it depends on an unspecified alternating-chain pathway) and need not have any simple relation to the $Q = 0.813 \text{ Å}^{-1}$ expected in the ladder model.

II. Experimental Procedure and Results

At present, single crystals of vanadylpyrophosphate of a sufficient volume for neutron inelastic scattering experiments are not available, however several experiments have demonstrated that neutron scattering experiments on polycrystalline samples of one-dimensional magnetic systems can yield considerable information.⁴² This is particularly true when using time-of-flight spectrometers, which can access a wide range of $(Q; \omega)$ simultaneously. The powder average of the correlation function observed experimentally is given by⁴²

$$S(Q; \omega) = T(\omega) F(Q^2) \int_{Q=Q_{\parallel}+Q_{\perp}}^Z \frac{1}{4Q^2} S(Q_{\parallel}; Q_{\perp}; \omega) dQ \quad (1)$$

where $T(\omega)$ is the temperature factor

$$T(\omega) = \frac{1}{1 + \exp(\hbar\omega/k_B T)} \quad (2)$$

$F(Q)$ is the ionic form factor, and Q_{\parallel} and Q_{\perp} are the parallel and perpendicular projections of the total momentum transfer Q relative to the intrinsic 1D magnetic axis. Clearly for any given Q all values of Q_{\parallel} Q will contribute to the scattered spectrum. Thus a mode which requires $Q_{\parallel} = q_1$ along the 1D axis to be excited will first appear experimentally at $Q = q_1$, but will persist at values $Q > q_1$, because these can excite systems with oblique orientations such that $Q_{\parallel} = q_1$.

Measurements of the excitation spectrum of a polycrystalline sample of $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ were performed on HET, a direct geometry chopper spectrometer on the ISIS pulsed neutron source at the Rutherford Appleton Laboratory. A rotating Fermi chopper phased to the neutron pulse monochromates the incoming neutron beam. Banks of detectors at 4 m and 2.5 m cover the angular ranges of $\theta = 3^\circ$ to 7° and $\theta = 9^\circ$ to 29° respectively. A further two banks at these lengths are situated at average angles of 118° and 130° , and are used for estimating non-magnetic background scattering.

The sample was prepared by Brody, in a manner similar to that described by Johnston, Johnson, Goshorn and Jacobson.³⁹ The final annealing was performed under flowing He at 973 K for 7 days. For this experiment it was mounted on the cold finger of a closed cycle refrigerator in a sachet of aluminium foil. All data described hereafter were collected while the sample was at a temperature of 13 K, using incident energies of 100 meV, 35 meV, 25 meV and 15 meV.

Data collected simultaneously across the full angular range of the forward scattering banks using an incident energy of 25 meV were combined to produce the contour plot of the scattering intensity shown in Fig.1. The dispersion relation predicted by Barnes and Riera⁸ has been superimposed on the plot to compare the ladder model to the experimental data, and to demonstrate the effects of powder averaging, which spreads the scattering over larger Q values than the minimum required for excitation. The predicted cut-off of the scattering at approximately 18 meV energy transfer is clearly seen, and at lower energies there is evidence of scattering consistent with the theoretical dispersion relation, particularly in the region $Q > 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$; the one-magnon band can be seen as it passes through a minimum energy near $Q = 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$, where there is an increase in intensity as would be expected from both a peak in the density of states and in $S(Q; \omega)$.

Using a lower incident energy of 15 meV the resolution is sufficient to resolve a gap between the elastic peak and the inelastic magnetic scattering. Fig.2 shows data summed over an angular range of $\theta = 14.3^\circ$ to 18.7° , which at an energy transfer of 3.7 meV represents a Q range of 0.72 \AA^{-1} to 0.88 \AA^{-1} (see Fig.2 insert). The data have been corrected for $k_f = k_i$ and detector efficiency. The figure clearly shows the onset of inelastic magnetic scattering above an energy transfer of approximately 3 meV. The low-energy onset of the inelastic magnetic scattering has been fitted with a Lorentzian convoluted with the resolution function, yielding a value of

$$E_{\text{gap}} = 3.7 \pm 0.2 \text{ meV} \quad (3)$$

for the gap. This is illustrated in Fig 2 by a dashed line in the upper graph and by a solid line in the lower graph, which shows the data after subtraction of the elastic and quasi-elastic components. The smaller dashed line on the lower graph represents the resolution function, and suggests that the spectrum has an intrinsic width, as expected if we are exciting a band rather than a discrete level.

The open symbols on the upper graph represent the data which was collected in the 2.5 m detectors at $\theta = 130^\circ$. At these high angles, and thus high Q values, there is no magnetic scattering due to the fall-off of the ionic form factor, and the inelastic scattering arises from single and multiple phonon scattering processes. This data has been multiplied by an empirical scale factor of 0.2 (determined in previous experiments) to provide an indication of the amount of non-magnetic background scattering underlying the magnetic scattering data collected at low Q values. The non-magnetic inelastic scattering contribution estimated in this way is clearly very small, and there are no features coincident with the observed magnetic scattering. The non-magnetic background scattering estimated in this manner has not been subtracted from the data presented in the lower plot. This data shows a feature at 1.8 meV energy transfer which is also visible in the scaled high angle data, confirming that the non-magnetic background scattering is indeed as weak as estimated by the scaled high angle data.

The resolution function of the spectrometer is made up of a contribution from the moderator and a contribution from the transmission of the chopper. The former is described by a Gaussian convoluted with an exponential, the latter simply by a Gaussian. The data below an energy transfer of 4 meV has been fitted using the FRILLS least squares fitting routine.⁴³ The elastic line is well described by the resolution function, but there appears to be a second broad component under the elastic line, which has been fitted with a Lorentzian convoluted with the resolution function. The origin of this scattering is not yet understood, and may involve scattering from magnetic defects in the sample.

No attempt was made to fit the scattering intensity versus energy above the gap using the ladder model, because there is an obvious discrepancy; the observed scattering is considerably stronger than expected from numerical studies of $S(Q; \omega)$ on small lattices,⁴¹ which anticipate a rapid fall in intensity away from the gap. This is the single feature of our data which does not appear to be in accord with current expectations for the ladder model.

The overlap of the one- and two-magnon bands would give rise to considerable structure in the scattering above the gap energy, notably contributions from two-magnon production at $\omega = 8$ and 17 meV, for which we do see some evidence. This includes scattering above 10 meV near $Q = 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$ which is evident in our 35 and 100 meV data. The 100 meV data indicates that this higher energy, $Q = 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$ scattering is strongest around 15 meV, and may therefore be due to the two-magnon band expected at 17 meV. Due to the gaps in experimental coverage we cannot be certain about the interpretation of these higher-energy excitations.

If data were available across a broader Q range, and without the null region evident in Fig.1, which is a consequence of the space between the 2.5 m and 4 m banks of detectors, it should be possible to extract the shape of the two branches and to study the indications of anomalous behavior in $S(Q; \omega)$. Such an experiment is planned for the near future.

III. Summary and Conclusions

In this note we present results from an inelastic neutron scattering experiment on the antiferromagnet vanadylpyrophosphate. We find evidence for a band of triplet spin waves, with a minimum excitation energy of $E_{\text{gap}} = 3.7 \pm 0.2$ meV at a momentum transfer near $Q = 0.8 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$. These values are consistent with the expectations of the spin ladder model of $(\text{VO})_2\text{P}_2\text{O}_7$, which predicted $E_{\text{gap}} = 3.9$ meV at $Q = 0.813 \text{ \AA}^{-1}$. The dispersion relation $\omega(Q)$ of spin excitations from approximately 0.6 \AA^{-1} to 1.5 \AA^{-1} is evident in our data,

and is also consistent with expectations for the lowest one-magnon band in the ladder model. These results confirm that $(\text{VO})_2\text{P}_2\text{O}_7$ to a good approximation is a realization of the antiferromagnetic Heisenberg spin ladder.

There remain two outstanding problems with the interpretation of neutron scattering from $(\text{VO})_2\text{P}_2\text{O}_7$. First, the intensity of scattering above the gap appears to be much stronger than expected from structure factor calculations on small lattices. Second, although the broad features of the excitation spectrum were observed in this experiment, the details of the expected bands above 10 meV are rather complicated, and an experimental investigation will require more complete coverage in (Q, ω) . Ideally this would involve a scattering experiment using a single crystal.

IV. Acknowledgements

We are grateful to J. Riera for communicating theoretical results for the magnetic structure factor $S(Q, \omega)$ of a spin ladder prior to the experiment, and for providing other unpublished results relating to ladder and alternating chain models. We also thank S. R. White for providing unpublished results for the singlet-triplet gap in the ladder model, M. E. Hagen for assistance with the data visualisation, J. Berlinsky, E. Dagotto, J. Greedan, H. A. Mook and H. Muta for related discussions, and M. A. Sokolov for a translation of Ref.[37]. We acknowledge the provision of neutron beam time by the EPSRC (formerly SERC). This study was supported in part by the Quantum Structure of Matter Project at Oak Ridge National Laboratory, funded by the US DOE Office of Scientific Computation under contract DE-AC05-84OR21400, managed by Martin Marietta Energy Systems Inc.

REFERENCES

1. F D M Haldane, Phys. Lett. 93A, 464 (1983).
2. I A eck, J. Phys. 1, 3047 (1989).
3. E Dagotto and A Moreo, Phys. Rev. B 38, 5087 (1988); Phys. Rev. B 44, 5396 (E) (1991).
4. S P Strong and A J M illis, Phys. Rev. Lett. 69, 2419 (1992).
5. E Dagotto, J R iera and D Scalapino, Phys. Rev. B 45, 5744 (1992).
6. T Barnes, E Dagotto, J R iera and E S Swanson, Phys. Rev. B 47, 3196 (1993).
7. J R iera, Phys. Rev. B 49, 3629 (1994).
8. T Barnes and J R iera, The Susceptibility and Excitation Spectrum of $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ in Ladder and Dimer Chain Models, ORNL / Rutherford Appleton Laboratory report ORNL-CCIP-94-04 / RAL-94-027 (1994), to appear in Phys. Rev. B.
9. R M Noack, S R W hite and D J Scalapino, Correlations in a Two-Chain Hubbard Model, University of California (Irvine) report UC I-CM THE-94-01 (1994).
10. S R W hite, R M Noack and D J Scalapino, Resonating Valence Bond Theory of Coupled Heisenberg Chains, University of California (Irvine) report UC I-CM THE-94-02 (1994).
11. S Gopalan, T M Rice and M Sigrist, Phys. Rev. B 49, 8901 (1994).
12. M Sigrist, T M Rice and F C Zhang, Superconductivity in a Quasi One Dimensional Spin Liquid, (1994).
13. H T sunetsugu, M T royer and T M Rice, Pairing and Excitation Spectrum in Doped t-J Ladders, Eidgenossische Technische Hochschule report ETH-TH/94-01 (1994).
14. D Poilblanc, H T sunetsugu and T M Rice, Spin Gaps in Coupled t-J Ladders, Lab. de Physique Quantique report LPQ TH-94-05 (1994).
15. M Azzouz, L Chen and S M oukouri, Calculation of the Singlet-Triplet Gap of the Antiferromagnetic Heisenberg Model on the Ladder, Universite de Sherbrooke report (1994).
16. K Hida, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 60, 1347 (1991).
17. S Takada and H W atanabe, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 61, 39 (1992).
18. H W atanabe, K Nomura and S Takada, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 62, 2845 (1993).
19. H W atanabe, Numerical Diagonalization Study of an $S=1/2$ Ladder Model with Open Boundary Conditions, University of Tsukuba report.
20. H W atanabe, Haldane Gap and the Quantum Spin Ladder, University of Tsukuba Ph.D. thesis (1994).
21. J C Bonner, S A Friedberg, H Kobayashi and B E Myers, in Proceedings of the 12th International Conference on Low Temperature Physics, ed E Kanda (K eigaku, Tokyo 1971), p. 691.

22. J.C Bonner and H.W. J.B lte, Phys. Rev. B 25, 6959 (1982).
23. J.C Bonner, S.A Friedberg, H Kobayashi, D.L M eier and H.W .J.B lte, Phys. Rev. B 27, 248 (1983).
24. K.M D iederix, J.P.G roen, L.S.J.M Henkens, T.O K lassen and N.J.Poulis, Physica 94B, 9 (1978).
25. J.Eckert, D.E Cox, G .Shirane, S.A Friedberg and H Kobayashi, Phys. Rev. B 20, 4596 (1979).
26. D.B Brown, J.A Donner, J.W .Hall, S.R W ilson, D .J.Hodgson and W .E.Hat eld, In-
org. Chem . 18, 2635 (1979).
27. W .E.Hat eld, J. Appl. Phys. 52, 1985 (1981).
28. Z.H iroi, M .A.zum a, M .Takano and Y .Bando, J. Solid State Chem . 95, 230 (1991).
29. M .Takano, Z.H iroi, M .A.zum a and Y .Takeda, Jpn. J. Appl. Phys. 7, 3 (1992).
30. R.J.Cava et al., J. Solid State Chem . 94, 170 (1991).
31. E.Bordes, Thesis (Paris, 1973).
32. E.Bordes and P.Courtine, Reunions Annuelles Soc. Chim .Fr. (M arseilles, 1973).
33. B.Kubias, Thesis (Berlin, 1974).
34. H .Seeboth, G .Ladwig, B.Kubias, G .W olf and B.Luecke, Ukr. Chem .J. 43, 842 (1977).
35. N.M iddlem iss, M cM aster University Ph.D .thesis (1978).
36. E.Bordes and P.Courtine, J. Catal. 57, 236 (1979).
37. Y .Gorbunova and S.A.Linde, Dokl. Akad. Nauk SSSR 245, 584 (1979).
38. D.C .Johnston and J.W .Johnson, J. Chem . Soc., Chem . Com m . 1720 (1985).
39. D.C .Johnston, J.W .Johnson, D.P.G oshom and A.J.Jacobson, Phys. Rev. B 35, 219 (1987).
40. S.R.W hite, private com m unication.
41. J.R.iera, private com m unication.
42. See for exam ple H.M utka, C.Payen, P.M olinie, J.L.Soubeyeroux, P.C olombet and
A.D .Taylor, Phys. Rev. Lett. 67, 497 (1991), and references cited therein.
43. R.O sbom, Rutherford Appleton Laboratory report RAL-91-011.

Figure Captions

Figure 1

Contour plot of the scattering intensity from $(VO)_2P_2O_7$ at 13 K using an incident energy of 25 meV. Contours of intensity run from 0.5 to 1.3 in steps of 0.1. (Arbitrary units.) The one-magnon (solid line) and two-magnon (dashed line) bands predicted by Barnes and Riera⁸ are superimposed on the data.

Figure 2

A constant Q scan across the predicted band minimum. Data from eight detectors which trace out the trajectories shown in the inset, have been summed. The upper graph shows the data (filled circles) and the fit as described in the text, together with data from the high angle bank of detectors (open circles), which have been multiplied by an empirical scale factor of 0.2 to provide an estimate of the non-magnetic background scattering. The lower graph represents the magnetic scattering after subtraction of the elastic and quasi-elastic components.