

# On mediums with negative phase velocity: a brief overview

Akhlesh Lakhtakia<sup>1,\*</sup>, Martin W. McCall<sup>2</sup>, Werner S. Weiglhofer<sup>3</sup>,  
Jaline Gerardin<sup>1</sup> and Jianwei Wang<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup> CATMAS — Computational and Theoretical Materials Sciences Group  
Department of Engineering Science and Mechanics  
Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802-6812, USA

<sup>2</sup> Department of Physics, The Blackett Laboratory  
Imperial College of Science, Technology and Medicine  
Prince Consort Road, London SW7 2BW, United Kingdom

<sup>3</sup> Department of Mathematics, University of Glasgow  
Glasgow G12 8QW, United Kingdom

## Abstract

Several issues relating to oppositely directed phase velocity and power flow are reviewed. A necessary condition for the occurrence of this phenomenon in isotropic dielectric-magnetic mediums is presented. Ramifications for aberration-free lenses, homogenization approaches, and complex mediums are discussed.

**Keywords:** Left-handed materials, Negative phase velocity, Negative real permeability, Negative real permittivity

## 1 Introduction

As witnessed by the introduction of a session on the so-called *left-handed materials* in this conference, materials with negative phase velocity have attracted much attention during the last two years. Over three decades ago, Veselago [1] suggested many unusual properties of materials with negative real relative permittivity and negative real relative permeability at a certain frequency, including inverse refraction, negative radiation pressure, inverse Doppler effect. However, his considerations were completely speculative in view of the lack of a material, or even a nonhomogeneous composite medium, with a relative permittivity having a negative real part and a very small imaginary part. A breakthrough was achieved by Smith *et al.* [2], who, developing some earlier ideas by Pendry *et al.* [3]–[5], presented evidence for a weakly dissipative composite medium displaying negative values for the real parts of its *effective* permittivity and *effective* permeability. Their so-called *meta-material* consists of various inclusions of conducting rings and wires embedded within

---

\*Email: AXL4@psu.edu; Telephone: +1 814 863 4319; Fax: +1 814 865 9974

printed circuit boards. Other types of nanostructural combinations with similar response properties can also be devised [6].

Experimental results published last year by Shelby *et al.* [7] on the transmission of a  $\sim 10$ -GHz beam through a wedge provided impetus to the electromagnetics community for a discussion on the concept of a negative index of refraction. Doubts have emerged on the homogeneity and the isotropy of the composite materials used by Shelby *et al.* as well as on the adequacy of their measurement setup [8]–[10]. Despite those doubts, the crucial flipping of the transmission pattern about the normal to the exit surface, when a teflon wedge was replaced by a wedge made of the ring-wire material, appears to be unexplainable in any way other than by resorting to the essence of Veselago’s suggestion. In view of the considerable literature accumulated during the past few months and the explosive nature of the current scientific scene [11], we take this opportunity to present our thoughts on a variety of related issues.

## 2 What’s in a name?

The emergence of a clear terminology is often a difficult process with regards to scientific findings relating to novel effects, something that is also apparent in the present instance. The first label for the candidate materials is *left-handed materials* [1]. But chiral materials are important subjects of electromagnetics research and the terms *left-handedness* and *right-handedness* have been applied to the molecular structure of such materials for well over a century [12]. The continued use of the term *left-handed materials* (LHMs) for achiral materials will thus confuse the crucial issues [2, 7, 13, 14].

The term *backward* (BW) medium has been proffered by Lindell and colleagues [15]. This term presumes the *a priori* definitions of forward and backward directions. Whatever be the merits of this term for planewave propagation, it would founder for problems involving nonplanar interfaces.

Ziolkowski and Heyman [16] recently provided the most extensive theoretical and numerical analysis of the negative index of refraction to date. They introduced the technical term *double negative* (DNG) medium to indicate that the real parts of both permittivity and permeability are negative. While sensible enough, such nomenclature conceals the importance of dissipative effects.

After a careful study of the relevant constitutive parameters, we have come to the conclusion that the term *negative phase-velocity* (NPV) medium is unambiguous and covers all possible situations that we could think of. It also provides a contrast to the emerging *negative group-velocity* (NGV) mediums, reports on which are now emerging with regularity [17]–[20].

### 3 The condition for NPV

Consider an isotropic dielectric–magnetic medium with relative permittivity  $\epsilon_r = \epsilon'_r + i\epsilon''_r$  and relative permeability  $\mu_r = \mu'_r + i\mu''_r$ . Dissipation is reflected in the imaginary parts  $\epsilon''_r$  and  $\mu''_r$ , whilst causality dictates that  $\mu''_r > 0$  and  $\epsilon''_r > 0$ , so that  $\epsilon_r$  and  $\mu_r$  lie in the upper half of the complex plane. The phase velocity is opposite to the direction of power flow, whenever the inequality

$$\left[ + \left( \epsilon'^2_r + \epsilon''^2_r \right)^{1/2} - \epsilon'_r \right] \left[ + \left( \mu'^2_r + \mu''^2_r \right)^{1/2} - \mu'_r \right] > \epsilon''_r \mu''_r \quad (1)$$

holds. [21] Clearly, the simultaneous satisfaction of both  $\epsilon'_r < 0$  and  $\mu'_r < 0$  is a sufficient, but not necessary, requirement for the phase velocity to be negative. This result has been illustrated by frequency–domain [21] as well as time–domain [22] calculations of planewave reflection at the planar interface of free space and a NPV medium with Lorentzian characteristics.

A plane electromagnetic wave polarized parallel to the  $x$  axis, and propagating along the  $z$  axis in a medium characterized by  $\epsilon_r$  and  $\mu_r$ , is described by

$$\mathbf{E}(z) = A \exp(ik_0 n_{\pm} z) \mathbf{u}_x, \quad (2)$$

where  $n_{\pm} = \pm \sqrt{\epsilon_r \mu_r}$ . The choice of the sign of the refractive index is mandated by the direction of power flow. If the criterion (1) is satisfied, then  $n_+$  (resp.  $n_-$ ) applies for power flow along the  $+z$  (resp.  $-z$ ) axis; accordingly,  $\text{Re}[n_+] < 0$  (resp.  $\text{Re}[n_-] > 0$ ), where  $\text{Re}[\cdot]$  denotes the real part. Thus, the phase velocity is oriented parallel to the  $-z$  (resp.  $+z$ ) axis. Some confusion in the literature [23] emerges from the claimed inadmissability of either  $n_+$  or  $n_-$  on grounds other than the dictates of power flow.

### 4 Perfect lenses

Pendry [23] presented the possibility of fabricating a perfect (i.e., aberration–free) lens from a material with  $\epsilon_r = \mu_r = -1$ , which attracted enormous attention from such luminaries as science reporters attached to various newspapers. Attention came from researchers as well [9, 16], [24]–[27]. In particular, Ziolkowski and Heyman [16] concluded from extensive two–dimensional simulations that the condition  $\epsilon_r = \mu_r = -1$  cannot be met by realistic meta–materials, even in some narrow frequency range.

Aberrations due to dissipation inside the desired NPV medium (with  $\epsilon_r = \mu_r = -1$ ) would prove to be a stumbling block in fabricating the desired perfect lenses [26, 27]. However, the possible use of active (i.e., non–passive) elements in meta–materials may provide some relief from the glorious tyranny of the principle of conservation of energy [28]. Chromatic aberrations due to non–fulfilment of the required conditions outside some narrow frequency range will also be important [9, 26].

## 5 Distributed Bragg reflectors

The Bragg regime of a multilayer distributed Bragg reflector (DBR) would undergo a blue-shift, if a conventional positive phase-velocity (PPV) constituent were to be replaced by its NPV counterpart [29]. An underlying cause may be the reversal of phase of the reflected and the transmitted plane waves, when a PPV medium is replaced by a NPV medium [30]. Anyhow, multilayer DBRs with NPV constituents could be useful in wavelength regimes that are inaccessible with DBRs employing PPV constituents exclusively.

## 6 Homogenization

The meta-materials wherein the phase velocity can be directed opposite to the power flow are composite materials comprising inclusions of various kinds dispersed in some host medium. At sufficiently low frequencies, a homogeneous medium can be prescribed as *effectively* equivalent to a particulate composite medium for certain purposes [31]–W00.

Incorporation of NPV mediums in such well-known homogenization approaches as the ones named after Maxwell Garnett and Bruggeman [31] is mathematically trivial, and we forecast many theoretical publications thereon. Whether or not the theoretical predictions of those approaches will be physically realized is another matter. We do, however, note that surprising results can emerge from the consideration of NPV mediums in homogenization approaches. For instances [8],

- (i) the Bruggeman approach forecasts that a certain mixture of a NPV medium with its prosaic PPV counterpart, both impedance-matched, can function as the medium that Pendry deems desirable for fabricating perfect lenses [23]; and
- (ii) the Maxwell Garnett approach predicts that composite mediums with zero permittivity and zero permeability can be made as electrically small NPV inclusions dispersed randomly but homogeneously in a PPV host medium.

## 7 Complex mediums

Oppositely directed phase velocity and power flow are distinct possibilities in complex mediums, as discussed by Lindell *et al.* [15], and could yield interesting phenomenons. As an example, the circular Bragg phenomenon will be reversed in ferrocholesteric materials with negative real permittivities and permeabilities [34]. Even in isotropic chiral mediums, negative  $\epsilon'_r$  and  $\mu'_r$  will lead to a reversed circular dichroism [35].

To conclude, this brief overview of various emerging issues relating to NPV mediums is expected to stimulate different lines of thought among the participants of *Complex*

*Mediums III.* In view of claims and counter-claims launched respectively by Shelby *et al.* [7] and the detractors of their experimental results, the scientific situation is very presently volatile. Though the commonplace Lorentz model does allow the possibility of isotropic, homogeneous, dielectric-magnetic materials exhibiting negative phase velocity [21], our brief overview definitely does not contain the last word on the topic of artificial materials acting similarly.

## References

- [1] V.G. Veselago, “The electrodynamics of substances with simultaneously negative values of  $\epsilon$  and  $\mu$ ,” *Sov. Phys. Usp.* **10**, 509–514 (1968).
- [2] D.R. Smith, W.J. Padilla, D.C. Vier, S.C. Nemat-Nasser and S. Schultz, “Composite medium with simultaneously negative permeability and permittivity,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **84**, 4184–4187 (2000).
- [3] J. Pendry, A.J. Holden, D.J. Robbins and W.J. Stewart, “Low frequency plasmons in thin-wire structures,” *J. Phys.: Condens. Matter.* **10**, 4785–4809 (1998).
- [4] J. Pendry, “Transmission resonances on metallic gratings with very narrow slits,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **85**, 3966–3969 (1999).
- [5] J. Pendry, A.J. Holden, D.J. Robbins and W.J. Stewart, “Magnetism from conductors and enhanced nonlinear phenomena,” *IEEE Trans. Microwave Theory Tech.* **47**, 2075–2084 (1999).
- [6] G. Dewar, “Candidates for  $\mu < 0$ ,  $\epsilon < 0$  nanostructures,” *Int. J. Modern Phys. B* **15**, 3258–3265 (2001).
- [7] R.A. Shelby, D.R. Smith and S. Schultz, “Experimental verification of a negative index of refraction,” *Science* **292**, 77–79 (2001).
- [8] A. Lakhtakia, “An electromagnetic trinity from ‘negative permittivity’ and ‘negative permeability’,” *Int. J. Infrared Millim. Waves* **22**, 1731–1734 (2001). This paper was incorrectly printed in the December 2001 issue, and will be correctly reprinted in the June 2002 issue. It is also available as: *Preprint physics/0112003* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [9] P.M. Valanju, R.M. Walser and A.P. Valanju, “Wave refraction in negative-index media: always positive and very inhomogeneous,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **88**, 187401 (2002). In our opinion, the invocation of ‘the “group Snell’s law” ’ by these authors has no foundation in electromagnetic theory, and any consequences drawn from that ‘law’ are highly suspect. Notwithstanding that, their concern on the transmission measurements having probably been not made by Shelby *et al.* [7] in the far zone does have merit.

- [10] N. Garcia and M. Nieto-Vesperinas, “Is there an experimental verification of a negative index of refraction yet?” *Opt. Lett.* **27**, 885–887 (2002). We thank the authors for sending us a preprint. Their doubt that the transmission measurements was probably not made by Shelby *et al.* [7] in the far zone has merit, in our opinion.
- [11] See the partial but impressive list of journalistic reports from newspapers (such as *Washington Post*) as well as science newsmagazines (such as *Science*) compiled by Valanju and colleagues [9].
- [12] A. Lakhtakia (ed.), *Selected Papers on Natural Optical Activity (Milestone Volume 15)*. SPIE Optical Engineering Press, Bellingham, WA, USA, 1990.
- [13] D.R. Smith and N. Kroll, “Negative refractive index in left-handed materials,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **85**, 2933–2936 (2000).
- [14] P. Markoš and C.M. Soukoulis, “Transmission studies of left-handed materials,” *Phys. Rev. B* **65**, 033401 (2001).
- [15] I.V. Lindell, S.A. Tretyakov, K.I. Nikoskinen and S. Ilvonen, “BW media — media with negative parameters, capable of supporting backward waves,” *Microw. Opt. Technol. Lett.* **31**, 129–133 (2001).
- [16] R.W. Ziolkowski and E. Heyman, “Wave propagation in media having negative permittivity and permeability,” *Phys. Rev. E* **64**, 056625 (2001).
- [17] L.J. Wang, A. Kuzmich and A. Dogariu, “Gain-assisted superluminal light propagation,” *Nature* **406**, 277–279 (2000).
- [18] P. Sprangle, J.R. Peñano and B. Hafizi, “Comments on superluminal laser pulse propagation,” *Preprint physics/0010033* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [19] C.-G. Huang and Y.-Z. Zhang, “Negative group velocity and distortion of a pulse in an anomalous dispersion medium,” *J. Opt. A: Pure Appl. Opt.* **4**, 263–270 (2002).
- [20] K.T. McDonald, “Negative group velocity,” *Preprint physics/0008013* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [21] M.W. McCall, A. Lakhtakia and W.S. Weiglhofer, “The negative index of refraction demystified,” *Eur. J. Phys.* **23**, 353–359 (2002).
- [22] J. Wang and A. Lakhtakia, “On reflection from a half-space with negative real permittivity and permeability,” *Microw. Opt. Technol. Lett.* **33** (2002, at press). Also available as: *Preprint physics/0202002* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [23] J.B. Pendry, “Negative refraction makes a perfect lens,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **85**, 3966–3969 (2001).
- [24] G.W. ’t Hooft, “Comment on ‘Negative refraction makes a perfect lens’,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **87**, 249701 (2001). J. Pendry, “Reply,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **87**, 249702 (2001).

- [25] J.M. Williams, “Some problems with negative refraction,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **87**, 249703 (2001). J. Pendry, “Reply,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **87**, 249704 (2001).
- [26] A. Lakhtakia, “On perfect lenses and nihility,” *Int. J. Infrared Millim. Waves* **23**, 339–343 (2002).
- [27] N. Garcia and M. Nieto–Vesperinas, “Left–handed materials do not make a perfect lens,” *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **88**, 207403 (2002).
- [28] The tyranny of the principle of conservation of energy is *glorious* for at least two reasons. First, it frees scientific development from those who invoke supernatural intercession whenever we are unable to explain a physical phenomenon. Second, it forces us to be creative in overcoming intellectual as well as technological barriers.
- [29] J. Gerardin and A. Lakhtakia, “Negative index of refraction and distributed Bragg reflectors,” *Preprint physics/0204086* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [30] A. Lakhtakia, “On planewave remittances and Goos–Hänchen shifts of planar slabs with negative real permittivity and permeability,” *Preprint physics/0203084* (<http://arXiv.org/>).
- [31] A. Lakhtakia (ed.), *Selected Papers on Linear Optical Composite Materials (Milestone Volume 120)*. SPIE Optical Engineering Press, Bellingham, WA, USA, 1996.
- [32] B. Michel, “Recent developments in the homogenization of linear bianisotropic composite materials,” in: O.N. Singh and A. Lakhtakia (eds.), *Electromagnetic Fields in Unconventional Materials and Structures*. Wiley, New York, NY, USA, 2000.
- [33] W.S. Weiglhofer, “Homogenization of particulate materials,” *Proc. SPIE* **4097**, 146–154 (2000).
- [34] A. Lakhtakia, “Reversal of circular Bragg phenomenon in ferrocholesteric materials with negative real permittivities and permeabilities,” *Adv. Mater.* **14**, 447–449 (2002).
- [35] A. Lakhtakia, “Reversed circular dichroism of isotropic chiral mediums with negative real permeability and permittivity,” *Microw. Opt. Technol. Lett.* **33**, 96–97 (2002).