

# On the Recent Results of E835 Experiment at FNAL

A.A. Arkhipov

*Institute for High Energy Physics  
142284 Protvino, Moscow Region, Russia  
(Dated: January 8, 2004)*

In this note we briefly concern several recent results of E835 Experiment at FNAL that are discussed in the framework of unified picture on hadronic spectra elaborated in our earlier works. It has been established that new E835 Collaboration results provided an additional excellent confirmation of our theoretical conception.

PACS numbers: 12.10.-g, 12.60.-i, 14.40.-n, 11.25.Mj  
Keywords: hadron spectroscopy, Kaluza-Klein picture.

No doubt the year 2003 will enter the history of particle physics as a year of fundamental discoveries. A series of new mesons have been discovered whose properties are in a strong disagreement with the predictions of conventional QCD-inspired quark potential models. New narrow meson  $D_{sJ}^{*+}(2317)$ , decaying into  $D_s^+\pi^0$  has been observed by BABAR Collaboration [1] in the first. This observation was soon confirmed by CLEO Collaboration [2], which have also established the existence of a new narrow state with a mass near 2.46 GeV in its decay to  $D_s^{*+}\pi^0$ . Belle Collaboration [3] reported the first observation of the  $D_{sJ}(2317)$  and  $D_{sJ}(2457)$  in  $B$  decays:  $B \rightarrow \bar{D}D_{sJ}(2317)$  and  $B \rightarrow \bar{D}D_{sJ}(2457)$  with a subsequent  $D_{sJ}(2317)$  decay to  $D_s\pi^0$  and  $D_{sJ}(2457)$  decay to  $D_s^*\pi^0$  and  $D_s\gamma$  final states. Both CLEO and Belle observations of  $D_{sJ}(2457)$  have recently been confirmed by BABAR [4]. Moreover, Belle Collaboration has recently reported [5, 6] the discovery of very narrow  $X(3872)$ -meson state ( $\Gamma_{X(3872)}^{tot} < 2.3\text{MeV}$ ) in the  $J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$  invariant mass distribution in the  $B$  decay  $B^\pm \rightarrow K^\pm J/\psi\pi^+\pi^-$ . This observation of Belle Collaboration was confirmed not long since by CDF at Fermilab [7]. The mass measurement presented by CDF  $3871.4 \pm 0.7 \pm 0.4$  MeV is in agreement with the result of Belle. It should be noted, in particular, that the mass 2317 MeV is approximately 41 MeV below the  $DK$  threshold but the mass 3872 MeV is very near the  $D^0\bar{D}^{*0}$  threshold, while the  $D^+D^{*-}$  channel with approximately 8 MeV higher threshold mass is forbidden for  $X(3872)$  decay by phase space. What is remarkable here is that all new narrow states have been observed at the masses which are surprisingly far from the predictions of conventional quark potential models. It is still more remarkable that all new observed states are very narrow, their total widths being about a few MeV. The small widths were found to be in contradiction with quark model expectations. Does it mean the end of the constituent quark model? In any case, this means either considerable modifications in the conventional quark models have to be introduced or that completely new approaches should be applied in hadron spectroscopy.

In our previous papers [8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15] we have claimed that existence of the extra dimensions in the spirit of Kaluza and Klein together with some novel

dynamical ideas may provide new conceptual issues for the global solution of the spectral problem in hadron physics. In fact, we have performed an analysis of experimental data on the mass spectra of the two-nucleon system, two-pion and three-pion systems, strange mesons, charmed and charmed-strange mesons, and found out that simple formula provided by Kaluza-Klein approach with the fundamental scale calculated before [8] has excellently described the experimentally observed hadron spectra. The results of this analysis are partially summarized in Report [16] presented at Xth International Conference on Hadron Spectroscopy HADRON'03 (August 31 – September 6, 2003, Aschaffenburg, Germany) where it is shown, in particular, that all new observed states mentioned above are excellently incorporated in our theoretically developed conception.

Really, a wealth of new and exciting experimental data have been presented at the Conference HADRON'03. We have touched some of new experimental data in the Report [16]. In this note we will concern the recent results of E835 Experiment at Fermilab presented in Aschaffenburg in the talks of Claudia Patrignani [17] and Ismail Uman [18].

In Table 1 from Ref. [9] the theoretically calculated Kaluza-Klein tower of KK-excitations for the two-nucleon system and the experimentally observed mass spectra of proton-proton and proton-antiproton systems above the elastic threshold have been shown. In Ref. [9] there are the references where the experimental data have been extracted from. It is non-trivial that Kaluza-Klein scenario predicts  $M_n^{pp} = M_n^{p\bar{p}}$  i.e. a special sort of (super)symmetry between fermionic (dibaryon) and bosonic states, and Table 1 contains an experimental confirmation of this fact as well. There are the blanks in Table 1 which have to be filled in the future experimental studies. It was pleased for us to hear that E835 have precisely measured directly the mass and width of  $\eta_c(1^1S_0)$  in  $\bar{p}p$  annihilation:  $M(\eta_c) = 2984.1 \pm 2.1 \pm 1.0$  MeV and  $\Gamma(\eta_c) = 20.4_{-6.7}^{+7.7} \pm 2.0$  MeV [17]. This new E835 measurement shown in Table 1 by bold-face number just filled the  $M_{28}^{p\bar{p}}$ -storey of the Kaluza-Klein tower.

New observations of  $\bar{p}p \rightarrow \chi_0 \rightarrow \pi^0\pi^0, \eta\eta$  through interference with the continuum and precise measurements of the mass and width ( $M(\chi_0) = 3415.5 \pm 0.4 \pm 0.07$  MeV

and  $\Gamma(\chi_0) = 10.1 \pm 1.0$  MeV [17]) are also nice news for us. As is seen from Table 2  $\chi_0$ -state just occupy the  $M_{39}^{\eta\eta}$ -storey of Kaluza-Klein tower for  $\eta\eta$  system.

In the same Table 2 new (preliminary though) results of E835 Collaboration [18] for the masses of resonances decaying into  $\eta\eta$  have been shown by bold-face numbers. New results of E835 Collaboration [18] for the masses of resonances decaying into  $\eta\pi$  have been presented in Table 3 by bold-face numbers too. Asterisks in Tables 2-3 mark the states which have not been seen before. It was a great pleasure to establish that new E835 Collaboration results provided an additional excellent confirmation of our theoretical conception [16].

In summary we would like once again to emphasize that the deep idea of existence the extra dimensions received an additional experimental confirmation. Here we have briefly concerned several recent results of E835 Experiment at FNAL that were discussed in the framework of unified picture on hadronic spectra elaborated in our

works. It has been shown that quite an interesting and exciting results of E835 Collaboration have excellently been included into unified picture.

This is certainly a remarkable fact that a series of our publications was followed by the fundamental discoveries in hadron spectroscopy mentioned above, and here we would like to point out that strong time correlation as well.

It is clear that further experimental studies with a higher mass resolution are of great importance. In particular, this refers to the problem of a large resonance overlap. It will also be important to learn how one could experimentally extract the fine structures in a broad peak. We believe that the idea of an ultra-high resolution hadron spectrometer [19] is a vital experimental problem which can be solved in hadron physics in the nearest future. Anyway, it is too much desirable, and I do hope our most courageous wishes will come true.

- 
- [1] B. Aubert et al. (BABAR Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0304021 (2003).
  - [2] D. Besson et al. (CLEO Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0305017 (2003); arXiv:hep-ex/0305100 (2003); Phys. Rev. **D68**, 032002 (2003).
  - [3] P. Krokovny et al. (Belle Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0308019 (2003).
  - [4] B. Aubert et al. (BABAR Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0310050 (2003).
  - [5] K. Abe et al. (Belle Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0308029 (2003).
  - [6] S.-K. Choi et al. (Belle Collaboration), arXiv:hep-ex/0309032 (2003).
  - [7] G. Bauer, Quarkonium Working Group Presentation, Sept 20, 2003, Fermilab, available at <http://www.qwg.to.infn.it/WS-sep03/WS2talks/plenary/bauer.ps>.
  - [8] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0208215 (2002); preprint IHEP 2002-43, Protvino, 2002, available at <http://dbserv.ihep.su/~pubs/rep2002/ps/2002-43.pdf>
  - [9] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0302164 (2003).
  - [10] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0302213 (2003).
  - [11] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0304014 (2003).
  - [12] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0305167 (2003).
  - [13] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0306237 (2003).
  - [14] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0308321 (2003).
  - [15] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0309002 (2003).
  - [16] A.A. Arkhipov, arXiv:hep-ph/0309327 (2003), to appear in Proceedings of HADRON'03.
  - [17] C. Patrignani (for E835 Collaboration at FNAL), Charmonium spectroscopy in  $\bar{p}p$  annihilations, to appear in Proceedings of HADRON'03.
  - [18] I. Uman (for E835 Collaboration at FNAL), Observation of resonances in  $\bar{p}p \rightarrow \eta\eta\pi^0$  at 5.2 GeV/c, to appear in Proceedings of HADRON'03.
  - [19] B.C. Maglich, Controversies about fine structures and variable widths in meson spectra and feasibility of an ultra-high resolution hadron spectrometer, to appear in Proceedings of HADRON'03.

TABLE I: Kaluza-Klein tower of KK excitations for  $pp(p\bar{p})$  system and experimental data.

n	$M_n^{pp}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{pp}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{p\bar{p}}$ MeV	n	$M_n^{pp}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{pp}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{p\bar{p}}$ MeV
1	1878.38	$1877.5 \pm 0.5$	$1873 \pm 2.5$	15	2251.68	$2240 \pm 5$	$2250 \pm 15$
2	1883.87	$1886 \pm 1$	$1870 \pm 10$	16	2298.57	$2282 \pm 4$	$2300 \pm 20$
3	1892.98	$1898 \pm 1$	$1897 \pm 1$	17	2347.45	2350	$2340 \pm 40$
4	1905.66	$1904 \pm 2$	$1910 \pm 30$	18	2398.21		$2380 \pm 10$
5	1921.84	$1916 \pm 2$	$\sim 1920$	19	2450.73		$2450 \pm 10$
		$1926 \pm 2$		20	2504.90		$\sim 2500$
		$1937 \pm 2$	$1939 \pm 2$	21	2560.61		
6	1941.44	$1942 \pm 2$	$1940 \pm 1$	22	2617.76		$\sim 2620$
		$\sim 1945$	$1942 \pm 5$	23	2676.27		
7	1964.35	$1965 \pm 2$	1968	24	2736.04	2735	$2710 \pm 20$
		$1969 \pm 2$	$1960 \pm 15$	25	2796.99		
8	1990.46	$1980 \pm 2$	$1990^{+15}_{-30}$	26	2859.05		$2850 \pm 5$
		$1999 \pm 2$		27	2922.15		
9	2019.63	$2017 \pm 3$	$2020 \pm 3$	28	2986.22		<b><math>2984 \pm 2.1 \pm 1.0</math></b>
10	2051.75	$2046 \pm 3$	$2040 \pm 40$	29	3051.20		
		$\sim 2050$	$2060 \pm 20$	30	3117.04		
11	2086.68	$2087 \pm 3$	$2080 \pm 10$	31	3183.67		
			$2090 \pm 20$	32	3251.06		
		$\sim 2122$	$2105 \pm 15$	33	3319.15		
12	2124.27	$2121 \pm 3$	$2110 \pm 10$	34	3387.90		$3370 \pm 10$
		$2129 \pm 5$	$2140 \pm 30$	35	3457.28		
13	2164.39	$\sim 2150$	$2165 \pm 45$	36	3527.25		
		$2172 \pm 5$	$2180 \pm 10$	37	3597.77		$3600 \pm 20$
14	2206.91	$2192 \pm 3$	$2207 \pm 13$	38	3668.81		

TABLE II: Kaluza-Klein tower of KK excitations for  $\eta\eta$  system and experimental data.

n	$M_n^{2\eta}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{2\eta}$ MeV	n	$M_n^{2\eta}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{2\eta}$ MeV
1	1097.74		33	2948.47	
2	1107.10		34	3025.66	
3	1122.54		35	3103.15	
4	1143.80		36	3180.91	
5	1170.56		37	3258.94	
6	1202.47		38	3337.19	
7	1239.11		39	3415.68	$\chi_0(\mathbf{3415.5 \pm 0.4 \pm 0.07})$
8	1280.10	$f_2(1275)$	40	3494.36	
9	1325.01	$\mathbf{2^{++}(1330 \pm 2)}$	41	3573.25	
10	1373.47		42	3652.31	
11	1425.12		43	3731.54	
12	1479.62	$\mathbf{2^{++}(1477 \pm 5)}$	44	3810.93	
13	1536.66	$f'_2(1525)$	45	3890.47	
14	1595.99	$\pi_1(1600)$	46	3970.15	
15	1657.34		47	4049.96	
16	1720.51	$\mathbf{0^{++}(1734 \pm 4)}$	48	4129.90	
17	1785.29		49	4209.95	
18	1851.53		50	4290.11	
19	1919.07		51	4370.38	
20	1987.78	$\mathbf{4^{++}(1986 \pm 5)}$	52	4450.75	
21	2057.54	$\mathbf{2^{++}(\sim 2030)}$	53	4531.21	
22	2128.24	$\mathbf{2^{++}(2138 \pm 4)}$	54	4611.76	
23	2199.80		55	4692.39	
24	2272.14		56	4773.10	
25	2345.18	$\mathbf{4^{++}(2352 \pm 8)^*}$	57	4853.89	
26	2418.86		58	4934.75	
27	2493.13	$\mathbf{6^{++}(2484 \pm 14)}$	59	5015.68	
28	2567.93		60	5096.68	
29	2643.21		61	5177.73	
30	2718.94		62	5258.85	

TABLE III: Kaluza-Klein tower of KK excitations for  $\eta\pi$  system and experimental data.

n	$M_n^{\eta\pi^0}$ MeV	$M_n^{\eta\pi^\pm}$ MeV	$M_{exp}^{\eta\pi}$ MeV
1	690.08	694.47	
2	711.99	715.92	
3	744.86	748.26	
4	785.79	788.72	
5	832.74	835.28	
6	884.37	886.58	
7	939.76	941.73	
8	998.30	1000.05	
9	1059.49	1061.07	
10	1122.97	1124.40	
11	1188.40	1189.72	
12	1255.56	1256.78	
13	1324.22	1325.36	$\mathbf{2^{++}(1330 \pm 2)}$
14	1394.21	1395.27	$1^{-+}(1400 \pm 20)$
15	1465.36	1466.35	$0^{++}(1474 \pm 20)$
16	1537.54	1538.47	
17	1610.63	1611.51	
18	1684.53	1685.36	$\mathbf{0^{++}(\sim 1700)}$
19	1759.15	1759.94	$\mathbf{2^{++}(1740 \pm 7)}$
20	1834.42	1835.17	
21	1910.27	1910.98	
22	1986.64	1987.32	$\mathbf{4^{++}(1986 \pm 5)}$
23	2063.47	2064.12	
24	2140.73	2141.36	
25	2218.37	2218.97	$\mathbf{4^{++}(2226 \pm 6)^*}$
26	2296.36	2296.94	
27	2374.66	2375.22	
28	2453.25	2453.79	
29	2532.11	2532.63	
30	2611.21	2611.71	